PROCEEDINGS
of the
AMERICAN SOCIETY for
PSYCHICAL RESEARCH

VOLS. XX-XXI
(for the years 1926-1927)

THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP
A complete record from January 1st, 1925

Edited by
J. Malcolm Bird
Research Officer of the Society

(Vol. 1)

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR PSYCHICAL RESEARCH
15 Lexington Avenue
New York
1928
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVI:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVIII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIX:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XX:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXI:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXIII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXIV:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXV:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXVI:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXVII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXVIII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXIX:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXX:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXI:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXIII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXIV:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXV:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXVI:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXVII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXVIII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXXIX:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XL:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XLI:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XLII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XLIII:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

XX: Introductory Remarks .......................................... 1
II: Mr. Dingwall’s Study of the Case ................................ 7
III: Walter’s “Talking Head” .......................................... 16
IV: Informal Tests of the Walter Voice .............................. 24
V: The Teleplasmic Hand .............................................. 31
VI: The Telekinetic Aspect: to July 1st, 1925 ..................... 47
VII: Donations from Walter ........................................... 64
VIII: Séances Outside the Lime Street Premises: 1925 ............. 69
IX: The Code-Hoagland Episode ....................................... 85
X: The Bell-Boxes of Early 1925 .................................... 114
XI: The Curious History of the “Hole Bell-Box” .................... 133
XII: The Serious Side of the Harvard Case ........................ 182
XIII: The A.S.P.R. Project: Séances of July, 1925 ................. 143
XIV: A.S.P.R. Séances: Second Series .............................. 171
XV: A Reversion to Teleplasms ...................................... 188
XVI: The Climax of the A.S.P.R. Sittings .......................... 214
XVII: The Telekinesis of Later 1925 ................................ 242
XVIII: One Sitter, and His Verdict ................................ 249
XIX: Another Sitter: The Same Verdict ............................. 256
XX: Dr. Richardson’s Voice-Control Machine ...................... 268
XXI: An Unevolved Skeptic .......................................... 277
XXII: Identifications of Personal Objects .......................... 287
XXIII: Identifications of Playing Cards ........................... 292
XXIV: Teleplasms in the Informal Sittings ......................... 305
XXV: The Glass Cabinet and Wired Control ......................... 312
XXVI: A New Procedure of “One-Man Sittings” ...................... 324
XXVII: The Bell-Boxes: to November, 1925 ......................... 326
XXVIII: The Wooden Letters: A New Instrument for Cognitions ... 342
XXIX: The Standardized Séance, in Two Parts ...................... 348
XXX: A Distinguished Sitter and His Reaction ...................... 362
XXXI: Another Committee ........................................... 365
XXXII: The Psychical Activation of the Luminous Paint ......... 390
XXXIII: Margery and Other Psychics ................................ 395
XXXIV: Four Séances of Outstanding Character .................... 397
XXXV: The Further History of the Bell-Box ........................ 412
XXXVI: The Rehabilitation of the Scales .......................... 417
XXXVII: The Further History of the Standardized Séance ........ 428
XXXVIII: Identification Phenomena in the Glass Cabinet ......... 434
XXXIX: Walter’s Cognitions During the Summer and Fall of 1926 437
XL: Vagrant Sittings in the Old Cabinet .......................... 444
XLI: Paraffin Gloves under the Co-Mediumship of Dr. Hardwicke 447
XLII: Further Teleplasmic Phenomena with the Aid of Dr. Hardwicke 465
XLIII: A Distinguished Sitter from Abroad ........................ 479
PREFACE

In the past, and up to 1925, it has been the fixed policy of the American Society for Psychical Research to issue every year a volume of Proceedings, distinct from its monthly Journal. The Proceedings volume has been intended as a repository for material too extensive or too recondite for use in the Journal; the basis for this being mainly the fact that the distinction between membership classes revolved about payment of an additional fee, so that the Journal had a larger and a more nearly “popular” audience. But in practice this has not always worked out well. There have been times when a single connected body of material justifying publication in Proceedings form has not been available; and when, therefore, the obligation to supply such a volume to the members who have paid for it has made it necessary either to group in one volume numerous short and unrelated items, or to publish at length something that might better have been issued in summary or even relegated to the documentary files of the Society.

Accordingly, during 1927 a decision was reached to discontinue the regular publication of Proceedings, and to enlarge the Journal to take care of some of the material thus made available for Journal use. Under this new policy, whenever the Society has a case which by virtue of its length or its recondite character, or on any other basis, seems suitable for Proceedings and unsuitable for the Journal, a volume of Proceedings will be published and will go to all members paying more than the minimum membership fee. But there will be no obligation to publish such a volume at regular intervals; and during the time between the appearance of two of these volumes, those members who elect to pay more than the minimum fee will do so with the idea of supporting the Society’s work by just so much more, rather than with any intent of receiving a definite additional piece of merchandise from the Society.

At the time when the decision to inaugurate this changed policy was effected, the Society was in arrears to its ten-dollar members to the extent of one Proceedings volume; and with the termination of the year 1927 it became a second year in arrears. This of course is an obligation upon the Society. In point of fact the lapse has been due, not to lack of suitable material, but to the inability of the Society’s
staff to find time for working into shape the material available. Throughout this period it has been the intent to use, for the next Proceedings, the growing mass of data arising out of the famous Margery case. The details of this plan have been modified from time to time; and what we now finally present is a two-volume compilation, which serves as the missing Proceedings for 1926 and 1927 while at the same time bringing publication of this interesting and important case substantially down to date. The first of these two volumes, carrying these introductory remarks, will reach the Society's members during October, 1928; the second one will follow without too much delay.

To what is said in Chapter I regarding the scope of this work nothing need be added beyond the statement that the intent to stop abruptly with the last séance of 1926 has been abandoned. The 1927–8 period of the mediumship has been much better covered by contemporaneous publication than were the preceding two years; so that using citation of existing literature as freely as this volume does, a given period of time may be covered with less expenditure of space than has been necessary herein. The second volume will carry the case to such point in 1927 or 1928 as seems to afford the most logical stopping place; and with it, the complete history of the case up to that point will be available for the first time.

The uncertainty as to just what the second volume will contain and just what its order of presentation will be, makes it impossible to complete certain cross-references out of the first volume into the second. These references are made by open number; a typical entry being: "See open reference No. 17 in Vol. 2." The first printed page following the title-page of the second volume will comprise a list of these references, in numerical order, giving for each the page-number of the volume to which the reference is intended to direct the reader. Since these references could not be looked up in any event until the second volume is available, the only inconvenience will be the necessity of thus having to look in two places for one reference.

The editor is conscious of the necessity for explaining away the treatment accorded many of the séances where photographs were taken. Such photographs are in practically every instance made by Messrs. Conant and Gerke, individually or in collaboration; and are developed by them, usually in a small dark-room which they have fitted up in what was once a closet, in 10 Lime Street. Always the appropriate precautions are taken to preserve the integrity of the picture; but always, in the end, the negative passes into Dr. Crandon's custody, it
and all rights of reproduction become his property, and the serious business of maintaining a permanent file of these pictures is in his hands.

Now prior to the incidence of the thumb-print sequence to which we do not come at all in the current volume, Dr. Crandon was never able to see the importance of preserving the tie-up between all photographs and their dates of making and the conditions under which they were exposed and the records showing all this. So there exist in his hands many plates and prints carrying no memoranda of date, and regarding which neither he nor anybody else can testify further than to say: "I remember being present when this picture was taken." Some of these undated pictures I give, when their intrinsic importance seems to warrant showing them despite this hiatus in their history. All pictures which can be positively assigned to a given date and positively given a place in the detailed record of that date I give, save when their interest is so slight as to lead me to begrudge them space. But in numerous instances I give the record carrying the statement that pictures were made, and without further apology than the present one let the pictures themselves go by default.

Usually when one camera is exposed in the Lime Street séance-room, three are exposed; and since one of these is stereoscopic, we may have as many as four different views of the same scene, from four different angles. Whether to publish more than one of these must of course be decided independently in each instance, on the basis of the content of the several views. The extremely beautiful stereoscopic effects which are displayed to anyone who goes to Lime Street to inspect the photographs and other exhibits there on file are, of course, quite impossible of reproduction in connection with a book; this will always remain one of the major advantages of a visit to the Crandon residence.

J. M. B.
CHAPTER I
Introductory Remarks
By the Editor

In a volume previously published through the ordinary commercial channels,¹ I have given the history of the Margery mediumship from its inception in May, 1923, down to the end of 1924. For this purpose there were placed at my disposal all the records in Dr. Crandon's possession; in addition to which, I had myself enjoyed greater contact with the case than any other observer who was not initially acquainted with the Psychic and her husband. The result has been a book which, written from the journalistic viewpoint by one having no idea that his interest in psychical research would ever become other than a journalistic one, when judged from severe scientific standards has certain obvious shortcomings. In spite of these, it is the most faithful account possible, at first hand and at second hand with citation of authority, of the first nineteen months of the mediumship. It continues to be recognized alike by friend and by foe of the medium as the sole primary source for at least that part of the history of the case prior to its consideration by the Scientific American Committee.

With my strictures upon that Committee and its work, it was not to be expected that Messrs. Houdini, Prince and McDougall would be in accord. I told the story of the Committee's handling of the case, as I saw it; and I set down the status of the case with the several Committee members, as it existed when my book went to press. Its further treatment by the Committee, and certain changes in the attitudes of the individual Committeemen, will be made clear by a reference to the several articles by means of which the Scientific American attempted to beat a decent and orderly retreat from the mess into which it had got itself.² A fuller statement of McDougall's viewpoint, with certain criticisms and discussions arising out of that statement, may be found in the Journal of my Society.³ These documents,

¹ "Margery" The Medium; Small, Maynard & Co., 1925; hereinafter cited as M. M.
and only these, need be consulted by one who wishes to gain an adequate idea of the Margery history to the end of 1924, and of the status of the case at that date.

As everybody knows, the mediumship did not yield to the adverse viewpoints of the Scientific American Committee majority. The mediumship has gone on and on; controversy about it has gone on and on; publication of primary reports of observations, and of secondary discussion and criticism, alike by the pros and the cons, has gone on in constantly increasing volume. Since my previous book on the mediumship, however, there has been made no orderly attempt to bring its history down to date in a single, unified discussion; and the only attempt at a bibliography has been in connection with a most biased adverse critique. The present text is aimed at making good the deficiency.

Just above, I speak of the history of the case; just below, of the character of the mediumship and of other questions of evidential context. This makes it necessary for me to emphasize that the present volume has a two-fold purpose and a double viewpoint. Wherever the records are unusually precise or the conditions unusually adverse to the hypothesis of fraud in general or to that of some particular fraud, or wherever it seems possible to deal in any critical sense with evidential values, this is done. But very often, nothing of the sort is possible. In such event, the dominant consideration must be the fact that, genuine or fraudulent, the Margery mediumship is a case of the very first importance—one which even by some of those who regard it as probably invalid, has been pronounced the most important case of physical mediumship in history. This makes it very vital that there be duly set down the best possible record of the phenomena, purely as a matter of history. Where no evidential comment is possible—and this is the case in perhaps more than half of the narrative—it is precisely this historical document that I present. The reader should be under no difficulty in discriminating between the two viewpoints; and having once pointed out to him the necessity of so discriminating, I shall not trouble myself further about doing it for him.

Particularly where, as is often the case, the only documentary record available is the one prepared by the medium's husband, the necessities for corroboration are large; and regardless of whence the record comes these necessities exist. In some degree we meet them as

---

4 See open reference No. 1, Vol. 2 of the present text.
we go along. In larger degree we meet them in one of the concluding chapters, in which routine information about all the sittings is tabulated, with complete cross-references to the text. The publication of the present text in two volumes necessitates that this chapter of routine data be postponed into the second volume. As compensation for this disadvantage, the time elapsing between the appearance of the two volumes will enable us to give, in the second one, statements from sitter who will have read the accounts of their sittings in the first volume and in proofs of the second, and who will indicate the degree to which they endorse or dissent from these records.

It is not the intent to duplicate in these pages anything that has already seen the light in any reasonably accessible publication. All such published matter is part of the history of the case, and will have its due place in the present text; but it will be given that place ordinarily by mere citation, and seldom by more than the sketchiest summary. Whatever of new matter is necessary to complete the history of the mediumship over the term herein covered will be presented. In considerable part, such new material will consist of séance records, the immediate responsibility for which will always be indicated. In so far as it is necessary to go beyond the séance records the text will be mainly of my own preparation, with chapters or portions thereof contributed by others who may happen to be in better contact with certain of the facts than I am. My share in the ultimate result will be that of editor and major contributor.

In this connection, a little consideration must be given to my own position with reference to the case. I am the first of a large number of people who, initially entire strangers to the Crandons, have through one or another circumstance been projected into their séance room for long and serious contact with the mediumship. My experiences in the séance room were such that at an early date in my exposure to the mediumship it became evident to me that some part at least of the phenomena were produced without fraud of any sort. So large a proportion of them occur under conditions of incomplete control or inadequate observation that I have never felt justified in setting up any claim of 100 per cent genuineness; such claim would clearly involve a carrying of testimony beyond the limits of one's evidence. I would emphasize, however, that neither in my own experience nor in that of any other critic do I find any serious evidence that Margery has ever employed fraud. In so far as this implies my rejection of adverse
published criticism based upon incidents falling within the period covered by the present volume, my reasons for such rejection will duly appear.

In my previous book, I took the attitude not only that the phenomena were demonstrated to my own satisfaction, but that they ought also to be demonstrated to that of the reader. I now believe this attitude to have been a mistake. For the first time in my journalistic career, I met, in Margery’s séance room, occurrences which it is not easy for the average reader to credit. Writing as a journalist, accustomed to telling my readers from a position of authority what was and what was not, I underestimated the difficulty which a non-witness has in crediting the phenomena of the séance-room. Certainly I did not myself credit them until I had seen them; why should anybody else do so?

Perhaps it is but another way of saying this same thing to confess that, writing as a journalist, I did not properly distinguish between the feeling of personal satisfaction that may come to a witness of curious occurrences, and the hypercritical exclusion of all alternatives which the scientist demands before he will accept new phenomena that transcend his knowledge of how nature works. If the phenomena are not valid, they must be fraudulent; and we must then set up working hypotheses as to how they have been produced. Many of these working hypotheses quite plainly border on absurdity. One who has seen the manifestations and got accustomed to them does not sufficiently realize that they, too, border on absurdity; and that the non-witness is therefore in a position where of two absurdities he must choose the most nearly sensible. If the adverse critic will fairly state and honestly envision the hypotheses which must subsist as the price of his skepticism, and if he will then honestly state that these appear to him less silly, less objectionable, than the hypothesis of genuine occurrence, I have today all respect for his attitude.

One thing must be abundantly clear from the outset, however. Among the hypotheses which must be admitted as the price of rejecting Margery’s phenomena is that of active and sustained confederacy by myself. The same remark will ultimately apply to numerous other sitters, but at this moment I am interested in it only as it involves me. My attitude, implied but none the less clearly present in my mind when I wrote my previous book, was that I knew myself to be innocent of this charge and would not quietly submit to it. This, too, is an idea from
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

which I have completely recovered. I have come to realize that to a very considerable proportion of persons, dishonesty from any source whatever, no matter how high, is easier to believe than are the phenomena of the physical séance. This is a perfectly valid state of mind, an aspect of human psychology from which we cannot escape. In common with all other investigators of psychic phenomena, I expect that a certain proportion of critics, when driven out of every other refuge, will conclude that, inasmuch as these phenomena cannot happen, and inasmuch as I have robbed them of every other alibi, the answer must obviously be that I myself have aided in their production or have reported them falsely. If any reader is of this type of mind, and if I succeed in reducing him to the plea that I am the confederate or the fraudulent reporter, I regard myself as having done my full duty by him, and as having carried him as far along the road of ultimate education in the facts as it is possible to carry him.

So on all these grounds, I modify somewhat, in this book, the tone which I took in my previous one. I shall still present the phenomena as valid; I shall still center my discussion about the exclusion of this, that or the other oblique explanation. But I shall write in recognition that rigorous scientific demonstration of something that you are unwilling to believe is not possible, and that use of this term or any equivalent thereof in connection with anything outside the theorems of mathematics and logic involves a fallacy.

The bald truth is, as every judge and lawyer knows, that questions of fact are invariably settled by preponderance of evidence, and by personal judgment as to the weight to be attached to this evidence. In considering these questions we can never hope to get away from the personal equation. Certain conflicting factors appear; no logical standard exists for determining which should have the most weight; one of them impresses you as the weightier and I find another one so; our judgments, thus divergent, we find cannot be reconciled. This is a fundamental part of all discussions on questions of fact, and in such discussion it is an illusion to think of absolute demonstration. Starting from the same point, two observers or critics reach divergent conclusions; and there is nothing that can be done about it. Impossible in the field of logic or mathematics, this is only what we must expect in dealing with matters of fact. The fallacy of talking about a factual demonstration as though it were a logical syllogism is one which I purpose studiously to avoid throughout the present volume. I am con-
fident that the Margery mediumship is valid: in writing its history I must write from that viewpoint; but I hope to avoid urging that viewpoint upon the reader against his better judgment. At no stage, I hope, shall I do more in the way of summary presentation of conclusions than to say that certain hypotheses seem dictated or certain others excluded, in given episodes; and that certain elaborate compounding of extreme improbabilities must be accepted as the price of rejecting the mediumship.

It is perhaps not out of order, then, to insist that this moderation of my attitude toward the skeptic does not correspond to any moderation in my own constancy of conviction. One other point of opinion on which I must likewise say a word is bound up in the question: "What is Walter?" If you ask me this, I shall very frankly reply that I do not know, and do not very seriously care. Throughout my acquaintance with him, from the very first, there has been present in my mind the spirit interpretation; and equally there has been present the interpretation in terms of subconscious masquerade which we have all and always realized to be the alternative to spirits, and which M. Sudre is nowadays formulating with such precision and vigor. If Walter is not a spirit, he is a prosopopesis. And in this particular instance, on account of the extreme degree of normal knowledge by the medium of the living Walter Stinson, it does not seem to me profitable to attempt the discrimination. Supposing that Walter is Walter, I should despair of ever proving it. To me, Walter is the personality that runs the Lime Street séances; just that, and nothing more. I concentrate my attention on what he does and ignore the problem of what he is.

As a measure of economy and statistical unity, certain routine facts about the sittings and the sitters are brought together, as stated above, in one of the final chapters. Until Volume 2 of this text is in his hands the reader will be unable to turn forward to this chapter in search of facts missing from the earlier ones. He will feel this deprivation most in connection with his desire to know who were present at certain sittings, and who certain sitters are. I greatly regret that I have found no alternative to this rather unfortunate arrangement of my material.

Since this text was written, the developments chronicled by Dr. Richardson in the A.S.P.R. Journal for May, June, etc., 1928, have given us an indirect attack upon the problem of Walter's personal identity which suggests that this despair may have been a bit premature.—J. M. B.
CHAPTER II

Mr. Dingwall's Study of the Case

By the Editor

My previous history of the mediumship chronicles1 its exposure, at a séance in London in December, 1923, to the critical eye of Mr. Eric J. Dingwall, (then) Research Officer of the (British) Society for Psychical Research. And in subsequent passages2 there is more than a hint that, in early 1925, Dingwall came to Boston as a more or less official emissary of his Society, to hold a series of séances with Margery and attempt a rigorous demonstration of validity or of fraud. In this he failed; partly because of the general principles which, as I have explained,3 make any such attempt illusory, and partly because of special factors which he himself introduced. His own greatly delayed account of his sittings and his states of mind,4 and my analysis of his work and of the reasons for the failure of his primary mission,5 should be read in toto into the present history of the mediumship. For Dingwall's examination of the case took up all of Margery's séance-room activity from January 1st to February 11th, 1925; and this study constitutes not alone the first chapter in the 1926 history of the case, but equally one of the most important chapters in its entire course.

Dingwall's stay in Boston resulted, first of all, in a complete change in the character of the phenomena. For reasons to which he attached great weight but which I regard as fallacious, Dingwall desired to get away from the accustomed phenomena of the mediumship. In this he succeeded brilliantly. Under a persistent suggestion from Dingwall, Walter turned to the production of a visible and tangible teleplasm, issuing from the genitals with the Psychic in trance throughout the séance. This, it will be appreciated, was a complete overthrow of Margery's accustomed routine; and it has constituted a step of the greatest permanent import. Walter did not abandon and has not abandoned the older telekinetic manifestations. Similarly, with Ding-

1 M. M., p. 137.
2 M. M., pp. 438, 483.
3 Above, pp. 5–6.
5 Journal, A.S.P.R., August, 1926, p. 480.
wall's departure he did not abandon and has not abandoned the newer, teleplasmic side. Since that time we get both aspects. Sometimes the choice is made by the sitters; more often, by Walter. Occasionally we get a mixed séance in which both the old and the new manifestations occur; more usually, a given phase monopolizes a single séance or a series of séances. My review of Dingwall's report, just cited, sufficiently emphasizes the details of this revolution, and its significance.

Another thread remains to be disengaged from the séances of these six weeks, and here displayed. Obviously, a difficult problem confronted Dingwall in his choice of sitters. Crandon, on his own insistence, had to be included. McDougall was a member of the Council of the S.P.R., and the only American member. By virtue of this fact, in spite of the ambiguous position in which the Scientific American enterprise had left him and in spite of his evident bias against the mediumship, Dingwall named him as his colleague and Crandon accepted him. By McDougall's nomination, there was added to the group Dr. Elwood Worcester, pastor of Emmanuel Church, one of Boston's select Episcopal congregations. There were held thirteen "official" séances, at all of which these four were present save once when Crandon allowed himself to be excluded; and at some of which Dr. or Mrs. Richardson or both attended. In addition there were nineteen "private" sittings of less restricted personnel and less severe conditions.

At first, Dingwall was most enthusiastic; after several experiences with the new teleplasmic phenomena, he wrote to Schrenck Notzing in emphatic and unqualified endorsement of the teleplasm and the conditions of control. Later he receded from this viewpoint; he reached a point beyond which he could not progress, for the simple reason that the success or even the application of every test which he regarded as a crucial one was prevented. His subsequent description of what happened was that he started with the working hypothesis of validity, found the facts leaning at first toward this, and retained it as long as they did so; but that he ultimately reached a stage at which evidence indicating the hypothesis of fraud began to be obtained. He now found himself obliged to cover his indiscretion in writing to

---

6 *Sci. Am.*, Apr., 1925, p. 229. The statement there printed had been released to the daily press on Feb. 11th, and for weeks before that date McDougall had been known by all parties concerned to hold the attitude therein expressed. See also, *M. M.*, pp. 439-440, and Chapter LII.

Schrenck by charging the latter with indiscretion in having published this letter. Ultimately he reached the judgment that while neither hypothesis could be regarded as established, the evidence comported a little better with that of fraud than with that of validity. But the preponderance of evidence was so slight that, despite much pressure for a definitely adverse verdict, Dingwall would not make any explicit statement in behalf of the oblique hypothesis. As Mr. Feilding so cleverly puts it on a later page\(^7\) of the volume in which Dingwall's report appears, their Research Officer found that "circumstances led him to box the compass of most opinions and to end with none."

So much for the face value of Dingwall's report. But long before it appeared, he had got himself into the most bitter controversy with McDougall. This I need not summarize here, save with the statement that by McDougall's own admission, pressure was brought to bear upon Dingwall calculated to make his judgment conform with McDougall's; and that Dingwall ultimately discovered McDougall, rather than himself, to be the principal in the investigation. The history of all this is to be found in a discussion participated in by Dingwall, McDougall and myself, and extending over a period of several months.\(^8\) It would require no further attention here were it not for one factor of a permanence and an importance which could not be properly anticipated at the time when the discussion was current, and which is therefore not sufficiently clarified therein.

Dingwall himself betrays the fact\(^9\) that a distinctly adverse observation which McDougall claimed to have made was withheld from him (Dingwall) for seven days, and brought to his attention then only at the insistence of Worcester. Crandon had already\(^10\) complained of this \textit{ex post facto} quality in McDougall's reporting, and I had observed it though commenting upon it less definitely. Briefly, it appeared to be McDougall's regular practice to leave a sitting with no word or deed indicating any absence of complete satisfaction; and then to turn up, days or weeks or months thereafter, with the allegation that during that sitting he had made this, that or the other specific damaging observation. But while his published comment upon the mediumship rather teemed with this sort of thing, opportunity to criticize it as his

---

\(^7\) Page 159.
general procedure rather than as a mere iterated accident did not come until October, 1926. In that month, despite Crandon's specific demonstration (Note 10, above) of the evil and the inadmissibility of the procedure, we find McDougall not merely returning to it but formally setting it up as proper séance procedure and defending it as such. The lengthy critique of the mediumship in which this occurs must be cited here as part of the permanent literature of the case. And this episode is made a part of the present chapter because McDougall himself has so made it.

For McDougall in many ways dominated the Dingwall study of the case and he dictated so far as he was able the form which Dingwall's final verdict took. Had he had his way, this verdict would have been a categorical negative: for his own judgment is such. The material upon which this judgment is based flows out of the Dingwall sittings, rather than out of his prior contact with the case—even where he cites this contact, he does so with little confidence and merely to make it appear that a continuous history of valid doubt runs back of January, 1925. And with this material and this verdict he has, since February, 1925, been engaged in an earnest and studious effort to damn the mediumship in the eyes of the metapsychical world. In view of the disproportionate weight which his opinion carries alike in the public and in the scientific mind, it is necessary to emphasize, in this summary of Dingwall's work, that neither on a basis of fact nor on one of methodological principle does McDougall's attitude justify itself.

In the *Psyche* article, McDougall gives the following evidence that the leopard had not altered his spots since his last previous reproof by Crandon:

> I was entirely baffled by the first and second of these movements. Fortunately during the third movement I detected what was to me convincing evidence that the medium's head had escaped from the control and that the disk was lifted by her mouth. I was under no moral obligation to report this observation in the presence of the medium. I did not do so, and signed the notes of the sitting which contained no mention of this critical observation. Without it the notes seem to report a supernormal phenomenon; with it they amount to nothing in the way of evidence. I could cite many instances of this sort.

PLATE 1. TWO VIEWS, SHOWING THE PSYCHIC COLLAPSED INTO HER CHAIR OR UPON THE TABLE, WITH CRUDE, FORMLESS TELEPLASM APPARENTLY ISSUING FROM EITHER EAR. ONE OF THE EARLIER STAGES OF THE TELEPLASMIC FORMS SHOWN TO MR. DINGWALL.
Plate 2. Teleplasmic masses, apparently from nose (above) and right ear (below), under observation of the Dingwall-McDougall group.
PLATE 3. A MASS OF CRUDE FINGER-LIKE TELEPLASM, APPARENTLY FROM THE MOUTH. THE OBSERVERS ARE MR. DINGWALL (ABOVE) AND DR. McDOUGALL (HEAD ON TABLE).
PLATE 4. CRUDELY FORMED TELEPLASMIC HAND, COVERED WITH LEATHERY SKIN, AND ISSUING FROM THE PSYCHIC'S BODY.
PLATE 5. CRUDE TELEPLASMIC HAND, ORIGINATING FROM THE GENITALS, HANGING OVER MR. DINGWALL'S HAND FOR OBSERVATION IN WHITE FLASHLIGHT IN THE MIDST OF A RED-LIGHT INTERVAL.
Plate 6. Another view, from another angle, of the hand shown in Plate 5. The present view shows the psychic's right hand and left hand correctly; the other has been reversed photographically at some stage of its history. The two of course are taken from opposite sides of the room.
Plate 7. Two views, one showing the relatively well-formed hand on the table, the other showing it in Mr. Dingwall's hand under his scrutiny. In both cases of bodily origin and with crude leathery skin.
Plate 8. Two views of a distinctly better-than-usually-formed hand. The second indicates its origin; and shows the "umbilical cord" as apparently having suffered a double fracture, to reunite laterally as a broken thigh-bone will.
If any reader clung, in the face of this last sentence, to the delusion that the subsequent tampering with the record was not McDougall's regular procedure, the good Professor would settle the matter by the passages in the succeeding text in which he explicitly confesses this to be the case, and explicitly defends the procedure in question. The idea behind this defense is that the *ex post facto* procedure is necessary. In its absence the investigator is under an insuperable burden, in that the fraudulent medium is kept posted about the progress being made in observation of his fraud. He is therefore always one jump ahead of the observer, and demonstration of his fraud is rendered impossible.

Now it is a matter for definition and discussion whether this is a valid viewpoint. There is at least a large possibility that the difficulty indicated by McDougall is one of the fundamental problems of the séance room, which must be met and conquered rather than artfully dodged. Even in the general case, and in the absence of any specific agreement covering the matter, the objections to the *ex post facto* method which Crandon and I have had occasion to set down in the Margery literature and which are so well known to other investigators of other cases, are very forceful and compel attention. But in the present instance, the matter did not even rest as one of general principle, nor was there any absence of specific agreement with reference to this important methodological factor.

The agreement covering the Dingwall series of sittings was not signed by McDougall. It was, however, signed by Dingwall as ostensible principal, and it specifically applied to the investigator and all his agents. McDougall having entered the case as such agent, by his own volition, will hardly advance the claim that this agreement did not cover his conduct. Among other things, it provides:

These notes shall, within the investigator's best memory, include every fact with relation to the phenomena and the accompanying circumstances which he regards as in any way important.

Now I need not go into the history of the Houdini "exposure" to illustrate the sort of thing this was designed to prevent; nor need I repeat the discussion cited in footnotes 13 and 14 covering the theory and practice of the matter. To most readers the impropriety of the *ex post* 

---

14 *Journal, A.S.P.R.*, Dec., 1925, p. 717; also *M. M.*, Chapters XLVIII, XLIX.
facto exposure will be so obvious, on so many different grounds, that discussion will be superfluous. To most investigators it has been equally obvious. If it is not obvious, if the investigator's feelings parallel those of McDougall which I have paraphrased from the *Psyche* article, he will refrain from signing any such protocol as the one from which I have just quoted, or from working on a case investigation of which is governed by such protocol. Unless the investigator be McDougall; in which event he will calmly accept the protocol and as calmly proceed to ignore it.

At least one vigorous protest has been published, by a Margery sitter,\(^{15}\) against the code of morals and the procedure here involved. An equally vigorous protest from Dr. R. J. Tillyard\(^{16}\) has gone unpublished; and from it I abstract the following remarks:

> If I understand Professor McDougall's claim aright, it is this: In a séance, a man may sign beforehand a statement that he will faithfully mention at the end of the séance, anything which appears to him convincing evidence of fraud; and that failing such mention, if he signs the minutes as correct, then these are to be taken as accurate record of the proceedings. But having signed such a statement, and left the world to believe for a period of weeks or months, as suits his purpose, that they are accurate, he may subsequently make the startling disclosure that he was convincedly aware of fraud all the time, but did not disclose it. . . . I venture to state that neither in law nor as between men of honor can such a position be maintained. . . . In simplest words, such things are not done. . . . Or can it be that I am so far removed from the world's standards, so lost in the mists of mid-Victorianism, as to have misinterpreted the moral implications of his article? I think not. I have tried to picture the effect of similar procedure in a case involving the good name of a fellow man in (a) my Public School (1900); (b) my University (Cambridge, 1903); (c) the Royal Society (1926), to which we both belong, having signed a declaration that we would endeavor always to uphold the honor and good name of that Society! In all three cases the reaction is the same. . . . I, therefore, have no alternative but to protest in public, and in the strongest possible terms, against the implied endorsement by Professor McDougall . . . of a moral code.


\(^{16}\) See Chapter XLIII for a statement of his scientific position and contact with the mediumship. His statement here quoted from will now have appeared in *Psychic Science* for July, 1928.—J. M. B.
repulsive to all the instincts of an English gentleman, and utterly indefensible in law as well. I can only conclude with a quotation from Professor McDougall himself, from the same page of his astounding article: “In such a matter the general public necessarily forms its opinion at second hand; and its opinion . . . must in the main depend upon . . . the relative competence, good faith, and absence of vitiating bias on the part of the opposed parties.” [The italics are Tillyard’s.]

I would not presume to attempt a betterment of Tillyard’s remarks, from his point of view. There is another angle of the matter, however, which impresses my cold-blooded and mathematical mind as equally serious. At ungentlemanly conduct by an investigator I should be mildly grieved; but if he succeeded in proving that way something which he could not otherwise prove, I should probably condone any lapse that a sane man would be at all likely to commit. McDougall, however, lapses seriously from the moral code; and by his lapse he succeeds in proving exactly nothing except his own personal animus. Without his superadded evidence, revealed for the first time months after the record was closed, he himself admits that this record is one of supernormality. With it, as he insists, the record would in truth be valueless. But there is no way in which this condition of “with it” may be achieved. The alleged new evidence is not part of the record and McDougall cannot by any means soever make it so.

This would be sufficiently the case, even though the extraneous allegations were in any way supported by citation of contemporary documents. And McDougall’s position is made just so much the worse when we find that they are not so supported, and that failure so to support them is again constitutional with him. As long ago as April, 1925,17 I accused him of having no records to fall back upon in support of the extremely treacherous memory which he has shown himself to possess. He made a careful reply18 to the article in which I did this, but the particular reproach which I now cite he allowed to go entirely by default.

With all this specific and general background of fact, no detailed citation of the principles of evidence and of scientific procedure is needed to make it wholly clear that the truth or falsity of McDougall’s new allegations is a matter of complete indifference. The only fact

17Journal, A.S.P.R., p. 221.
about them that in the least matters is that they are out of the picture. True or false, they may be given no attention and may be regarded as proving nothing save McDougall's scientific ineptitude. They arise, as the procedure giving them birth arises, entirely out of that viewpoint of distorted prejudice toward the Margery mediumship, which he displays on every occasion. Nowhere does he make this clearer than in the opening sentence of the *Psyche* article [the italics are my own]:

*It might have been hoped* that the adverse verdict of the *Scientific American* Committee, followed as it was by Mr. Hoagland's article in the *Atlantic Monthly* for November, 1925, would have satisfied all but a few resolute believers that the claims made on behalf of this medium have no solid foundation.

We may grant that, if the judges who have passed a negative verdict are sufficiently numerous and of sufficiently obvious authority, it might be expected that their judgment would become an approximately final one. But why should one hope that this would be the case, and deplore sadly the fact that this hope is not realized? Unless one possess an unquenchable animus, I am sure the use of this word would never occur. Demonstration of the animus is all that needs to be added from without to the demonstration which McDougall has himself given of bad procedure. And this whole critique of the improper methods used by him, methods without which he would be left entirely lacking in excuse for attacking the validity of the mediumship, is given here at such length because there has been no opportunity elsewhere to bring the *Psyche* article into parallelism with McDougall's previous conduct; and because of McDougall's unique position as self-appointed censor of the Margery mediumship. From all quarters, one hears of his industrious propaganda in behalf of the proposition that nothing good can come out of Lime Street. In the past, moreover, and from time to time as we go along with the present narrative, we come to an attack upon the mediumship, an alleged exposure, etc., etc. With the single exception of Houdini, for whom I think I have sufficiently accounted, no single one of these detractors has been free from the influence of McDougall and his associates in Harvard and the Boston Society for Psychical Research. With the one disreputable exception named, all anti-Margery propaganda bears these imprints. This is a factor of the case to which due consideration must be given; for if what appear

---

19 M. M., Chapters XLVIII, XLIX.
to be independent attacks upon Margery's validity turn out to radiate from a single source, their weight is of course greatly lessened. And if their common source turn out to be contaminated with inadmissible procedure, their weight may well be reduced to zero. For the evidence that this is in fact the case, that this contamination actually exists (so far as this evidence can be set forth in a scientific compilation and without undue descent into personalities), the reader is directed to Chapters IX–XII, XXI, XXXI, XLIII, and (in the second volume) LXIV–LXVII of the present text; as well as to certain other points which cannot be cited at this stage of the present undertaking other than by an appeal to open reference No. 3 in the second volume. Even in cases where the spirit of the parenthetical remark just above prevents the Editor from too explicitly indicating the linkage between the unfavorably disposed sitters of one or another of these references, and the source of contamination of viewpoint under discussion at this moment, the reader who has followed the course of the case through the avenues of private scandal will recognize the connection.

20 A fuller discussion of the propriety of McDougall's procedures would mean, among other things, giving space to a contribution in his defence; and it is not possible to do this here without unduly delaying the make-up of the early chapters. Inasmuch as a point of much importance in psychical research is involved, the case will be reopened for further discussion in an appendix; the reader may locate this through open reference No. 2 in the second volume of the present text.—J. M. B.
CHAPTER III

Walter’s “Talking Head”

By the Editor, and from the Séance Records

Following the last Dingwall séance on February 11th, two separate four-day intervals were allowed to lapse without a sitting, in order that the Psychic might recover from the strain of the preceding six weeks; and the first six sittings held during this period were entirely given over to conversation with Walter and to a renewal of the old telekinetic habits, without trance.

During the earlier part of Dingwall’s study, the teleplasm had been always of one particular sort; and Walter made no claims as to what anatomical structure it was supposed to simulate or what function it was supposed to fill. Apparently, it was just teleplasm. At about the time when Dingwall began to be dissatisfied with the course of events, the character of the teleplasm began to show a change. Thereafter it was always of the new sort; and it was presented by Walter as an attempt at materialization of his talking apparatus. McDougall regarded this as a “red herring” drawn across the trail, to camouflage the failure of the original program to get past the sticking point.

To the small, lumpy, breathing, luminous masses of teleplasm that now appeared Walter gave the name “my talking head”; and the sitters shortly fell in with this terminology. Starting on February 24th, they began a series of séances designed to pick up where Dingwall had left off, and to continue the development of this talking head. On this evening, much of Walter’s conversation revolved about the alleged thoughts and acts of McDougall and Worcester, and the resignation of Prince from the American Society for Psychical Research. With the omission of such irrelevant matter, the record follows:

Walter said that tonight he was going to work to reproduce and finally finish what he began for Dingwall, namely, the production of the speaking head on the table that should be visible to all. He said it had been coming on finely for Dingwall [paraphrase: until the attitudes of McDougall and Worcester so disgusted him, Walter, that he lost interest]. We were instructed to sit for this
WALTER'S "TALKING HEAD"

purpose on Feb. 26, 27 and 28. The psychic was to have no sup­per and as few clothes as possible; and Walter believed he could then pretty well finish the head on the table, providing it with teeth and all necessary features. We could put a thermometer in the mouth. In view of the state of mind of the average observer Walter proposes to produce hereafter, so far as possible, only such phenomena as carry their own validity with them.

He then went on to formulate what we had already deduced, namely, that there are many forms and consistencies of teleplasm. The first is invisible to our eyes and entirely unable to bear any light. The second is capable of being recorded on the photo­graphic plate but is not visible to our eyes: it is however able to endure red light. The third is of sufficient solidity to be visible and palpable in red light and even in white flashlight. Then there are other types of which we shall know later.

Walter now went on to produce a vague sphere of luminosity four to six inches in diameter, which danced up and down on the table and gave out the hissing, inspiration sound which has been heard before. This was not synchronous with Margery's breathing, though it sounded nasal. The sound clearly overlapped words spoken by her. Walter said it was his nose, "learning to breathe." He told us to leave the red light on for half an hour, and to meet promptly at eight o'clock on the 26th. The sitting ended at 10:10.

There was of course no sitting on the 25th, but Crandon felt it advisable, in view of what might come to pass during the following three days, to record that for the preceding four (?) days, since the plan for the independent speaking head had been on, Margery "has been having constant paroxysms of sneezing, with headache, mostly frontal. She apparently has no coryza or frontal sinus infection [i.e., no cold], and there are no nasal polypi. Also her voice sounds unusual, as though the nasopharynx were somewhat obstructed." These symptoms persisted, and on March 8th, after Margery returned from a visit to New York, Walter stopped the teleplasmic program for the time on their account. Similar symptoms are noted in the record (by Crandon) for the next séance, of February 26th:

The Psychic's head suffered from symptoms of sneezing, frontal ache, and occlusion of Eustachian tubes; all without temperature. Walter, asked whether these symptoms and the phenomena interfered with her thinking, replied: "No, over there you use only an eighth of your brain anyway; over here you use it all."
The physical phenomena of the evening were obvious progressive steps in the production of the promised speaking head. Psychic lights, bigger than have before been seen by us, appeared over Margery's chest and then on the table and in the space above it. These were sometimes as large as two feet by six inches. We concluded that the light came from some real object, since it would suddenly occlude, from the vision of one or another sitter, the light from Margery's luminous headband.\footnote{The Crandon records are habitually silent, save accidentally as here, about routine controls.—J. M. B.}

The luminous hand was seen on the table, and later a long upright light almost suggesting a phantom. Walter said: "That is my shining skin outlining my form, but tonight it has no bones. That is what a phantom is. Tomorrow bring a thermometer to put in my mouth. This head I am making will be a real head, bones and all features. The stuff I am using tonight is like macaroni. It is not transparent."

In continuation of the same program, the séance of February 27th led to the following record:

A luminous area the size of a fist appeared over Margery's chest, and within five minutes shunted over to the table. Then light trance supervened.\footnote{I infer, and Crandon verifies from memory, that there was no trance on the 24th and 26th.—J. M. B.} Then the mass of luminosity exhibited the greatest physical activity: getting slowly bigger, bouncing up from the table, occasionally spreading out like a large handkerchief, but most of the time appearing like a vortex which would evolve and then involute \textit{[sic]}, with a final complicated rolling and unfolding which suggested the kneading of dough. At times black streaks would appear on it; at others, it seemed that features could be made out on it. Twice a globe of light four inches in diameter came out from the region of Margery's heart or left axilla, and rapidly joined the big globe on the table; this accretion would be followed by increased convolutions. At three periods the mass on the table breathed a nasal inspiration, twelve to eighteen times, not synchronous with Margery's breathing, and twice overlapping her voice murmurs in trance. This breathing and overlapping was heard by all present. Walter said the force was fairly low tonight but everything was going well for the big night tomorrow. This was to be the biggest thing he had ever done for us.
WALTER’S “TALKING HEAD” 19

On the 27th, De Wyckoff had been present in the house, but had been invited upstairs to the séance only after Walter had expressly urged his presence and had indicated that he would not in any way interfere with the advantages which it was hoped to realize through the use of a constant group of sitters for these teleplasmic experiments. On the 28th, De Wyckoff and I were present after the same procedure of specific invitation by Walter. The record by Crandon:

Walter came through promptly but did not do much talking. Almost at once a brilliant ball of light four inches in diameter with black streaks through it as though it were convoluting, appeared from Margery’s chest and made its way to the table top, and from there made repeated bouncing excursions up and down, but never twice in the same path. It was then apparent that Walter was working on this sphere of light to differentiate out of it certain structures. He kept up some talk throughout the exhibition; and finally, about 9:15, we were able to see, on the side of the ball of light remote from Margery, a definite skull with jaws open. The diameter of this skull was not over 2½ inches; the orbit, nose-holes and mouth were clearly visible to each of us except Bird. In turn it was directed on each of us so that each could study it; and all saw it, those outside the circle [De Wyckoff and Bird] less well than those inside. When one complained that he could not see the skull clearly, there came from Margery’s chest a kind of canopy, frame, or background, brilliantly lighted, precisely like those seen around Hope’s psychic extras. This attached itself to the skull and illuminated it so all could see it.

I should have had to be present more than once under approximately similar conditions before I could comment, with confidence, upon the very much lower level taken by my observations than by those of the others present on this evening. The ball of light on the table was unmistakably visible to me but to me it was extremely faint and of vague outline most of the time. My impression at the time was that this could very well be because I was considerably further from the object than anybody else, and because it was perhaps fainter, or wholly dark, on the side toward me. Adler and Conant, sitting in the circle on the same side, in general terms, with me, could largely overcome this (hypothetical) one-sidedness of the luminous object by leaning forward above it; this I could not do because of the obstruction by their chairs and shoulders. When he made a particular effort,
presumably by turning the object, Walter was able to give me better visibility, but I did not at any stage see anything which I could honestly describe as more than vague dark striations in the faintly luminous mass. It is noteworthy that De Wyckoff's observations for some time were similar to mine; but that Walter was able ultimately to make him see substantially what the others saw. Some readers will doubtless lay this up to suggestion; but De Wyckoff's station was considerably less remote than mine, and in a considerably different direction. With reference to the "canopy" effect of the record, my position would seem to be less unique; one would suppose that I should have been able to see what any other sitter saw objectively. It seemed to me that the brilliance and illuminating power attributed to this part of the psychic apparatus were greatly exaggerated, perhaps in accord with a general tendency of Walter's more immediate friends to attach superlatives to his work. It is difficult, in any event, to understand how further illumination of this precise character would make more visible a faintly self-luminous object with darker mottlings. I wondered at the time whether this supplementary cloud effect did not rather represent a momentary visibility of some connecting structure that was present all the time, bridging the gap between the psychic and the teleplasmic mass on the table.

This séance had a termination which is, I think, wholly unique in psychical literature—superficially, at least, it was cut short by an earthquake! The record is adequate so far as concerns the facts, though a bit foggy about their exact sequence.

At 9:20 Margery came suddenly out of the light trance in which she had been all the evening, and Walter [very abruptly] said: "Good night, I've got to go now, quick." The light was turned on at 9:23, and at about that moment an earthquake shock was felt which lasted about two minutes.

There was disagreement among the sitters as to when the shock was first felt. The consensus of judgment was that no actual tremor was observed before Walter's "good night"; but that the first vibration of the house came almost immediately thereafter. The Weather Bureau places the shock from 9:22 to 9:24. The quake was a mild one, and we were not sure whether it was really that, or an explosion, or perhaps only very heavy traffic on Beacon or Charles St.; until we found it impossible to get a telephone connection with any
of the local observatories or weather bureaus, and were informed by
the obliging central operator that the earthquake was the reason for
the continually busy wires. The *prima facie* suggestion would obvi-
ously be that Walter, whether cryptesthetically or hyperesthetically
I would not venture to guess, sensed what was coming and feared the
effects upon the entranced medium or the psychic structures, or both.
If one could but produce meteorological phenomena to order one might
obtain an interesting series of parallelisms between them and the
behavior of the Psychic and her controls. In the present instance, the
question might be raised whether Walter is not in the habit of leaving
quickly and unceremoniously, as though called away by important con-
siderations of some sort; and accordingly, whether his present conduct
was in any significant way different from his habitual behavior. As a
matter of fact, however, while he very often stops the action of the
séance rather suddenly and unexpectedly to start the business of saying
“good night,” it is not usual for him actually to go so quickly; he
very often hangs on, engaged in conversation, for as much as ten
minutes after one gains the first impression of his impending departure.
The sudden announcement that he must go followed by his instant going
is altogether out of his habit. Further, a number of us went through
the motions of sitting on the following night, March 1st; but after half
an hour we adjourned without any indication of Walter’s presence.³

On the 2nd, however, he continued the program with utmost vigor:

The physical phenomena then began. The little three-inch
skull appeared on the table, brilliantly illuminated from behind.
We could hear the bones of it hit the table, then Walter would turn
it over and pound its lighted canopy on the table and that sound
was soft. Walter said that this skull was a kind of foundation,
that he was going to clothe it with flesh and features and then blow
it up to man’s size; and he added satirically: “I shall fill it with
lung and then blow it up.” From the lighted mass on the table there
kept springing up a three-foot column of light almost in shape
like a human phantom, having three brighter but poorly defined
zones at top, middle and bottom. This column not only lifted high
above the table, but moved laterally with lightning-like speed. It
would entirely disappear, reappear, then gradually disappear.

Following this séance there ensued a visit to New York; and when
Walter was again present in Lime Street, on March 8th, he layed over

³ See open reference No. 4, in Vol. 2.
the teleplasmic program, as indicated above, on the ground of the Psychic's physical condition. When he again began to show teleplasmic effects, they were representations of a hand rather than of a head, and their consideration may be deferred until another chapter. In the interval between the "talking head" manifestations and those taking the form of hands, there ensued several séances at which there was nothing except ordinary telekinesis and conversation with Walter. The first suggestion of an attack from a new quarter upon the problems of teleplasmic materialization is found in the record for March 12th. The record gives no information about control. Practically the only action which it records is this:

Walter ordered the two luminous doughnuts off the table, whereupon he produced from Margery's body a very brightly illuminated mass like luminous cheesecloth, which came out into a ball on the table, rolled around, exhibited convolutions, and lifted up into the semblance of a phantom three feet high.

On the 13th Margery "was still suffering from frontal sinuses and had just received a second subcutaneous injection of antitoxin. She was ill but insisted upon sitting"; there was no continuance of the new luminous manifestation. On the 14th, however, we have it again:

A light four or five inches in diameter came from Margery's chest, landed on the table, and stretched out to upwards of thirty inches. When so stretched, its upper and lower poles were its brightest parts. ... Throughout this sitting, whenever any physical phenomena occurred, Richardson controlled both Crandon's hands and Margery's right. Goodall maintained control of Margery's left hand throughout. ... Strict conditions of control as already described were maintained during all these phenomena.

Again on the 16th, with no record of control, there was a brief physical display with lights rising in the form of a small phantom, to a height of three feet above the table. In my presence on the 22nd, control of Crandon and Margery throughout the séance was in one way or another entirely in the hands of the De Wyckoffs and myself; there were a few weak attempts at lights but Walter said his force was small. On the 25th, with "all physical phenomena done under

---

4 See the complete record, p. 53.
full control” of the two Crandons by Hale and Mrs. Richardson, and with the additional precaution of luminous head-bands and anklets on the Psychic, there were observed “some beautiful light phenomena, making a ball of light on the table develop upwards of 24–30 inches.” And on the 27th, with control similarly in the hands of Arkin and Mrs. Litzelmann throughout the séance, “there were a few light phenomena and the sitting then closed rather abruptly.” One is left at some loss for an interpretation of these light effects. Presumably they are to be regarded as having something to do with the teleplasmic evolution. The obvious weakness of this statement is its horrible generality; but if it is the best we can do, this need not deter us from making it.

The topical treatment employed in this text as in M. M. requires for the better part no particular comment. Evidently one of the results of such treatment is the complete separation, in so far as the facts of the sittings permit it, of the teleplasmic and the telekinetic aspects. We shall find, in 1925–6 as in 1923–4, that the mediumship is predominantly a telekinetic one, with episodes properly recognizable as teleplasmic occurring only at intervals and under some direct provocation. It may therefore be in order to indicate here that the reader interested in pursuing in connected narrative the teleplasmic aspect to which the present and preceding chapters have been devoted may turn next to Chapter V; and that at the end of that chapter he will find further references to facilitate his pursuit of the teleplasmic theme.
CHAPTER IV

Informal Tests of the Walter Voice

By the Editor, and from the Séance Records

An outstanding feature of Margery's mediumship has always been the vocal phenomena; nobody can possibly attend without having actively presented to him the question whether this is really an independent voice, and the enormous implications which an affirmative answer thereto would carry. Chapters XI and XXXVII of M. M. summarize alike the history of this question, and my own exposure and reactions to it. I believe that I was justified in the attitude that the other immediate physical problems came first, that I did not have time to consider the vocal problem until some of these had been in some way resolved, and that I might therefore with propriety make a working hypothesis about the Walter voice and lay this hypothesis aside for resurrection and test at some undefined future date.

Dr. Richardson, however, with his more easy and more frequent attendance and his medical viewpoint, found the vocal question the most intriguing of all the problems presented by the mediumship; and the one upon which he, as a scientist, might most profitably concentrate his attention. Though he has no official connection with any organ or organization of research, he is without question the most competent in the scientific sense of all the frequent sitters. So, more or less automatically, there grew up the convention of regarding him as the sitter whose wishes should receive most attention after Walter's and Crandon's had been met, and in whose hands might best be left any continuity of program in the scientific development of the sittings. The net result of all this was that, following hard on the Dingwall sittings, Richardson started and for some months pursued a systematic examination of the vocal phenomena. This took two directions: a study of the mechanical means, presumably of teleplasmic character, of voice production,¹ and an attempt to borrow from Scientific American procedure and demonstrate the physical independence of the voice from the Psychic's vocal apparatus, without further question as to what its mechanical status really was.

¹ See Chapters XVI, XX.
The water tests of Chapter XI of *M. M.* and the tests, with hand control of the Psychic’s mouth and other mouths present, of Chapter XXXVII, offer initial suggestions for procedure. I have already discussed the philosophy of this situation, and explained why Richardson’s ultimate program was shaped along the lines of mechanical mouth control; this argument I need not here repeat. The first idea which he tried to work out involved the use of a toy balloon, to be inflated and held in the Psychic’s mouth while Walter spoke. One’s initial impression would be that this might afford a valid control, through the hope that the whistle in the mouthpiece of the balloon would come into play if the Psychic’s mouth were sufficiently diverted from holding the balloon to be used for speech. In any event, it would be a preliminary attack upon the problem; modification or complete overthrow of the program could come as the result of experiment.

The first experiment, then, was made in the séance of February 16th, 1925. The balloon-whistle used was the ordinary five-cent toy familiar to us all. It lay in the Psychic’s lap when the séance opened, and presumably remained there while Walter chatted extensively on various topics. Toward the end of the séance “he said suddenly: ‘Why, what is this?’ and the balloon whistle sounded above the Psychic’s head.” This phenomenon, even though constituting a diversion of the balloon from its original purpose, and therefore open to attack as a begging and fogging of the issue, would be of extreme interest if we only had a more adequate description of it; for plainly the blowing of a current of air through the whistle, or even the holding of the normally inflated balloon followed by a release, is something a little beyond ordinary telekinesis.

The next mention of the balloon-whistle is found in the record for March 11th. Discussing with Richardson the plans for use of this instrument, Walter suggested an improvement: let each sitter have a balloon, paint a big luminous cross on each, then let all sitters (and the Psychic) inflate their balloons and hold them so with the tongue while Walter went on talking. In the dark, it would seem probable that collapse of any balloon would then be visible as well as audible; while Walter held out the further hope that he might be able to do this stunt in red light, or to permit the light to be turned on without warning while he was doing it, thus disclosing all the balloons in their

---

1a This instrument recurs on pp. 48, 58; but in another use.—J. M. B.
3 To dispose of all possible confederacy.—J. M. B.
proper places and properly blown up. When the balloon was again tried out in the séance room, it was under less ambitious conditions. The record for March 31st tells us:

Under Walter's instructions, the Psychic took the penny whistle in her mouth, blew it up to full capacity, stuck her tongue in the pipe, and so held the balloon distended. Then Richardson said: "Walter, now say 'David dug a deep trench.'" Whereupon Walter immediately replied: "David dug a devilish deep trench;' and on request for the same thing again: "David dug a damned devilish deep trench." The voice came apparently from above the Psychic's head. There was no squeak from the balloon, and the luminous cross on its frontal surface showed it to remain distended. After the test, the air was released with the usual prolonged squeal. The Psychic's hands were under control during this test and it seemed to all sitters that the enunciation by Walter was even more distinct than usual.

Tests made on several occasions by all of us showed it to be impossible to substitute lip for tongue to keep the balloon distended. Neither is it possible, apparently, for the tongue to tuck a piece of chewing gum into the pipe to keep the balloon distended. Assuming that Crandon released the Psychic’s right hand, it is apparently not in any way possible for a distended balloon with pipe plugged by the tongue to be shifted to the fingers without an escape of air to cause the squeak. Therefore, while it is obvious that the test is not 100 per cent scientific, there was no doubt in the minds of all sitters that the voice had been demonstrated to be independent of the Psychic’s vocal organs.

The test was then made again at Walter's suggestion; and while he was speaking, Richardson was told to put the back of his hand against the distended balloon which was in the Psychic’s mouth. He reported the balloon to be distended; no sound came from it; and the luminous cross in its proper shape could be seen by all.

During the above sitting, Walter promised Golding that on the following evening he would add variety to the independent-voice tests

---

4 This sentence having been constructed to involve free use of labial consonants such as d, t, ch.—J. M. B.
5 A useful check.—J. M. B.
6 By Richardson and Crandon.—J. M. B.
7 Before the seance—J. M. B.
8 The record makes no showing with regard to examination of the whistle, prior or subsequent to the test.—J. M. B.
by permitting a water test. The record for April 1st shows that he
made good:

Walter came through in five minutes and apparently in ex-
cellent spirits. There had been prepared on the table a small glass
empty and a big glass two-thirds full of water. Walter said
almost immediately: "Ha! Whiskey!" Then we heard water
pouring. The light was turned on, with permission, and the small
glass was found full of water. It was emptied⁹; then in the dark-
ness the same phenomenon was repeated. Then under instructions
the Psychic filled her mouth with water from the big glass, and
under these conditions Walter said: "David dug a devilish deep
trench." He then whistled long and more loudly than usual.

The record adds, at this point: "A perfect test of the true inde-
pendence of the voice." This it obviously was not. The use of a
second glass is so that a measured amount of water may be taken in,
and this amount checked up when the subject returns it after the test.
The diversion of the second glass from this use, plus the failure of
the record to specify anything about hand control, would have to be
remedied before the quoted comment would be in any degree justified.

The obvious and admitted dependence upon Crandon's unaided
control makes it of little point to attempt any critical discussion here,
save as a pointer for future experiment. One fact may, however, be
stressed, in view of the facility with which certain performers are able
to whistle through the nose. Mouth control of almost any type, what-
ever its value when Walter speaks, has no serious significance when he
merely whistles.

Walter now forgot all about the balloon test for the time, and
for several evenings pursued the water test in the direction of increased
rigor. Thus this test was repeated on the 3rd (April), and in the
repetition the criticisms immediately above were met. The record
tells us:

Walter came in about ten minutes in excellent spirits. He first
did the water test to prove the independence of the voice. The
Psychic filled her mouth with water, after which Walter said with
great distinctness: "I have dug a deep trench for mine enemies,"
and then whistled beautifully. The Psychic then ejected the water
into a measuring glass, and it was found to be the same amount

⁹ By the sitters.—J. M. B.
that she had taken in. Perceiving apparently that Costikian was not wholly convinced, Walter then instructed us to have everyone fill his mouth with water and repeat the test. This was done; and he spoke and whistled with equal ease and distinctness. This was most impressive to all because before the sitting everyone had tried speaking and whistling with mouth filled with water, and all had found it impossible.

The water test had been given on April 2nd, at the Richardson residence (see page 70); it was repeated on the 4th, in Lime Street:

Walter instructed us to proceed on the water test of the independent voice. Martin had tried before the sitting, to test the impossibility of one’s normally speaking or whistling with mouth full of water.

The Psychic’s mouth was filled with water, taking all the water there was in the [secondary] whiskey glass. The original big [reservoir] glass of water was put, under Walter’s instructions, by Martin behind his own chair. The empty whiskey glass to receive the rejected water later, was put in Martin’s pocket. The light was then put out and Walter spoke, saying “Hello! Do you hear that? David dug a devilish deep trench.” He then rapped three times on the cabinet as a signal to put on the light and let the Psychic empty her mouth. This she did, bringing forth the same amount she had taken, about two-thirds of the capacity of the whiskey glass.10

This record is to be recognized as a very satisfactory one; it can be attacked only on the ground that it falsifies, or that hand control of the Psychic was relaxed to permit her to use a rubber bulb or something of the sort as a temporary receptacle for the water. I think the water test in its very nature remains open to these alternatives so long as it is not conducted in full light. Assuming that it cannot be (as in fact it was not ever) so conducted, we have got as far with it as we can ever get; except that by citing its repetition before new sitters we to some degree make more difficult the two explanations which remain open. It was so repeated, on April 5th, on which occasion there came, in what appeared to be a female voice, the sharp query from the cabinet: “Don’t you hear the voice?” to which Walter

10 Richardson joins with Crandon in the oral statement to me that this returned water was unmistakably free from all trace of the stomachic content and stomachic odor which would necessarily be present following regurgitation.—J. M. B.
INFORMAL TESTS OF THE WALTER VOICE

at once added: "That's Nannie," 11 The voice was also credited with being louder here than at any previous water test. The record speaks of "strict control conditions," without further specifying what these were. I suppose we are privileged to interpret the remark in the light of the record of April 4th, showing as this does the appreciation of what control is necessary in connection with the water test.

After a blank on April 7th, in the presence of Mr. Roy Holmyard of Cincinnati, a prominent member of the American Society with much experience here and abroad, a successful sitting on the 8th resulted in Holmyard's being exposed to the water test:

He then gave Holmyard and the other strangers the water test for the independent voice, with great brilliancy and under strict conditions. The strangers had tried it on themselves before the sitting. The Psychic took two-thirds of a whiskey glass of water into her mouth; the empty glass was given to Holmyard, and the big glass was put by Holmyard on the floor behind his chair.

Further narrowing of the residual possibilities of fraud was sought on April 10th, for which date we are told:

Then Walter proceeded with the water test of the independent voice. The Psychic's clothes were searched for receptacles, and Millea put in his pocket the empty glass from which she had taken the water. After her mouth was full and the light was out, Walter proceeded to sing a song [of his own composition] and to make several other remarks with perfect distinctness; and he threw in a whistle for good measure. The Psychic then ejected the same amount of water taken in.

On the 11th, in what one judges to be the most satisfactory of all the water tests to date, an approximation was made to its prosecution in the light. Another program had been planned, but Walter receded from this:

The implication was that the conditions were not favorable for hand-making, but he announced that he would settle the question of the independent voice by a clear-cut test. Accordingly the Psychic went into trance, this being accomplished almost instantaneously; and in this condition she filled her mouth from the small glass of water which Crandon held to her lips. Martin placed the empty glass in his pocket, and Walter then whistled and spoke

11 A deceased relative of one of the sitters.
with exceptional cleverness. He then said: "You may turn on the red light, but don't go poking about in the cabinet. Don't worry about the medium. Her instinct protects her." This last was thought to refer to the possibility of her choking while in trance with a mouthful of water. Later he said: "She could not have choked because I took away her swallowing apparatus." Red light was on until after she had ejected the water.

On April 12th, he again gave the water test, the record citing the performance only by title. Much the same may be said of another repetition of this test which was staged on April 18th, only the presence of Walton making the incident of more than ordinary interest. And after this date, we find nothing further to record in the way of voice tests until we come to Richardson's formal attack upon the problem of a mechanical control for the Psychic's mouth, as chronicled in Chapter XX.

12 May we not assume the presence of trance to have been the determining factor permitting this?—J. M. B.
CHAPTER V

The Teleplasmic Hand

By the Editor, and from the Séance Records

As we have seen,¹ the first series of teleplasmic manifestations following Dingwall’s departure fell into character with the attempted materialization of the “talking head” which had marked his later séances. In early March Walter suspended this,² and the only teleplasmic suggestion of the few séances immediately following lay³ in certain marked luminous effects free from anatomical context. The first suggestion of a new chapter in the teleplasmic sequence antedates the older chapter, going back as far as February 23rd. On this date the record tells us that there was seen “outlined against the luminous doughnut ⁴ the shadow of the finger-like processes” with which Walter works. The following night, “in all the work on this luminous apparatus,⁴ Walter’s terminal was seen like a black-pointed mitten, and frequently was seen to be at the end of a long black arm coming from the direction of Margery’s body.”

This systematic silhouetting effect is now for the first time met in Margery’s séance-room because it is only now that we have free illumination of the articles used in telekinesis. Of old, luminous paint was employed regularly on the ends of the curtain pole, and occasionally in other connections; and very occasionally, one of Walter’s own psychic lights afforded means for the silhouetting effect. But the psychic terminals, whatever their character, were projected and used for the most part in absolute darkness. Doubtless it was with the very intent of provoking this shadowgraphing effect that Dingwall introduced the luminous doughnut and the luminous basket, and painted luminous bands around the ends of the megaphone.⁴ The result was immediate, as his own records show; and of course the silhouetting of the terminals against the bright backgrounds continued after his departure, with the continued use of his apparatus and technique. The effect continues to be chronicled, in some but not all of the sittings at which telekinesis occurred; a typical entry being that for April ⁴th,
in which the description of telekinetic effects is accompanied by the statement: "Several times during the work on the luminous objects the black outline of the terminal could be plainly seen by all."

At this stage, there was resurrected, for rather persistent use, an instrument which had been met only casually in Margery's séance room of prior dates. Two rectangular slabs of cardboard, the one 19 x 10 inches and the other 12 x 10, were completely coated, on one face of each, with luminous paint, and at the séance of April 11th were introduced to Walter. The idea was to leave them flat on the table, where Walter, by passing his terminal over or placing it upon them, could produce the silhouette effect. In practice, he was rather more likely than not to pick up the "plaques," as they came to be called, and carry them about the room telekinetically. Even in doing this, however, owing to the complete illumination of the entire surface, the silhouetting of the grasping member was by far of more interest than the mere levitation; so I catalog such action here rather than elsewhere. The record for the 11th tells us:

He then gave an exhibition of his terminal, as seen over the illuminated plaque, both large and small: his "arm" and "finger" were plainly visible. He carried the plaque all around the table, at different angles, and nearly across to Donnell, saying that the latter's psychic force helped him to move it so far.

Again on the 12th we have a record from which the following excerpts are pertinent in the present connection:

All the rest of the phenomena of the evening were done under double control: Goodall having both the Psychic's hands, Miss Pierce both Crandon's hands and his head. The luminous plaque was used. Walter lifted it, waved it all over the region of the top of the table as high as two feet above the table, and constantly we could see the outline in black of his thumb and terminal as he held the plaque. The control was irreproachable.

On April 18th, we are told, "Walter's visible terminal was seen in shadow over the illuminated plaque." Again on the 19th the same phenomenon is mentioned by title only; and continuous double control

---

4 See page 47.
5 The quotes are not mine, they occur in the original record, to indicate that these are terms merely descriptive of the visual effect, and not actual claims as to the character of what was seen.—J. M. B.
6 See open reference No. 5, Vol. 2.
is stated to have been in effect. The record for the 20th goes more into detail:

After some good whistling and personal chat, Walter said: "I have a new idea. Leave the light going and all of you go downstairs for ten minutes; then perhaps I will do something for you." This was done; and on our return Walter directed the luminous plaque to be put on the table. Then under strict conditions of control of the Psychic’s head, hands and feet, Walter’s hand came out over the luminous plaque and played for ten minutes as it might on a piano, keeping time to his whistling of a jig tune. The hand was relatively crude, with short fingers. It was a right hand, and resembled the one we have seen and photographed in red light.

Again on the 21st, under control which is described in detail in another place, the static silhouette was given:

The luminous plaque, laid horizontally, was then used to show the complete silhouette of Walter’s right hand, visible to and described by all. It was a somewhat crude hand, with short fingers, but the fact that it was a right was obvious to all. The plaque was then held successively by Dennett and Adler, bent, lifted, and pulled away from them [by Walter].

The next repetition of this phenomenon was before the same very small and wholly friendly audience to which it had first been offered. The date was April 23rd, and the record reads:

He then proceeded to show us his hand again over the luminous plaque. It was a right hand, with short fingers. The sulcus between thumb and forefinger was very deep, the whole closely resembling the hands seen in the Dingwall sittings and likened by McDougall to “surgically manipulated animal lung tissue.” In other words it was not a human hand but obviously a crude attempt at a hand. It was very lovely, however, and played a merry tune to Walter’s whistling, using the fingers as they would be used on a piano. Crandon remarked that the little finger looked distorted

7 Of course only Adler and Crandon were available for this.—J. M. B.
8 In the Dingwall séances; see the photographs of Chapter II.
9 I incorporate this passage of the original record with full knowledge that it will be regarded by hostile critics as showing an incorrect mental attitude on Crandon’s part; and with some sympathy for this criticism. See M. M., p. 219, where I remark upon the adjectives habitually applied by Crandon to Walter’s whistling. For Crandon’s comment here, see open reference No. 6, Vol. 2.—J. M. B.
and dead. Walter replied: "Yes; if I had more force I could make the hand perfect."

On the 24th, after the hand had been seen in incidental silhouette on the circular platform of the Dingwall bell-box, the set demonstration of the silhouetting was put on:

Walter then asked for the luminous plaque, and bent and twisted it while it was held by Andrews, his terminal being seen pulling and holding the edge of the plaque. The plaque was then put on the far west corner of the table and Walter put his whole hand out over it—obviously a right hand with short fingers, more or less crudely formed—and there went through the motions of piano playing.

This, of course, begins to be important. We have for the first time the possibility of seeking outside testimony that this silhouetted object was of the form of a crude hand, was alive, was apparently not the Psychic's hand or foot. This possibility arises again in connection with the séance of the 25th; and in addition, the psychic student meets there the further complication of trance:

The Psychic had no supper and was entirely disrobed except for a bathrobe and stockings. She was searched by Mrs. Fessen-den before the sitting. Walter came through at once, and immediately asked to have the Scientific American bell-box put on the table; then he immediately ordered it off again. A rustling sound was heard in the Psychic's lap. Walter then asked for the luminous plaque to be put on the table, and almost immediately showed the shadow of his complete right hand and wrist above it. It was then discovered that the Psychic was in trance. Martin was instructed to feel the hand, which now rested on the plaque. In the dark he did so, describing it as cold (about 40° Fahrenheit) and soft like a baby's hand.

I presume the rustling in the Psychic's lap will here be taken, alike by proponent and opponent of the hypothesis of validity, as indication that the hand was something independent of the Psychic's four normal extremities, and that it was actually brought forth in the fashion

10 See page 118.
11 As remote from the Psychic as could be, and in the region occupied by the strangers, Andrews and the Hales.—J. M. B.
which Dingwall described in his records and which so well comports with both hypotheses. It is not, then, especially pertinent to cite the presence of stockings, save as these would prevent the feet from being used to manipulate the extra hand; and it is pertinent to lament the absence of recorded independent motion by the hand. The record goes on with a most interesting further description of visibility of the hand in red light, but independent movement apparently continued to be lacking:

Something was heard in the dark to flop on the table like a fish-tail, and then under Walter's instructions dim red light was given. All sitters saw a rather poorly formed right hand and forearm, pinkish white in tint and covered with an obviously human-appearing skin. No finger-nails could be identified. The forearm appeared shrunken like that of a famine victim. The total length of hand with forearm was some fifteen inches; and at the edge of the table it was connected with a cord extending down into the opening in front of the Psychic's robe and toward her abdomen. Then under instructions each sitter felt of the hand, squeezing it as much as he wanted to. Walter particularly told us to feel the bones in the middle and little fingers. Crandon described it as being obviously a phalanx, with shaft and a large knob at each end. Each finger contained two of these, but not three. The ends of the fingers were soft, there was no bone in the body of the hand itself, and apparently none in the forearm. In fact the whole materialization seemed to be that of a hand containing some but not all of the bones. The skin was soft and had the usual wrinkles; no veins appeared. On Mrs. Fessenden's exclaiming: "My, how cold it is." Walter's reply suggested that this was to be expected.

I may here remark that this coldness, continuing long after the production of the hand, affords one of the major obstacles to the belief that this is a normal artificial object, brought forth from the obvious locus of anatomical concealment. One adverse critic was sufficiently impressed by this argument to postulate a refrigerating instrumentality of some sort, which remained concealed in the region whence the hand came!

The record (still of April 25th) now passes on to action which offers a large hope that there was really involved an independent motion

---

12 The human hand contains three in each finger.—J. M. B.
13 Doubtless because of the missing third phalangeal bone.—J. M. B.
of the hand. Although the next paragraph might well be regarded as part of the bell-box chapters, I give it here for two reasons: it seems equally to belong here, and with it here we may present the complete record of this interesting and important séance all in one place:

Then on request the bell-box 14 was again put on the table, in a position the other side of the end from the Psychic. 15 The light was put out. Ten seconds later we heard a flop again; and when the light went on the hand was on top of the box flapper, bent at the wrist, the forearm hanging down the Psychic's side of the box and the table; Walter having moved the box so that its edge was at the Psychic's edge of the table. In the red light the hand then rang the bell-box. In the dark, Walter next said he would ring the bell a requested number of times. Then with the light on, Walter with the visible hand rang the bell-box the number of times requested by Martin; and then, after a brief period of darkness, again in the light the number of times requested by Mrs. Fessenden. The box rang only when requested. Walter asked Crandon to make the spring stronger; Crandon replied that it was not necessary for evidential purposes. "Very well," said Walter, "I'll do it myself." And he apparently did it, for next time we saw the bell ring the excursion of the flapper was greater than before. 15a

After five seconds of darkness, we observed again in the red light that Walter's hand had seized the luminous basket, and then in the red light we all saw his hand move the basket and tip it over. In the next red light, we found that Walter had put the luminous doughnut on the finger of the visible hand; and in red light he then waved it to and fro.

Following Martin's request, Walter's hand was thrown on top of Martin's. Later it was thrown over to cover Martin's hand combined with the Psychic's, near the west wing of the cabinet and not over the table. This 16 was then shown us in bright red light.

Then following instructions, Martin took the luminous doughnut between his left thumb and forefinger. In bright red light, Walter's hand took the doughnut from him between his thumb and

---

14 Scientific American model; see p. 116.
15 This is the way the record reads: Crandon in May, 1927, says that it means on the side of the table remote from the Psychic, and at the corner, on that side, which was slightly further from her than its mate.—J. M. B.
15a Cf. the theory of fraud outlined on p. 119.—J. M. B.
16 The position finally attained; not the action of attaining it.—J. M. B.
forefinger, and waved it twice in air. After this Walter remarked: 17 . . .

The Psychic then came out of trance, and Walter sang and whistled and answered questions by Mrs. Fessenden and told us about fourth-dimensional 18 ethics. He said there are only two sins there: suicide, and hurting the other fellow.

The above record is complete, save for Walter’s thrusts at Worcester and McDougall which I have deleted from public presentation. And again on the 28th, before a different group of sitters, there occurred a séance revolving so wholly about the presence and behavior of the materialized hand that we may present in this place the entire record, minus such of Walter’s conversation as may need to be suppressed:

The Psychic was disrobed except for bathrobe and stockings. Walter came through in about five minutes, in cheerful mood. He talked with us for about ten minutes, and said he was going to try to show us phenomena in red light. Thereupon, trance came on.

Within two minutes Walter called for red light, his voice coming between the snores of the Psychic. The dim red light revealed a white hand, crudely formed, on the Psychic’s edge of the table. It was a right hand; the palm was shrivelled and the fingers were not in good proportion. The thumb was toward the west. Later in the sitting it was obviously a left hand, palm down, with thumb to the east. Throughout the sitting the control of the Psychic’s two hands was unbroken and these hands could be seen plainly during all the red-light periods. In about the third period of exposure of the hand to five seconds of red light, it had been shoved further out upon the table until, with the forearm, it measured some fifteen inches in length. The only movements we saw of it as a whole were toward the Psychic, and were always accompanied by tremors of the cord. The cord was round and twisted like stick candy; an inch and a half in diameter. 19 In red light each sitter was allowed to feel of the fingers, and each was directed to feel the phalangeal bones in each finger. There were apparently

17 I take the liberty of expunging his remarks, which were most uncomplimentary to certain former sitters.—J. M. B.
18 Crandon and Walter both regard Walter as living in a four-dimensional world.—J. M. B.
19 Almost certainly an over-estimate. I find a large tendency to under-estimate small fractions of an inch in the seance room, and to overshoot the mark on dimensions of an inch or two. Crandon agrees with all this.—J. M. B.
two, not three, in each finger, but none in the palm or forearm.\(^{20}\) In all we were given twenty-five exposures to bright red light, varying from three to twenty seconds. We were told to feel the skin. It was thick and soft, but had every feel of human skin. It could be lifted off the subcuticular tissues. In the dark the hand was flopped over on the hands of Dennett, Mrs. Yerxa and Mrs. Dennett successively, palm to palm; and then on two hands combined in red light.\(^{21}\)

To further demonstrate the bony stiffness of the fingers, in the dark the hand went over to Dennett’s right hand holding the Psychic’s left, and Walter’s finger was poked first into the back of Dennett’s hand and then into his palm. Dennett estimated the pressure at a quarter-pound. In long exposure to red light, the hand grew smaller in a kind of shrivelly amebic manner; in the dark it grew bigger again. In no two exposures did it seem to be exactly the same size.\(^{22}\) One disproportionately large middle finger grew out toward Adler.\(^{23}\) The skin always felt cool.

On request, Dennett put his watch and chain on the table. Walter’s hand was then shown clasping this, and later shown again with the watch on the back of Walter’s wrist.\(^{24}\) Walter’s fingers, when they had just picked up something, seemed to be shorter, thinner, and more pointed. In one pose in red light, three fingers were seen poked through the hole in the doughnut. The next time, a thumb was stuck through this whole.

The hand was seen to ring the bell-box \(^{25}\) the number of times requested by Dennett and then by Mrs. Dennett—five and three times, respectively. We could see the excursion of the bell-box flapper as the bell rang, and we could see the cord contracted in, as a whole, as though made up of separate longitudinal fibers.

Walter now said he would show how he did some things in the dark. The big megaphone was placed erect on the table, and the light turned on. The hand was seen on top of the megaphone; it pulled this over to the Psychic’s edge of the table, the hand going

---

\(^{20}\) Thus corresponding closely with the hand of the 25th.—J. M. B.

\(^{21}\) Of what sitters, the record fails to state.—J. M. B.

\(^{22}\) When we have two or three successive exposures with markedly different aspect, Dingwall very justly warns us against too hastily assuming that these are different aspects of the same object; but if we may take this record at its face value, this suggestion would here require altogether too wide a supply of clandestine material.—J. M. B.

\(^{23}\) It is not clear to me whether this is to apply to the entire series of exposures of the hand, the word “grew” being interpreted statically; or whether it refers to a dynamic phenomenon of one or two successive exposures.—J. M. B.

\(^{24}\) Are we to assume that it was a wristwatch?—J. M. B. Yes.—L. R. G. C.

\(^{25}\) Scientific American model.
with it and the two falling together in a heap into her lap. In red light we saw the hand holding the side handle of the big megaphone, and then rolling it back and forth. Trance ended at 10:15.

Walter then sang, whistled and talked. It is a pity that it could not all be recorded; some of his sayings follow:

Never inflict your will on any one else, except an untrained child. It's terrible. Two free wills in a house are better than one. Make harmony your pet; keep it around. Tame it, have music in your home.

When you sit in a chair, twice as much of you as is seen is all around you, making an aura of about a foot in thickness. I make my invisible hand out of the Kid's aura. These sittings are fine preparation for a four-dimensional life. There are two fundamentals in preparing for the next life: telling the truth, and self-control. If your mind is prepared from the first, you will never have to suffer homesickness as I did.

He directed us hereafter to sit only three times a week: Tuesday, Thursday and Saturday; with possibly an informal sitting on Sunday.

On the 29th, a group of the old friends, Brown, Adler, etc., sat in the hope of seeing materialization of the sort recorded above; but Walter came through in ten minutes and said his force was low; that he would be unable to do materialization tonight, but would try to do it on May 3rd for the same group.

For May 1st, an engagement had been made to sit in Lime Street with the Code-Hoagland group from Harvard; and Crandon's record indicates that they were exposed to the materialized hand:

Walter came through with whistle and voice, immediate and strong. He asked if all sitters were instructed as to behavior. Then trance came on.

Damon was told to put his hand on something vaguely seen near the luminous plaque. He did so, and felt four finger-like processes of a mass; cold and firm but soft and clammy. Then Walter ordered red light for three seconds; then in a second period of red light each sitter in order felt and pressed down on the teleplasmic hand. There were four such exposures, and the hand was examined by all sitters. The second time the wrist muscles were felt; another time, the firm core in the wrist was felt by all, and also tendons which slipped under the exploring finger like the

---

26 See Chapter IX.
drumstick of a fowl. The temperature was that of a dead fowl. All believed they felt the tension of tendons; four saw the thumb (near Damon) moved independently; the rest of the mass did not move at the same time. Damon and Hillyer saw two nails on the fingers.

The hand moved in every direction; it moved the luminous doughnut in a circular path with a diameter of some six inches. The palm was shown lifted off the table with acute flexion at the wrist, the finger ends remaining on the table. The wrist in the light extended at an angle of 45°. There were in all about ten exposures in red light showing the teleplasmic hand—the longest of thirty seconds, the shortest of three seconds.

Crandon went to the telephone. Code was told to put the doughnut on the table. He put it on the middle of the table; then Walter made him put it against the teleplasmic hand. The hand then picked it up and turned it over and the thumb and finger grabbed it. Before this the Psychic forced Damon’s right hand in hers down hard on Walter’s hand and said: “It hurts here.” She did this again twice, later. Then Walter asked Hillyer to turn the doughnut bright side up and shove it over toward the teleplasmic hand. Then the hand picked it up again. During all this time Hoagland had the Psychic’s right hand, the one usually held by Crandon; and the Psychic’s head-band was observed constantly by Hillyer. Walter’s hand was put on Hillyer’s.

In the dark, with the Dingwall bell-box, the black hand could be seen ringing it by dropping upon the luminous platform; and at one time, it seemed as though a second psychic structure were in contact with the bell-box top, from Damon’s aspect thereof. The speed of action here prevented absolute verification of Hoagland’s triple control. The bell-box top got stuck and Damon fixed it twice. The weight of Walter’s hand pressed it down sideways, and Walter finally ordered it off the table, in disgust. Then came more work with the luminous doughnut. Then the doughnut was put on the floor by Damon and later was ordered into the basket. Walter’s hand touched Damon, and then the basket with the doughnut in it was levitated and waved about at the height of one foot over the top of the table, and then thrown to hit Hoagland’s right shoulder.

Walter said, in effect: Here’s a message for the Professor. Tell him we have some goats over here with lungs with bones in

27 A totally uninforming statement, of course.—J. M. B.
28 Black in silhouette in the dark.—J. M. B.
29 Of Crandon’s two hands and the Psychic’s right.
them; but over on your side they are not always goats, they are herring-chokers. Tell him we have a modern Hell—oil-burners. Tell him to take his friend Houdini to the Harvard Club again.\footnote{The reference is to one or more occasions on which McDougall entertained Houdini at this Club. Houdini boasted far and wide about it; McDougall confided to some of his acquaintances that he did it because he found Houdini’s psychology so absorbing.—J. M. B.} Tell him I’d have more backbone than that, even if I were a poor fish. McDougall couldn’t do any better without changing the philosophy of a life-time.\footnote{M. M., p. 476.} Tell him the Kid carries equipment in her insides of a little ice-box, a pair of bellows, and six lungs with bones in them. She chews liver for a cud;\footnote{Journal, A.S.P.R., Apr., 1925; p. 198, index (40).} she has insides as big as a cow.\footnote{Etc., etc.; I give this humor only so far as it seems to me to be inoffensive.—J. M. B.}

The above record is given complete, save as indicated. Though drawn by Crandon, it is subject to attack only by showing how the observations which it records could have been provoked, under the conditions recorded, through fraudulent production of the phenomena; for it carries the signatures of all five sitters, all of whom have ultimately rejected in detail the hypothesis of genuineness. It may also be emphasized that when Crandon goes to the telephone, he leaves the room entirely; and that under these conditions the phenomena continued—for how long, we are prevented from saying by the unfortunate failure to record the moment of his return.

On May 2nd, the materialized hand again performed, but only as an incident in a séance of general character; and, so far as I can conclude from the failure of the record to mention onset, emergence, or incidentals thereof, without trance:

Some very fine work was now done with the plaque and the Dingwall bell. Walter repeatedly showed his hand, ringing the bell and drumming on the plaque. The fingers were of unequal length and shape, but unmistakably it was a hand; and five times it was seen to descend upon the platform of the bell and hit it a resounding whack. As it approached the lighted disk each time, it was illuminated on the under side apparently. Walter whistled while the fingers made as if to play on the piano. The plaque was held in turn by Miner and Leavitt, and Walter took it from them, showing plainly his terminal over the edge. . . . All the dark
phenomena were done during double control, plus control of Cran-
don’s head by Leavitt; and the Psychic wore her usual illuminated
head-band and anklets.

On May 3rd, with a wholly friendly group:

Walter said that he could not produce the visible teleplasm
tonight because there were so many nerves around; but he would
do something just as good. Besides his usual brilliant levitations
of the luminous big megaphone, the ring and the basket, he gave
various exhibitions of ringing the Dingwall bell-box, bringing his
whole hand visibly down with force on the top thereof. The hand
was better formed than the one we see in red light; and Walter
said of it: “Yes, that’s the one I use in the paraffin work.” He
picked a handkerchief off the plaque; he showed his whole forearm,
wrist and hand in full length along the plaque.

On May 4th, Walter “showed his whole hand hitting the Dingwall
bell-box twenty times, and showed us his hand over the luminous plaque
five times, perfect in outline—a right hand.” And May 5th brought
another group of friendly sitters, to whom:

Walter said that he could do nothing in the red light tonight,
because his material tonight was gummy or sticky. And sure
enough, when later we had contacts on face and hands the tele-
plasmic hand was very cold and sticky; and when Walter wished
to pick up the luminous doughnut he had only to slap his hand
down on it, and then lift it up adherent to his palm. He then
did some very fine exhibition of the hand over the luminous dough-
nut and plaque. Over the latter the hand could be seen as high
up as six inches above the plaque, waving gracefully, coming down
on the plaque as though playing the piano; while Walter kept up
a lively whistling to fit the motions. He gave numerous contacts
of his teleplasmic hand with all the sitters.

On May 8th, in a séance given mainly to bell-box and telekinetic
work, Walter none the less “proceeded to show in a most wonderful
and distinct manner his whole hand ringing the Dingwall bell-box
by means of the luminous top. This was clear, was repeated nine
times, and was seen by everybody.” Again on the 13th, “he rang
Dingwall’s bell-box showing his hand completely over the luminous
top; and each time it rang with a loud crash. He showed us his hand
as though it were playing a piano, over the luminous plaque.”
For no reason that appears in the records, the luminous silhouetting now ceased for some time to be a feature of the Lime Street séances; though occurring with increasing freedom in the Cambridge séances under the jurisdiction of the young men from Harvard. 34 Similarly for no recorded reason, there came along two séances at which a heavy concentration of psychic lights was observed. On May 30th:

Walter then gave us a psychic light, long and willowy and undulating, rising as high as a continuous column four feet high from the floor, again crumpling like a luminous cloth to the floor. For the most part, the light went over by Mrs. [Richard] Mansfield's left knee; and it there stayed nine minutes, constantly touching and patting her knee.

It was doubtless much the same sort of demonstration that led, in the record for May 31st, to the extremely inadequate statement: "The exhibition of psychic lights was very striking.”

When, as appears usually to be the case in this mediumship, telekinesis is executed through the use of a teleplasmic terminal which is in some degree visible and tangible, it must always be difficult to draw the line between the telekinetic manifestations, and the display of the terminal to the sitters’ sight or to their touch as an end in itself. A good deal of contact between the sitters and the terminals which might reasonably enough be regarded as belonging in the present part of the story, I deal with under the telekinetic heading. But a little above, where the contacts involved a verdict by the sitters as to the apparent consistency of the teleplasm, I have classified the episode in the teleplasmic group. Similarly, we may here incorporate the experience which is described in the record for June 11th, even though it very closely overlaps ordinary telekinesis:

In the dark, Walter did his telekinesis of all the luminous objects with wonderful levitation. 35 As a new act, he put the luminous doughnut on his [teleplasmic] finger and whirled it about. He showed his hand over the doughnut and over the Dingwall bell-

34 See Chapter IX.
35 One can, if one wishes, differentiate between ordinary telekinesis of which motion across the table is typical; and levitation, when the object is actually carried about the room in defiance of gravitation. Telekinesis in general may defy gravity but need not do so; when it does so, if we seek a special name, we find it in levitation, which thus becomes a particular category of telekinesis.—J. M. B.
box top; and he repeatedly touched the three strangers, on request, on their hands. Day also got several touches on the forehead, as did Crandon. He ruffled and pulled the hair of the three strangers at their request. The teleplasm was very cold and gave the sensation of being wet. After one's skin had been touched by it, the cold, moist feeling persisted for several minutes.

On June 15th, we return to the silhouetting of the terminal. The record is a trifle puzzling, making a distinction which might well seem not to exist, and which Crandon agrees with me should not have been made. Presumably the platform of the bell-box was brighter than usual, so that a more clean-cut silhouetting was obtained; also, a closer approach to actual illumination of the hand as it approached the luminous surface. In any event, whatever the precise interpretation we give it, the record tells us, the italics being mine in connection with the foregoing comment:

Walter rang the Dingwall bell-box and we saw not the shadow of his hand but the actual hand—four fingers and thumb—against the luminous platform of the box. A handkerchief was put over the platform to dim it a bit; and Walter held his hand over this and picked up the handkerchief. He said in answer to questions that the hand was connected to the Psychic by an invisible cord. Walter directed Laura Crandon to place her head, face down, on the platform; he then touched her face with his hand. It felt cold and moist.

For June 28th, in place of the more familiar luminous plaque or luminous platform of the bell-box, there had been prepared, for Lime Street use in imitation of Harvard technique, a new luminous coordinate board, with one-inch squares. This was so newly made that the luminous paint was hardly dry; and its use led to the following striking record:

On request Walter put his hand over the coordinate board; it was a right hand and covered squares approximately nine by four inches. This he showed us three times; then he exclaimed: “Dear, dear; there's paint all over my hand.” And sure enough, when he picked up his hand from the board, the fingers and hand were more or less outlined with a smear of the luminous paint. We then had

---

36 A regular part of the telekinetic séances; see p. 50.
37 Described on p. 89; not to be confused with the plaque of p. 32.—J. M. B.
THE TELEPLASMIC HAND

the very interesting experience of seeing Walter’s hand more or less luminous, enabling us to follow its movements. It went quickly toward the floor between the Psychic and Crandon; then it reached way under the table and touched Adler’s left knee and Brown’s two knees, the longest reach being well over five feet from the Psychic’s right shoulder. He then touched every sitter on chin or forehead, touched several hands, and reached up and pulled the cow-bell; all these movements could be followed. He then put his right hand again on the coördinate board; and on request less than a minute later, his left hand. The hand seen all through the evening was apparently complete in all details, with well-rounded fingers and plenty of intelligent motions.

The coördinate board continued in use, although it did not figure in all the sittings of the ensuing weeks; since Walter, in response to the Harvard “exposure,” developed a policy of more red light and less darkness. It appeared in the séance of July 6th, however:

Walter said he was using up his force too much with red light phenomena; he would show us his hand up to the elbow in the dark. This he did first on top of the Dingwall bell-box; then on the coördinate board, held vertically as well as horizontally. He touched both the Hodges, who reported the effect as cold and clammy.

Again on the 10th, Walter “also rang the Dingwall bell-box, showing his terminal”; and “all the phenomena were done under strict double control, plus the luminous wrist-bands, anklets and head-band.” The sittings of July 16th–18th, under my jurisdiction, were devoted in considerable part to a display of the teleplasmic hand; they are recorded separately and in full in Chapter XIV. For the sake of comparison and of a general check-up and estimate on Crandon’s reporting, it may be of interest to quote the following from a memorandum by him, covering the sittings of the 16th and 17th:

The hand was perfectly developed, both a right and a left, and shown in full size and in motion over all the luminous objects. Its measurements were eight by seven inches. Each finger moved separately, both on the table and over the coördinate board held by Bird six inches above the table. At all critical moments of this

38 See record for June 20th, p. 164.
manifestation, Bird had hold of the Psychic's right and Crandon's two hands, and Richardson had the Psychic's left. The luminous bands on the Psychic's five extremities were visible at all times.

The history of the teleplasmic hand during the period covered by the present chapter will be incomplete until the reader has examined the records of my mid-July séances mentioned just above; as well as of the Harvard sittings of Chapter IX, in which the hand played a large rôle. From the date marking the close of the present narrative, the hand ceases to be offered as an end in itself, though often seen incidentally to other manifestations. The reader who is interested in tracing its history should digest first the remarks of pp. 47–8; after which he may find brief mention of the hand on pp. 50 (record for March 14th), 53 (second paragraph), 60 (record for April 19th), 75 (bottom), and 125 (record for June 25th). Such reader may also feel that the hair-rumplings and shoe-removals of Chapter VI involve a tactile experiencing of Walter's terminal by the sitters on a scale justifying their inclusion in the teleplasmic sequence. Chapters IX and XIII, as just indicated, will then carry this sequence through June, 1925, and bring it up to the point where, in Chapters XIV, XV, XVI and XXIV, we have a deliberate and well-staged return, by Walter, to the formal presentation of the teleplasmic side as an end in itself. Further references permitting the reader to pursue this theme without interruption occur at the end of Chapter XXIV.
CHAPTER VI
The Telekinetic Aspect: to July 1st, 1925

By the Editor, and from the Séance Records

The immediately preceding chapters have been devoted entirely to the teleplasmic aspect of the mediumship, from Dingwall’s introduction of this down to an indeterminate date in June–July, 1925. It has however been stated that the telekinetic side was not abandoned; that this continued to be displayed, usually in séances free from teleplasmics but sometimes in parallel with the more abstruse phenomena of newer type.

Dingwall’s contact with the mediumship, however, left on the telekinetic practice almost as indelible marks as in the matter of trance and teleplasmics. His whole attitude, from his very first séance, was that of intense repugnance for any phenomena which Margery had ever produced before, intense desire for new and different manifestations. I have hazarded the guess that this was with the intent, if the case should turn out to be one of fraud, of taking the psychic and her confederates (if any) sharply out of practiced territory. It took the form, after the suggestion of the trance and the teleplasmics, of a complete elimination during Dingwall’s stay of the Scientific American bell-box and the substitution therefor of a mechanical bell-box designed by Dingwall; the introduction of paper “doughnuts” (rings made out of a single sheet of paper, by cutting first a large circle and then cutting the center out of this) and small wicker baskets as objects of telekinesis; and the very free use of zinc sulfide luminous paint in marking these objects for use in the dark.

This brought about, as I have emphasized in Chapter V, a wholly new situation in which telekinesis was often accompanied, almost of necessity, by a silhouetting against a luminous ground of the “terminal” employed by Walter. It also brought about a new era in the telekinetic history of the mediumship. For we now have telekinesis of several entirely new objects; and telekinesis on an entirely new scale of objects that are visible in the dark. At the same time, telekinesis is telekinesis; there is a far greater facility of observation

1 See page 118.
under the new technique, but the process is fundamentally the same. I need not, therefore, in the present volume, detail completely all the telekinetic action at all séances; much of this can be adequately covered if read into the record by title. Also, with the luminous silhouetting, the presence of a materialized end-organ is a more obvious and fundamental part of the telekinetic process than it was before. Observations made, visually or tactually, that serve in any sense to characterize this organ must still be regarded as part of the teleplasmic aspect of the case; but mere visual or tactual observation of its presence may now be set down as details of the telekinetic episodes. We shall have no chapter on psychic contacts as we did in *M. M*.

Among Dingwall's ideas which did not remain permanently with the mediumship was one of placing the séance table, with any objects thereon, in a gauze cage to isolate them from any possibility of normal action. This cage was used once after Dingwall's departure, on February 16th, 1925; the record indicates what happened to it and why it was dropped:

In the Psychic's mouth was a five-cent mouth-balloon which had been suggested by Richardson as a test for independent voice. Walter said he wanted the cage cut in halves, and that he would then work through it easily. Then he said suddenly: "Why, what is this?" and the penny-whistle balloon sounded above the Psychic's head to the great surprise of all sitters. Then Walter said: "Now I will show you a joke. Everyone move a little away from the cage so I can run around." After about five minutes he said: "Well, I must go now. Don't forget to look for your whistle." The sitting closed. Search for the whistle revealed it within the cage in front of the Psychic. Examination of the cage showed that several thumb-tacks had been pulled out; and there were two places where the whistle could have been shoved through. Adler and Crandon state that they did not drop the Psychic's hands at any time. As Walter said, it was only a joke at best, to show that Dingwall's cage was not fraud-proof.

On the 21st, 22nd, and 23rd (February), Walter gave considerable time to the display of his telekinetic powers. I give a paragraph to the details from each of these sittings, in order:

He beat time with the megaphone on the table. He picked up the luminous doughnuts, put one on the end of the megaphone, put

---

2 See page 25.
the big megaphone over the little one, put the whole on the table. He held the megaphone to the mouths of the various sitters, put it on heads and hands, played with it generally, and blew the balloon whistle so hard that the rubber came off.

He wafted in air the larger luminous megaphone, and the smaller one at different times, with undulating horizontal movement over a large area within the circle, holding it in front of J. H. Brown, setting it upright on the table, etc. He and E. W. Brown played ball with the smaller megaphone, Brown sitting at the far center of the circle. Walter hit the megaphone from the table with such force that it landed in Brown's lap. Brown had hardly placed it on the table again when Walter hit it again; and they thus played shuttlecock with it for a time. Walter hit the megaphone also away from Brown, so that it landed on the floor between Mrs. Brown and Crandon. He then moved the luminous doughnuts about on the table and in air, held them in front of J. H. Brown, tossed them over the latter's shoulder, etc.

He picked up the big luminous doughnut with difficulty, doing this much more easily after Crandon bent two or three angles in it. This doughnut was wafted all over the surface of the table, thrown on the floor, picked off the floor and lifted vertically to 18 inches above the table. He then manipulated both large and small luminous megaphones from the floor to the table, and made them sail above and over the table at a height of two feet, with fish-like motions. Both the Bradlees received touches on ankles and legs. During all important manipulations Mrs. Bradley held the two hands of Crandon and Margery's right hand, while Bradlee held Margery's left hand.

February 26th saw a mild epidemic of touches, without further telekinetic accompaniment. Gerke got it on a leg, Adler on his right hand, Crandon on his head. Adler reported that his contact was like that of a powder puff; Crandon described his in terms of a duster or light mop. And all sitters of March 2nd received a firm downward pressure from Walter's terminal.

March 8th found Walter in inventive mood, looking for something different to do with the apparatus of telekinesis. Doughnut, basket, large and small megaphone:

were waved all about over the heads of the sitters. The big megaphone was thrust down upon the head of each sitter in succession
save Margery. Megaphones were snatched out of the grasp of various sitters and hurled across the room in all directions. All sitters except Crandon were invited, one at a time, to put their heads on the table; whereupon the hair and shoulders were stroked by Walter’s terminal. The luminous doughnut was lifted four feet above the table-top, then dropped to the floor and lifted from the floor to a point three feet above the table-top. During the whole séance, whenever physical phenomena were going on, Donnell held both Crandon’s hands and Margery’s right hand; and J. H. Brown held her left hand throughout.

This business of having a sitter put his head on the table (later, often with his nose in the center of the luminous doughnut), to get his hair psychically rumpled, became a regular order of routine with Walter. Comment may also be made upon his often-demonstrated ability to pick up the doughnuts when they lie flat on floor or table. One reason for their introduction was to test this ability. They are not grasped as readily as other and more upstanding objects; grasping often is effected only after sliding the doughnut about the floor or to the edge of the table; but the flatness and thinness are not found to be at all an insuperable obstacle.

For March 10th telekinesis of doughnut and megaphones is mentioned merely by title in the record, without particulars. Immediately ensuing dates gave rise to the following, the record in each instance being quoted verbatim:

Mar. 13th: Walter came through without speaking, but manifested by touch or pull on Hillyer’s trouser-leg, then Marshall’s, then Damon’s right thigh. . . . The large luminous megaphone was put on the table; then with Damon holding Margery’s left hand and Hillyer holding her right and both of Crandon’s, it was pushed across the table into Margery’s lap, lifted from the table and two to three feet above the table, and while aloft moved constantly with fish-like motion. Under the same control it was lifted from the table up over Damon’s head and thrown outside the west wing of the cabinet.

Mar. 14th: The penny-balloon whistle, marked with luminous paint, was on the table initially; it was moved across the table, lifted in air, and dropped. The large luminous doughnut was lifted from the table and dropped on the floor; then lifted thence to the table, a black mitten-shaped terminal being seen grasping it. The large luminous megaphone was rolled away from Margery on the
table, apparently when Walter tried to grasp it; he asked that it be rolled back. It then went two or three feet in the air with fish-like movements; first one end, then the other, was presented to Goodall, Richardson, Mrs. Richardson and Crandon. Mrs. Richardson held the megaphone up horizontally in both hands and Walter lifted it out of her hands and up into the air. He repeated this for Richardson. He whistled a jig tune and the small end of the megaphone danced on the table to this tune. Then with vigorous movement the megaphone was tossed up on to the top of the cabinet. The megaphone was placed over the whistle on the table; then a sound was heard, apparently from within the megaphone, as of blowing up the whistle; then the loud note of the whistle sounded, showing that the balloon must have been much distended and released. The whistle was again blown up while under the megaphone and released still under the megaphone. Throughout the sitting, whenever any physical phenomena occurred, Mrs. Richardson controlled both Crandon’s hands and Margery’s right, and had Crandon’s mouth on her hand. Goodall maintained control of Margery’s left hand throughout.

March 15th: Walter came through with touches on Damon’s leg and on Hoagland. He asked for the big luminous doughnut, pushed it audibly to Margery’s edge of the table, and it dropped to the floor. After a brief time he lifted it to the table-top and higher, then made wild dancing motions with it in air above the table for half a minute. The megaphone was called for, and as last night, it rolled away from Margery, whereupon Walter asked somebody to brace it so that he might pick it up. This done, it sailed all over the area above the table, thirty inches in air and with motion like a big fish or Zeppelin. The small luminous basket was then called for and moved all about the table, lifted four inches and sailed through the air, and finally thrown with great force over toward the northeast corner of the room, landing on the sofa between Mrs. Brown and Mrs. Stinson. Throughout, Hoagland kept constant control of Margery’s left hand; Damon of her right hand and Crandon’s two hands; and Crandon’s mouth was on Damon’s hand. During and at the end of every phenomenon, Hoagland and Damon repeated the precision of their control.

March 16th: Gray was touched on hair, hand and sleeve. The big luminous megaphone was lifted out of Gray’s hands, sailed through the air a distance of about 24 inches from the table, with

---

3 Sic. This presumably indicates a spoken validation of control by Hoagland and Damon at these critical moments.—J. M. B.
the usual fish-like motions, and finally thrown up on the roof of the cabinet. Half a minute later it was thrown down from the roof.

March 19th: Walter came through touching Richardson. Later, Arkin, Richardson and Miss Richardson were successively told each to put his nose in the doughnut\(^4\) on the table, whereupon Walter stroked the hair and patted the shoulder of each. He lifted the doughnuts one at a time from the table, up a foot or less, dropped them on the floor; then with great persistency after several failures picked each up and put it on the table. He lifted the small luminous basket two feet in air, waved it all about, and finally threw it with great force toward Mrs. Stinson in the far corner of the room, landing it on the couch beside her. The big luminous megaphone was placed on the table at Walter’s request. He lifted it and made it travel all around the table like a Zeppelin. He allowed the Richardsons and Adler successively to take hold of it, whereupon he snatched it away. Richardson estimated that he held it with at least fifteen pounds resistance. The megaphone was thrown on the floor, put back by Adler, lifted and hurled with great violence into the space between Margery and Crandon. It hit neither, landing in the southeast corner of the cabinet. The small luminous megaphone was used similarly but with greater speed; used to knock on the table; and finally hurled toward Mrs. Stinson, landing on the sofa beside her. All phenomena were carried on with Richardson controlling Margery’s left hand and Mrs. Richardson controlling her right hand and Crandon’s two hands and face. Margery wore visible anklets and headband.

March 21st: There was brilliant work with doughnuts and megaphones. With the big megaphone particularly, Walter had several sitters try to catch it; others he allowed to hold it, then took it away from them. De Wyckoff, Mrs. Richardson and Mrs. Brians were each told, one after another, to put his nose in the doughnut on the table, after which Walter stroked their hair and patted their shoulders. During all physical phenomena De Wyckoff held Margery’s left hand, while Mrs. Richardson or Mrs. De Wyckoff\(^5\) held both Crandon’s hands and Margery’s right hand, and controlled Crandon’s head. Margery wore luminous anklets and headband, which constantly accounted for these extremities.\(^6\)

\(^4\) It may be understood that the doughnut is always luminous.

\(^5\) The circle was changed during the séance.

\(^6\) I.e., which were at all critical periods reported visible to some or all sitters, in their proper places with relation to the room.—J. M. B.
March 22nd. Walter came through promptly in good spirits; raps and greetings were heard on the east wing of the cabinet near Bird. The illuminated penny-whistle was lifted from the table and thrown to the floor. The doughnut was asked for by Walter, obtained by Bird, and thrown by him on the table. It was lifted from the table; travelled all over the region above the table at a height of some eight inches; and was slipped over the Psychic’s edge of the table, up and down like a rising and setting moon. The basket was then asked for and put on the table by Bird. It was lifted up and over the table and thrown to the floor. The small megaphone was asked for and when obtained was lifted all around with the fish-like effect. Mrs. De Wyckoff was asked to hold it, and it was taken away from her with much force. The big megaphone was then called for, and when obtained was lifted high and exhibited for three or four minutes with beautiful fish-like motions.

Walter then said: “You may put anything in the room on the table, and I will lift it up.” Whereupon J. H. Brown passed along a half-dollar to be put on the table. It was heard to make many raps; then it fell to the floor. Walter said after a few minutes: “Oh, I can’t be bothered with that.” We thought he was excusing his inability to lift it. Later it was apparently felt scratching along the table-leg, the vibrations felt and the sounds heard suggesting this interpretation.

Bird was now instructed to sit within the circle, facing the Psychic. He was told to hold the basket in two hands, at a time when he was holding it on one palm, showing that Walter knew in the dark that only one hand was being used. Bird felt and saw the “terminal” come out and agitate the basket. This occurred several times; then all at once Bird heard something fall in the basket. Walter said that the half-dollar was in the basket: Bird examined the basket and confirmed this. The basket was then taken from Bird’s hands, tipped over, the half-dollar spilled on the table, and the basket finally thrown on the floor. It was brought back, and there ensued a complicated series of motions of the basket, during which Walter several times put it accurately on Bird’s extended hands. Several times Walter instructed Bird to

---

7 This record is largely by me, and in so far as it is not by me and does not deal with elements clearly beyond my knowledge, it has my complete endorsement, barring the one exception which I take on p. 51.—J. M. B.

8 The apparatus was initially on the floor behind the wing of the cabinet, in easy reach from my initial position.—J. M. B.

9 Hard against the table, closer to her than usual for sitters facing her.—J. M. B.

10 The single luminous band was well up toward the top of the basket, and would hardly afford, by silhouette or other means, any indication of how I was holding the basket.—J. M. B.
take the half-dollar out of the basket or put it in, and Bird handled the coin freely on his own initiative. In every case when Walter spoke, there seemed no normal means whereby it could be known to anyone save Bird where the coin was; but in each case the instructions were consistent with the situation as it existed. Also several times Bird was instructed to take the basket in one hand or in two hands, and each time these instructions were pertinent. Several times Walter withdrew the coin or placed it in the basket. Once or more he lifted the doughnut from the floor and placed it in the basket, which was then in Bird’s hands. Once or more Walter’s terminal could be clearly seen outlined against the doughnut. Once when Bird held the basket on his two palms he had the sensation of a touch on his finger-ends, which extended toward the Psychic beyond the edge of the basket. With Bird holding the basket containing the doughnut and the coin, the big luminous doughnut was brought down over the whole assembly; the big end of the megaphone was then tipped in such a way that the basket was spilled out of Bird’s hands into the megaphone. The entire outfit then went into the air as one unit. At one stage, a big psychic structure like a foot or a forearm was felt touching De Wyckoff’s knee and Crandon’s left leg.

Throughout the sitting control was either by De Wyckoff at Margery’s left and Bird in the position between the Psychic and Crandon;¹¹ or else by De Wyckoff of Margery’s two hands and by Mrs. De Wyckoff of Crandon’s two. [After removal of Bird to seat at table, facing the Psychic,] in all these experiments the control was constantly declared to be perfect by the De Wyckoffs.

The period of the above séance during which I sat at the table, facing Margery and engaged in play of various sorts with Walter, lasted more than half an hour; it constituted one of the most striking of all my Lime Street experiences, and I think by all means the most nearly unique. The record of this part of the séance is entirely mine, save for the statement that “in every case” Walter seemed without normal means of gaining the knowledge that he displayed. There were times when such means probably or certainly existed; once, for instance, I had dropped the coin audibly on the table. There were, however, occasions when I had it in my hand or my pocket, or in the basket in my hands, or when I had pretended to lay it in the basket, on which I was

¹¹ For history and description of this technique of control, see M. M., p. 154; as well as numerous subsequent points in the book describing the occasions on which control was exercised in this manner.
very confident that normal means of sensing the situation were lacking to anyone other than myself. Likewise there were moments when I had the basket in one or in two hands; and when Walter was able to say which, without touching it himself.

The physical action of this part of the séance had its focus directly in front of me—so much I could determine from the pulling and tugging on the basket and from the few occasions when the terminal was visible to me. The hands of Margery and her husband were completely accounted for; the circle remained permanently incomplete while the De Wyckoffs controlled without interruption as described in the record. No other sitter could conceivably have got into the theater from which the phenomena were offered. There remains only the fact that the medium’s feet were subject to no organized, continuous control.

She wore stockings, with soft slippers and without luminous control. At various critical moments of the séance I was able to find one or occasionally both of her ankles, shins or knees by groping with my own feet; and occasionally her restless feet would contact with my feet or shins, being then recognizable because they were so softly shod. I was also quite confident at times that there had been a grasping of some séance object or a control of the phenomena, going beyond what could have been achieved with a stockinged foot. To a critic who insists that nothing is impossible for a member that is not under continuous and rigorous control, this séance would prove nothing. To one who is prepared to estimate what is and what is not feasible under any given set of conditions, the fact that the Psychic wore stockings, coupled with the fact that the doughnut was handled as freely and as successfully as any of the other apparatus, ought to go a long way in demonstration of validity. And if the objection be urged that the performance was never repeated I can only answer that if it were done by fraud it ought to be susceptible of repetition with no difficulty; while the cognitive aspects of Walter’s performance on this date are rather analogous to what later became a regular feature of the séances. My own state of mind during the performance was that it was about as intrinsically convincing as anything that had occurred in my presence since the cabinet-smashing episode of June 24th, 1924.

March 25th: Walter then did some wonderful levitation with the doughnut, sailing it all about the table in graceful curves. He then took the luminous basket, lifted it thirty inches above the table, made it sail about, and finally landed it on the floor. Next
he used the big megaphone, which sailed about through the air over the table, then was laid with one end in Hale’s lap and the other end to his mouth. Then both the Hales and Miss Richardson were asked to hold one end while Walter snatched it away from them. Similar phenomena were given with the small luminous megaphone, which was at last thrown across the room toward Mrs. Stinson. The big one was finally thrown with great force between the Psychic and Crandon into the cabinet. Walter then asked that all luminous objects be removed. Asked what to do with the basket, he said to leave it on the table and he would attend to it. This he did by throwing it over toward Mrs. Stinson. All the physical phenomena were done under full control. Hale had both Margery’s hands, Mrs. Richardson had Crandon’s; and Margery wore luminous headbands and anklets.

March 27th: There was an exhibition of his very best levitation all over the table-top from the floor to the table, three feet above the table, with throwing of objects about, all under perfect conditions of control. He had each sitter in turn put his face forward on the doughnut as it lay on the table, and he then stroked the back and hair and patted the shoulders of each. Then he went on to entirely new phenomena. The lacings of Arkin’s left shoe and Crandon’s right were undone, the two shoes taken off; then Mrs. Litzelmann’s right shoe was removed. The removal process was preceded by a lot of pulling on the lace; then a finger-like process would be inserted in the top of the shoe to loosen the lacings; then a firm grasp would push down along the heel, gripping this and pulling the shoe off. Each shoe was then put separately first on the table and later on the floor. Throughout the sitting, from beginning to end, Arkin had Margery’s two hands, Mrs. Litzelmann had Crandon’s two hands, and Margery’s two hands and Margery wore luminous headbands and anklets.

It is a happy circumstance that on this, the first occasion when it was offered, the shoe-untying stunt was carried through to its logical climax in the removal of the shoe, and was prosecuted under such complete control. The extremely small circle gives unusually good assurance against confederacy from within; the specter of confederacy from without I suppose we shall always have with us as an escape from isolated phenomena of isolated sèances which defy all other conventional explanations. That the present episode does defy these seems fairly clear; I doubt that Margery’s ability to do all this with a foot will be urged. Here it is of interest to note that in the cases of her
immediate neighbors, Arkin and Crandon, it was their shoes on the sides away from her that were tampered with. Perhaps the severe skeptic will take this, plus the extension of the action to Mrs. Litzelmann, as indication of a confederacy from without operating from the far side of the circle. It may not then be amiss to remind the reader that Mrs. Stinson is very badly crippled with a general arthritis; numerous physicians have attended her and the bona fides of her condition cannot be questioned. She is so bad that once she is seated, it is a matter of severe labor and considerable noise for her to leave her chair.

March 28th: Walter went to work on the baskets, doughnuts and megaphones, carrying out one of the most brilliant programs we have ever seen. Amongst other things there was a tug-of-war with Laura Crandon on the megaphone. He complained that he had so few things to work with that he was getting sick of it. We promised him some new apparatus. He put his attention on Richardson's right shoe; he untied the laces and removed them about three-quarters from their holes. Failing then to get the shoe off completely, he picked Richardson's foot and leg up, and stamped several times on the floor with this member, with great noise.

We may, I think, now adopt the suggestion of the above record, that the performance of telekinesis with basket, doughnut and megaphone is about standardized. We need therefore give no further space to descriptions of these acts that involve no new element; we may chronicle them by title. Such chronicling will cover the physical side of the sittings of March 29th and 30th. On the latter date, Walter repeated his expression of boredom with his present "playthings" and asked that some new ones be got. On the 31st, after the routine performance with the luminous objects, he did something considerably more impressive: telekinesis of an object produced at random from a sitter's pocket. The record is adequate:

There was very brilliant work with the megaphone, basket and doughnut; and then with Golding's pocket knife. "You know," said Walter, "there's no string on that." He rapped a requested number of times on the cabinet with a twenty-dollar gold piece, and finally put this in the basket on Golding's knee. Then he did something new with the megaphone: he lifted this, on the far side of the table from the Psychic, from the floor to the level of the table; he then asked Adler to hold it with two hands; after which, Walter's terminal apparently came out above the table, took the megaphone from Adler, and completed the circle of travel with it.
April 1st saw two items of novelty. One of these revolved about a handkerchief with a crude face drawn on it in luminous paint. This had been made during Dingwall's stay, and christened the "Houdini handkerchief"; the general character of Walter's humor as directed thereat can be sufficiently imagined. On this evening he asked for it, but said it was too brightly lighted. Crandon substituted one of his own. We may now turn to the record, going back to page 27 for our atmosphere and adding to the data there given the further statement that the penny whistle was present:

After a few minutes [of inaction], Walter said: "Turn on the red light and look in the back of the cabinet." The red light was given, and we beheld in the right back corner of the cabinet the penny whistle, hanging unsupported in the air, fully eight inches away from both back and east wings of cabinet. . . . Walter asked for five seconds of red light; we turned this on and saw the handkerchief in the same place where the whistle had been, suspended without visible support and slowly rotating in the air.

The routine telekinesis was given on April 3rd and 4th; following which, on the latter date, "Walter tried some red-light telekinesis, using the big megaphone, standing on its big end. He was able to move it a couple of inches." Following a return to the routine for the 5th, he promised some more red-light telekinesis for Martin on the 11th; and on the 8th, after a routine display, he did for the first time something which has since then become well standardized:

He then began working on the basket in the dark. He worked ten minutes and then asked us not to pay any attention to him but to tell stories. He interjected many "damns," and finally said: "I think I have it; turn on the red light three seconds." This was done; the basket moved an inch, then turned over on its side. It was then on the northwest corner of the table, farthest from the Psychic, and all hands were visible. This experiment he repeated many times, with increasing success, asking us to leave the light on until the basket moved. As a final exhibit, he held the basket with long axis horizontal, over the far edge of the table, with nothing resting on the table but the handle.12 He then lifted the basket up on the table, from that position into its normal upright phase. This

12A position in which it is wholly evident that it could not be maintained normally without support of some sort.—J. M. B.
he repeated three times, all in good red light;\textsuperscript{13} and each time, during the same red-light period, Walter laughed.

April 10th saw the routine of telekinesis of illuminated objects in the dark; but first:

The next efforts were in the way of red-light levitation. Walter moved and tipped over the little basket, at the two corners of the table remote from the Psychic.\textsuperscript{14} He then asked Millea for his wrist watch and strap. This was put on the table, and in good red light Walter moved the unit two separate times between two and three inches along the table; every hand and foot being visible at the time.\textsuperscript{15} . . . He pulled off Mrs. Ekland’s hair net and pulled the hairpins out, letting her hair down. He took a quarter (Crandon’s) off the table and handed it to Mrs. Ekland “to pay for the net,” putting it squarely in her hand. He then took Ekland’s pen from the table, put it on the floor, lifted it up and put it into Mrs. Ekland’s up-turned palm, her hand resting on the doughnut. All these phenomena were produced with Millea in possession of the Psychic’s two hands, and Mrs. Millea in possession of Crandon’s hands and in control of his head.

And all of them, after the indicated omission of more routine items, were of course in darkness.

The 11th saw a continuation of the red-light telekinesis of an object contributed by a sitter: Martin’s watch. The record tells us:

We now heard [in darkness] sounds as of the watch being pushed about for a few minutes, when Walter said: “Put on the red light until the watch moves.” In dim red light the watch was seen plainly to slide along the table a few inches—it looked like a beetle crawling. The experiment was then repeated with other objects, the movement of a shoe five or six inches being the most spectacular. This shoe had been removed by Mrs. Fessenden from her own foot in the dark, and placed by her on the table; its movement in red light was plainly seen by all.

The usual routine of the dark-room telekinesis of illuminated objects was given on this date; as on the 12th, 18th, 21st, 24th, 26th, 29th,

\textsuperscript{13} But not a single period of red light for all three episodes; rather, there was an interval of darkness after each.—J. M. B.

\textsuperscript{14} The same performance as that of the 8th.

\textsuperscript{15} But an interval of darkness having preceded each episode.—J. M. B.
THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

30th, May 2nd, 3rd, 4th, 5th, 8th, 13th, 18th, 29th, 30th, 31st, June 2nd, 6th, 8th, 11th, 14th, 25th and 27th. It is to be understood that this routine includes not merely manipulation of doughnut, basket and megaphone, tug of war, throwing away of the megaphone and basket, etc.; but also the putting of coins off and on the table, in and out of the basket, etc.; the rumpling of the hair of sitters as they place their noses in the doughnut on the table, etc. As regards departures from the routine, or more or less critical observations in connection with the routine, the following excerpts from the records may be given:

April 12th: [Following the identification of objects contributed by the sitters and while these were still on the table.] Walter then separately moved each of these articles in two directions, at an angle to each other, over distances of from two to six inches. The clinical thermometer he not only moved parallel to its long axis, but also rotated it. He then tipped over the little basket and moved it first from one corner and then to the other of the two corners of the table farthest from the Psychic. All this was done in good red light.

April 18th: The basket was moved and tipped over in red light, and then Walton’s watch was placed on the table, moved five inches in one direction and six inches at right angles thereto, in red light. Walton’s pencil was lifted from the basket in the dark, and an object put in the basket by Walton was removed by Walter and identified as nail scissors.

April 19th: Levitation of the luminous basket, the luminous doughnut and the large megaphone were all done with great brilliance in red light; and Walter’s terminal was shown over the illuminated plaque. All this was under perfect conditions of double control, except when Crandon went to the victrola, at which time phenomena still went on. In red light a match box belonging to Button was moved five inches.

Of the sitters at the above seance, Hyslop was unimpressed with the performance; he objected seriously to Crandon’s definition of “phenomena in red light.” He is very clear that nothing happened which

---

16 See page 287.
17 With intervening darkness between every two episodes, or every two groups of episodes. Crandon’s use of the term or the concept “red-light phenomena” always implies this restriction, which in his viewpoint is fundamental. He regards it as entirely possible for the teleplasm to support exposure to these brief intervals of light, where continuous exposure would destroy it.—J. M. B.
merits such description; he insists that red light was merely given for observation of the results of a motion occurring entirely in darkness, or that there were always intervals of darkness between phenomena which might mean something in terms of fraudulent preparation. I do not believe that he would presume to suggest how these intervals might have been used in support of the effects presented; his objection to them is on more general grounds than that. Perhaps, as I once said of Comstock, he is superstitious about the resources of the conjurer's technique. But whatever their basis, his exceptions must be recorded here, as must be those of every sitter of whose exceptions I am aware.

April 21st: Dennett put on the table, in the dark, a large silver cigarette case. This was handled and moved about by Walter in the dark. It was opened, and a cigarette pulled out of it and put on the table. This episode was not well controlled; the Crandon-Psychic link was not covered at the moment. Then in good red light Walter moved the case, in view of all, five or six inches along the table. Next, in good red light, we discovered a flower brought by Mrs. Dennett, balanced, standing nearly vertical on the edge of the table most distant from the Psychic. Walter in the red light then proceeded to bend it over until it rested on the table. Late in the sitting a big gourd rattle with a handle was put on the table; and Walter not only moved it, but the gourd-handle carried one of the doughnuts along with it through a travel of five inches, in good red light.

April 24th: Walter asked Andrews for his wrist watch and strap. This was put on the table, and then Walter moved it four inches in good red light.

April 29th: All these phenomena were under strict double control of Crandon and the Psychic. When Crandon was called to the telephone, in his absence Murray maintained full control of the Psychic; and beautiful levitation of the doughnut continued, with waving in all directions. On Crandon's return, Walter picked the luminous doughnut off of a nail in the middle of the east wing of the cabinet [on which it had been placed by the sitters]. Throughout the sitting the Psychic's head and ankles carried luminous bands.

This last episode had been given also on the preceding evening. It is of considerable interest in that the nail in question is distinctly

---

This means that the red light came on to reveal it so standing, and that it continued the balancing during the duration of the light.—J. M. B.
behind the Psychic as she occupies her séance chair. When we grant
the double control, we are reduced, for a "normal" explanation of the
manifestations, to a reliance upon the Psychic’s feet, which must be
pictured as out of control and engineering the levitations, etc. The
present incident contradicts this theory about as sharply as well
could be.

May 2nd: Then the basket was put on the table and Walter
in the dark moved it over to Richardson’s side; then called for the
red light. The basket was then seen to be about two inches over the
edge of the table, suspended without normal support. It righted
itself on to the table and slid along about one inch toward the
center, all in continuous red light.

May 3rd: All these phenomena continued while Crandon was
out at the telephone.

June 2nd: He [Walter] extracted Mrs. Griscom’s comb from
her hair and put it in Griscom’s hand. He unfastened completely
the lacings of Griscom’s right shoe and made a good attempt to take
the shoe off. He then took off Mrs. Litzelmann’s right shoe with
success. Griscom could feel the finger between his shoe and stock­
ing, trying to loosen the lacings.

June 6th: Some streamers of ribbon had been hung over the
cabinet pole, with luminous paint at their ends. This was with the
hope that Walter would blow them out. He did so, at request;
or rather he must have moved them with his terminal. For shortly
afterward he touched Richardson’s wrist and deposited small
specks of luminous paint thereon. Also it was observed that no breeze
was felt when the ribbons moved; and when, later, breezes did come,
the ribbons were quiet. Touches were also felt by Crandon and
Mrs. Richardson.

June 25th: As a finish to the sitting Walter rang at great
length the bell suspended under the chandelier,10 and then used the
big megaphone in some way to ring this bell.

June 27th: With Hill he had an exciting game of ball, using
the megaphone as bat and the clothespin hitched to the cowbell for
ball. There was a long series of “strikes” and “balls,” after
which he rang the suspended cowbell vigorously. All these phe­
nomena were under double control. During the sitting Walter
gave Hill repeated touches, and finally made a definite effort to
unbutton Hill’s shirt.

10 See page 165 for description and history.
Rather than get too far ahead of the chronological development of the case, it seems desirable to suspend the present narrative here. It is to be pointed out that the exigencies of proper topical treatment make it necessary to deal with three very striking séances under a separate heading in Chapter XIII; and that the Harvard records cited in Chapter IX also revolve in considerable degree about telekinetic phenomena. For the immediate future, most of the séances at which telekinesis is chronicled will be found in Chapters VIII, IX and XIII. And when we have got these chapters behind us and have thus brought the entire history of the case up to an approximately even date, we shall resume the telekinetic sequence in Chapter XVII. Any general comment which might be appropriate at the present point may therefore be postponed until there is a larger body of data on which to base it.
CHAPTER VII
Donations from Walter

By the Editor

For a while during the first half of 1925, Walter pursued an amusing theme which I shall have to present wholly in narrative and descriptive form. The general idea was that of bringing presents to the sitters; these usually took the form of small articles of jewelry. The Lime Street routine of sitting is very far from what would be necessary to prevent the smuggling of such objects into the room; and a fair case could be made as regards the possibility of handing them out under cover of the moments at which control is interrupted. Even if one believed the conditions adequate to exclude all this, one would have to grant that the records do not show this to be the case. So here I simply tell what is stated by the sitters to have occurred. If genuine, these presents obviously are apports; and it appears altogether probable that apports do occur genuinely in some cases.

From February 26th on, Walter did a good deal of talking about his plans for giving presents to Conant, Gerke, the Richardsons, Goodall, etc. Some of this conversation is in the records; much of it I suspect has been omitted, for there is extreme lack of continuity in the recorded fragments. A promise of what was to come may be seen in the record of March 14th, which informs us that one of Margery's garters, lost for three days, was put in her lap by Walter during the séance. If the mediumship suffers through the constant occurrence of things of this sort, which make a large demand upon one's credulity and which could not possibly be put on a basis of rigorous demonstration, I think we must also realize the advantage in having the complete and frank and friendly record of the frank and friendly intercourse between Walter and his sitters.

Some of the atmosphere with which Walter managed to surround his presentations to the sitters is worthy of reproduction. In a joking way, he is always representing himself as living in the fire-and-brimstone atmosphere of Hell, as being a little devil with a forked tail, etc. Once when he had assured Mrs. Stinson that they would meet on his side, she acknowledged the satisfaction which this gave her by some use of the word "Heaven." and Walter at once pointed out that
he had said nothing about that. It was in this spirit that (February 26th, 1925) he told the sitters that his presents for Conant and Gerke would comprise something from the molten fires of Hell. Another frequent theme of his jests is that his presents for the sitters are got by a more or less piratical process of canvassing old graves.

During the latter part of March the conversation about the intended gifts to the sitters became much more frequent. The first successful performance came on March 27th, Mrs. Litzelmann being the recipient of Walter’s favor. During this sitting, Walter suddenly said: “Sary, put out your right hand, palm up, on the doughnut on the table; but don’t break the circle doing it.” After Mrs. Litzelmann had done as directed, Walter went on: “Sary, here’s a button for you; keep tight hold of it.” With the words, there was put in Mrs. Litzelmann’s hand a small cold object feeling quite like a button. Examination after the séance showed this to be “a piece of turquoise matrix, flat on one side and spherical on the other, circular in shape, ready for mounting in a ring.” The record chronicles: “Throughout the sitting, from the beginning to end, Arkin had Margery’s two hands, Mrs. Litzelmann had Crandon’s two hands, and Margery’s luminous headband and anklets were visible.” It adds, by way of summary and conclusion, “The conditions of control were so perfect as to leave little doubt that this was a true apport.”

On the very next evening Walter did it again. He told Patty Richardson to hold out her right hand on the doughnut without breaking the circle, as Mrs. Litzelmann had done the night before. She reported that she felt his terminal touch her thumb and then her palm, in process of placing in her palm a small cold object. “Here’s a button for you, Patty; a speautiful spink one. Hold on to it.” It was found to be a piece, about $\frac{1}{4} \times \frac{1}{2} \times \frac{3}{4}$ inches, of what was taken to be a Mexican opal; it was white with a slight pinkish cast, and somewhat translucent. The record fails entirely to cover the question of control, either for the generality of the séance or for the moment of delivery of Miss Richardson’s present.

The next donation was for Walter’s mother. It came on April 1st, in a séance the record of which is explicit regarding the existence of control for a long series of telekinetic phenomena; but no statement is made to cover the moment of delivery of this present. Contrary to precedent, Walter this time announced, before delivery, what it was: a crystal cameo. Because his mother was not in the circle, he said he would hand it to Golding, who was. Golding under instruc-
tions placed his left hand, palm up, on the doughnut (luminous, here as always) on the table; there was put into it, and bounced out, a small cold object "like a stone." Later investigation showed this to be "an exquisite crystal cameo, $\frac{3}{4} \times \frac{1}{2} \times \frac{1}{4}$ inch, with the most delicate Greek female profile carved on it."

After this, there was quite a lapse before Walter made his next donation. On April 12th he promised a present for Dr. and Mrs. Brown if they would be present on the 17th; but they weren't, so nothing came of that. On the 15th, however, Adler was the beneficiary:

Walter then went on: "Freddy, you're a patient sitter. I'm going to bring you a ruby. It will be a half inch long. Don't let anybody tell you it is a "sympathetic" ruby. Ha, ha; it's a real one. I think I will give you something tonight, also. John, go get Freddy a 'stun.' Hurry up, there! Don't be slow." Crandon then asked if Walter would do some work with the plaque, to which he replied: "No, not till John brings that stun." In about two minutes Walter said: "Freddy, put your left hand on that luminous ring on the table, palm up." Whereupon we all could see, under perfect control conditions, a black, arm-like process cross the luminous ring; and Adler felt something drop in his palm, though it bounced out and fell on the floor and was found later. Walter said: "Too bad. You will find a green stone with the matrix in one place crumbled, and no wonder; it has been buried 150 years. Don't let anyone get it away from you."

The record fails to chronicle the finding of the stone at the end of the séance, or its character; so this much of the story must consist in ex post facto statement by Adler himself. He tells me that it corresponded in all ways with the record; and by way of proving this he shows me the stone itself.

The Browns got their present on the 26th (April). The record is adequate:

In the midst of the show Walter said: "You remember, Kitty, I promised you as one of my early faithful sitters a present; and that present would have orange blossoms on it. 1 Well, I've sent for it. It isn't here yet. It will be here pretty soon." About two minutes later he broke in on whatever he was doing to say: 2 "Here's your

---

1 We have seen that he made a promise; the sitters confirm the matter of the orange blossoms, which does not appear in any of the records.—J. M. B.

2 It is of course understood that there was no dictaphone or stenographic transcription of the séances in which the record is Crandon's, unaided; conversation with Walter out of such sittings is set down out of the best recollections of Crandon, almost always with aid from the others.—J. M. B.
DONATIONS FROM WALTER

present, Kitty. Put your hand, palm up, over the lighted doughnut. Here it is.” Then we could hear something hard rapping all over the table. Then with great precision there was placed in Kitty’s right hand a hard object, which she at once declared to be a ring. Then Walter said: “I had to search seventeen graves for that. You’ll find on it some crumbly stuff; and no wonder. It has been buried 150 years. It has great value; I doubt if you ever saw one like it. It is a lapis.”

Kitty’s apport proved to be a solid silver ring. There was a worn mark inside it which may have been a worn mark “Sterling,” but which looked to our eyes as though it were not that. The ring was worn and shiny, as though it had been used for many years. Where it reached the sides of the stone it showed on each side a conventional orange blossom in silver. The stone itself was a beautiful lapis lazuli 1.5 centimeter long and one centimeter wide. A striking feature is that every sulcus or carved depression in the ring was filled with a reddish brown oily dirt, as though the ring had never been cleaned. The delivery was made under double control of the Psychic by [Dr.] Brown and of Crandon by Mrs. Brown.

Walter seized the opportunity offered by the presence of the Litzelmann’s, on May 4th, to remember another old friend:

Walter went on to say that he wanted to be the sole donor of the ring to Sarah [Litzelmann]; so he said: “Carl, I am going to send now for the money. And Freddy [Adler], you have been a patient, faithful sitter and I am going to send for your ruby now. Don’t let anyone tell you it is ‘sympathetic.’ Hey, John, go get that money and the stun. John isn’t sure that he has time. He has duty elsewhere. Yes, you go ahead, John; and be lively about it. You have plenty of time.” Walter then went on with some repartee; and in about two minutes he said: “John is back; good boy, John; now you can go. Do you hear that, Carl?” Whereupon we heard the crackling of paper on the east wing of the cabinet and on the table. All this was under perfect double control. This same crackling paper was forced into Carl’s left hand, and a minute later Freddy’s hand, palm up on the luminous doughnut, received something done up in waxed paper which we had just heard Walter fumbling about to extract from the luminous basket. . . . The apports proved to be, for Carl, a new twenty-dollar bill; and for Freddy, a pigeon’s blood ruby, big as one’s fingernail. A perfect stone.
After a long hiatus, Walter returned on December 22d, 1915, to the business of giving presents to the sitters; but under a technique that is hardly satisfactory to anybody save the donee.

He told Conant to put his left hand, palm up, over the doughnut. Conant did this, retaining the Psychic's left hand; Gerke had her right hand and both of Crandon's. Something was put into Conant's hand. A similar experiment and experience was put through for Gerke. Each was told to put his apport into his pocket and not to tell the other or anyone else what it was. Walter added that one of the two would have in his pocket "the spirit of '76." Conant declared later that he knew what Walter meant by "the spirit of '76," but neither revealed what he had received.

A secret present was similarly bestowed upon Patty Richardson on January 2d, 1926. The record tells us:

He then instructed us all to sit away from the cabinet except Patty, who was told to put her hand through the hole in the front door. She was told further that what she received was to be a secret between her and Walter. After a while she felt a small object being put in her hand; and she later took it home with her without telling anyone what it was.

Though his inclination to bizarre performances remains unlessened, the particular stunt of giving presents to the sitters was indulged in by Walter for the last time on the above date.

*Of the glass cabinet—see Chapter XXV.*
CHAPTER VIII

Séances Outside the Lime Street Premises: 1925

From the Records, with Comment by the Editor

During the very first days of the mediumship, it was customary to alternate the sittings between the Crandon residence in Lime Street, and Dr. Brown's house in Beachmont. As the interval between séances became shorter and the amount of séance paraphernalia greater, the convenience of having a fixed place of meeting became more compelling; and the urgency of Dr. Crandon's being always within easy telephonic access of his various hospitals was another factor tending in the same direction. As a result, we have a condition to which the skeptics have always pointed with extreme derision. In point of fact, it has never been the custom to hold all séances in the medium’s own residence. But the custom has sufficiently approximated this to lend real point to the criticism; so that a proponent of the mediumship has felt obliged to meet this objection not with a denial, but with an argument to show that the phenomena are not a function of the Lime Street room.

As the list of séances held in 1923–24 shows, the custom of sitting partly at Dr. Brown's was terminated on August 18th, 1923. During the balance of these two years, and exclusive of five sittings given in Paris and London during December, 1923, seventeen séances were held outside Lime Street, on eight different premises in or near Boston, in New York, in Buffalo and in Niagara Falls. It continues to be a matter of principle to sit now and then in some other place. Barring the one occasion on which Dingwall took the medium to Mrs. Hemenway’s residence, she sat outside Lime Street for the first time in 1925 on March 6th, at the DeWyckoff apartment in New York. No record was made; but Crandon received an oral statement from De Wyckoff enabling him to refer to the séance in one of his own records, with the statement that "good physical results were obtained, especially the lifting of a silver plate from floor to table and back, and much independent voice. There was no cabinet."

1 M. M., Chapter LIII.
The experiment of sitting in a strange place was repeated on April 2nd, at Dr. Richardson's residence. Despite Richardson's long and intimate connection with the mediumship and with the Cran­dons, this was the first time that his house had been used for a sitting. The full record follows:

This was the first time Margery had sat in this house, and we had some doubts about the rooms, etc. Events proved that Walter was entirely at his ease, though Mark and John failed to come [as had been hoped, and as was one large reason for sitting on these premises]. The sitting was held in the music room on the ground floor, which is about 25 x 15 feet, and has nine windows. These were darkened by drawing shades and curtains; but even then slight shafts of light entered, to which however Walter made no objections. The only circumstance that appeared to annoy him was the rather frequent passing of automobiles. Before the sitters were aware of their approach, almost, Walter would say: "There come the neighbors," and would pause until the glare and rumble had ceased. He also noticed a peculiar sound in the victrola, due to some mechanical deficiency. This instrument played "Souvenir" throughout the sitting, but [in the absence of an electric motor] had to be wound by Verna J. from time to time.

The cabinet was made by a three-way screen, over which was thrown a brown blanket, a specially warm cover, later called a horse-blanket by Walter. The cabinet was so placed that its left wing touched the keyboard of the piano, leaving perhaps two octaves exposed, between the hands of Margery and Richardson. Walter twice played distinct notes on request, under double control of the medium and Crandon [by the Richardsons].

Walter came through very quickly and whistled his greetings, as usual. He said the boys [John and Mark] were not present, but he expected them later. They were busy, he said, on some work of their own; whatever the reason, they did not turn up. However, as Walter said, we felt we ought to be glad to get anything on first trial in a new place. The first thing he did was to lift the small lighted megaphone from the floor to the table. He asked for the large one, a little later, and was rather vexed that it should have been forgotten. He played skillfully with the lighted doughnut, carrying it up to the inside of the cabinet, where it remained for some time, at a height about on a level with the medium's head,

---

2 Lime Street, being one block long, is absolutely free from all traffic save that originating in or destined to this block; so that, though the séance room is at the front of the house, automotive noises are seldom heard therein, and automotive lights never seen from its fourth-floor level.—J. M. B.
looking as though stuck in this position. Adler affirmed, later, that this was the longest excursion the doughnut had ever made from the Psychic. Later Walter placed it upon Richardson's thumb and otherwise manipulated it.

In the expectation of having Mark and John present with Walter, Mrs. Richardson had brought two objects formerly belonging to John. With Walter's consent she now placed one of these on the table which stood before the medium. It was a glass ball, quite heavy; and as Walter said that it "did not interest" him at all, it was removed and the second article put on the table. This was a white Teddy bear, about eleven inches tall, dressed in trousers and a jacket, with pocket and cuffs and buttoned down the front. It was a favorite toy with John Richardson, and has been kept in a box along with another tiny wooden bear, one and one-half inches high. Mrs. Richardson brought this box into the room on the present occasion, telling nobody; and she left it on a shelf until the sitting was in progress in the dark. As it was wrapped in a cloth carefully pinned up, she feels safe in saying that nobody knew of its presence save herself. Only at the present juncture did she undo this package, take out the Teddy bear and feel in the box for the other little wooden one without finding it, and lay the Teddy bear on the table with no word as to what it was. Walter at once began to play with it and talk about it; but he grasped at once and fell in with the idea of keeping the secret from the other sitters. He did not actually name the toy, calling it "Josiah," saying something about "bears and bear skin coats," "what nice cuffs," "who made these clothes?", "I undid the buttons," "won't I tease the boys!", etc. He said "don't put it on its face," and then Mrs. Richardson sat the animal up; which he observed correctly, although apparently wrong about its first position. It soon became evident to Mrs. Richardson, from his words and actions, that he had found the small bear which had eluded her. This he tried to place in her hands; but he failed, the small shape falling to the floor, where there was some difficulty locating it after the sitting. Walter then picked up a handkerchief, from the floor he said, and dropped it into Mrs. Richardson's hand. During all the time he was playing with the toys, none of the sitters knew what he was talking about, except her. Richardson took it to be a toy animal, but visualized the wrong one. At the end, the little buttons were found unfastened and one arm was out of its sleeve. Mrs. Richardson feels fairly certain that Walter did this, but hesitates to make a positive statement since the bear had not been out of the box for months and was not seen by her on
the present occasion until the end of the séance. The incident shows supernormal knowledge, beyond a doubt.3

The independent voice was next tested, by Walter’s orders. The medium filled her mouth with water, which she afterwards expelled again; and while she held it Walter spoke with great distinctness the words: “David buried all my enemies in a damned deep trench.” One of his witticisms of this evening was: “My Ethical Culture consists of ‘To Hell with my enemies.’”

He reproached us for coming to sittings “all fagged out.” This, he said, was not fair to him. Several sitters, those nearest the Psychic, felt touches as of some heavy but soft object on knees and feet. Margery herself also reported this. Walter lifted a tambourine from the table and jingled it in rhythm in the air, apparently about one foot up. He picked a piece of paper from the floor and put it in Richardson’s hand.

Leaving, he said the force was spent and he was afraid to stay any longer. There was “double control” during a great part of the evening.

This record, of course, demonstrates nothing more than that the phenomena of the mediumship can be obtained outside the Lime Street house. The demonstration was repeated with added emphasis during May and June, 1925, in connection with the Code-Hoagland inquiry.5 During this period, six séances were held in a laboratory room in the Harvard “yard,” and two in Hoagland’s residence.6 Even from the ultimately adverse viewpoint of the Code-Hoagland report and its collateral documents, it seems granted that the action throughout these séances was fundamentally parallel with what is to be observed in Lime Street. That, of course, is in the last analysis all that can be expected. Sittings on strange premises cannot, of themselves, determine the question of absolute validity; they are pertinent only to the exclusion of such fraud as depends upon preparation of the premises.

The Harvard sittings perhaps afford, in this respect, what the mathematician would recognize as a local maximum of demonstration;

---

3 This statement, of course, is predicated upon the assumption that throughout this episode control was valid and continuous of both the Psychic’s hands and both Crandon’s. Whether this was actually the case, or whether reliance had to be put in Crandon’s statement of control for a part of the sitting, the record does not clearly indicate.—J. M. B.

4 The pertinence of this lies in Crandon’s lifelong interest in the Ethical Culture movement. Doubtless the conversation had turned in that direction.—J. M. B.

5 Chap. IX.

6 See M. H. V., pp. 38–82, for detailed records.
but the demonstration must be kept alive by continuation of the practice of sitting, every now and then, elsewhere than in Lime Street. This was done, during the summer of 1925, by using the Crandon summer cabin on Point Shirley, some fifteen miles out of the city along the North Shore. While this cabin is the property of the Crandons, it is free from many of the objections of general principle that apply to the Lime Street séance room. In particular, the walls are entirely bare, and the cottage is of course detached on all sides. The space under the floor is open to free examination by anyone who will crawl under the house. There is freedom from the city noises. It is a very simple matter indeed to conduct a search of the premises which enables one to say that any invasion of the séance room must originate out of doors; whereas, as I have once testified, the Lime Street premises are quite complicated.

The cottage is mostly one large living room, 24 feet by 20, and got up to resemble as closely as possible a ship’s cabin. Infinitesimal staterooms opening out of this room serve for sleeping quarters, bath, etc.; and at the rear there is a galley, similarly opening out of the main room, and measuring 16 by 7. Behind this is an unfinished shed or lean-to. Séances are held in the living room. There is a skylight, and there are windows clear across the front; there are no adequate provisions for darkening these. It must be extremely light in this room when there is any moon at all—it just happens that whenever I have attended sittings there, there has been none. Under these latter conditions, of course, darkness is quite satisfactory.

Séances had been held in the Cabin before, as a reference to M. M. will indicate. The first time in 1925 when a sitting occurred at the Beach was on July 12th. The record gives an adequate idea of the difference in general conditions, and of the action obtained:

The séance was in the open room, with no cabinet. The victrola was kept going by Dr. Brown. The room was darkened only relatively. Walter came through almost at once with merry whistle and jest, in spite of the absence of cabinet. After a while he proceeded upon his present plan of giving nothing but phenomena in red light. The bell-box was rung the number of times requested by Hubbs, Mrs. Hubbs and Mrs. Thaler with one hundred per cent success.

7 M. M., p. 107.
8 Who had to wind it, and set it back to the beginning of the tune, as these operations became necessary.—J. M. B.
9 The Scientific American model.—J. M. B.
Still in good red light Walter proceeded to work on the straw basket. This was placed on the table, and after a few minutes Crandon was able to leave the circle and stand over by the red light, where he was told to turn it on for ten seconds. This was done; and the basket was discovered with one edge resting on the edge of the table farthest from the Psychic, and slanting off the table forty-five degrees from the vertical, a position impossible by normal means. It then was seen to lower itself into completely horizontal position, the bottom alone touching the edge of the table.10 It then lifted itself back to the vertical and fell over on the table. In the next period of red light, the basket was seen in front of Hubbs. In the red light it was then rotated through ninety degrees, and then slowly fell to a horizontal position11 toward the chair just vacated by Crandon. During each of these red light periods, a striking manifestation occurred. While the basket was in motion in red light, Walter whistled four or five notes, loudly and distinctly, above and behind the Psychic. Each of us looked at her mouth and found it tightly closed at this moment.

Later in the sitting a light was seen at Mrs. Thaler's back, and she felt a touch on her right hand, which Walter said was by someone on his side.

The Cabin next came into use for séance purposes when I remained in Boston over the week-end following my sittings of July 16th–18th,12 to spend Sunday the 19th with the Crandons and other old friends at the Beach. We went down in three carloads, taking some of the séance paraphernalia with us. We stayed into the evening and held a séance, during the preparations for which I managed to execute a search of the entire premises which was quite adequate to the exclusion of all unauthorized persons. The duty of drawing up a record was assigned to me; I discharged it while the party was breaking up and preparing for the drive back to the city:

Aside from the sitters in the circle, Bird was free in the room, keeping the victrola wound and reset to the starting point in the absence of motor and repeater, generally observing the phenomena from a roving position of best momentary advantage, etc.

The circle was originally formed directly beneath the skylight, to cover which no attempt was made. Walter came through and requested that we move toward the front of the house, so as to

---

10 And the entire basket being off the table, at the side, without visible support.
11 In the air off the table, to one side.—J. M. B.
12 See Ch. XIV.
get more out of the very dim diffused light from this source. [There was no moon.] After the circle was thus moved, Bird remained for the most part in the back of the room; and from such position, at all times of the séance, the several sitters were silhouetted to him against the windows. When he moved around to the window side of the circle [occasionally], the sitters on the room side were not in the least degree visible to him, nor was any of the furniture in the center of the room visible; so he infers that he was invisible to the sitters so long as he remained in the quarter away from the windows.

The first action consisted in free motion of the dark megaphone, as described by several sitters, in the space above the table. Bird's eyes were not yet sufficiently accommodated to the darkness to see this; the others were closer to it, and in large part reported it by the senses of touch and hearing.

The large basket, with luminous ribbon band and three luminous spots on the handle, was placed on the table. Walter took off the band and dropped it on the floor, then was thought by some sitters to have placed this on Margery's feet or ankles. The basket moved very freely about the table. Once or twice red light was permitted for a short period [a red bulb had been brought out and substituted for the white one in a socket on the wall which Bird could reach]; and the basket was found, on the onset of this light, teetering on the edge of the table, clearly without adequate support, as in the case of the note-book on July 9th and the basket on the 12th.13 It went far over and off the table almost into horizontal position, recovered, remained in teetering balance, and finally fell or was carried to the floor. Twice thrown away by Walter, it was the first time recovered by Bird and the second time permitted to remain out of action.

Either the basket or the doughnut, Bird is not sure which, was recovered by Walter after it had dropped to the floor at the side of the table remote from the Psychic. The doughnut was moved freely about the table, and once or twice was recovered from the floor at points nearer the Psychic than implied in the preceding sentence. There was here no silhouetting of the teleplasmic hand, as such; but on numerous occasions there were rapid eclipses of luminous objects on the table, apparently by Walter's terminal in transit.

During many of the more impressive acts there was control by Bird of the Hubbs-Margery link; and by Mrs. Hubbs of the Cran-

13 See pp. 243 and 74, respectively.
Bird's control of the junction was usually supplemented by control of the Psychic's head through contact with his own.

Late in the sitting Hubbs, at Walter's invitation, put his luminous wristwatch on the table. It moved at least a foot in the direction straight toward Hubbs, and therefore diagonally toward the corner of the table at the Psychic's left. This direction was about sixty degrees removed from a line joining the Psychic with the initial position of the watch. The watch, too, went to the edge of the table in red light and teetered there; and of course the claim of a thread or other connection meets difficulties here which do not arise in the case of the doughnut; for the watch was produced from Hubb's wrist during the séance.

Bird exercised far greater freedom of exploration about moving objects than he would have dared admit during the progress of the séance. In this he met no contacts whatever save in the case of the moving watch, when he collided with what appeared to be a cord, extending in the direction of travel of the watch. He satisfied himself that this had been the leather strap on which the watch is mounted; further immediate exploration by Bird indicated that this was extended in precisely the direction of the watch's travel, and subsequent experiment resulted in duplicating, from this strap, the sensation previously encountered during the séance darkness.

The Code bell-box was placed on the table; the external hinged board was opened and closed by Walter, and the bell was rung several times.

The table used was the round dining table which is part of the permanent fittings of the cabin. There was no cabinet at all; the Psychic sat free in the room like any other sitter. Walter's whistle was once heard from a point which all sitters placed at the side of the Cabin, remote from the Psychic and well outside the circle.

On the following Sunday, July 26th, another séance was held at the cabin, under much more impressive conditions. Mrs. Bird was in Boston with me for my sittings of July 23rd-25th; and at the Cran- dons' invitation, we were living in the cabin at Point Shirley, driving in to Boston each day and back to the Beach each evening after the séance. We were thus in residence at the cabin from Friday morning until Monday morning; so that when the crowd arrived for Sunday

---

14 At first glance it looks as though I might more profitably have controlled the Cran- don-Psychic link. But if confederacy can be charged against either Hubbs or Mrs. Hubbs it can be charged against them both; and I then prefer to have the position dictated by the fact that Margery is right-handed.—J. M. B.
at the beach, it was in many respects as though they were visiting us in our own house. I think even the critic of hostile disposition must grant that under these circumstances we have a much clearer demonstration of the innocence of the premises than it was possible for me to have the week before. Both Crandon and I made records; his was in the usual form and mine was in the shape of adequate but extremely sketchy notes, jotted down that night after the crowd had left and before I retired. I was on the road home until a very late hour Monday, and hence received Crandon's record before I had had time to expand my own into a finished form. Accordingly I here present his record, with certain amplifications from my own notes. I make this explanation merely as a matter of history, and not in any sense to dodge responsibility for the record; it may be read as though it were mine.

Bird was free in the room to tend the victrola and to control at his pleasure. There was no cabinet. The darkness was much more effective than last Sunday; at no time was there the slightest visibility, to Bird, of silhouettes of the other sitters against the windows, though he was almost continuously in position to see this had the effect been sensible.

Walter came through promptly, and said his force was low, but that he came rather than disappoint us. He at once rang the hole bell-box several times, despite the seal over all the openings as described in previous records; then he ordered various pieces of kitchen hardware brought in and played with them, mostly on the floor in a fashion that would have been evidential only with a foot control of extreme severity—which we did not have. At one stage or another Murray and Mrs. Bird reported touches.

Walter finally instructed the sitters to put out personal belongings on the table, for him to identify. During these identifications, Bird stood directly behind the Psychic, reaching around over her shoulders so that with his left hand he could control the junction between her and Murray, with his right that between her and Crandon. Throughout this period, with minor exceptions, he was continuously conscious of contact with all four of these hands; and as an incident of his position, his head was in constant contact with the Psychic's.

There was no element of supernormal attribution by Walter of each object to its proprietor; rather, he called for each sitter by name to put out something. The objects offered in response

---

15 See p. 126, top, for summary of the facts referred to here.
were therefore on the table singly, and the only supernormal element lay in Walter's statement of their identity. As each object was successfully or unsuccessfully named, it was withdrawn by its owner and Walter called upon another sitter. The objects offered, the sitters presenting them, Walter's performance, and the degree of control by Bird in accordance with the above description, follow:

J. H. Brown; a penknife. So identified by Walter. Brown did not respond for an interval, whereupon Walter added: "It may be a pencil." The knife was in fact smooth and round to an unusual degree for such an object. Full control by Bird.

Gerke; a magnifying glass in its leather case. Identified in three stages: leather, glass, a magnifying glass in a leather case. Full control by Bird.

Dr. Brown; a bill (money) of unstated denomination. Identified at once by Walter's remark: "Take back your money, Bos'n." Full control by Bird.

Bird; a handkerchief. Identified by the words: "Take up your handkerchief, Birdie." Full control by Bird, his left hand which put out the handkerchief sweeping back to a position of control over such a path that it would have met either of the hands under its control had they, too, been under the necessity of making a similar return. Before again releasing either of these hands Bird verified the identity of both.

Murray; a purse. Successfully identified. No memorandum of this identification in Bird's record, and hence no knowledge of state of control.

Dr. Brown, called upon next for an object, robbed Laura Crandon, at his left, of a hair-pin. No indication of protest or surprise from her was audible to Bird, whose first inkling of what had occurred came from Walter's words: "Ha, ha; Eddie; you can't fool me. Laura, take back your hairpin." Full control by Bird.

J. H. Brown; a penny. Identification slow, halting, and without any definite ultimate success. This is the more interesting, since this was the one identification during which Bird's control was not satisfactory.17

16 Walter commonly calls Dr. Brown this, in allusion to Crandon's yachting days.—J. M. B.

17 My memorandum does not specify what the deficiency was; it simply says "control bad." I think it probable I had gone to wind or set back the victrola, and that the identification was started while I was away from my post. I had to leave my position thus, several times during the course of the identifications. In every other instance save this, an entire episode, from Walter's calling for the stated sitter to contribute an object to his final success in identification, fell entirely between
Gerke was next called upon by Walter; and he started to
get out a cigarette. In the meantime, Dr. Brown possessed
himself of another piece of Laura Crandon’s property, this time
her shoe, and placed this on the table. Walter said: “Thought
you’d fool me again, did you, Laura? It’s your shoe.” Where­
upon he threw the shoe to the floor. By this time, Gerke had
his cigarette on the table; Walter immediately identified it, too.
Full control by Bird throughout this.

Bird; a commutation ticket. Walter identified it as a paper,
control by Bird being satisfactory, under a technique identical
with the one employed before when he had to put out an object
for identification.

Crandon; a pair of scissors of odd design. Walter described
this object as “scissors with a hole in it,” quite correctly. No
memorandum of control, this item being missing from Bird’s
record.

Bird, invited to contribute two objects at once, could find
only his “keytainer” with perhaps half a dozen keys in it, and a
wooden toothpick which he came upon, loose in his pocket.
Walter identified the former as “a case with something in it;”
the latter he characterized as “too personal” to be named. No
memorandum of control for this episode.

Out of all this, the points to be stressed are these: In the first
place it was quite out of the question for the Psychic to handle the
various objects as they were put out. In not more than two instances
at the outside was there audible to me any noise accompanying their
placing on the table by their owners or contributors. But after they
had been so placed, something was distinctly heard to handle them;
and Walter’s words carry more than one index that identification was
by a tactile process. Anything in the nature of vision, normal or
hyperesthetic, by the Psychic I think must be ruled out. My line
of vision across the table coincided almost absolutely with hers, and I
could see no slightest silhouetting of the sitters opposite us. I think
it ridiculous to talk of visual hyperesthesia under such absence of light.

We must, then, if we seek the oblique explanation, fall back upon
the hypothesis of confederacy. But it was Walter’s voice, with all
its habitual nuances and all its habitual quick humor and all its
habitual effect of coming from the immediate vicinity of the Psychic’s

two of my absences and was therefore prosecuted under my continuous control. On
each return, of course, I verified the identity of the hands on resuming control.
—J. M. B.
head, that did the talking. And we were not even in Lime Street, where the fireplace and the comparatively easy invadability of the room offer the impervious skeptic some precarious foothold. Short of attacking my account itself, I must confess I do not see any answer in terms of fraud. Even a confederacy of prior arrangement, so that the Psychic knew what objects were to be put out, by what sitters, would work only if it involved Gerke and myself.

Again on the following Sunday, August 2nd, there was a party at the Beach followed by a séance. There was good moonlight; to escape this, the sitting was held in the shed back of the kitchen, which has no openings of any description other than the two doors, one to the yard and one to the kitchen. The record tells us of a decidedly brilliant séance:

We sat in the shed, which was cool and absolutely dark. Outside of the constant recurrence of a small star-like light, the phenomena were practically all in the red light. Dr. Brown was outside the circle to keep the victrola going.

Walter came through at once and first worked on Dingwall's small illuminated basket. We were given in all about fourteen periods of red light in which to observe the manifestations. The small basket was seen resting on one of its edges on the west end of the table. From that point, in the light it erected itself to vertical and then lowered itself carefully over on the table. This was repeated on the north and east sides of the table.

Then Walter called for some personal object, whereupon Crandon put on the table his handkerchief. At the next period of red light the handkerchief was not to be seen; but then it slowly reappeared up over the north end of the table, and climbed up on the table.

The handkerchief was next seen within the small megaphone; and it grew out of the big end, just as a rose or head of lettuce might grow. This was repeated three times. Then the handkerchief was next seen on the back of Murray's head and neck, moving down to the side of his neck. It seemed to Murray as though there was something inside the handkerchief; and Walter said: "Of course there is." Several other small personal objects were placed on the table by various sitters and moved from six to nine inches. As the various objects climbed up on the edge of the table and moved about, the Psychic's head was moved violently and irregularly in her efforts to see the phenomena; and it could by no

18 The Psychic was at the south end, Crandon testifies from a very clear memory.
calculation be thought to be connected therewith. Hand control was perfect throughout.19

It would seem fair enough, in view of the use of the lean-to for the above sitting, to regard it as having been held in a different place from previous sittings at the Point. From this viewpoint, when the next séance was staged at the Beach, on August 16th, a third "premises" was used—the garage. The floor here, of course, is of solid concrete, with no space under it; and it is of interest to remark that in the shed where the séance of the 2d was held, this is also the case.

Dr. Brown was on the outside of the circle to keep the victrola going. The room used (the garage) was absolutely black.20 No luminous controls were employed.21 Walter came at once and called at once for playing cards. Dye then opened in red light a freshly bought, sealed package of playing cards, with the revenue stamp on them. These he shuffled in the dark and put under his leg in the chair. At Walter's request, in the dark Dye then put out one card at a time; and after Walter had read a card in the dark, which he did with increasing rapidity, the card would be given to a particular sitter, until finally each sitter had one card and some had two. Brown kept a list of the sitters and the name of the card as given by Walter. Walter named eleven cards complete, as regards denomination and suit; with two errors as between Spades and Hearts. In addition, three face cards occurred in the course of the test; of these he named the suit but made no attempt to read the denomination, throwing these cards on the floor instead.22 Save as indicated, all fourteen identifications of the cards were completely successful; and only these fourteen were attempted.

I think the most important aspect of these Cabin sittings is to be found in the way they dovetail with the current Lime Street séances. They amply support the generalization that the phenomena which are being obtained at a given moment in Lime Street continue to occur when the sittings are transferred to the Beach. The character of

19 The visibility rendered this somewhat superfluous; in so far as it was necessary, the failure of the record to mention double control leaves us to assume that Crandon's control of the Psychic's right was unchecked.—J. M. B.
20 It has one window and there are translucent panes in the doors. Both were adequately blanketed.—J. M. B.
22 See Chap. XXIII, particularly p. 293, top.
the manifestations varies strongly from time to time, and must therefore be a function of some variable; but that variable is emphatically not the place of sitting.

With the onset of September, the Sunday parties at the Beach were dropped; but the occasional sitting outside Lime Street and in new places was not dropped. On September 17th, the mediumship for the first time invaded the Litzelmann residence in Cambridge. Both Margery and the Doctor have been in the house, socially and professionally; but the séance record tells us that they had never been in the room in which the sitting was held. The action centered entirely about the Richardson voice machine, so the detailed record may best be given elsewhere. Here we need only cite page 265 in support of the statement that the séance was in every way a success, constituting a good contribution to the sequence by which Richardson approached certitude in his vocal tests.

When next the mediumship went abroad, it was to give, or to hold, a séance in the residence of Mr. William Foss, of Concord, Mass. Mr. Foss is himself a physical medium of considerable fame in the Boston territory. He sits always with a considerable number of his family, if I may generalize from the reports that reach my ears; and he admits outsiders sparingly and with reluctance. Comstock, of the Scientific American Committee, at one time gained the old gentleman's confidence and attended a considerable number of sittings. Conditions of occurrence and of observations were of course never what he would have desired; but he felt that there was approximately an even chance that the manifestations were valid. If they are so, the stories that one hears of Foss would place him close in Margery's class, in all respects save that of range or versatility. But we shall see immediately below that on Foss' own admission these stories are exaggerated.

On September 28th, 1925, Margery and the Doctor journeyed to Concord and a séance was held in the Foss residence. As is usually the case when Margery sits with another medium, the result seemed to consist more or less in a crossing of the two mediumships, rather than in a clear-cut performance by either medium at which the other could be regarded solely in the light of a sitter. Crandon's record follows:

Before the sitting, Foss, who is seventy-five years old but very active, sat with hands on a table in bright white light in the living room, while intelligent raps in code came on the table apparently without any possibility of fraud. The sitting was held in the kitchen, around a table five feet square. A slight white light came
through two windows; a third window back of Foss was covered by a blanket.

The table almost immediately became mobile, with motion as though it were on a ship at sea. Then the whole house, or the portion of it in which we were, shook violently in periods of ten to twelve seconds. This was noted by all; Foss had repeatedly observed it [in his own séances]; it was not apparently possible to do it normally, though we tried this after the sitting. Then came a lot of raps in threes of differing intensities, apparently answering yes or no to questions of identification put by Foss or Randall. Things were then quiet for a spell, and in order to start them again Foss sang "Nearer, My God, to Thee." At this there was a low whistle of surprise from behind Margery. This was very welcome to the two of us. Then Foss sang "Old Black Joe" and Walter—for it was unmistakably he—broke in with an obligato accompaniment which was very beautiful. Walter was then introduced all around and seemed in very friendly and tactful mood. Next there came an apparent effort of someone to speak between Foss and Randall. Walter kept encouraging this by saying, "Come on, Joe. Now, Joe; it's easy. Let me count one, two, three, Joe; then speak." "Joe" then came through in a very rapid whisper quite new to us, and in the region between Foss and Randall, saying: "You usually have strands on your wrists and ankles." This we took to be addressed to Margery, and we felt it more or less evidential. We asked Walter how Joe would know that, and Walter said: "I told him. Do you think we are all fools over here?"

Then followed a period of raps of all intensities on the table, ending with a bang as from a gun, which startled everybody. Foss now said a pistol was being held against his forehead, and we shortly heard a pistol hammer lifted up. We had no enthusiasm for this. Crandon got many touches on left foot, ankle and thigh. Papers were taken from his left coat pocket, brushed across his face, and put back in the pocket. It was mechanically impossible for anyone in the room to have done this. It was apparently done by Walter, who chuckled in glee. Then Crandon was nearly tilted out of his chair, sideways, three times. Walter said Joe was doing this. Walter then told us to call him up later at Lime Street, and departed.

Foss said that he had never attended a sitting like that; that he usually has many voices. The stories of his "materializations" turn out to be a mere matter of touches with apparent hands; he has never seen an apparition. The control conditions during our
sitting were good, and we feel there is no doubt of Foss' integrity. He says he sits not over three times a year. He says further that he can go out in a field with a tin pan in bright sunlight and raps will come on the pan.

On the way home Walter whistled once in the car. He told us later that he rode home with us on account of the taxicab strike.23 At 11:30 we called on Walter in Lime Street, and he said he had to stay around whenever the Kid sat, in order that no other control should get hold of her and do her possible damage.

From October 30th to November 5th, 1925, Margery was in Buffalo and Niagara Falls, on family and personal errands. During her stay, as in December, 1924, she gave sittings—five in all, to a total of about thirty-five sitters. This time, however, Crandon remained in Boston, and the sittings went on without him. The brief memorandum drawn up by Crandon, from Margery's oral report of her trip, follows:

Among the sitters on two occasions was a Mr. Lamont, a medium, of Buffalo. This medium's control is a "Mr. Fox," alleged to be an English general who passed over seventy or eighty years ago. At these sittings Walter came through, and there was a large amount of comedy as he conversed with "Mr. Fox" through the entranced Lamont. The contrast between the gay and energetic Canadian (Walter) and the dignified Britisher kept all the sitters convulsed with laughter. A large assortment of luminously marked objects was levitated about the region in front of the medium, with control of the medium constantly changing between four or five of the men sitters. Among these sitters was "Jones,"24 who is apparently developing as a medium.

Anything which might be said here in summary on the major theme of the present chapter has been said on pages 69 and 72. The two final sittings of this group, however, introduce a new theme, in expansion upon which it is in order to observe that whenever Margery sits with other mediums, there may be anticipated an interesting combination of the two series of phenomena or an interesting interplay between the two sets of controls. This theme may be pursued through p. 334 and Chapter XXXIII to the chapter, falling in the second volume of this text and not yet numbered when this page goes to press, dealing with the interplay between Margery and William Cartheuser.

23 A typical bit of Walter humor.—J. M. B.
24 See Chaps. XLI, XLII.
CHAPTER IX

The Code-Hoagland Episode

By the Editor

In August, 1924, Mr. Foster Damon, Instructor of English at Harvard, was introduced to the Crandons and had a sitting. At several occasions during the ensuing autumn he returned to the Lime Street seance room, bringing with him Mr. Robert Hillyer and Mr. Grant H. Code, incumbents of academic positions similar to his own. The three made, in the academic and literary sense, a rather distinguished group. Damon has conducted a good deal of research into the practices of medieval alchemy, which he finds to parallel present-day metapsychics to a surprising degree. Hillyer is a poet of some distinction; Code has written verse and short stories, and in addition is an amateur conjurer and contortionist of rather more than average ability.

From what they saw of the mediumship in the latter part of 1924 (Damon having six sittings, Hillyer and Code three each), they acquired a state of mind which I think may best be described as comprising a large degree of incipient conviction. This went to the length where one of them presented Margery with a copy of his latest book, with an enthusiastic inscription on the fly-leaf testifying to his belief in her supernormal powers; and where they used their experiences in Lime Street as a basis for the assignment of themes to their undergraduate courses. In addition, the entire group in a general way and Code in particular came into a cordial personal friendship with the Crandons.

These young men at this time were quite out of patience with Professor McDougall for what they, in common with the Crandons and myself, regarded as his bungling consideration of the mediumship. When, as they and I saw it, Dingwall continued the identical bungling course which McDougall had pursued, and showed a large McDougall influence, their indignation became extremely real. They enlisted the aid of Mr. Hudson Hoagland, a graduate student who had previously been majoring in physics but had recently transferred his allegiance to psychology, and Mr. John Marshall, regarded as one of the more
brilliant members of the Senior class; and they began an intensive contact with the mediumship which they hoped might lead to its greater academic respectability and its more competent examination. I believe that they had no more definite plan, at first, than this. Their first renewed contact came on March 13th, 1925, when Damon, Marshall and Hillyer attended a seance, being the only sitters outside Adler and the immediate family. The same three, plus Hoagland, sat on the 15th, this being Hoagland’s introduction as the seance of the 13th was Marshall’s.

Following this, the aims of the Harvard group became somewhat more ambitious, turning more or less definitely in the direction of a set series of seances to be conducted by them. In anticipation of this, they had turned their attention to the construction of seance-room apparatus; and they had produced a very much better thought-out and better finished version of the mechanical bell-box than that which Dingwall had hastily constructed for use in his own sittings. It is this bell-box which I describe on page 117; Dingwall’s own model was relatively crude. The general principles of design follow his, however; and inasmuch as the introduction of the new mechanical bell-box resulted in the old one’s becoming obsolete, it has been customary to refer to the new one, like the old, simply as the Dingwall bell-box. The details of the design, and all the work of construction, it must be emphasized, are to be credited to the young men from Cambridge.

They brought this revised Dingwall bell-box to Lime Street on March 29th and attempted a sitting, with Marshall, Damon and Hoagland in more or less complete control of all potential sources of fraud. They drew a total blank. Walter explained, after they had gone, his reasons for withholding the phenomena; and promised to do better the next time they came. The record of this date is drawn in a form which seems to recognize Hoagland as the active head of the Harvard group. It is a fact that the others brought him in, with the idea that he had a laboratory technique and an experience in dealing with physical problems which they lacked; and that his combination of physics and psychology was just what was needed for the work in hand. Equally, Hoagland regarded himself as the eyes and mind of the Harvard group, looking very much down upon the inexperience.

---

1 Pp. 22, 50.
2 P. 51.
3 See open reference No. 8, Vol. 2.
4 See open reference No. 9, Vol. 2.
idealism and general unscientific background of his colleagues. A little later in their game I spent a long afternoon with him at his residence, in the course of which he put to me very strongly this estimate of his own and his colleagues' abilities.

Their consideration of the mediumship now began rapidly to crystallize; and when next they sat, it was under a quite definite program of trying for something very conclusive with the Dingwall bell-box, in the absence so far as might be of all superfluous sitters. The date was April 17th; and Crandon's record may be given in full:

Present to left: Damon, Code, Adler, Marshall, Hoagland, Crandon. Walter came through promptly in about six minutes, and mutual introductions were carried out. Hoagland had brought from Harvard the finished mechanical bell-box designed by Dingwall. After getting acquainted with it for a while, Walter found no difficulty in ringing this bell with great vigor in the dark, and thereafter during the sitting whenever something else was accomplished successfully, Walter banged with great vigor upon the DB. This and all other phenomena during the evening were done under strictly double control conditions.

In the dark, Walter exhibited levitation and other forms of telekinesis of the luminous basket and the doughnut. Then he had each of the sitters in turn put his nose into the doughnut while he pulled the hair and stroked the neck of each. The big megaphone was then called for and beautiful levitation was shown, the megaphone sailing above the table in all directions with the greatest freedom.

The Harvard group was next present on May 1st; the record appears in full on page 39. While the DB was again present, the sitting shows the same thing happening to these investigators that later happened to me: their program was deflected into close coincidence with Walter's current routine. Partly on this account, and partly because of the difficulty of excluding social sitters and controlling general conditions in Lime Street, the Harvard group now advanced an extremely definite project that they be given dates for a series of highly formal sittings, to be held on premises supplied by

---

5 For the first time, in connection with this project.—J. M. B.
6 These must have involved the apparatus and the program rather than the sitters, none of whom was strange.—J. M. B.
7 A description ensues, which I omit since I cover it elsewhere.—J. M. B.
8 Dingwall bell-box.
9 See p. 50 for generalization covering this.
them and to be under their entire control save for whatever of general reservations Crandon might apply to them as he had applied to Dingwall. The immediate result of this project was séances Nos. 428, 432, 438, 442, 452, 453, 457 and 458, running from May 19th to June 30th, 1925. The ultimate result has been a very complicated series of facts and theories, about which extreme controversy has centered. Much has been published, but in fragmentary and often in partisan fashion. No orderly statement of all the facts has been attempted. Such statement, with orderly assignment of the existing literature to its proper place and without undue duplication of or quotation from such literature, is now a problem of extreme difficulty.

I may most profitably set down first, without further explanation for the moment, that the young men from Harvard finally adjudged the mediumship to be wholly without validity. I may then briefly summarize the chronology of publication. Following a period of uncertainty as to whether their findings were to be published at all, and as to the form and place of publication, Hoagland submitted to the Atlantic Monthly a semi-popular account of their work. This appeared in the Atlantic for November, 1925, page 666; I cite it hereafter as Hoag. Atl. In the Journal of the A.S.P.R. for December, 1925, I published a criticism of Hoagland's article, both in matters of its face value and in matters of my own inside information of its delinquencies and those of its author and his colleagues; all leading me to conclude that this "exposure" possessed as little merit as Houdini's had done. This article I cite hereafter as B. vs. H. Then, Hoagland having published only his conclusions with a running comment upon such of his data as were most in harmony with these, and there being no apparent hope of getting the full séance records before the public in any other way, a group of Dr. Crandon's friends published a pamphlet, the main purpose of which was to carry these records, but in which space was also given to considerable material in rebuttal of the claims of the Harvard group. The title of this pamphlet is Margery-Harvard-Veritas; it appeared privately in Boston in 1926, though its title page carries a copyright date 1925; I cite it hereafter as M. H. V. Although other material dealing primarily or incidentally with the issues arising out of this episode has appeared elsewhere, these three citations are all we need to make at this point of our story.

By these citations, we may consider that the séance records themselves, Hoagland's treatment of them, and such of the defence as ap-
pears in B. vs. H. or in M. H. V. are read into the present record. The first two are obviously available to my readers; any who have not seen the third may get copies from Crandon while they last. I may, however, summarize briefly the salient points of the Harvard sittings. All were held either in Emerson Hall, Harvard, or in Hoagland’s residence. The official make-up of the investigating group was to include only Code, Hoagland, Damon, Hillyer and Marshall. At their pleasure, faculty members of higher rank were to be invited in as observers. Such observers were to sign the séance record and assume all other due responsibilities, but were to have a hand only indirectly in any final verdict which might issue from the investigation. The record was to be dictaphonic, and was to comprise all significant facts; there were to be no post-mortem allegations of fraud, a la Houdini.

Dr. Deborah Fawcett or some other qualified woman was always present to examine the Psychic before and after the séance; and this was to be done more seriously than ever before or since with this mediumship. Foot control was left entirely to the luminous bands; hand control was supplemented in most sittings by a galvanic current running through the circle and to a galvanometer outside the room, under constant watch of a specially detailed observer.

On two occasions, dictaphonic accident required that the record be drawn up or supplemented from the memories of the sitters. Once, when I was in Boston at the date of a sitting, I was invited to attend and did so. Other added sitters included Professor Harlow Shapley of the department of Astronomy, five times; Dr. Hilbert F. Day, surgeon, twice; Dr. E. G. Boring of the psychological laboratory, Dr. S. B. Wolbach of the Medical School, Professor W. J. V. Osterhout of the Rockefeller Institute and Professor E. B. Wilson of “Tech,” once each.

Considerable new apparatus and new procedure was used. An electrical bell-box of new model was conspicuous among these innovations, as was a plaque ruled off by luminous lines in one-inch squares and designated as the “coordinate board.” A means was employed of determining that the electrical conductivity of Walter’s terminal was substantially that of a human arm. The phenomena obtained were telekinesis, with a constantly increasing degree of silhouetting of the terminal against luminous grounds, notably the coordinate board. When I was present, the Psychic for the only time wore bloomers

---

10 See Chap. X.
scaled above and below to insulate the ordinary locus of anatomical fraud. Paraffin and modelling clay were used to secure imprints from Walter's terminal. Etc., etc.

During the course of their official sittings, the members of the group individually or collectively attended other séances in Lime Street. On May 24th all save Marshall were present at a demonstration of Richardson's voice machine. On the 31st Code and Damon attended a family gathering. On June 18th, 19th and 20th I was conducting serious séances in Lime Street; on all three occasions Damon ran the dictaphone for me and Hoagland was in the circle, while Code was present once. And on the 25th, Damon and Code brought in another English instructor, Dr. Hood, the Hole Bell-box being introduced to Walter on this occasion.

These attendances are of some importance as emphasizing that the negative conclusion reached by the group involved a turnover of opinion on their part. Of further significance in this direction is a conference which I had with Hoagland, lasting an entire afternoon on the occasion of my June visit to Boston. We discussed the things they were doing and planned to do, the program of my own sittings, the general bearings of the one undertaking upon the other and how we might best avoid duplication of effort, the actual assistance which they could render in my sittings, the make-up of their group and of my circles, etc., etc., etc.; all in a way making it utterly absurd to suppose that in Hoagland's mind at this moment there reposed any doubts about Margery's essential bona fides and validity. We even discussed the bearing which the to-be-anticipated verdict of genuineness might have upon Hoagland's academic work and his relations with McDougall, under whom he was majoring.

My first inkling that this picture had changed came in a letter from Crandon himself, advising me in a general way of the claim which had been set up that the phenomena were produced normally, under a hypnotic and auto-hypnotic setting which relieved both him and the medium of the charge of conscious fraud; and telling me of one or two interviews in which members of the group had put these views before him. My first word from any member of the group itself came a day or two later, in a letter from Code, dated July 5th. He wrote as follows:

---

11 See p. 263.  
11a See pp. 43, 61.  
11b See Chap. XIII.  
12 See pp. 60, 62, 125.
This letter is strictly confidential. Recent developments in the Lime Street case make it highly important that I see you for a confidential talk as soon as possible. The case apparently has a solution that is not dishonorable for any of the parties involved. It is not a question of the supernatural, but of a very delicate and complicated problem in abnormal psychology, the nature of which I cannot commit to writing. The strictest privacy is essential. Any publicity is to be deplored, especially since it is likely to excite, irritate and complicate a very unstable mental situation. It seems to me unwise to let the persons chiefly involved know that I have communicated with you. At present I am in a position to be able to influence them for their own good; I am acting solely as their friend; and any destruction of this confidence in me would put it out of my power to do anything for them. I write to you partly because you control some lines of publicity on the case and will best know what can be done. But I write to you chiefly as a friend of the parties involved. You have it in your power to do them inestimable service, and your intimate knowledge of the case puts you in a unique position.

The highly melodramatic working of Code’s mind, as indicated by the veiled hints in place of direct statement as to whom he was talking about, the similar pussyfooting as to what he was talking about, and the whole spirit of the letter in fact, seem entirely characteristic. In our conference, held on July 9th, he dropped the fiction that we were dealing anonymously with the parties; but he never ceased to deal anonymously with the situation. He was greatly concerned, throughout the period of my intimate contact with him, about the psychological catastrophe which hung over Lime Street and from which salvation could be achieved only through him; but beyond indicating that its incidence would follow from the moment when the Crandons themselves came to a realization of the truth of the hypnosis theory, he was never able to reduce it to any more definite terms than those of the above letter. And indeed, as much as anything the dominant reason why he wanted to see me so badly turned out to be his fear lest I publish in the Journal of the A. S. P. R. something about the work of his group and their findings. When he was assured that I had no intent of doing anything of the sort, he breathed more easily; and only then was he able to discuss other aspects of the case.

It was from Code’s lips at this time that I first had the story that

13 The wrong word; he means supernatural.—J. M. B.
has been so often retold, as to just how the great discovery was made. Substantially it came to this:

Repeatedly, during the séance of June 29th (the seventh and penultimate one held by the Harvard group), he had been dissatisfied with the appearance of the luminous anklets. It seemed to him that one of them was on the floor with a foot or a slipper lying over it to prevent it from being seen as a full circle of light. Finally, he did so see it for a moment, and he made the direct statement, for the dictaphone, that it was off the Psychic’s foot. This Walter promptly contradicted, and followed the contradiction by giving a more or less convincing display of the visibility in proper semi-circular form and of the proper mobility and other proper relationships of the two ankle-bands. But Code, and perhaps some of the others, were not convinced. As a matter of fact, Walter on the following evening admitted that “of course” the band had been off; but he said that, to save the face of the group in the presence of a very supercilious guest of Shapley’s, he had denied it at the time.

The anklet, then, it is granted by all parties, was off. The record is defective, in that it does not indicate whether the Psychic wore slippers alone, or slippers with stockings. The fact is, she wore slippers alone. Following the séance (of the 29th), Code remained behind (at Hoagland’s residence, where the sitting was held although the record fails to specify it) with Damon and Hoagland, for purposes of experiment. He found that with slippers over his bare feet and anklets of the sort used in the séance and similarly applied, he could very readily remove the luminous band, using the toes of the other foot for the purpose. He could put a foot or a loose slipper over the freed anklet to preserve its semicircular aspect; and with the free foot or feet thus attained, he could duplicate a lot of the phenomena of the mediumship. Finally, he could restore the anklets to place. The hypothesis was at once formulated that this was the modus operandi of practically all the phenomena. It is not a fact that always prior to this time Margery had sat without stockings; but with reference to the Harvard sittings it appears that this had been the case.

It will be seen that Code’s personality runs large through the preceding paragraphs. Through those that follow it will run larger. We have had Code making the critical observations and prosecuting the critical experiments on which a theory of fraud is to be based. When the group needed a spokesman to put their findings before me, to try to win me over to adherence to their findings or at least to silent
acquiescence therein, he took this function upon himself. And he did not stop here. He proceeded to formulate that precise theory of the fraudulent origin and history of the phenomena which his colleagues were to espouse; to usurp complete leadership of Hoagland's investigation, in and out of the séance-room and in all its extra-official as well as official functions; and finally, to nominate himself for the delicate office of intermediary between the Crandons and the exposers, of kind friend of the medium and her husband who was to save them from the ruination which their own folly might be expected to bring down upon them. His own story covering his actions before, during and after the final séance of June 30th is told in part in the previously cited documents, and in remaining part in a communication by him printed in the Proceedings 13 of the (British) S.P.R. All this may appropriately be outlined here.

After the séance of June 29th and the sequel thereto in which Code experimented with ways for escaping from the luminous foot-control, the means of production of the Margery phenomena were believed to have been fully discovered. Measures to prevent the use of this type of fraud were to be taken at the sitting of June 30th. It was anticipated that this séance would then either turn out a blank; or would result in the spontaneous offering of new and unfamiliar phenomena, of whatever sort and by whatever means a spontaneous grasping of opportunity might permit. This of course meant exposure.

Code, in reflecting upon the consequences of such an event, concluded that they would be disastrous. He was very fond of the Crandons. He feared that the climax séance, if carried through according to schedule, would lead to a confrontation scene, in which Margery would be denounced in some way by his colleagues. He thought it better to break the news to her more gently, and to avoid entirely the possible conflict of a more or less open exposure. In addition, there was the consideration, hinted at in his letter to me, that if she or Crandon or both were brought to a full acceptance of the theories of the Harvard group as to the causation of the phenomena, he feared the emotional results which would then ensue; he went so far as to speak of possible insanity or break-down of the family ties under this stress. Just how this double psychological factor was to work out if he did not interfere with the plans of his colleagues for the exposure, he does not make anywhere clear; nor does he explain how the same

consequences were to be avoided in the slower and less dramatic exposure, and conviction in their own minds, which he must have expected would follow any steps that he might take to prevent the emergency of the moment. We are told only that he felt the call to rush into the breach and save the Crandons from the situation which threatened to engulf them.

Likewise there is lacking any published history of the development, in his own mind, of his theories as to the causation of the phenomena. It is not stated anywhere that he had any serious doubts of the phenomena prior to June 29th, and apparently he had none. But on June 30th he was in a position to talk fluently about his theory exculpating the Crandons from any conscious fraud. The basic idea is a rather elusive one; it partakes of the nature of hypnosis but must not be identified with hypnosis in the strict technical sense; it seems to lie on middle ground somewhere between true hypnosis and mere intense autosuggestion with complications. The upshot is that through the motivation unintentionally supplied by Crandon's keen interest and desire, and by other less definite and less respectable factors such as Margery's enjoyment of the limelight, Margery herself is pictured as going into this indeterminate state of amnesic suggestibility, wherein her physical resources, sharpened as always under hypnosis, are utilized for physical fraud without her concurrent knowledge or subsequent memory. There would have to be a good deal of extra-séance preparation, and for this we are told that she lapses into the near-hypnotic state at convenient moments during the day. There would have to be release of her hand and other active confederacy by Crandon, and for this we are told that he too lapses into that state. There would have to be extra-séance preparation by him of the surgical specimens used teleplasmically; the theory passes over this entirely, save as it is covered by the following fact: Individual members of the Harvard group were never in accord as to just how far we may picture the two Crandons as consciously and deliberately helping out a Walter who came into existence, initially, in the way indicated, as a semi-hypnotic impersonation of the dead brother, and in whose reality they have faith. Indeed, it has not been demonstrated to me that any of them save Code ever gave this hypothesis H, as it came to be called, more than the most perfunctory adhesion.

Code insists vehemently that he did not cook the theory up out of whole cloth as a mere means of shielding the Crandons from more infamous charges. At the time, he protested violently that he believed
it, that it was the truth and the whole truth and nothing but the truth. His conduct throughout the controversy, however, as well as during the 1926 discussions, public and private, arising out of Margery’s warfare with her critics, makes it impossible for me to give credit to this, and convinces me that Hypothesis H was a deliberate and cold-blooded fabrication, to save him from the pain of charging conscious fraud against a lady whom he greatly admired. I do not believe that he himself ever credited it, for a moment. And it is wholly clear to me that he nowhere explains satisfactorily the very rapid genesis of this hypothesis in his mind. What he does tell us is that, moved as explained above by the fear of the consequences of a sudden and dramatic exposure and a self-conviction, he went to Lime Street in the daytime of June 30th and had a longish interview with Margery. He described to her the events of the previous evening, and tried to convince her that the phenomena had been produced by normal means. He thinks he succeeded in this; he found her reactions strongly in line with the idea that the trickery was unconscious and that she first learned of it through his words. She was frightened and asked his advice. He in turn was prepared to go to any length to prevent the threatened disaster of dramatic exposure. He suggested that they adjourn to the séance room so that he might consult Walter. He tells us that this was done; that Walter came through promptly; and that, Margery being in trance and without knowledge of what was said, arrangements were made for Code to serve as confederate in the séance of that evening. He was to occupy the seat of control at the Psychic’s right; and he agreed to release her hand, to slide the luminous band up to her elbow so the hand might be used, etc.

In the séance he executed this agreement. His colleagues were baffled when their expectations of a blank were defeated; but after the medium had left the premises Code assembled them and explained to them what he had done in the séance. He did not tell them the story of his private sitting; he presumably left them to infer that he had acted entirely “on his own.” That he had done the things during the séance which he claimed to have done, their own observations of the séance action plus their own newly found willingness to believe this fraudulent forced them to believe. For his entire statement therefore they took his word so far as the facts were concerned, and apparently raised no question of the propriety or motivation of his conduct.

In their private conference, Walter and Code had agreed that in
order not to "worry" Crandon, this conference would best be kept secret from him. Code and Margery made the same agreement after she emerged from trance. She accordingly expected Code to say nothing about the visit to the séance room, confining any revelations he might make to the conference with her in the living room and withholding any statement of the agreement alleged to have been reached. She said nothing about it herself; when Code was first quoted to her as having told of it she denied it; since then, of course, she must continue to deny it. Code is thus able to explain very plausibly the conflict, to which we shall in due course come, between Margery and himself as to what occurred on this day. I of course need not emphasize that the preceding few paragraphs represent my abstract of Code's story, and that I entertain the strongest reservations as to its correspondence with the facts.

It is not necessary to read into the last remark any accusation of direct and deliberate lying on Code's part. All who were in the slightest degree on the inside of the situation as it existed in July, 1925, knew that Code was a person of most unstable emotional make-up, and that he had the strongest specific emotional reactions toward the Crandons and toward every angle of the case. It is a fact that he derives the keenest intellectual pleasure out of his ability as a contortionist and amateur conjurer, out of his ability to reproduce fake psychical effects, out of his position as an exposé of mediums in general or in particular, and finally, like Houdini, out of his supposed ability to expose any mediumship. With this quirk of Code's mental make-up I had ample experience when I took him to Lily Dale with me in August, 1925, on a general scouting tour to see whether any of the mediums at that place were worthy of attention. Always his assumption was that the phenomena of each case were fraudulent and that all remaining for us to do was to learn how they worked.

A further fact known to all his friends was that Code's personal affairs at the time were in a troubled state; that his emotions were being run ragged by these troubles; that he came often to Lime Street seeking opportunity to discuss these troubles with Margery. His correspondence of the period with the Crandons gives every suggestion that his mental turmoil was eased by the advice which she gave him, and equally by the abstract factor of the contact which he had with her. She tells me that he more than once was reduced to tears in their talks about what he was best to do with himself. Certainly during the
two weeks in which I saw so much of him en route to and in Lily Dale, he was quite unable to conceal the degree to which his emotional life was being lived in Lime Street. One in particular of his letters to Margery gives a most extraordinary exhibit of the incoherent babbling of things better left unsaid. The document in question was a sort of farewell effusion, written after the denouement of the investigation and after he had left Boston for his new position in Delaware, and hence at a time when it seemed that there would be no further occasion for contact or correspondence. At one stage in late October of 1925, when both parties were firing broadsides at each other through the columns of the Boston Herald, the Crandons were so provoked by Code's part in the needless publicity that they had serious thoughts of publishing this document. Entirely as a matter of friendship, I wrote to him advising him of this, and suggesting that if he felt any compunction about having it appear in public he would do well to minimize his part in the published controversies. I suppose I should have been prepared to have him interpret this in accordance with the following extract from his British Proceedings article: "Mr. Bird warned me of the attack that would be made upon me, outlined the attack, and advised me that the less I had to say the better."

Now I have no wish to persecute Code. But I must spread these facts upon the record, for the simple reason that so very large a portion of the Harvard case against Margery rests upon his testimony. I have not the least doubt that Code's emotional state with reference to the case was such as to make accurate reporting by him quite out of the question. He was in no state to attempt observations of any description, or to remember what he had observed. Most certainly he was in no state to guard against subconscious fabrication, or against the zealous acceptance and championing of a story which he might have told in the first place under the impression that the end justifies the means. Once we have realized the degree to which the case against Margery depends on Code's evidence; the degree to which he was disqualified from testifying; and the degree to which anything he told his colleagues at any time was at once, automatically and uncritically accepted as necessarily valid, and made part of their case and basis of their further procedure—once we realize all this, we must feel that the gravest discredit attaches to the whole structure.

I have gone into some of the specific facts and charges in B. vs. H., and others have been threshed over in M. H. V. I do not propose here
to review the entire controversy; but into certain aspects on which I have material not heretofore published I must go. Take for instance the matter of the anklets on June 29th. Evidently the prosecution must allege that the anklet was deliberately removed, and that such removal was habitual; evidently the defence must plead that it fell off accidentally and that this accident was unique. The evidence—even that adduced by the prosecution—is largely favorable to the defence. For the Crandons tell us that the anklet fell off on this date not through unaccountable eccentricity, but because it was different from and larger than the anklets previously used. It was the custom for the Psychic to bring with her to the Harvard séances the luminous control bands which she had in her possession for routine use in Lime Street. On the evening of June 29th, they tell us, they brought these bands as usual but they were not used. Instead, the record testifies:  

The bands the Psychic wore had been made by the observers and substituted for the bands which she had brought with her. She had complained before the sitting that the ankle bands were too loose, and had attempted to tighten them with safety pins. The band’s coming off during the sitting was thus made possible by the carelessness of the observers.

To this the Crandons add that the bands thus substituted were twelve inches in circumference, as against eight inches for her usual ones. The attempt to tighten them was unsuccessful and was abandoned; and to take up the superfluous length, the band, instead of being put snugly on the ankle, was placed across from the instep to the heel of the slipper, with no adequate support or fastening. One acquainted with trance restlessness would feel safe in predicting that the bands would come off.

I met Code in New York on the evening of September 9th, as he passed through the city en route to his new job in Newark, Del. We discussed the claims which I have set down above, and he put forward a counterclaim which I asked him to reduce to writing. As a result, he wrote me on September 11th to this effect:

I made all the anklets and wristlets used at Harvard with the exception of those Margery brought with her. I measured them by my own wrists and ankles, not having Margery’s handy at the time. They stretched somewhat in use. At first Margery wore

---

14 M. H. V., p. 76.
her own, which were painted on one side only and were so dim that we had difficulty keeping sight of them.\textsuperscript{15} On one occasion, Shapley suggested on account of some phenomenon or other in the region of the foot that Margery wear a pair of ours instead of her own. On one occasion Walter permitted us to put a bright pair on her during a séance. It was customary to keep all the anklets exposed to light for some time before the séance and until they were needed. Then some one of us distributed them to the sitters.\textsuperscript{16} At Emerson, I usually attended to this. At Hoagland's house on the 29th of June Hoagland took Margery\textsuperscript{17} a pair of ours. There was no planting of large anklets on Margery at any time. The anklets were distributed at random from a common heap. Margery found her pair too large on June 29th, and reduced the size by pinning them with safety pins. Thus pinned, the anklets were precisely the size of her own, which were ten inches in circumference, quite large enough to slip on and off at will. There was no suggestion of this big anklet talk until June 30th. After the sitting of June 29th, in which the anklet had been reported off, Margery specifically called attention to the fact that they were so tight they cut into her ankles. This fact was verified at the time by Crandon, who removed the right anklet, and by Day, who removed the left. You must remember that at this sitting Walter had denied the anklet was off. At the sitting of June 30th Walter admitted the anklet was off, and covered himself by saying it was too big and had fallen off. This is the origin of the big anklet story, and it is nonsense. Margery never wore anklets big enough to fall off. Any elastic anklet big enough to wear is big enough to take off.

I have pointed out\textsuperscript{18} that on their own showing of fact it took these young men six successful séances plus an accident to discover that a luminous garter can be removed from a lady's bare ankle if it is not in some way attached to the skin—or to a stocking. I now point out that Code's excess of enthusiasm for his story runs away with him. In the first place, if the garters, as pinned to take up the slack, were the same size as her own, they would not have cut into her ankles; so one of these statements is false. Further, a garter tight

\textsuperscript{15}The séance records bear this out, so far as regards the matter of poor visibility.—J. M. B.
\textsuperscript{16}In this connection, as well as in the light of the remark, a little earlier, about all the anklets used at Harvard, it should be pointed out that the custom was for all sitters to wear the luminous controls.—J. M. B.
\textsuperscript{17}I.e., took upstairs to her dressing room.—J. M. B.
\textsuperscript{18}B. vs. H., p. 726.
enough to cut into the ankle I do not believe can be systematically removed by the use of the toes of the other foot alone, without sufficient noise and commotion to attract even the sluggish attention of such investigators as the first remark of this paragraph shows these to be. Getting it back on again would involve an easier problem, since here the toes may get under and around it while it hangs loosely on the foot. But to get it off, the toes must to some degree get under it as it sits upon the ankle, so tightly as to cut in. And they must do this without too much of noise or of synchronous movement of the two feet; for the first garter must be removed by a foot which carries its luminous control. Finally, Code’s insistence that the garters were entirely proper and that the whole story of loose garters is a baseless fabrication suffers heavily in the face of the recorded statement that the Psychic “had attempted to tighten them with safety pins,” plus the recorded admission that “the band’s coming off was made possible by the carelessness of the observers.” And when Code admits that the garters had to be tightened but still claims that the big ankle story is absolute fiction, to some degree he directly contradicts himself. No: the whole body of evidence suffers too much from the evident desire to make out a case.

I do not think that my favorable opinion upon the mediumship blinds me to the weight of evidence pro and con. It seems to me that, weighing all the factors here adduced, there is no valid evidence that the ankles were out of control other than through accident; and that the story told by the defence is in every respect as inherently plausible and as much in consonance with the records, as is that of the prosecution. And since the whole argument could so easily have been eliminated before it started by using stockings or plaster, the investigators ought to some extent to be bound by the results of their own stupidity. If they reported the phenomena valid, we should be entitled to throw them out on the ground of their bad control; must we not refuse to recognize their plea of fraud based upon that same bad control, and remind them that on their own showing all they can testify is, that they do not know what happened in their presence?

The only other point in Code’s story which we need consider in any detail is his picture of his “private séance” with Walter, at which the plot was hatched for his confederacy on the evening of June 30th. It will of course be appreciated that this sitting was supposed either to turn out a blank, or to give action fundamentally different from that
of its predecessors. It did neither of these things; it gave admirable
action, of approximately the usual sort. The other members of the
group were very much at a loss to explain this in their own minds, until
Code got them together after the séance and confessed that he had
created the phenomena. He did not tell them of his conference with
Walter, but let it be supposed that he had acted wholly on his own
initiative. But in the ensuing week he told at least one of them pri-
vately about it, and by the time the report was ready for publication
in the Atlantic they all knew of the claim in a general way.

I am not able to determine to what degree Code has told a single
consistent story from the very beginning, and to what degree his story
has been modified as he went along. In his British article, he gives
what purports to be a contemporaneous documentary record, but one
that is not at all impressive when analyzed internally. In this
record, for instance, there occurs a deal of conversation between Code and
Walter. Walter is represented as calling Code "Old Chap"; as
using the words "awfully decent" in characterization of Code's con-
duct; as saying "Cheery-o" in farewell; and as speaking generally
like an English schoolboy. Nobody who has ever once sat in Lime
Street can possibly accept this as remotely parallel to Walter's man-
ner, and any such person must wonder whether the record is not
stamped on its face as apocryphal by these words which it seeks to put
in Walter's mouth—whether these words are not explained by Code's
knowledge that he was writing for an English audience.

Equally damning to the authenticity of this record is the picture
which it gives of Walter's character. One who has seen and heard
Walter's vigorous dealing with all the emergencies that have confronted
him since the "Piece of String" adventure of November, 1923, finds
it utterly beyond credit to have him pictured as meeting this emergency
with a whining, reiterated, "What are we going to do?" Walter solves
his own problems, he doesn't bring them to his sitters for solution; and
if he is baffled he says so in a straightforward fashion possessing no
common factor with the exhibit which Code tries to give us. If Walter
(a spirit, a prosopopesis, even a fake if you insist; I speak merely
of the séance-room Walter as I have met him, without reference to what
he really is) tried to assume the attitude in which Code puts him, he
couldn't do it. One might as well represent Mr. Wilson begging his

19 M. M., Chapter XVI.
18a See open reference No. 33, Vol. 2, for comment by Hoagland on this and
other points.
Cabinet for advice in a trying situation, or Mr. Ford torn in his mind over the advisability of spending a million dollars for a machine that would save ten dollars and six minutes in the manufacture of every car. No: this story, so long withheld and so patly produced, is clearly apocryphal.

Finally, we come to a specific denial of Code's story, by a witness. It has been hinted previously that when Code called at 10 Lime Street on the afternoon of June 30, 1925, he thought he was alone in the house with Margery but thought this mistakenly. As soon as the Crandons were aware of the nature of Code's story, Margery herself went through the formalities of recording her denial in due form; and at the same time they interviewed the witness of whom I speak, and got a signed statement from her. Getting both parties concerned before a notary was a matter of considerable difficulty and some procrastination. I doubt that this culminating step would ever have been reached had it not been for the stimulus provided through the publication in the British Proceedings of January, 1927. In the interval between November, 1925, and June, 1927, I ought to say, through misunderstanding by the Crandons with regard to the precise nature of an affidavit or through some looseness in the use of terms, the mere signed statement was sometimes spoken of by them as an affidavit, and knowledge of its existence became fairly general under that mistaken designation. Both affidavits in question follow:

Boston, Mass., November 24, 1925.

This is to certify that June 30, 1925, about noon, Mr. Grant H. Code came to call on me at my house at 10 Lime Street. At that time he was an Assistant in English at Harvard College and was a member of a group of young Harvard instructors who were having sittings at Harvard College with me.

He was admitted to the house by Mrs. Lizzie Waters and made his way up one flight, where I met him in what we call the book room. Mrs. Waters is what is called an accommodator, and occasionally comes to help in my domestic work.

He came to discuss the episodes of the sitting which had taken place the previous night, and incidentally to talk over his personal affairs, as a man might discuss them with his mother or sister. He stayed about twenty minutes and did not leave the book-room, brightly lighted with sunshine, until he left it to go out of the house.

There was no "sitting." There was no trance. We did not go to the séance room.

Mina S. Crandon.
THE CODE-HOAGLAND EPISODE

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

Suffolk, ss.: Boston, June 3, 1927.

Then personally appeared the above named Mina S. Crandon and made oath that the foregoing statement by her subscribed is true.

Before me,

WENDELL P. MURRAY,
Notary Public
My commission expires Dec. 13, 1929.

AFFIDAVIT OF MRS. LUCY K. WATERS

I, Lucy K. Waters, residing at 55 Hopedale Street, Allston, Massachusetts, hereby certify upon oath that in June of 1925, I was employed by Mrs. Le Roi G. Crandon, of 10 Lime Street, Boston, doing sewing work; that in the latter part of that month, in response to a ring at the front door, I admitted a gentleman who stated his name was Mr. Code, and that he desired to see Mrs. Crandon.

My attention was directed to his appearance because he wore no hat, and his socks were loose and hanging over the sneakers which he wore. I recall that his coat and trousers were not of the same color.

I went up the front stairs and spoke to Mrs. Crandon, who asked me to have the gentleman come up to the book room on the second floor, and he did come up the front stairs to that room, and I immediately went up the back stairs to a room on the same floor, where I took up some sewing. There are no doors between the room in which I was sitting, sewing, and the book room, and I was able to hear without difficulty the voices of the gentleman and Mrs. Crandon in conversation, but I did not overhear any of the words, but Mr. Code seemed to be very nervous and worried about something for I could hear him walking up and down, and his voice sounded as though he was sobbing a little.

He remained in that room about twenty minutes, and then went down the front stairs with Mrs. Crandon, and left the house. Neither he nor she left the book room at any time while he was there except when he was going out.

No one went upstairs to any room higher than the book room. When Mrs. Crandon went down the front stairs with the gentleman, I went down the back stairs to the kitchen, for luncheon, and within a moment or two Mrs. Crandon came down to the kitchen, and we all had luncheon together.
I have previously given a statement of this matter to Dr. Cran- don, about six or eight months ago, and I have also told Mr. Bligh Bond all of the facts which are stated above.

Lucy K. Waters.

Commonwealth of Massachusetts

Suffolk, ss.: Boston, June 3, 1927.

Then personally appeared the above named Lucy K. Waters, and made oath that the statements contained in the foregoing affidavit by her subscribed are true.

Before me,

Wendell P. Murray,
Notary Public
My commission expires Dec. 13, 1929.

Now the above affidavits have their weak points and their inconsistencies, but I think all these are explicable on natural grounds and that they weaken the case for the defence little, if any. We shall have to conclude, for instance, that the sewing lady knows her own name better than Margery knows it. That Mrs. Waters does not attempt to fix the precise date of an eighteen-months-old observation is to her credit rather than to her discredit. As regards the obvious plea that the day of which she speaks is some other day on which Code came to the house, it is true that he came often; but I believe he will not deny that Mrs. Waters admitted him on June 30th, and that this was unusual if not unique. And if these affidavits be attacked on the ground of the long period elapsing between the date of which they speak and that on which they are drawn, I can only point out that Margery can hardly meet an accusation until it has been made, and that if she is telling the truth about the events of June 30th, she could not know of this accusation until she read of it in the Boston Herald or it was reported to her by some one having an earlier knowledge, of it.

In point of fact Code claims credit for having told his story to his friends during the summer of 1925, and claims that what he finally published in 1927 is the same story. I will testify that the story of the above affidavits is the one which Margery has always told, from the moment when I first had knowledge of Code's claims about the private conference between himself and Walter; and I will point out that she is on no worse ground, as regards delay in getting it into a public document, than is Code.
If we are to reject the story that Code tells, we must have some sensible theory that will comport with the known and undisputed facts. Such a theory is not difficult of construction. Margery's own story of the interview of the afternoon of June 30th affords the only clue we require. She says that Code told her of the events of the previous séance; that he told her their belief as to the physical facts of the séance; and that he unfolded Hypothesis H to her in explanation of her share in these facts. He then explained that Crandon would undoubtedly go insane if he came to know all this; and proposed his own confederacy during the coming séance. It was in connection with this proposal that Margery said: "You frighten me." She turned it down emphatically, putting the refusal on the ground which she thought most likely to appeal to Code: that he would stand an excellent chance of detection, and that this would ruin him. After satisfying himself that the refusal was final he left. Even if one were willing to infer that she might go into trance and emerge again without knowledge that she had been "out," this supposition would be barred by the necessity for her going, consciously, with Code to the upper floor.

This story checks exactly with Code's, so far as it goes, and suggests that so far Code is telling the truth. If we then picture Code at the evening's sitting, still in the grip of his determination to prevent the dramatic exposure, we shall find him in control of the entranced Psychic and in a position to produce phenomena, to move her luminous control, etc., etc., to his heart's content, with neither her nor anybody else to say him nay. We cannot, therefore, deny his claim to a share in the phenomena of the evening; we can merely deny that he cooperated with Walter's or Margery's consent. He could do anything save drop her hand completely—the galvanometer control was in effect to prevent this. He might even shift the luminous control and his own point of contact with her arm, and then imagine that the phenomena were produced by the hand which he had thus rendered free and had thus put out of his immediate control. In point of fact, Shapley during this sitting of June 30th made certain observations, of which he drew up an independent and contemporaneous memorandum, in complete ignorance of Code's claims. This memorandum he left on his desk on sailing for Europe and it was found by his secretary and placed at the disposal of Code and his colleagues. While apparently not demanding the hypothesis that the medium's hand was free to the extent which the Harvard group would like to believe, this document is entirely consistent with such hypothesis.
So much for the bare facts of Code's behavior. Let us now examine the rationale of his conduct as he describes it to us. Was it a course of action likely to lead to the ends at which he tells us it was pointed? Was it a course which a rational person, free from emotional disqualifications, would have followed in pursuit of those ends? That it was not, appears inescapably from the very first moment when consideration began to be given the question of what the Harvard group were to do with their findings. From this moment, Code was in an impossible position. He himself tells us, in his British Proceedings paper:

I could not bring myself to believe that an account of these tricks was an adequate explanation of the entire mediumship. In fact, it seemed to me that an account of these tricks published without a study of the subjective phenomena and of the human relations behind them would give, not a true but a false idea both of the mediumship and of the persons involved in it. Yet, as a member of an investigation committee, I had been limited to a study of the physical phenomena. Upon these phenomena only could I make a public report. The evidence which I could give that bore on the subjective phenomena and on the human side of the mediumship I felt that I had obtained in confidence and could not publish. Therefore I gave my complete view of the case to the Crandons and to my fellow investigators and opposed as far as I was able publicity of any kind.

This seems a very polite and conservative way of saying that Code was between the devil and the deep blue sea. He couldn't permit his evidence to be published and he couldn't permit it to be withheld. That this dilemma would arise should have been evident from the first. Was it reasonable to suppose that a dozen or so excellent university men, having made a research of this degree of interest and importance, were going unanimously to agree not to publish anything about it? Such supposition was the height of idiocy. Of course one could hardly have predicted that one of them would go to the length of publishing it in a popular magazine in highly garbled form and of encouraging lurid newspaper stories based upon this publication; but this unexpectedness of denouement is a matter of degree only and not one of kind.

Code's procedure as he paints it was therefore one certain to

20 Not quite true, of course; there were numerous things which he concealed from one of the Crandons, and for a time at least from his colleagues.—J. M. B.
THE CODE-HOAGLAND EPISODE

involve him in precisely the dilemma in which he now found himself. Moreover, it was a procedure that could not possibly lead to the result which he was seeking. He admits this tacitly on the spot, by telling his colleagues that very evening what he had done; thereby reconstituting the emergency which he has just now relieved. It must have been evident to the muddiest intellect that Code's course could not possibly do more than postpone the crisis which he feared; and that in the postponement it would be made all the worse. So Code's whole conduct, if we accept his story, was idiotic and without effective motive.

There are numerous other grounds on which one must take exception to this story. For one thing, in conversation with me throughout the summer of 1925, he was always very emphatic in his endorsement of my objections to the 

post fact

procedure of mediumistic investigation. This had been practiced upon Margery first by Houdini and later by McDougall, and conversation between Code and me on the subject was therefore not without plenty of illuminating material to serve as text. That you cannot collect the sitters after the medium is gone, and explain to them that she did thus and so, that the phenomena were produced by a fraud of which you were aware during the séance and which you could have prevented, but which you elected neither to prevent nor to record, is fully known to Code. Why, then, should we believe that at the first convenient opportunity he adopted this procedure as his own?

Again: Margery has been through the stress of exposure before. She kept her head admirably during the Houdini mess. If we read Dingwall's report with our attention centered upon the hypothesis of fraud, we shall find an incident where, on this hypothesis, Dingwall had made a vastly more critical observation than anything Code ever claimed to have made. This record shows us the teleplasmic mass, which for the purposes of the present argument we assume to have been produced fraudulently from within the Psychic's body, lying inert upon her thigh. It must be got upon the table, and since Crandon is not in his accustomed place at the medium's right, she cannot free a hand for use in this service. She must therefore seize it with one of her hands held by one of the investigators, and thus held she must toss it upon the table. Its position is unfortunately such that the effort to reach it with her right hand, under Worcester's control, is out of the question; accordingly she must employ the left, held by Dingwall.

He tells me in conversation that by his announcement or by some other element of his behavior—I am not now positive which and am not now able to consult him—it must have been made evident to a fraudulent operator that he was fully conscious of the movement of the left hand and the possible significance of this. The incident therefore is altogether as critical as any situation that ever existed in the presence of the Harvard group collectively or of Code individually. Moreover, both personally and in virtue of his official connection Dingwall was a far more formidable figure than Code; and if Margery is going to break down and lose her nerve and weep on the metaphorical shoulder of her exposé, it will surely be in Dingwall's presence rather than in Code's. But she didn't! The most extreme advocate of the hypothesis of fraud will find that she never lost command of the situation with Dingwall for one split second, in the face of the most damning observations which such advocate could possibly conceive. After this, when Code asks us to believe that his elucidation to her of his wild and woolly hypothesis would break her down and strike panic in her heart to the point where she would as good as confess everything and make him an accomplice—well, he asks too much.

I think we may leave Code here, with the verdict that his story is quite incredible, and that it is not at all necessary to an understanding of what occurred on the two last days of the Harvard investigation. He will crop up once more, in Chapter XI, where we shall encounter another spasm of his extraordinary conduct, and one which may aid us in making a choice between idiocy and rascality as his mainspring. For the balance of the present chapter we need only consider one or two further aspects of the Harvard sittings which have not been wholly thrashed out in print. One of these relates to the claim of internal concealment of the wide variety of teleplasms produced during the séances. On at least two occasions, Margery was wearing sanitary napkins, indicating a condition which would make such concealment a physiological impossibility. In the text of the records there is no reservation from Dr. Fawcett about the reality of the menstrual condition; but there exist *ex post facto* statements by her, made at the time of newspaper controversy in October, and conveying the implied charge that the presence of the bandages was a blind, and that there was no evidence of their necessity. Later, in response to private inquiry by Hyslop, on my behalf and admittedly for citation in this volume, she made a statement of similar content; but one which was ambiguous and incomplete, and one whose ambiguity and incomplete-
THE CODE-HOAGLAND EPISODE

MARGERY
HARVARD
VERITAS

A STUDY
in PSYCHICS

Mark W. Richardson, A.B., 1889; M.D., 1894, Harvard.
Charles S. Hill, A.B., 1882, Wesleyan; Harvard L.S. 1895-7
Joseph DeWyckoff, Lawyer.

The title page of an "anonymous" pamphlet; see p. 110.
ness were only cleared up after specific and leading questions had been put to her. The Crandons of course alleged at the time and have maintained ever since that the condition indicated by these napkins was present. It is not wholly impertinent to remark that Dr. Fawcett is an old friend of Damon's parents.

When I attended one of the Harvard séances, on June 22nd, the Psychic wore a pair of Mrs. Hoagland's bloomers, sealed above and below in such a way as to make impossible their undetected removal. This of course is a deliberately applied control for the prevention of anatomical concealment, and is of much more value than the fortuitous control afforded by the presence of catamenia. It was perhaps the most important single means of control used at this séance. Yet no mention was made of it in the record by the investigators, and had it not been for Walter's own humorous reference to the Psychic's "cast-iron breeches" it would not have got into the document at all.

It is incidents like this that lend some degree of color to Crandon's insistence that the whole Harvard exposure represents a deliberate attempt to discredit the mediumship, arising out of an anti-psychical prejudice in administrative circles at Harvard and gaining force as it was handed down through McDougall 23 to the young men working under his direction or influence. I have avoided this allegation of bad faith in the present text; but it is accepted by so many people that the story would be incomplete without at least a passing reference to it.

There remain one or two points to be mentioned, in which the M. H. V. pamphlet has been attacked by the Harvard group and their sympathizers. For this purpose we must cite an article by Prince, under the title "A Review of the Margery Case," which appeared 24 in more or less direct response to the pamphlet. In some respects it is merely amusing, as when it cites the pamphlet as "Anonymous." I reproduce the M. H. V. title-page and invite my readers to judge how microscopic a search for the names of the authors has been prosecuted by Prince. I suppose he would rest his case on the absence of the little word "by." But surely there is no ambiguity about the authorship and responsibility; and any effort to make it appear that there is smacks strongly of sheer animus.

The most serious charge brought against the pamphlet is that instead of republishing the Harvard séance notes in their original

23 See Chapter II.
form, as it claims to do, it makes important additions and subtractions. Under the former head we are told: "A paragraph of 108 words on page 182, declaring that in 'our minds' is 'no doubt that this mediumship is one of the most important ever recorded,' masquerades as part of the séance notes." If this is not a deliberate misstatement, it constitutes at least a very stupid attempt at critical distortion. The facts are these:

The séance notes are given, in what amounts to one chapter of the pamphlet. This chapter starts with an extensive discussion by the pamphlet authors; they finally come to the point where they say, in effect: "the full séance notes follow"; these are given; and the authors are then at liberty to continue their own text until they regard it as complete. I know no precedent for the claim that we must begin a new chapter after every extensive quotation.

The typographical arrangement is an unfortunate one. But this is due wholly to a too slavish following of the typed séance records delivered to Crandon by the Harvard group. These were not uniform in arrangement and heading; and they contained subheads which occupied a more prominent position and were in larger type than the major headings. Some of the records had no heading at all. This ill-arranged mass of material was sent to the printer with strict instructions to follow copy; and he followed it "out the window," in composing-room jargon. When he got to the ultimate end of the séance records, which technically constitute a 44-page quotation from which quotation marks were wisely omitted, he inserted a rule and went on with the authors' text. That the records are so badly arranged typographically as to make the latter portion of them look like an independent chapter from Harvard, is not the fault of the pamphlet authors. That, having completed their quotation of the records, they had only 108 words more to say, is perhaps unfortunate; but one would hardly demand that they go on after they were through merely to satisfy Prince's sense of typographical propriety. If the arrangement provokes the reader to wonder about the authorship of the paragraph in question, he will find in it amongst other things a statement that "those in charge of the mediumship gladly offer opportunity" to all proper observers to see it. If he does not then find it perfectly clear that this paragraph is by the authors of the pamphlet, I am indeed sorry for him. Had I been editing this volume, as Prince at one point insinuates to have been the case, I should have arranged this paragraph in a way that would have left even him with no excuse for a
deliberate misunderstanding of its origin; but I should have realized that in so doing I was practicing the niceties of editorship, to which one not by training and instinct an editor cannot rationally be held. There is no addition to the record here, and no sensible reader can imagine that there is; nor can I imagine that Prince honestly thought there was. What he was criticizing was the arrangement merely, and he would have been more honest to say so.

The facts about the alleged subtraction are of different order. On this ground, Prince says:

Although various addenda of the earlier and uncertain stage of proceedings are properly printed, including one written twelve days after the sitting, Hoagland’s addendum of 210 words relating to his discovery of the leg, made during the sitting and announced later the same evening, is entirely expunged, although regularly incorporated with the official notes and typed on the same page with the matter [included in M. H. V.]. Also the final 4½ pages of June 30th, partly composed of dictaphone notes of the same evening and partly of addenda supplied by members of the group, [the ellipsis covers extended description of the content of these addenda], are completely obliterated.

It is difficult to regard these charges as other than maliciously distorted. The M. H. V. pamphlet makes no claim to complete presentation of anything other than the séance notes. Crandon was a sitter; and I think it will not be seriously maintained that séance notes can be continued after his departure. Anything resulting from such continuation is plainly an addendum, by the sitters who choose to make it. The M. H. V. authors have faithfully published everything which the Harvard group dared to dictate in Crandon’s presence. Anything dictated or written in his absence, and which on submission to him he found acceptable, was granted the privilege of admission which it could not properly demand; and all such matter is distinguished, for the reader’s eye, from the séance records proper. Anything dictated or written in Crandon’s absence and which he does not accept enjoys no privileges whatever; Crandon and his co-authors are entirely within

---

25 The discovery, not the addendum. Application to Prince’s text of his own ridiculous standards would easily lead to the charge that he was here seeking to make it appear that the addendum had been dictated during the séance.—J. M. B.

26 To his colleagues, after the departure of the Crandons. Here, I cease playing with the idea of censure, and actually censure Prince for withholding mention of the ex post facto element involved.—J. M. B.
their rights in refusing the leave to print to such material. It is not part of the record; it is part of the scheme of interpretation agreed upon by certain sitters and rejected by others. Why should these others be asked to print it? If any further emphasis on its *ex post facto* character were required, I need only cite the occurrence, in the document which Prince demands be printed as part of the June 30th record, of remarks by Wolbach and Day, who *were not even present* on that date! McDougall's notion that he is privileged to make any sort of *ex post facto* observation he chooses is bad enough; but it pales into nothingness beside this quaint demand that Crandon be bound in his publication of the case by such *ex post facto* elements originating *outside the responsible membership* of the investigating group!

Let me repeat: the séance records are complete and correct in *M. H. V.*, barring the slight expurgations and the alteration throughout from "Crandon" to "FH," 27 to which Prince admits he doesn't really object. But when the other sitters attempt to incorporate riders upon the séance records, Crandon and his colleagues reserve the privilege of saying whether these may be admitted as representing the sense of all the sitters, or excluded as coming only from one element thereof. If the Harvard investigators don't like that method of publication, they are respectfully advised to publish their own records at their own expense. They may then incorporate as much extraneous matter of their own as they will, and exclude as much of Crandon's comment as seems to them damaging to their case.

---

27 To gain uniformity with the style of *M. M.*, and to avoid all suggestion that Crandon was capitalizing the case.—J. M. B.
CHAPTER X
The Bell-Boxes of Early 1925
By the Editor

One of the devices that has been longest and most freely used as a séance room tool for Walter's manipulation involves one or another application of the general idea of the closing, by his telekinetic agency, of an electric switch; which of course is followed by the lighting of a lamp or the ringing of a bell or the functioning in any predetermined way of the circuit in which the said switch is wired. This procedure is in fact such an integral part of the case that an exception must be made to our general rule of not summarizing in this volume the work done in 1923–24 and chronicled in my previous book. We must have here an outline of the early developments in this department of the phenomena, in order to examine understandingly the sequence of 1925–26 events. Further, we have now come to a place where the story of the bell-boxes constitutes a vital element in the history of the Harvard exposure. We must therefore at this point interrupt the latter long enough to enable us to set down the former.

The idea was Comstock's originally, and in its original form involved the use of a telegraph instrument. This was wired into a bell circuit, so that the bell could be rung by closing either the key or the switch of the telegraph. At about this time, however, there arose a scheme of séance philosophy which pictured Walter as much better able to work upon objects that offered a high ratio of surface to volume, or to weight, or to force required for their operation. In response to this idea, I designed and constructed a contact mechanism consisting of two eight-inch-square boards, hinged together along one edge of each and held apart in the shape of a V by a spring. At corresponding points on their inner surfaces were fastened metal contacts. If the boards were pressed together against the resistance of the spring, the V would close until these pieces of metal touched; and when wired into an electrical circuit of any sort, the device then constituted a switch. Moreover, it was a switch which was particularly designed for facility of operation by Walter, under the scheme of philosophy which I have just outlined.

114
This contact apparatus was originally a separate unit, which could be wired into any type of circuit. During July, 1924, a fixed routine was established of using it with a bell. The next logical step came with the creation of a permanent housing, in a locked wooden box, for the bell with its batteries; and as a matter of further convenience, the contact device was then firmly fastened to the top of this box. The wires issued from holes in the sides of the box and ran to the contact plates; barring such portions of their lengths as were thus exposed, all the electrical portions of the ensemble were inside the box and inaccessible to fraud.

A detailed account will be found in M.M. of the conditions under which this apparatus was used in the séances, and of whatever of climax of demonstration it achieved. At first it rang only in darkness, but with all sitters save one excluded from the room, and with conditions of hand and foot control of the medium which wrung from Carrington a definite verdict of validity. Later there was initiated a slow process of working toward ringing in the light. The bell, at a typical séance of late 1924, would first ring, freely and spontaneously, as it stood on the table in the darkness; with Crandon sometimes wholly responsible for hand control of the Psychic and sometimes other sitters sharing this with him, but with no valid safeguard against confederacy from other quarters, and usually with none against the use of head or foot by the Psychic herself. Then the bell would ring on the table in an interval of red light, during which great freedom of exploration was permitted the sitters, in search of an external connection. It would next ring on the table in red light in response to requests from the sitters, who would be instructed to ask for arbitrary combinations of long and short peals. Finally, it would ring spontaneously, while being carried about the room by various sitters, to extreme distances from Margery running as high as twelve feet. All these items were brought to a point where they were obtained in a single séance, successively and practically on demand; and the closest examination of the box, internally, before the séance, was permitted any sitter. But ringing at command while the box was off the table and in the hands of a sitter Walter pictured as adding severe difficulties to those which he had to meet in the other acts; so, while he very occasionally gave this extreme of performance, it did not become part of the routine.

The spring originally installed to keep the contact boards separated was a spiral one. The boards were kept from opening beyond a certain
distance by a strip of cloth tacked across one of the open sides of the V; and slight depressions in the inner surface of each board received the ends of the spring. Thus the spring held the boards apart; and the boards, under constriction by the cloth strip, in turn held the spring in place. McDougall, in the course of his exposure to the bell-ringing in October and November, 1924, conceived the idea that the

![Diagram of Bell-box](attachment:image.png)

Diagrammatic Sketch of Scientific American Bell-box

presence of the cloth strip might in some way add to the possibilities of fraud. To permit its elimination, a strip spring was substituted, fastened to the lower contact board and bearing against the upper one, as diagrammed. This eliminated all tendency for the top contact to fly over backward, the normal position of the spring holding it nicely, an inch or so out of contact position. At about the same time, the contacts were redesigned and improved, so that there might be no element of uncertainty to the eye, whether contact existed or not. The diagram makes this, too, clear. The changes produced no noticeable effect upon the séance action; ringing of the bell proceeded in just the way it had been proceeding, and the progress toward more brilliant performances under more brilliant conditions continued without noticeable acceleration or deceleration.

The bell-box was not used during Dingwall’s sittings, except that in the very informal séance of December 30th, 1924, it gave its usual performance, concluding with ringing while he held it aloft and turned with it in his hands. He had no suggestions to offer as to how the
thing might be done fraudulently. But he took a violent dislike to the apparatus, shaking his head again and again and exclaiming that it was "most unfortunate" that it had ever been brought into existence. So far as I could ever get anything out of him on this head, his objections were based upon the fact that, when the bell rang, he wanted to know exactly what had happened; and he did not see how he was to decide whether the contact board had been depressed, or the current carried across the gap between the contacts on a psychic bridge of some sort, or the ringing produced by some manner of psycho-electrical trick inside the box, or even by a purely telekinetic manipulation of the bell-clapper inside the box. I thought that to some degree he exaggerated this difficulty; he is the only critic who so far as I know feels any doubt that the contact board is depressed when the bell rings. And if his criticism were valid, it might be met with the rejoinder that a determination of how Walter rang the bell was exactly what was not in mind when this apparatus was designed; all that was contemplated was a rigorous exclusion of fraud. In this respect the electrical bell-box is superior to a purely mechanical one, since it permits long continuous periods of ringing during which various tests or examinations can be carried on; while any mechanical substitute evolved by Dingwall or any other person limits us to instantaneous and isolated blows on the bell with something acting like a hammer. It is strongly suggested that his true animus against the bell-box arose out of the fact that it was designed by the Scientific American Committee, of which he has never been able sufficiently to express his contempt.

Dingwall, however, faced the necessity of providing Walter with "toys" of one sort or another for telekinetic and teleplastic manipulation during his séances; and as one of these he designed a mechanical bell-box. An ordinary clapperless gong was enclosed in a box, in the upper side of which there was a small hole. Through this hole there protruded a stick of wood, which was held away from the bell by a spring. If struck a smart blow, however, the stick would descend against the bell, ring it sharply once, and rebound under the spring's recoil to its normal position. Attached to the upper end of this striker was a horizontal plate some five inches square; and this was marked with luminous paint so that when Walter used the apparatus, there might be seen a silhouette of his terminal with which he did the striking. This device, which is diagrammed, was used more or less freely in Dingwall's séances; and when he left, it remained in Lime
Street, and was used in subsequent séances. The same applies to the electrical bell-box of Scientific American model, which is still in use, with the addition of a spot of luminous paint on its contact board so that this may sometimes be seen to move in the dark. In future discussion and description, we may refer to these two pieces of apparatus as the DB and the SAB.

After Dingwall’s departure, the SAB was restored to its position of prominence in the routine of the sittings. Like the miscellaneous tele-
out at the conclusion of the experiment]. While it was ringing up in the air, however, there were two momentary stops.

If we address our attention to the possibilities of fraud in the ringing of this bell-box, certain things may be ruled out at once. Any one may explore the surface of the flapper with a magnet, and verify that it lacks magnetic properties. One species of skeptic clings pertinaciously to the idea of radio fraud, though any sitter may satisfy himself that the box carries nothing which conceivably could function as a radio receiver. Conventional magic might most profitably attempt the effect by misdirection of attention, in connection with the ringing of some other bell, elsewhere in the room. This theory is met by the facts that the flapper's motion is often observable, and that the ringing is often located in the box beyond possibility of error; also by my dictaphone records of Chapter XIV carrying the sound of the bell-ringing. The bell can obviously be rung, and synchronism obtained with the flapper's motion, if we run a wire or other connection from a guilty hand to this member; but the procedure adopted in the séance room is aimed first of all at excluding this most elementary of frauds, and is adequate to the purpose—so adequate, in fact, that no current criticism of the mediumship revolves about this hypothesis. Refusal to accept the SAB ringing as genuine now invariably falls back upon a plea originated by the conscientious objectors from Harvard—a plea that gives critical importance to the intervals of darkness that separate the ringing episodes. Margery is pictured as freeing a hand from her husband's control, and as manipulating the spring with this hand until the contact is all but closed. Preliminary ringing in darkness as the box stands on the table represents experiment and working test whereby she knows that the spring is just right. Then as the sitter takes the box in hand and rises and moves about, the constant small resultant jarring is supposed to cause the contacts to vibrate into and out of touch, producing the ringing.

This picture does not square with the facts. First, the only sounds that I have been able to get out of the box by the technique described are a series of highly staccato pickings at the bell, lasting each the merest fraction of a second and hardly to be called rings at all. If one wants continuous ringing, one must apparently bend the spring down so sharply that ringing starts while the bell stands by on the table, which almost never occurs in the séances; and under these conditions, accidental jarring is hardly enough to break contact and cause
the momentary silences. If one be content with tickings of the bell, these are to be got only by shaking the box to a degree going equally beyond accident, and leading to an audible dropping together of the metallic contact points which is more noticeable than the ringing itself and which is absent in the séance. Again; the theory seems to meet the fact in that ringing in the séances usually stops only after the bell is back on the table and the light has gone out and opportunity has thus been given for reverse manipulation of the spring; but it conspicuously fails to meet the fact that the ringing here, which has been pictured as dependent upon the vibration from an unsteady arm, continues without modification after the box is put down.

Finally, while the bell-box acts are given always substantially as described, there now and again occurs, accidentally or through design, a critical variation in detail. Thus, under the theory outlined, the bell should ring the instant it leaves the table; in fact, it often does not start until it is very well indeed away from the table. Then, too, on numerous occasions the generalization that the bell continues to ring after the box is set down and until after the light goes out, has been contradicted. The box has been known to stop its ringing on the table before the light was turned off, and even while it was still in the hands of the sitter who had carried it about. And while the rings are always long enough to support the contrast which I have drawn between them and the effect obtainable by tampering with the spring, a notable variation is observed in the number and length of the silent intervals. Often these are quite long; and when they are so, they are not usually punc-
tiated by momentary or staccato rings, as would be the case if silence or ringing was due to jarring of the spring.

We may then proceed with the records: in connection with featureless performances of the SAB, merely giving the date and the name of the sitter who lifted or carried the box or turned around with it; and in connection with important episodes which add anything to the picture of validity, giving the full record so far as it involves the bell-box.

On February 22d, J. H. Brown was the engineer, as we may call the sitter who handles the box during the séance. On March 22d, 25th and 29th, it performed only while standing on the table; the same restriction applies to April 4th. On April 8th, Holmyard was the engineer; and the record tells us explicitly that the ringing began only after he had it well off the table. On the 10th, Millea was the engineer, and the record stresses the intermittency of ringing. On the 12th, after the ringing on the table in red light to the order of various sitters which always is given when the box performs at all, we find that:

He had Miss Pierce pick up the SAB and it rang in the air while she held it; then he had her pick it up again, to show that it does not always ring when picked up. All this was in good red light.¹

On April 18th, Walton was the engineer; on the 19th, Button. The record here explicitly states that there was intermittent ringing. On the 21st, Dennett engineered the box; on the 22d, it rang only on the table. For April 24th we may give the full record of the SAB performance:

Walter rang the SAB the given number of times, as requested, in red light,² by Andrews, Mrs. Andrews and Mrs. Hale, successively. He then allowed Andrews and Mrs. Andrews successively to pick up the SAB, and it rang intermittently while each turned through 360 degrees. The ringing here began and ended in the red light. He then had Andrews pick up the box after Walter had

¹ But not all in the one interval of light, of course. In case the record may seem ambiguous to the cautious critic, I state specifically that the second demonstration which it mentions was a success; Miss Pierce picked up the box freely and it did not ring at all.—J. M. B.

² The sitter is always instructed to give his request only after the red light has come on, and it is met in this same interval of light. I think the point a somewhat strained one; but the obvious idea is to prevent tampering with the box after the order has been voiced.—J. M. B.
removed his force, to show that it did not always ring when picked up. 3

On April 25th and 28th, the teleplasmic hand was seen in red light ringing the SAB; details are given on pp. 36–39. On May 8th, Walter acted as his own critic, as he so often does:

In red light, under instructions, Edwards picked up the SAB, which then in the air rang intermittently while Edwards turned a full circle. The success of this was not entirely satisfactory to Walter, so he repeated the same thing twice, the box being once lifted by Lawrence and once by Edwards again.

On May 13th, Kwaran and Lupton engineered the box; on the 18th, Dennett and Stratton; on the 30th, Clement; on June 2d, Griscom; on the 8th, some sitter unnamed; on the 11th, Day. On the latter date, “Walter immediately after told Day to pick it up again and it did not ring.”

The very admirable performance with the bell-box during my formal sittings of June 18th, 19th and 20th is given in detail in the full records of these sittings, in Chapter XIII. Especially on the first of these dates the record adds something to the preexisting structure.

During the period covered by the above excerpts, the Dingwall model, mechanical bell-box (DB) was being used more or less as a routine instrument for telekinesis and luminous silhouetting. For the former purpose it was ridiculously inferior to the SAB, of course; for the latter purpose it was available and the SAB was not, since the one has a luminous platform and the other has not. The telekinesis of this box is seldom of sufficient interest to be described, falling rather under the dates 4 on which routine telekinesis is read into the record by title; its use as a background for silhouette is described in Chapter V. This is obviously of such fundamentally distinct nature that it need not be covered in detail in the same chapter with the electrical bell-box.

3 Of course, under the oblique hypothesis, this means merely that the spring has been restored to full tension in the intervening darkness.—J. M. B.

4 See page 60.
CHAPTER XI

The Curious History of the "Hole Bell-Box"

By the Editor

Through their routine use during the first half of 1925, the two bell-boxes which I have described and whose performances I have chronicled in the preceding chapter came under the frequent observation of Messrs. Code, Hoagland and Co. These observers, although they built a new and improved DB as stated on page 86, were not greatly interested in this model, for the reason that I have advanced: that it could not be used for continuous peals enabling it to be examined while in action. And to the design of the SAB, which would permit this examination, they advanced what they regarded as a critical objection. The contacts and portions of the wires were exposed, in the open; and this should not be. The entire outfit, including especially all portions of the electrical circuit, should be enclosed. In principle this is simple enough; all one need do is take the entire SAB unit and enclose it within another, outer box, with a hole or holes through which Walter may project his forces or his terminals to depress the flapper; or through which a material striker similar to that on the DB may pass, to be worked upon by Walter in the open. Both these principles were employed in the construction of a series of bell-boxes manufactured by the Harvard group, and used in the séances of the late spring and early summer over which they had supervision. With this super-critical insulation of the working parts of the bell-box against fraud one may sympathize, even though one be at a loss to picture in precise terms what fraud might be committed on the external wiring of the SAB.

The Harvard group, first and last, constructed several bell-boxes of different design, all aimed in the direction indicated by the above remarks. One of them was got, in effect, by duplicating the SAB and putting it inside a bigger box, with means for access through the top of this to the hinged flapper within. This came to be known as the Code bell-box, and we may so denominate it herein. Their much more complicated ultimate masterpiece of bell-box design was different from this,
and far more ingenious. The initial idea behind its construction was the desire to learn more of Walter's terminals. So a long, narrow outer shell was contemplated for the box, with a row of holes in its top of different sizes. As reduced to practice there were six of these holes, and their diameters ran from a full inch down to a sixteenth. Each hole was surrounded by a quarter-inch-wide ring of luminous paint. They were arranged along the top of the box in line and in order of size, so that there would be a minimum of difficulty in associating any observed silhouetting with the diameter of the hole at which it occurred.

In view of the fact that pressure might thus be exerted upon the contact member inside the box over quite a wide range of its surface, it was now deemed advisable not to have this hinged, as in the SAB; for if it were so hinged, more pressure would be needed to ring the bell through one hole than through another. The contact member was therefore hung in an ingeniously devised rubber cradle; and the contact members, instead of being small bits of sheet metal as in the SAB, were sheets of copper substantially the full cross-sectional size of the box. The net result was that a uniform pressure would depress the wooden and rubber intermediaries and bring about contact at some portion of these copper sheets, regardless of what point on the wooden member received this pressure. To open the box for examination or for renewal of the batteries, one of the long faces was hinged; and this was not the top, as in previous bell-boxes, but one of the vertical faces. This face was hinged at the bottom and padlocked at the top. When unlocked, it of course would fall open away from the box. And being locked by staple and padlock, it of course did not stand snugly in position; it rather had a play of something like a thirty-second of an inch, and as the box stood on the séance-room table there would be always a crack of that width along one entire side of the top. This could have been avoided if the top piece had lapped over the sides; instead of that, the sides came up flush with the top. The drawing (page 120) is intended to exhibit the critical features of this box as the story will bring them out, without complicating the issue with any superfluous lines. By way of further illustrating the mechanical action involved in the ringing of this bell-box, a pencil is shown inserted into one of the holes and about to depress the upper board into contact position.

One further feature remains to be mentioned. Upon the upper face of the wooden contact member inside the box there could be fastened carbon paper, clay, or any other substance designed to take
an impression of some sort from the terminal used in ringing the bell. Such terminal would have to enter the box to a depth of about one and one-half inch in order to depress the wooden member to the contact point. Code et al claim that all the marks ever got on the carbon (see pp. 90, extreme top; 125, June 25th record; 137–9) were very evidently made by use of a pencil as “terminal.”

This piece of apparatus was dubbed the “Hole bell-box” by the Crandons, and we shall so call it, designating it as HB for short. Code brought it with him to the Lime Street séance of June 25th, the record for which tells us:

The new bell-box was put on the table and Walter’s hand could be seen almost at once. He penetrated the three biggest holes with a stiff enough terminal to be able, as we found later, to scratch the carbon papers clearly. There was not enough stiffness in the terminal, however, to ring the bell; a pressure of about nine pounds was required. Each hole that he penetrated seemed to be completely filled by the entering terminal. Walter said that if the spring could be made less stiff he could ring the bell without difficulty through the three biggest holes at least.

Code took the HB away with him when he left Lime Street that night. It was presumably present at the Harvard sittings on the 29th and 30th, but did not come into use; the records printed in M. H. V. indicate the extent to which other models of bell-box were used by the Harvard group and rung by Walter; into this I need not here go. Then, following the promulgation of Hypothesis H, and while there still existed a friendly feeling between the Crandons and some at least of these investigators, the Doctor asked Code whether they would not turn over to him, for subsequent use in the Lime Street séances, such of their apparatus as they felt they had no more use for. I do not see just how Code could consistently meet this request, since he was as emphatic as it is humanly possible to be in behalf of the proposition that the mediumship must be dropped to avoid disastrous psychological reactions on the medium and her husband. Nevertheless, he did meet it; and the HB was among the apparatus thus turned over.

Its first performance in Lime Street came when it was employed to considerable degree and with surprising effect in my “official”

---
1 He was talking in terms of previous experience; this box has no spring. The spring effect is got from the rubber suspension.—J. M. B.
2 Journal, A.S.P.R., Dec., 1925, pp. 718–9; and above, p. 94.
séances of July 16th-18th, the records of which will be found in full in Chapter XIV. For the immediate present purposes, however, it may be well to summarize the facts with reference to the HB from these séances. Walter rang it with all six of the holes sealed up in thoroughly effective fashion; and my theory that he was gaining entry to the box by the crack along the upper front edge was met when he permitted us to seal this, too, and continued to ring the box as merrily and with as complete command of its action as ever.

I did not happen to see Code during my July visits; but when I was in Boston for my sittings of August I saw a lot of him, in connection with a project involving his assisting me in another investigation. Following this, I drew up a statement on August 15th which in some measure duplicates what I have already set down herein; but the general desirability of citing contemporaneous documents impels me to give it in full, despite the repetition:

It will be recalled that on several occasions in July, the HB was rung by Walter when the holes and the orifice along the lid were both sealed. At this time it was Crandon’s impression that he had not the key to the box; so I postponed any careful examination until I might get access to the interior without forcing the lock.

On the morning and afternoon of Saturday, August 15th, I had long conferences with Code. I described to him the way this box had been rung with a seal over all the openings I had been able to find through which it could be rung. Code stated that he himself could ring the box under the same conditions. I asked him whether it was intentionally in a condition permitting this; he said it was, and gave the following history:

As originally designed and constructed, there was no “gimmick” about the box. It could be rung through the holes and, though that was not the intent, doubtless through the crack. But following the séances of June 29th and 30th Code began to sit in his apartment, for test purposes, in exploration of the possibilities of fraud, and with his colleagues as “sitters.” At this time and in this connection, he rebuilt the box, incorporating in it means whereby it might be rung in some fashion other than provided for in its original design. He did not state what the gimmick was, though I gave him opportunity to do so; I did not ask him outright, since it became evident that he did not wish to tell me. He did not state what the motive was, either, though equally I gave him opportunity here. While he was using the “gimmicked” box for their mystification, he did not inform his colleagues that it was
in a different condition from that in which it had been presented to Walter; whether he ever told them this, he did not indicate.

As regards motive, I must comment unfavorably. The criticism advanced against the original SAB was that part of the electrical system was external to the box. The argument was made that the entire electrical mechanism, and particularly the means for making and breaking the circuit, should be housed within the locked shell. The Code bell-box was designed to meet this argument, and after it the HB was put out as a further improvement. It involves a fundamental contradiction, and a reflection upon the good faith of the whole argument, when we find a gimmick incorporated into the HB which permits the bell to be rung by a manipulation outside the box, such as we shall see to be the case here.

Code did not indicate whether the gimmicked box had been used in the Harvard sittings. But when Crandon asked, as a favor, the delivery to him of the apparatus made by the Harvard boys for which they had no further use, there was turned over to him, among other things, the HB. Code stated that he meant to restore it to its original condition but had no opportunity to do this; that failing this, he meant to notify Margery of its gimmicked condition. He stated that he delivered the box to Lime Street in person, finding the Crandons out; that he made several subsequent efforts to notify them by telephone; but that he had succeeded only in informing Margery that he had had the bell-box ring for him in white light in his room. It was not at all clear to me why he was dependent upon the telephone; or why, if he was able to tell her half the story, he could not tell her all of it. It is a fact that Margery knows of Code’s claim to have heard the bell ring in his room in daylight; but she puts it in just those words, and does not in the least understand that this involved a gimmick. She knew that Code had told his colleagues about this white light ringing in his room, and suggested that he’d best have a care, or they would think he was crazy. She displayed bewilderment as to just how Code reconciled his claims against her and against mediumship in general with this story of the bell’s ringing for him. I am altogether inclined to believe that this represents her true state of knowledge and belief and her true reaction. If she understood that there was a gimmick in the box, under the hypo-

---

3 See p. 123.

4 At this time I had not access to the records which would have shown that it was not. This makes another very cogent reason for not using it at all, either gimmicked or in its original state, in Code’s experimental sittings.—J. M. B.

5 This seems to comport well with the atmosphere of mystery and melodrama surrounding his letter to me which I quote on p. 91.—J. M. B.
thesis of fraud she would keep quiet about it and try to find it for her own use, while under that of validity she would seek my aid in finding and eliminating it.

The net result is that I must be acutely suspicious of the whole episode. Why attach a gimmick to this box at all? Why turn it over to Crandon in gimmicked condition? Why fail to inform Crandon and Margery of the presence of the gimmick? Why attempt to notify her, rather than Crandon? Why make such an ineffectual attempt at this notification?

Code told me that the gimmick was of such character that examination of the inside of the box would not reveal it. This suggested a short-circuit, so cleverly concealed that the wood-work of the box would have to be torn apart to find it. I went back to Lime Street to look for the gimmick, and as the obvious attack I looked for external means of short-circuit. The outside of the box carries an extreme number of metal parts; two hinges, a padlock with plate and staple, and an enormous array of screws. Operating with a length of wire, I tried the effect of setting up connection between all possible pairs of these members. After some fifty failures, I succeeded. Either of two screws holding one end of the box in place constitutes the one terminal; either of three screws serving a similar purpose at the other end of the box serves as the other. In addition, it is evident that the wire carrying this trick circuit runs along the woodwork of the side of the box; for a certain particular screw along that side can also be used as a terminal for the short-circuiting. This screw accidentally taps the shorting wire; by screwing it out to the extent of about 3/32 inch, this tapping is relieved, and then one can set up the short-circuit only by using the terminals at the opposite ends of the box.\footnote{Code subsequently verified these inferences as to the intent of the gimmick, and the accidental character of the role played by the screw at the side.—J. M. B.}

Crandon was able, this time, to produce the key; so I examined the interior of the box. Midway between top and bottom, a shelf corresponding in length and width to the box itself divides the interior into two closed compartments. The large number of screws seen in the outside surface of the box arises in good part out of the necessity for having a row of screws clear around the box to hold this shelf. In the lower compartment are mounted the batteries and bell. On the upper face of the partition is fastened an extensive copper sheet. A second board, of approximately the same dimensions, is suspended above this shelf by four strips of rubber, one at its each corner. These strips are tacked to the board in question, and to the ends of the box just under
the top. Pressure on the suspended board elongates these rubbers and permits the board to descend. On its lower face is a second copper sheet corresponding in size and position to the one on the upper face of the shelf. Wires from battery and bell run visibly, one to one of these sheets and one to the other. Without destroying the box it is impossible to learn whether other connections exist; for the interior of the box is crammed full of boards, etc.

The apparent complexity of the ensemble is increased by a third board. When the suspended contact board hangs at rest, there is space between it and the top of the box; this space has been largely filled by the insertion of an absolutely floating board, which can be removed at will when the box is unlocked. It is against this floating board that any object thrust through one of the holes in the box-top bears; pressure is then transmitted through the floating board to the suspended one, carrying this down. The clever result is that pressure at any point on the floating board will ring the bell, as effectively as pressure at its center. This is why the bell can be rung through the crack at the extreme side of the box.

Another purpose of the floating board is obviously to facilitate the insertion and removal of carbon paper or other means of getting impressions of the object that enters the holes. Such paper is tacked lightly to the surface of the floating board, and may then be inserted or removed at will by inserting or removing that board. Changing the paper is thus made easy.

The screws at either end of the box that provide terminals for the gimmick circuit really do serve to hold the box together. But a channel has been chiseled out in the junction between the side and end boards, and in this channel has been inserted a narrow metal plate, running up and down, and pierced by the screws. From these plates wires must run through concealed ducts in the wooden faces of the box, one to one of the copper contact sheets and one to the other. It is one of these concealed wires that is accidentally tapped by the screw in the side of the box. Completing the circuit between copper sheets by means of an external wire running from one screw-head terminal to the other obviously rings the bell, just as effectively as does contact between the two plates.

The scheme for Code to assist me in another investigation went through successfully, and I was in his company for much of the latter two weeks of August. We talked a great deal about the Margery case. Code made every effort to convince me that Hypothesis H would
hold water as a complete solution to the case. I made no attempt to convince him of anything; I merely asked questions and in every way encouraged him to talk. He verified all my conclusions with regard to the gimmick, and seemed a bit chagrinned that it had yielded so readily to search. He expanded greatly on the story of his use of the box in fake séances, his attempts to notify Margery about it, etc., etc. I told him point blank that many people would have difficulty in crediting his story or in believing that he had acted in good faith, and I told him with equal bluntness that I thought he had played the part of a consummate ass. He agreed with me, without reservation of any sort. To my query as to the position in which the Crandons would have been placed had the discovery of a gimmicked bell-box in routine use in their séance room been made by a skeptic of the Houdini breed, rather than by myself—well, he smiled a sickly smile and had no adequate answer. I am by no means satisfied that this was not the motive behind the whole incident. If I am correct in this hazard, a decent interval would have been allowed to elapse, in order that the HB with its Harvard origin might have been in Crandon's hands long enough to lend plausibility to the notion that he had tampered with it. Then a hostile observer could have been "planted" in one of the séances, to make the damning discovery. People who do not wish to be suspected of such a plot as this should take pains to make their behavior less of an invitation to the charge.

If this really were the purpose, a good start had been made toward putting the scheme into execution. On July 20th:

The HB was then called for. The luminous holes were covered with a strip of cardboard, tacked on so that if it were lifted as much as 1/16 inch the luminosity would show. The crack through which it had been discovered that the bell could be rung with a knife was covered with surgeon's tape, which was doubled over on the ends and under the box. There remained then no normal way that we could think of whereby the box could be rung. Trance came on, and Walter rang the bell with great vigor, long and short peals and the number of times requested by Hill and Litzelman successively. During this ringing Hill had the Psychic's left hand and knee, and her head-band could be seen in its proper place in the room. Litzelman held the Psychic's right hand and Crandon's two hands, and Crandon's chin rested on Litzelman's hand. The Psychic's two ankles could be seen, and her feet rested on Litzelman's feet.
It is unfortunate that Crandon tends to permit extreme control, such as is instanced above, only by sitters with whom he is most closely acquainted, and against whom the allegation of confederacy is therefore somewhat less absurd than in the general case. Nevertheless, one can appreciate how Crandon's confidence in the sitter is necessary before the sitter can be given a post of extreme responsibility, from which he may either lie about his control or make unauthorized moves that Crandon regards as detrimental to the Psychic's well-being. It is such considerations as this that drive Crandon to mechanical control.

In connection with all this confession stuff from Code, I demanded that he write to the Crandons, giving them a statement of the gimmicked condition of the box and pleading guilty to having gimmicked it himself. This seemed necessary, to protect them against any possible charge of having done it, themselves. He met this request, with a letter written and mailed at some date in September or possibly later; but he post-dated it back to July 11th, the date on which he delivered the apparatus to Lime Street. This seems final proof of his bad faith: his letter written to exculpate the Crandons of knowledge of the condition of the box was calculated, if they ever produced it, to make it appear that this knowledge had been theirs throughout the period of its use in their séance room!
CHAPTER XII

The Serious Side of the Harvard Case

By the Editor

To this point, the Harvard case against Margery has been discussed only in so far as it rests on Code's testimony and Code's activities in general. That his conduct was so devious as to isolate him from every benefit of the presumption of good faith which ordinarily attaches to a normal person seems to me inescapably clear from the narrative of Chapters IX and XI. On the face of this record, his good faith would have to be very specifically demonstrated rather than assumed, and the demonstration would have to overcome a notable weight of adverse evidence. So far, then, as the Harvard case against Margery is based upon evidence in which Code is in any way involved, it is unworthy of serious attention.

To what degree and on what grounds did it, despite this, get the attention of Code's immediate colleagues, and of the other faculty members who came in any way into the picture? What evidence against Margery, independent of Code's contributions, have they to present in support of their published negation of the mediumship? These questions—particularly the last one—must receive the serious consideration of any critic who wishes to be free from the appearance of one-sidedness.

Of course in the very nature of things, we should not look for complete uniformity of conviction from so many persons; and in point of fact, there appears neither uniformity of conviction nor a uniform degree of enthusiastic continued prosecution of the case. Code and Hoagland shine in both these respects, followed quite closely in at least the former regard by Shapley. As regards the entire group, however, it is distinctly in order for us to consider the rather complex reasons why the very large doubts thrown upon the case for the prosecution by the present narrative have not been given more weight.

All human motives are mixed; those with which we deal here seem to me more than ordinarily so. In some part, as I have suggested on page 106, whatever degree of varied individual acceptance the members of the Harvard group gave to Code's story was due to their lack of
full information covering all the facts of his connection with the case. One naturally gives a considerable degree of automatic credence to one's friend and colleague, and one has naturally to be more or less forced by circumstances and against one's will or inclinations into a consideration of the possibility that such a person is not to be credited. When we see how even those in charge of the policies of the London S.P.R. have allowed Code's apparent academic respectability to put them more or less in the position of automatically accepting his word as a gentleman, against Margery's as a mere defendant, we must realize that it would have been far too much of a wrench to expect his immediate colleagues and close friends to do anything different.

This is the more the case, in view of various general considerations, no one of which was operative to its full possibilities in any of the Harvard minds, but all of which must have been consciously or unconsciously present to some extent in all these minds, and all of which constitute more or less of an urge toward negative findings. Leaving quite out of the question their prior contact with Margery, it is fair to point out that all these academic gentlemen must have had some degree of predisposition against the general notion of the validity of psychical phenomena; and that in so far as their experience with this particular case had led to their formation of tentatively favorable judgments, these judgments must have been more than ordinarily open to reversal on that account. The general attitude of aprioristic negation was most evident with Shapley and the members of the Medical School faculty who came into the case; that any member of the entire group could have been wholly free therefrom is ridiculous to suppose.

I pass over very lightly the allegation, rather freely made by Margery's partisans, that a direct and irresistible academic pressure was exerted upon the entire membership of the group. Richardson states that one of them so admitted privately to him; Hill states that practically all of them were quoted in this admission by a newspaper man who interviewed them and him at the time when the case broke into the front-page headlines of the local press. But it is vigorously denied by all of them, and there does not seem to me to be enough evidence to justify insistence upon the point. What is however amply clear is that in so far as the members of the immediately responsible group—Hoagland, Code, Damon, Hillyer and Marshall—had any degree of conviction that the phenomena were or might be valid, they must all have had the distinct realization that the more conservative
and the more academically respectable course lay in the direction of negation. Their duty to scientific truth would hardly permit them to ignore large obvious facts, nor to refuse such open-minded investigation as they might be capable of. The factor mentioned would however give them some distortion of viewpoint toward the ambiguous factors which enter so largely into psychical research; and in some of their minds at least there must have been a distinct feeling of relief when it became clear that their findings might with some show of plausibility fall in with the majority opinion of the academic world.

The presence of McDougall in Cambridge and his immediate responsibility for the work of Hoagland with the case cannot be ignored or minimized in this connection. Hoagland had an oral agreement with McDougall, approving of the Committee's project, of their use of University premises and facilities, and, if the outcome warranted this, of Hoagland's using the results of the investigation for his doctor's thesis. This agreement was made at a time when Hoagland expressed confidence that their final results would be favorable to the hypothesis of validity. But even when we know this, it does not in the least take the curse off the sinister presence of McDougall behind Hoagland's contact with the case. McDougall could very safely agree that Hoagland might have a doctorate in exchange for proof of validity that would satisfy McDougall! We are told that McDougall had no contact with other members of the group until after the denouement but it is evident that he could influence them through Hoagland, with whom he must in the nature of the case have kept in contact. Are we to suppose that he was any more moderate in talking about the case to Hoagland than to Tillyard, Schiller, Miss Walker, etc.?1 And are we never to have an unfavorable verdict upon the case that is free from all suspicion of having been dictated or influenced by this obstinate Scotchman?

These factors are quite adequate to explain any tendency toward a negative verdict which the members of the Harvard group, or the group as a whole, might have displayed. For the verdict itself, aside from the mere tendency, something a little more definite would be required. Something must have been afforded them which, in the presence of the tendencies just now described, would appeal to them as direct evidence against Margery, independent of Code's share in the case. Without this, even in the presence of the influences which I have

1 See pages 479–82.
shown to be active, it would hardly have been possible for them to swallow Code's evidence so completely or to incorporate it so thorough­goingly into their case.

In point of fact there were several categories of observations and deductions, made independently of Code and carrying sufficient impor­tance to require that they be explained away before the case for the medium could be regarded as cleared up. Most of them may be explained away with sufficient ease, on the general grounds that what is presented by these critics as indicative of fraud might equally well be an aspect of valid mediumship; and that the negative viewpoint toward these items is forced upon these critics by the general factors which we have enumerated as pushing them in that direction.

For instance: after the hypothesis of fraud had been formulated, Hoagland and others were able to look back over the previous sittings, and to see where the silhouetted objects which at the time had gone into the records as caused by teleplasmic terminals could now be interpreted in terms of the psychic's feet, hands or legs; of artificial arm­like objects; etc., etc. Assuming that the records are honestly made in the first place, it is wholly proper thus to examine into the propriety of their reinterpretation in the light of new knowledge. It is of course very necessary in this connection to guard against a restatement of the facts which shall be of no merit other than as it serves to make the facts more amenable to the new interpretation—against a revision of the record in the interests of the oblique hypothesis. This revision seems to me to have been undertaken in some slight degree by the Harvard addenda to which Crandon has objected; but otherwise the Harvard group are innocent of any tampering with the documents. They have not, however, in my judgment, given sufficient attention to the question: If two opposed interpretations of a given series of facts are offered, how shall we choose between them? They have, it seems to me, chosen merely the one which they like best. Given observers who have suddenly become more willing than they were to interpret in the sense of fraud observations such as the silhouettings, touches, trance restlessness, etc., etc., etc., occurring in a mediumship of this type, it would certainly be most extraordinary if they found nothing which could be forced into the figure of such interpretation. All their evidence in these categories seems to me quite easily reconcilable with the hypothesis of validity—as easily so as with that of fraud.

Much more serious, however, is another aspect of their case: that
arising out of their efforts to obtain imprints from the teleplasmic terminals. Indeed, of all their facts and allegations, I rate this as most difficult of reconciliation with a favorable interpretation of the case. Inasmuch as it is at the same time one of the aspects of the case which has not been completely covered in print, I can here kill two birds with one stone: making good the deficiency in the existing printed records while also making it clear that I am not at all disposed to dodge issues or ignore unfavorable evidence.

The history of this matter is touched upon in H. A., and in so far as a defence was at that time offered, I have indicated in B. vs. H. what this was. Naturally the Harvard group denied these counter-charges; and a more or less complete statement was drawn up by Hoagland, setting forth their side of the controversy. This carries the date December 18th, 1925, and came into my hands under circumstances guaranteeing its contemporaneous character. I have already criticized the failure to show in the detailed records of the séances the very pertinent facts (I ignore Crandon’s denial, and attach that term to them as a mere matter of tentative convenience, much as in the séance-room we call Walter by his name) of this statement. If further criticism were attempted on the basis that these facts should have appeared in the Atlantic, the pressure of space would be a satisfactory answer, save in so far as Hoagland’s use of such an improper medium makes him responsible for all the infelicities arising from its use. The statement in question is as follows:

The first medium used to obtain prints of the teleplasm was warm paraffin on plates. Dr. Wolbach, Professor of Pathology at the Harvard Medical School, took charge of the prints made at this time. Paraffin was ladled on to a plate and the plate then placed on the table into which the medium thrust her leg. This plate was then put aside in a box by Professor Wolbach and covered with paper and carried to the Medical School where he examined it. It distinctly showed coarse skin marks, identical with those of the human foot. It apparently had been marked

---

2 See pages 673, 676.
3 Pages 725–6.
4 B. vs. H., page 726.
5 Inasmuch as I am giving an original document, I refrain from any textual revision. I assume that “plate” rather than “table” is intended to be the antecedent of “which”; and I infer that the action so baldly attributed to the medium’s leg must at the time have been represented and accepted as that of a teleplasmic terminal. See open reference No. 32 in Vol. 2.—J. M. B.
by the ball of the foot and there was a mark nearby which could readily have been made with the great toe.

In the next sitting paraffin was again used in a similar way. On this same occasion plasticine was introduced. This plasticine was examined beforehand for its purity by the naked eye. It was put upon glass plates and during the séance set in front of Walter for impression. The teleplasm made impressions of a blurred sort on one of these plates of plasticine. A ball of plasticine was also put on the table and this was stamped vigorously leaving an impression lined with skin marks as of a human heel or the ball of the foot. It was in the plasticine of this evening that the lint was clearly found. It was visible to the naked eye as lint and under the microscope was identified by Dr. Wolbach with the lint of the slipper in our possession. There was no lint on the plasticine where it had not been touched by the impressing body. This plasticine was set aside with greatest care on a table. At the conclusion of the séance it was marked in the presence of Dr. Hilbert Day, Professor Shapley, Code, Damon, Dr. and Mrs. Crandon and myself. They were then carefully placed in tin boxes, no cloth or even paper touching them. On the following morning I carried them with the greatest care to the Harvard Medical School. Impressions of Mrs. Crandon's feet and hands were also taken on the same evening and these were marked by writing in the plasticine near the impression with a point. The labelling and sorting of these impressions can be verified by Dr. Day, Dr. Shapley, or by Prof. Wolbach at the sitting which he attended, to say nothing of Code, Damon and myself. The claim that they were thrown into a bag together is absolutely untrue. The lint, the skeleton of an insect, and the particles of silica were unmistakable.

It is interesting to note that the lint fibers appeared black to the naked eye but that under the microscope there were a number of short red fibers. These short red fibers appeared both in the lint of the slipper and in the lint of the plasticine. There was no question either in point of view of the material, length of fiber, or color but what the lints were identical in every respect. Dr. Wolbach kept the impressions in cold storage at the Harvard Medical School all summer. They are now in my possession and may be examined at any time along with the slipper.

The impressions of the plasticine were blurred to some extent,

---

*I.e.*, the several plasticine blanks carrying prints of any character whatever, whether admitted normal or allegedly supernormal.—J. M. B.
as stated in the Atlantic, rendering identification with the prints of the medium's foot extremely difficult. We have since found however that the greatest difficulty, since the writing of the Atlantic article, appears to be the fact that the impression of Mrs. Crandon's right foot was poorly taken, because of our lack of technical knowledge of these matters. A shallow impression of Mrs. Crandon's right heel is all that was taken on this occasion; no impression was taken of the ball of the foot.

A prominent expert on these matters has since informed me, from examination of the plasticine, that he believes that the impressions were made with the ball of the foot rather than with the heel and since we have no record of the ball of Mrs. Crandon's foot we have not been able to make any direct identification. This same person told me that he was sure he could make an identification if adequate impressions of the medium's right foot were taken. If Mrs. Crandon cares to have such a record taken in the presence of satisfactory witnesses this aspect of the case might still prove interesting. However, though no direct identification was made between the foot print and the teleplasm print it was clear that the teleplasm print was that of a human foot, that it carried lint from the medium's slipper, sand, and an insect skeleton. And it is also a fact which can easily be verified that these impressions were adequately classified and handled with the greatest care.

The above record is much fuller than anything we have heretofore had from the Harvard group on this subject, though it still leaves unmentioned some points of more or less importance. It appears that impressions were got on three dates. On June 24th, three paraffin plates were secured, one on china and two on paper; and on the 29th and 30th, one plasticine imprint for each date. This of course has to do exclusively with séance prints of alleged supernormal origin; normally made prints of Margery's own feet were taken at least once, in plasticine, for comparison. The séance record is ambiguous where it attempts to define the procedure with the plasticine balls; they were in fact kept in a group on a side table or board and placed one at a time on the séance table for Walter's attention. But this constitutional inability to produce an adequate record is characteristic.

Another point upon which oral interrogation (not by me, but by one who reports to me) of Hoagland has resulted in amplification of the documents has to do with the details of the incriminating prints.

\footnote{M. H. V., page 79.}
THE SERIOUS SIDE OF THE HARVARD CASE

The statement is made that the silica, the insect skeleton and the lint whose presence in one of the teleplasmic prints leads to all the controversy were, all three of them, in the actual impression and firmly ground down thereinto, thus becoming part thereof. Accordingly, they must have been laid down off the imprinting object or have been priorly present on the surface of the plasticine ball. Hoagland under oral interrogation recognizes that this latter suggestion is one which the defense may well take up, in view of the recorded fact that on June 30th, plasticine balls (which led on this date to no impression but which were present for use if wanted) were allowed to fall to the floor, and were apparently picked up therefrom and returned to a position of potential use in the séance. By way of meeting the obvious rejoinder which might be built up out of this circumstance plus the grossly inadequate character of their own records, the statement is now made in behalf of the Harvard group that in the sittings from which imprints actually resulted, nothing of this sort occurred. Once the records are found so incomplete, of course, ex post facto supplementary statements like this, representing the best memory of the investigators, despite their obviously unsatisfactory character are the best attempt that can be made at answering any questions that arise.

I have no space or purpose to go into any long argument or analysis on any such inadequate or ex post facto basis as is here afforded. Obviously in addition to the general factors involved in any such discussion which one might make, there would be the accumulation of individual observations, the sum total of each observer’s experience in the séance rooms; experience originally interpreted in teleplasmic terms, but now fitted into the theory of fraud and more or less satisfactorily reinforcing the individual’s adherence to that theory. Such items were doubtless of much weight in the individual minds but I have sufficiently indicated the weight which they ought to have in view of their essentially ambiguous character. And I have no doubt that persons adversely disposed toward the mediumship, as well as those whose minds are open in both directions, will regard the whole situation revolving about the paraffin and plasticine impressions as the strongest evidence presented in support of the Harvard conclusions. One can deny it in toto as Crandon tends to do and when one does this it is true that no clean-cut proof can be offered in its behalf. Nevertheless no clean-cut proof can in the nature of the case be offered

---

8 See B. vs. H., page 726, top.
against it—this would be true, even in the extreme case where such evidence as this had been deliberately fabricated in support of a deliberately fraudulent exposure. The physical evidence of the print is in existence and gives to this part of the case against Margery a standing—speciously if you insist, but none the less a standing—which can never be enjoyed by mere squabbles about what happened in a given séance or what interpretation is to be put on something admitted to have happened. Nobody can well escape the conclusion that here lies the gravest part of the entire Harvard case against Margery; and any person who holds a favorable viewpoint toward the case as a whole may well be asked, pointedly, how he proposes to get away from it. I do not know that my answer to this query will particularly impress any adverse critic; but for whatever it may seem worth to such critics, here it is:

The hostile critic, confronted by a well-drawn record of an active séance and asked how he explains these phenomena, will be able to show how, in his judgment, most of the recorded action could have been fraudulently produced, under the recorded conditions. With respect to other items he will have plausible suggestions to make, indicating what errors may have occurred in the reporting of the phenomena or of the conditions; and how, after the correction of these errors, the picture of fraud may be preserved. But with respect to a minority of the phenomena he will be more or less bankrupt; and of these he can only say:

"I have shown how most of the phenomena of this séance could have been done artificially. I am not omniscient; I have no doubt that for these few residual phenomena there are equally good explanations on the ground of fraud; but what these may be I cannot say. Nevertheless, I have shown so heavy a percentage of the phenomena to be absolutely or possibly fraudulent, that I have discharged my duty. I cannot be held responsible for a hundred per cent explanation of everything that occurs."

Now it may be a new idea to hold that the hypothesis of validity may enjoy this same privilege of laying certain things on the table for future discussion; that the critic upholding the validity of a mediumship is not obligated to give a complete resolution of the character and motives of all unfavorable critics and a complete disposition of every single fact or observation which has ever been advanced as evidence for an unfavorable verdict. But if this is a new idea it is
none the less one that ought to have standing. If ninety-five per cent (say) of the phenomena occurring in a given séance or a given mediumship are open to no conceivable attack, and if the remaining five per cent carry with them observations suggesting a fraudulent origin, it is certainly not a violation of logic to insist that the preponderance of evidence is in behalf of the theory of validity; that some of the apparently adverse factors can be explained away, thus and so; but that others must be left open for the time, awaiting explanation. The thing is done so in every branch of science; we do not, for instance, attack the validity of the law of gravitation because we have never been able to reduce Mercury's behavior to complete agreement therewith. The only conceivable question, it seems to me, would be one of fact rather than one of principle: namely, is the favorable presumption strong enough to subsist in the face of whatever unexplained unfavorable evidence we may have left on our hands. In the present case, the presumption of validity introduced by the generalities of the Margery history seems to me so strong, and the percentage of unfavorable observations and verdicts which can be completely explained away as product of the exposers's psychology seems to me so very large indeed, that there can be no question as to the proper attitude toward items like the present one which we are not at this moment able to explain away. They should be regarded as anomalies instead of being put forward as evidence that the ninety-five per cent (more or less) of favorable observation and verdict is wrong.

I take this attitude in deliberate preference to the attempt to explain them away in the one way that seems immediately available. The notion is strongly current, especially in credulous hyper-spiritistic circles, that genuine phenomena possess an inherent characteristic of parallelism with fraudulent ones. When this philosophy is carried to its limits it becomes impossible to get any evidence of fraud. Is the light turned on to show the "entranced" medium's hands and feet being used in the normal production of phenomena? Then it must be that the forces were weak and the operators chose this way of doing things in preference to a blank sitting. Do the impressions made by the teleplasmic terminal show the medium's fingerprints? Then it must be that this terminal constituted a psychic projection of the unfortunate medium's hands, prints and all. Does the sticky black mess which was smeared on the trumpet appear, at the end of the sitting, in a betraying ring around the medium's mouth? How inter-
esting; it must have come off on the teleplasm, and been deposited in this place as the latter was being reabsorbed into the medium's organism. Is the message on the slate obviously in the medium's hand? Evidently, in the process by which the spirit functions through the medium, so much of the medium's manner has been taken over by the spirit. Are the cards on which the spirit writing appears different from those supplied for use that day—different in thickness, in over-all dimensions, in color, in texture and in weight? Then it must be that the occult process through which the writing is precipitated upon the cards has upon these reactions which we do not understand, and which produce all these changes.

The plea which I have caricatured and shown in its vicious extremes in the above paragraph is one with which I have no patience. Much preferable I think is the open admission that here is an anomaly which we do not understand, which is on its face no better reconcilable with the theory of validity than is Mercury's behavior with the classical theory of gravitation, and which we therefore leave open to interpretation at some later date, when we shall be able to promulgate a theory, in some degree different from present ones or going beyond present ones, and under which all observations made of the mediumship may be coördinated into a single generalization.

In presenting this picture, which at first glance seems such a brazen one, I emphasize that I am really on better ground than the opposition; since I have far less residual observations to hold out awaiting explanation than has any adverse critic of the mediumship. For the fact that this viewpoint enables me to present fully and honestly any apparently adverse factors—such as the present one—I claim no credit; and similarly I will not submit to the implication that in this circumstance lies a specious and unfair advantage of the viewpoint in question. It cannot be specious and unfair to apply here a general principle that is accepted without question everywhere else in scientific research.

---

9 See Scientific American, Dec., 1923, page 390; and Light, Dec. 22, 1923, Feb. 2, 1924, for the details of a case where this plea was actually advanced under the circumstances outlined.—J. M. B.
CHAPTER XIII
The A.S.P.R. Project: Séances of June, 1925
Séance Records and Comment
By the Editor

To this date, there had been a lot of more or less serious and formal study of the Margery mediumship by more or less accredited investigators of one sort or another. But while these gentlemen had often been, individually, members or even officials of the American Society for Psychical Research, the Society itself, as a Society, had had no contact with the case at all. Indeed, so long as Prince was its Research Officer it was hardly to be expected that this would be otherwise: for aside from his brilliant success in making himself obnoxious to the Crandons, he had demonstrated more conclusively in this than in any preceding case his weaknesses of temperament and procedure.1 But when I became Research Officer of the Society in the physical field almost at the very moment that Dingwall's examination of the case was petering out into nothing, it became evident that a move was in order to seek a study of the case by and for the Society.

There was a certain amount of negotiation with Crandon, who naturally wanted to know what I proposed to do and how I proposed to do it. I drew up a tentative program, indicating the type of phenomena which I meant to pursue, and the issue to which it might be hoped that my pursuit of them would come. This program revolved entirely about the telekinetic phenomena; for reasons which will be made clear as the present and immediately succeeding chapters roll along, I regarded these as the most hopeful, alike for the attempt at rigorous demonstration of the validity or otherwise of the phenomena, and for fruitful inquiry into the collateral questions of modus operandi. Although my personal opinion was entirely favorable and I was on record to this effect, there seemed no reason why I could not give the hypothesis of fraud as good a part in a serious study of the case, as a more skeptical person could give to the hypothesis of validity.

1 M. M., Chapter L. Of course Prince insists that he is grossly libelled here; and equally that his inability to get on with the Crandons is entirely their fault.
One's personal opinions need not interfere with the rigor of one's scientific procedure and deductions.

It was my intent to record the sittings dictaphonically. This had not been attempted since Comstock had made such a hash of it for the Scientific American Committee. I thought I knew what was wrong there. In the first place there was unskillful dictation. And in the second place there ruled the old-fashioned convention that the words fed into the dictaphone were complete and final, that they must not be altered one jot or tittle.

This convention I believe to be a great mistake. If the phenomena are occurring on any other basis than that of an infinitesimal piece of action every ten minutes, it is impossible to put into the machine a complete record of the manifestations and the accompanying conditions. It is easy, however, to get into the record enough to serve as a complete jog to subsequent memory. Transcription of the dictated record should therefore be accompanied by elaboration. The responsibility for this of course must be clean-cut, and the portions of the record which are thus added must be so arranged as to be easily identifiable, and must be checked by all the sitters as carefully as they would check the dictation itself. I offer the records of my twelve séances of June, July and August as a demonstration of seance-recording technique. The dictaphone, I would remark, is superior to the stenographer because it doesn't talk back and ask questions; because it involves less noise by the dictator; and above all because conditions of illumination are immaterial to it. And if the dictator follow my procedure of transcribing the wax notes himself, there will be less of unintelligibility than with shorthand notes; while the interpolation will be made easier.

It may not be immediately obvious that what I here propose to do, and what the subsequent records show me as doing on an extremely liberal scale, possesses any fundamental distinction from the Harvard practice of supplying addenda to the records, against which Crandon has so strongly objected, with such strong support from me. The fact of course is that the Harvard records were supposed to be complete in themselves and mine were not supposed to be complete until after the amplification had been effected; that my dictation was purposely done with the view to this subsequent amplification; and most important of all, that all sitters understood the intent to amplify and that a recognized orderly procedure existed for supplying the added

2 See pages 112-3.
matter and for insuring that it had the assent of all sitters. The circumstances are therefore not in the least degree parallel. In these present records what we have is an orderly and systematic series of interpolations by the entire group of sitters under my responsibility, aimed solely at meeting the impossibility of dictating everything one would like to dictate during an active séance. In the Harvard records we had not this, but rather a set of arbitrary addenda by part of the sitters, against the belief and over the protests of the others. Moreover, my addenda are always confined to matters of fact while the Harvard addenda seek to incorporate into the records the interpretations which some of the sitters give to the facts after due (or undue) reflection—matter proper enough for a published discussion but not for an original record. I think there will be no difficulty on the part of the unprejudiced reader in appreciating the distinction, and with it the propriety of making the records as I have here made them.

My project got under way in the middle of June, at a time when the Harvard investigation of Chapter IX was still under way and still apparently pointed toward a favorable verdict. It was agreed between myself, Crandon, and the young men of the Harvard group, that some of them would comprise part of my circle. For the rest, Crandon was to be present save on such single occasions as I might request his absence; and Richardson likewise. Had my initial program gone through as the work of the first three sittings suggested it would, I should rather early have come to the time when such request was in order. As things turned out, there was never an occasion when the absence of either of these two sitters would have been at all critical, so I never requested either of them to stay away. Social sitters, however, were to be excluded with considerable rigor; and in all questions which Crandon did not reserve for himself as of critical importance to the Psychic's well-being, I was to have complete determination.

Aside from this, the personnel of my investigation was unsettled when the first sittings were held. It had been hoped to find competent assistants for me in the academic field; but none had materialized. Rather than postpone the undertaking indefinitely, it was decided to go ahead with what personnel could be mustered for each séance. If no worth-while progress was made, personnel didn't matter; if we found that we were getting toward proof of anything, the summer sittings would have afforded valuable preliminary work, and with the reopening of the universities in the fall we could attack anew the problem of getting a commission of permanent membership who would not be
afraid to attest what they might see and whose attestation might mean something. So the project started on the basis indicated in the first records, which I annex:

Seance of June 18th, 1925: 10 Lime Street, Boston. Dictaphonic record, transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic elaboration by Bird. Original dictation by Bird, with assistance of other sitters [as indicated in text]. Circle formed at 9:17 [and seance held in total darkness throughout]. Order of circle, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Hoagland, De Wyckoff, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. Outside [circle, on the sofa, in its usual location at the northeast corner of the room]: Laura Crandon, Charles M. Toll [Instructor in Philosophy and Psychology, Amherst College; and on a chair immediately west of sofa], Mrs. Richardson. Damon at the dictaphone [outside the circle, seated in front of the victrola, facing north]. Luminous controls on the Psychic's wrists, ankles and forehead. [Continuous victrola throughout the sitting; record "Out of the Dusk to You." Dictaphone connected into top center socket of the lamp stand, and hence independent of the red lamp and victrola.]

[Apparatus present:
SAB: Electric bell-box, Scientific American model; initially on east end of table.
D: Luminous doughnut. Plane toric section, popularly known as ring, of rough yellow paper, luminously painted on one side. Thickness without paint, 0.007 inch. Initially on floor, outside and east of cabinet.
LM: Luminous megaphone, luminously painted around both ends. Large end 33 inches circumference, small end 7 inches length 20½ inches along slant surface. Initially on floor beside D.
T: Table, the regular Lime Street model.
C: Cabinet, the regular Lime Street model.
DB: The Dingwall model mechanical bell-box, with luminous platform, was also on the floor with D and LM, but did not come into use and remained in situ throughout the séance.]

[The Psychic was clothed in robe and stockings, as usual. She undressed and assumed this costume under supervision of Mrs. Richardson, as usual; Bird attempted no control of the process. The Psychic gives it to be understood that under cover of the séance darkness she throws the robe more or less open, with the theory that this facilitates the necessary projections from her body into the theater of action.]
I interrupt the record here for the purpose of remarking that this is one of the points picked out for severe criticism by a gentleman who has read the proofs with a mildly hostile attitude toward the mediumship. He seems to feel that this claim ought to run throughout the history of the case if it is to be advanced at all; and also that under the control supposed to be in effect at the present séance, the action pictured would be impossible for the Psychic to execute. The latter point is certainly not a valid one, in view of the case with which the robe could be displaced by movements of the shoulders and body. The former I think is best met by observing that Margery and Crandon display an extreme volatility in their outlook upon the theoretic aspects of the mediumship. This is not so much a matter of believing one thing today and another tomorrow; they would, for instance, at any time in the period covered by this book, have placed importance upon conditions making teleplasmic extrusion easy. It is rather that for short periods their attention is strongly concentrated upon this, that, or the other theoretical point. This week they may be strongly conscious of the viewpoint that Walter is no miracle-worker, and that if you prevent him from bringing his teleplasm into play you prevent him from working. Next week, while still believing this, it has suffered recession to a minor position in their consciousness while they are strongly conscious of some other factor—the music, say; or the illumination; or the provision of an identical circle for several evenings running; or the importance of placing mediumistic sitters in certain relations with Margery; or the necessity for strict obedience to Walter’s wishes in touching the teleplasm; etc., etc. Quite aside from the fact that this volatility seems characteristic of the mediumistic disposition in the general case, I think it is rather more suggestive of validity than of fraud; for under any theory of fraud, it seems to me that a constant attitude and procedure in such matters as this would be of more importance than under a theory of genuineness. If the inconsistencies which any critic can easily find in the conduct of any human being are definitely aimed at an oblique end, the subject must present these inconsistencies consistently; whereas if they are merely evidence of his human fallibility and inconsistency, he can be as inconsistently inconsistent as he pleases without any inconvenience whatever. But I do not know that in connection with the present point all this discussion is particularly worth while; so we may get on with the record:
9:23. Red light while Crandon and De Wyckoff exchange seats, at Walter’s instruction.
9:26. In darkness, Bird and De Wyckoff [now] exchange seats, at Walter’s instruction. [In effecting this change, De Wyckoff held the Psychic’s hand until Bird gained possession thereof, after which Bird verified the continuity of the hand which he now held, with the illuminated wrist. A similar continuity of control over Crandon was not maintained during the shift, but after taking the hand at his right De Wyckoff verified its identity as Crandon’s left. The necessity for continuity of control did not arise during the preceding shift of seats because the red light was then on. After the second shift, the circle ran, clockwise: Psychic, Richard­son, Hoagland, Crandon, De Wyckoff, Bird, Psychic again. There were no victrola stoppages and no telephone calls at any time during the sitting; so Crandon remained, undisturbed, for the balance of sitting, in a seat remote from the Psychic and controlled by Hoagland and De Wyckoff.]
9:29. [At Walter’s instruction] D was placed on T, dim side up, without sacrificing control. [Bird put the Psychic’s hand on his knee, reached down with his free left hand and got D, disposed of this, and recovered the Psychic’s hand from his knee, where it had remained without interruption. The luminous control lent visible certainty to this procedure, if visible certainty were regarded as adding thereto.]
9:30. SAB rang. D moved on T. Control OK. [For the present sitting, this expression means specific consciousness of integrity of every hand-link in circle, by Richardson, Hoagland, De Wyckoff and Bird. This definition was agreed upon among the sitters; and it was agreed that when Bird dictated “control OK,” this should be a challenge, to which any sitter who could respond in negative or dubious terms should so respond, and should be recorded as so responding. As regards the luminous controls, the absence of automatic individual responsibility made necessary a different sort of convention. The head control was best visible to Bird, and any failure of it to be visible to him was to be recorded; throughout the present séance, it never failed to be visible to him at critical moments. Nor did he at any time observe movements, or rigidity, of this control mark, which would suggest either the use of the head or the freeing thereof from the control. De Wyckoff was best placed to observe the foot controls; he was to report on these by specifically acceding to Bird’s words “Control
OK"; and such verification was not lacking on any occasion. The hand controls were similarly best visible to Bird and Richardson, respectively; Bird's was always visible to him when he noted "Control OK," and Richardson never failed to respond affirmatively to this challenge. Neither of these sitters observed any suspicious mobility or rigidity of these markers. In addition to the specific responsibility thus allotted, there was large general visibility of the luminous controls by other sitters during most of the séance, and no question was raised by any sitter as to their behavior while visible, or as to their prolonged invisibility. The agreements as to control responsibility and control reporting implied herewith were reached, orally, by the sitters; but it was of course not possible to put all this matter into the dictaphone, so it had to rest until the transcription.

[9:30: dictation continued from above] SAB was put on the floor by Crandon at Walter's request. [It was put under Crandon's chair—see 9:40 dictation; and this was done] under continued control [of Crandon's hands by those next him, through his wrists].

9:31. D moved on T. X (Walter's "terminal") silhouetted against D. [Partly simultaneously with this and partly after D came to rest] T moved sharply back and forth [—so sharply that Bird inquired whether any sitter were responsible. All disclaimed it specifically]. D moved to edge of T, then fell to floor. D was picked up by Bird [and restored to place on T] without sacrifice of control [the Psychic's hand being deposited temporarily on his knee, as previously].

9:33. D was dragged to the edge of T by a visibly silhouetted X, picked up, waved about over T, and fell to the floor on the side of T remote from the Psychic. [It was recovered and] replaced on T by Hoagland. All controls OK throughout this action.

9:34. D moved about T, then was shoved off the edge upon the floor; visibly silhouetted X. D [was here] left [momentarily] on the floor, bright side up; then Bird picked it up without sacrificing control [Psychic's hand on his knee, as before], and placed it on T, dim side up.

9:35. D moved about T; visibly silhouetted X. Walter asked for coin [hereinafter indicated by Q]. Bird, De Wyckoff's hand on his knee during interval, [got half dollar from pocket and] placed half dollar on table, in the hole of the D. D moved back and forth, and Q was [distinctly] heard by Bird, scraping on T; then was heard by all dropping on T. [This act was] repeated. All controls OK. Rapping on T, presumably by Q. [Whether the dropping and rapping of Q, as well as its dragging, was accom-
panied by motion of D, is not recorded; and the question was not raised until several days afterwards, when recollection of sitters could not be relied on with certainty.

9:36. D was turned bright side up [by Walter’s direction], and Hoagland’s hand placed over it. [Crandon’s hand, Hoagland reports subsequently, remained under control by continuous contact with Hoagland’s upper arm.] An attempt was apparently made to put Q in Hoagland’s hand [which lay, cupped, palm up, over D]; Q struck the side of the hand and rolled off T, Hoagland’s hand being struck by X. [Speaking in terms of previous experience, De Wyckoff or Crandon used the word “thrown” to describe the attempt to put Q in hand; the contact by X would not constitute 100 per cent denial of this.] Another touch [reported by Hoagland], this time on his thumb; by request. Hoagland’s hand removed from D [on what suggestion was not recorded]; and a fresh coin [half dollar again] was placed on T by De Wyckoff [in view of temporary loss of the first coin. The identity of De Wyckoff’s hand was verified by Hoagland, on regaining control, through continuous contact between De Wyckoff’s arm and Hoagland’s hand during interval.]

9:37. Hoagland put his hand on D again [control of Crandon being maintained as during the 9:36 dictation]. Walter dropped Q so that it rested on Hoagland’s hand, X touching Hoagland’s finger-tips, apparently from the direction of Bird. All controls OK. X apparently passed back and forth above Hoagland’s hand, eclipsing [intermittently] those portions of D otherwise visible, and touching Hoagland’s hand repeatedly. Hoagland’s hand was withdrawn [at what suggestion not recorded; and circular hand-control was reestablished].

9:39. X was seen momentarily by Bird against D, which began to curl up. [After perhaps five seconds of progressive curling, the upstanding edge was approximately vertical, with the opposite side still flat on T; D then left T with the curiously smooth motion customarily described by Margery’s sitters as “swimming”; and] D floated in air at the level of Bird’s eyes. Repetition of this [was given, with D floating largely] edgewise; [i.e., in air vertically]. X was seen in silhouette as though projecting through hole in D. All controls OK.

9:40. SAB rings on floor under Crandon’s chair. Foot control of Crandon [had not existed up to this point; it was at once] established by Hoagland and De Wyckoff. The degree of certainty that each had Crandon’s foot, and each a different foot, would seem rather high, in view of the small personnel and wide spacing
of the circle.] SAB continues to ring [after establishment of control over Crandon's feet; it rings] again and again and again violently. Walter said this was done by John.

9:41. D in motion on T. A scraping sound on T accompanying this [was heard by all; X, Q, or what?]. Richardson was punched in the chest; Hoagland was touched on the right leg; SAB rings freely, Bird is touched on the right ankle; SAB rings again. All controls OK, including control of Crandon's feet. [The action here was the fastest and most furious that Bird has experienced with this mediumship. It was remarkably long-sustained for activity of such high pitch. Bird is inclined to think there was simultaneity between SAB ringing and touching of Hoagland or himself, or both; but certainty was impossible. The action was so rapid that, even in the most abbreviated terms, there was considerable difficulty getting it all into the dictaphone.]

9:42. Hoagland's nose was placed in the hole of D, on T; D [being] bright side up [and Hoagland leaning forward with his head on T]. Walter then felt about on [the exposed top and back of] Hoagland's head, and pulled his hair; [during this] X eclipsed D intermittently from Bird [in addition to the partial eclipse effected by Hoagland's head]. The hair-pulling continued [by request of sitters] vigorously, eliciting pain sensation. [Presumably X is] now feeling [and fumbling] at Hoagland's knee. SAB rings. Slight motion of D on T. [There was excellent concentration of activity here, but nothing equal to that of the preceding paragraph.]

9:45. [This interval was bridged by Walter's humorous conversation, which was very free and very general; and which so successfully filled the gaps between physical episodes as to have led to the impression, taken in conjunction with the physical phenomena, of continuous contact with and action by Walter from 9:29 to 10:02.] D was removed and LM was placed horizontally on T, small end toward Bird. Hand control of the Psychic [was maintained by placing her hand] on Bird's knee while Bird did this. LM rolls back and forth, then rotates on its vertical axis [through an angle of some 135 degrees. LM rises slowly and smoothly in the air for this act, with "swimming" effect noted above; and it] floats in air toward Crandon and De Wyckoff. De Wyckoff is touched on his right hand by LM, which then goes higher, slightly above Bird's head, and "swims" about [very smoothly] in a complicated three-dimensional path. LM dances [in air following the above motion and without any intermission of rest]. LM touches Bird's hand [in similar continuity with the
preceding movements], crashes on to T, and into Hoagland’s lap. Walter recovers it thence, X striking Hoagland’s thumb. LM is [then] in air, floating freely and continuously for [a period recorded at the time by Bird as] about a minute; [but in retrospect, Bird feels that the estimate was influenced in some degree by the activity preceding the crash into Hoagland’s lap, and that the duration of one minute is considerably too long for the action subsequent to this crash, but far too short for the total action before and after the crash. Bird also feels that this account, while as good as could be expected by any reporting technique short of motion-picture photography, distinctly fails to do justice to the spectacular character of the megaphone performance. This, of course, is not necessarily a loss.] LM replaced on T [by Walter, at the conclusion of this period of activity]. Control OK throughout action.

9:47. D was replaced on T, bright side up, at Walter’s request [this was done by Bird, without sacrifice of any control]. De Wyckoff’s hand was placed [palm up] on D by [Walter’s] request. Q [of the whereabouts of which since it last figured in the dictation no sitter had knowledge] rolled into De Wyckoff’s hand; then rolled out again [of itself], because of position of palm. There was no loss of control anywhere [during this act; specific reports were rendered to this effect, in accord with the convention agreed upon, but no report was made indicating the technique of Crandon-De Wyckoff control while De Wyckoff’s hand was on T].

9:48. Walter requested the removal of D. [This was done by Bird, in the usual fashion without sacrificing any control.]

9:49. LM is lifted and floated freely, touching hands of Bird and Hoagland. It continues to float, and to rap on T. It comes to rest on the end of T . . . [A few words of the record were here lost, when it broke as Bird tried to force it far enough on to the spindle to permit transcription of the extreme end. The transcribed record therefore passes to the second cylinder, with omission of this fragment. The removal of the first cylinder and the placing of the second one on the machine was effected by Damon in the dark; and Walter obligingly slowed up his tempo until Damon was ready to resume his taking of Bird’s dictation.]

9:51. Q fell [audibly upon T; no indication of whence it came or height of fall].

9:52. SAB rang. All controls OK, including control of Crandon’s feet. SAB continues to ring, accompanied by intermittent sounds of snapping of the spring against the contact board. [This sentence edited on transcription, to make the sense
SAB rings again, and [for some time] continues to ring [intermittently], and to give sound of spring vibration without ringing. [This sound can be produced by violent depression of the contact board, following which the spring reacts so strongly as to kick the board high in air and free from the spring, which then vibrates until the board falls, audibly, against it again. It can of course, also be produced by direct manipulation of the spring, treating this like a tuning-fork, while the board is deliberately held free of the spring.] SAB all this time was under Crandon's chair; all controls OK, including control of Crandon's feet.

9:54. LM was removed from T [by Bird, the Psychic's hand on his knee]. De Wyckoff was directed [by Walter] to pick up SAB. [He had some difficulty finding it, and more in getting it clear of the legs and rungs of Crandon's chair.] Before he had it off the floor [but not until after he had got hold of it and after he had moved it and struck it laterally against chair legs, etc.], it was ringing; and it kept on ringing while being lifted to a place on De Wyckoff's knee, [where it] continued to ring. [During this action De Wyckoff required both hands and was out of control]; Hoagland [reached over across Crandon, and during the time when De Wyckoff was otherwise engaged he was] in control of Crandon's left hand along with his right; Crandon foot control [during the interval] as usual. [No attempt was made to maintain control between Bird and De Wyckoff here. The state of the Richardson-Hoagland-Crandon control was not reported as] Hoagland now slowly put SAB from De Wyckoff's knee to T. All controls were then restored and reported OK.

9:55. SAB rings, on the end of T near Bird. All controls OK. Bird reports [an unusually clean-cut observation of] free motion by Psychic's head-band immediately after this ringing. [The height and lateral range of the moving spot of light seen by Bird were clearly such as to be susceptible to no other interpretation than that of motion by her head or her upraised hand. Bird made specific verification of his control of the Psychic’s right hand, and at his request Richardson did the same at her left. We therefore have the strongest evidence that the head-band was in its proper place at this time.]

9:56. Hoagland picks up SAB [at Walter's instruction]; it rings as he lifts it, and also gives noise of vibrating spring, without ringing. The ringing was accompanied by a visible spark. 3 Hoagland here [reported that he] manipulated SAB without

---

3 M. M., p. 288.
sacrificing control [but did not report how]. SAB rings again [presumably on T]. With the Psychic’s hand on his knee, Bird [his own hands of course out of control, as always when he was called upon to use them for manipulation of the apparatus] picks up SAB in two hands, moves it very freely in all directions [up and down, sidewise, out and back, and in combination of these directions, in each instance as far as he could go without leaving his seat, and always as rapidly as he could conveniently go; making, in fact, every effort to induce ringing through motion by box: but] with no ringing and no audible vibration of the spring. Hoagland is touched [no indication whether by X or by material object]. Bird [his test of the bell’s failure to ring spontaneously through mere motion of box completed] replaces SAB on T; SAB [immediately] rings.

[Time entries here were omitted for an unusually long interval, through desperate pressure of other dictation. It was all Bird and Damon could possibly do to keep pace with the physical facts of the séance.]

Bird puts SAB in the air again [in his two hands as before]; and [he] feels distinctly the pressure as Walter rings it, with visible spark. [This entire experience] is repeated. Three rings [are now] given to Bird’s order, with a visible spark each time, [and with a tendency of the board not to maintain contact with absolute continuity during the entire duration of each peal. Bird was now carrying the box in one hand; and] each time [the bell rang, it did so] with pressure [on the box from Walter] sufficient to depress [through several inches] Bird’s hand carrying the box. [Bird had regained control of the Psychic’s right hand, and had verified the identity of this hand, immediately prior to responding to Walter’s request that he indicate how many rings he wished from SAB.] All controls OK [throughout period of ringing by SAB under Bird’s manipulation]. The identity of [De Wyckoff’s] hand was verified by Bird on regaining control [thereof] by direct hand-clasp; [and he had been continuously conscious of its presence on his knee during ringing period]. SAB was on a level with the lower part of Bird’s face while being rung [as he held it in air. He held it as nearly motionless as possible, but this turned out to be of no particular pertinence, in view of his observations of pressure during the ringing of SAB].

10:02. [After a brief pause] Walter announces no more phenomena tonight. Some conversation with Walter [almost if not entirely revolving about subsequent plans of Bird and Hoagland groups]; after which:
10:06. Walter said "Good night."

The distance from the Psychic’s right shoulder to the approximate position of SAB as it rang on the floor under Crandon’s chair was measured immediately after the restoration of light, and found to be 6½ inches. In addition, there were obstructions to normal access in the table, and in De Wyckoff’s leg, controlling Crandon’s foot from a position in front of SAB. [But any allegation against the SAB ringing from this position would revolve about confederacy from the far side of the circle.]

Throughout the séance the dictaphone worked perfectly. At nine o’clock the listening side had been tried and found in order. But when Damon tried to verify that he had made an audible record, the machine would not rotate; following which, even the dictating side was inoperative. By substituting a lamp for the machine it was verified that current was present and the switch closed; but the motor of the dictaphone would not rotate. Going to Lime Street next morning, I found the dictaphone wholly operative; as soon as I closed all the switches I was able to transcribe the entire record without difficulty.

Largely because of the suggestion which this offered of parallelism with the irregularities of the victrola which had been recorded in the past, no sitter was quite prepared to assign this dictaphone irregularity to natural causes, without further discussion. It persisted and got worse during the next day, so that at the séance of the 19th a complete record was not obtained. On the 19th, Walter disclaimed any connection with the phenomenon, which was in fact ultimately traced to a defective motor, which got hot enough after running for an hour or so to develop an internal resistance sufficient to prevent the passage of current.

In addition to being placed before all sitters for suggestion and approval, the record of this sitting was at a somewhat later date displayed to Code, while I was still on good terms with him, in order that he might have opportunity to check it against his theories of fraud. Among the comments which he makes, in writing, I find the statement: "Note that Walter disclaimed the bell-ringing under Crandon’s chair."

The record does not justify this; and it is certainly something which I would not omit from the record, if it had happened. Code’s memorandum is not dated; but my recollection is that it was made en route to or in Lily Dale, in the latter part of August. Doubtless Hoagland

---

4 M. M., Chapter XL.
had told him that Walter had disclaimed the interference with the orderly operation of the dictaphone, and Code had unconsciously transferred this to something to which he would rather apply it. Or Walter’s statement at the top of p. 151 may have been ineptly taken as a denial of all supernormality.

Seance of June 19th, 1925: 10 Lime Street, Boston. Dictaphonic record, transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic elaboration by Bird. Original dictation by Bird, with assistance of other sitters [as indicated in text].

Circle formed at 9:07 [and séance held in total darkness throughout]. Order of circle, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Laura Crandon, Hoagland, De Wyckoff, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. Damon at the dictaphone [seated on the sofa in the northeast corner of the room, facing the circle]. Luminous controls on the Psychic’s wrists, ankles and forehead. [Continuous victrola: record “Out of the Dusk to You.” Dictaphone connected as previous night, but by a longer cord, enabling Damon to take the position noted. Psychic clothed in bathrobe and stockings only, under her own supervision and responsibility. Bird requested the place at Psychic’s right to which Walter had moved him the night before. Crandon refused to grant this unless on Walter’s motion, which was not made.] Psychic’s weight immediately before séance [in séance costume], 140 pounds.

[Apparatus present:]
SAB, D: Scientific American bell-box and luminous doughnut, as on 19th. SAB initially on S₁ (see below); D initially on floor at east of cabinet.

T, C; Table, Cabinet: regular Lime Street models.

S₁: Small platform scales, registering up to 2½ pounds on circular dial with needle. The needle and the 2½ integral graduations on the dial were marked with luminous paint, even pounds receiving long strokes and odd short ones. It was easy to read scale with good accuracy in dark. Net weight of S₁ unit, three pounds. Its sensitivity in the region adjacent to ten pounds (the weight of the SAB unit) was not all that might have been desired; all that could be said was that with the SAB unit on the pan of S₁ unit, the minimum pressure necessary to ring the bell would disturb the needle of the scales. Initially on T, slightly east of center, and carrying SAB.

U: Ordinary laboratory stand and clamp, supporting in vertical position a glass U-tube, ¾ inch bore and 3 inches, plus,
long in each arm. The base plate, the top of the metal upright, and the top of each arm of the tube carried spots of luminous paint; the apparatus could not be displaced or dismantled without instant detection. In the bottom of the U-tube, a luminous-painted marble; it was the hope that Walter would displace this vertically without displacement of the U apparatus as a whole. Initially on T, at northeast corner.

DM: Dark megaphone, smaller size, 11 inches long slant height, 22 inches circumference, large end. Initially on the floor at the east of the cabinet, as almost always in Margery séances.

9:10. Walter voice heard. Walter called attention to the fact that Hoagland’s luminous watch was visible through his pocket, and requested that it be turned around. [There was no super-normal cognition here. Walter was merely the first to note normal visibility.]

9:15. Walter displayed knowledge of the fact [confirmed by Hoagland] that Hoagland’s face was unusually serious at the moment. [Here we have apparent super-normal cognition, recalling an identical experience by Bird months before. The theory has been hazarded, and apparently accepted by Walter, that he is more apt to sense the sitter’s movements or expressions corresponding to a state of mind, than those of purely physical context.]

9:18. SAB rang. It gave a prolonged peal; the scales travelled from the normal reading of 10 pounds plus clear up to the 24-pound limit [striking the top with a bang]. A moment later this maximum travel of the S1 pointer occurs again, [but] without ringing of SAB. Control OK [defined for this night below; see dictation for 9:21]. S1 again travels to its limit without ringing SAB. Controls OK here, plus extra control by Bird, across Cran-don, of the Psychic’s right hand; [for definition and discussion, see dictation for 9:21. The convention that “Control OK” for the present evening includes this extra hand control was not in effect until 9:21; hence this extra control is here specifically mentioned, and in the episode immediately preceding it was absent.] SAB rings again, pointer going to limit [of travel].

9:20. Walter instructs that S1 be turned around. [The dial had been facing Crandon and Bird, so that only they could see it. In its new position, the entire S1 unit, with the SAB unit on it, was rotated counter-clockwise through an angle somewhere between 45 and 90 degrees.] so that the other sitters could [now] see it work.

9:21. SAB rang in its new position, the scales travelling to their limit. Control OK, with extra control by Bird of the Psy-
The medium’s right [and Crandon’s left] hand. [It is here agreed that] for tonight “Control OK” includes: normal hand contact all around the circle; foot control all around save with respect to the Psychic’s two feet and the two [one of Richardson and one of Crandon] immediately adjoining her at either side; visibility of the luminous controls on the Psychic’s two wrists, two ankles and forehead, [responsibility for this visibility being approximately as on preceding night, with Crandon substituted for Bird so far as constant observation of the right wrist is concerned]; and control by Bird, reaching across Crandon, of the Psychic’s right hand and Crandon’s left [in addition to his normal control of Crandon’s right]. The forehead control is well visible to Bird, so Crandon does not have to take this over. The detailed convention for challenge of the control by Bird at critical instants, and for response by the sitters, was as on the preceding night. For the additional control of the Psychic-Crandon hand-junction, Bird’s left hand, carrying Crandon’s right with it, is brought across in front of Crandon to a position of contact with the clasped hands between Crandon and the Psychic. Bird either grasps one of these hands, and lets the other two contact his from above and below respectively, or else slips Crandon’s right up to his wrist, leaving his own left free to grasp the clasped hands of Crandon and the Psychic. In either event, he always satisfies himself that both these hands are attached to appropriate wrists and arms, or that both are living and mobile hands. Inasmuch as there is no free living hand in the room to be used in substitution, the second procedure is as valid as the first; and only after putting one or the other of these procedures into effect does Bird announce the extra control, or announce “Control OK” when this announcement includes the extra control. Following the announcement of “Control OK,” SAB rings again with registration of the full 24-pound limit.

9:22. Walter stated that he would now ring SAB without exerting this maximum pressure. SAB [at once] gave a short peal, $S_1$ reading increasing less than half a pound.

9:23. Registration of four-pound pressure when SAB rang [i.e., $S_1$ reading increased four pounds]. Walter called attention to the fact that SAB was in danger of falling off the pan of $S_1$. [It was] verified by Bird [that this was the case] and [SAB was] restored to central position on pan. [Control of the Psychic and Crandon involving their three hands unbroken during this; control of De Wyckoff continued during the interval, his hand being placed on Bird’s knee while Bird’s right hand, unaided, adjusted SAB on $S_1$.]
9:24. Crandon reports a touch on his leg. Bird gets this, repeated three times, on his left leg. Control OK.

9:25. SAB rings, giving registration of the full 24-pound limit; then immediately again giving an increase of barely one pound over the normal weight of SAB.

9:26. SAB rings twice [in rapid succession], the first time with minimum increase in scale reading, the second with maximum. [Walter at one stage of the conversation stated that he could press far harder than the 24 pounds to which the present readings were limited; and it was the distinct opinion of all sitters that the limit readings, on this evening, often corresponded to pressures materially higher than 24 pounds. See the first interpolation under 9:18, e.g.] Walter seized the U assembly and waved it about. At Walter's direction, Bird placed SAB on the floor between De Wyckoff and Hoagland. [Bird's hands were out of control during this operation; Crandon's right and De Wyckoff's left hands were on Bird's knees; the Crandon-Psychic link was without external control.] While Bird was thus disposing of SAB, the scales [freed of all normal load and hence able to show no normal reading above zero] stood momentarily at 2 pounds, shot around to 24, then oscillated rapidly between 2 and 10, approximately.

9:28. Scales pointer [continues to dance wildly] all over the dial, while Walter whistles in time with its action. Control OK, including additional control of Crandon's head on Bird's upper arm. The scales again oscillate violently, approximately between 2 and 16 pounds.

9:30. A violent blow on the pan of S1, twice repeated. The pointer [then] stands motionless at 4½ pounds, presumably out of order. [This presumption is verified when] Walter strikes repeated violent blows upon the pan without affecting the pointer; then [himself] turns scales around to face Richardson. S1 [unit entire is now] waved in air, the motion being mainly up and down; then dropped [not laid] on T at Crandon's (east) end. [It is thought that this may be the heaviest object yet levitated freely by Walter, as distinguished from mere pushing about or mauling, as of cabinet, table, etc.]

9:31. S1 again goes in air, above Bird's head, returning to T. [The record fails to specify control OK; the judgment of the sitters when subsequently consulted was that this was wholly a matter of Bird's having no opportunity to interrogate them; all remembered the episode and all were under the impression that they had been conscious of continuity of controls. If this is correct, the incident is an outstanding one by virtue of the combined horizontal
and vertical range, and the weight of levitated object.] Several gentle blows upon . . . [the record is here undecipherable, and no sitter recollects the apparent locus of the blows. The scale pan seems to present the greatest probability. The failure to remember here is of considerable negative weight in connection with the preceding episode and the parenthetical remarks thereon.]

At this point it is again necessary to yield the floor to the adverse critic who has read the proofs. He feels that the situation here existing lends a very strong presumption that the record usually covers a large degree of unconscious absence of observation by the sitters. I would point out however that the failure to remember is of the next day, and obviously cannot affect the credibility or even the completeness of the actual dictation. Further, it has to do with a point which was completely covered by the running dictation, and which no sitter could therefore anticipate being called upon to remember next day. Accordingly, it seems to me to reflect little if any discredit upon the observations and record, save as indicated in the interpolated remark. Indeed, the very reason we make séance records during a séance is because we know that in this way we escape the necessity for trying to remember such minor points as this.

9:32. With Bird maintaining control of right hands of the Psychic and Crandon [Crandon's left being momentarily free for the purpose indicated], D was placed [by Crandon] on the pan of S1 [at Walter's request], bright side up. As Crandon thus placed D on the pan, Walter announced that he had [possession of] part of the scales. [No sitter had yet missed anything from the S1 assembly.] X was silhouetted against D, and the luminous needle from S1 [was then] laid down [by Walter] over D. [Walter stated that he had recovered the needle from the floor behind Bird's chair; this would imply that it had dropped off during the levitation of 9:31.] Hoagland's hand was laid over D [at Walter's request, and without sacrificing control, the adjacent hand going with it]. Walter stroked Hoagland's hand [presumably with X], then jiggled S1 up and down [under the cupped hand and the D]. Walter put something [material momentarily] in [or on] Hoagland's hand—apparently the U apparatus. [The dictated notes do not indicate any reason why it was necessary to indulge in speculation about the whereabouts of an object so liberally marked, and recollection of the sitters is equally at fault.]

9:34. DM [presumably] heard scraping on floor; [it was then] lifted and dropped [exact locus not indicated]; all controls OK.
At this point, about three-quarters through the first record, the dictaphone became inoperative. It continued to rotate and to advance, so that Damon, unaware of anything wrong, continued talking into the receiver; and it in due time came to the end of the record. But it made no impress upon the wax. When the record came to an end, and after Damon had placed the second record on the carriage, either the motor or the clutch failed to go into effect again, so that Damon now observed the machine’s inoperativeness. Walter at one stage of the séance denied having caused the irregularity at the end of the preceding session. He stated that the wrong chain (referring presumably to the pull-switches on the lamp-stand) had been pulled. This it was difficult to credit, since all hands had worked over the machine on the preceding night. Code, however, reports to me: “Subsequent to Damon’s failure to read record, I called on the Crandons with Damon and tested the dictaphone with Damon, discovering that Damon did not understand some necessary function of the machine.” The indefiniteness of this statement is doubtless due (see page 155) to the time which elapsed between the observation and the report. It is a fact that at the end of the present séance, after light was given, Damon worked for some time over the machine, but could not make it go; and that I then went to it after a further interval of some five or ten minutes, and made it run at a touch of the switch, without any trouble at all. It is also a fact that after this machine was returned to New York, it was found to be liable to erratic stoppage after running for any considerable time; see page 155.

The above paragraph was compiled, in its present form, some weeks after the séance. During the period when it was supposed, erroneously, that a record was being produced, séance action was intense. De Wyckoff, Laura Crandon and the Psychic collaborated with me, next morning, in listing the episodes of this period. The balance of the record for this date consists of this listing, as edited by me on that same day, and with no subsequent alteration. Inasmuch as this was the only means of obtaining a record after the failure of the dictaphone, the brackets are omitted from the moment when the failure occurred. It is believed that the following account is substantially complete. I relied upon the list and upon the memories of the other sitters only for the episodes by title; for the details I was able in every instance to fall back upon vivid recollection of the terms of my lost dictation of the preceding evening. No attempt is here made to preserve the sequence of events.
Luminous needle from $S_1$: This moved about freely on $T$, and dropped to the floor and was recovered by Walter at least once and probably several times. It was inserted in the end of the U-tube as though in an attempt to move the marble with it, but it was not nearly long enough for this. A long and complicated series of manipulations occurred, similar to the "scientific research," so called by Walter. The needle would appear in air, before and close to the face of a sitter, usually Bird or Hoagland; this sitter would so report; the needle would then be withdrawn with extreme rapidity and brought to a similar position with reference to another sitter. The transfer was always visible, over a definite path in the room; but the rapidity and accuracy of execution were extreme.

$DM$: More or less action throughout, which cannot be recalled in any great detail. One important episode consisted of a tug-of-war between Hoagland and Walter. Hoagland hung on more successfully than is usual in these affrays; but Walter, as usual, finally twisted rather than pulled $DM$ out of his grasp. Hoagland estimated the force exerted here as 30-40 pounds, at least. In the final jerk out of his grasp, $DM$ flew in the direction of the space between Bird and Crandon. At the moment when the dictaphone stoppage was discovered, the stage had just been set for an apparent tug-of-war with Bird, but Walter suspended the séance on Damon's announcement of the inoperative dictaphone.

$U$: Picked up bodily many times and waved in air; numerous sitters touched with this, as with $DM$; taken into cabinet or outside cabinet, at Psychic's right, and rapped smartly against cabinet walls; finally turned upside down, spilling marble out on floor. We have here an excellent example of Walter's refusal to abide by rules which we may make governing what he is to do and how he is to do it. The apparatus was restored to initial position on $T$ and there found at the end of the séance, minus the marble, which was recovered from the floor next day.

$D$: Extreme freedom of motion, horizontally and in tilting sense, as it lay on $T$ or in pan of $S_1$, with or without Hoagland's hand over or on it, and with or without luminous needle on it. Much of this occurred with visible silhouetting; and on one such occasion Bird saw distinctly an outline as of claw, the effect being quite that of the superfluous claw part way up a dog's leg, or the long, claw-like finger-nails affected by some persons. A long and elaborate episode occurred in the space between $T$, Bird and De Wyckoff,

---

6 Excluding any thought of apports, four-dimensional work, etc.—J. M. B.
7 $M. M.$, pp. 212–214.
THE A.S.P.R. PROJECT: SÉANCES OF JUNE, 1925 163

quite inaccessible for normal activity by Psychic or Crandon. D moved up and down repeatedly, from a position sometimes apparently on the floor, sometimes apparently on SAB beside De Wyckoff, to a position in the air level with the top of T. In vertical travel, D usually stood more or less on edge; at rest, usually horizontal, though sometimes on edge or curled. Repeatedly as it descended on or near SAB the latter would ring. The visual impression of course was that D had been used to ring SAB; but D is not stiff enough for this, so it can apparently only have been carried in the same X employed to depress the SAB contact. With the possible exception of the needle manipulation, this elaborate motion of D was the most brilliant of the unrecorded portion of the séance. The distance from the Psychic’s right shoulder to the region in which it occurred was found to be about 60 inches.

SAB: Rung early in the “lost” portion of the séance, independently of D. Walter announced that the spring needed adjustment. Bird on investigation in the dark was inclined to agree with him that while the bell rang as usual, the board did not return to position with its usual snappiness, indicating need for spring adjustment. A little later Walter stated that he had thrown the contact board clear over backward, wide open and free of the spring; Bird and Hoagland investigated in the dark and found this correct.

Cabinet: Suffered numerous violent shocks at one stage. Bird is inclined to think it was shaken without material displacement or deformation; the Psychic next morning expressed feeling that it had closed in on her more or less.

Experiment immediately after the séance indicated that the Psychic could not, with her feet, reach SAB in its place near De Wyckoff.

At one point (Bird believes while DM was being moved about near the floor and occasionally touching him) Bird and Crandon reported what, in Bird’s case at least, certainly was not contact by any material object known to be present. This came under Bird’s left knee, and was sufficiently vigorous to give a definite impression through his clothing. Bird can best describe it as similar to a large, stiff, rough brush. As usual, this is merely the nearest one can come to a description in terms of known objects, and is not to be taken as completely descriptive. This particular contact was the most difficult to characterize that Bird had at this date experienced through this mediumship.

At the end of the sitting the Psychic registered 143 pounds on the same scales used initially. Bird suspects error in making the
initial reading; this the Psychic strongly doubts. Walter sug-
gests that she stood off-center on the scales first time; and in fact
140 pounds is the lightest weight ever got for her to this date by
Bird, supporting one or the other of these assumptions.

There was frequent verification and reporting of "Controls
OK" during the "lost" portion of the sitting, but of course these
reports cannot now be directly associated with the accompanying
phenomena. Bird feels that there was no pertinent lapse in control.

Séance of June 20th, 1925; 10 Lime Street, Boston, Mass.
The old dictaphone was now replaced by a new instrument, received
only this day from the manufacturers. There were in the house,
as a measure of economy and of safety against shortage, several
cylinders carrying a few turns of record from old Harvard sittings;
and it was agreed to use up one of these first. Damon employed
the listening side of the machine to verify that he was starting beyond
the point where the previous dictation stopped. It is suspected
that he forgot to turn the machine back to the talking side; for
though the first record was fed properly through to its end, it
turned out to be totally blank. The second record was OK. The
discovery of deficient recording was not made until the afternoon
of the 22nd, when Bird had his first opportunity to transcribe the
records. It was then too late to supplement the missing portion
of the record from memory as successfully as had been done for the
sitting of the 19th. The account of the starting arrangements and
the apparatus present is of course complete; following that, we
have, however, only a very sketchy outline of the first portion of
the séance action. In view of the character of the record, brackets
are omitted from the present text until the dictated portion
is reached. No material alteration has been made in the text
for the earlier portion, as prepared on June 22nd, 1925.

Circle formed at 9:35, the delay being caused by a thunder-
storm; and séance held in total darkness. Order of circle, clock-
wise: Psychic, Richardson, Code, Hoagland, De Wyckoff, Bird,
Crandon, Psychic again. Damon at the dictaphone, outside the
circle on the sofa as on the 19th. Also on this sofa were Laura
Crandon and Mrs. Richardson. Luminous controls of Psychic's
wrists, ankles and forehead. Continuous victrola: record "Out
of the Dusk to You." Psychic clothed in robe and slippers (not
stockings) only, under Mrs. Richardson's supervision and responsi-
bility. Nothing was said about the change from stockings to slip-
pers, or the reason therefor; it was doubtless a reflection of the
procedure used at the Harvard sittings, now going on.
Apparatus present:
S2: Larger and heavier platform scales than those of preceding evening; it was, in fact, Margery’s bath-room scales, of very sturdy construction and giving readings up to 200 pounds. The dial is horizontal, behind the pan, rather than vertical, in front of it, as was the case with the postal scales (S1) used on the 19th. The needle was marked with luminous paint, and 10-pound multiples were similarly marked around the dial, the even 50’s being given longer strokes to aid in rapid reading. The S2 unit was initially on the east end of the table.
T, C: The usual Lime Street séance table and cabinet.
SAB: Scientific American electrical bell-box; initially in pan of S2.
DB: Brass dinner-bell, ordinary clapper type, suspended from the ceiling light-fixture, and hence located, in a horizontal sense, at the center of the room, somewhat beyond the northwest corner of T. It hung very high. Initially there was attached to it a short cord, at the end of which, high enough to be out of reach of any person present while seated, there was tied:
CP: Clothespin carrying a daub of luminous paint. After Walter spoke, he expressed dissatisfaction with his “power” for the evening, and had red light turned on while Crandon lengthened the cord and lowered CP. This process was gone through with a third time before Walter indicated ability to reach CP; and in this way some ten minutes of the sitting was used up, with no action.
D: Luminous doughnut. Initially outside cabinet (east side), on floor as usual.
LM, DM: Luminous and dark megaphones, former as on the 18th, and latter as on 19th. On floor, east of cabinet, initially.

After CP was adjusted to Walter’s satisfaction, phenomena began. SAB rang several times on S2, with varying increases in dial readings, from a vanishing minimum to something like 30 pounds. On this S2, with its coarser graduation and heavier action, it is possible to ring the bell by pressure on the contact board without producing any visible reaction by the needle. It is believed that Walter did this at least once, but recollection is not positive. Walter ordered SAB removed, and proceeded to work with the bare S2. For some time he delivered pressure or blows, at his pleasure, with varying registration from zero to 40 pounds. Bird is
under the impression that once or twice a powerful blow was delivered without any effect upon the needle, indicating delivery of the blow on the frame rather than on the pan. $S_2$ was tilted freely in all directions, with the ostensible purpose of allowing all sitters better opportunity to read the dials. Then over a considerable period of time there occurred lifting of the $S_2$ unit from $T$ and dropping back, sometimes one side or one corner only leaving $T$, sometimes the entire unit; likewise with this there was mingled a certain amount of free levitation in the air. The net weight of the $S_2$ outfit is about 20 pounds; it is to date unquestionably the heaviest object which has been lifted clearly and cleanly into the air in any of Margery's séances. Whether more force is required for its levitation than for the cabinet disruptions, etc., of 1924, would be a matter of conjecture; the answer would probably be a negative.

For a long time Walter played in one way or another with CP, not alone pulling it to ring DB, but also waving CP freely in air without attention to the bell. At one stage he had Hoagland take CP in his hand; and while he was so holding it, Hoagland reported that it was pulled and jerked up and down as well as sideways. With visible motion of CP as the apparent means, Walter rang DB in time with his whistling.

Considerable use was made of LM, and a tug-of-war with Hoagland was unusually good. Hoagland reported that as he struggled to hold LM with both hands, it was forced up and down, back and forth, and across, in all three dimensions of space, apparently at Walter's will.

In ringing SAB, which he did with considerable freedom, Walter employed the telegraph code, and twice he attempted to ring the letter of which a sitter was thinking. One of these experiments, (Hoagland collaborating) was completely successful, without complication or qualification. The second time, Code, in attempting to think of the Morse “D,” had actually in mind, through error, the dot-dash sequence of the Morse “G”; and Walter rang the “G” on the bell. In neither experiment was there any vocal indication, any whispering to another sitter, etc. etc., so that there was no check upon the collaborator's admission of success; likewise there was correspondingly little play for any explanation on a basis of hyperesthesia.

Control was frequently verified and reported as OK during the part of the séance for which the dictated record is lost, but of course these reports cannot now be associated with the accompanying phenomena. “Control OK” for this evening included:
normal hand control throughout the circle; extra control of the Crandon-Psychic link by Bird, reaching across Crandon, as on 19th; foot control throughout the circle except on either side of the Psychic, as on 19th; visibility of all five luminous controls, the responsibility and the reporting technique here being substantially as on the 19th. The freedom of the Psychic’s feet and legs from other than luminous controls is chargeable to Walter’s general dislike for personal control at these points.

This brings us to the part of the séance recorded dictaphonically, which is transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic interpolations by Bird, as usual. Dictation mainly by Bird, with assistance from other sitters.

10:08. Hoagland and Code report cold winds on the backs of their hands during these touches [the reference is of course to the immediately preceding dictation, which is lost]. Hoagland reports that the object touching him seemed to have fine creases on its surface.

10:09. D moves with visible silhouetting of X; control OK. D moves repeatedly with visible X [silhouetted]. D continues motion on top of T, [with] silhouetting.

10:12. Wide motion of D, with silhouetting [of X]. All motion so far has been confined to [the region on and immediately over] the top of T. Bird now holding D horizontally above T; Bird’s hand is touched, with visible silhouetting of X against D. Bird feels a contact on D, which is taken from his hand after considerable effort [the difficulty being in getting hold of D, not in overcoming resistance from Bird or anything of that sort], and placed upon CP held by Hoagland. [Doubtless the missing portion of the record would have made it appear that Hoagland had had one hand on CP, under adequate maintenance of control, for some time].

10:13. CP with D held close to Bird by Hoagland, at Walter’s instructions. D falls on T, dim side up. Hoagland releases CP, [which swings a bit, pendulum-wise, and then slowly comes to normal rest on its suspension].

10:15. Crandon touched by DM [identification of this object by Crandon, supported by the sound made when the record continues:] which is brought out over T and dropped on its far side. SAB rings [on the floor, somewhere in the neighborhood of De Wyckoff.] Control of Crandon OK, and foot control around SAB verified. C heard to slide; Psychic reports she is [being] closed in. Control of Crandon’s head on Bird’s shoulder is established [and continued throughout subsequent C manipula-
168 THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

[Text continues as per the original document]

10:16. The Psychic reports continued pinching in of C. Violent noises continue from that quarter. The Psychic reports pressure from behind on C. The noises continue.

10:17. The Psychic reports that she is entirely out of C, violent motion of which is indicated by noises. Crandon and Bird report breezes from direction of C.

10:18. T moves; C appears to lunge violently, apparently over a large distance. [The very noncommittal statements about C in this dictation are the fruit of previous experience that extraordinary commotion in that area may correspond to a shockingly small displacement of C.] Crandon and Bird report more breezes from direction of C. Richardson reports [northwest] edge of C considerably moved back.

10:19. Extremely cold breezes from direction of C reported by Bird. C continues in [apparently] violent motion. Walter scratches on it at Hoagland's request. Walter volunteers to rap on C, and does so. Control OK, including Crandon's head. Scratching continues, and more straining of C.

10:20. Continued motion of C. Code reports that for a moment here, C was sufficiently far back for him to see the collection of illuminated apparatus on the floor; [ordinarily this is quite hidden from a sitter in Code's position, C intervening]. Crandon reports being pushed out of the way [of moving C] toward Bird. Bird is touched repeatedly on the [left] knee; he experienced also a scraping down the [left] calf. [The sensation here was very similar to that got from vigorous rubbing by a rubber pad with projecting rubber rods or spikes, which Bird has met as washcloth or massage pad, if not as both.] Crandon is pushed violently against Bird. Controls OK.

10:21. Code recovers LM [without sacrifice of control] and places it on T vertically. LM shifts [almost at once] into horizontal position, floats above T, passing between heads of Crandon and the Psychic without striking either. It passes [completely] out of the circle, [behind Crandon], and [comes] back [in circle] again [by passing] between Crandon and Bird. LM [is then] thrown violently, high in air, and comes down [obviously] free. LM is rattled violently around on the floor, in the space between Crandon and C; then comes up through the space between the arms of Crandon and Bird [on the one side], and T [on the other]; balances above T momentarily; shoots high in air; [then apparently] falls free. [There is no problem involved here, of the
possible penetration of matter by the terminal supporting LM; if this originated anywhere on Psychic's frontal aspect, and is sufficiently flexible to dodge the heads of Crandon and Bird by curving upward in passing them, it could handle LM as observed, without fouling any physical object in the room.]

10:23. Walter apparently recovering LM from under T. Richardson reports touch on finger as though by some object, which is now held against Psychic's hand by his ring finger.

10:24. LM continues violent motion on the floor under T, pushing SAB against Bird's [right] foot. LM rises partly from floor on side [of T] remote from the Psychic, touching several sitters. Code at Walter's instruction recovers LM and places it vertically on T [as at the beginning of the 10:21 entry]. As he took hold [of LM during or at end of its rising movement just chronicled], he could feel that Walter still had [hold of] the other end. [After Code has placed it on T], LM moves about T, first retaining vertical position, then horizontally; then floats; passes between Richardson and Psychic, and falls on the floor outside cabinet. Now 10:25, [at the end of this action].

10:29. After some conversation with Walter, lights on, C found in normal position, save for slight displacement backward. [The next entry recalls that during the "lost" part of the record, Walter had put some object in Richardson's hand, stating that this was a "present" for him. There was some talk by Walter about this present, but just how serious it was and in just what terms is not remembered. There certainly was nothing particularly evidential in connection with the character of this "present" as now determined, else this would have been retained in memory.] Richardson's "present" is found to be a piece of wire. [This was not identified as from any of the séance apparatus; its source remains permanently unknown.]

It is hardly necessary for me to comment extensively upon the above. Any reader of experience will be able to isolate numerous incidents of considerable permanent weight in the direction of validity; and of course the sittings are not free from elements which one must question keenly. Indeed, a séance without its suspicious episodes would be, in toto, an object of grave suspicion; for the phenomena do not occur that way. The enthusiastic advocate of validity will see much to rejoice him in the records, but, if he preserve his mental balance, nothing which he may put forward as negating the generalities of pp. 239 and 266. We are not looking for a single episode that
will validate the mediumship; and we find none. We do add a considerable breadth and depth of incident, and I think we considerably reduce the small probability that all these phenomena can be satisfactorily explained as due to fraud. To hope for more, especially out of three sittings, would be unduly ambitious. Particularly, we must not regard the dictaphonic recording as an established failure because of the rough spots remaining to be smoothed out in its operation; nor may we feel that it is justified as a permanent procedure until we have gone through a set of three sittings without accident. We have got, as a result of these three séances, just where any rational prophet would have expected us to get.

Following my three “official” Society sittings of June 18th–20th, I was to have resumed this study in two weeks. The excitement ensuing upon the events of June 29th and 30th, however, combined with the social demands of the July Fourth holiday upon the Crandons, made it expedient to skip this period; so I found myself again in the Lime Street séance room after four weeks rather than after two.

---

8 See Chapter IX.
CHAPTER XIV
A.S.P.R. Séances: Second Series
Séance Records and Comment
By the Editor

The series of sittings starting July 16th, 1925, followed very closely on the promulgation of the major hypothesis of hypnotic fraud by the Code-Hoagland group. Code, at least, was willing to go on sitting for me in the face of this hypothesis. I found the expediencies to be against the inclusion of him or Hoagland, and I was left with no time to take up seriously the problem of replacing them—the emergency burst at the last moment. Mr. and Mrs. Willett Hubbs, of Niagara Falls, were available, together with Dr. Richardson, to make up a circle of five sitters plus one dictaphone operator. In spite of the fact that Hubbs is Margery’s nephew, this seemed the best procedure at my disposal. He is Secretary of the Niagara Falls Trust Co.

A further complication lay in Walter’s expressed desire to bring the phenomena into red light to a greater degree than had heretofore been done, and in Margery’s pronounced endorsement of such program as a means of silencing further criticism and controversy. It was my own impression that this would probably involve a good deal of preliminary sitting in darkness or partially in darkness, under a procedure in the main similar to that formerly termed “incubation” by Comstock. Anticipating that on this account no final results would be attained in any direction in this particular series of sittings, the opportunity seemed a favorable one to impose upon Walter the identically same circle for several consecutive evenings. This is something for which he continually asks and which he hardly ever gets.

As it turned out, there was total darkness and continuous trance throughout the three sittings of this series, and the phenomena turned, from the telekinetic ones got by me on my previous visit, somewhat in the direction of the teleplastics presented to Dingwall in January, 1925; though with teleplasm of a type sharply divergent from that shown to Dingwall. Walter was so pleased with his own progress in this direction that he looked definitely forward to more of the same.
sort of thing, certainly with photography and probably with a good deal of red light, on my next visit. He consented to the presence of melted paraffin in the séance room each night of the present series, and several times he seemed to indicate that only the oppressive heat kept him from working with it. Weather Bureau records show temperatures of 74, 78 and 70 degrees at ten o'clock on the three evenings. The séance-room thermometer was broken and I found no opportunity to replace it, but the room temperature was each night in the neighborhood of 90 degrees, with considerable humidity. Walter at one point stated that his recourse to trance was not through choice or through the inherent necessities of the phenomena, but arose out of his efforts to deal with the hot sticky weather. That the trance as well as the shift in the character of the phenomena was his own motion rather than mine I need not emphasize. I have a slight preference, in this mediumship, for the tranceless sitting, since I believe the medium's conscious observation of the phenomena to be a factor tending to her better morale and better physical condition. And inasmuch as I was engaged primarily in an attempt to strengthen the presumption of validity, I had a very heavy preference, at this time and place, for the telekinetic phenomena. I would not at all underestimate the significance of the teleplasms or the necessity for a long and careful study of that side of the mediumship; but in precipitating me into such study at this time, Walter was in my judgment getting the cart before the horse. But I did not then and do not yet know any feasible method for holding Walter upon a given task when his inclinations lean toward another.

Throughout the present three evenings, I was driven to constant rubbing and scratching of my face by a sensation different from anything I have ever experienced through meteorological conditions alone; this I thought might correspond to Margery’s "cobwebs."¹

The program was to have Hubbs at the dictaphone. While instructing him in its operation prior to the séance, I accidentally upset the machine. Carelessness in inspecting it after restoring it to even keel opened the way to its unobserved inoperativeness during the séance. The electrical circuits were intact, so that the cylinder fed through as it should; but the mechanical connection between mouthpiece and microphone was interrupted, so that there was no

¹ Daylight saving time; nine o'clock standard time.
² M. M., p. 193.
recording of the dictation spoken into the former. It is to be emphasized that failure of the dictaphone on this evening was due to causes that were definitely known, and definitely known to be normal, even though its misconduct during June was not yet wholly accounted for on normal grounds.

In the absence of the dictaphone record, I reconstructed the séance action next morning, with assistance from the other sitters. The sequence of events was slow for a Margery sitting, and I am confident that this sequence as well as the value of the major events themselves is preserved.

Séance of July 16th, 1925: 10 Lime Street. Record made from memory on morning of July 17th, by Bird with assistance of other sitters; parenthetic interpolations therefore superfluous, the material which would ordinarily be found therein comprising part of the record itself.

Circle formed at 9:15 and séance held in total darkness throughout. Order of circle, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Mrs. Hubbs, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. Hubbs at dictaphone, on sofa, facing circle. Margery wore bathrobe and slippers only, being examined and put in them by Mrs. Hubbs. Five luminous controls were in use on her ankles, wrists and head. It is a matter of observation that on a hot, sweaty night, the Psychic’s perspiration saturates these and, particularly in the case of the ankle bands, lowers their visibility. On the present occasion, though this happened, all five bands remained visible to some sitters throughout. For the visibility of the foot control, responsibility devolved largely upon Dr. Richardson; Bird in particular, owing to the smallness of the circle, found the table almost always between his eyes and the Psychic’s feet.

Throughout the sitting and without exception, hand control at all junctions other than the Crandon-Psychic link was uninterupted. When Bird used his right hand for manipulation of the apparatus, Mrs. Hubbs transferred her hand to his wrist and went with him. Crandon several times left his seat in search of apparatus. Usually this occurred in red light, with the Psychic’s free hand visible. Several times, however, it took place in darkness. In such intervals there was no action; and the first such interval did not come until after the brilliant display of X (Walter’s terminal) against D (luminous doughnut).

Repeatedly at critical moments Bird was given additional control of Crandon’s two hands and Margery’s right; frequently,
of Crandon’s head as well. The loss of the dictaphonic record makes it impossible to connect such control with the precise phenomena accompanying it. Bird is positive that with one or two exceptions, the full additional control prevailed at every episode of moment after the conclusion of the X-D display. Taken severely on their merits, all these episodes under the extended control are not of equal value; for at some times Bird is better able than at others to verify absolutely that the two hands temporarily controlled by him have physical continuity with Crandon’s and Margery’s shoulders. On no occasion did he have any active fear that either hand was not what it purported to be; but absolute certainty here is a function of the time available, which in turn varies with the nature of the phenomenon of the moment.

Shortly after the light went out, Crandon reported sound as of rubbing against C walls. Not heard by anybody else, this provoked a question addressed to Walter, who replied with whistle as the first indication of his presence sensible to all. There ensued considerable whistling and talking over an interval of perhaps ten minutes. A sitter suggested that the Psychic might go into trance. She expressed unwillingness, but within a very short time Crandon reported the trance. At the instant it was not observable by the others but soon became so. The thrashing with the feet was less pronounced than in Bird’s previous experience with the trance; the movements of head and body were much more free. There was unusually frequent vocalization of the petulant, almost whiny complaint: “Don’t feel good, at all.” Vocal effects in general were more notable than usual, save for snoring, which was almost entirely absent. There was a deal of puffing, blowing, snorting and smacking.

At one point, Bird and Mrs. Hubbs were in the act of reporting touches on their knees, when Walter spoke up to say that it was the Psychic’s feet. The ankle controls were invisible to Bird and could not be brought into his field of vision because of their position relative to the table; other sitters however were able to verify Walter’s statement.

So far as these particular touches went, Bird could not have made a positive verdict of normality. Later he was touched often and freely pushed by what he took to be unmistakably the feet.

1a It is only fair to point out the complete consistency of this chronicle with the theory that the mediumship is of hypnotic origin. Code, in reading the M. M. book, found its earlier chapters describing the beginnings of the mediumship, and particularly the beginnings of the trance habit, brilliantly in line with his own hypotheses.—J. M. B.
The first, and ambiguous, touches consisted in a stroking of the knee, much as is done by the teleplastic terminals; this was firm and clean-cut and seemed intentionally directed. The sensation was so little that of a human contact that Bird infers the slippers to have been on the feet. The incident strongly emphasizes that for dark-room touches, we are much more dependent upon certainty of control than upon the sensations reported. It is also worthy of note that Walter made no attempt to claim these touches, though inquiry was so couched that he could apparently have done so with no risk.

After the onset of the trance D was placed on T. There ensued some delay, with instructions from Walter several times to remove it or turn it over temporarily because of its extreme brightness. Finally there occurred a series of dark silhouetting against the bright ground, lasting perhaps twenty minutes in all.

First the outline was that of a single finger, followed immediately by that of a badly formed hand. Bird commented upon this bad formation; a change of shape at once occurred, best described by suggesting that two fingers, which had been lying together, were now separated. After this had occurred Bird still saw but three digits. On his remarking this, a fourth at once moved into the visible field, coming from off the D at Bird's side; after which a thumb moved into visibility from the side remote from Bird, and again in a way suggesting that it had been there continuously. Mrs. Hubbs and other sitters at Bird's right could see this before Bird could.

Some sitters thought the hand a miniature: Walter and others disputed this. Bird later found by experiment that one tends to underestimate the size of D itself in the dark, and with it that of the silhouetting object. The hand was doubtless of adult size. It is hereinafter referred to either as X or as H—the latter when emphasis on its hand-like appearance is desired.

Mostly this object lay motionless across the D, sometimes for minutes at a time. There were occasional changes of position; some of these gave the impression of a change in size and shape as well, but Bird is confident that all could be interpreted as changes of position. Several times, usually in response to Bird's remark calling attention to lack of mobility, H would move about carrying D with it. Such motion was totally lacking in preference for any particular sense or even any particular line. Several complete or three-quarter circles were described with all freedom, the rotation of H in these being always or almost always counterclockwise. As climax to one such episode, D was picked up and
waved vigorously in the faces of Bird and Mrs. Hubbs, coming about as close as is possible without actual contact; then dropped on T in front of Mrs. Hubbs. Bird and Crandon both recall that at this moment the extra controls prevailed. The description of the silhouetting against D makes it plain that if this be fitted into any picture of fraud, the Psychic’s own hand is needed to produce it. Nothing is remembered definitely which would operate to the categorical exclusion of the claim that at some moment during the subsequent demonstration a foot had been substituted for this hand.

During manipulation of D or at some other moment, Crandon and Richardson in rapid succession reported a passing touch from X, flicked across the tips of their fingers.

At one stage Bird was permitted to touch the teleplasmic hand with the back of his own hand, as the former lay over the D. The dominant sensations were of cold and smoothness. The first is conventional and needs no comment. On the second Bird insists strongly: this was not a skin-covered object; it gave an impression of slickness quite foreign to skin.

After the removal of D, the Dingwall mechanical bell-box (DB) with luminous striking plate was placed on T. H was brilliantly silhouetted against the striking plate, in fuller outline than against D; for this plate is a full circle, five inches in diameter, luminously painted over its entire area. H was now plainly seen to be the normal size of an adult hand. Bird thought it impossible to state whether it simulated a right hand, palm down, or a left, palm up. Other sitters thought they could observe curvature of the fingers concave downwardly, calling for the former alternative. H moved visibly and audibly on its luminous ground, and several times rang the bell.

The coordinate board (CB) was next placed by the sitters on T. This consists of a luminous network of one-inch squares, ten by twelve, painted on a cardboard somewhat larger than necessary to accommodate it. H was silhouetted several times against this, giving maximum length of six inches and width of four to five. Then Bird was instructed by Walter to hold CB in the air above T. He did this, about eight inches from the table-top. H was then silhouetted against CB, moved visibly, struck CB audibly several times, and finally pushed the latter off Bird’s hand, away from the Psychic.

See page 117.
The hole bell-box (HB), of new design by Code, was now introduced. With this on T, Walter asked that the luminous holes be covered. There was considerable fumbling and experiment by the sitters before this could be done satisfactorily. One arrangement that covered the entire top of the box with a large cardboard sheet, Walter rejected. The arrangement finally reached involved cutting a strip of this cardboard, laying this over the row of holes, and fastening it at either end with thumbtacks. It was inferred by the sitters at the time, and later verified by Bird, that no normal access could be got through the holes to the contact board without displacing this cardboard shield sufficiently to make the luminous paint around some of the holes visible to some of the sitters. Nevertheless, with the card in place, Walter repeatedly rang the bell without the slightest glimmer of luminosity. On at least one of these episodes there prevailed the full additional control of the Psychic's right and Crandon's left hands by Bird.

Inasmuch as the Scientific American and the original Code bell-boxes were in the room, it is necessary to record that, owing mainly to the different quality of the wood, all three give different and easily recognizable notes. The ringing here was distinctly that of HB and was distinctly on T. After ten or a dozen episodes of this, Richardson and Bird were invited by Walter to put their hands on the cardboard, one at either end. The bell gave one brief peal under these conditions, stopping as though the circuit had been interrupted. Walter then reported the bell inoperative; and sounds were repeatedly heard as of the contact sheets striking, without ringing. At the end of the séance Bird was about to examine HB, expecting to find a wire off a terminal; but it was now found to be wholly in order and operative.

The Psychic was weighed before and after the séance. Pains were taken to prevent the recording of any normal loss of weight, the bathrobe, which would have taken up any perspiration, going on the scales with her. Her weight was the same before and after.

At a moment when Bird's head was far forward over T, ex-

---

4 See page 128. In view of what is there told, it should be stated that no sparking was reported by any of the sitters at the present occasion. While we were of course looking for none, since we supposed the box to be rung by access in some way to its interior, I am very certain indeed that had there been a spark I should have seen it.—J. M. B.
5 See page 124.
5a A paragraph discussing the construction of the HB, and speculating as to Walter's means of ringing it here, is omitted in view of the fullness with which the point is covered on pp. 123-9.—J. M. B.
amining H on D, but from one side so that it could not have obscured D from Psychic’s seat, Walter made remark indicating knowledge of Bird’s position. As against the idea of coincidence or inference, Bird urges that this was the one moment during the séance when his head was really out and over the table to a degree surpassing what might have been looked for from one intent on observation of the action.

During a red-light interval, while Crandon was searching for apparatus, Walter whistled sharply from C in response to Bird’s remark. No sitter was watching the Psychic’s lips at the moment.

The séance was terminated by unexpected emergence from trance at 10:35 followed by Walter’s good-night.

Séance of July 17th, 1925; 10 Lime Street, Boston. Dictaphonic record, transcribed verbatim, with parenthetical elaboration by Bird. Original dictation by Bird, with assistance of other sitters, relayed into instrument by Hubbs.

Circle formed at 9:15 p.m. and séance held in total darkness throughout. Order of circle, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Mrs. Hubbs, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. [Hubbs outside circle, on sofa in northeast corner of room, at dictaphone. Margery clothed in robe and slippers only, under supervision of Mrs. Hubbs. Crandon at his own request was “frisked” before séance by Bird, with negative result. Five luminous controls as heretofore. Continuous victrola, record “Out of the Dusk to You.” Various apparatus, none new, present in space east of cabinet. Following previous night’s demonstration with HB, this had been more carefully prepared, the cardboard strip having been put in place in daylight and tacked firmly down.]


9:25 [the interval having been well filled with conversation from Walter]. At Walter’s request and without interrupting control, Bird removed the original Code bell-box [from its initial place on T, at side remote from Psychic, to place on the floor, between his own feet. It remained here and played no part in the séance]. HB remained on T, [where it had been initially, along the side next the Psychic. No other apparatus was on T initially].

9:26. HB turned end for end by Bird, at Walter’s instructions. [No interruption of control. Box had stood with padlocked side away from Psychic, in accordance with usual conventions of this mediumship; it now stood with padlock toward her.
Bird was aware of this; Walter was asked which way HB now stood and demonstrated that he, too, knew.

9:30. Crandon announces trance. [The other sitters were unable to verify this at the moment, but did so very soon, before any further phenomena occurred. Trance very little vocal—much less than night before. Considerable motion of feet; at times these were on Richardson's knees, or in contact with shins and knees of Bird and Mrs. Hubbs, or in sharp motion under T. The luminous foot controls were Richardson's particular responsibility. They were visible to him practically throughout, and always to Mrs. Hubbs when not to him. The whole trance effect was much more peaceful than the night before, though Walter complained several times of the excessive heat. The paraffin, melted in a pail, was in C, as the night before, through Crandon's hope of getting molds of hand; but tonight there was a bucket of ice water behind it, for Walter to use if he would, and to maintain a lower cabinet temperature. Headband visible to some sitter at all times; luminous control of right wrist not uniformly or constantly visible, so control of this hand must be specified at critical moments.]

9:30. HB rang on T; no luminosity visible anywhere [this of course refers, here and later, to luminous marks on top of box and not to luminous controls].

9:31. Two long peals from HB. Richardson, with head far in cabinet, and Bird, equally remote (and equally low) on other side of T, both fail to see any luminosity.  

9:32. Walter rings HB three times to Bird's order; no luminosity visible. One long peal follows, [of Walter's own motion]. Walter says he does not use the holes, that we may seal them with sealing wax next time.

9:35. In response to Bird's request, Walter rings bell three times, shorter and more closely spaced than before. No visible luminosity. HB rings four short peals; then [after brief interval, and both times on Walter's motion] six peals of varying lengths. It is suggested [by some sitter] that this is an attempt at the Richardson family signal; Walter immediately gives this in better form.

---

6 It was of course ultimately indicated, almost to the point of absolute proof, that Walter rang the bell without use of any means of entry to the box—such entry not being necessary! Nevertheless, it seems desirable to leave the record as it was written when this was not known, rather than make any deletion of matter which now turns out to have no particular point. The references listed on p. 189 will enable the reader to trace the complete history of the blind ringing by the Hole Bell-box.—J. M. B.
9:36. One very long peal, followed by a series of seven or eight very short ones. Then two long and two short, alternating.

9:37. With Bird's forearm lying the entire length of the box, on top [no sacrifice of control], Walter gave one long peal on the bell. Bird felt [what he described at the time, for brevity's sake, as] vibrations of lid of box, immediately prior to ringing. [An accurate description would be as follows: partly through hearing and partly through feeling the jar or shock, Bird got impression as of light tapping by fingernails, which because of the muffled effect he confidently placed inside the box.] This experiment was suggested by Walter; but at a moment when Bird was revolving in his mind the possibility of making some sort of contact between his person and T or HB, for the very purpose of seeking some such experience as actually ensued.

9:40. [Over the impatient protest of Crandon, on the ground that it was "leading nowhere"], Bird's experiment of just now was repeated by Richardson; but he reported no sensation save the ringing of the bell. [Walter seemed anxious to have the matter cleared up; with his consent] Bird now placed an ear close down in the angle between T and HB, in hope of again hearing the effect; but he heard and felt only the ringing of the bell.

9:41. [Walter continued to press this matter, apparently determined to get a reconciliation of some sort.] With one hand under each end of HB [no loss of control], supporting it thus off T, Bird [experienced two episodes of bell-ringing, separated by some seconds. He] reported that the first time he sensed no effect other than the ringing. On repetition, he felt pressure [on his hands] as bell rang, [duplicating previous experience in holding other bell-boxes while Walter rang them]. But the attempt to feel vibrations [internal shock, or anything of the sort], was again a failure. Throughout all these bell-ringing episodes [certainly since 9:37 if not from an earlier moment], there was no visible luminosity; and hand control was specifically verified by all around circle [but Psychic's right hand by Crandon alone]. Psychic's headband was visible to Bird and the foot controls to Mrs. Hubbs.

[Reports of visible foot control, unless the reverse is specified, always imply that for each foot a single band is seen, and not two bands or a full circle or ellipse, as should be the case if the band were off the ankle. The sitters making this observation, of course, are seldom if ever able to judge whether the spatial relationship between the two bands is such that one foot may be thought of as covering the band that has been detached from the other; or
whether any other means of concealing such removal (as with a slipper) has been put into effect. This inability arises not out of shortage of observing time, or out of any state of mind unfavorable for observation; but out of the fact that no accurate judgment can be formed of the distances from the eye to small luminous objects visible in darkness, and hence that no verdict can be reached as to how they would appear if a normal view of them were afforded, in normal perspective.]

9:45. Bird out of control while removing HB from T [and placing it between rheostat and fireplace]. Hand control of Crandon and Mrs. Hubbs on Bird's knees here. Doughnut (D, luminous) secured by Crandon and placed on T by Bird. [In this interval Crandon's left hand out of control; no report about Psychic's right.] Walter very particular about precise location of D on T. [Commenting on this dictation, he said it didn't really make any difference; he just enjoyed making us follow precise and arbitrary instructions.]

9:47. H [Walter's "hand"] descended on D with a flop, audible to all. Extra control of Psychic's right hand and both Crandon's, by Bird, immediately following this, and control by Richardson of Psychic's left [as always], demonstrating that hand on D was none of these four. At Bird's request, Walter moved both the Psychic's feet, demonstrating that it was neither of them, [nor anything carried by one of them. Having asked for this, Bird was in position for precise observation. Both ankle bands were low down and far apart, making it out of the question for both to be on the same limb. In addition, they did not move quite simultaneously; and one came forward away from the Psychic while the other moved partly sideways]. Slight movement of hand with D [after above observations in control, and after Bird had restored his attention to table-top]. Bird was [here] permitted to touch H quite extensively with back of his hand. Sensation of smoothness duplicated that of night before. Sensation of coolness present, but Bird believes not quite so cool as night before. Walter assents to this.

9:51. Complicated series of movements [going on for several minutes before and after dictation] by individual fingers of H. Sometimes one finger moved while others remained motionless; sometimes two or even more fingers moved simultaneously but independently. Some shifting of H and D on T here.

9:55. Lateral movement of H with D.

10:00. H still silhouetted over D, and at the moment better visible to Bird than at any time since first contact. [Considerable
motion or change of shape, or possibly of both but not necessarily so, going on too slowly for observation on its merits, would be implied by this remark.] Slight movement of fingers now noted. At Walter's suggestion Bird brings his nose very close to H; he reports no odor of any description. To his best judgment, movement by H during this episode indicated that H was actually clear of D in the main, resting only upon its own finger tips [in a fashion strongly suggesting that H was in some sense alive and self-supporting. The major items leading to this conclusion were the curvature of the fingers and the relative speeds, across the luminous ground, of the forward and rear portions of the hand]. H now removed from D.

10:05. D removed by Crandon [no report of his left or Margery's right hands during the interval] and DB placed on T. No interruption of Crandon-Bird control.

10:06. DB moved sharply away from Psychic, across T. T also moved in this same sense. Walter in response to query said he did this teleplastically, and not through the Psychic's feet. These feet [had] both [been] visible to Mrs. Hubbs at the time, [and she reported that they had been at rest]. Immediately following, a hand was silhouetted against the luminous plate of DB. Then the tips of several fingers struck the plate and rang the bell several times; then the entire hand with the fingers sharply crooked [did the same]. While Bird maintains control of all three hands [one of Margery and two of Crandon] at his left, H is [again] silhouetted against the plate and rings the bell sharply several times. It withdraws, returns, and repeats the act. In response to speculation about H, Walter displays it repeatedly in whole or in part against the plate, ringing the bell incidentally. The fingers [are now] crooked so as to make it certain to all that it is a right hand, palm down. Richardson verifies Bird's impression that the fingers were decidedly gnarled and knotty.

10:10. Referring to previous reports of right hand, Walter now implies that he will show a left. A hand descends sharply on the plate, ringing the bell repeatedly and visible in various positions. [It is] distinctly a left, palm down.7 The same knotted effect of the fingers [is observed]. Extra control by Bird of three hands

7 If it had been the same hand as before, it would have had to be turned palm up to simulate a left. All sitters agreed that there could be no possibility of mistake; although I did not point out to them this significance of the observation. Of course, the same considerations which I have adduced in my parenthetic remarks following the 9:41 dictation might be urged here by the skeptic, as a means of meeting the present observations.—J. M. B.
throughout this; [and foot controls reported specifically visible to Richardson].

10:12. At Walter's request, Crandon removes DB and substitutes CB. This now lies on corner of T nearest Bird [at Psychic's far right]. H descends on CB with fingers wide apart, [a position quite different from any in which it has yet been seen at this seance:] it is eight inches long and about seven wide from tip to tip of outstretched thumb and finger. H moved slightly on CB; it was a left.

10:15. H again silhouetted, momentarily; Walter asks Bird to verify that it is a left. [It was.]

10:16. Right hand silhouetted against CB [still on side of T remote from Psychic], as Walter whistles in cabinet. [No observations since 10:12 as to concavity of fingers or orientation of H.]

10:18. Right hand silhouetted against CB. Bird is invited to hold CB in air, above T. He did this, with his thumb projecting toward the Psychic, from under CB. A right hand was silhouetted against CB; and Bird got a long and persistent contact against the end of his thumb from an object which, save for the cool temperature, might well have been a human hand. While this went on, Bird for some time had had all hands at his left; and Richardson specifically reported control of the Psychic's left hand [which he later stated was with him uninterruptedly throughout the sitting].

10:25. Audible flop on T. Crandon and Richardson report that this is by neither of the Psychic's hands. Audible scratching on T, by request; same report. [No showing against theory that this incident was by a foot.]

10:30. Walter said good night. In response to Crandon's urging, Walter was heard to whisper, incoherently, in red light, by Bird and Mrs. Hubbs. No one able to see the Psychic's lips. Recovery from trance was had only after red light came on, contrary to course of preceding night's recovery, when Psychic announced that she was "here" before Walter said good night.

At the séance of July 18th, I planned, if any of the bell-boxes were rung, to attempt a dictaphonic recording of this phenomenon. A hypnotic or hallucinatory theory covering the production of the phenomena in general had already been disproved photographically, as regards the visible phenomena of this mediumship. It seemed worth while to disprove it again as a generalization covering the auditory phenomena.
During the morning of the 18th, I conducted a series of experiments to determine whether positive results of any sort could be hoped for in this connection, with the equipment at hand. I found that with the unaided mouthpiece of the dictaphone, no impression was made upon the cylinder when the box was more than two feet distant during ringing. At six inches or less, a very satisfactory record was got; between six inches and two feet, a less satisfactory and less uniform one. With the bare mouthpiece, even at a distance of only an inch, the dictaphone reproduces the action of the bell not as a ringing, but as a whirring. I looked forward to attempts to improve upon this result with the use of a horn on the mouthpiece; but there was no time in connection with the present sitting to experiment with means of attaching this securely. So I decided to make the experiment, for this evening, with the bare mouthpiece.

Séance of July 18th, 1925: 10 Lime Street. Dictaphonic record, transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic elaboration by Bird. Original dictation by Bird [through Hubbs], with aid from other sitters.

Circle formed at 9:00 p.m. [the watch used during the séance was later found to be some twenty minutes slow; this affects the absolute but not the relative timing. Séance held in total darkness throughout]. Order of circle, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Mrs. Hubbs, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. Hubbs at dictaphone, on chair in front of sofa. Gerke [present], outside circle, in chair, behind space between Richardson and Mrs. Hubbs. [Five luminous controls, as usual. Continuous victrola, tune "Out of the Dusk to You." Psychic in robe and slippers, under supervision of Mrs. Hubbs.]

[In arranging the seats prior to sitting down, all sitters at Bird’s right were crowded further to their right than usual, making it possible for Bird’s chair to be entirely at the side of the table opposite the Psychic, rather than in its more usual place on the corner at her far right. Crandon was shifted a bit to his left, and the rheostat was moved back close to the fireplace. The net result was to leave a clear path along which Hubbs, in the dark, would be able to move the dictaphone up to a position of contact with the table. This was necessary, because of the extremely limited range of the instrument, as indicated above.]


9:12. At Walter's suggestion, Crandon leaves his seat to remove SAB from T and replace it with HB. [Sentence edited in transcription to avoid ambiguity of original dictation.] Bird took over control of Psychic's right hand [during this; Crandon out of control. Various other pieces of apparatus in reach behind Crandon's wing of the cabinet, as usual; only HB on T.]

9:15. Two long rings on HB.


9:24. Sharp movement of T away from Psychic; attempt to verify positively the foot control failed [apparently owing mainly to the closeness of the sitters to T]. Walter [as last night] stated that he had moved T [teleplastically, rather than with the Psychic's foot]. Immediately several sharp staccato rings on HB, the last coming after Bird had established control of Psychic's right [and Crandon's left] hands.

[Walter had been told, early in the séance, of the plans for recording the bell-ringing. He assented and promised to indicate when it might be done. Twice the suggestion from a sitter to do it was met with the statement that he was not ready. At the present point he instructed that the dictaphone be brought forward. This was done; and Walter then proceeded with the experiment so rapidly that there was no time to dictate an a priori statement. The next thing on the record must therefore be either a blank space, corresponding to failure to record the ringing; or a series of whirring noises, corresponding to success. In the latter event, there will be pertinent spacing between the several peals occurring during the same episode of ringing; but no pertinent spacing between the two separate episodes, since during the considerable period separating them the dictaphone was not in rotation.

The record in fact carries five distinct whirrs, separated by intervals of which the first is noticeably shorter than the others. The first four whirrs are of approximately the same duration; the last one notably longer than these. Verbatim transcription is here resumed.]

9:26. The whirring sounds which it is hoped are here recorded on the dictaphone [as seen above, the hope was realized] represent ringing of HB. Walter called for Bird to assume control; Bird took the three hands at his left [both of Crandon's and the Psychic's right], as well as Crandon's head, on his shoulder. The Psychic's head-band was visible throughout to all sitters; Richardson had her left hand; Richardson, Gerke and Mrs. Hubbs all reported that they could see the foot controls. The dictaphone was now moved close to T; Bird placed left hand of Mrs. Hubbs
on his knee [for control], and operated dictating device with his right hand, which was out of control [save as the successful operation of the machine controlled it]. HB rang one long peal. [Bird was not quite ready, and did not get the dictaphone into operation until after some considerable fraction of this peal had passed.] Upon invitation from Walter, Bird then asked for four peals [making no statement as to their lengths]. These were given [the first three of moderate length and], the final one very much longer than the others.

[Hubbs, standing behind dictaphone during this episode, was apparently unable to reach the bell-box because of the position of Bird’s hand with the receiver, blocking him off. At the conclusion of the episode, Hubbs wheeled the dictaphone back to its place and resumed his seat and his operation of the machine. On repetition of the experiment under similar conditions, the person in Hubbs’ place will be instructed in advance to place his hands in control on Bird’s shoulders, and to keep them there throughout.]

For balance of sitting, “control OK” [or “ordinary control”] includes Richardson’s control of the Psychic’s left hand, visibility of her foot markers to Richardson and Gerke, and of her head-band to Bird at least.

9:35. After a lot of joking by Walter as to whether he would obey Bird’s request for two long rings followed by one short, HB rang differently from this. Then Bird established control of the three hands at his left and of Crandon’s head [on his shoulder], and with this plus all ordinary control his request was met by HB. Walter then rang a long and complicated tempo on HB, most of this occurring after Bird had [again] established full control of three hands and Crandon’s head. All ordinary controls OK. Walter here whistled in accompaniment to HB.

9:36. Bird in control of Psychic’s right hand while Crandon removed HB.

9:42. Walter said he must go, and séance ended.

[As safeguard against accident to the record, before it was removed from the carriage the portion that records the HB ringing was located; and Bird, Gerke and Hubbs listened to it and verified that ringing was recorded, as above. The record was brought safely to New York, and is now at 15 Lexington Avenue.]

The hypnotic or hallucinatory theory is therefore disproved as a generalization covering the bell-ringing, if not the other auditory effects. Likewise, we have disproved as a generalization the theory that the ringing is done by some other bell than that under attention
at the given moment. For no other bell would have recorded; none other being within five feet of the receiver, unless concealed and therefore muffled in the clothing of some sitter. The dictaphone seems to have been mastered, and to provide the ideal means of séance recording; with the reservation that the proper operation of the machine in darkness is not as simple as one might suppose, so that its use in important experiments should be preceded by adequate practice and rehearsal. For the rest, we face the obvious hazard of having the phenomena of the present case diverted into a field from which we would prefer to keep them away; and the course of the next series of sittings must be watched with considerable trepidation lest this diversion be continued.
CHAPTER XV
A Reversion to Teleplasmics
Séance Records and Comment
By the Editor

Owing to pressure of other engagements by the Psychic to sit with informal friendly groups, it was found necessary to schedule the third series of A.S.P.R. sittings a week earlier than they would otherwise have been held. This brought them so close upon the series of July 16th–18th that Walter elected very pointedly to regard these sittings as a continuation of those. The implication was that the trance and the X silhouetttings of the earlier series were to be continued and developed, into what Walter hoped would take the form of visible or photographable teleplasmic structural effects. The promise that he would try to produce something for us to photograph was particularly explicit.

Going into the series of July 23rd–25th, I wrote for my own reference the following memorandum:

The problem of personnel apparently will have to be dealt with afresh for each series of Society sittings, for the present at least. Conant being out of town on vacation, Gerke's services as photographer were secured. Dr. Horace Westwood, Unitarian minister from Toledo and member of the Society, was to be in Boston on the evening of the 23rd; and he was to be accompanied by Mr. Joseph Dunipace, a Toledo business man, who would be available for all three of my evenings. I found it possible to take Mrs. Bird to Boston for this series; Dr. Richardson was available but not Mrs. Richardson; and a prominent Boston lawyer, Mr. Charles S. Hill,¹ who was at the moment keenly interested in the case through recent contact, was added to the group. It should be recorded that the group went through the three evenings without any addition of sitters; and that Walter expressed the keenest satisfaction on this point, attributing his good results largely to this factor.

In going into the first evening of this series, there was considerable uncertainty as to just what the psychic program was to be. The

¹ See page 439; also open reference No. 10, Vol. 2.
luminous control bands of course react strongly to the photographic flashlight, and for some time after a picture they are of extreme brilliance, and of course give an effect of white light. On this account, it is more or less the custom in Margery’s séance room to omit them when photographs are certainly going to be attempted. But we were not certain, on the first evening of the present series, that this would be attempted; and we feared that there might be a good deal of telekinesis, luminous silhouetting, etc., which would be rendered largely worthless in the absence of hand and foot control. We therefore effected a compromise; we omitted the wrist bands as being most distracting to the psychic and most nearly dispensable through application of routine personal control, but we retained the luminous controls of ankles and forehead.

There had been considerable discussion as to the means through which Walter had rung the Hole Bell-box, with the holes sealed against physical access of any sort. Examining the box with this problem in view, I had reached a working hypothesis which was entirely tenable so far as events had yet gone. The crack between the hinged side and the top of the box I found to be wide enough for insertion of a penknife blade; and using such means to get access to the interior of the box and to depress the floating contact board, the bell could be rung easily and freely. The crack, under this theory, was being used as a substitute for the holes. On the 17th, before performing with HB, Walter had had the box turned around, so that the side carrying this crack was facing the Psychic; and this, despite the fact that the metal padlock was on that side, whereas he has usually requested that the SAB be placed with the padlock side away from her. This seemed good evidence pointing toward’s Walter’s use of the crack as a means of ringing the bell.

On the other hand, I had put this evidence before Walter during the séance of the 18th; and while he would not deny in so many words that he used the crack, he offered to bet that he could ring the HB with all holes and the entire length of the crack sealed. Accordingly, for the new series of sittings, in addition to the cardboard strip carefully tacked over the luminous holes, a long strip of surgeon’s tape was carefully put over the crack, from end to end. Prior to each séance the cardboard was removed, the paint about the holes activated, and

---

2 See pp. 177, 178, 179, 180; Chap. XI in toto; and pp. 336-7.

3 See page 178, bottom.
the cardboard replaced; so that removal of this shield during the séance could not be effected. No luminous marking was used beneath the tape, because of its narrowness; and no marks were made across this and on to the box, because if this were done a second and a third time it was feared that confusion between the several sets of marks would result. But the folds, creases and other irregularities of attachment of the tape had my very careful attention, and these were quite adequate to insure against its removal and replacement in darkness.

For the present series of sittings Westwood made the rather ambitious suggestion that we give Walter a chance to deal with something inside a closed and sealed space. I accordingly purchased six pill-boxes of such size that they could be nested, one inside another. Certain objects known only to Westwood and myself, and one of which we believed it would be impossible to duplicate, were placed in the smallest box; all the other boxes were placed about this, in turn; and each box was carefully sealed by means of signatures or thumbprints of Westwood or myself. One might hope for either of two things: for a positive identification by Walter of the objects in this package, or for an apport of one of them out of the package. In point of fact, while this assembly (NPB: nested pill-boxes) was present more or less during the present sittings, Walter gave it no attention.35

Operation of the dictaphone through an intermediary had not proved altogether satisfactory. It necessarily involved a loss of time and a doubling of vocal noise. Then the assistant did not always understand exactly what I wanted to go on the record; and he was always liable to pay undue attention to remarks by other sitters which struck me as not pertinent, or even to arguments about the record which might arise between various sitters and myself. Of course such arguments always had to be settled, in or out of the séance room, before the record could be regarded as finished and approved by the sitters. But when I dictate into a machine there is certainty that no discussion among the sitters gets recorded in an intermediate or unsettled stage, and when I dictate into a human ear this certainty is absent. Equally, when I dictate into the machine I am able, if the circumstances require, to leave the argument in a state of suspense for extraséance discussion, the results of such discussion to go into the interpolatory matter; whereas the human agent, knowing that he must properly put in much that comes from other mouths than mine, will probably

35 Nor did he ever subsequently return to this apparatus.—J. M. B.
not know when or how best to hold the record in such suspense. The dictation for 9:46 on August 12th (page 219) gives a fair sample of the sort of situation that is better handled by dictation to a machine than to a human being.

Against all this, there had to be considered the fact that if I attempted to run the machine myself, while my command of the record would be absolute, and while time would be conserved and needless noise eliminated, it was not clear to what degree my ability to sit in the circle, control my neighbors and observe my control of them, and observe the phenomena themselves, would be curtailed. I decided to experiment with this direct operation of the dictaphone, during the present series, in the effort to determine how the advantages checked up against the disadvantages. I found that at times there was conflict between close observation and close attention to producing the best record. I found also an unanticipated drawback, in that Crandon was apt to feel that I ought to be observing at moments when I was dictating, or vice versa; and that failure to alter my course in accordance with his ideas led to more or less tension. On the whole, however, I found the disadvantages far outweighed by the advantages; and I definitely decided to do all my séance recording in this way until some better technique presented itself.

No break is involved in the circular control when I sit in the circle and operate the dictaphone. My right-hand neighbor takes my right wrist instead of my hand, since the latter must be free to handle the mouthpiece with its switch; his hand is then under a control as rigid as usual, while mine is fairly well controlled by his, and in addition could engage in unauthorized activity only by sacrificing the record. When I come to the end of a cylinder, it is necessary for both my hands to go completely out of control to remove the old cylinder and put on a new one; if I try to do this with hands on my wrists I am too likely to drop one of the cylinders or strike it against metal with sufficient force to break it. While I am changing the records my neighbors continue under control; for this purpose I need only place their hands on my respective knees. The dictaphone stand is placed partly between me and my right-hand neighbor (I speak now of the Margery procedure specifically, and not of the general case), partly in the space behind us. The space between us is thus widened; and were it not for the support afforded by the armchairs, we could hardly maintain our hand-contact for the hour, plus, to which these sittings run.
The above represents a subsequent editing of my rough notes of July, 1925. No material has been added, but the notes were not in such condition that they could be presented intelligibly in their original form. We come now to the séance records:

Séance of July 23rd, 1925: 10 Lime Street. Dictaphonic record, by Bird with aid of other sitters; transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic elaborations by Bird.

Circle formed at 9:00 p.m. [and séance held in total darkness save for red-light and flashlight intervals noted in record]. Order, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Westwood, Hill, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. Two cameras set up [in north of room], bearing upon the Psychic and the table. Gerke in room, free, attending to these. On sofa [in northeast corner]: Mrs. Bird, Dunipace and [as guest of the evening] Mrs. Bradford Holmes [of New York; member, A.S.P.R.]. Bird operated dictaphone from his seat in circle. [Psychic in robe and stockings or slippers, apparently under her own supervision; this note supplied too long after séance to permit of certainty on these points.] Initially the Psychic had but three luminous controls, those on the wrists being omitted. [Continuous victrola, as always; no further attempt was made to keep track of the tune of the evening, so this condition may be understood to apply in future sittings, without specific mention.]

On T initially, HB and NPB.

9:21 [after longest interval of waiting yet experienced in the Society sittings, and after some sitters had expressed fears of a blank]. Walter whistled in C. The voice was of unusual loudness; and, as heard from Bird’s seat [seemed] unusually far out from C.

9:24. Continued loud conversation by Walter, apparently outside C. Discussing possibility of getting photos tonight, Walter expresses fear lest the flashlight dissolve his teleplasmic formations.

9:30. [There was] overlap between Walter’s conversation and a sound [heard but] not identified by Bird; but stated by Crandon [Richardson and Gerke] to be the Psychic’s yawn.

9:34. Prolonged whispering and whistling by Walter, louder than ever before heard by Bird. Richardson reports whistling beyond C, toward victrola. Crandon says this was right at his left ear. Richardson reports whistling now in his right ear; and from Bird’s seat the effect is distinctly as though from that region. [The room temperature was such that it had been felt necessary to install a fan; it stood on the floor, approximately behind Westwood.] Westwood reports breeze opposing that from the fan;
Richardson concurs. [There had been strong suspicion several times previously that this was occurring; this was the first time anybody was willing to report it positively.]

9:35. Westwood says the whistling is now facing him, apparently far forward in [or in front of] C. For several minutes Walter has been whistling practically continuously, and in this time he has covered the entire tune ["All Alone"] being played tonight on the victrola. The whistling shifts rapidly in apparent locus [in general, not pointedly at this instant; and when it specifically did so at this instant] the Psychic's luminous head-band was visible and motionless. Extremely loud Walter whistling and whispering continued, apparently out over T. It is now 9:37. [Practically everything Walter said tonight was audible without the least difficulty to those on the sofa, who usually have had about all they can do to satisfy themselves that the whispering is present at all.]

9:38. Red light given while luminous wristbands are placed upon the Psychic, by Walter's instructions. Control then restored and light off. [At Walter's instructions,] light given again to remove NPB from T. It is now 9:39.

9:41. Crandon reports the Psychic in trance, together with some delay on his part in making the report. [She was not in trance during last red-light interval.] Crandon reports movement by the Psychic's right hand on her thigh, and fingering of his hand by hers. [Reports of this sort are rendered to Bird through duplication, by Crandon's hand on Bird's, of effect being produced by the Psychic. In this instance it was a slight stroking of finger on finger characteristic of the Psychic in the séance room, whether entranced or normal.] Richardson reports motion on considerable scale of Psychic's right hand, and Hill of her foot [the latter being observed visually].

9:44. One long peal from HB [in spite of the sealing of all orifices through which Bird has been able to ring it by normal means].

9:45. Control shifted so that Richardson has both the Psychic's hands and Bird both of Crandon's. [Here the record carries two whirring noises; fairly long, close together, fainter than those of the July 18th record, but unmistakably audible.] The mouth-piece [has just been] open while the bell gave several long and short peals; the distance is such that Bird questions whether they will record. [Apparently all did not.] Several short peals [were given] during dictation [of preceding sentence; but on the record they are not distinguishable through Bird's voice].

9:47. [Three whirrs, approximately equal in length and close
together, here occur on the record; their strength is about as before. At Bird’s request, HB rang three peals; Crandon’s head was on Bird’s elbow in addition to the other [usual] controls, [but time was lacking to set up extra control by Bird of the Psychic’s right hand, which was therefore controlled by Crandon alone. The dictaphone was open at the same distance from HB as before; and as the above parenthesis shows,] the ringing was successfully recorded. [The record is preserved at 15 Lexington Ave.] The conventional circle was restored at the end of this episode. Crandon reports patting of the Psychic’s thigh by her hand.

9:49. Bird removes HB from T at Walter’s request; he was out of control while doing this, but his neighbors were controlled through their hands on his knees. While Bird was thus engaged, Westwood reported a touch inside his left knee. Hill reports having felt, about the same time, a touch inside his left knee; he failed to report it promptly, thinking it Bird’s knee. Bird says it was not his knee. Hill reports the touch again during this dictation. [At the moment of contact no sitter had an eye on the luminous anklets; but immediately after, Hill reports them visible and motionless.]

9:51. Psychic’s right hand [identified by Crandon] heard scratching on T. Richardson reports concurrent movement of left arm.

9:52. Richardson reports, in general, much motion by the Psychic tonight.

9:55. Walter gives the signal for Gerke to get ready and for the other sitters to get out of the camera’s field. Richardson and Crandon [at Walter’s instruction] remove the luminous controls from the Psychic, the circle being maintained save at their points of contact with her. [Walter stated here that the brightness of the control bands would bother him in “withdrawing.”] 3b

9:58. Control restored immediately after above. [The apparent undue lapse of time was caused by the fact that Walter had ordered the luminous headband removed, as well as the wristlets; but] the Psychic in trance refused to permit Crandon to

3b Here again we have our hostile critic, with the insistence that if this measure is ever necessary it ought always to be so; and with a deadly parallel between the situation existing here, and that discussed in the textual insert of page 202, within the first paragraph of the July 25th record. The critic of favorable disposition will probably reply simply to the effect that, if the procedure of withdrawal were a fraudulent one, the objection “if ever, then always” would apply even more strongly. I have discussed the general principle here involved in a paragraph of the text inserted just before the 9:19 dictation for June 18th; see page 147, as well as page 202, referred to immediately above; and, finally, page 213.—J. M. B.
[touch her head sufficiently to] do this, and he had to be content with turning it over, bright side down. He then reported that the Psychic withdrew her right hand for a moment, and suggested that she took off this control herself. [Walter protested vigorously against the inclusion of this item in the record; Crandon seemed inclined to support both Walter in objecting to it and Bird in putting it in. The séance proceeded only after the situation had been cleared up, as recorded in next entry.]

10:00. Red light given at Walter’s insistence [to remove headband and to check up against the preceding freedom of the Psychic’s hand]. Crandon reports that the Psychic again fought removal of the band [but that this time he got it off]. The circle was rejoined at 10:01, after all sitters saw in red light that the T was empty.

10:01. The Psychic’s head [fell forward] upon T, her right hand at the left of the head and carrying Crandon’s with it. [This hand] immediately returned to its natural place at east of T.

10:03. Walter gives signal for the photo; the flashlight misses fire. Gerke is permitted [by Walter] to use his red torch to reload the flash pan. In the interval, the Psychic is in extremely deep trance, marked by snores and other vocalization.

10:06. Crandon observes and Richardson verifies [respiratory effect by the Psychic, sufficiently similar to] “Cheyne-Stokes breathing” [to constitute a notable symptom of the trance. Any alarm which might have been felt was prevented by previous observations that this effect is apt to ensue in deep trance by Margery. For a description of the effect, see Encyclopedia Britannica, Eleventh Edition, Vol. 6, p. 749; and note also mention of this effect in article on Hibernation, as sometimes characterizing the latter phenomenon]. This effect was followed, perhaps half a minute later, by breathing sounds similar to flow of water through a pipe. The Psychic’s head then returned to T.

10:09. The signal for the flashlight was again given [and this time it was sprung successfully]. Following the flash, the extreme brilliance of the particles of luminous paint [with which the table-top has, in long course, become impregnated, made it in effect a luminous plaque, which] shows the Psychic in silhouette, in a state of [apparent] collapse. There was an interval of perhaps two minutes [of absolute inertness] between the flash and her first audible respiration. Richardson reports the pulse about normal in rate and volume during this interval.

---

4 Cf. my experience with Mrs. Leonard: My Psychic Adventures, p. 135.
10:15. [Considerable conversation ensued with Walter after the Psychic's recovery from collapse but while she remained in trance.] Walter says her face ought to appear [in the picture] as though covered with mesh or lace, and swollen. At least, this would be the case if visibility could have been established in the dark; he is uncertain what modification the presence of the white flashlight may effect. He promises that tomorrow night he will try to show teleplasmic formations on the Psychic's face, in red light before the flash.

10:16. The Psychic came out of trance while Walter was still present and talking.

10:17. Walter says good-night. Crandon's usual effort to provoke a word from him, in red light after this is given, was a failure.

The photographic plate was developed by Gerke and seen, in the glass negative, by all sitters before leaving the house. The Psychic's face was thought to be swollen, and a white [on negative] fringed effect was thought to be visible, like a beard, about its lower part.

Séance of July 24th, 1925: 10 Lime Street. Dictaphone record, by Bird with aid of other sitters; transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic elaboration by Bird.

Circle formed at 9:06 [and séance held in total darkness save for red light and flashlight intervals noted in record]. Order, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Hill, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. Two cameras as last night; Gerke in charge and free in room. On sofa: Dunipace and Mrs. Bird. [Bird operating dictaphone from seat in circle, as last night.] Owing to the photographic program, all luminous controls of the Psychic omitted for this evening. [Psychic in robe and slippers only, as usual; she changed into this under Mrs. Bird's supervision.] HB initially on T; no illuminated apparatus present save one doughnut [which was not called for and not used].

9:07. Walter's voice heard immediately on extinction of the light. Walter instructs that red light be given and sitters from the sofa inserted in the circle. While this was going on Walter's whistle was heard in full red light; [no eye was on the Psychic's lips at the moment]. New circle, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Mrs. Bird, Hill, Dunipace, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. [The record at this point carries a faint impression of Walter's whistle, audible through Bird's dictation.]

9:11. Lights out on the revised circle. Walter whistled at
once [and this whistling is audible on the record through Bird’s voice].

9:13. Walter’s voice and whistle are as brilliant as last night [here the whistle is audible through the dictation] in all respects [the whistle is again audible on the record]. The Walter whistle is heard from very high in C, as well as from points apparently well out over T, etc.

9:15. Continuous conversation and whistling by Walter. [Numerous snatches of the whistling appear on the record here; see the latter part of the next paragraph.]

9:22. [A dark megaphone, DM, has been on floor of C at Psychic’s right initially, as is usually the case with this mediumship. This] DM, which according to Crandon has been in air for some time, is now reported by him to have returned to the floor. Red light given at Walter’s instruction to remove HB from T. During the interval preceding this dictation, Bird had been making efforts to record the Walter whistle [holding the dictaphone mouth-piece open and directed to C at moments of clear, loud whistling; and he continued these efforts after this dictation]. DM heard in motion. [A brilliant series of whistles is recorded here.] Walter was sufficiently interested in the attempt to record his whistling [brought to his attention by the preceding dictation], to give numerous loud blasts, apparently far from C and very close to dictaphone. It is hoped that some, at least, of these will be recorded in the interval preceding this dictation. [It will be seen that they were, and very freely. Following this dictation, the record carries further audible whistling.]

9:25. Crandon reports semi-trance. Half a minute later, [he reports] deep trance. Since trance period began, Walter whispering and whistling [have] lessened; [but he greets this dictation with a fresh outburst, audible on the record through the dictation in the absence of any effort by Bird to catch it]. Deep snores from the entranced Psychic.

9:26. [With trance of less than one full minute’s standing,] in two-second period of red light [given, as throughout, at Walter’s direction], the entire side of the Psychic’s face is seen by all sitters to be covered with a network of white substance. The head is inclined to the left [so that the uppermost] right side is affected. Richardson and Crandon state that hand control of the Psychic has been continuous since the lights went out at the start of the séance. The description as “network” should be amplified. The mass lay, not in fine lines, but rather in heavy bands perhaps half an inch wide; with large empty meshes between, some of these as
much as an inch across. Richardson suggests the simile: like hanks of cotton yarn as seen at the factory.

9:27. Further period of two seconds of red light. The entire top of the Psychic’s head and much of the face are now seen covered solidly with the white mass. Long low groans are heard from her. Walter states that this white teleplasm, different in color from that produced for Dingwall, is what apparitions are made of. The Psychic continues groaning in trance. Dim red light for two seconds leads to disagreement among the sitters as to the teleplasmic details; so Walter orders bright red light for two seconds more. The Psychic’s entire head and face are seen now covered by the white mass. Similes applied by Crandon and Richardson in description of the appearance both carry the idea of a textile fabric. Everybody agrees that while this is a just simile as far as it goes, the appearance is not that of any cloth [known to them]. The vocal effect in trance suggests obstruction in breathing by the teleplasmic mass.

9:30. In spite of the difficulty in breathing, the Walter voice seems unimpaired. Walter states that the white material issues from the ears. In a further period of two seconds of red light, the general position of the mass seems lower and it appears more consolidated. It is possible that the teleplasmic veil is as high as before, merely extending to a lower point. Richardson reports violent efforts by the Psychic’s left hand to reach the face, without success.

[It should be noted that while Walter always called for “two seconds,” of red light, and while the record follows him in this, the interval actually given was seldom if ever so short. Crandon’s interest, and his knowledge of the other sitters’ interest, lead him to stretch the exposures to red light. Once Bird counted five full seconds during one of these “two second” intervals. This remark also calls attention to the failure to state heretofore, in the records of this series, that at all times Crandon handles the light switch. Bird cannot conceive of circumstances which would impel him to intrust this to another person.]

9:34. Walter calls for preparation for a photo. Then he says, “Shoot, any time.” There is a slight delay as Gerke pre-

---

5 See Chapter II.

6 The original records of this period employ always the words ectoplasm, ectoplasmic. Inasmuch as the Society has abandoned this term, turning it over to orthodox biology in the interests of its long-established use there in another connection, I have throughout substituted the newer and more expedient terminology.—J. M. B.
Plate 9. The photograph of July 24, 1925; 9:35 o'clock. White teleplasmic mass, arising apparently out of the right ear and almost wholly covering the face. The appearance is somewhat that of a sheep's omentum.
pares the second camera for action, with the Psychic groaning. Crandon reports vigorous shaking by her hand.

9:35. Just as Gerke was about to shoot, the red light was given for a second or so [so that there might be a visual check against the photo]. All sitters clearly see the teleplasmic mass on the Psychic's face and head, with the exception of Richardson, who was looking elsewhere, and Mrs. Bird, whose eyes were closed in anticipation of the flash. After the flash, the teleplasmic mass gave a faint luminous effect; it was not nearly so bright as the T with its particles of luminous paint, but none the less visible to all the sitters.

It may be well to point out, here, that if the teleplasmic mass is of genuine character, it represents a substance quite new and unknown to the sitters. When we feel it, we get a sensation presumably not corresponding exactly to anything in our past experience; when we look at it, the same factor is present. We can attempt to describe our visual and tactile experiences with the teleplasm only in terms of past experiences through these senses with other specific substances. We employ the utmost freedom of simile in this sense, without any intent to reflect upon the validity of the teleplasm. Similarly, we make this remark without any intent to imply that the teleplasm is to be taken as necessarily valid.

Further: a very interesting suggestion is made by one who has read the above in proof, and who wants to know what impressions the sitters had as to the color of the after-luminous teleplasm; whether this effect could not have been an after-image; and particularly, what Mrs. Bird, whose eyes were closed during the flash, had to report. The color was the same whitish or gray-whitish effect seen in afterglow by the luminous paint; the adjectives just used being not wholly satisfactory until the reader explicitly adds to them, in his mind, appreciation of the fact that the effect is distinctly a luminous one. The suggestion that an after-image was involved is disposed of by the unanimous verdict of all sitters to the effect that they have to look at the teleplasm in order to see it; that if they turn their eyes elsewhere, anything that they may see is of different form. And again, while Mrs. Bird cannot at the late date when interrogated recall the details of the present experience, it is the positive observation of various other sitters that a person whose eyes are closed during the flash, after opening them sees the same after-glow as the others, and sees it in the
same place. At the time when this paragraph is written, there is available nothing beyond this distinctly *ex post facto* statement. At the first opportunity, I shall get contemporaneous testimony on this point from specific sitters and in connection with a specific séance; and I hope to have such testimony in time to publish it along with the other statements of endorsement or repudiation by the sitters, which I have promised the reader on page 3.

9:38. Crandon reports that the Psychic carries his hand to her chest, and directs it in feeling the cold mass thereon [edited in transcription to eliminate ambiguity]. Walter expresses willingness for Bird to do the same. There is considerable difficulty overcoming the reluctance of the entranced Psychic to permit this, but it is finally effected. Bird finds the mass soft, slightly cool, distinctly [of a plastic surface and] not of the nature of a textile fabric. Another sitter supplies the word "rubbery," which comes fairly close to Bird's sensations.

9:40. Bird is left in control of the Psychic's right hand as Crandon goes for a cloth with which to cover the luminous table [following the flashlight. He brings a white sheet for this purpose].

9:42. Gerke is reloading his flashpan with the aid of a red torch. The Psychic's head is apparently forward on T. Crandon reports that he feels teleplasmic cord running along her right thigh. [This seems to contradict Walter's statement about the present manifestations, and to throw us back into the Dingwall period.] Much moaning and groaning by the Psychic. [Because of its similarity in color to the teleplasm,] Crandon suggests that the sheet *

9:45. Groaning, moaning, blowing, restlessness, vocal complaint. Flash being reloaded and plates in cameras changed.

9:46. Second flashlight sprung. [Some sitters were taken by surprise and blinded; all others report] marked visibility of the teleplasmic material [immediately] after the flash. There is a pronounced cobwebby, stalactitic effect; no particles are detached from the mass [yet the word "dripping" characterizes the general effect]. Another simile strongly approved [by some sitters] is

*See page 213.*
that of pulled chewing gum or candy. Hill reports contact by back of his hand [under what guidance is not indicated] with a rough, cool, stringy mass. Bird [out of control] changing record [and dictation lags temporarily on the same ground].

9:51. [When the Psychic's head went up after the second flashlight, there remained on T a dark, silhouetted mass. At first taken merely to be a dark zone in T, this turned out to be the teleplasmic mass itself, in silhouette. It was this that Hill felt.] Mrs. Bird [next] felt the teleplasmic mass on T. She describes it in terms of rough, cold dough. Dunipace had the same experience; he agrees partly with Mrs. Bird's description but suggests that the feeling is also that of rubber. All having the experience agree that the temperature is cool but not cold. Walter reports the teleplasmic mass gone from T; he requests that the sitters relax and pay him no attention. Mrs. Bird says the temperature was almost exactly that of dough made from cold hydrant water. Walter endorses this.

9:55. Walter and the Psychic are now both fairly quiet, but the trance is still a plaintive one. There is considerable restlessness by the Psychic [immediately following this], both her feet being momentarily on Hill's knees. In response to Crandon's query, Walter states that his "gang," previously stated to comprise seven [for the present night], all helped him; he could not give the teleplasmic performance alone. The Psychic's foot is beating on the floor.

10:00. Violent convulsion of C heard by all. According to reports by Richardson and Crandon, this was certainly not done by either of the Psychic's arms. C continues apparently to be hauled around violently. [Bird here cites previous experience in connection with the disappointing amount of net motion observed by C after an appalling racket.] The Psychic's hands are [reported] under control, and quiet; violent perturbations of C continue.

10:01. Another spasm [of this]. Loud whistle, reported by Crandon as through DM. [It was not so heard by Bird, who would have taken it to be an ordinary Walter whistle, without any "trimmings." ] DM was next moment thrown upon T, then fell to the floor between Mrs. Bird and Hill. There has been no interruption in the hand control [of the Psychic] since the last red-light interval, Crandon and Richardson report.7

7 See M. M., p. 158, for significance of this.
10:03. The Psychic is out of trance. Walter requests that the sitters leave quickly, without "hanging around."

10:05. Bright red light given for five seconds, then turned off again, at Walter's request. He states that when we see a genuine materialization, the substance used to-night is used, becoming luminous. Among his difficulties in the séance-room he gives light and heat a leading place. In dismissing us, he suggests that Mrs. Bird make examination of the Psychic. [This was done. Mrs. Bird left the room with the Psychic. She reports later that she examined the Psychic nude, with particular attention to hair and ears. The Psychic handed her robe to Mrs. Bird as she stepped out of it, and this too was examined with care. Bird himself examined the cabinet with care as soon as the Psychic vacated it. All findings here were negative.

The plates were developed by Gerke and examined (in negative) by the sitters before leaving the premises. Both corresponded closely with what was seen in red light preceding or white light during the flashes.

The dictaphone cylinder carrying the Walter whistles is preserved at 15 Lexington Ave.]

Séance of July 25th, 1925: 10 Lime Street. Dictaphonic record by Bird, with aid of other sitters; transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic elaboration by Bird.

Circle formed at 9:07 [and séance held in total darkness throughout, save for red light and flashlight intervals noted in record]. Order, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Mrs. Bird, Hill, Dunipace, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. Cameras in place as previously and Gerke in attendance. Illuminated apparatus present, but on floor at east of C, concealed under a sheet pending indications of what Walter proposes to do. Luminous controls of the Psychic were omitted in anticipation of possible photography.

A certain contradiction appears to exist between this statement, and the confession appearing in the dictation for 10:09, July 23rd, that the table itself is luminous after the flash. It will however be appreciated that there is on the table no single luminous area of anything like the extent presented by the control bands. The paint on the table, visible only under conditions comparable to those of the post-flashlight period, is almost entirely in flecks of very small size, or else in very narrow lines where it has run along the grain of the wood. The outline of the Psychic is faintly visible when these
areas are luminescing and when she then falls forward upon the table; but when she remains upright, there seldom if ever seems to be enough light from the luminescent table to constitute a drawback under any theory. Further; when she remains upright this light is much farther from her than that of the luminous controls. Hence if there is any valid physical objection to the presence of light in the séance room, it ought to be far more essential to darken the controls than the table.

The skeptic, however, will doubtless still feel that while the table remains in any degree luminous, it is silly to object to the presence of the control bands. The controls, of course, are visible throughout the sitting and the table only for a little while after the flash; and this will constitute an illuminating comparison between their relative candle-powers. I would insist on this comparison more confidently, were it not that once or twice, in séances where the responsibility for the record has not been mine, Walter actually has objected to the luminous table and has required that a sheet be put over it. He is more likely, however, to ask that this protection be given him, as it was here, from a pile of luminously marked objects which often stands beside the cabinet awaiting use, and which is very noticeable indeed after a flashlight. The matter comes up again on p. 213.

Further interesting speculations might be indulged in, and further interesting comparisons in candle-power adduced, as between the control bands and the luminous plaques, etc., upon which teleplasmic structures are often laid in direct contact with the paint. The candle-power of the red light is also of an order equal to or greater than that of the luminous objects ordinarily present; but of a different wavelength, of course. If there is a physical factor of light-inhibition, it of course would be different for different parts of the spectrum and would afford justification for the use of red light where white is banned. Indeed, whether this is the case, or whether the objections to light are a wholly subjective factor of the medium's own mind, has been freely discussed for years; and when the question came up in the Paris Congress of 1917, there was a sharp cleavage of opinion among recognized authorities. If it were ultimately adjudged that the objection to light is entirely subjective, the extreme inconsistency of procedure with lights of different characteristics, seen not only in the present records but in all mediumships, would be completely explained. This completes the present interpolated discussion, and we return to the record:

[The Psychic in robe and slippers only, to which she changed under Mrs. Bird’s supervision.] On T initially, four balls of modelling clay, one on each corner. [A new record, “Rememberin’,” from “Topsy and Eva,” caused some delay through the effort to make the music softer; and there was a telephone call for Crandon.] The seance finally got under way [with lights out] at 9:11.


9:14. Among other observations of the extreme mobility of Walter’s voice, Mrs. Bird and Hill join in reporting whispers from him, apparently in the space between their heads. Richardson reports a touch with DM, which was initially in C [as usual, standing on the floor at the Psychic’s extreme right]. Extreme mobility of Walter whistle continues.

9:17. Observations on the mobility of the whistle suggest strongly that tonight there are two distinct “whistlers,” and that one of them has to a considerable extent been working in the corner by the victrola. [An extremely] clear observation [is made] by Bird and Crandon of a whistle outside C, to the east, behind Crandon.

9:20. Red light given to remove the modelling clay from T, at Walter’s instructions. One of the four balls was found cut in two, as per announcement made a little earlier by Walter. Apparently [this had been] done with the edge of M. Richardson and Crandon here report that the Psychic has been in trance for some seconds, perhaps as much as a minute. [The onset was much gentler than ever before in these sittings.]

9:23. Red light given for several seconds, revealing a white mass on the Psychic’s right shoulder. Crandon and Mrs. Bird report visibility of a connecting cord running to the right ear. Walter responds to this dictation by calling for bright red light for two seconds so that all may see the cord. All see it. Crandon and Richardson report a resemblance to a trachea. On renewal of the bright red light for two seconds, Mrs. Bird reports frayed appearance of cord, and Bird a twisted effect. All saw the cord here. Walter had stated, on the first exposure of the material on the Psychic’s shoulder, that it was a materialization of the thing with which he talks. [It was in fact long and narrow, suggesting a larynx, trumpet, or something of the sort. The long diameter ran from front to back of the Psychic. The ear-cord joined quite near the rear end, and the front end was considerably the larger of the two.]

9:25. Dim red light for five seconds. All teleplasmic material is gone from the right shoulder; in its place, a U-shaped mass over-
Plate 11. The first of four flashlights taken on July 25, 1925; this one at 9:34 p.m. The teleplasm is of precisely the same type as on the previous evening, but in detail it shows considerable variation.
lies the right side of the head, as the head inclines to the left. The ear is exposed in the middle of the U. A fresh interval of red light is given [in response to this dictation], to verify Walter's correction that the ear is not exposed; this is found to be the fact. In this view, the rear arm of the U is much heavier than the front one; and Bird thought the arms joined at top and bottom, making it now a crude O instead of a U. [Hill endorsed this emphatically.] Numerous sitters accept Gerke's suggestion that the appearance [in color and texture] is that of pie dough. Walter's correction that it is whiter than pie dough is accepted by the sitters.

9:27. In dim red light for two seconds, the front limb of this O-shaped object is seen to run straight down the Psychic's face [hanging down thence over the chin] to the breastbone. The rear limb is as previously described and in approximately the same position as before. Those sitters able to see the Psychic's left ear also report a branch of the teleplasmic mass overlying it, and dangling like a rubber band.

9:30. Walter says: "Look at this and see whether you want a picture of it. The mass of teleplasm overlying the Psychic's face is very notable. Considerable discussion ensues by the sitters whether to take a picture. Mainly at Walter's motion [with promise of much better effects a little later] it is decided not to do so for the moment.

9:32. "Look at it now," says Walter. The head is turned to the left, exposing the right side [which is] overlain with considerable masses of teleplasm, and a cord shows, running to the right ear. "Do you like this better?" asks Walter; all agree that they do. The Psychic's head is inclined forward and to the left; masses of teleplasm are visible all over the face; [there is] a visible cord to the ear, and long particles dangle down the front of the Psychic's robe.

9:33. Preparing for the flash. [Walter has indicated that we may take photos almost ad lib. to-night.]

9:34. Gerke ready. Walter ready. In red light before and during the flash, and in luminescence from T afterwards, long masses of teleplasm are again seen overlying the Psychic's face and dangling down in front. It waves in air and sways about, a foot and a half from her head as this swings forward. After remaining distinctly visible for some seconds, the teleplasmic mass partly fades from view as the Psychic leans further back into C. (This observation and dictation were made in fumbling fashion, and the record has been edited for smoother accord with the facts as they presently developed.) [It is believed that there was no
possibility of seeing an oblique connection between motion of the Psychic's head and that of the teleplasm, but no sitter is willing to make the *ex post facto* negation in stronger terms than these. All agree that the head moved slowly and steadily forward, came to rest, and presently withdraw to a point further back than that from which it started; and that during this simple excursion and return, the teleplasmic mass swayed back and forward several times, at a different and faster rate.\(^7\) Brilliant whistling from Walter. Crandon and Richardson report that hand control has been continuous since the séance began.

9:35. Walter forbids Gerke to use the red torch for the moment. A dark cloth is placed over the freshly luminous tabletop.\(^6\) Walter says he cannot harden the teleplasmic material in the light; it curls up. He gives red light interval to let us see [in illustration of this remark] what happens to the teleplasm [after exposure to light. The visibility was poor and no report was made by any sitter.] In repetition [of red light] the mass is seen distinctly, lying inert on the right shoulder and connected with the right ear by cord. The face and head are clear. [The diameter of the cord is estimated by Bird, here and elsewhere, to be a scant eighth-inch. It was here that the uncertainty as to what had happened toward the end of the 9:34 dictation became cleared up; this uncertainty had revolved about the question of where the Psychic and the teleplasm went as they faded out of the visual field of the sitters.]

9:39. With the Psychic's head withdrawn somewhat further into C than usual, Walter gives [a lengthy period of] dim red light through the rheostat in place of the usual red torch for Gerke to prepare for the second flashlight. The general effect is as before, save that now considerable teleplasm is found on the right side of the face. During this red-light interval [there is a prolonged outbreak of] extraordinary whistling in the corner near the victrola, as well as from C. Walter says the two came simultaneously, but no sitter heard them so. [Bird would not have believed that the whistling from the corner was other than on the victrola record, had this not been played through many times during the early parts of the séance without this whistling.]

---

7\(^{b}\) This parenthetic interpolation, while set uniformly with the others because its ultimate relation with the text is the same, is not contemporaneous. It arises out of a discussion between myself and an adverse critic during the period when this book was going through the composing room; and the recollections of the sitters, which I consulted in this connection, are of course a good deal older and less reliable than in the cases of other interpolations. My own memory of the incident happens to be much clearer than is usually the case after such a lapse of time.—J. M. B.

6\(^{c}\) See page 213.
whistling continues, in and out of C, in red light and with the Psychic comparatively inert. [The light was too dim and she was too far back to support observation of her lips; but no person present could possibly consider receding from the positive location of whistles in the corner near the victrola.] Returning to the teleplasmic mass: some of this was on the Psychic's forehead, and it spread further over her robe toward the right breast [than on the previous view]. Whistling.

9:41. Gerke ready. Light, continuous since 9:39, now is put out. In darkness, Walter states that his main purpose in giving this long period of red light was to enable us to observe the stretching of the cord as the Psychic moved. Mrs. Bird and others verify [that there had been] motion of her head, but no sitter had noted the stretching of the cord.

9:42. Walter therefore gives a fresh interval of red light for this observation. All sitters see motion of the head and stretching of the cord. There is slight moaning by the Psychic here; but vocal effects of the trance have been much more sparing tonight than before.

9:44. A brief interval of red light shows a long mass of teleplasm lying down the Psychic's chest, extending pretty well to her waist, and showing visible connection with her ear. Bird is changing the cylinder [the first one being full]. While he was thus engaged [other sitters reported] further development of the teleplasm down the front of the Psychic's robe and on to T, observed in two intervals of red light. Another red light interval then shows the Psychic with head far forward, the teleplasm hanging loosely from some point of her face to T, and then stretching far across T. Walter says it hangs from the ear, not from some point of the face. The flashlight misfires. Walter again corrects the dictation, insisting that the teleplasm comes from the ear. Brief red light was given to check this; and so far as Bird could judge, there was no point of contact between the Psychic and the teleplasm save at the ear. It hung free from the ear to T, and [lay] draped far across T toward the remote left-hand corner. Gerke is refilling his flashpans.

9:47. A brief period of red light [is given]. The Psychic's head is more nearly erect; the teleplasm hangs in a long sweeping arc from her ear to T and across T beyond point of first contact [therewith]. To Bird, the end of the teleplasmic mass where it lies on T is greatly enlarged. Hill [checks this and] reports two dome-like protuberances like "solid bubbles" in the portion lying on T.

9:49. Unusually long red-light interval, preceding [successful]
flashlight. [The teleplasmic appearance was substantially as above.] In the period of visibility of the teleplasm [through faint self-luminosity] following the flashlight, pronounced visible changes were seen, best described as shrinking away and shrivelling up. Not [apparently] a shrinking toward the Psychic; simply a shrinking in diameter [and this change was observed in process, not merely through its ultimate result 8]. A pulling in toward the longitudinal axis, says Hill.

9:50. The teleplasmic mass now lies down the Psychic’s chest, nearly to her waist. [Whether it was still seen by its own luminescence or in an interval of red light, is not indicated.] She is in her chair, reclining backward unusually far. The teleplasmic mass is twelve to eighteen inches long and an inch or two broad, irregular in outline. During the shrinking or shrivelling process immediately above, several sitters saw what they characterized as the development of holes in the teleplasm. 9

9:51. Gerke leaves the room to reload fresh plate-holders. [In two intervals, with brief onset of darkness between], a prolonged period of red light [is given to aid his passage and] for observation of the teleplasm. It lies in a mass at least two feet long down the front of the Psychic’s robe. The sum total of Bird’s observations here is: a more pronounced ramification of the lower end of the mass than he has yet seen. A sea-weed effect, suggests Crandon. During all this, there is considerable motion by the Psychic, resulting in movement of the teleplasm. It was not always clear that the latter motion was dependent upon the former [sentence edited in transcription for the sake of clarity]. Perhaps as a consequence [of the head motion and teleplasm motion] and perhaps independently, the sitters watching the cord report a pronounced swaying thereof.

9:55. [The above dictation was made in darkness, following the observations which it described.] During [this] dictation, Walter called for red light; the teleplasmic mass was seen entirely withdrawn from the Psychic’s robe, etc., and concentrated upon her face and head, so that the face resembled a dead white mass, without features. Returning to the ramified effect of a moment ago, Bird emphasizes that many of the finger-like projections [at the bottom of the teleplasmic mass] had a slight curl.

---

8 One of Dingwall’s main grievances, it will be recalled, was that he practically never saw a change of the teleplasmic form thus in process. He would see the mass in one state, then after an interval of darkness he would see it in another. The present experience stands out in strong contrast with his.—J. M. B.

9 See note 8, immediately above.
Plate 12. Second flashlight (9:49) of July 25, 1925. The psychic despite her appearance of active attention is in a trance; the teleplasm is extended across the table from its point of attachment at the right ear.
9:56. Walter says: "Turn on the dim red light and let the Psychic do anything she likes." She rises in her seat. The teleplasmic mass lengthens considerably, and hangs free in the air without actually resting upon T [though the Psychic is leaning forward so that it hangs over T]. The connection with the ear was preserved [and in fact provided the sole support and point of suspension]. Hill disagrees with the statement that the mass hung free of the table; Crandon agrees that it did; Dunipace agrees that it did not, that the end rested on T. [The light had been put out and the Psychic had presumably reseated herself.] Repetition of the episode [was afforded] by Walter, resulting in a unanimous agreement [by all sitters] that the teleplasm was four or five inches off the table, hanging freely from the Psychic's ear. On both these occasions the Psychic freed her left hand from Richardson's grasp, and made curious sweeping motions with it, toward and across her face, but without touching the teleplasm. Walter remarked: "If she touches it, I'll break her damned neck." 10

9:59. Dim red light for two seconds shows the teleplasmic mass upstanding from the Psychic's face [and in contact at its upper end with the roof of C, as though fastened there and hanging thence]. It is still connected with the ear. [Richardson and Crandon report] hand control of the Psychic OK throughout the dark interval preceding this. Tapping on T [identified as] by Walter [when Crandon and Richardson repeat their report of hand control. In fresh period of red light] Walter gives another view of the upstanding teleplasmic mass. [The effect is that of approximation to the human form through the presence of two branches above and two below, as ultimately shown in photograph.] Hill and Bird [are so impressed by this effect that they] agree to make a sketch of it after the séance [but the photograph which was presently obtained made this unnecessary].

10:01. The demonstration [of the upstanding teleplasm] is repeated for Gerke's benefit on his return to the room. [Fresh red-light interval given for this.] Tapping heard on T.

10:02. The tapping on T continues. Crandon and Richardson report hand control [of the Psychic] OK. Renewed rapping while Bird verifies Crandon's control of the Psychic's hand.

10:04. Photograph taken of the upstanding teleplasm.
ing the period of luminescence following the flash [all sitters not blinded by the flash report a] gradual swaying downward from C roof [of freed upper end of teleplasmic mass], as though the entire mass were withdrawing toward the right side of the medium's head. The word floating is used in description of this effect (with all possible insistence that there was nothing which could be taken for free falling). 11

10:05. Walter suggests a photo of the Psychic, standing. There has been considerable whistling by him in the interval just past, as in other interludes. There is a strong inclination here by Bird, Crandon and Hill to identify an odor [strange to them and tentatively recognizable as] of teleplasm. It is distinctly not the odor of the flash-powder; Crandon describes it in terms of burnt bread. The word "pungent" is used by Hill [and by one or two other sitters whose observation of the odor was so delayed as to offer no defence against the implication that in their cases it was subjective. Bird was divided in his mind between "pungent" and "musty"]. Richardson reports a sensation as of teleplasmic touch across the backs of his fingers. It is now 10:07.

10:09. Flashlight misses fire. [Bird remarked here that Walter was much more patient and good-natured under this repeated failure of the flashlight than he would be himself if his rôle were comparable with Walter's.] Red light [in anticipation of the photo] reveals the Psychic standing, with perhaps the heaviest mass of teleplasm yet seen dangling [in space between her and T, and reaching decidedly below the level of the tabletop].

10:12. Gerke ready again. [In red light,] the Psychic stands with mass of teleplasm swaying in pendulum fashion from her ear; no other point of contact. The amplitude of the swing is such that the teleplasm struck Richardson's hand; and Hill reports, from his seat directly facing the Psychic, that the swing covered more than the entire length of T. 12 Most sitters were now blinded by the flashlight. Hill [was not; he] reports that the mass continued to swing [vigorously] until the Psychic was reseated in her chair.

10:14. Brief interval of red light given, in which it is seen that the teleplasmic mass has entirely withdrawn to the Psychic's

11 See note 8, above, and note 12, below.—J. M. B.

12 Offering convincing evidence that the mass weighs too much to explain away the observation that it floated down from its previous upstanding position because of its extreme tenacity: There can be no escape from the conclusion that an inert mass heavy enough to swing as this swung here would fall with practically no retardation by atmospheric resistance.—J. M. B.
Plate 13. The 10:04 flashlight from July 25th, showing mass of teleplasm upstanding from the psychic's head, apparently supported in normal fashion at top of cabinet. The fourth view taken on this evening (10:12, p. 210) was so badly fogged by the presence in the room of smoke from the preceding explosions that it is not reproduced.
shoulder and to the upper part of the right breast. The connec-
tion with the ear is still visible. Dim red light again, for two sec-
onds, shows the Psychic's head reclining to the left, the teleplasmic
mass covering the right side of the face.

10:15. Red-light interval shows the teleplasmic mass over the
left of the Psychic's face; [the right side is now in shadow, so that
no sitter can say with certainty whether the mass is shifted or
merely extended]. Bird is changing the cylinder [the second one
having been filled]. The sash and curtains of the easternmost win-
dow are opened wide by Walter's instructions [following complaint
by himself and some sitters of heavy powder clouds from the four
flashlight explosions].

10:15. While Bird was changing the record, Walter whistled
brilliantly. There is considerable white light in the room [through
the open window; see details below]. Walter now announces [that
there will be to-night] no more pictures, and gives two brief inter-
vals of red light for visibility of the Psychic. He calls attention to
the fact that the connecting cord actually enters the ear; and he
remarks that in consequence, she is as deaf as a haddock. The
teleplasmic mass here lies for the most part on the Psychic's left
breast, with one rope-like filament extending down at least a foot.

10:15. Red light given for two seconds. The teleplasmic mass
lies down the left side of the Psychic's robe to her groin. There
is a constricted section part way down, with considerable flare above
and below this; the shape of the whole being that of a very attenu-
ated hour-glass. There is some suggestion of a knot at the con-
striction. [All this is checked by Hill as Bird dictates it.] All
this is in partial white light with the window open. This white light
was not such as to contribute at all toward the visibility of the
Psychic to the sitters, but it gave very clear silhouetting of objects
in the room to one looking toward the windows from any point
whatever [this sentence edited in transcription, for better clarity].
Two further intervals of red light are given, showing the teleplasm
lying in a complicated curved fashion down the front of the Psy-
chic's robe, starting at [or above] the right breast, extending
down and out to her left, then around in a sharp sweeping curve to
the right thigh. There were at least two constricted zones, and a
pronounced fan-like spreading at the extreme tip. Again two sec-
onds of red light show the teleplasmic mass on the Psychic's right
shoulder and, so far as can be judged, hanging down behind her.
Hand control OK throughout this. A renewed interval of red light
is given for verification of above supposition, the Psychic being now
screwed around in her chair so that the sitters at her right can
clearly see the long filament hanging down behind her. The episode is repeated [in fresh red light], and the extreme lower end of the mass is seen below the chair-seat. This time the red light was of maximum rheostat intensity.

10:21. Audible motion by DM in C. Crandon reports an effect as of a big, hairy head on his hand, below the level of the Psychic’s chair. [There is apparent desire on his part to connect up with the Pithecanthropus of Pawlowski’s report on Kluski.13] Crandon reported that during this contact the Psychic’s head was located, by her groaning, [elsewhere than at the point of contact. Walter said something which Bird interpreted in such way as to dictate:] Walter implies that what Crandon felt was the Psychic’s head. Walter objected vigorously: he didn’t imply, he said it was her head.14

10:25. The Psychic’s foot is in Richardson’s lap. Dim red light for two seconds shows her reclining far back in her chair, with the teleplasmic mass lying on the left of her robe, from the shoulder down to the waist or below. During this dictation Walter again calls for red light and we find the mass wholly on the Psychic’s face, to the left. The distribution of the mass over the face seems to Bird to be more uniform than at any previous observation; [and he wonders whether all these moves since the last photo are not essential parts of the mechanics of withdrawal].

10:26. Dim red light for two seconds shows the teleplasm to be all gone. “No one in your world can find it,” says Walter. Talking with Gerke, Walter says this white teleplasmic substance comes from the white part of the brain. Crandon and Richardson state that the fore-brain contains a considerable mass of white substance for which orthodox physiology finds no use. Walter states that the dark uterine teleplasm produced for Dingwall is of a different type. He repeats from last night that all genuine materializations are of the cortical rather than the uterine teleplasm. That’s why we shouldn’t ever touch the white variety.

10:30. Customary amenities between Crandon and Walter. The Psychic is out of trance.

10:34. Conversation by Walter in red light. A small dark megaphone is placed on T by Crandon, at Walter’s request. The circle, allowed to lapse during recent minutes, is reformed. Walter suggests a telegram to McDougall: “Professor:—Ghost has brain storm—psychologist needed.” Walter remarks that Crandon

13Journal, A.S.P.R., September, 1925; Crandon had seen the manuscript.
14Such disavowals by Walter of phenomena which if fraudulent he could easily claim are frequent.—J. M. B.
didn't even know his own wife from the "Pithy-Anthroscope" [see 10:21 entry]. Hand control OK. A red-light interval is given to verify that the cloth from T has been thrown over Richardson's head. Bird is now the victim of the same performance. Dim red light is given for verification of this; hand control OK.

10:40. Walter [has been] carrying on a very jovial conversa­tion throughout the interval since 10:34. This [has been] punctuated by brilliant whistling.

10:41. In bright red light the Psychic reports something touching her on the right shoulder. Walter says good-night.

[Examination of C by Bird and of Psychic by Mrs. Bird, as last night. All details the same, with addition that the Psychic's robe was sweaty, and after examination was put in the tub for rinsing. It was then removed by Mrs. Bird and hung up to dry by her. The results of these examinations were entirely negative.

It is noteworthy that where the Dingwall trance sittings for the production of the uterine teleplasm had a profound depressive reaction on the Psychic, so that postponement was frequently necessary, she reports both tonight and last night that she feels extremely well after the sitting. There is more than a suggestion that the net result is actually a stimulating one.]

There runs through this chapter a thread of reference to use of a covering over the potentially luminous table, which is insufficiently clarified by the text of the records. The generalities of the situation are discussed in the textual interpolation of pp. 202-3; and the covering of the table as a means of meeting this problem is first indicated in the 9:42 dictation of p. 200. Here the cover was a bed-sheet, placed over the table at the start of the séance, and overlooked in the dictated account of the preliminaries. In commenting on it here we may refer to the footnote discussion of p. 194 and to the text pages there cited. On p. 206, at 9:35, we find that the sheet having been omitted at the start of this séance, an emergency arose in which a black focussing cloth was the most readily available cover for the table. At the extreme top of p. 213 we note Walter's use of this cloth as an instrument for spontaneous telekinesis. Anything in the nature of further summary of the above records, or comment thereon, is so effectively provided by the introductory remarks of the following chapter that we may without further formality close the present chapter here.
CHAPTER XVI
The Climax of the A.S.P.R. Sittings
Seance Records and Comment by the Editor

In reviewing Dingwall's report\(^1\) of his sittings of January-February, 1925, I had written\(^2\) substantially as follows:

"When we put on the séance table an object like the bell-box or the scales, we know in advance exactly what this object is. When it rings or levitates, we are confronted only by the problem of demonstrating its state to be what we had supposed it to be. There are no mysterious unknown factors at all; for if we can prove that its state was as intended and as represented, the immediate and simple problem of personal control at the moment is all that stands between us and a definite verdict. Even if we go beyond the mere validation of a valid episode and seek to discuss the psychic machinery, the *prima facie* terms of the problem are simple. We know exactly what has happened, in terms of sense impression, in terms of physical behavior, in terms of foot-pounds or degrees or inches. All we need look for is the dynamic agency leading to such result.

"In the presence of a manifestation which consists of the production of teleplasm from the entranced medium, everything is enormously complicated. Before we can reduce our problem to one of behavior or of units, we face the riddle: 'What is it?' There is a dominant factor of mystery which we can never overcome. Even could we overcome it, we should find that every difficulty marking the ordinary dynamic manifestations is present in exaggerated form in dealing with this static problem. The complications and the inherent uncertainty added by the mere fact that we do not know what this object is with which we deal, must be evident. But we can be more specific in our reservations.

"No prior examination can be attempted of this substance, for if it is genuine it is not 'there' initially. Any allegation which can be advanced in behalf of the possibility of concealed apparatus in a telekinetic séance is equally applicable to account for the presence of the teleplasm; but in the telekinetic séance the apparatus has still to be

---

\(^1\) *Proceedings*, S.P.R. (British), Part 98, Vol. XXXVI; June, 1926.
\(^2\) *Journal*, A.S.P.R., August, 1926.
used for the production of a pretty definite action by a definite object, whereas in the teleplasmic séance its mere appearance on the premises is the phenomenon which we must evaluate. Theories of fraud which may be advanced as to what it is or how it got in the room are not, as might be hoped, simpler or easier to meet than parallel theories to cover the ringing of the bell or the oscillation of the scales. If genuine, the teleplasm has the most fundamental anatomical nexus with Margery and we must expect that its examination or handling will be severely restricted—far more severely, and with far less resultant suspicion, than examination or handling of the ringing bell or the swinging scales."

In a word, when we turn away from telekinetics and toward teleplasmics, we attack the manifestations that present the maximum of inherent difficulty.

Dingwall so turned by choice, as I pointed out in the critique from which the above is abstracted. My own choice of a field for investigation was made in accord with the spirit of these remarks. My entire plan revolved about the assumption that my sittings would be mainly telekinetic in character. As my June records indicate, this plan was initiated, and good progress was made with it in these three séances. But with the sitting of July 16th, Walter's interest and attention began to veer in the direction of teleplasmics; and the further we went, the more pronounced this became.

One large contributing cause here was the fact that at this time Richardson was engaged in a serious and continuous study of the mediumship revolving about the vocal phenomena. This study was of an importance fully equal to that of my own program. It was initially directed toward the problem of developing a mechanical means of mouth-control which should be of sufficient and sufficiently obvious rigor to constitute a demonstration of the independence of the voice; and in this direction a very conspicuous success\(^a\) was ultimately scored. It was not, I believe, part of the original intent to seek out deliberately anything more than this. But for many months Walter had been in the habit of mentioning more or less seriously and more or less informatively the teleplasmic apparatus through which, he stated, his vocal effects were produced. A natural consequence of the holding, by Richardson, of a prolonged series of sittings devoted exclusively to the vocal phenomena was an increased amount of discussion with Walter about the nature of this mechanism. It was, I believe, mainly at Walter's

\(^a\) See Chapter XX.
motion that there was grafted upon the original program of mere demonstration a further project for rather extensive visible materialization, photographing and study of what he would present as his vocal apparatus; but Walter’s motion in this direction was enthusiastically seconded by Richardson and Crandon.

In June, when my séances were permitted (by Walter and Crandon) to take a telekinetic turn, Richardson’s program was hardly under way, and had not defined itself at all. In July it was well under way and was beginning to define itself in the sense of the preceding paragraph. In August it had got in full swing and was completely defined in that sense. So that during this time there was every provocation for Walter’s interest in the teleplasmic side of the mediumship, at the expense of the purely telekinetic.

One would have questioned, *ab initio*, the ability of Walter and the sitters of the intimate group to carry along two simultaneous investigations, two interlocking series of séances, with wholly divergent aims; and to keep these distinct. This failure reached a logical climax when I appeared in Boston for my August séances. At this time I was confronted by a proposal which I could not trace with certainty to a definite origin, but which I infer to have arisen more or less simultaneously and spontaneously in the minds of Richardson, Crandon and Walter: namely, that the Society sittings and the Richardson sittings be consolidated, to the great economy of time and energy. Neither in the degree to which this would substitute Richardson’s control of the séance procedure for mine, nor in the complete concentration upon teleplasmics which it involved, was this proposal in line with my own plans or my own ideas. But it was so definitely presented to me, both in and out of the séance room, as constituting Walter’s plan and Crandon’s wish, that I was left without effective means of protest. It was obvious that I must go on in this way or not at all; and for the time at least, the choice between these alternatives was clear. It was plain to me that in so far as there was to be any stage management by the sitters, other than Crandon, this would be exercised by Richardson to my own exclusion. To this subordination of my own rôle, as well as to the radical divergence from my own phenomenistic program, it seemed altogether the wisest course to submit.

Séance of August 12th, 1925: 10 Lime Street. Dictaphonic record by Bird with aid of the other sitters; transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic elaboration by Bird.
Circle formed at 9:11 [Crandon reserving for himself the place at the Psychic's right, and requesting Richardson to place the other sitters.\(^4\) S\(\text{eance held in continuous darkness save for intervals of red light and flashlight indicated in the record.}\) Order, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Hill, Mrs. Richardson, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. Three cameras set up [in place of the two previously used. One was of the ordinary model, using glass plates, the other] two were stereoscopic [using films]. Conant and Gerke in charge [of photographic work]. Luminous controls on the Psychic's ankles, but in view of the photographic program, not on her head or wrists.\(^{4a}\) [The cameras took up so much room that it was possible to accommodate no more sitters in the circle than those listed; so] Mrs. Bird was on the sofa in the northeast corner.

[Bird operated the dictaphone, from his seat in the circle. The stand had to be placed further in toward the circle than previously, because of the cameras; and Bird was therefore uncomfortably remote from Mrs. Richardson. Part of the time he handled the mouthpiece with his right hand, Mrs. Richardson maintaining control by grasping his wrist. Part of the time, however, it was necessary for Bird and Mrs. Richardson to rest these two hands, in simple contact across the arms of the chairs; and Bird then operated the dictaphone with his left hand, free, depositing Crandon's right upon his knee for control. The temperature necessitated an electric fan; it stood on the floor, approximately behind Hill.]

[Preliminary search of the Psychic was unsatisfactory, for reasons which are more conveniently set forth in the record of the following evening (p. 223). She wore robe and slippers.]

9:15. In response to Mrs. Richardson's request that the fan

\(^4\) I ought to point out that I was doing the recording of my own choice, and under my own procedure; and that this procedure involves my preoccupation with the dictaphone to such degree that I could not in any event occupy the place next the Psychic, with its demands for continuous close attention to the control of her members. Any criticism of the seating arrangements, therefore, must be on the general ground that Crandon was by his own insistence at one side of the Psychic; rather than on the specific ground that I was not assigned this seat. Had it been offered me, I should have declined it.—J. M. B.

\(^{4a}\) Whether these controls are removed entirely, as on July 23rd, 24th and 25th; or whether those on the ankles are retained, in accordance with the remarks of page 189 and as we tried to do it on July 23rd, seems to be a point permitting of no generalization. Unless the phenomena and the conditions under which they occur were to present much wider variation than is the case during the period to which we are now giving our attention, it would certainly be the case that elimination of the ankle controls on one occasion to permit fraud would necessitate that this be always done. And the essential parallelism between the phenomena of Chapter XV and the period of the mediumship ushered in thereby, and those of the present period, entitles us to assume that inasmuch as the feet could not there play any large part, they need not play one here.—J. M. B.
be moved, Walter spoke [for the first time] and instructed that this be done, in red light. In the darkness following this he whistled greetings as usual.

9:16. Crandon announces trance. [On a recent evening, there had been obtained, on two plates exposed in the séance room, an apparently teleplasmic cloud obscuring most of these plates.]5 Walter refused to answer most of the questions [put to him about this]; but he told Conant that it was engineered from his side. In response to inquiry, he stated that he could do the same thing with a plate exposed in a camera in the dark séance-room. His philosophy—here he interrupted the dictation to say it wasn't philosophy, it was fact—appears to be that there was teleplasm, or "himself," in front of the camera, and that in the flash this became luminous or reflected light. [He represented it as a psychic accident, without intent.] With regard to some black marks on the same plates, Walter says this was himself, moving; he says these marks are joined by what he describes as a swish like a comet.

9:24. First vocal sounds of trance, which up to here has been entirely a quiet one. Crandon suggests that the noises, a curious blowing effect, come from the teleplasmic ball. Walter says no. [The reference here is to the "breathing head" of teleplasm.]6

9:25. Blowing sounds continue. Most sitters connect them with difficulty in breathing through the teleplasmic veil.

9:30. Blowing sounds still heard intermittently. [There has been] continuous conversation with Walter, on various topics, to this point; [and beyond, remarked Walter. This turned out to be quite valid].

9:41. Walter stresses that for the purpose in hand, demonstration of his speaking apparatus, he is obliged to combine the two types of teleplasm [as characterized in the sittings of the preceding series. Bird had already been confident in his own mind that there was a liberal mixture of the philosophy of the Dingwall sittings and of his own; and that there was involved either contradiction or some such combination as Walter has now indicated]. No photos will be taken tonight, said Walter; [he would merely prepare for the following evenings, which he indicated would be brilliant affairs].

9:44. The Psychic's head is on T. Very loud blowing. Crandon reports her hand on the floor, under his control. She is erect

---

5 The present text describes these adequately; and the date on which and the conditions under which they were taken were not recorded. Hence they are not reproduced.—J. M. B.

6 See Chapters II, III.
again, after ten or twenty seconds. Immediately after this her left foot is on Richardson's knee for some twenty seconds. The Psychic is very restless; Crandon compares her grunts with those of a woman in labor [and Richardson assents].

9:46. [There is] considerable discussion of a questionable observation [by Hill and Gerke, the latter standing behind the Hill-Richardson space with his head forward and probably as close to C as that of any other sitter except Crandon and Richardson] of a "Maxwell-Parrish" blue light in C. Hill is positive that he saw it; Gerke less so; [no other sitter saw anything]. Walter said it was there, then called for dim red light. A white mass about the size of a fist was seen on the Psychic's shoulder; it was less irregular in shape and more rounded than [when] previously [seen by some of the sitters in Richardson's sittings]. Richardson said it looked like a rounded mass of coral; Crandon echoed this. Hill thought it looked like a new baseball; Bird found the surface appearance [irregular and fluffy], like cotton batting. Crandon thought the surface flaky, like vegetable ivory; and two other sitters used the word "flaky." Walter said that tomorrow night we would not know the teleplasm, and indicated that this is an important fact.

9:50 [at end of the above]. Walter states that the Psychic will not be feeling well tomorrow night but that we are to sit just the same. [Mrs. Bird, present through part of the examination of the Psychic prior to the present séance, reports that she spoke as though menstruation were imminent, and wore a Kotex napkin into the séance. She wore one again on the following night but spoke and acted as though entirely well.]

9:51. A very faint tapping on the east wing of C was heard by Bird only after Crandon had called his attention to it.

9:55. Walter said that next night we might all touch the teleplasm. [This was realized.]

9:56. Richardson reports a touch inside his left thigh; at this moment the foot controls are visible to him; next instant he was touched again, on the chest. Again Richardson is touched, on the right arm; Hill verifies the visibility of the foot controls on the floor where they belong. Hand control by Richardson and Crandon is reported as uninterrupted through all this. Several times immediately following there is a stroking and plucking at Bird's left foot and leg, and a plucking at his trousers; [the latter is] repeated as he dictates. During this time Bird had extra control of two hands at the Psychic's right, [in addition to normal control of Crandon's

7 But see page 232.
right hand; but he was without time to verify their identity as closely as he usually does. There was no specific reason for doubting this, however; and Richardson reports control of her left hand throughout the touches. Both foot controls were visible throughout these touches to several sitters, including Hill. During this dictation M (dark) fell on T. [Initially there was no apparatus on T or in C, save this M, on the floor at the Psychic’s right as always.] Immediately thereafter Bird was touched on the left arm, and Crandon felt the object—M or X—that did this. M placed by Walter at Richardson’s mouth, [so that Richardson spoke through it]; all controls as a moment before.

9:59. A touch on Bird’s right knee; all controls as before.

10:00. Several touches [apparently] by X felt on Bird’s hand, [where it is grouped with three others] on the Psychic’s [right-hand] corner of T. Both anklets were visible [at this time] and Richardson reports control of the Psychic’s left hand. Bird’s arm, bared at Walter request, is touched by what Bird took to be [the cold] metal mouthpiece of M. Here and a moment before, Crandon’s head was controlled on Bird’s arm. The cold touch was repeated.

10:01. M raps sharply on T a few times; all controls as during the past few moments. The additional controls are then dropped. Walter says these little manifestations do not count, he is just stalling us. [This is of considerable importance as indicating Walter’s appreciation of the triviality of the phenomena in question.] Crandon, while Bird was being touched, felt something like a husky forearm going past the backs of three of his fingers, on his left hand; with sinew-like processes at work therein.

10:04. Richardson reports the Psychic’s head down [on T].

10:05. Walter correctly reports the Psychic’s head up.

10:05. [Richardson had for some time past been talking about the possibility of Walter’s deflecting, other than telekinetically, the needle of a luminous compass; or producing some other non-telekinetic, magnetic phenomenon.] With Walter’s permission, Richardson now placed [such a] compass on T [and the séance centered about it for some time]. The compass-needle oscillated [almost or quite at once]; the sitters could not decide whether [to infer that] Walter had done this, or that the needle had not come to rest [after motion of the unit in Richardson’s hand]. With additional control by Bird of the Psychic-Crandon junction, the compass was eclipsed; immediately thereafter the needle oscillated through a ninety-degree angle. No sounds were heard here; but the sitters lacked any feeling of assurance that the compass had
THE CLIMAX OF THE A.S.P.R. SITTINGS

not been moved en masse. Equally, the needle might have been jarred into motion by displacement of the compass while eclipsed. Finally, even if we assume the phenomenon to be genuine and confined to the needle, this might conceivably have been moved telekinetically, Walter working inside the case in this way, rather than magnetically as desired. Just how to exclude these alternatives would be quite a problem. [This comment on the compass action is included in the record, because it was brought out by conversation in the séance room among the sitters and between them and Walter. It has been considerably edited in transcription, for the sake of clarity and completeness.] Momentary eclipse observed, twice.

10:07. Compass eclipsed; oscillates; eclipsed; oscillates; eclipsed to Hill but not to other sitters; partially eclipsed several times. At this stage there was twice heard a rattle [of the compass case against T]. Crandon’s left thigh touched. Compass eclipsed.

10:08. The foot controls were visible throughout this; and there was additional control by Bird of the Psychic-Crandon junction. The compass was eclipsed, one half at a time [and then the other half]. Hill continually reports eclipses at times when the other sitters see both ends of the needle, [which alone is luminous]. Walter says that he is working from Hill’s side of T. There is considerable oscillation of the compass needle, off and on, throughout this. Bird twice [but only twice] heard faint metallic sounds [suggesting movement of entire unit rather than of needle alone. There next ensues a] rapid complex of partial and total eclipses. The compass [then goes] in motion, en masse and sharply, across T; and this motion is repeated in the opposite direction. Eclipses [follow], plus metallic clicking.

10:12. Oscillation and eclipse of the needle, followed by clicking, then by sharp movement of the unit across T. Momentary eclipse. The compass is then moved across T to the extreme corner near Bird [the far right corner as seen from the Psychic’s seat]. There then occurs sharp oscillation [of the needle alone] without noise, and under Walter’s conscious control [e.g., he would address remarks to “Little Needle,” giving it instructions which it would proceed to execute.] Repetition of all this is given at the Richardson-Hill corner of T [the Psychic’s far left]. All controls are reported OK since 10:05, including Bird’s additional hand control.

10:16. Complicated compass manipulations occurring while Bird is engaged in changing the cylinder [are accordingly not recorded in detail]. The ambiguity of the compass experiment
leads to discussion of the psychic closing of an electric circuit [under conditions more lending themselves to exclusion of telekinetic or normal mechanical action]. Walter says he can close a gap of five inches, and can make the teleplasm conductive or nonconductive, at will. It becomes conductive or the reverse en masse, he says, and not in detail. He thinks he could do this in red light, [which would be essential to rule out endless discussion about search of the Psychic and use of her hands while thought to be under control. (In answer to a query)] Walter says that the choice of electrical properties in the teleplasm is not a matter of will alone; it consists in a physical abstraction [or addition] of something. He says he puts “air” between our terminal and his to produce nonconductivity. To Bird’s objection that this [begs the question, since it] constitutes an incomplete closing of the gap, he replies that for him the closure is complete, though for us it is not. He says he takes the pores of the teleplasm and fills them with “air.” The discussion closed with Walter’s statement, [usual under similar circumstances,] that the ideas which he is trying to express are foreign to our concepts [and that he must accordingly do his best to put them across through crude analogy].

10:24. The compass is still on T, and occasionally moves or is eclipsed.

10:25. Telephone; Bird takes the Psychic’s right hand as Crandon leaves.

10:29. Crandon returns and the normal circle is reestablished.

10:30. Trance terminates.

10:33. After a little final discussion Walter says good night and the séance ends. The Psychic a few minutes later reports stomach cramps.

Séance of August 13th, 1925; 10 Lime Street. Dictaphonic record by Bird with aid of other sitters; transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic elaboration by Bird.

Circle formed at 9:00 p.m., [under same procedure by Crandon and Richardson as preceding night. Séance held in darkness throughout, save for intervals of red light and flashlight, as recorded.] Order, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Hill, Mrs. Richardson, Bird, Crandon, Psychic again. [Dictaphonic arrangements as the night before.] Mrs. Bird on a chair immediately behind the dictaphone, in Bird-Mrs. Richardson space, [whence it was hoped that she would have better view of table-cabinet region than the preceding night. Her omission from the circle, it should be specified, is rather in accord with her own wishes.] Luminous
controls on ankles, but those on head and wrists omitted in view of the photographic program. [Cameras as night before, Conant and Gerke in attendance.]

[The Psychic wore robe and slippers. On the 12th, Mrs. Bird reported that so far as her own part therein was concerned, the search of the Psychic was not satisfactory. Mrs. Richardson and Mrs. Bird officiated together; but in the middle of the process Mrs. Richardson and the Psychic entered the bath room together and closed the door, leaving Mrs. Bird without. On the present evening, Mrs. Bird conducted the preliminary examination alone, Mrs. Richardson not being in the room at all. If one were then to seek to go behind the search, this could be done only by attacking its completeness or competence, and not the circumstances surrounding it. This is the more interesting, inasmuch as the séance of the 12th was largely a failure and that of tonight a brilliant success; while the only noticeable difference in conditions was that in the search, which should have influenced things in the other direction if at all.]

9:01. The Psychic complains of acute and universal itching. [No report was made regarding the degree of freedom of scratching allowed her by Crandon and Richardson.]

9:03. The Walter voice is heard. Walter stated that tonight the teleplasmic material of "his" larynx will be much hardened as compared with previous experience. What previously looked like a rubber ball will now be seen hanging out of the teleplasmic "mouth," to a length of about a foot. He is going to show us what he talks with.

[Once or twice during the evening Walter said "larynx." Bird had never before noticed any tendency on the part of Walter or Margery to mispronounce this word. But next day, she duplicated this mispronunciation.]

9:07. Crandon and Richardson simultaneously announce trance.

9:10. Unusually sustained and tuneful whistling by Walter. He asks that tonight we observe particularly the location, etc., of the cord joining the teleplasmic mass with the Psychic. He states that the teleplasmic larynx is made once for all. It remains with the Psychic, not with Walter or in the room. A moment later he seems to indicate that it stays with him. He explains the apparent contradiction by saying that the apparatus stays with her, the force going with him—it's like the deflation of a balloon. [A rather clever simile, Bird thinks.]

9:14. Dim red light for two seconds shows the mass of teleplasm overlying the entire face. It is rather heavy in texture, of
a general veil-like effect. The cord is visible, at the right, running apparently not to the ear but downward at least as far as the right breast. At the junction with this cord, the mass is aggregated into a small globular formation. [The cord was much thicker than ever seen before; perhaps half an inch, certainly three-eighths or more.] The trance becomes a complaining one; "Don't feel good, at all; head aches," [in petulant tones].

9:19. Bright red light for two seconds. The teleplasmic mass is seen heavily consolidated on the Psychic's right shoulder; the cord lies down the right side to —. At this point Walter interrupts to say that the extension seen lying down the right side of the Psychic's frontal aspect is not the cord, but the laryngeal extension of which he spoke earlier. The cord, he says, extends from the ear to the big mass; he gives an interval of red light and we verify this. The cord is seen distinctly running from the ear, decidedly smaller in diameter than usual; and the extension lying down the Psychic's breast is seen to have a definite termination. Crandon and Richardson state that the general effect of the mass upon the shoulder, with the extention below it, is that of a trachea running up into a larynx. [In Walter's conversation there has been some indication that he regards the extension as the larynx, and the generating mass as something else—a head, perhaps. Following Crandon's and Richardson's simile, the balance of the record refers to the laryngeal mass and the tracheal extension, or to the teleplasmic larynx and trachea. As the sitting developed, with its strong indication that Walter had in mind a picture of the tracheal extension as protruding from an oral cavity and as perhaps being itself a larynx, Crandon and Richardson were impressed with his departure from the anatomical model—even, perhaps, with his caricature thereof. Walter's terminology was influenced by ours, and toward the end of the séance he had fallen in with ours completely.]

9:22. Walter states that the trachea looks as though it entered a mouth in the laryngeal mass. At the preceding moment of observation, Bird had felt some resemblance to exist between the side of this mass facing him, and the human countenance; but not enough, or not clear enough, for him so to report. Other sitters now are inclined to agree on both counts.

9:23. In bright red light for one second the facial aspect of the laryngeal mass seems increased. Crandon points out that [as usual] he gave a very long count [for the period named by Walter for the light].

9:25. The Psychic's left foot is on Richardson's thigh. Dis-
cussing the possibility of an early flashlight, Walter says he has a lot to do before he can stand this.

9:26. The left foot is replaced on the floor. M [from its usual place in C initially] is heard scraping about immediately thereafter. Following this the Psychic’s head is reported on T. After some ten seconds, it is up again.

9:31. Walter calls for one second of red light and gets about five. Bird and Crandon agree that the appearance is much as before, with the possible exception of a longer trachea. Hill calls attention to the fact that tonight’s teleplasm is darker in shade than we have been in the habit of having it, of late. Muddy gray would perhaps describe it well, [as against the rather brilliant white of the cortical teleplasm of the recent sittings. After the seance, all sitters were agreed that the teleplasm was more or less white at the start, getting grayer as we went along. In this connection one might recall Walter’s remarks about the mixture of the two teleplasms.] At this point Walter requested that Richardson follow the Psychic’s right hand and permit her to do, under control, anything she desired. [Apparently there was no sequel to this request; at any event, Richardson made no report.]

9:32. Under fresh exposure to red light, the tracheal appendage is seen with two sharp bends. It lies vertically downward from the main mass for a space; then turns sharply outward and to the Psychic’s right in a horizontal segment; then turns again and terminates in another vertical segment. [This sentence edited in transcription, for greater clarity.] The laryngeal mass is about the same [under this exposure to light] as before. At the conclusion of this dictation Walter calls for red light again and the tracheal appendage is seen extending upward to the Psychic’s nose, entering the right nostril. It is smoother, and lighter in color, than before. The Psychic is quite restless during this phase, with noisy breathing. [Throughout the ensuing 58 minutes during which the tracheal appendage remained thus in the nose, there were intermittent indications of an obstructed breathing.] Walter protests that nobody seems to have observed how the trachea emerges from a mouth-like orifice in the larynx. Crandon and Gerke thereupon state [from their memory of preceding observation periods] that this is a fact. Under repetition of red light for the express purpose all sitters verify the [presence of the] mouth-like orifice, with a single exception.

9:33. Gerke having failed to see the “mouth,” we have red light again for his benefit. [This insistence by Walter that everybody see, and record his seeing, before we proceed, is characteristic
of his recent attitude.] Other sitters agree that the orifice is more prominent than before [when the light is thus given for Gerke's benefit;] and Gerke, [in spite of his unfavorable position outside the circle at the east, largely in his own light,] sees this too.

9:34. Fresh exposure to red light to verify that this is the set-up that we want for the first photograph. After a discussion of whether all the cameras are focussed upon the proper region, red light is repeated within 30 seconds. While preparations are under way for shooting with all the cameras Crandon's hand is brought up [to the Psychic's face by hers] and he is permitted to feel of the [teleplasmic] larynx. [He reports it] very cool, at most 40° Fahrenheit. Richardson repeats this observation.

9:35. A camera having been knocked down, Walter gave two seconds of red light to aid in its restoration. The teleplasmic configuration is about as before. Walter seems able to hold the teleplasmic pose indefinitely, with no perturbation over the long delay.

9:39. [All cameras being ready,] the red light is again given for inspection of the teleplasm. Gerke states that the tube running to the nose distends and flattens as though respiration were being effected through it. Walter agrees with this.

9:40. Red light given for two seconds for final verification of [the teleplasmic] pose. Within five or ten seconds the flashlight is detonated, in red light; [but prior experience of all sitters leads them to protect their eyes rather than seek a glimpse of the teleplasmic mass]. In the luminous period following the flash, [however,] the teleplasm is plainly visible. [In this period of self-luminescence the teleplasm is not to be compared in brightness with objects that carry luminous paint; but it is clearly to be seen, in definite and detailed outline.] M is now observed [in silhouette against the luminous table-top] to be standing on T, toward the west end. Crandon is permitted to feel the mass on the shoulder and the cord running to the ear. Clammy, cool, soft, sticky, [is his report; making the same experiment,] Richardson says the mass is slightly warmer than before. [In general, it warmed progressively with the progress of the séance.]

9:44. Richardson is permitted to feel, in the vicinity of the Psychic's nose, a rounded cord about the size of a pencil. Crandon reports that when his hand was lifted to the face, a loop of this cord fell across his four fingers.

9:45. Physic's head on T. Crandon reports cold breezes blowing from [the direction of the] Psychic. Hill feels these on his face and chest, Mrs. Richardson on her knees. The Psychic is erect again.
Plate 14. Two views, from different quarters, resulting from the 9:40 flashlight on August 13, 1925. Observe the heavy "tracheal" appendage, so-called by Walter, thrust upward into the nose; and the very fine cord running to the left ear. This teleplasmic object is stated by Walter to represent his speaking mechanism.
9:48. Red light given for two seconds. The laryngeal mass is seen on the Psychic's face, on and above the nose and heavily concentrated on the forehead. In repetition of this red-light exposure, the teleplasmic "mouth" is seen very distinctly by all in the circle except Mrs. Richardson. The massed effect of the laryngeal structure upon the upper part of the Psychic's face is very pronounced. There seemed to Bird no normal reason why this mass should stay in place instead of falling.

[9:50 or a little later.] Flashlight taken while Bird was changing the dictaphone cylinder. After the flash the teleplasm is luminous, as usual. Walter calls for a black cloth to go over [the too-luminous] T; and this was supplied with considerable delay, confusion and breaking of circle.

9:55. Circle restored, complete and in good order. Crandon and Richardson are immediately touched by [something taken for] the teleplasmic mass. Richardson says this came first on his right hand, then on his forehead. Crandon felt something big, more or less like a head of cabbage; it struck the left side of his forehead.

9:57. The Psychic's head [is reported] on T immediately after the above.

9:59. Walter asks us all to draw as close as we can to get a view of the fine cord. Hill then reports vigorous breezes, focalized, as though caused by air issuing from a tube. Red light is given for two seconds; the Psychic's head is seen on T, resting on the left side. The laryngeal mass [lies out] on T, perhaps three inches in front of her face. The tracheal cord extends from her nose to this mass. Bird is particularly struck by the aggregation of this material at its point of entrance—[an aggregation which on transcription he distinctly recalls as having been inside the nostril and slightly overflowing therefrom]. Two seconds of red light to verify the photographic set-up. One camera is [reported by Gerke to be] out of focus under present status, [with the Psychic's head and the teleplasmic appurtenances so far forward from their usual position]. In fifteen seconds Walter gives us a fresh view [in red light]; and the Psychic's head carrying the teleplasmic ensemble with it is seen to have shifted considerably on T. The relation of the teleplasmic mass to the head is about as before; if there is any change, it is a little closer. Vigorous blowing by the Psychic in trance.

10:02. Red light for two seconds. The Psychic's head is on the extreme corner of T [at her near left], the laryngeal mass practically in contact with her mouth. The tracheal cord winds in passage from the teleplasmic mass to her nose, [rather than being
shortened to compensate for the reduced distance]. Repetition of red light for further verification of the pose shows the teleplasmic mass moved across T to a considerable distance from the Psychic's face; Crandon and Mrs. Bird saw the ear cord [this time,] as well as the tracheal cord to the nose.

In the luminous period following the flashlight [which was sprung here, at some time between 10:02 and 10:06,] the laryngeal mass and both tubes were very plainly discernible. Hill, given permission to feel the mass, puts his hand on the larynx and then gently pinches the trachea—[both items at Walter's explicit instruction]. Immediately after this, red light is given for several seconds; and most sitters felt they had had a more brilliant view than at any previous exposure. Bird was particularly struck by the attenuated character of the ear connection. Before Hill could report on the sensations of his contact with the mass, Bird was invited to feel in red light, which was given for this purpose and which lasted at least five seconds. Bird was particularly struck by the soft, yielding character of the laryngeal mass. Hill states and Bird endorses that the temperature was somewhat higher than on previous contacts [of this evening]; also that there was a feeling of very slight moisture. Hill got same general sensations from the nasal cord as from the main mass, save that it was even a trifle more yielding. Richardson was invited to follow the teleplasmic cord into the "mouth," in the red light. Nothing particular to report except that he did this.

11:06. Telephone. Bird takes the Psychic's right hand in Crandon's absence. [Instant advantage was taken by Walter of this opportunity to engineer a contact between Bird and the teleplasmic mass.] Bird's hand was carried over by the Psychic's, and pressed upon and into the teleplasmic mass on T, far more forcefully than Bird would have dared do it himself. Bird's hand made a depression in the teleplasmic mass, he judges, of \( \frac{1}{4} \) to \( \frac{1}{2} \) inch. [In entering this depression, staying therein, and withdrawing, Bird observed no feeling of resistance to compression under his hand, as is the case when a flexible—e.g., rubber—ball filled with air or water is indented. The character of the contact remained unchanged, no matter how deep the depression; and Bird was quite confident that he sensed a flowing effect of the mass, through which it may be inferred that the depression made by his hand was compensated by erection elsewhere, as is the case in handling kidney, liver, or other organic aggregations of similar type; rather than by an internal compression as in the case of the inflated ball. As his hand withdrew, this flow of course followed, and so rapidly that
Plate 15. The second flashlight (9:50) of August 13th; badly out of focus in all the cameras, and reproduced merely to complete the record.
Plate 16. The third exposure of August 13th (10:02), showing the "talking head" on the table, with the two connections to the psychic's nose and ear.
THE CLIMAX OF THE A.S.P.R. SITTINGS

in Bird's judgment the actual contact with his hand did not end until the original, symmetric configuration of the mass had been regained. This one would expect to be the case with the compressed ball; with the distorted organ-like teleplasm it would not necessarily follow that the return to form would be so immediate. All this represents subsequent analysis of the sensations which led Bird to put into the dictaphone the statement that [here, more than in any previous instance, he felt that he was in contact with a living organism. [The pressure on the dictaphone during this phase was so severe that Crandon's return was not recorded. Recollection would place it as occurring during or after Bird's second teleplasmic contact of the next paragraph.]

Hill and Richardson state that in [above interval of] red light, through shadow or other causes the junction between the nasal cord and the main mass was darker than the surrounding regions. Bird's hand is again carried into violent contact with the teleplasmic mass, [in darkness, as immediately above]. His fingers were used in giving almost the effect of kneading this mass, being driven into it [by manipulation from the Psychic's hand] again and again. Except for the increased vigor, the sensations of this contact were those of the preceding one. Mrs. Bird makes the point, [generalizing from her numerous views of the mass,] that visually the structure is waxy or doughy. Bird finds from recollection of his contacts that [tactually as well] the structure is dense. He means to apply this term to the granular structure of the material, and not as indicating the hardness or softness of the mass—[this, as noted in several places, is decidedly soft]. Hill states and Bird emphatically endorses [as he has already indicated parenthetically] that one's impression on contact with the mass is not that of contact with any gas- or fluid-filled membrane. [When Bird, in amplification of this, stated that] it seemed clearly a homogeneous mass throughout, [the word was given an] enthusiastic reception by several sitters, as just the word for which they had been searching. Walter said we would see a great deal more in the pictures.

10:11. Richardson was instructed to give his two leading fingers to the Psychic. They were carried to her face and used to finger the teleplasmic mass. Walter asked Richardson whether he felt skin, and Richardson said he plainly did—a distinct change

---

8 An interesting example of the tendency of one sitter to report in concrete while another reports and thinks in abstract terms. Presumably what Mrs. Bird means by "waxy" or "doughy" is precisely the same effect as that of which I think in terms of a density of structure.—J. M. B.
over what he had felt before, an unmistakable skin effect. Crandon, in rendering a similar report on a similar experiment, uses the adjectives "rough, almost warty." There is repetition of the contact by Richardson with verification of the rough-skin effect. Gerke, instructed to come near and make the same experiment, [hesitated to state at the time the only simile that occurred to him as giving mental satisfaction. He said he would report to Bird later; but Walter ragged him into reporting before the other sitters, to the effect that] the nearest he could come to describing the mass was that it felt like a woman's breast. Richardson was again in contact with the mass; then it was Conant's turn. Walter taps the mass audibly with Richardson's fingers. Conant, reporting on his contact, says that the temperature was somewhat below his own.

10:16. Richardson feels the mass in red light. Gerke asks where the cord from the ear enters the mass; Walter says from the back. Mrs. Richardson, reporting on contact, says the mass feels to her like dry dough; dough that has been exposed to the air for a while and has developed a bit of crust on its outer surface. Crandon endorses this and Bird is inclined to agree. Hill is asked by Walter to put his finger in the teleplastic "mouth" and to verify that the mass is cooler therein than elsewhere on its surface. Hill reports that this difference is clearly perceptible. The surface effect now suggests to Hill that of a fine-grained Morocco leather that has just been freshly finished. The general verdict is that the mass is getting more granular on its outer surface. Gerke suggests that the mass is larger than it has been; Bird agrees.

While Bird was changing [from the second to the third] dictaphone cylinder Mrs. Bird travelled around the room, [coming to a place behind Richardson], and felt the teleplasmic mass. On thus seeing it more closely than at any previous moment, she observed a slight pinkish tinge and certain faint vein-like markings. The feeling was that of a homogeneous mass under a thin, fine skin like a baby's; [but Mrs. Bird agrees with Bird's observation that the absence of compression and the characteristics of the flow under indentation were such as to forbid the assumption that we were dealing with a gas- or fluid-filled membrane].

10:20. Red light given to verify the set-up for another picture, which Gerke wants to pose so that it will show the junction between the ear-cord and the main mass. The Psychic is erect, the mass on her shoulder. All the touching by sitters of the past few paragraphs has been done with her head on T. The circle has gone pretty much into the discard during the past ten minutes or so; [but there has been no sacrifice of control of the Psychic herself].
Plate 17. An undated séance photograph showing a teleplasmic structure identical with that of August 13th. Doubtless obtained in one of the sittings of Chapter XX or XXIV; presented here because of its photographic excellence and its parallelism with the pictures of this chapter.
THE CLIMAX OF THE A.S.P.R. SITTINGS

10:24. Victrola slowing. Several sitters state that this occurred earlier, but by a wide margin not so strongly as now. The machine now is apparently about to die. [Walter made some remark which was interpreted as a disclaimer of responsibility for the effect.]

10:25. Walter asks Richardson to feel the ear-cord between the tips of two fingers. Richardson says that it feels like a piece of [cooked] spaghetti. The victrola has picked up and is running normally.

10:28. In a brief period of bright red light, the entire laryngeal mass is seen hanging and oscillating freely through a short arc [in a way interpreted by the observers as implying suspension] from the nose-cord. The red light is repeated to check up Walter's correction that it was not from the nose-cord, it was from the ear-cord. So far as the eye could judge, it was hanging from either cord or from both. Walter says there is no tension on the nose-cord; [but this cord lay perfectly straight, and] its bulk was such that Bird felt the statement would have to be taken on faith. [One simply could not judge whether it were under tension or not; but the ear cord was clearly tensed. Hill points out that in the very brief interval between these exposures there was marked change in the outline of the mass. [Some sitters feel able to endorse this, others cannot say; nobody feels able to deny it.]

10:30. Walter objects to our taking anything on faith and gives a fresh exposure to red light. [Waiting for this, Bird and Hill discussed whether we should find the nose-cord detached, or lying in an arc, as a means of showing the absence of tension.] The nose-cord is seen detached from the nostril, fallen below the main mass and hanging there; the teleplasmic mass is now plainly oscillating on the ear-cord alone. [Walter had stated at the beginning of all this that his purpose was to demonstrate the strength of the ear-cord and the integrity of its junction with the Psychic.] The consensus of opinion placed the diameter of the ear-cord here at ½ inch. [Bird is certain this was a heavy overstatement; nobody realizes how big an eighth-inch is until it is driven home upon him.] In bright red light for another second or two, the teleplasmic mass is seen on the Psychic's chin and jaw as her head is inclined sharply to the right.

10:34. One second of bright red light is given. The laryngeal mass looked to Crandon like a whole face. The nose-cord is in place again. The mass hung slightly to one side of the median line of the Psychic's face, extending below the chin. It seemed to Bird larger than before, [and no sitter contradicted this]. Mrs. Rich-
ardson suggested that it looked like a gourd. In repetition of this red light, the teleplasmic mass is seen hanging below the Psychic’s left cheek, partly above and partly below her chin. Both cords are as before. It seemed to Hill as though the mass projected almost at right angles from the left frontal corner of the jaw.

10:36. Flashlight. Walter promises an improvement for tomorrow night. [In fact we got a blank so far as the teleplasm was concerned.]

10:42. The victrola is slowing again; Walter says it has nothing to do with him.

10:50. After a long delay, stated by Walter to be due to exhaustion of his resources and consequent difficulty of proper withdrawal, he said good night. The Psychic apparently came out of trance little, if any, before this. When the red light goes on at the end of the sitting M is found on T. Crandon explains that Walter had used it to express his loud appreciation of a story told by Mrs. Bird just before his departure. He had been trying hard to get us laughing and joking, to facilitate his winding-up processes, but most of us felt that [under repeated demands of this character, these two evenings,] we had told all the jokes we knew.

[In the after-search by Mrs. Bird, it developed that there were slight pink stains on the Kotex napkin which the Psychic wore, tonight as last night. In view of previous experiences and allegations revolving about this point, it should be stated that there were no traces of this sort on the séance table or on the hands of the sitters who touched the teleplasm. During the day the Psychic expressed complete well-being; after the séance, exhilaration.

A generalization agreed upon by several sitters is that the Psychic shrinks from contact by the sitters with the teleplasmic mass; and that not always, but often, she groans under such contact. Bird is fairly confident that so far as his own contacts with the teleplasm are concerned, the groan has never preceded the contact, even when this was made by his hand independently of the Psychic’s.]

For the séance of August 14th, Richardson had arranged with Crandon, at some time during the day, that he (Richardson) should dictate the arrangement of the sitters in the circle. My first inkling that this was the case or that it was planned to displace Crandon from his usual seat came after the company had gathered in the séance room. I think it probable that had my preoccupation with the dictaphone not made it obviously unwise for me to occupy the seat
Plate 18. The final picture (10:36) of August 13th, showing the large mass hanging free on the cords joining it to the nose and ear.
next the Psychic, this seat would have been assigned me—especially had I asked for it. There being no substitute available for me at the dictaphone, one had to be used for the position of control; and this was accordingly assigned to Hill. This choice I regarded as an entirely logical one.

Initially, the small dark megaphone (M) was in the cabinet, at the Psychic’s right, on the floor, as always. Outside the cabinet, at the east (the Psychic’s right), with the wing of the cabinet between her and them, stood quite a collection of apparatus: hole bell-box, doughnut, basket, etc. There was no place for these on the evening’s program, but they were not removed because it has become more or less customary to store them at this point. Some or all of them had in the same way been present during the two preceding evenings. In accordance with the custom when it could be inferred that they would not be used, they had not been activated; but with some straining of the eye the various painted spots and areas on them were faintly visible at short range, in the séance darkness.

Séance of August 14, 1925: 10 Lime Street. Dictaphonic record by Bird with aid of other sitters; transcribed verbatim, with parenthetic elaboration by Bird.

Circle formed at 9:02, [and séance held in total darkness throughout]. Order, clockwise: Psychic, Richardson, Crandon, Mrs. Richardson, Bird, Hill, Psychic again. Three cameras in use as on two preceding evenings; Conant and Gerke in charge. Mrs. Bird outside the circle, on chair, behind Bird–Mrs. Richardson space. Luminous control of ankles, but not of head or wrists in view of photographic expectations. [Dictaphone manipulation as on two preceding nights. The Psychic, in robe and slippers, prepared for the séance under Mrs. Richardson’s supervision.]

9:07. Hill reports a marked increase in the temperature of the Psychic’s right hand. It started cool, and is now a bit warmer than normal.

9:11. No indication of Walter’s presence having been previously given, M is heard scraping about the floor. Richardson reports contact on ends of his fingers.

9:13. Richardson reports trance.

9:14. Bird feels a contact on his left leg; Hill says it was not he. Immediately following, Mrs. Richardson reports cool breezes under T. [The fan was not going tonight.] Crandon and Richard-
son verify this, and the cool breeze is felt on Hill’s left hand. Bird too feels it vigorously.

9:15. Contact on Richardson’s finger and knee; contact on Bird’s left ankle and instep as of searching finger (or toe).

9:17. Considerable blowing by the Psychic in trance, and marked tremor of her right hand.

9:20. Richardson touched on the back of his left hand; then he reports a fumbling contact on the front of his vest, as though in search of his watch. Hill reports a similar contact on the front of his shirt, while he himself has an eye on the foot controls.

9:24. Hill reports a marked touch on his shirt front, with foot controls O. K.

9:26. M fell to floor; [whence, is not known].

9:27. Victrola slowing badly; marked blowing and smacking in trance.

9:28. M is moving up Hill’s left leg with considerable pressure. About to mount T, it falls to floor instead; then moves freely about under T. Hill reports foot controls visible and motionless.

9:29. M is heard on T; then is thrown violently to the floor on Bird’s side. Victrola is not so slow [as it was], but is still below normal speed.

9:30. M had been thrown into a position [which seems] totally inaccessible to the Psychic, in the region between Bird’s chair and Bird’s and Hill’s feet. Nevertheless Hill now reports it moving up his leg again. Neither Bird nor Hill had been conscious of its withdrawal to that side [from Hill’s right]. Creaking of C heard; heard again; and a third time, quite vigorously.

9:34. The basket [marked with luminous paint but not activated, as stated above] is brought into C by Walter from its usual preliminary position outside the east wing. It is heard, and very faintly seen, moving about on T; and Hill felt considerable contact with it on its way into C.

9:35. The victrola is about normal and has been so for some time.

9:36. Violent shuddering and twisting by the Psychic, confined to the right side. Crandon remarks that sittings of this character have been held in the past, when it turned out that nobody was present except John [Richardson], holding the fort in Walter’s absence. A voice from C [is here heard, saying]: “That’s me.” This was
Plate 19. Views from other angles (see plates 15, 18) at the third and fourth flashlights of August 13, 1925.
followed by a whistle. After some discussion, it appears that Walter is present, in charge of the trance, etc.; but that John is doing the telekinesis.

9:37. It is not known with certainty, but it is believed that the luminous doughnut (D) was not initially on the basket (B), but on the hole bell-box. When D is seen floating freely about T, therefore, it is concluded that Walter brought it in as he had brought B, but independently. [These sentences edited in transcription, to smooth out very incoherent dictation.] Walter says [we are right,] D was on HB. Like B, it is extremely faint, [and visible with the utmost difficulty]. HB is now being stevedored across the floor, [independently of any motion by C]. Hill’s hand is brought up to the right side of the Psychic’s head. B is in motion on T and levitating with considerable freedom on and over T. In response to Mrs. Richardson’s request B is dropped into her lap, whence it falls to the floor. Richardson is touched on the right knee.

9:40. B is in motion under T; both foot controls visible to Hill, and motionless. B is in free motion on the floor and in the space beyond T, between T and the knees of Bird and Mrs. Richardson. Foot controls visible and motionless, reports Hill. B is brought on to Mrs. Richardson’s lap, back to the floor, to her lap again, to Bird’s knees, and finally dropped to the floor.

9:42. Walter says he got a little too much light last night, from the flashes. With both foot controls visible to Hill and motionless, B rises to Mrs. Richardson’s lap and Bird’s knee, then rattles about in contact with T leg, Bird’s toes and the floor. It rises to knee level and falls to the floor. Foot controls visible to Hill, and motionless. Additional control during this episode by Mrs. Richardson of Crandon’s knee.

9:44. B in motion. Quite violent perturbation of C. In response to request by Mrs. Richardson, raps on C. Touch on Richardson’s right forearm. D shifts across T. Foot and hand controls O. K. Hill reports a marked breeze from C on his left hand and forearm and the left side of his head. Strong apparent motion of C. [All the above in extreme rapid succession.]

9:46. The Psychic’s elbows are on T and she leans forward. C rocks.

9:47. The Psychic is erect again. Violent disturbance of C.
9:51. Touches outside Hill's left leg; foot control [reported by Hill] O. K. The victrola is slowing badly.

9:52. Touches on Hill's left arm, and he O. K.'s the foot control. Walter calls for objects [to be put] on T for identification. Hill supplies one. Rapping heard on T. "A ring," says Walter, several times. [No response of any sort from Hill.] "Wait a moment," says Walter, "I'm not so sure. Don't know just what it is, but it's metal, like a Yale key, with a seal on the end." Banging on T ensues, [presumably with Hill's object]. Bird now attempts to identify this object. It is metal, he finds, and he thinks it is a stamp for use with sealing wax, with a hole in the end of a curiously shaped shank, so that it might conceivably be carried as a watch charm. [This turns out to be entirely accurate; but the idea in Hill's mind revolved about the design of the seal, which is in some way curious or unique.] Walter speaks up: "It has letters on it." [This is wrong, it is rather a design.]

9:56. Bird puts an object down for identification; [the metal cap, with rubber safety grip, off one of the dictaphone cylinders]. Walter taps T with it and says it is some part of a machine; he doesn't know just what; a little frying-pan arrangement, with something in it. Beyond that he can't say. [The description is quite pat, and strongly implies a tactile or pseudo-tactile or para-tactile mechanism of some sort.]

10:00. Richardson put down [for identification a deck of cards in the case]. The victrola is rather slow, and there is considerable trance complaint. "A little book of some sort," [says Walter]. It falls to the floor. "Never mind, I'll get it," [says Walter]. Difficulty of some sort [ensues in connection with the attempt at recovery].

10:02. The object is restored to T by Walter. The victrola is in great distress. Walter: "It's a pasteboard box." Richardson: "What's in it?" Walter: "Oh, have a heart." [The pun is apparently accidental.]

10:05. Extreme tremor of the Psychic's hands.

10:10. While Bird was changing the dictaphone cylinder, Conant produced an object for identification. Walter says: "It's a celluloid measure of some sort, isn't it?" The Psychic's hands are both very restless and she groans considerably.

10:14. Returning to Conant's identification, Walter says that
as near as he can make out, it's saw-toothed on one edge and smooth on the other. Not necessarily saw-toothed, he modifies, perhaps just rough. About twelve inches long. Conant reports it a six-inch celluloid rule. The victrola is sick again.

10:16. Walter says he is going. The Psychic is out of trance. Walter reiterates that the reason why no teleplasm was got tonight was the extreme amount of flashlight last night. He says the light dissolves it; if he can keep it from getting luminous it doesn't dissolve, but the moment it luminesces dissolution begins.

Hill reports that at all moments of the séance when it was pertinent, the foot control was visible to him and motionless. He and Richardson report that hand control of the Psychic was unbroken at any time during the séance.

Conant's scale turns out to be graduated on both edges, but the graduations on one edge are much deeper than on the other, and give much more a tactile impression of roughness or indentation.

[The recovery of the apparatus from behind the cabinet is so suggestive of invasion that it seems desirable to specify: as usual, the door was closed and locked. The cabinet was found, at the end, in very approximately its initial position.]

The recovery, by Walter, of the apparatus from outside the cabinet, with its introduction into the theater of action, is unique in the history of the mediumship. The adverse critic will wonder whether the substitution of Hill for Crandon at the medium's right did not interfere with the procedure which had been used for the production of the teleplasm, throwing the Psychic back upon the necessity for improvisation and thus leading to new phenomena. The feet alone would be available for the production of these, under the oblique theory; the hand control cannot be attacked. Escape from the luminous foot control along the lines postulated by the Harvard group would presumably have been possible; for the Psychic wore slippers rather than stockings.

The record does not contradict this theory, and in some features seems to bear it out. The first object recovered from the storehouse outside the east wing was the basket; and its appearance in the theater of action was preceded by creakings of the cabinet. Disturbance of the cabinet continued throughout the séance, and particularly
such disturbance preceded or accompanied the introduction of further pieces of apparatus into the active theater. From 9:44 to 9:47 there went on what might be interpreted as a restoration of the cabinet to its approximate initial position; after this, no further apparatus was brought in from without. And at 9:37 the record suggests that the hole bell-box was found in the way of this restoration process and had to be moved as a preliminary thereto.

Even Houdini, however, when obliged to picture the cabinet as tilted backward, admitted⁹ that this would require the medium's hand; that she could not do it with an unaided foot. On the present occasion, then, we must picture the cabinet as shoved bodily backward, rather than tilted up to permit the apparatus to pass under it. But the arrangement of the circle was such that the clasped hands of Hill and the Psychic rested, not on the table, but on his knee and her own. That is to say, the two knees were close together, in contact intermittently rather than continuously; Hill's elbow and forearm lay along his own leg and on his own knee, with Margery's similarly on hers; the clasped hands would now be in contact with one or both knees, now perhaps for a time free in space as the Psychic's restlessness carried her knee further than usual from Hill's. Though of course no attempt can be made at any generalization covering the relations existing between both hands and both knees throughout the sitting, it seems clear that under any arrangement which might obtain at any moment, the Psychic's right leg could hardly be used with any degree of freedom, without the awareness of the sitter at her right. The allegation that this fraud ruled at the Harvard sittings requires rebuttal only by virtue of the fact that at all of these save the last, Crandon sat at her right. Hill in particular is a very enterprising sitter—on more than one occasion he has engaged in spontaneous exploration on a scale which I would not pursue without some expectation of receiving Walter's reproof. That the right foot could be used in moving the cabinet with him at Margery's right is only a little less preposterous than the supposition that it was the left foot thus working on the right wing. It therefore becomes necessary to point out that all the potential elements of suspicion in the record are equally the sort of thing that would happen if a bulky teleplasmic terminal were fishing for the apparatus around the corner of the cabinet. And when we give due regard to the fact that the foot which pushed the cabinet back would have to pull it forward again,

⁹ M. M., p. 420.
THE CLIMAX OF THE A.S.P.R. SITTINGS

we may fairly insist upon the favorable interpretation of the whole sequence.

The general considerations set forth on page 214 deter one from attempting any serious demonstration of the reality of the teleplasm of the first two evenings of this series; a far more severe search of the medium than was given would be only one of several elements which would have to be added before any rational person would make such attempt. We can, however, and we must, at this stage pause to ask just where we have attained. The present séances are obviously of enormous interest and importance; nevertheless it is evident that my initial plan for examination of the telekinetic side of the mediumship is permanently sidetracked and defeated. A series of business emergencies in New York and elsewhere, followed by illness in the Crandon household, made it impossible during the ensuing two months for me to go again to Boston, and hence made it unnecessary for me to give such definite consideration as otherwise I should have been forced to give, to the question whether I should terminate the present project or make another effort.

I was inclined toward its termination. It did not seem to me at all profitable to study the teleplasmic manifestations until a more nearly inescapable presumption of general validity had been built up. For the teleplasm can never be proved valid on its own merits, as my introductory remarks to the present chapter indicate. Not only do the general considerations which I have there elucidated prevent this; we have further the very special fact that every photograph of teleplasm, in the very nature of the case, looks more or less like some particular material object and suggests to the skeptical explanation in terms of this appearance. Very clearly, the orderly consideration of a versatile mediumship like Margery's involves, first, a prolonged attack upon the problem of demonstrating the telekinetic validity; and only after some large degree of success should we pass to study of the intrinsic properties of the teleplasm.

This of course does not involve any recession from my personal conviction of validity; nor does it in any sense contradict that conviction. At this date I knew Margery's phenomena to be valid because of the extraordinary character of my exposure to them and to her and to Crandon. My experience could not possibly be explained away, but at the same time I could not put it before another person, a non-observer, with the demand that he accord all elements therein the weight which they had in my mind. It seems a trifle anomalous for one who aspires
to scientific method to say that he knew the phenomena to be valid but was not in a position to insist that this had been proved. It had, however, been proved to me; but with due regard for the circumstance that we are dealing with a factual sequence and not with a logical syllogism, I could not put this proof forward too insistently for others to accept. Further discussion of my individual viewpoint and my public position in the light of the séances of these four chapters will be found on the opening pages of Chapter XXXI.

I had no intent of abandoning the mediumship, of course; any abandonment would involve merely the present project. And it seemed about time to admit that inversion of the program had brought about this defeat; when the proposal came from Crandon, who assumed the project still to be alive, that I make my “next” visit in October, in connection with the climax that was now being so rapidly reached with Richardson’s VCO machine.10 This suggestion I accepted, with very fruitful results so far as concerns demonstration through the VCO machine of the independence of the Walter voice. But the matter is so entirely one of the voice tests, and so little in line with the course of events that has brought us from the record of June 16th to that of August 14th, that it may well go into the chapter devoted to the VCO machine.

A summary of the work accomplished in the present project, if made at the time, would be considerably less sanguine than if made to-day, in 1927. For to-day we have behind us the extremely clean-cut demonstration of validity through use of the glass cabinet.11 It really seems as though we are now entitled to say that no rational critic has the right of resisting the accumulated weight of the evidence. If this be so, we may turn back to August, 1925, for study of the other aspect of the case, secure in the presumption of validity reflected upon this by the 1926 history of the case. From this viewpoint, the work of July and August, 1925, was very important and altogether worth while. At the time, of course, one could only lay these records aside for future reference, in the hope that the future course of the case would thus make them citable as documents of importance.

One positive and final statement remains to be made. The complete success of the dictaphonic recording was now a matter of no possible question; and the balance of advantages and disadvantages

10 Chapter XX.
11 Chapters XXV, XXVI, XXVIII, XXIX, etc.
seemed somewhat in favor of my giving it my personal attention. The gain in recording under this procedure more than offsets any slight loss in my own ability to concentrate upon observation. For the recording is my own unique responsibility, and nobody else can discharge this responsibility for me; whereas the very fact that I record the observations of all sitters is a confession that this part of the séance-room duties is not my own exclusive prerogative. Moreover, the distraction of my own attention is not at all critical; I can come very close to doing as much and as good observing as I need to do, even with the operation of the dictaphone on my mind and hands.
CHAPTER XVII

The Telekinesis of Later 1925

From the Séance Records, with Comment by the Editor

It must not be inferred that the four series of serious, formal séances afforded me on behalf of the A.S.P.R. and detailed in the four preceding chapters absorbed the entire attention of the mediumship during the summer of 1925. The reverse was very much the case; sittings were held more frequently during that summer than during the corresponding period of either of the following years, and the ordinary development of the case went on at approximately its ordinary pace. The present chapter, however, represents not so much any fundamental deviation from preexisting telekinetic routine, as an attempt to keep the topical treatment of the case from getting too far out of step with the chronological sequence. The telekinetic standardization which I have stressed in Chapter VI and from which the sittings of Chapter XIII diverge only in detail, rather than in principle, was continued through the summer. A few of the séances of this period have already been covered in Chapter VIII. Dates on which the telekinetic routine was experienced in Lime Street, without features dictating the inclusion of full records in other chapters than the present one, include July 5th, 6th, 8th, 9th, 14th, 20th, 21st, 22nd, 27th, 28th, 30th, 31st, August 3rd, 8th, 9th, 15th, 17th, 18th, 19th, 30th, September 1st, 3rd, 20th, 26th, October 2nd, 3rd, 4th, and 23rd. On many of these dates there were episodes falling in some other category and described in some other chapter; on all of them there occurred more or less of the routine telekinetic display defined in Chapter VI. I give with a minimum of comment such extracts from the records as describe phenomena or conditions at all critical in any respect.

July 5th: Murray put a small pocket note-book on the table; the light was then turned on for twenty seconds, and during that time the book moved without visible contact from anything, eight inches, away from Murray and toward the Psychic. The light was then put out. Crandon pointed out to Walter that this might be open to the criticism that the Psychic was pulling it toward herself with a hair or thread. "Very well," said Walter, "turn on the light again." This was done; and the note-book was seen to be
half on the west edge of the table and half on the knee of Hubbs. It now started in motion, without visible contact of any sort, and went nine inches eastward toward Crandon. During this, the Psychic’s and Crandon’s heads were moved freely to show that there were no connecting links between these heads and the moving book; after which Murray picked up his book, showing that it had no connection with anyone.

Whether we are to assume that the light continued throughout the motion and up to the time when Murray recovered his note-book is not clear from the record; if it really happened so, it is most unfortunate that the record does not make it clear.

On the 8th, Walter “for the first time picked the big megaphone up from the floor beyond the table, and put it on the table.” This is a feat which could obviously not be charged against the Psychic’s feet; but of course the record can tell us nothing pertinent to the exclusion of confederacy by one of the sitters on that side. The length of a teleplasmic rod adequate for this act would be at least five feet. Later, the megaphone was thrown from the table “completely over the cabinet, hitting the ceiling in transit and landing on the floor back of the cabinet.” A brilliant performance was also given by one of the wicker baskets.

This was placed on the west end of the table and on turning on the red light it was seen to be balancing on the edge of the table. It was then lifted to vertical and slowly laid over to the horizontal in good red light.

On the 9th, the movement on the table of an object contributed by a sitter was given something of a climax. My own records says:

Miner put a small leather note-book on the table. This was the object of several isolated demonstrations. Red light would go on, and the note-book would be seen on the table, at rest; it would then go into motion and proceed toward the edge of the table. One or two final episodes were even more extraordinary. On the incidence of red light, the note-book would be seen at the extreme edge of the table, hanging over. It would teeter on the edge, seesawing up and down over space, and likewise moving further off the table to make it absurdly evident that it lacked normal means of support. It hung wholly or almost wholly off the table thus for several seconds, then descended to floor, but
not falling freely; and did not strike as from a fall, but rather as being laid down.

My record from which I quote the above also carries a reminder of a general factor that ran through numerous séances of this period. Walter, in philosophizing about the Harvard "exposure," had concluded that one way to prevent the future occurrence of that sort of thing was to revert to the late 1924 attitude of seeking to bring the phenomena out into the light. It was true that, influenced by the keen desire of his numerous friendly sitters to see better teleplasmic displays, he had been gravitating throughout the first half of 1925 toward phenomena occurring in large degree in darkness, with large dependence upon the luminous paint for such visibility as they might possess. He now definitely proposed to get away from this and to work for phenomena in light. Clearly, there may be a difference of opinion as to what constitutes "phenomena in light," but that is neither here nor there. Likewise, one would expect that now as in 1924 the atmosphere of the séances would be that of gradual approach toward ideal conditions of illumination; and this expectation was in accord with the course of events. Finally, the lesson for new procedure which the familiar sitters ultimately drew from the Code-Hoagland episode and put into effect in the séance room was a different one, and involved an attempt to idealize the conditions of control rather than those of illumination. But for the immediate present, Walter's séance philosophy became that of the gradual attack upon the production of phenomena in light. In accordance with this philosophy, all the action of July 9th, to which any significance was to be attached occurred during red-light intervals. And I may also add, with my own endorsement, the following from Crandon's record of the note-book action got on that date:

The light was good, all hands were visible and none moved, the Psychic's head did not move, and her feet and knees were visible and apparently did not move.

For July 14th, in addition to the routine production of several other items in the telekinetic schedule, the performance with the basket was carried to new extremes:

The luminous basket was then put on the table and made to balance in the dark on one edge of the table in a way that could
not be done normally. It was then put over on the floor to the right of the Psychic, and lifted thence to the table and higher. On request of Hill it was turned upside down and so lifted high in the left side of the cabinet between Richardson and the Psychic. These things were all done in the dark. Then in the dark the basket was lifted up to the middle of the east edge of the cabinet, and then for a period of ten seconds of red light it was seen suspended there without apparent means of support. Still in red light a similar phenomenon was shown on the west side of the cabinet, the basket hanging out horizontally toward the north with no visible support.

A statement from the July 21st record ought to be quoted, with the explanation that it approximates to the regular procedure; but that the regular sitters are so habituated to this procedure that they usually fail to record it explicitly. The statement in question reads:

All the apparatus was examined carefully by the strange sitters in full light outside the séance room before the sitting. The séance room door was locked throughout the sitting.

The record for July 27th indicates an unusual degree of precision of control: all the telekinetic phenomena of a very versatile séance "were accomplished under control consisting of De Wyckoff's hold on the Psychic's two hands, Miss Boring's hold on both Crandon's hands and her contact with his knees and chin, and the wearing by the Psychic of five luminous markers on her five extremities." This could be done on the present occasion without any question of Walter's disapproval inasmuch as there was no thought of taking photographs and no sitter able to handle the photographic technique.

July 30th saw one incident strongly suggesting the use by Walter of two separate terminals. The record says, of this:

He put the doughnut in the basket held high by Miss Keith; then he seized the basket and held its handle and the doughnut apparently in the one grasp. But then, still holding the doughnut high in air and motionless, he threw the basket across the room. All controls were beyond reproach throughout.

On the following night, July 31st, approximately the usual performance with the basket was given, but over an unusual spatial range

---

1 *I.e.*, at the Psychic's right, on Crandon's side of her.—J. M. B.
2 But not the same continuous interval of light.—J. M. B.
and in zones to which it would be more difficult than ordinarily for the Psychic to gain fraudulent access. And the telekinesis of an article contributed by a sitter went to extreme lengths. The record:

He next turned his attention to the luminous basket, ordering the luminous band to be taken off the basket itself but leaving the markers on the handle. In red light it was seen in contact with west edge of the table, sliding over 45 degrees towards Miss Keith. Then in the red light it erected itself and slowly laid itself over on the table. This was then repeated on the east end of the table and again on the north end. When it was done on the east end, before it tipped it was seen to turn 90 degrees apparently of itself before the other motion started.

Walter then asked for someone to put a personal article on the table. Miss Clancy put her handkerchief on. When red light was ordered the handkerchief was seen on top of the Psychic's head and as she turned her head it fell off to the floor. Walter then called for something else, and Laura Crandon put her handkerchief, much perfumed, on the table. In the dark Miss Keith immediately noted the perfumed handkerchief under her nose. Then red light was ordered and the handkerchief was seen floating in the air above Psychic's head, undulating and rotating. The angles or corners of the handkerchief were pulled out in four points. The whole roughly resembled a jackstone. This was shown to us twice thus floating and the second time while we still looked at it, it decended slowly on the Psychic's head.

This handkerchief stunt was repeated a few nights later. The record for August 6th tells us:

On request, Laura Crandon's handkerchief was put on the table, and when red light was allowed it was seen rotating slowly above the Psychic's head in the cabinet, free from all apparent connection with anything. Three views were given of this, and each time it was nearer the Psychic's head.

On August 9th, after having thrown the megaphone into the space between the Psychic's chair and the back wall of the cabinet, Walter retrieved it himself, bringing it back to the table; the record asserts that this had never been done before. The throwing away of the basket while the doughnut was held steady in the air was repeated

---

3 In separate intervals of red light.—J. M. B.
here; and, in the usual intermittent red light, an unusually fine demonstration was given of the balancing and erection of the basket at the edge of the table.

The statement of the August 15th record: “toward the end of the sitting, when he came to levitation of the heavier objects, Walter had to use light trance,” is one which should obviously be filed for possible future reference.

The basket performance of August 17th was, apparently, in some details at least different from its predecessors:

This was revealed in red light balancing at an impossible angle on the westerly edge of the table, directly in front of Bentley. It then went over still farther toward him, then erected itself, and then fell over on the table. On the east side of the table it was next seen balancing in red light. It then erected itself and rotated through 90 degrees, then tipped over. Laura Crandon put a handkerchief on the table and it was seen next in red light, rotating, or better spinning, at the right of the Psychic’s head and six inches above it. This was shown a second time at a different level. The control conditions were “perfect.”

The record for the 18th testifies to double hand control of both Margery and Crandon, presumably by the adjoining sitters; with luminous controls on the Psychic’s ankles.

September 1st saw another very good demonstration by the basket. Red light was given and it was found on Abbott’s edge of the table and tilted toward him at an impossible angle. “Then in good red light it straightened itself to the vertical, rotated 90 degrees, and then fell over horizontally.”

The séance of October 2nd, I ought to state, must not be held against Prince in his refusal to be impressed by the mediumship. It is true that he had no immediate answer to the VCO machine and that he never availed himself of the permission given him to visit the house in the daytime for purposes of experiment with it. But I suppose he would plead, as Rhine later pleaded, that he did not know that there was not some way of defeating it. As regards the rest of the phenomena, he found no actual evidence of fraud but several respects in which the phenomena as presented paralleled the way in which

---

4 Chapter XX.
5 Page 512.
they would have been presented if done by the fraudulent methods which he had in mind; and other respects in which, to look forward again to Rhine's paper, they were given under conditions that might have permitted fraud, and that so far as he could see were not essential for genuine phenomena. All this is duly set down in more detail in Prince's own words in Chapter XXI.

To this date, in the three episodes of handkerchief spinning, there has prevailed a distressing common factor—in each case it was Laura Crandon who was called upon to place her handkerchief on the table. The record for October 3rd meets this situation very squarely:

Returning now to red light phenomena, Hill was asked to put a handkerchief on the table. After a brief time Walter allowed us to have red light for two seconds and we beheld the handkerchief suspended above the head of the Psychic, rotating on a vertical axis, but not hanging limp as it would have if it had had but one point of support. This experiment he repeated successfully; and the handkerchief was afterwards, in the dark, rubbed across the faces of two of the sitters. All phenomena were under strict double control in the dark and single control in the light.

The handkerchief stunt was repeated on October 23rd, and one who looks upon it in terms of pre-séance preparation will have to seek a new confederate; for while the record omits to state whose handkerchief it was, neither Hill nor Laura Crandon was present.

I have mentioned incidentally, at an early point in the present chapter, that the sitters met the Harvard "exposure" by the development of a new type of control. The first experiments with this control follow hard on the period to which we have now come. The result is that during the weeks of concentration upon these experiments, many of the familiar aspects of the case fell into abeyance. Routine telekinesis under conditions permitting inclusion in the present discussion was one of these; so we terminate the chapter here. We shall come back later to Walter's telekinetic routine; and we shall see that it was in no fundamental respect altered by the new conditions of sitting.
CHAPTER XVIII
One Sitter, and His Verdict
By the Editor

The present brief chapter revolves entirely about the personality of a particular sitter; and I may introduce it by giving in full the following séance record:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, July 10th, 1925. Present to left: Dudley, Adler, Mansfield, Crandon. Walter came through in about eight or nine minutes and seemed to be cheerful as usual. Mansfield was introduced; and he informed Walter that he had been a Spiritualist for twenty-five years, had reached the belief intellectually, had had it confirmed by subjective mediums, but had never seen a valid physical medium. However, he firmly believed in the reality of the physical phenomena. Whereupon Walter rang the [SA] bell the number of times requested in red light, and then rang it three successive times intermittently while Dudley held it high in air and turned himself around 360 degrees. Walter then "removed his force" and Dudley picked the bell-box up and it did not ring. Walter then did unusually brilliant levitation of doughnut, big megaphone and basket. He also rang the Dingwall bell-box showing his terminal. All the phenomena were done under strict double control plus the luminous wrist-bands, anklets and head-band.

For Mansfield's presence I was in large part responsible: I had sent him to Crandon, and had written privately stating that I could not quite make the man out. He was either a bit of a fool, or a bit of a rogue, or a tremendous zealot; I couldn't tell which, and Crandon would have to determine for himself whether he cared to admit him to the séance room. My experience with the man leading to this pronouncement was confined to two long interviews.

Mansfield called on me the first time without appointment, introducing himself as a very old and valued friend of the Society and of Dr. Prince, my predecessor as Research Officer. Ideas flow on to his tongue faster than they can flow off, with the result that one's main impression after he has been talking for three hours is of a deluge of unordered words. Disentangling the essentials of the walter
THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

of disoriented conversation in which he buried me, the story that he had to tell was approximately this:

For twenty-five years he has been a fake medium, and has practiced all phases of this profession all over the country. As a result, he is intimately acquainted with all the mediums now practicing. He knows them all by their first names and knows all their private scandals and knows how all of them achieve their results. They are frauds—all of them, with a few conspicuous exceptions. These exceptions are mediums through whom he has had message material of one sort or another which defies explanation as other than valid. In addition, he knows that certain physical phenomena occur because they occasionally happen spontaneously in his presence.

He was at the moment more or less down and out, financially and physically. He was going to Boston, where he was planning to start a spiritualistic church—whether on a basis of genuine or of fraudulent mediumship he avoided saying and I avoided asking! His whole manner was insinuatingly and furtively confidential. He is exactly the sort of person whom you would expect to have no other address than "General Delivery"; and usually this is in fact the case with him. But—whatever reservations one makes about the man himself and about other parts of his story, it is abundantly clear that he does not exaggerate his knowledge of the ways and means of fake mediumship. In this respect I think he outranks anyone with whom I have talked. Houdini, for instance, was much the same sort of egoistic, voluble, disorderly talker; but his vaunted acquaintanceship with the actual processes of fake mediums was largely a matter of suspicion, inference and speculation. With Mansfield it is a matter of personal knowledge based on personal experience or personal contact with other operators whose confidence he enjoys. Sane or insane, honest or crooked, the man is an authority on fake mediumistic practices. He is the only person with whom I have ever discussed the subject, for instance, who properly appreciates the unwieldy character of most of the trick slates described by Abbott, and who properly appraises the extremely high percentage of fake slate-writings that is got by simple sleight of hand with innocent slates. In a word, he knows his field thoroughly; and if Prince was in the habit of consulting with him as freely as Mansfield would have me believe, Prince will be able to bear me out in this judgment.

1 *Behind the Scenes With the Mediums.* Open Court Publishing Co.
ONE SITTER, AND HIS VERDICT

As a matter of fact, not only Prince but also Dingwall does bear me out. Mansfield is one of the very few persons aside from himself whom Prince deigns to introduce as witnesses to the phenomena described in "The Psychic in the House." And Dingwall, when he was in this country in 1921-22, met Mansfield, and was by him shown what he characterizes as "a most extraordinary collection" of "lovely gadgets" for use in the production of fake physical phenomena. Mansfield is neither bluffing nor crazy when he represents himself as thoroughly familiar with this field.

Crandon’s first impression of Mansfield was rather favorable; he realized that the man was none too stable, but entertained no doubts of his essential honesty. During the ensuing days, however, he had more opportunity to listen to his conversation; and he began to entertain doubts as to his good faith and his object in sitting. These doubts did not become dominant in time to prevent Mansfield’s second attendance on July 13th; but they were at that date sufficient to bring it about that the major part of the evening’s record dealt with the stranger’s conduct:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, July 13th, 1925. Present, to left: Gray, Murray, Hubbs, Mrs. Hubbs, Dr. Brown, Mansfield, Crandon. The sitting was an hour late in starting because of a long discussion of mediums and fraudulent mediums which preceded the sitting, downstairs. Mansfield had given us a very interesting lecture on the fraudulent methods of both subjective and physical mediums. He said that his purpose in life was to expose fraudulent mediums for the purpose of encouraging the valid ones. He said he had devoted fifteen years of his life to this purpose; that he had made apparatus to aid fraudulent mediums, later to serve for their undoing. On the subjective side he told of himself posing as medium, of telling some one in the audience to hasten to the telephone and to notify his wife that the barn, forty miles away, was on fire; that he had arranged to have the barn set in a smoldering fire and to have the housewife come out and discover it at just that moment when notified by telephone. Then he told us of the arrangements between mediums by which they, in fair exchange, give each other tips on the various dupes in the way of believers who might come to them.

On the physical side he showed us the typical aluminum trumpet in three sections used by standard mediums. He showed  

---

2 Page 156 of the volume named.
how two of these trumpets hitched together in the dark would reach across the average room. He showed us what appeared to be a pocket pen, which, with a trigger, would extend out 48 inches; then he hitched a luminous painted butterfly on the end of this and then waved it about in life-like fashion. He showed us psychic photographs; two he said were valid, the rest he said were faked. He tried to get our Psychic to accept some of this apparatus as a present from him. Of course she refused it, and at no time was she left alone in a room with him. Her friends were present and witness to every act and every word which occurred during the evening. He said that he was a working man, single, who, as often as he saves a thousand dollars, stops work and sets out on this hobby of his to expose fraudulent mediums. He seems to be forty-five or fifty years old, well nourished, prominent abdomen, very dexterous white hands and wears gold spectacles. A Masonic emblem was notable on the left side of his coat. We are inclined to believe that he is an emissary of some organization sent to size up the mediumship.

At the sitting Walter came through slowly, partly we think because it was so late. He rang the bell many times in the dark, cracked a few jokes, more or less aimed at our strange visitor; then rang the bell box in the red light the number of times requested by Mansfield, and departed at 10:40 p.m. The visitor then talked till midnight and departed in the custody of Brown and Murray. They say that he never spoke once after he entered their automobile. The evening was full of interest, and we feel sure that the visitor went away with a lot to think about.

The Lime Street regulars were much disturbed by Mansfield's behavior; and particularly by his insistence upon demonstrating and explaining the apparatus and procedures of fake mediumship in Margery's presence. They were not at all confident that this did not constitute an attempt to "plant" her in some way, as Houdini had done. In point of fact, it became obvious in rather short order that he had simply been fishing around, for his own satisfaction, to see what would be Margery's reaction to these things. That he was satisfied is amply indicated in an article by him appearing in the Boston Spiritualistic weekly, Banner of Life, for August 15th, 1925. From this article I abstract enough to make it a matter of record in this place that this very competent and none too lenient critic was wholly satisfied alike with the physical and the psychological evidence of Margery's validity:
The writer sought and obtained permission to witness the phenomena of Margery. He bore no letter of introduction and was not asked for references. He was a total stranger. He has seen all kinds of mediums, genuine and fraudulent.

Margery has spent and is spending much money in entertaining investigators and those who come to witness her phenomena. Besides the actual outlay of money, time, energy and labor involved, she must answer dozens of letters received weekly relative to her séances. For a long time she avoided publicity, and she would be unknown today but Fate decreed otherwise. None ever finds a fraudulent medium that avoids publicity and spends money instead of making it in demonstrating his phenomena.

Fraudulent mediums are apprehensive of strangers and if the least bit suspicious will refuse to admit them under any one of various pretexts. I have been told that Margery never refused to admit any person that proved his interest in her work, and most of her visitors have been strangers to her. The writer was a stranger and said frankly that he knew something of magic and fraudulent mediumship, yet he was gladly admitted to two sittings and sat as close as possible to the Psychic while the phenomena took place. In admitting strangers to her séances Margery has everything to lose and nothing to gain. She is risking the presence of one who might publish a garbled account of what took place and “explain” to his own satisfaction the phenomena on normal grounds.

Fraudulent mediums will not hold a séance in the presence of a magician or even of one with a slight knowledge of magic or fraudulent mediumship. Margery welcomed to her séances world-famous exposers of fake mediums.

Margery’s mediumship is in a class by itself. Her work is not standard. It differs entirely from that of fraudulent mediums. And each séance is to some extent different, whereas séances by fraudulent mediums are standardized to a large extent.

Fraudulent mediums avoid as much as possible discussing their phenomena, no doubt through fear of making a slip. Margery discusses her work with all interested and answers fully any question asked.

Fraudulent mediums depend for their support almost entirely upon messages. Margery’s guide, her brother Walter, rarely gives a message, or announces the presence of a spirit known to a sitter, or states that he has seen or met any particular spirit. A medium that never receives a message or “impressions” for sitters is something new.

Objects levitated by fraudulent mediums are generally from five
to ten feet distant from the medium and have a straight-line movement, and sitters are occasionally struck by them. Objects levitated in Margery’s séances are generally three or four feet distant, frequently have a curved-line motion, and in many respects differ from the levitations of fraudulent mediums. No sitter was ever struck.³

Probably most Spiritualists think that the red light in Margery’s circles is about the same strength as that usually found in séance rooms. The writer knows it is frequently many times more brilliant, far stronger than any fraudulent medium would permit. There are many phenomena not witnessed by the writer, reported in Margery’s séances, which fraudulent mediums would find it impossible to duplicate under the same conditions.

I bring this chapter to a close with brief reference to an interview between Mansfield and myself in New York, some weeks after his sittings. He expressed his satisfaction and his conviction of Margery’s genuineness, more directly than he had done in print. He was particularly impressed by the obvious fact that she had nothing to conceal, and by the honesty of her reactions when he tried to demonstrate to her some of the methods of fraud. And of course he freely admitted that many of the phenomena which he saw could not with good sense be visioned in terms of fraud. But he made a prophecy which has come out more than once. If they were not more careful in admitting others than they had been in admitting him, they would let themselves in for serious trouble from enthusiastic expositors of the sort who do not bother about keeping within the facts.

* * * * *

The above represents the present chapter as originally written, during the summer or fall of 1927, with complete consideration given to all the facts as they were then known to me. During the interval ensuing before publication, however, it has been suggested to me that in private conversation Mansfield has told quite a different tale from the one of the above extract. I have pursued these rumors into the western city of their origin, and have learned that in fact he has expressed dissatisfaction with various features of his sittings, and has even attempted to repudiate or explain away the document carrying

³ By this, of course, he means accidentally and with force; he does not mean to deny the frequent intentional touching of sitters by Walter, with megaphones and other apparatus. Likewise, of course, in this paragraph he speaks more from hearsay than from direct knowledge of his own.—J. M. B.
his name from which I have just quoted. In view of the possibility that these viewpoints may exist in documentary form and may at some future date achieve publicity, I have interrogated the editor of the Banner, asking him whether Mansfield offered the printed report spontaneously or whether it was solicited; whether it was published in its original form or after revision; and whether, after its appearance, Mansfield made protest of any sort. Mr. Scott replies by holographic letter:

The solicitation was all on his [Mansfield's] part. Dr. Cran-don had nothing to do with it and no one tampered with the manuscript except possibly to edit it by correcting the English. He never protested, but on the contrary was very proud of his effort and requested and received several free copies of the issue in which it appeared.

Whether Mansfield's true opinion was favorable or unfavorable, it would be sufficiently easy, assuming lack of moral fiber on his part, to suggest motives for his giving statements contrary to his actual beliefs. The reader must judge for himself to what degree Mansfield's dealing in contradiction robs his testimony of value. Whether it does this wholly or only in part, his first contact with the mediumship must be described as part of the history of the case; and the rest of the story must then be told in justice to the facts. Indeed, it is particularly necessary for me in this compilation to avoid any appearance of suppressing the fact that what might be interpreted as Mansfield's final and fully considered opinion was adverse; while it is equally important to get the whole episode on accurate record so far as I can learn the facts in order that subsequent citation of this adverse attitude may not be made without full access to all the details of his contact with the mediumship.

4 This part of Mr. Scott's statement I can emphatically endorse. In talking to me, Mansfield displayed this same inordinate, almost childish, pride over having broken into print.—J. M. B.
CHAPTER XIX

Another Sitter: The Same Verdict

By the Editor

Another of the few individuals whose contact with the case has been of the particular sort that demands a special chapter in this volume is the Rev. Edward H. Cotton, Unitarian minister and one of the editorial staff of The Christian Register, a Church weekly. The sequence of events that culminated in his attendance at Lime Street began with his assignment to interview Houdini for his paper, the subject of course being Spiritualism and psychical research. The result was sufficiently explosive, even though Cotton's text as it appeared was necessarily for the major part about Houdini. I do not have conveniently available the date of this publication; but I can cite the Literary Digest of July 18th, 1925, for a summary of the article which is much more generally available than the original.

The appearance in The Christian Register of this extremely violent interview led to a deluge of letters of protest. Not a few of these came from ministers and laymen who had sat with Margery, who, for a wonder, had been mentioned but casually in the article. Westwood, for instance, told the editor of his knowledge of and interest in the Margery case, and suggested that Cotton be assigned to look into it as a fair sample of the best aspect of the other side of the picture. After some correspondence between Cotton and Crandon, this was actually done. Cotton attended his first séance on August 3rd, 1925. He read my Margery book and other available literature. He talked the subject over in some detail with me to the extent of an entire afternoon. And, as a result, there appeared two articles in The Christian Register for October 8th and 15th, 1925, the second of which at least was remarkable enough in its prima facie character. For while its predecessor was nothing more startling than an interview with me, as Research Officer, on the subject of physical phenomena, this second offering was no less than an interview with Walter, pieced together as a composite picture of Cotton's four evenings of contact with him during August.

I cite this literature here because it is characteristic of the reaction of a certain type of mind. In interviewing me Cotton would not, and I could not make him, stay off the subject of spiritism. I really talked
to him about the phenomena, stressing to my best ability the distinction between this and talking about the spirits. His printed report of the afternoon’s proceedings seizes upon and magnifies every mention of the spirits, and revolves entirely about the connection of the phenomena with the spirit hypothesis. And when Cotton got around to the task of describing his séance room experiences, the physical manifestations are relegated to a position of extreme obscurity while he dilates about his impressions of the personal character and characteristics of Walter.

Of course the reason for this is obvious. Cotton is a minister, and his whole life has been spent dealing, on a religious and metaphysical basis to be sure, but none the less definitely dealing, with the idea of survival. The ministers who oppose spiritism and psychical research, we must always remember, do so not because they oppose the idea of survival. They do so for the very respectable motive that the alleged survival of the séance room does not look to them like the survival with which they are familiar; or for the less respectable motive that they fear it to be the same spirit world in the two cases and resent the intrusion upon their preserves. But whether they fear or welcome the evidence of the séance room, their major interest in it must be in its spiritistic bearings. This was Cotton’s reaction: he was being brought into far more concrete touch than ever before with something that claimed to come from the other side of the veil, and his entire interest lay in analyzing this something and determining how it checked up with his pre-existent ideas. In his entire sanity and good sense and in much of his philosophy Walter checked up very well, and Cotton was strongly impelled to accept him as what he claimed to be.

I give this brief chapter to Cotton because of his published account of the mediumship and because his viewpoint is so characteristically a theological one. I conclude it by pointing out that he continues to sit as opportunity offers, and that there are obviously no doubts in his mind about the reality of the phenomena. That he accepts the spirit interpretation and refuses even to entertain any other may or may not be a weak point in his philosophical armor. It at least does not detract from his representative clerical character or from the value of his conviction of validity.
CHAPTER XX
Dr. Richardson’s Voice-Control Machine
From the Séance Records, with Comment by the Editor

All the time that Walter had been playing with the water test, Richardson had been working outside the séance room with the idea which, in its more nearly perfected form, was described by him and by me in the Journal of the A. S. P. R. for December, 1925. Starting May 10th, this apparatus was frequently put before Walter, and frequently improved in some detail as the result of observations upon and objections to the details of its use and the results thereof. The records are not always entirely specific as to the exact nature of these improvements and the exact form of the apparatus on a given occasion. On the date named, for instance, it is indicated that what was at that date regarded as the permanent model of mouth-piece was not in use; but the record is ambiguous as to whether there was any mouth-piece at all or whether the naked ends of the tubing went into the mouths of the sitters. The point is not an important one, since the test was in the nature of a preliminary one; but it is of importance to observe that Walter met this test with complete success on first encountering it. The record is given complete, though some of the descriptive matter duplicates that cited from the A. S. P. R. Journal:

Sitting at 10 Lime St., May 10th, 1925. Present to left: Dudley, Adler, J. H. Brown, E. W. Brown, Crandon. It was not our intention to sit tonight, because the Psychic was not feeling at her best; but Richardson had brought in an apparatus for independent-voice testing and everyone was anxious for Walter to inspect it. This apparatus consists roughly of a large U-tube with a luminous float in each arm. One limb of the U-tube and six other tubes lead through the cork of a large empty bottle. Some or all of these six flexible gas-pipe tubes are held in the mouths of the sitters, including the Psychic; pressure enough is blown by one or by all into the big bottle and thus into the U-tube to raise one float and lower the other; this pressure is maintained by the mouth of each sitter and then Walter is asked to talk or whistle. If the pressure is lost, any sitter may be to blame. If

1 Chapter IV.
pressure is not lost and hand control is maintained, and if the mouth of the Psychic is known to be free of anything that could close her tube, a positive result would tend to prove the independence of the voice.

Walter seemed much interested in the experiment; and at once, while the tubes were in everybody’s laps but still in the dark, he did something which made the floats oscillate through two inches. Dr. Brown then showed that by tucking a rubber pencil eraser into his tube with his tongue, he could freely talk around it. On this Walter commented: “Yes, but I defy any of you to speak as I do with my voice.” Dr. Brown then showed how the mouthpiece could be attached to the upper lip, while one could speak around it but could not whistle. An informal try-out was then made, the floats were blown to unequal levels and everyone obtained control of his own pipe with his tongue. Then the light was turned out and Walter spoke freely and whistled. When the new perfected mouthpiece comes no control of the pipes will be possible except by the lips.

Starting on the 21st, there was extreme concentration upon this new machine for vocal control, in séances more under Richardson’s own supervision and less under Crandon’s than is the Lime Street custom. No material alteration in the apparatus as a whole had been made, but the new mouthpiece was in use and is described in the record:

May 21st, 1925; séance for the purpose of making the first complete trial of Richardson’s apparatus to prove the independent character of Walter’s voice. The most important part of this apparatus is the mouthpiece which each sitter has. It is made of glass, like the curved stem of a pipe. About one and one-half inches of the glass tube is in the user’s mouth; a large glass flange prevents further entrance. The end of the tube may be closed with the tongue. Two little holes, top and bottom, are in the shank of the tube; and these can be closed only by the lips. Thus, after one sitter blows hard until the luminous floats assume a position out of equilibrium, this condition can be maintained only if every sitter keeps the three holes of his glass terminal tightly closed by lips and tongue. All sitters tried, with the mouthpiece thus held, to speak and whistle; but in vain. Miner came nearest to it, but could not make a phonetic whisper and could not repeat either whisper or whistle.

In the dark, Walter came through very quickly in cheerful mood, saying: “I’ve been having great fun, sitting watching you folks. You don’t seem to be able to work your own apparatus.
Diagram showing the operation of the VCO machine with use of the reservoir bottle; and vertical longitudinal section of the mouthpiece in the form used from an indeterminable date in 1925, to March 26, 1926. This mouthpiece was in use when the Editor sat in October, 1925; and for some time earlier. The significance of the lettered indices will for the most part be clear from the text; any which are not clear are interpreted on pp. 676, 678, A. S. P. R. Journal, December, 1925.
PLATE 20. THE VCO MACHINE, ASSEMBLED WITH THE RESERVOIR BOTTLE, AND SPECIALLY POSED BY MARGERY AND DR. RICHARDSON. OBSERVE THE CLIPS SEALING THE RESERVOIR CONNECTIONS WHICH ARE NOT HERE IN USE.
Give me time now and I’ll try it.” He then talked along merrily in the dark, and finally said he was ready for a preliminary trial. This was made with the ordinary circle, and had no rigorous value because the link between Crandon and the Psychic was uncontrolled. Walter spoke with the greatest facility.

Walter repeated this experiment several times, and then instructed us to set up double control: Richardson taking the Psychic’s two hands and Mrs. Richardson taking Crandon’s two. Under this control Walter spoke; and he improved upon Richardson’s original test sentence by saying: “David dug a damned devilish deep trench.” Then he whistled merrily. The control was irreproachable.

Walter then said: “Now I will show you one that will sting you.” Whereupon he picked up the small megaphone and said: “Now blow up your machine.” This was done, and Walter proceeded to talk and whistle through the big megaphone high in the air.\(^1\)

This experiment was repeated, and before Walter began to speak the column of fluid carrying the floats fell. Walter said: “The Big Chief, the Bugologist, could not hold his own machine.” This was true, it having been Richardson who was unable to maintain the pressure. At another time it was Mrs. Richardson who failed to hold, and again Walter spotted who had failed.

Twice he repeated the following experiment: He began to talk with the machine blown up under double control and then instructed us to acquire single control.\(^2\) This was done with complete success.

As a last type of experiment, after the machine was blown up Walter began to whistle his own tune which contains a lot of notes, first high and then an octave lower and much prolonged. This he whistled beautifully, and for so long that our tongues and lips ached from maintaining the pressure. The door was locked throughout the séance.

Two evenings later, they did it all again, with a somewhat different make-up for the group of sitters who had to hold the fort while Walter gave the vocal performance. The record (May 23rd, 1925):

---

\(^1\) A specific statement of control here would be welcome, but is not given.—J. M. B.

\(^2\) “Double control” means of course that the sitters next to Crandon (and at his right) and Richardson (and at his left) participated in the control of the Psychic by these two, reaching across the “suspect’s” lap to place a hand upon the joined hands of suspect and Psychic. Single control means that Crandon and Richardson were in unverified control of the medium’s hands.—J. M. B.
This evening was to test again Richardson's machine for proving the independence of Walter's voice. The six forming the circle first practiced in the red light to get familiar with the method.\(^2\) In the dark, Walter appeared in about two minutes. The tests of the voice machine were made as follows:

In the dark, with no control, the machine was blown up. Walter spoke and whistled freely.

With double control, Richardson having the Psychic's two hands and Mrs. Richardson both of Crandon's, the machine was blown up. Walter again spoke and whistled freely. This test was repeated.

There followed a discussion of possible flaws or weaknesses in the apparatus. Walter himself suggested: "One sitter could pull his glass terminal out of his gas pipe, and block the rubber tube so that he would be free to speak as me. To meet this, blow up the machine when you are ready; then give one second of red light to see that each sitter has a tip in his mouth. Also, before and after a demonstration you should test the tube from each mouth to the reservoir bottle, to see that they are all unobstructed."

The experiment was then tried as directed. Each sitter was seen to have a terminal in his mouth; yet Walter spoke and whistled freely. This was repeated. [The record then describes some vocal effects, different from those usually got, and ascribed by Walter to John. Inasmuch as they were not given under the machine control, they are here omitted.]

With all tubes in the mouths under Walter's instructions, the markers in the U-tube began to oscillate vertically, and air could be felt being blown into all the mouths. This could have been done by Walter through alternate blowing and sucking on the open top of the U-tube; or by one of the sitters, blowing and sucking through his tongue-hole while the others held fast. The floats danced up and down some fifteen inches. [Another brief section of the record that has nothing to do with voice tests is here omitted.]

Walter then instructed Mrs. Richardson to take Mrs. Litzelmann's chair, and had Mrs. Litzelmann stand between the Psychic and Crandon. Then under instructions the apparatus was blown up and held by all sitters; and then Mrs. Litzelmann sang, Walter whistled and John sang, all three at once; and once or twice Walter or John also laughed aloud.

The exact point of the blowing through the tubes, and of Mrs. Litzelmann's part in the last test of this evening, are not clear, of

\(^2\) A very necessary measure—see Journal, A.S.P.R., Dec., 1925; p. 684.—J. M. B.
course. But one would expect that in pursuing demonstration on a new apparatus of this sort to its logical climax, numerous false leads would be taken and numerous blind alleys entered. The fact that he does not display superhuman omniscience in travelling in a straight line to his destination surely cannot be urged against Walter.

The next display of the voice machine came in the presence of the Harvard group, who invaded Lime Street for the explicit purpose; and of Dean Edwards, who was there through an appointment which accidentally coincided with that of the young men from Cambridge. The record indicates that the purpose of the sitting (May 24th) was:

First, to experiment with Richardson’s machine for testing the independence of Walter’s voice; and second, an attempt to make a paraffin hand. First, the six sitters in the circle practiced for twenty minutes, working with Richardson’s machine to learn its technique. Walter came through in about six minutes, whistling a beautiful obligato to the new tune “Out of the Dusk to You”, and this continued more or less extensively throughout the sitting. Walter proceeded at once to experiment with the voice machine. Hillyer had trouble maintaining pressure; so did the Psychic; and later, so did Crandon and Hoagland. Walter jeered at each in turn, saying that he was far more expert with the machine than we were. Finally, without control, the machine was blown up; and Walter spoke and whistled.

With double control the machine was blown up; and Walter spoke and whistled. This experiment was repeated successfully, to a total of four times.

All sitters expressed themselves as entirely satisfied of the independence of Walter’s voice, in so far as they could judge from their own experience in trying to “beat” the machine. Considerable discussion then followed for fifteen minutes as to the use of a microphone as another test of the actual point of greatest intensity of the voice in the cabinet. This kind of discussion, taking interest from the current experiment, seems always to kill Walter’s enthusiasm. Further, the three repetitions of the double-control operation of the voice machine were each staged after a flash of red light. Of this Walter said: “You’ll have to wait a bit each time, for that red light dampens my ardor.” At the end of the discussion referred to, Walter said: “There is no use in my doing the paraffin glove tonight although I am ready to do it. There are so many free hands in the room, it would be silly and would have no evidential value.”
Following this, and while Richardson and others were discussing and planning improvements alike in the machine and in the technique of its use, it began to figure as a regular feature of the séances. Thus, on May 29th:

Actual sitting began after a considerable amount of practice with the Richardson voice machine. Walter came through in seven or eight minutes and seemed to be cheerful. He had us make several tests of the voice machine without hand control, and then formal tests were made and carried out, with 100 per cent success, five times. Each time after the machine was all set in disequilibrium, the red light was turned on for two seconds in order to see that each mouth contained a mouthpiece, and to confirm the double control by Richardson and Taylor. Then each time Walter talked and whistled, the whistling once including a little obligato to the music. He sought by humorous remarks to make us lose our pressure; and once he succeeded, when he said: "Hold it, you devils, hold it!"

After the above séance, there was a long hiatus in the experiments with voice-control. In fact, before these were resumed, Richardson's interest in the vocal aspects of the mediumship had led to another excursion into photography. The memorandum of the conference with Walter on August 1st is meager, but tells the story:

Walter came at once and was told Richardson's desires. He replied that if we wanted a picture of his [Walter's] voice apparatus, we would have to sit with the same group for three successive nights, August 4th, 5th and 6th; but not to have the photographers present until the last two nights. He said further, that he does not want us to sit more than three nights a week hereafter. Walter emphasized his remarks with many loud poundings on the table.

It does not appear from the records that this program was carried through with complete accuracy. The sittings of the 5th and 6th appear; but that of the 4th was replaced, apparently, by a sitting on the 3rd. At all three of these, the same circle was present; except that Cotton was absent on the 6th, while Hill and Litzelmann exchanged positions in the circle on that date. The photographers were absent on the 3rd, according to schedule; and on this date the séance was devoted largely to the routine of telekinesis and identification of objects. At the end, however;
Walter then proceeded to put the Psychic into trance, saying that all the work done tonight was only to stall us along and keep us amused; that as a matter of fact he and his gang were all very busy preparing for the next two nights.

On these two nights, Conant and Gerke were in attendance and pictures were made. The thoracic or pharyngeal character of the teleplasmic masses presented on these evenings, however, was so far from evident that I deal with the records elsewhere; they will be found as part of a teleplasmic sequence in Chapter XXIV. And there is nothing more of the voice machine in the record until the middle of September. It had been intended to use it on the 10th, and on that date it was prepared for use; but Walter said that he could do nothing with it on account of the conditions remaining from the excessive exposure to white light on August 13th. He represented himself as working to restore his psychic apparatus to a condition of operativeness; and it was ostensibly his absorption in this task that dominated the séance to the exclusion of all physical effects of any account. On the 11th (September) he said that the damage had been made good and he could proceed. The record tells us:

The main work of the evening was the use of Richardson's voice machine. Walter said: "Now get out your spitting machine. Everybody get a nipple of the psychic nursing-bottle." The experiment was now made four times in succession. The first time was with an ordinary circle and no light. The second time was with an ordinary circle; but just before the test, the light was turned on momentarily to show a mouthpiece in each mouth. At the third test Hill acquired control of the Crandon-Psychic link, and then the light was turned on for an instant. At the fourth, this was repeated. All four tests were completely successful. At one time, despite Walter's efforts to break down our gravity, we held on while he talked and whistled for forty seconds.

The Richardson machine was taken to the Litzelmann residence in Cambridge for the séance of September 17th, and was there used with the usual brilliant success. The record tells us:

The Richardson voice apparatus was on the table with its six control tubes. The mouth and pharynx of everybody were examined before the sitting by Richardson, and each one after this examination was escorted by Richardson into the circle and his hands held until the circle was completed. Walter came through
in about five minutes, and seemed to be very cheerful. He directed
a rearrangement of the circle until it was as above. The voice
machine was then used with this circle in its ordinary status; which
is the equivalent of no control, scientifically speaking. It worked
perfectly, Walter talking and whistling freely. The test followed
a period of ten minutes of trance. The same experiment was re-
peated, and again it worked perfectly.³

Then came the crucial experiment of the evening. All the de-
tails were carefully worked out by Walter beforehand, and he gave
the orders. All the mouthpieces except two were clamped and
closed. Of the two remaining open, the Psychic had one in her
mouth, and Richardson had the other in his. At Walter's signal,
Richardson blew through his mouthpiece until the luminous floats
in the U-tube showed about ten inches difference in level. Then
the Psychic gave her two hands to Richardson, and all the other
sitters left the room and closed the door. Richardson then reports
that Walter spoke and whistled freely for twelve seconds. The
whistling could be heard by the other sitters from outside the door.
Then Richardson rapped three times on the floor, as prearranged,
and we all filed back quickly and made up the circle again. Walter
said that this was in order to prevent total loss of his force.

At the end of this experiment, Walter took the Psychic again
into trance and went on talking, saying merrily that he was pretty
well used up and must collect force. Three times, in full red light,
he talked and whistled while the Psychic was plainly seen to be in
deep trance with lips motionless. He said: "John says that I have
changed over from a psychic control into a broadcasting one."

Later, at Lime Street, many raps being heard at 12:20 A.M.
in a brightly lighted bedroom, Crandon and the Psychic sat again.
The Psychic was entranced, and Walter talked until 1:00 A.M.,
saying that he did this to gather force; and he directed that the
red light be left going.³a

The procedure of the above sitting is open to criticism, to the ex-
tent that Richardson's control of the Psychic's hands started too late
to be of rigorous value. He can not testify that while he was blowing
the machine up, she did not use her hands in some trick enabling the
position of disequilibrium of the floats to persist while she used her
mouth for conversational purposes. She might, for instance, have
plugged the open end of the U-tubes. Or, in complete default of any

³ A paragraph of the record dealing with subjective experiences of the sitters,
of no importance, is here suppressed in the interests of space.
³a See open reference No. 11, Vol. 2.
concrete suggestion as to what she may have done with her free hands, on the hypothesis of validity there was no necessity for them to be free and they should not have been so. This, and other equally obvious shortcomings of the procedure as the above record reveals it, were subsequently corrected. The one-man sittings with the voice machine became a regular though somewhat rare feature. They ultimately reached a point of very rigorous demonstration, and one entitling us to attach weight to the fact that the first attempt to use the voice machine with a single sitter was a complete success.

On September 29th the voice machine was again the central theme of the séance:

Richardson's voice machine was put into action. 1: It was worked in the dark without any control. 2: Red light was turned on just before the experiment to show a tip in everyone's mouth. Double control was then established of Crandon and the Psychic; after which the light was put out. A perfect success ensued, Walter talking and whistling freely for twelve seconds. 3: The same experiment was performed with Crandon out of the room; again a perfect success was scored. 4: The same experiment was again done with Crandon present, and with the ordinary circle, lacking double control; but as Walter was talking, he touched Richardson repeatedly on the arm. Walter explained the point of this: "The Psychic might have done something to the glass tube with her hand, or she might have touched Richardson with her hand; but she could not have done both." This comment is in fact not the whole story; for we have found it impossible, while the floats are in the unstable position, for one to extract the tube from one's mouth without losing the pressure.

We then asked for single sittings, but Walter said he would not do this. There was force enough, but things were confused because of last night's sitting. "I don't want the Psychic to sit any more with Foss," he said; "the rest of you may do so, but it gets things all mixed up for the Kid to sit with him."

Though the record does not show it, Walter probably arranged to give a one-man demonstration on the following night, September 30th; the record for that evening says: "this was to mark the second

---

4 Hereafter, following the Richardson-Crandon usage, we shall refer to this as VCO (voice cut-out).
5 See my testimony in this regard, in the Journal, A.S.P.R., Dec. 1925.—J. M. B.
6 Like Richardson's experience of the 27th.—J. M. B.
7 At Concord, with another medium; see Chapter VIII, p. 82.
experiment with VCO having only one sitter in the room besides the Psychic." It goes on:

We now proceeded to the experiment of the evening. All the exits of the bottle but two were closed. The Psychic was given one of the active tips, and Hill the other. Hill took the Psychic's two hands, and the light was turned on. The machine was blown up to instability, and then we all filed out, leaving Hill and the Psychic. Hill had requested Walter to speak, using as many j's and x's as possible. We closed the door; and shortly heard Walter's whisper and his whistle. As we filed in the machine was still in unstable position, and Walter was whistling the wedding march from Lohengrin. Hill reported that Walter had spoken as soon as the door was closed, saying: "Jane is an extraordinarily jazzy jay-bird, I'll be jiggered."

I cannot too strongly emphasize the fool-proof character of the procedure here followed. The light goes on, showing the floats in their normal state of equilibrium, and the Psychic's hands in Hill's. While Hill and all the other sitters watch, he blows the machine up; and after all the others leave the room, so that there is no one in it free to speak for Walter, Walter speaks and whistles. It is not even pertinent to talk about cleverly concealed soft spots or valves in the tubing; if such existed, there would be no way to bring them into action. Objection to this test is automatically confined to two directions: the adequacy of the glass mouthpiece itself must be attacked, or Hill must be impeached as a confederate. If the critic choose the latter course he will find that his list of accomplices must include Hill, Richardson and myself, at the very least. I take it that if he is a critic to whose words we need pay any heed, he will then abandon the idea of confederacy, and center his attack upon the design of the mouthpiece. Is this really fraud-proof; or might there not be discovered some extremely ingenious manipulation of lips, tongue, teeth and cheeks that would beat it?

This claim, of course, involves the attribution to Margery of fairly superhuman powers; for it requires that this trick, which has baffled every other human being who has examined the nozzles, revealed itself to her casual inspection of the tips the first time they were put before her. It requires, also, that a new trick for beating the mouthpieces

\(^{76}\) An exception to this sweeping generalization might be made in behalf of the episode chronicled on pages 275, 357.—J. M. B.
reveal itself similarly after each of several radical changes in their design. Incidentally, with the approach to conclusive demonstration which we now make, we might do well to read formally into the present record the careful description of the entire apparatus given by Richardson in the A.S.P.R. Journal for December, 1925; for we have reached a date at which the VCO machine was in the semi-permanent condition there displayed. The pictures are reproduced herewith, in accordance with the general policy of giving in the present volume all important illustrative material, regardless of whether it has appeared elsewhere (see p. 260).

A rather well-known adverse critic was among the sitters of October 2nd; and, "contrary to Crandon's inclinations," Walter instructed that the VCO be demonstrated to him. The record goes on;

The mechanism of this was explained to Prince, and then he distributed the glass tips: one to Saunderson, one each to the Sturtevants, one to Prince, one to Crandon, and one to the Psychic. An experiment was now made in the light; then one was made in the dark; then two were made in the dark, each preceded by a brief red-light period to show that each person's tip was in his mouth. During all these experiments, Prince had the Psychic's two hands and Mrs. Hack had Crandon's two. Under these conditions Walter whistled and repeated the test sentence of the preceding night. Prince was told he could come down to experiment with the machine any time he wants to do so.

On October 6th the VCO again was used:

First the machine was used in the light with all six sitters; then in the dark with the six sitters; then in the dark with three sitters and with double control of Crandon and the Psychic. This was then repeated with red light immediately preceding the voice, in order to show that both Crandon and the Psychic had their tips in their mouths. Then Walter said the "Jazzy Jane" test sentence; and for good measure added twenty bars of an obligato to go with the victrola.

On October 16th, we are told, "Walter used the VCO with great brilliancy." On the 19th, I was present for the first time since

---

8 There being but six tips, Hill and Mmes. Uffield and Hack had to be left out of the distribution. Prince was included, rather than Hill, because the demonstration to him of the difficulty of operating the tip seemed more important than that of the non-confederacy of such a very eminent citizen as Hill.—J. M. B.

8a See the remarks on p. 247; also Chap. XXI. These should be digested before placing any appraisal upon Prince's participation in this sitting.—J. M. B.
August—my expedition to Lily Dale in August-September had conspired with illness on the Society's staff and in Lime Street to keep me away. The three sittings of the 19th, 20th and 21st marked the end of my official examination of the mediumship in behalf of the Society which had begun in June. And they also marked the climax of the merging of my program into Richardson's, as described in detail elsewhere. Although it has appeared in part elsewhere, I give my record of the three evenings in full, with the transfer of one paragraph to another chapter in view of its complete impertinence here. This record was not dictaphonic, for the reasons explained internally; it was drawn up in rough form each evening immediately following the sitting, and the finished draft here reproduced was compiled from these rough drafts after my return to New York.

Séances of October 19th, 20th and 21st, 1925, at 10 Lime Street, Boston. Present on each evening and in a circle clockwise: Margery, Richardson, Hamilton, Hill, Bird, Mrs. Richardson, Crandon; except that Mrs. Richardson was absent on the 21st. Present outside circle and in charge of camera, etc.: Conant and Gerke. Present outside circle as guest on the 21st: Newman Gray.

In view of the fact that Margery was not well' it was agreed to substitute some other program for the teleplasmic one of Bird's more recent sittings. Richardson was approaching a climax with his VCO machine for the demonstration of independent voice; descriptions of this machine will appear in an early issue of the Journal of the A.S.P.R., and such material is accordingly omitted from this record. As Richardson stated that if he could get a report by Bird of a one-man sitting with this machine to add to similar reports by Hill and others he would regard his formal tests with this machine as completed, Bird agreed to make this the order of the day. In view of the fact that Bird's whole attention and all his physical resources will be completely occupied with control of Margery and operation of the VCO at critical moments the dictaphone reporting was suspended.

On the first evening Walter came through promptly and after [an episode described in Volume 210a], the action of the séance was confined entirely to the use of the VCO machine. No attempt was made at a one-man sitting, Walter stating that he required

9 Chapters XIII-XVI.
9a See pages 215-6.
10 Journal, A.S.P.R., Dec. 1925
10a See open reference No. 31 in Vol. 2.
considerable practice and also (as was quite true) that Bird and Margery required practice in the physical operation of the machine. Only two of the mouthpieces were in use, and these were in the hands of Bird and Margery, sometimes with and sometimes without hand control of Margery by Bird. Walter gave in all perhaps a dozen separate episodes with the machine, speaking freely, and whistling brilliantly, while the float remained steady.

In this connection it must be remarked that Bird has experimented faithfully with this machine and found it quite impossible to articulate any other consonants than m and n under its use. He feels 100 per cent positive that any attempt at tricking the machine would involve its removal from the mouth or its blocking by other than anatomical means, while in the mouth. Richardson examined Margery's mouth before and after and made a negative report; and Bird has been quite unable to remove the mouthpiece from his mouth without leakage of air and movement of the float.\textsuperscript{10a}

The second séance (October 20th) was a repetition of the first, except that the one man experiment by Bird was made. This was in detail conducted as follows:

Bird blew into his mouthpiece while Margery held hers, to prove that his tube was not clogged. Reversal of this test proved that Margery's tube was not clogged. Bird held Margery's two hands in his during this test and continuously throughout the experiment thereafter. Margery held her mouthpiece while Bird blew the float up close to the top of the tube, and then held it there. In red light which was now given, the other sitters verified Bird's control of Margery's hands, the proper position of the two mouthpieces and their two mouths, and the position of the float at the top of its tube. The red light was then extinguished, and they filed out of the room as rapidly as possible. The door was hardly closed behind them when Walter began talking. Bird does not remember everything he said, but among his remarks were the test sentence “Jane is an extraordinarily jazzy Jay-bird; I'll be jiggered.” The purpose of this sentence is to incorporate as many sounds as possible, normal articulation of which involves a wide opening of the lips. During this same test period Walter also repeated the expression “phenomenish phenomena,” which one of the sitters had used shortly before. Also he whistled brilliantly and laughed. Bird permitted this to go on until he felt there was

\textsuperscript{10a} The record is defective to the extent that it fails to indicate any control over Margery's mouthpiece before or after the sitting. The several mouthpieces available were at my disposal and I chose two at random, later giving Margery one of these and retaining one myself, at random. What tests I made of the due operativeness of hers, I do not recall.—J. M. B.
danger of his losing his air-tight grip on the mouthpiece. He then
signalled for the return of the other sitters and some, at least, of
them were in the room and had observed the undisturbed position
of the float when Bird’s grip relaxed and the float collapsed.

Repeatedly, on this evening, as on the previous one, there were
brilliant demonstrations of the VCO machine operated by Bird and
Margery in the presence of the other sitters. Likewise at one
stage Walter signalled for a flashlight photograph to be made.
He expressed the hope that some of his psychic apparatus would
appear on the negative, but in possible default of this he insisted
that the test be made with the machine in full operation. He made
the point that this would show the float in its high position and
the top of the open tube untampered with.

The sitting of October 21st was delayed for about one hour
and a half while Crandon and Hill conferred with Griscom of the
Boston Herald, with the other sitters, and again with Griscom.
The occasion for all this was a publication in the Herald of the
advance story about the findings of the Code-Hoagland group. 11
The acts of Shapley, Boring et al. in signing séance records which
explicitly disclaimed the idea of fraud and later signing a very
specific allegation of fraud, agitated Margery more keenly than
any incident since that of the Houdini box. It was a foregone
conclusion that when we did sit we would get nothing but conver-
sation from Walter. It was likewise to be assumed that Walter
would be much calmer and more philosophic about it all than Mar-
gery. Both of these easy predictions were borne out.

For the second of the three dates covered by the above document,
Crandon prepared a record of his own; and inasmuch as it goes into
more detail on some phases of the séance than mine, I give it as well:

Walter came through in about nine minutes and seemed to be
cheerful but not very talkative at first. Later he warmed up and
kept us full of laughter.

The Psychic was searched and examined by Dr. and Mrs.
Richardson and her hands were either in the possession of Richard-
son or Bird throughout the tests of the voice machine. The voice
machine was arranged for two sitters. The tips and tubes were
both in possession of Bird, who tested both before he handed which-
ever one he pleased to the Psychic.

Walter now instructed us to try the thing out in the dark.
It was done twice successfully. Then he threw the Psychic into

11 Chapter IX.
a deep snoring trance with respirations resembling the Cheyne-Stokes effect. This trance lasted for twelve minutes, with Walter talking freely between snores. The Psychic groaned as with labor pains and complained in a querulous voice that she did not feel good. Walter now said that he was going to try the VCO and would bring her out of the trance. This he did after she had been nauseated for two or three minutes with attempts to vomit. He now proceeded to work the test twice. It was successful. During these tests Richardson had the Psychic’s left hand and Bird had her right hand and Crandon’s two hands. Walter now said he was going to try an experiment but was not sure that it would work. He told the boys to get the cameras ready and they did so. The VCO was blown up and through a mistake in signals the flashlight went off too soon. Walter forgave it and took about ten minutes to recover himself. He now said that he wanted Bird to put his head down near the table, so that his head would appear in the picture. The VCO was then blown up and a flashlight was taken. Then Walter said “I have tried to show myself in the picture and it was taken for another very important reason.”

Then the voice machine was used with Bird as the sole sitter. Everyone else went out of the room and we all heard Walter whistling. A period of red light preceded our departure from the room, showing Bird holding the Psychic’s two hands and them both with a tip in each mouth. When we came back Walter was still whistling and the VCO was still blown up.

My successful use of the VCO machine, in solitary sitting with Margery, was regarded as more or less of a climax preceding the description of the new device and its operation, in a contribution by Richardson to the Journal of the A.S.P.R. This appeared in the Journal for December, 1925, and was supplemented by an article from my own typewriter. The two stories tell about all there was to tell at that date regarding the design and the use of the VCO machine, and they should be read into the present record.

Following the October sittings, the development of the glass cabinet took up all the time of the group for several weeks. At first, with the Psychic in the glass cabinet and the sitters outside it, and often a closed door between them, there was no scope for use of the VCO. Presently, however, it was realized that the hand control of the glass cabinet solved automatically one of the difficulties of the VCO.

12 See page 195. 13 See Chapter XXV.
tests, and these two pieces of apparatus were then brought together. The only modification which this required in the previous procedure with the VCO was the dropping of the convention that one or more of the sitters must have a tube and a mouthpiece; the distance between the Psychic and the others make this a bit awkward. For two or three nights, all the superfluous openings into the reservoir bottle were clamped shut; the Psychic then sat with the machine on a shelf or table in front of her, the one tube in action and its mouthpiece in her mouth. As soon as it became clear that this was a permanent change, better form was achieved by eliminating the reservoir bottle entirely; its sole function having been to make it possible for a plurality of persons to work the machine. The Psychic’s tube was now connected directly to the upper end of one arm of the U, and thus a radical simplification of the apparatus was effected.

The records are not wholly explicit, so I shall have to make out of my own general knowledge of the case the statement that after two or three sittings in which the point remained unsettled, it became the invariable custom for the Psychic to emerge from trance for the VCO test and to remain wholly normal for this. Despite her tendency to a slight claustrophobia, she found it easy enough to habituate herself to the hand and foot control, so that the maintenance of these bonds during a considerable period of consciousness irks her neither physically nor mentally. But the head control is quite another thing, altogether too severe for application to a conscious medium in the absence of a dominating motive for submission to unnecessary discomfort; so the custom rapidly crystallized of releasing her head when she emerges or as she is about to emerge from trance for the VCO test. One of the sitters then inspects the tip and places it in her mouth. She blows up the floats to the unstable position and holds them there while all the sitters withdraw to the doorway of the room, lending certainty to the negation of an accomplice. The records of Chapters XXV and XXIX will add details and dates, and will further demonstrate that the technique described took a little time to settle down into permanency and constancy.

The VCO continued to be used throughout the year 1926; but so far as its essential history is concerned, we may finish with it here, without too much chronological loss. Its next chapter comes with the standardized séances which began to take form in January, 1926.

14 See pages 327–34, and Chapter XXIX.
and which constitute the theme of Chapters XXIX, XXXIV and XXXVII in their entirety, as well as of portions of the intervening and subsequent chapters. We soon arrive in these chapters at a point where the VCO takes its place beside the scales and the bell-box as a routine instrument whose use seldom requires more than citation by date and title.

But on February 22nd, 1926, as told on page 357, one of the sitters found that the VCO was not, for him, an absolute gag. He could do nothing with it if some other person put the mouthpiece in his mouth for him, in proper central position; the effort then to shift it would result in loss of air. But if he put it in himself, he could place it in the extreme corner of his mouth, with the tongue-hole bearing against the side rather than the tip of his tongue; and he could then whistle around it very well, and talk around it very poorly, just as he was in the habit of whistling around his smoking pipe as an amusing trick for his friends.

In spite of the restrictions governing Sherburne’s performance with the VCO and from which Walter had amply shown himself to be free, and in spite of Sherburne’s belief that his trick was a very special one which few people could duplicate, it was at once realized that the mouthpiece must be modified to meet this trick. Sherburne pointed out that his ability to do the trick depended upon throwing the mouthpiece to the side of his mouth; if a nozzle could be designed that would compel him to hold it centered in his mouth, he would be as helpless as anybody else. The problem was attacked along these lines; the cylindrical shank entering the mouth was changed into a broad, flat shank, of the full width of the glass flange and of the average mouth. The new mouthpieces had to be specially ordered and could not be received at once; so pending their delivery, the VCO continued in use with the old mouthpiece.

During this interim of working with a nozzle that was known not to be absolutely inhibitive of trickery, the test of March 12th, 1926, ought to be mentioned because of the unusually long period, 42 seconds, during which Walter spoke while the Psychic held the floats in their unbalanced position. For March 26th the new mouthpiece was available, completely filling the lip orifice and making lateral displacement impossible. It was tried out in a very restricted circle and gave Walter no trouble, so on the 27th it was permanently substituted for the older mouthpiece. On this date the VCO test was given with com-
plete success, Overstreet handling the mouthpiece and doing all the work of examination. A photograph of the new mouthpiece will appear at an appropriate point in the second volume.

This completes the history of the VCO, so far as its history involves anything beyond its routine use in the séance room. It became a regular part of the standardized séance, and will be mentioned freely as such in the chapters dealing therewith: XXIX, XXXIV, XXXVII, etc. But it underwent no more changes and was the crux of no more critical demonstrations. We need therefore say nothing more about it as a special topic; we may leave it to figure in the séance routine as it may chance so to figure.
CHAPTER XXI
An Unconverted Skeptic
Séance Record and Comment by Walter Franklin Prince
With Remarks by the Editor

On pages 247 and 269 mention has been made of the presence, at the séance of October 2nd, 1925, of Dr. Walter Franklin Prince, who in his capacity of Research Officer to the Boston Society for Psychical Research, stands as the more or less official sponsor of the viewpoint that Margery's phenomena are not proved and that they are in fact to be presumed fraudulent. On both occasions when I have spoken of Prince's presence in this séance I have indicated more or less explicitly that he was not convinced by what he saw. The facts of his presence and of his well-known antagonistic attitude toward the mediumship, however, seem to make a little more than this in order; and especially, it seems only due the reader that he be given the opportunity of judging just how serious are the specific grounds for Prince's non-acceptance of what he saw on the evening in question. The notes of the séance which he prepared or dictated on the following day were intended for his own private use and benefit alone, and were no more extended than they are since he did not expect to be called upon for any further public utterances on the case. He has however been good enough to put them at my disposal for use in the present volume, subject to the explanation which I have just given in his own words. They are dated October 3rd, and read as follows:

I received an invitation from Dr. Crandon, through Mrs. Hack who had been present at an earlier sitting because of my request to Dr. Crandon, to be present at a sitting at 10 Lime Street, October 2nd. I arrived at 8 o'clock and was ushered in by the Doctor. Besides Dr. and Mrs. Crandon there were present the Rev. Dr. Saunderson, Mrs. Hack, Judge Hill, an elderly lady, Mr.—— and presumably his wife.

There was considerable conversation between me and the Doctor before the others arrived, and by all in common before the sitting began.

Margery was very friendly, has intended to visit this office, wants to tell me a psychical experience of hers, etc. Before, during
and after the sitting Dr. Crandon made many sarcastic and disparaging remarks about Dr. McDougall. Before the sitting and others were shown the album of photographs of casts, ectoplasm, spirit photographs of Hope and Deane, etc., etc. After the sitting we were shown the pictures of the ectoplasm in stereoscopes.

I shall not attempt to give a precisely chronological order of the events as it was not possible to take any notes whatever. But the general order, with the principal incidents follows:

I was the controller of Margery's left hand, Dr. Crandon on her right. Dr. Saunderson to my left, Mrs. Hack to the right of Dr. Crandon. The others in between. Margery put luminous bands upon her ankles but remarked that there would be no need of arm bands in the red light. Nevertheless all the phenomena except some of the bell-box ringing occurred in darkness but she said in a loud voice to me that there would be no need of the bands in the red light. She put on the ankle bands and a band around the forehead showing luminous spot in center.

First that came was the supposed independent voice, really whispers, of Walter. He addressed himself to me and in the effort to make me hear the whispers approached very closely and I was quite willing that they should approach more closely than was absolutely necessary for me to hear. The result was that I am absolutely sure that her head was but a few inches from mine when the whispers blew into my face. Walter said that he was glad that I was present and we had an exchange of insignificant chatter, after which no such effort was made to make me hear directly, but his remarks were interpreted from time to time by Dr. Crandon. At no time in the evening was there the slightest appearance to me that the whispers or the whistling came at any point removed from Margery herself.

The next stage was bell ringing, the bell rang several times in the dark, then I was asked to give directions, and called for one long ring and two short, and they followed. Then in accordance with directions, after a dark interval, Dr. Saunderson was told as soon as the light came on to take up the bell-box and turn around. He did not perfectly understand the order and executed it somewhat hesitatingly, but the bell rang and stopped ringing several times in the circuit. Then two or three times I was asked to direct what kind of rings should be given, the light was turned on and the rings followed as directed. I was not asked to take the box and turn around. I was encouraged at intervals to see that there were no attachments but am not particularly interested
in making sure of details at invitation. There certainly were no tangible attachments. Once when the bell was to ring Margery, with my hand in hers put it upon the table beside the bell box remarking that I might have it there if I liked. Dr. Crandon immediately said something to her in a low voice which I could not understand but my hand was taken away by hers instead of remaining according to the terms of her offer.

Then the “doughnut,” that is to say the paper disc with a hole in the center, both periphery and hole about the dimensions of those of a large doughnut, was brought into play. It was explained to the company as a device introduced by Mr. Dingwall, being an object of a nature difficult to levitate because of its thinness. I do not quite follow the reasoning here, but that was the statement. Perhaps the meaning was that it would be thought hard to get hold of. The doughnut is well luminous upon one side and appears faintly so on the other, but it may be because of the luminosity showing through. Thereupon in the darkness the doughnut performed various tricks, shifted about upon the table, went up into the air, went to a point seemingly between Margery and Dr. Crandon, etc. Once when it came near me I seemed to see something protruding through the hole, not slender but something which fairly well filled it. Then Dr. Crandon, still in the darkness, asked me to hold out my hand and gave me what he said was a silver half dollar. This I was requested to put in the hole of the doughnut as it lay upon the table. Soon a slight movement of the doughnut was seen as though the edge of it were raised and the half dollar extracted from beneath, then the coin was heard to ring upon the table a foot away. Then Dr. Saunder­son was asked to extend his palm over the doughnut, the apparent object being to drop the coin into it. This was done two or three times and each time the half dollar struck the table. I gained the impression that it did not drop into the palm but it may have done so and fallen off. I was not asked to extend my palm in this species of experiment.

At Dr. C.’s request I raised a basket about a foot above the table, and the doughnut was lifted into it.

Another stage was occupied by a megaphone about 2 feet long, with some kind of a handle upon the side. There were two luminous rings upon it, one at each end. The megaphone performed all sorts of antics, being shoved, raised, poked into faces, once falling upon the floor between the table and Dr. Saunderson and myself and coming up with considerable difficulty. Once it fell off the table and landed on the floor back of it and after some little time
THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

was flipped upon the table, after for some moments I had been watching what seemed to me evidence of muscular strain on the part of the medium. Finally the megaphone flew apparently over the medium's head into the cabinet. So far as I could tell, at the precise moment the medium's body gave a violent jerk. Dr. Crandon asked me if I felt her tremble. I did not personally think the word tremble was the right one but did not say so. Throughout the performances of the doughnut and the megaphone while not only I felt the pressure of Margery's left foot upon mine but was able frequently to see the luminous band upon the left ankle, I was at no time able to see the other band. I took special pains to look down alongside the front edge of the table next to the medium and it is very difficult to suppose that her foot could have been held in such a position during the considerable time that these acts of the doughnut and megaphone were taking place and the foot not have been moved so that the band would appear if it remained upon the ankle.

The final feature was the use of an apparatus devised by Dr. Richardson, I understood, an explanatory diagram of which is annexed to this report, the same made by Dr. Crandon to be taken me by Mr. Mansfield. Across the curved glass tube are two horizontal luminous bands and at the surface of the liquid on both sides is a floating perpendicular indicator. The liquid is of course at equilibrium in both branches of the curved tube unless force is exercised to drive it higher in one branch. The diagram shows one of the mouthpieces, which is made of glass having two lateral holes and one terminal hole. From one to six persons may use the apparatus at a time. Whoever is using it blows, the liquid rises on one side as shown by the luminous indicator and then if all using mouthpieces have their lips pressed firmly against the lateral opening and tongue against the terminal one the indicator remains stable. But if anyone who is using a mouthpiece uncovers any one of the openings in it the air escapes and the indicator sinks. Consequently when the indicator remains stable and the liquid is higher on one side than the other, if Walter is able to talk, it is supposed to be an absolute proof of independent voice. It is stated that all sorts of experiments have been tried to see whether these holes can be kept shut and yet voice be possible, and that no one has been able to show that this is the case. The two or three experiments of this sitting when voice was produced the

---

1 Omitted in this publication in view of its having been covered in Chapter XX and in the A.S.P.R. Journal articles therein cited.—J. M. B.
indicator did not remain absolutely stable but sank slightly, though very slightly. I was invited to come over and try to cheat the apparatus if I could. I stated that I claimed no special skill in dealing with mechanical apparatus but I might come over for the amusement of seeing whether I could do it, although I had no expectation of being able to.

After the sitting was through, as I have stated, I looked over the set of ectoplasmic photographs in a stereoscope. To all appearances there were several types. One looked like a bulby mass the size of a large pear with a kind of a twisted cord perhaps six inches in length extending from it. This appeared in a number of the photographs, with the end of the cord protruding from a nostril, and a sac-like protuberance variously placed. I think that in all of these there was the appearance as of a thread passing from the bulbous extremity up toward the ear. This object (mass, cord and thread) was said to constitute Walter's speaking apparatus, and Dr. Crandon said that Walter said if the thread were broken it might kill the medium. He did not say whether this apparatus was used in all the sittings or only in the trance ones of Dingwall's series. But as it was alleged that ectoplasm was produced only in trance, and as it has frequently been alleged that Walter speaks and whistles independently when she is not in trance, I hardly see the advantage of having such a vocal apparatus. Another species was like a large egg, so far as I could judge from the picture possibly 3 inches long and $2\frac{1}{2}$ inches wide in the center (these figures are of course very conjectural), the egg more or less covered over with strands of a lace-like white material. The color of the egg portion was considerably darker than the material which crossed it, making one, in fact, think of rubber. Another form exceedingly roughly resembled a hand. The fingers fell apart in awkward fashion, and while I do not mean to intimate that it was carved out of some anatomical substance, yet that comparison spontaneously kept coming to my mind. I mean it only as an attempted item of description. There were other pictures that represented the ectoplasm as issuing from the ear, at least the small end was protruding from the ear, and hanging down in masses or strands from a few inches to apparently more than a foot. Others showed the substance or some white substance covering a portion of the top of the head or even a large part of the face. The material in some cases looked very different from that in other cases. In several instances where one extremity of the substance was protruding from the mouth it was nevertheless stated by the Doctor it exuded from the ear. He did not explain
what it was doing in the mouth. Of course the pictures do not prove that a substance sticking into the ear actually issued therefrom.

Before I left, Margery said she hoped I would be able to see the ectoplasm and I said I should be very happy to do so.

After the séance I was asked to see what I could do with the voice apparatus. I succeeded in pronouncing two or three words, the float showing only a momentary jerk—not greater so far as I could judge, than the jerk which preceded the voice when Margery had her mouth applied. I was then asked to utter a prescribed jaw-breaking sentence, and did not attempt it, knowing it would be hopeless, at least without considerable practice.

[Signed] WALTER FRANKLIN PRINCE.

Before the above document came into my hands, I had made inquiry of Prince about the October 2nd séance, and about the general character and extent of the negative reports from various sitters which I had been told were in his possession. With reference to my general query whether he had made on October 2nd any specific adverse observations, the record above reproduced was forwarded, with the following additional statement:

I [Prince speaking, of course] send you a copy of my sitting of October 2nd, 1925, written the following day. The chief marks which made it not evidential but rather the reverse were the following:

(1) The approximate certainty that the luminous band on the ankle next to Dr. Crandon was removed and concealed. For fully half an hour I vainly tried to get a glimpse of it, though there was no difficulty in locating the other. Of course if off, the band was off for a purpose, which purpose would presumably be the production of "phenomena" by the free right foot.

(2) The medium made an excuse for leaving off the luminous wristbands—an excuse contradicted by the sequel. The reason given not being correct, I am forced to seek the real reason, and none seems so intelligible as that of leaving the right hand free to help the foot where necessary. Since it has been proved and published without remonstrance that Dr. Crandon is capable of releasing the medium's hand without due notice, this reason fits in with the general scheme.

(3) There was to me not the slightest indication that the

---

2 The reference is to *M. M.*, pp. 157-159, 256.—W. F. P.
whispers and whistling were “independent,” whether when the breath came into my face or at any other time.

(4) I noted very clearly that the more strenuous of the “telekinetic” movements were accompanied by those movements of the medium’s body which generally indicate muscular effort. I was very confident, for example, that her violent start when the megaphone flew up did not follow but was contemporaneous with that “phenomenon.”

(5) When Dr. Crandon said something to the medium which made her remove my hand in hers from beside the bellbox where she had said it might rest, this to me indicated that he thought that it would be dangerous to have my hand there. I cannot believe that even had I touched the “ectoplasm” which was sturdy enough to throw a megaphone, it would have injured that substance, and suspect that the peril was a different one.

(6) Nothing apart from the mechanical contrivances presented difficulties for a free right foot with the occasional aid of a free right hand.

(7) Mechanical contrivances kept in control of the medium can never be free from doubt. Hundreds of pieces of apparatus have been invented by magicians, which have defied the inspection of committees. The voice machine, persistently pressed upon attention when there are so much simpler and surer means of showing whether or not sounds proceed from the throat, raises rather than settles suspicion.

While for the better part I present Prince’s strictures without comment, one or two remarks from me will be in order. The demonstration of the photographic exhibits to him, along with the other material on file in the Lime Street book room, might doubtless seem to him or to anyone not acquainted with Lime Street routine as a special gesture directed at him. In point of fact, every new sitter or every old sitter who comes back after a long hiatus receives precisely this immersion in the documents of the case; it is not an attempt at conversion or conviction but merely a desire on Crandon’s part to present the fullest possible information as to the current status of the case. It is usually done before the séance but when the time factor requires its complete or partial postponement until afterwards this occurs as on the present occasion. I have no doubt that Prince understood all this thoroughly but I make the explanation in the interests of insuring against misunderstanding by any reader.
Prince's last remark about "simpler and surer means" of control would doubtless suggest to most readers a personal control of one sort or another; and if this were what he had in mind, he could easily be met with the statement that the history of the case shows many occasions on which the voice has occurred under such control. But of course, the constitutional skeptic always wants, on each occasion, a different type of control from that actually used. If you hold the medium's hands he wants to know why you did not tie them and if you tie them he asks why you did not hold them; and so through the entire gamut of control procedures. The mechanical voice-control represents a studied attempt to get away from personal control, on the ground that personal control has been so seriously objected to. I would rejoice exceedingly to find a skeptic who is willing, after having eaten his cake, to reconcile himself to the fact that he no longer has it to eat.

The above paragraph, however, while entirely applicable to the skeptic whose only thought is to object to the control that he happens to find in use, does not constitute an entirely valid rejoinder to Prince's criticism; for the better control which he had in mind was not a personal one, but a different type of mechanical one. The stethoscope is a familiar enough instrument, and many others before and after Prince have wondered why it was not used in this or in other vocal mediumships. It could be applied directly to throat or upper chest and while it would not prevent fraud in the same sense as does the VCO (assuming this to be a valid control), it would give interesting returns as to the active or passive state of the medium's entire vocal and respiratory apparatus during the voice phenomena. In elaboration on this point, Prince writes: "the constitutional scientific observer desires to apply any and all feasible tests in this, as he is expected to do in all other, branches of inquiry; and particularly that test which seems simplest and most effective; rather than to be limited to a mode dictated to him."

The obvious reply to this is that the VCO is designed to prevent fraud and that it seems an entirely effective means of achieving this prevention. Any specific criticism of the VCO as ineffective has always been and will always be met by its redesign. But when the skeptic merely says without giving any bill of particulars that he doesn't like it and would rather use his hand, or his eyes, or his stethoscope, or his some other idea, Crandon invariably reacts with a metaphorical bristling and a demand to know precisely what is the objection to the VCO.
In view of its availability for test and experiment and of the completeness with which it has been described and of the accuracy of these descriptions, he feels that it may be rejected only through specific criticism; and he does not grant that its permanent presence in his house constitutes valid ground for attack upon its use.

Further, against the specific suggestion that the stethoscope be employed in its stead he points out that the use of this instrument would bring us back again to a discussion of the validity of the hand control of the Psychic. In my presence, fraudulent mediums on whom the stethoscope was being used have freed a hand from control and removed the stethoscope from immediate contact with their throats or chests, as the case were, thereby creating a condition where the "spirit voice" was unaccompanied by any stethoscopic report of vibrations in the medium's vocal apparatus. The VCO on the other hand cannot be thus manipulated, as has been emphasized on pp. 682-3 of my article in the A. S. P. R. Journal for December, 1925.

Moreover, the VCO gives a positive verdict while the stethoscope does not. By this I mean that if the float in the VCO tube drops habitually while Walter is speaking, we must conclude that the Psychic's mouth is being used normally and we have no conceivable alternative to this conclusion. But the stethoscopic control is so much less direct as to afford the following possibility of alibi:

If the stethoscope is used and if it reports a vibration of any sort in the chest or throat of the medium, the notion of the essential ambiguity of psychical phenomena which I have satirized on page 142 may be called in, much more plausibly than in the cases there outlined. It may be alleged that obviously there is some sort of psychical or pseudo-material connection between the medium's normal ensemble of brachio-thoracic functions and apparatus, and the psychical machinery for the independent voice; so that production of the latter is accompanied by a species of reflex action in the former. As evidence that this particular thesis is not wholly and inherently absurd, one might instance the behavior of Frau Rasmussen's respiration during the production of phenomena which on no conceivable theory of fraud could have any dependence upon her breathing. I do not at all insist upon this interpretation of a superficially unfavorable stethoscopic record but I do insist that I know no way of conclusively silencing the person who does advance it. Neither do I insist that all the points here adduced

---

are conclusive reasons for sticking to the VCO apparatus and refusing to use the stethoscope but I do insist that they are Crandon's reasons, and that as such they must have due respect. If not conclusive, they are at least plausible and constitute a bar against offhand damnation of the vocal phenomena on the mere ground that a stethoscopic control ought to be used and is not.

So much for Prince's one sitting of the period since October, 1924. In reply to my query as to the nature and status of the collection of adverse reports⁴ which he was alleged to have in his custody he wrote as follows:

Reply to Query 2. It is correct that reports of sittings in the Margery case have been handed me by several persons, none of whom have become known in connection with the case. The reports by two of these persons are long and detailed, and they support and agree with the reports of the Harvard Group and the Rhines⁵ in a general way so far as the phenomena were alike. There was no glass cabinet and no balances as in the Rhine sitting, and various apparatus and consequent reactions present in the Harvard sittings were absent here. One of the persons rendering a long and detailed report was certainly quite independent of the Harvard Group, as his sitting came first. The other author of long and detailed reports wrote them long before the Harvard report was made public, and I doubt if he knew anything about what it was to be—though not sure of this.

All possibility of misunderstanding Prince's position with reference to the case having been eliminated by the preceding material,⁶ and all claim having been forestalled that due attention has not been paid to the evidential values of his observation of the case, we may proceed with the chronological developments of the summer of 1925, which have rather lagged behind in the interests of the topical discussion of the present and the immediately preceding chapters.

---

⁴ See pages 479ff.
⁵ See Chapters IX, XLV.
⁶ Dr. Crandon will comment upon Dr. Prince's text above, in one of the appendices appearing as part of Vol. 2. See open reference No. 17, in that volume.—J. M. B.
CHAPTER XXII
Identifications of Personal Objects

By the Editor

From a very early date, it has been Walter's habit to use in telekinesis small objects contributed from the pockets of a sitter, or even to help himself to such objects. Occasionally he would go so far as to tell the contents of wallets, the denominations of bills, etc., etc. But he never pursued the matter systematically; and, indeed, we must deal at first with several apparently isolated and unsystematized instances of the thing which we shall ultimately systematize.

The first reference will be to the séance of April 2, 1925, in the Richardson residence, in which Walter correctly identified an object not known to be present by any other sitter than Mrs. Richardson; and followed the identification by further more or less evidential statements about this object. On April 11th, he made a deliberately staged return to this sort of thing; the record tells us:

He now invited each sitter in turn to place quietly upon the table some small object for him to identify. In this way, under double control, he examined and correctly named a brooch, a clinical thermometer, a notebook, a spectacle case, and a pair of scissors. The only thing that puzzled him was a latchkey; he could only call this a “drip,” which was partly true, as it hung from a ring or tag.

This first performance of what has now become a specialty distinguishing the mediumship came after there had been demonstration of the teleplasmic terminal, in silhouette against luminous objects; and the prima facie aspect of the identifications was that they were done by this organ, through a tactile process. The same may be said of a repetition given on April 12th (see page 60):

All the rest of the phenomena of the evening were done under constant double control: Goodall having the Psychic’s two hands,
Miss Pierce both Crandon’s hands and his head. Walter had Goodall, Miss Pierce and Brown each put a personal article on the table. He recognized Goodall’s as a watch, Miss Pierce’s as a face-powder box, Brown’s as a thermometer in a case.

Whether by the Harvard enterprise of May-June or by some less easily identifiable distraction, Walter’s attention was turned away from the matter of identifications after these three preliminary performances; and he returned to the subject only on July 26, 1926, in the Cabin séance of which the complete record appears on page 000. On this occasion, the picture was rather that he gave us the identifications because he hadn’t the physical force at command to give us anything better. And, as I state on page 000, while my control of the Psychic was irreproachable and while confederacy was made ridiculous alike by the range of sitters it would have needed and by the manner in which the identifying statements flowed from Walter, there was ample evidence that the teleplasmic tactile process was at work. The objects placed on the table were handled by something.

The identifications (which of course we must carefully distinguish from mere telekinesis of objects contributed by sitters) became now a regular part of the mediumship. They were given on August 3d and 8th, from the records of which dates I quote, and on the 14th, the record for which appears in full elsewhere.5

[Aug. 3d.] Then followed a period of identification of objects put on the table by the sitters, under strict double control of the Psychic and Crandon, together with luminous control of the hands. Every recognition by Walter was correct.

For Cotton: “A big jack-knife.” Correct, except that Cotton does not call it big. But Walter says it is bigger than most pen-knives.

For Cotton again: “Time to take the collection.”6 This statement was accompanied by many raps with the object, which proved to be a coin.

For Hill: “A bracelet, tattoo marks, leather, keys.” Correct as named. Here, however, was an extraordinary fact. Hill had on sleeves reaching quite to his wrists; but he does wear, out of sight on his right arm, a locked bracelet, and there

---
5 See p. 233.
6 This statement, as the other ones similarly given, was made by Walter in identifying the object.—J. M. B.
IDENTIFICATIONS OF PERSONAL OBJECTS

are tattoo marks on this arm. Litzelmann and Hill alone knew of the bracelet; Hill himself alone knew of the tattooing.

For Litzelmann: “It is warm, leather, a tobacco pouch.” Correct.

For Richardson: “Paper; letter; one-half—no, one-quarter—in inch long.” Correct, a sheet of Braille. Its presence in the room known only to Richardson.

For Mrs. Richardson. “A side-comb.” Correct.

[Aug. 8th.] Walter next turned his attention to the matter of identification of strange objects in the dark.

For Davis: “A nice jack-knife.” Correct.

For Hill: “Take back your paper money.” Correct; a dollar bill.

For Mrs. Hill: “A hair pin; a wire one.” Correct.

From the 14th, I need not repeat here the passages of the dictaphonic record that have to do with identifications. I do need, however, to put emphasis upon Richardson's contribution here—the deck of cards. It led to discussion with Walter, culminating in his promise to identify individual cards out of a pack. The process of selecting a card from the pack in the darkness of the séance, which is essential in the prevention of fraud by substitution or confederacy, also brings it about that when it is finally chosen and presented to Walter, no sitter knows its identity. In this fact, as well as in the immediate measures taken to eliminate fraud and in the character of the frauds that must be eliminated, the card test is so essentially divergent from the identification of personal objects that it may well be set aside for discussion in a separate chapter. The wooden letters invented by Richardson for cognition tests may likewise be set apart, for precisely the same reasons; and we then deal here only with the more personal type of identification, revolving about objects contributed by sitters. These, too, offer scope for statement by Walter of the contributor's identity or of the psychometric background of the object contributed. This he does not always undertake, nor always achieve with the same degree of success; but as we shall see, he often makes a good score, and where one or two such incidents might be explained away as the product of chance coincidence, I think most readers will find that we have too many of them for such treatment. Likewise, he now and then

7 Chap. XXIII.
8 Chap. XXVIII.
finds himself able to make some statement about an article which seems clearly beyond the knowledge of any sitter; or to deal in such fashion with the identification as to throw some light upon the problems surrounding his own personality. We have the following items:

[Aug. 27, 1925.] Of the first thing put on the table by Richardson Walter said: “I don’t care for that; it’s something like raised flowers. Take it away.” It was a Braille map of South America. Of the second article Walter said: “Those letters are too small, and besides, I have no skill at reading them. I don’t like it; take it away.” It was a book with raised letters [ordinary ones, not Braille] for the blind. Then Hill put on the table an object for identification and Walter almost at once declared it to be a pencil sharpener. This was correct. Then Litzelmann put something on the table, and Walter commented: “Open your mouth, Chief. Are you ready? It’s good.” Richardson opened his mouth and Walter put a lump of sugar in it.

[Aug. 29th.] De Wyckoff then said he was going to put a bill on the table in the dark, and asked Walter to name the denomination. He said he had many bills in his pockets, but did not know the denominations. Walter immediately named the bill as a ten. De Wyckoff then put out another bill, and Walter immediately named it as a ten also, and added: “The first is a yellowback; this one is a greenback.” This was all found to be correct.

[Aug. 30th.] Under conditions of double control, Walter told De Wyckoff the denominations of bills which he placed on the table. Dudley then put an object on the table, and Walter identified it as a “pocket book with an unusual snap to it.” Zeligzon then put an object on the table which Walter identified first as a quarter, and then added: “No, that’s a penny; a Canadian cent.” All these identifications were correct.

[Oct. 4th.] Walter then proceeded to identify objects from the pockets of the sitters. In each instance the success was 100 per cent, although for Sturtevant he said: “This thing is a case or holder; probably a thermometer.” In fact it was a pencil such as none of us had ever seen, resembling closely a [clinical] thermometer case. Asked to tell how much he used the sense organs of the Psychic, Walter replied: “You may blindfold her and stuff her ears and I can work just as well.”

[Oct. 16th.] Walter identified objects belonging to the sitters, when these were placed upon the table.
The concentration upon the glass cabinet\(^9\) now interfered with further prosecution of the identification specialty, and this is not again met for nearly three months. When it is resumed, in February, it is usually carried through under such improved conditions of control that, in the interests both of classification and of chronology, we may set apart another chapter for the continuation of the story.\(^{10}\) For the present, we may make the comment that these obviously tactile identifications depend with extreme obviousness upon the validity of the hand-control; and we may point out that Walter never attempted to make good on his suggestion of the 4th October, just above. All further comment may be deferred to the point where we again take up this thread.

\(^9\) See Chapter XXV.
\(^{10}\) See Chap. XXVIII; and following this, Chaps. XXXVIII, XXXIX.
CHAPTER XXIII
Identifications of Playing Cards
By the Editor

In the preceding chapter I have referred in passing to the presentation to Walter, on August 14th, 1925, of a deck of cards as object, in toto, for identification. Some sitter, probably Richardson, was moved to ask him whether he could identify individual cards from the deck; he indicated a desire to try it, some other time. The occasion came on the very next night, August 15th. As usual, I had stayed over, after my serious sittings, for the informal week-end gathering. The record tells the story:

It was apparent that Richardson’s more or less jocose request of the preceding night that Walter read playing cards in the dark had rather piqued Walter; for he now called for a pack of cards. A pack was handed to Brown, and on request Brown put on top of the bell-box any card which he happened to select in the dark. Walter announced the value and suit of the card, and it was handed to some particular sitter to hold. Each time, Bird made a record of the card as named by Walter, and of the sitter to whom it had been passed. At the end of the sitting Bird read his list, and each sitter produced the card corresponding to the list; in every instance Walter was correct. After the sitting Bird tried in vain to identify cards by means of a luminous head-band such as the Psychic wears.

The above record is faulty, in one respect. Describing this séance in the Journal of the A.S.P.R., Crandon says: “in this way Walter named eight cards, making no errors in the denominations of pip cards, two errors as between kings and jacks which he complained presented a tough problem, and one error as between spades and clubs.” This latter version was drawn from my own memorandum record; and aside from my general confidence in the correctness of this, I have an actual memory of the facts in the present instance. Walter did make the errors which my memorandum describes, and which are so strongly suggestive of a pseudo-visual process. As the playing-card perform-

---

1 June, 1926; p. 326.
ance began to be standardized into a regular feature of Margery’s séance room, Walter rather got into the habit of rejecting face cards, because of the difficulties which they present to him. Such rejected cards he ordinarily throws on the floor, asking for another in place of the discarded one; and this discrimination between pip cards and face cards he always makes accurately.

The present test is of interest first because of the conspicuous success which Walter scored in dealing with a new problem; and second because of the clean-cut fashion in which it points the way to a more determinative procedure. The most serious deficiency in the staging on the 15th lay, of course, in the history of the deck of cards employed. I knew nothing definite about this deck; so far as my best knowledge and belief were concerned, it was a deck that had been in the house for an indefinite time, and that had been taken upstairs by Richardson or Brown or Crandon so that we might be prepared for this test if Walter offered it. This will immediately suggest, to any person of conjuring experience or indeed to any moderately ingenious laymen, a procedure which would have been applicable on the present occasion, and which in the most general terms would be describable as follows:

The performer abstracts $x$ cards from the deck, secretes these on his person, and memorizes their value and order. The deck itself, lacking these $x$ cards, is given to the sitter who is to officiate as Brown did on the occasion just described. As he, in the dark, places random cards from the deck, one at a time, on the table, the performer must defeat the hand control sufficiently to recover his concealed cards, one by one, and substitute them for those thus handed out. A variation would consist in using an accomplice, who would hold the stacked cards and effect the substitution, while the performer remained under rigid control. At the end, after all the "identified" cards have been restored to the deck, the performer still has the cards that have been handed out during the sitting. The deck is therefore still short, and its examination must be prevented until after an opportunity has been created for the return of the missing pasteboards. Any number of cards up to $x$ may be identified; and the performer may give the completely successful reading which the method makes possible, or he may aim at a proper psychic atmosphere by introducing minor errors into some of his identifications.

Just as obvious as the trick is the prevention. Let a comparatively strange sitter bring into the séance room a new, sealed deck, with the
revenue stamp intact. Let him break this seal only in the darkness of the séance room; let him then shuffle the cards and pass them out, one at a time, for identification. Let him retain possession of the stock until after the light is given at the end of the séance; let him then determine how many cards and what cards are missing. Let the several sitters who have custody of the identified cards then return them to him; and let him at this time verify not only that these are the cards needed to restore the deck to completeness, but that they are, in pattern, etc., the identical cards from this deck. If this be done, all substitution tricks are ruled out to the point where it becomes idiocy to talk about them. And if we employ enough different strange sitters as masters of ceremonies in successive sittings, any talk of systematic confederacy between these sitters and the Psychic, under which the shuffling is only apparent and pre-arranged cards can be handed out by one who knows the way in which a new deck of cards is assembled for packing, becomes equally idiotic. As I emphasize in another place, not all the Lime Street regular and casual sitters may be regarded as confederates.

This, then, leaves open only one line of attack upon the validity of the identifications. Is it not possible for the Psychic to sense the denomination and suit of the cards by other than psychic means? Four possibilities must be considered here: normal or hyperesthetic tactile impressions gathered after hand control has been defeated; normal visual impressions in the absence of what to a normal sitter would be total darkness; and hyperesthetic visual impressions got in what the normal sitter would find to be a complete absence of light.

The most immediate deficiency of the present sitting comes in the third of these categories. The record indicates that the Psychic was wearing the usual luminous controls. It also indicates that after the sitting, I failed in the attempt to read cards by the light from such controls, worn as she had been wearing them. Subsequent experiment indicated that the reason for the failure lay in the adoption of a slightly wrong technique; it is a perfectly simple matter for one wearing a luminous head-band to get enough illumination from this on a pip card for accurate reading of the denomination and for approximately accurate reading of the suit. One cannot, so far as my experiments indicate, do much more than guess between kings, queens and jacks. This finding becomes the more serious when we realize that it checks up exactly with the errors that Walter made on his first performance. It becomes imperative to do away with the luminous
control entirely when giving identifications of playing cards; and we shall see that this became the Lime Street custom.

When this has been done, however, the theory remains open that instead of using clandestinely a source of light known to be present, the operator has fallen back upon clandestine presence and use of a light-source not known by the sitters to be there. This theory is a more complicated one, to the extent that the performer would have to defeat the hand control in order to manipulate her flashlight, small luminous plaque, or whatever other source of light she be pictured as employing; while to use the head-band she would have to do nothing more than bend her head over close to the card as it lay on the table. Provided she could produce and use effectively a light of the sort visualized by this theory, however, such procedure would be better conjuring practice than use of the head-band.

Whether she could do so would constitute a delicate question. Tricks of dark-room card-reading more or less similar in their superficial aspects to the phenomena with which we here deal are done commercially. I have not seen these under conditions which were sufficiently clean-cut to rule out one type of fraud and define in an observer's mind another type as the one under use. I am told however that these tricks are done in the presence of precautions which are completely adequate for the exclusion of confederacy and substitution; and if this be true, the use of a small secret light of some sort seems the only way out. But it is most unusual to hear the psychical skeptic proclaiming his ability to exclude substitution or confederacy or any other particular fraud; he is more in the habit of basing his negations upon his alleged inability to detect or exclude trickery.

Even if we reject the claim that the trick is customarily and successfully done in this way, however, we must be willing to consider this way of doing it as a possible hypothesis of fraud in the present connection. So considering it on its merits and inquiring what these are, we may observe first of all that it brings up the question of hand control in acute form. Certainly if the Psychic is to use a light for illumination of a playing card and if she is to prevent the other sitters from perceiving this, she must have both hands free to bring card and light together somewhere in the folds of her garments. But her sitters are much closer to her and much more nearly on all sides of her than would be the case with any commercial performer; so we may strongly suspect that her consistent use of this trick would lead rather consistently to observation of some sort suggesting to the sitters that
an unauthorized light was present. We shall note one or two occasions when observations which are interpretable in this sense were made; but I think the evidence as a whole is distinctly against the theory. I make no further or more definite comment until we shall have come to a point where the identifications are being done under a mechanical control which shall throw new security over the status of the Psychic's hands and feet during the séances.

With reference to the theory of tactile hyperesthesia, I made inquiry of the United States Playing Card Corporation. I asked them, first, whether the glazed surface was applied to the face of the card before or after the printing of the face. If before, so that the black and red ink overlies the varnish, one might suppose that the edges of the pips would be sufficiently marked to appeal to the hyperesthetic sense of touch. If after, as one would infer to be the case, there could be no rough or abrupt edges to the pips; the only pertinent question would then be whether the ink of the pips was thick enough to create a raised area the additional thickness of which might be felt hyperesthetically. The varnish would not fall quite so thickly over the infinitesimally thicker zone of the pip as it would over the infinitesimally thinner blank areas, so that the additional thickness of the printed parts of the card would be masked; nevertheless, one needs expert testimony as to its tactile detectability. Under date of May 19th, 1927, I have the following statement from the New York office of the playing card manufacturers:

Replying to yours of the 17th inst., would say that the color face printing of our playing cards is done before the varnish flow is applied. This color coating has no appreciable thickness that might be apparent to the eye or touch.

In our experience we have never known of anyone's being able to read suits or denominations of our cards by the sense of touch, with the single exception of our Braille card intended for the use of the blind. In fact we do not consider such a thing possible.

The matter of visual hyperesthesia I suppose we shall always have with us; it is most improbable that any room possessing windows and doors is absolutely dark in terms of ordinary visible light, and it is quite certain that no room above-ground within miles of a center of civilization is free from wave-lengths of the ultra-violet persuasion which might conceivably arouse a visual response in a given subject's optic nerves. For present purposes, I fear we shall have to take a
identifications of playing cards

categorical stand here, laying down this postulate: If, in a room
where normal vision gives no slightest silhouetting of bulky objects,
Margery is able hyperesthetically to read the denominations of a play-
ing card, this faculty is by definition a psychic one. There must be
some point where normally hyperesthetic sensibility stops, and super-
normality begins.

Following the performances of the 15th and 16th (p. 81) Crandon
consulted with me on the possibilities of fraud left open; and the next
reading of cards was carried out in such fashion as to eliminate these.
The date was August 18th and the record reads as follows:

He next proceeded to his presentation of the card reading.
Cotton had in his possession a new pack of cards with the Govern-
ment revenue seal intact. This pack was now opened by Cotton
in the dark, and the whole pack put in his chair under his leg.
Cotton then put one card on the table, picked at random by him
from the pack; and in about three minutes Walter announced the
value and suit. The card was now taken by Gilmore, and kept by
him; and Gerke kept the "log" showing in each instance the name
of the holder of the card and the identity of the card as announced
by Walter. Walter repeated the reading until each sitter had a
card in his possession. The card reading was done with the
Psychic in trance. There was no light of any kind visible to any
sitter in the room. When the light was put on at 10:15 P. M.
it was found that every reading by Walter was correct. Gilmore
now collected the identified cards and the remainder of the pack;
and he showed that the pack was lacking precisely the cards identi-
fied, and that with these cards each suit was complete. At the
end of the sitting the Psychic complained of ache in her eyes.
Walter says that he does not "look" at the cards in the way we
mean when we use the word, but that he sees them through his eye
plus some use made of the Psychic's visual apparatus.

Through what I am entirely convinced is oversight, the above record
fails to clarify the facts in one respect which might be regarded as
important. It will be realized that there was no prior examination
of the deck; Cotton brought it in with the seal intact, and on breaking
the seal assumed that the contents were in good order. One would,
I think, infer from the record, if one made any inference at all, that
Cotton himself had supplied the deck. In point of fact it had been
purchased by Crandon, and by him turned over to Cotton immediately

2 It is easy enough to manage this, in the dark.—J. M. B.
before the séance. It would then have been possible for Crandon to have removed the seal, abstracted several cards, and replaced the seal; after which the trick could have been done as outlined above—provided we assume another error in the record or the procedure, which would have permitted the cards in the Psychic's possession at the end to be "switched" again for those in Cotton's possession, before restoration to the deck. The point is one that is met in numerous later séances; and I think it equally significant to say that my information about the history of the deck comes from the Richardson record of August 27th; a document placed in my hands by Crandon himself. If the failure of his own record to cover the ground were other than accident, it is evident that he would not thus circulate another record that so completely covers it.

Walter's next return to the matter of card identification was on August 27th, and there were a lot of complications and points of interest, so the Richardsons went to the trouble of drawing up a full statement. This I give, rather than Crandon's less complete record:

At a Margery sitting at 10 Lime Street, Boston, Thursday evening, August 27th, 1925, an experiment was performed of sufficient importance to justify independent and isolated record.

As is well known, the phenomena occurring at these sittings have been almost exclusively of the physical type. The one here recorded belongs to that immediate domain, partly objective and partly subjective. The genesis of the idea embodied in this experiment was in the production some weeks since by Richardson of a package to be identified by Walter in the dark. At that time Walter first said that the package was a book; then corrected himself, saying that it was a box containing something.

"Cards," said Richardson, "Can you name them Walter?"

"Have a heart, Chief," said Walter.

The article was in fact a box containing a pack of playing cards. Later a pack of cards belonging to Crandon was used for experimentation in the dark, the correct identification of individual cards being made in several instances. Once subsequently a new deck, purchased by Crandon, and brought to the sitting with seal intact, was used with equal success. From that time on this form of experimentation had not been tried at these sittings, and nothing more had been said about such experimentation.

---

2 August 15th; see above, p. 292.
3 August 18th; p. 297. See, also the comment immediately above, on the history of the cards.
On Friday, August 21st, Richardson noticed in a shop window, a pack of Jumbo playing cards; and he bought them in the original sealed container. He did not mention this to any member of the group, not even to his own wife. Twice he brought this pack of cards to the sittings, done up in another package, the shape and size of which would afford no clues to what was therein. He had been accustomed to place this package under his chair when he took his place in the circle, in case an opportunity might come up to use its contents.

At the sitting here recorded, Walter suddenly made a facetious remark to the effect that it was high time that the eggs upon which Richardson had been setting should be hatched, and that he, Walter, was afraid that in the recent heat wave they would spoil. He suggested that they be brought out for experiment. Whereupon Richardson brought out the large package with some difficulty, got it open in the dark, and took out what was subsequently found to be the deck of large cards in a container. While in the dark he broke the seal and the inside paper wrapping. At random he took one of the large cards and laid it upon the table. He did not say what it was that was laid there, but remarked to Walter that he did not know whether it was right side up or not, to which Walter replied that that made no difference to him. He identified this card shortly as an unusually large playing card and as the deuce of clubs. Litzelmann was directed to reach forward and get the card and keep control of it until the end of the session. Another was brought forward and identified as the jack of spades. This was given into the custody of Hill. The next card brought out entailed some delay. Suddenly Walter said to Richardson:

“You old sinner, you thought you would fool me, did you? This is covered with printing, with the word GUARANTEED at the top”.

That card was likewise given to one of the group to keep in his possession. The process of identification went on until each person had a card in his control.

Through the entire sitting there was no light whatever. There were no luminous bands. There was no red light, and of course no white light. At the end of the session the red light was turned on, enabling the cards to be identified. Every card was found to have been correctly named, including the “guarantee” card. Each identification had been written down as it occurred by Conant, who sat outside the circle. Immediately upon the checking up of the identification, Hill took the entire deck with the container out of the séance room, where it was carefully examined by all present.
The deck was what is known as "Jumbo Bicycle" cards, manufactured by the United States Playing Card Company. The backs were red and of the type known as "rider" backs. The dimension of each card was $7 \times 4\frac{1}{2}$ inches. It comprised fifty-four cards: four complete sets of thirteen, a Joker, and the "guarantee" card, which is an advertising card. The "guarantee" card had printing on it, and the lettering of the word GUARANTEED was in Old English, and stood alone at the head of the printing. The letters were $5/16$ inch in height, and the length of the word about $2\frac{1}{4}$ inches. All of the cards which had been identified, and in addition virtually the entire fifty-four cards, were carefully examined and were ascertained to be free from any mark, embossing, scratches, or pinpricks, which would serve in any way as a guide to the sense of touch in determining the identity of the card.

Although this experiment is of the type that can fairly be said not to require rigid physical control, it may be noted that the following precautions were taken:

1. The room itself was entered before the sitting by several of the circle and no accomplice was found.
2. During this sitting the door to the room was locked on the inside in the usual way, after which entrance cannot be had from the outside because it is impossible to unlock the door from the outside as the keyhole does not go through.
3. Complete control of Margery's hands was maintained by Richardson and Crandon during the entire experiment.\textsuperscript{4a}
4. The hands of every sitter were controlled in each case by his neighbor's continuously.
5. Conant, who sat outside the circle, stayed continually in a position directly back of Hill, with pencil and paper. He was talking at intervals with Hill and the other members of the circle in such a way as to render it practically impossible for him to leave his seat and in any way contribute to the work of identification of the cards.
6. The light which was used for the first time at the close of the sitting was a new colored medium, a blend of red and orange, which excludes white rays entirely. This was still further dimmed by the intervention of red tissue paper. When this colored light fell upon the red cards which were identified, such as ten of diamonds, it was found that it virtually annihilated the red printing upon the cards, so that it was extremely difficult to identify with

\textsuperscript{4a} There was no "double control" and no check of any sort upon Crandon's control of the Psychic; so the conditions need not be regarded as adequate unless one deliberately chooses so to regard them.—J. M. B.
the normal sight the red cards until they were taken out into pure white light.

As a departure from the usual line of phenomena hitherto exhibited, and as apparently justifying a working hypothesis that there may be a super-normal power of visualization, or some sense with which we are not perfectly familiar, this incident is made a subject of record.

We, whose names are hereto affixed, hereby affirm that we were each personally present at this experiment, and that the description of the same here given is correct in every detail.

(Signed) Mark W. Richardson, M.D.
Josephine L. Richardson.

The card-identification was again a feature of the séance of August 29th. The record tells us:

The whole pack was shuffled and held by Zeliqzon. He then put one card in the dark on the table, and in about two minutes Walter declared that it was the ten of clubs. Zeliqzon then tore off a part of this card and gave one piece into the custody of a sitter. This experiment was repeated three times; and at the end of the sitting it was found that every identification was correct.

This record, of course, is deficient in that it makes no showing as to the previous history—good or bad, as the case may have been—of the cards; and none in the matter of their examination prior to the performance. The tearing of the identified card was doubtless done on the spur of the moment by Zeliqzon, under the impression that he was guarding against substitution. But the opening for substitution in connection with these identifications, as we have seen, would come earlier in the game; this marking of the cards after identification means nothing. It is interesting also to note, in this and other records, that the identification is seldom, if ever, an instantaneous process or even a rapid one. Always or almost always it is a matter, as here, of considerable time and ostensibly of considerable effort on Walter's part. The deficiencies of the preceding record are very largely made good in those of September 1st and 3rd, which I now quote to the extent of a paragraph each:

Litzelmann brought to the circle a newly bought deck of cards, showed the seal to all the sitters, and then in the dark opened the pack and put one card from it at random on the table. After about two minutes Walter named the card and it was given into
the custody of one of the sitters. This was repeated for six cards, and a record kept by Litzelmann of each alleged identification and the person in whose custody the card was placed. At the end of the sitting it was found that every identification was correct.

Coughlin had brought with him a new pack of cards, with the government seal intact. He now broke the seal and put one card at random on the table. In about three minutes Walter identified it. It was put in the custody of [J. H.] Brown and the record of identification made by Dudley. This experiment was repeated until each sitter had a card in his care. At the end of the sitting, every card proved to have been identified correctly. Dudley now put on the table an advertising page torn out of the back of a magazine in the dark. It had lain on the table for about two minutes when Walter declared the page to read: "WORLD-WIDE TOURS." This was put in some sitter's care, and another sheet, again selected by chance, put out. This was repeated four times. At the end of the sitting it was discovered that in every instance Walter had read correctly the important title words on the printed page. Walter seemed to enjoy this experiment, and kept saying: "Ain't we got fun?"

This variation of the identification experiment owes its invention to Dudley's ingenuity in following out the suggestion embodied in Walter's performance on August 27th, in reading the word "GUARANTEED." It will be appreciated that it presents the same opportunities for substitution as the card version; but that, when this possibility is excluded, the random character of the selection is equal to that with the cards; the possible answers comprise almost an infinite range instead of one of merely fifty-two elements; and the proof of validity is of precisely the same order.

For October 4th and 6th the card test was made, and on both dates the record is rather above the mean in adequacy. Again I give a paragraph to each date:

On request Walter then proceeded to try out the cognition of cards. Sturtevant had brought in a fresh pack; he broke the government seal in the dark at the sitting and put one card on the table. After about five minutes Walter named it and it was given into the custody of a sitter. This was repeated with four cards,

---

5 A total stranger, which Litzelmann of course is not.—J. M. B.
6 In darkness, as a preceding passage of the record makes clear; but a specific statement of the total absence of all light is lacking.—J. M. B.
each being given to a different sitter after being named. The sixth card occupied Walter longer, and Crandon at one time thought he saw a psychic light in Margery’s lap. Walter then said: “This is no playing card. It is a blank card with two words on it.” At the end of the sitting each identification was correct; and the last card was as described, the two words being “EXTRA JOKER.”

Walter then proceeded to read five cards picked separately from a fresh pack brought by Litzelmann and opened in the dark by Dennett. This was entirely successful. Walter now instructed Dennett to bring next time an envelope filled by another person with large-type advertisements from the backs of magazines; and Walter would read them in the dark.

The earlier of these last two records carries what some critics will regard as strong suggestion that there was clandestine use of a light by Margery. One who so holds will meet very easily the objection that the observation in question was made by Crandon himself: the light was used bunglingly, this critic will say; Crandon sensed the bungling, feared that some other sitter would see the light, and brought it up himself as the best means of allaying suspicion. In point of fact as I have said several pages back, if this fraud were being used it would seem that it ought to be observed more often and by more of the sitters than appears to have been the case; and of course, the whole question of hand-control is involved, in a way that becomes critical when we find comparable phenomena occurring under conditions which bar the raising of this question.

During the concentration on the glass cabinet and the development of techniques for sitting therein, the card identifications were temporarily dropped. When attention was restored to identification acts, after the new year, certain objections to the use of playing cards were given new consideration. These carry with them a certain inevitable atmosphere of parlor magic, making it more difficult than it should be to take seriously any act in which they are used. They are so small that control against substitution must always be a matter of some concern; and their standardized, machine-made character adds to this uncertainty. In connection with any attempt at such control, the full sealed deck must be used; making it an automatic certainty that the elements offered for identification involve merely the choice between the fifty-two known cards of the deck. There can be nothing

7 See Chapters XXV, XXVI.
spontaneous and no surprise. The disadvantages of this against a situation where the sitters may offer the most bizarre elements for identification, are evident. It is equally clear that the wooden letters introduced by Richardson, while of limited range, meet all objections; for on any given evening, an arbitrary choice may be made by some sitter, which of the letters to bring into the room. Their only drawback is their obvious and serious amenability to normal processes of touch. If the use of the Psychic’s hands can be prevented with any degree of certainty, the letters are better than the cards; if it cannot, advertising pages cut at random from magazines are better than the cards. So when identification acts were resumed in the next period of mediumship it was with these objects and with articles personally contributed by the sitters, rather than with playing cards; the history of the latter ends here.

---

8 See Chapter XXVIII.
CHAPTER XXIV

Teleplasmics in the Informal Sittings

From the Séance Records, with Comment by the Editor

To this date, it will be realized, the purely teleplasmic side of the mediumship has been reserved for serious sittings with serious investigators. The more ordinary groups have had more or less experience, it is true, with luminous silhouetting of the teleplasmic hand; but this has always been incidental to the use of the hand in telekinesis. Red-light display of masses of teleplasm, with or without an anatomical context, has not been given save to Dingwall, to Richardson and to me.

Starting late in July, 1925, after my séances of the 23rd–25th had brought this sort of thing to the highest point it had reached since Dingwall’s departure, it began to be offered more generally. The first indication of the new order, in fact, occurred on the 22nd, the night before my arrival. The record here tells us that, while Walter was manipulating the Code bell-box with its luminous plunger,¹ this plunger fell out of its seat in the box:

and Davis held it in his hand while Walter took it from him. At this moment the Psychic groaned as though hurt; and later Davis told us that he had squeezed the terminal gently as it touched his hand, showing in some way that this is connected with the central nervous system of the Psychic.

The conclusion here drawn would seem to be partially justified, since under any theory of fraud, if Davis did not recognize what he squeezed as a human hand or foot, the Psychic would probably have no means of knowing that it had been squeezed. Criticism would have to hang upon the plea that the coincidence between a squeezing or other contact of the teleplasm by human hands and the groans of the Psychic should be observed many times, and that negative observations should be made going to show that when it is not thus squeezed she does not groan while she does groan there is this or some other ascribable reason, before any conclusion so definite as the one of the above record could justifiably be drawn.

Display of the teleplasm in ordinary séances continued after my July series of sittings. Its next presentation, on the 28th, was to a

¹ See pp. 118, 123, 339, note la and accompanying text.
group which, as the record emphasizes, was one of quite unusual character. The presence of De Wyckoff, Mrs. Pierson, the Bonbrights, Dudley, Westwood and Dunipace on one evening did indeed create an atmosphere of experience and sympathy which is seldom present in Margery's somewhat heterogeneous collections of sitters. The record enumerates the sitters, and then tells us:

Walter came through almost at once, and gave a brief lecture for the benefit of those who were new sitters. He explained the size and relation of the astral body to the physical, and urged all the sitters in the light of the physical phenomena not to forget the significance of it all and its spiritual side. The triviality of the event imports nothing; its meaning we should have constantly before us. He finished by saying that he would show them various physical phenomena in red light and in darkness, and would then show in part the mechanisms involved. The group of sitters was a particularly interested and earnest one, and seemed to furnish just the right atmosphere for the production of happy results.

Thoroughly typical displays of bell-box ringing and of telekinesis of the various séance paraphernalia were then given; after which:

Under direction, the circle and those outside it gathered closer to the Psychic. Trance came on; and Walter gave us five periods of five seconds each of exposure of great masses of white teleplasm, connected by a fine cord to the right ear of the Psychic. It was seen first on the right shoulder, then down the front of the Psychic to her lap; and finally it was spread out like seaweed over the westerly end of the table-top. It then disappeared, leaving no trace. The sitting ended at 10:35; and the Psychic was then conducted, with hand control, into a lighted room by two woman sitters and there searched thoroughly with no results.

Following this display, arrangements were at once put into effect for photographing anything of the sort which Walter might again offer. This promptness bore fruit on the very next evening; and inasmuch as the sitting was given over wholly to the teleplasmic exhibit, we may present the record here in full. The date is July 29th.

Although the new visitors were having their first experience at a sitting, they have followed this case for months as printed and reported and were, therefore, more like old sitters.

Walter came through almost at once and immediately put the Psychic into trance and within five minutes we had instructions to
Plate 21. The presence of De Wyckoff at the psychic's left, and the appearance of the luminous clothespin above the cabinet (see page 165) identify this as one of the photographs taken on July 28th, 1925. Although badly out of focus, it and the following view are reproduced, to indicate the general character of the teleplasm on this date.
Plate 22. The photograph of Plate 21 is presumably the first one taken on July 28th, and this will then be one of the two later ones. The third is similar to this one in all essential features, and because of the bad focusing may therefore be omitted. It shows the psychic's head forward, with the teleplasmic stream cascading across the table.
Plate 23. These two views were evidently taken simultaneously from different quarters of the room. They are perhaps identical with the view of plate 22, or perhaps from the séance of August 5th or 6th; in spite of the inability to date them, they are included because of their excellent detail.
PLATE 24. TENTATIVELY IDENTIFIED BY DR. CRANDON AS FROM AUGUST 5 OR 6, 1925, THIS VIEW IS SHOWN BECAUSE OF ITS DISTINCTIVE FEATURES. IT SEEMS TO PRESENT A TELEPLASMIC ORGANIZATION SIMILAR TO THAT OF CHAPTER XV, BUT IN A STRUCTURAL FORM MORE LIKE THOSE OF CHAPTER XVI.
PLATE 25. TELEPLASM OF THIS CHARACTER, PRESENTED BY WALTER AS HAVING SOME CONNECTION WITH HIS APPARATUS OF SPEECH, MARKED THE DINGWALL SEANCES OF EARLY 1925 AND SOME OF THE INFORMAL SITTINGS OF LATER MONTHS. THE PRESENCE OF THE LUMINOUS CLOTHESPIN (SEE PAGE 165) SUGGESTS THAT THIS VIEW IS OF ONE OF THE LATER OCCURRENCES.
Plate 26. The same exposure as that of plate 25, but from a different angle and at a closer range.
Plate 27. The upper view is probably from one of the later Dingwall séances. The lower one appears to be a closer and better view taken at the same time as Plate 21. They are shown together to make clear the contrast between the white teleplasm with dark core and without core.
PLATE 28. View similar to that of plate 25, but not simultaneous with that one. At the psychic’s right are seen Dr. Crandon, Mrs. Richardson and Dr. Richardson; the sitter at her left is unrecognizable; the luminous clothespin suggests a date in July, 1925 or later; but no positive identification by date can be made.
give bright red light for five seconds. Then we beheld again the white teleplasm coming from the right ear and spreading down the right side of the neck. From that time on we had ten or twelve exposures to it; at times covering the face, at times spread out down as far as the groin, again hanging in strips across the face, again gathered in a mass on right shoulder. At one time her head was thrown forward on the table and the teleplasm could be seen stretched out like a beautiful white seaweed all over the table. When her head was down thus, her face was towards the east and Walter’s voice giving instructions could be heard distinctly coming out as from the back of her head. Walter said later that he wondered if anyone noticed that. We were given opportunity to take three flashlight photographs and each time three cameras were set: one with fused quartz lens, the other two stereoscopic; one on the east and one on the west. Late in the sitting the hand of each of the sitters was allowed to be put on the table and it was touched by the cool clammy teleplasmic mass.

This was quite the most wonderful opportunity we have had of viewing the head teleplasm. The substance resembles grossly many of the pictures of Eva C. in Schrenck-Notzing’s book, but the texture varies at almost every view we have of it, like lace, like soap flakes, like dough, like noodles, like seaweed, like vegetable ivory flowers.

The sitting closed at 10:30 P.M. and the Psychic gradually woke up in increasing red light.

The procedure of arranging with Walter beforehand when the teleplasmic “show” was to be given, and having the photographic contingent on hand for the occasion, continued to prevail; so the next teleplasmic session, on August 5th, was as carefully staged as the preceding one. The record tells us:

The Psychic was searched by Mrs. Richardson before and after the sitting, with negative results.

Walter came through in about three minutes and seemed to be cheerful. He said the Psychic’s nerves had been a bit jangled, which fact did not contribute toward big results. Nevertheless, in about ten minutes trance came on, Walter continuing to talk with us for purposes of “stalling.” He gave Cotton a lot of word-pictures of his [Walter’s] present surroundings, occupations, duties, etc. He said he was composing a new poem called “The Weavers.” It begins: “Oh Weavers, whose intricate design.” He

16 Lime Street slang for clearing the psychic decks for action.—J. M. B.
said it would be prose poetry. He said that last night he and his
gang, one the chief mate and the other the engineer, sat around
after we had left, swinging their legs and laughing themselves to
death. He would not tell us what they had been laughing at.
There were others in the gang that we did not know. He said he
hoped we would stick to this effort to photograph the Psychic's
voice apparatus until we got it right; it was worth doing.

He then proceeded to let us have four views, of five seconds
each, of a mass of white teleplasm on the right shoulder, connected
with the right ear. Gerke thought he could see a structure similar
to several superposed vertebrae. Then a flashlight photograph
was taken (three cameras). After that the Psychic's head went
on the table, facing east; and Walter's voice came from the back
of her head. Then in red light we saw a structure six inches high
as if made of white wax. To some it seemed as though there were
something like a mouth on top thereof.

As indicated by the record for August 1st, the above sitting and
that of the following evening were a deliberately organized attack upon
a particularly teleplasmic problem; and a part of the argument was
the use of substantially the same circle throughout. The record for
the second number in the series (August 6th) is substantially parallel
with that for the first:

At the early part of the sitting Walter had very little to say
because he was busy preparing the physical phenomena. He seemed
to be full of cheerfulness and self-confidence. At about 9:15 P.M.
he gave us our first look in red light and after that, in all, gave us
about twelve views of the teleplasmic structure. His plan is, by
consecutive sittings with the same group, to show us all the stages
in development of the completely independent talking mechanism.

First we saw a large mass, perhaps seven by four by three
inches wide, of white teleplasm on the right shoulder and chest,
apparently connecting with the right ear. Then it was seen still
there, but in addition there was apparently a separate mass on
top of the Psychic's head. Then the lower mass was seen alone
next, but it had grown and seemed to be somewhat rounded. A
photograph was then taken. After the photograph the mass be-

---

2 This was the theme of the present series of séances; see reference to August
1st, below.—J. M. B.
3 This paragraph is included, not merely in order to give the full record, but
because it is so thoroughly typical of Walter's lighter vein, as regularly displayed
during the warming-up portions of the séances.—J. M. B.
4 See p. 264.
came radiant for about three minutes, showing that it absorbed light. Then the Psychic’s head was thrown on the table and the mass was seen spread in front of her face and toward the east. It was rounded, like a white balloon or thin skull with a drapery of white vegetable ivory structures over it. A flashlight was taken. Then the Psychic sat up again and the mass was seen much bigger, perhaps six inches in diameter, on her breast bone. Both when it was on the table and again when the Psychic was erect, definite long breathing could be heard coming from the mass. The breathing was a deeper respiration than the Psychic’s snore which could be constantly heard; the two were not synchronous, and occasionally they overlapped. Richardson and Crandon successively were allowed to feel of the mass as it lay on the chest, and, as each of them felt, it seemed as though there were some soft vibratory objects more or less like lips under a soft rubbery mass. These lip-like structures kept regularly beating against the exploring hand. Richardson was then allowed to feel of the Psychic’s mouth, which was six inches above the mass just described. Another flashlight was taken.

Walter gave instructions to the same group to meet on August 12, 13 and 14 and to ask Bird for these nights. He then launched forth on a royal entertainment in the subjective way, started by certain questions. Mrs. Richardson and Hill will each send in a report of this part of the sitting.4a

In accordance with Walter’s instructions of the preceding record, the teleplasmic side now was suspended until my next visit; although something of exception to this statement might be made in behalf of the sitting of the 9th, at which the familiar silhouetting of the hand-like terminal was given with unusual freedom; the record tells us:

Walter then . . . produced in about fourteen minutes a complete visible right hand which could be seen over the luminous doughnut and finally over the coördinate board. First he made us put the handkerchief over the board because it was so bright.4b then he showed the complete hand, six by four inches, and then crumpled the handkerchief and lifted it. Mrs. Parker then suggested that he spread the handkerchief out over the coördinate board, which he did with great precision, pulling and patting it just as one would the counterpane of a bed.

4a And which will presumably not come within the scope of the present compilation.—J. M. B.
4b See final paragraph, p. 213; and other pages there cited.
My full dictaphonic notes of Chapter XVI will chronicle the action, teleplasmic and otherwise, of the sittings of the 12th, 13th and 14th. They will, I think, support the statement that the second of these sittings furnished the peak, to date, of the teleplasmic side of the mediumship. They will also inform the reader that, following exposure to four flashlights on this date, Walter on the 14th represented his teleplasmic structures as pretty thoroughly disrupted; and that it appeared to be a matter of doubt just how soon he could have them in order again. This theme ran consistently through the ensuing sittings. Thus, on the 17th, "Walter came through in about fifteen minutes and said that his force was low and directed us to leave the red light on and go downstairs for half an hour while he gathered new force. We did this, and Walter came at once, apparently with good force." 4b Again on the 18th, "Walter came in about ten minutes rather faintly and said that he had not yet fully recovered from the effects of the white light, but that if we would be patient he would get his teleplasm rebuilt in due time." On the 19th he gave a very definite picture of being engaged in the reconstruction of his structures; and I judge that the long hiatus from this date to the 27th was dictated by him on these grounds. As late as September 10th and 11th, he advanced the white-light exposure of August 13th as reason for his inability to go through with a scheduled demonstration of the vocal side of the mediumship. And it was not until October 25th that there were signs of a return to the teleplasmic displays. Even then, this return was only a partial success:

A new record was on the victrola, and Walter came through in good spirits and said he had a lot of power. He talked for a brief time, then proceeded to physical manifestations. He called for the luminous coordinate board, 5 and exhibited over it his hand, first a left and later a right; under strict conditions of double control of Crandon and the Psychic. 6 He lifted the hand up, laid it on the table as on a piano, and then directed each sitter in order to put his hand palm down on the luminous co-

4b It is perhaps not entirely clear that the whole group went downstairs, leaving the séance room empty; returning later to resume the séance.—J. M. B.
5 See page 89.
6 The reader must be cautioned, here and in many other similar passages, not to read into the text of the record any implication of the existence of tactual foot-control. Foot control throughout this period was practically never by other means than the luminous bands; and this should always be borne in mind where there seems the slightest possibility that a free foot could have produced the phenomena recorded.—J. M. B.
ordinate-board; whereupon he touched and caressed each of these hands. The feel was of intense and lasting cold. The substance of the hand was rubber-like, but it was full of sinewy strength. He caressed the heads of several, and was preparing to exhibit the hand in the red light; when he suddenly broke in: "Leave the dim light on and go downstairs quickly. Something unexpected has happened."

The séance was not resumed; and there was no further sitting in Lime Street until November 7th, the Psychic being in Buffalo and Niagara Falls for most of the interval. The records do not indicate that there was ever an opportunity to get Walter's further testimony as to just what had broken up the present séance. And the next teleplasmic display came after such a long interval, and with so much intervening history, that we shall have nothing further on this aspect of the mediumship until we come to Chapters XLI and XLII.
CHAPTER XXV
The Glass Cabinet and Wired Control
By the Editor, with Citation of the Records

Throughout the summer of 1925 there was much discussion by the Crandons and their friends as to what lessons and benefits might be derived from the Code-Hoagland episode. This discussion naturally took two directions: on the one hand it revolved about the séance-room philosophy, and on the other it dealt with specific procedures which might be profitably inaugurated. On both these heads, the experience with the young men from Harvard was turned to ultimate good ends.

The philosophy of the situation created by the Code-Hoagland procedure and their published report was sufficiently well covered in an article which I contributed to the A.S.P.R. Journal for July, 1926; and inasmuch as it is a matter of a fairly brief extract from this article rather than the complete text, I depart from the usual procedure of this volume and give in full the extract in question:

In the published history of the case, control of Margery’s extremities has always been personal—that is, by the good old-fashioned procedure of holding or maintaining contact with them. An avenue of escape from this procedure, often explored in this as in other cases, lies in the search for a phenomenon that requires no control at all. Walter has had his shot at sealed containers, endless cords, and the like. He has equally had his shot at working in a continuous and sufficient light. In neither direction has he done anything that encourages the hope of ultimate finality through such means.¹ Let us then consider the deficiencies of personal² control, and just what we might evolve to evade these.

The major deficiency lies in the fact that proof of validity depends upon our willingness to accept the controller’s words for facts of paramount import. The difficulties go deeper than at first blush appears. It is all very well to say that one who investigates seriously must select as colleagues those in whose honesty and ability he has confidence. But no such necessity rules in any other

¹ Not so true at the date of publication of the present volume as it was when written.—J. M. B.
² The term covers, of course, the use of the controller’s feet and head, indeed of any part of his anatomy that can be brought into play; not merely his hands.
field of science. The physicist, the astronomer, the head of a group of workers in any other field, is never in a position where he must accept, without possibility of appeal or verification or correction, the critical contributions of his colleagues or his assistants toward his final result. If we define psychical procedure so that this necessity arises, we violate scientific convention and repel many workers whose interest we might otherwise enlist.

For scientific work of all sorts revolves about probabilities. Every observation or inference that gains acceptance, by the individual worker or by science at large, wins credit because the probability of its accuracy comes to appear greater than the probability of its error. But psychical research deals with questions of probability whose criticality is matched in no other field. The metapsychist must consider the probability that there exists a fundamental property or faculty of space and of the human organism which science has not yet recognized; and at the same time he must deal with the probability that any particular person reporting his control is one hundred per cent accurate and one hundred per cent honest. Both these probabilities defy precise numerical determination; they involve the human equation; the emotions and prejudices must enter into any attempt to evaluate them; the procedures necessary to establish them as having been realized must be subject to violent controversy.

If Crandon is in control, and if he renders a report implying the validity of the phenomena, we expect that a certain proportion of the critics in all intellectual honesty will find it more probable that he is mistaken or even lying, than that this defiance of common experience can be. If control is taken from him and given some other person of greater detachment, the probability of erroneous reporting should take a smaller value in any fair judgment; but will it take a value small enough to overcome the probability that common experience is final? With some critics we know that it will, or at least that it may. With others, hard-won experience teaches us that it will not.

We must reconcile ourselves to the existence of a large class of people to whom life-time philosophies are so dear that no matter whom we might put in control—the President, the King, the Pope himself, the objector’s own wife or mother even—it will seem more probable that this person is mistaken or even lying, than that ordinary experience can be transcended as it is in the séance room. What better evidence of error or prevarication could one ask than willingness to testify to something that “in the nature of things” could not have occurred? I condemn such a critic only when he is
not candid enough to see and admit his bias; or when he expresses *a priori* satisfaction with my control, only to turn the other face and charge me with fraud when something happens which he had taken for granted would not happen. That is neither wise nor fair, and it should be avoided. But with the conscientious objector who honestly confesses that he regards new human testimony as more fallible than generalizations from old testimony I have all patience, even though I regard him as fundamentally wrong; and I regard it as part of the problem of metapsychics to devise procedures that will drive him from his refuge.

We have, moreover, two concrete instances in Margery’s history which teach us that this impervious skeptic, when not intellectually honest, will go so far in his determination to combat the phenomena, as to allege carelessness or even dishonesty against himself. Such a “skeptic” can be neither cured nor converted and we need seek to do neither. But we must protect the medium against him, and this we cannot do while clinging to personal control. The investigator too must today get away from this control, for his own protection; for Houdini and Code have taught us that the claim of fraud based on personal control is no more final than the claim of validity so based. Honest exercise of personal control probably gives, as Geley felt, a greater personal conviction than any substitute; but personal conviction must be sacrificed in behalf of general scientific procedure.

Now none of us likes to be shut up, or tied up; and any substitute which we may propose for personal control must necessarily be mechanical, and bring with it some degree of confinement and discomfort, mental if not physical. Margery is no freer from claustrophobic shrinkings than anybody else; and while she had always expressed a complete willingness to go to any lengths to improve the validity of personal control, she had insisted that she would never submit to being tied up or confined mechanically. But Code’s conduct added to Houdini’s stressed the danger of permitting any person in the room to enjoy a unique experience, about which he could lie or err with no possibility of correction; and personal control is nothing but a summation of such experiences.

There was a lot of philosophizing of this sort in Lime Street during the summer months of 1925, and Dr. Richardson did a lot of hard thinking about the specific problems of design for a mechanical control that should afford the maximum of rigor and endurability. The idea which he finally worked out to the point of application involved a new
cabinet, of radically different style from the old one. It was constructed during the Psychic's absence in Buffalo in October-November, and was ready for her on her return. We must first firmly fix its bare physical features.

The dimensions are six feet deep, three feet wide and seven feet high. There is a solid wooden floor, independent of the séance-room floor, hinged at the back to permit raising it in its entirety for inspection of the space beneath it, but otherwise integral with the cabinet. The roof too is solidly built of wood and solidly screwed to the corner posts. Two sides and the back are entirely of plate glass, save for these corner posts, and for wood panels dividing them into upper and lower panes, and in the case of the sides also into front and rear halves. The fourth side of the cabinet, in front, matches the others in construction, but is hinged so as actually to serve as a door; and it is provided with latch, lock and key.

It will therefore be seen that instead of three sides plus a loose cloth top, the new cabinet has six integral sides. It is a complete and self-contained box. Conceivably the Psychic could sit in it, near the front, with door open and with a circle maintained by herself and the sitters, as in the open cabinet. Equally, she could be completely locked in the glass box; and in this event, conceivably phenomena might occur inside the cabinet with her, or outside it in the room with the sitters.

There was no definite plan as to which of these alternatives would be followed; that was for Walter to decide.

What was planned, however, regardless of how the sitting might be staged in other details, was a complete mechanical control of the Psychic's five extremities. At corresponding points in the wooden panelling at the two sides are three pairs of rectangular ports, four inches by four and one-half. Each of these is provided with a cover, hinged at bottom and closing at the top with a snap-lock. At adjacent points in the top of this cover and in the wooden frame immediately above are eye-bolts, so that when the ports are closed they may be wired or sealed. Each port-cover is fitted with a chain that prevents its falling open past a horizontal position; and when they open, they open outward. The reader who is a bit ahead of the story will visualize the Psychic's hands as emerging from these ports. It will be equally clear that she may sit in a forward, central or rear position in the cabinet, and let her hands project through the corresponding pair of ports.

A word of description and discrimination will here be necessary for
most of my readers, revolving about the technical distinction between eye-screws and eye-bolts. We are all familiar with eye-screws—screws with a metal eye for a head, so that after they are screwed into place a wire or cord may be passed through this eye for the suspension or fastening of some object. The term eye-bolt involves something a little different, which I can best explain by dealing with the present particular case rather than with the general one.

Picture an ordinary screw-eye, but with straight shank like a bolt instead of tapering shank like a screw. Picture a hole bored through a wooden member of any sort, and the eye-bolt passed through this hole and projecting considerably beyond it. Picture the hole as sufficiently larger than the eye-bolt to permit the latter to turn freely in it. Picture now a nut threaded upon the projecting end of the bolt, and screwed down close to the wood but not in actual contact therewith, so that the bolt with its nut are still free to rotate as a unit. Picture finally a process analogous to the heading down of a rivet whereby the threaded end of the bolt which projects beyond the nut is bashed down upon this nut so that the latter may no longer be screwed off. The bolt and nut, considered as a unit, may still be rotated in their hole: but further than this, they constitute a single member, quite inseparable. This member may be freely turned in its hole but cannot be withdrawn therefrom; and one may twist and turn on the exposed eye as long as one will, nothing will happen but this same harmless and aimless rotation of the bolt in its seat.

Suppose the wooden member in which this bolt were thus secured to be one of the outer boards of the cabinet. Picture now another board about to be placed face-to-face on this, to serve as the inner lining of the cabinet. If we will bore or chisel a circular counter-sunk hole part-way into the inner board at the point where this overlies the nut of the preceding paragraph, the latter will fit into this counter-sink and will maintain the ability to rotate. And we now reach the point where I may make the specific statement that the eye-bolts in Margery's glass cabinet are thus patterned and thus inserted. It is a tricky and expensive job, but when it is done we have this assurance: the eyes, which to the casual gaze look as though they might so easily be screwed out of place, can be rotated in their seats forever without in the least degree coming out or coming loose. If you want to remove one of these eye-bolts, you must destroy the encircling wood-work.

Now the primary purpose of the glass cabinet is to provide a means of lashing the psychic for control of all extremities in such fashion
Plate 29. General view of the upper half of the glass cabinet, with the medium lashed in place. The reflections from the glass panels are confusing but the psychic's position inside the cabinet and the relation of the hand tie to its environs will be clear.
that no rational claim can be advanced in behalf of the possibility of her escape. The general necessities in this connection will be clear if one will read my accounts of my sittings with Evan Powell and Nino Pecoraro. It will there be seen that wide separation of the medium's hands; the use of a separate length of rope (or wire) for each point of tying; avoidance of any turn of rope (or wire) that passes about the medium's body or about anything superfluously; and a stretching of the medium's extremities to the greatest possible extent, constitute the fundamentals of this game. Also it will be understood that the medium quite possibly possesses strength to break out of any bonds which we may dare impose upon him; and that our task is not so much to prevent this, as to be very certain that escape could not be gained in such fashion as to leave the bonds intact against his subsequent reentry into them.

The eye-bolts which I have described in the panelling outside the cabinet and adjacent to the ports provide the points of attachment for the hands. When these are properly moored to the eye-bolts in question, the protruding shelves furnish support for them, so that the discomfort of having them hanging in air, supported only by the lashings about the wrists and dragging down on these with their entire weight, is avoided. The points of attachment for the feet are similar eye-bolts, a pair of which is set, about eight inches apart, in the floor of the cabinet at each of the three positions. The means of lashing contemplated in the plans and employed continuously since the glass cabinet has been in use is No. 3 picture-wire of the ordinary multi-strand type. This, as everybody knows, is soft enough to be easily tied by hand and cut with scissors, but will not stretch appreciably under any ordinary load and presents a high tensile strength against breaking. This wire of course could not be put, bare, about the medium's wrists or ankles without cutting her. Accordingly flexible rubber tubes are provided, of diameter somewhat less than a quarter-inch. A pair of these is carefully cut to a length slightly less than the circumference of the Psychic's wrists, and another and longer pair is similarly made for her ankles. The wires are threaded through these; then, at the point where the two ends of the rubber fail to meet in passing about the wrist or ankle, one may tie the bare wire into a hard knot.

The usual procedure in lashing Margery into the cabinet is to take

---

3 My Psychic Adventures, Chapter X; Scientific American, February, 1924.
a fresh piece of wire for each wrist and ankle, cut on the spot from the roll by the person who is to do the tying. This is cut, by approximate measure, long enough to pass around the member in question, to be tied into a secure knot, and to leave projecting through this knot ends long enough to pass to the appropriate eye-bolt and be again tied. The exact procedure of the tying, of course, varies with the individual doing it. Always the wire is cut, threaded through the rubber tubes, and tied on the wrists and ankles in the full normal electric light of the bedroom. These bracelets and anklets the Psychic then wears into the séance room, and the second part of the tying is done there, after she takes her seat in her chair in the cabinet. Some sitter's make a workman-like job of this; others do not. Some hesitate to draw the wire from the wrist to the eye-bolt as tight as it can be drawn; others do not. Obviously no generalization can be made covering anything beyond the means provided for the tying; plus the fact that in my presence the Psychic has always encouraged the tightening of these wires to the utmost, and more than once has insisted that they are not tight enough. The tendency of sitters of course is to tie the ankles as tight as the wire will go, and to slack off a bit on the wrists. Experiment with a sitter has made it clear that the presence of heels gives an alarming degree of freedom to the wired feet; the feet can be scrouged over sideways, and the full height of the heel at once and automatically becomes slack wire. Not as a result of this experiment, but always from almost the beginning, Margery invariably goes into the glass cabinet in stockinged feet. Not all movement of the feet can be inhibited; no matter how severely one pulls on the wire before tying it, automatically the feet may to some degree rotate about their eye-bolts as a pivot. With reference to the hands, I can say most emphatically that I have on occasion tied them so that they could not be retracted into the cabinet through the holes, from their normal wired position outside on the shelves. I have not always been able, even with Margery's keen cooperation, to tie them equally well—the wire is not quite as manageable as one would like and complete success in tying the wrists depends upon small variable factors that one cannot readily isolate. We must therefore be rather dependent upon the verdicts of the immediate observers as to the satisfactoriness of the hand control on any given occasion.

In the glass cabinet as originally designed, a soft cloth collar was provided for head control; this was secured by wire or cord to an eye-bolt in the ceiling. Cleats on the cabinet floor make it difficult
Plate 30. Enlarged close-up of the hand-tie in the glass cabinet. The lead seal here used was abandoned at a rather early date in favor of knots in the wire. This picture was taken after the psychic had been wired in the cabinet for one of the first sittings held therein.
but of course not impossible for the Psychic’s chair to be shifted during the séance. This is of minor importance, however. A shift could not be thought of as giving any freedom with hands or feet, wired to fixed points as these are. It might give some freedom of the head. But even this is doubtful. In the original design, just described, a forward shift to bring the head nearer what will ultimately be found to be the theater of action would tighten the head control; in the later design for head control to which we shall come, a backward shift would alone be possible, and this would take the head away from that theater.

This seems to complete the description of the glass cabinet as a physical factor; a full set of photographs is given to supplement the printed word. The manner of use, the conditions surrounding phenomena, etc., are sufficiently variable so that they can be taken account of only from séance to séance.

The new cabinet was introduced to Walter in two sessions on November 7th and 8th which were so very informal that no record was made of the sitters present. Crandon’s memorandum tells us merely:

On the Psychic’s return [from Buffalo] there was a sitting November 7th and another November 8th. These sittings were in no way official, but involved a try-out of the new plate-glass cabinet devised by Richardson and donated by Dennett. Walter’s first comment was “Another box!” But as he proceeded he seemed to like it, and said that it would be particularly favorable for the development of complete apparition. He said the trouble, if any, was that he would get too much force in it. This seemed to be confirmed by the fact that he frequently ordered the glass door to be opened; and when it was open a crack he would push it violently open to about ninety degrees with a force estimated at thirty-five pounds. He had no difficulty in reaching his terminal out through the small hole in the front door and ringing the bell-box. The first official test of the new cabinet was set down for November 9th.

The record for the 9th gives considerable space to a description of the cabinet. In so far as concerns matters which we have not already covered, it tells us that all the ports were sealed except the two in which the Psychic’s hands were wired and the one in the front door. The Psychic sat in the forward position. In place of tying the wire

4 The word applies to Richardson’s program of sitting.—J. M. B.
5 As this remark indicates, after Richardson’s design was complete, Dennett paid for the construction of the new cabinet.—J. M. B.
ends to the eye-bolts, these ends were passed through lead seals of the sort used on freight-car doors; this procedure in fact lasted for some weeks. The Psychic wore low shoes into the cabinet with luminous bands that went over the instep and under the bottom of the shoe. This of course would prevent the removal of a shoe without detection, since the band of light was partly on the shoe and partly on the stocking; to which latter, the record tells us, the bands were tightly sewed. The record goes on:

Walter came through quickly. One of the first phenomena was a loud push of the door, which had been held partly open in order to hear Walter's whisper. The door having then been closed, there was considerable movement of the unlighted megaphone, which had been placed inside the cabinet at the Psychic's right. Then without warning the Psychic said that Walter was trying to take off her shoes, which he did in a very short time, ripping off the luminous bands. The door having been partly opened, Walter placed the shoes in succession in the opening, whence they were removed by Richardson.

Walter said he was having considerable difficulty from two factors. First the closed cabinet concentrated one kind of force in such fashion that he could hardly control it. In fact, he was afraid he might break the cabinet to pieces. There was also a second factor, which prevented his doing fine work such as picking up small objects. As regards the first factor, often when the door was partly open it would be swung forward with a good deal of force. In fact once when Richardson tried to shut the door he had considerable difficulty in overcoming this force.

As regards levitation of objects, the luminous doughnut was placed in the opening of the door for a considerable period of time without Walter's being able to pick it up. Finally, however, after about an hour's interval, he drew it into the cabinet but it fell immediately upon the floor. Later he was more skillful and each sitter had the following experience. He was told to take the illuminated doughnut in his hand and hold it through the opening of the door inside of the cabinet. In this position, Walter bent the doughnut back and forth, tapped on it with his finger and at times touched the hand of the sitter with his terminal which felt soft, boneless and rather cool. Finally, in each instance, Walter succeeded in grasping the doughnut and carried it in beautiful circles all over the anterior portion of the cabinet. The excursion of the doughnut often times reached as high as the Psychic's head and seemed to go slightly back of her head. Finally in one instance,
the doughnut was passed out of the right lateral opening and fell upon the floor.

Walter then called for the large megaphone but when it was introduced into the cabinet it was so bright that it made him very angry. His tone of voice was very sarcastic and he seemed to think that we should have known better than to put such a bright object in the cabinet. This megaphone was therefore removed and replaced with a paper megaphone which had less bright lines on it. This megaphone gave Walter a great deal of difficulty. He could not seem to grasp it and he was not able to levitate it. Later in the evening, however, the brightness of the big megaphone having been diminished it was placed in the cabinet. Walter raised it to the level of the Psychic’s head, carried it in all directions forward and backward and finally dropped it on the floor. This he did two or three times in succession. During this and most of the other phenomena the door was locked. During all of these levitations both Crandon’s hands were held by Mrs. Richardson. Under these circumstances, of course, the Psychic’s free hand was still controlled by the wire fastenings.

About 11:30 P.M. the sitting ended. Immediately with the aid of white torches the wire controls of the Psychic’s feet were examined and found to be intact. As a result of her experience, Walter predicted that there would be found considerable swelling of the hands and legs as the wire cut into the flesh quite a little. Such was the case. The wire hand controls were then examined and found to be perfect as was also the bandage on the head. The wire controls were then cut and preserved for future reference. The seals on the unused doors were examined and found to be intact. This sitting, therefore, showed that even though the Psychic’s extremities and head were under absolute control, Walter with his extra terminal was able to levitate not only an illuminated paper disc, but also a large and quite heavy megaphone. Of course during all these phenomena Walter’s terminal could be seen against the brilliancy of the illuminated objects. During the major part of the sitting the Psychic was in trance and her snoring could be heard even outside the cabinet. The loop of bandage around her neck seemed to choke her to a certain extent and although the sitters became somewhat worried Walter said not to mind, that he would take care of it all right.

6 The rubber tubing was an afterthought, introduced in view of this experience. It not only protected the Psychic, but enabled the wire to be drawn much more satisfactorily tight.—J. M. B.
The practice of putting the Psychic in trance for the glass-cabinet sittings became almost at once standard. I am very confident that this is done to make her oblivious to the presence of her bonds; since the phenomena given in the glass cabinet are in large part the same as those given in the old cabinet, without trance. That she could go through a major part of an hour in the glass cabinet with the wire controls, in full consciousness, I wholly doubt; the trance however is a convenient means of making the control tolerable, and at the same time making possible its application with a rigor that one would hesitate to employ with a conscious subject.

There was no intent to confine the mediumship to the glass-and-wire control or to the phenomena obtainable therewith; but this theme was pursued to the exclusion of all else for some time. In many ways the new procedure was experimental, and subject to revision from night to night. But it was taken as a matter of definition that the new control replaced rather than supplemented older techniques. We come finally to sitters who feel that they need the luminous-band control in addition to that of the wires, as added guarantee of the integrity of the latter. Since this demand means a coupling of two mechanical controls and not a mixing of the mechanical and the personal, we shall find that when made it is usually granted; but for the present it was not made and the desirability of the combination did not occur to Crandon. The protective rubber tubing was not used on the 9th, as we have seen, but was on the 11th as we shall see in the next chapter; whether it was used on the 10th is not indicated in the record for that date, with which we close this chapter:

Trance came on while the light was still on and before the circle was formed. This followed the complete tying up of the Psychic’s five extremities, as described in the sitting of November 9th, namely, with wire and lead seals and a halter for the head. Examination of the Psychic’s mouth was made after the tying up and was negative. Mrs. Richardson superintended the dressing of the Psychic which consisted of a single garment.7 8

---
7 Plus stockings.—J. M. B.
8 A hostile critic has inquired, on reading this chapter whether Crandon is ever searched, as well as the Psychic; if not, what is to prevent his passing apparatus to her after the session is under way. The very charge here contemplated is brought later, as part of the necessary mechanism of fraud in the glass cabinet, by all adverse critics. Crandon is not searched nearly so often as the Psychic, but occasionally this privilege is afforded the male sitters. So far as his confederacy of the sort indicated is concerned, there are of course many occasions when he is absent, or present and effectively insulated.—J. M. B.
Plate 32. Specially posed photograph, showing the routine arrangements for head-control in the glass cabinet. Taken after the substitution of the leather collar for the cloth bandage; see page 331. The difficulty of lighting the inside of the cabinet for photography through the glass sides explains why this view was posed rather than taken in connection with a séance.
Under these conditions then the glass door was closed and after a few words of greeting Walter said "two new reporters present. All is lost." Under instructions Gerke held a luminous doughnut about six inches through the front door hole (4 x 4½ inches). Walter fiddled with it for a few minutes and his terminal could be seen touching the doughnut. Then he took it gently from Gerke's hands and waved it all about in the cabinet, up to the ceiling and as far as eleven inches back of the plane of the Psychic's head, and finally thrust it out through the right-hand frame hole of the cabinet into the hands of Crandon and Barnes.

This experiment was now repeated complete for Flynn; that is, he held the doughnut through the hole in the door. At this time the doughnut was levitated in all about four minutes. Through the hole in the doughnut could be seen the blunt knobby end of Walter's terminal protruding about two inches. The doughnut at one time fluttered against the door-glass; and then, on request, Walter rapped on the glass with his terminal, with an end projecting through the hole.

Crandon was now instructed to hold the Scientific American bell-box in through the partly opened doorway and to put the luminous doughnut on the flapper. This was done and Walter proceeded to ring the bell repeatedly, his terminal being visible on the doughnut as he pressed down the flapper.

The large luminous megaphone was now put in the cabinet and the door closed. The megaphone was promptly levitated with great skill and nicety, and wandered about like a huge fish in an aquarium. It was finally lifted over vertically directly behind the Psychic's head and was then laid horizontally on her left arm and was then thrown over her head to the back of the cabinet.

Later Conant was instructed, by Walter, to crawl into the cabinet on the Psychic's left to get out the megaphone, because the light on it disturbed the force. Walter said that at that time he was standing at the Psychic's right, out of Conant's way.

He then played a lot with the door, opening and shutting it. Gerke had hung a paper doughnut, ten inches in diameter, like a Christmas wreath inside the cabinet door. Walter proceeded to tear this apart in one place and then allowed a red flash light to be turned on to show it. At this moment of flash, which was repeated, Barnes observed a white mesh, apparently teleplasm, over the Psychic's face in trance.
CHAPTER XXVI

A New Procedure of "One-Man Sittings"

From the Séance Records

Emphasis has just been put upon the fact that in starting the use of the glass cabinet, no set rules were laid down beforehand. Alike on Walter's part and that of the sitters, the procedure was visualized as wholly experimental. The séance of November 11th saw the inauguration of an experiment of sufficient distinction and importance to merit a special chapter. Those present were Richardson, Flynn, Barnes, Crummy, Miss Conklin, Dudley, Conant, Gerke and Crandon. Flynn is a well-known free-lance writer, who was present on a tentative assignment to write the case up for Collier's Weekly, if he found it sufficiently interesting for that purpose. Barnes was a regular member of the staff of the Brooklyn Eagle on similar assignment. Barnes's story appeared in the Eagle for December 27th; and Flynn had at least three articles in Collier's, during 1926, on this case and on mediumship in general. We may let them tell the story of the present evening:

I proposed that in order to rule out all question of help from either Crandon or any other sitter, some measures be taken toward that end. The Psychic suggested a one-man sitting with no one in the séance room but herself locked in the cabinet, and me outside. Crandon advised a preliminary sitting of the Psychic, the doctor, Richardson and myself to ask Walter's counsel.

Walter's voice came through promptly. He directed that the Psychic be locked in the new glass cabinet and that I stand outside the cabinet, all lights out. The doughnut was to be in readiness. The door of the séance room was to be left open, with the hall lights out and the other persons in the hall so that they might witness the sitting from that point. I was directed to listen to Walter's instructions. He would, as he announced, "run the show." The doctor was instructed to remain out of the room. The circle was then broken.1

1 Several persons on reading proof of this have felt that the sequence of events was not clearly indicated; and have wondered whether it were not possible for Crandon to pass a reaching rod or other apparatus to the medium in the interval of more or less confusion suggested by the words: "the circle was then broken." This statement in point of fact applies to the end of the informal conference sitting with Walter. The sequence was that they all sat down in old-fashioned style in the open cabinet and chatted with Walter about the evening's plans. This pre-
After this the Psychic was lashed in position in the new glass cabinet. I witnessed the putting on of the wire controls. These consisted of stout picture-wire carried through rubber tubing to protect the Psychic's skin. One was securely fastened around each wrist and each ankle. These wire bands were then fastened to wire staples screwed into the floor and into the slots for the hands in the side of the cabinet as already described in minutes of preceding sittings. These wires were sealed with lead seals. I personally inspected in white light all of these fastenings and saw that they were secure. The Psychic's head was controlled by a band of surgical tape around the neck and carried taut to the ceiling, where it was fastened to a staple. During these proceedings, which were carried out by Gerke in my presence, Crandon was on the floor below.

The door of the cabinet was then locked, the phonograph started by Gerke and the room cleared of all persons save myself. The door of the séance room was left open and was guarded by Barnes. Other sitters were reported in the hall. The doctor was brought upstairs and reported in the hall outside the séance room.

At this time I was in the séance room alone, with the Psychic locked in the cabinet, lashed as described to the controls. I sat in front of the cabinet with the luminous doughnut in my pocket. I then put out the red light.

Walter came through very promptly. After a brief period he asked for the doughnut which I put through the slot of the cabinet door. Within half a minute I felt Walter's terminal tapping the doughnut and then saw it moving over the surface of the doughnut. Then he passed the terminal across my fingers. I then saw the terminal floating through the hole in the doughnut and then Walter commanded me to "let go." The doughnut was lifted from my fingers and floated gracefully around the cabinet. It soared a foot or eighteen inches over the Psychic's head and around the outer limits of the cabinet close to the glass. While this was going on the regular séance in the glass cabinet under way were gone through, quite as though the group had only now come upstairs. Indeed, page 326 makes it clear that the Psychic was searched; and page 325 carries several statements showing that Crandon was sent downstairs and kept there during the preparations that now ensued for the formal séance. If only there were a clean statement placing this search between the informal and the formal sittings, the critic would apparently be left with no leg to stand on. As it is, as the price of maintaining the oblique hypothesis, the informal séance itself and not the interval following it must be pictured as the occasion for guilty passing of apparatus from Crandon to the Psychic, and the search of the latter must be placed prior to the informal sitting.—J. M. B.
the Psychic, in obedience to Walter's instructions, began to count. She counted in an audible voice with clear articulation up to fifteen, when her voice faded out. Up to this time she had not been in trance, but when she reached fifteen her voice became faint. Afterwards it appeared that she had been put into trance at this point.

After a graceful, sweeping levitation of the doughnut, it fell to the floor. Walter directed me to open the door and pick up the doughnut. I did, placed it on the little shelf in the front door slot and locked the door.

Walter then said someone else might come in for a repetition of the one-man sitting. Barnes applied as a candidate. He then took my place at the cabinet while I retired from the séance room and guarded the door.

I should add that before the Psychic entered the cabinet, Miss Conklin reported that she had examined the Psychic when she undressed and before entering the dressing gown in which she sat and reported that the Psychic had nothing concealed on her person.

[Signed] JOHN T. FLYNN.

Barnes made his statement with Flynn's before him, apparently, and avoided a duplication of effort. He tells us:

During the time that Flynn occupied the stool in front of the glass cabinet, I guarded the door and can vouch for the fact that during this period no one entered or left the room. Crandon stood in the hall near the door and grasped my arm during most of this period. We conversed from time to time during the period.

When Walter requested that some other person take the stool before the cabinet I volunteered and took the stool. Flynn retired.

I asked Walter what I should do. He requested me to place the paper disc inside the cabinet (holding it in my hand). After the usual intermission Walter grasped the disc and, as formerly, levitated it about the room. Walter then thrust the disc through the opening on the right side of the cabinet. I failed to discover what had happened to the disc. Walter asked for Richardson, whom I called. Richardson presently explained to me that Walter had thrust the disc through the opening.

[Signed] RALPH W. BARNES.

The record for this date may be completed by the testimony of Richardson, who makes the following statement:

---

To demonstrate that her mouth was not engineering the levitation.—J. M. B.
During levitations of the luminous doughnut in the glass cabinet I was in the hall, holding Crandon's hand. After Flynn and Barnes had had their tests, I took my place before the opening in the front door. At Walter's request, I put the doughnut into the opening; and after a short period of bending and tipping, Walter's terminal grasped it and waved it gracefully in all directions, mostly in front of the medium. Finally, on request, Walter dropped the doughnut into my hand, within the door, from a height of at least a foot.

[Signed] MARK W. RICHARDSON.

The procedure of "one-man sittings" thus spontaneously brought into being was recognized as an admirable one, and was continued on November 13th. The record for this evening reads:

For now the fourth time 2 the one-man sitting was repeated, under the strict conditions of lashed control of the Psychic. All her extremities were controlled in the manner already described in the last three sittings. Then Osborne was left alone in the room. All others, controlling each other, stood in the doorway. Osborne handed the luminous doughnut in through the hole in the locked front door of the plate glass cabinet. He then reports, and all of us in the doorway confirm the fact, that the doughnut was seized by an obvious black-appearing terminal and was levitated as high as the ceiling in the cabinet over behind the Psychic's head to right and to left, in graceful curves for a period covering four minutes. This was then repeated for Franchois; and after this on request of Walter the luminous megaphone was put in the cabinet, the door closed and it then went through all its usual beautiful gyrations from front to back like an angry fish and was finally thrown over the Psychic's head to the back of the cabinet.

The VCO machine was then brought in, tested by Osborne, the tube passed through the hole in the door, the special tube put in the Psychic's mouth and then the door closed and locked. After a few seconds the Psychic blew up the luminous floats to an extreme degree of disparity, whereupon Walter spoke and whistled freely, saying to Franchois "How's that, you son-of-a-gun?"

This ended the phenomena for the evening, but Walter went on to talk in his usual modest way on the topic that he didn't know everything and that the opinions he expresses are only the opinion of one man; that you may get as many pictures of the fourth plane as there are discarnates to tell about it.

---

2 Counting the Barnes and Flynn episodes of the 11th as two, and the present experiments by Osborne and Franchois as two more.—J. M. B.
The record for the 14th shows some tendency to take the physical arrangements for granted—a tendency into which Crandon ultimately fell completely, after a temporary rally. The range of phenomena in the glass cabinet was increased by at least one number, as the following record for this date indicates:

Walter came through promptly and greeted each one. The Psychic had already been lashed with the wires and sealed as she has been every night of this week. The controls were declared faultless by all strangers present after personal examination. Walter then proceeded to give a one-man sitting for Judge Foss, and again for Wilcox; and during this time all the others were accounted for in the doorway but kept out of the room by one person.

After this the big megaphone was put into the cabinet and levitated and finally lifted high above the Psychic's head and dropped behind it. During the doughnut levitation, Judge Foss reported it as five feet ten inches from the floor and at least two feet behind the Psychic's head at times.

The VCO machine was then brought in, and the sole tube was handed in to the Psychic, after its patency was proved by Judge Foss. The door was then closed, the Psychic blew up the machine, and while it was in a condition of disequilibrium Walter talked and whistled freely.

At Walter's request then, we moved to the old cabinet and he talked at some length with the sitters along his usual ethical lines. The sitting closed at 10:10 p.m. and all sitters agreed that they were willing to sign the minutes.

For November 15th there was a presentation of the glass cabinet to some of the older friends of the mediumship; and there resulted a séance record carrying the signatures of all present. To some degree it duplicates what we have already had, but we have just criticized Crandon mildly for failing to do this very thing. We may therefore give it in full:

Walter came through in one minute, the Psychic being lashed with wires and seals as before. The lashings were examined by all and pronounced satisfactory, whereupon Walter proceeded to give his one-man sittings and levitations for Murray, for Dr. Brown, and for Mr. Brown, all others being in the corridor at the time. The following notes were then drawn up with the signatures as here recorded.
We, the undersigned, hereby certify that the following is a true account of what took place on the evening of November 15, 1925, at the home of Dr. L. R. G. Crandon, 10 Lime Street, Boston, Mass., between the hours of nine and ten p.m. The medium having removed all clothing in the presence of a lady and robed only in a kimono, stockings and slippers was subjected to the following control.

Loops of picture wire passed through rubber hose (to prevent injury or discomfort to the skin) were knotted on each wrist and ankle with fast knots drawn so tight that withdrawal of the hands and feet or any of these was found to be impossible by test.

The medium was then seated in a glass panelled cabinet, the only openings to which, apart from the door, were hinged portholes about six by four inches in size and a similar opening in the glass door. The ends of the wire were then, in each instance, passed through the eyes of eye-bolts firmly fastened to the floor and sealed with lead seals in respect to the ligatures of the ankles. The hands having been thrust through the openings at either side, the wires binding the wrist were likewise sealed through similar eye-bolts on each side of and outside the cabinet. The head of the medium was then held in an immovable position by a soft bandage tied in a fast knot behind the neck and this attached to the ceiling of the cabinet.

The medium was then examined in white light by each of the sitters and the ligatures found fast, intact and prohibiting motion in any direction by either the limbs or head except within a radius of three or four inches. The door was then closed and all, except one of the sitters, left the room but remained standing in the doorway in such a position that the cabinet was in sight of all. The single sitter remaining in the room passed an illuminated paper ring into the cabinet, which was thereupon seen to be raised inside the cabinet to a height of above five feet, to pass to the right and left of and finally completely around the medium, the door being closed.

Later the circle being formed and manual control maintained, the door was opened and a large illuminated megaphone was placed

3 Relatively, of course, not absolutely; and much more nearly immovable in the fore-and-aft sense than in that of sidewise swaying. Again, since the control is applied to the neck, movement of the head by pivoting at the neck is always possible, and could in fact be prevented only by a rigid hold of some sort upon the forehead zone.—J. M. B.

4 It is of course often possible, in the dark, by waving a luminous object back and forth in simple curved arcs, to give the illusion that a complete circular motion is present. The record in the nature of the case can do no more than record, or imply, the sitters’ conviction that such was not here the case.—J. M. B.
within the cabinet and was seen to be raised and made to pass around the medium in the same manner as the ring had been.

The circle of all of the observers being again formed and manual control of the hands of the Psychic being maintained, the tube of the voice control machine was inserted through the opening in the door. The illuminated floats were seen to remain in position. The wires controlling the hands and feet and the bandage restraining the head continuing in the same position as above stated. While the floats maintained a position in the tubes showing no escape of the air pressure the voice of Walter was heard and recognized and carried on a considerable conversation and at intervals indulged in a whistled obligato with the phonograph record.

At the conclusion the wires and bandage were again carefully examined in white light and found with the knots and seals intact and bearing no indication of having been tampered with. This account was thereupon immediately prepared and signed by us as soon as drawn up.

Signed: WENDELL P. MURRAY.
E. W. BROWN, M.D.
J. H. BROWN.
J. FRED ADLER.
R. H. GERKE.
K. E. BROWN.

The next séance was three nights later; and again the glass cabinet was featured, with the one-man procedure applied to two more sitters who had not previously enjoyed this. The record:

Séance at 10 Lime Street, November 18th, 1925. Present, to left: B. Eddy, Bishop, Kent, Mrs. B. Eddy, Marshall, Miss Seabury, Gerke, Crandon. Walter came through promptly, greeted the newcomers in his characteristic jocular manner, and gave a little sermon on the necessity of our understanding the meaning of these sittings; that they are no good to anyone unless they signify the existence of psychic force apart from any question of spiritualism. He added: “You may call me a secondary personality and hypnotic impersonation, or an exterior motivation. I will not complain; only report honestly what you see and the conditions thereof.”

He then proceeded to give a one-man sitting to Eddy and Bishop in succession. The Psychic was submitted to the usual wire lashings and head control. The glass cabinet was closed, there was no one in the room but the one sitter. The presence of
all the others in the corridor behind him was attested by Bishop and at the second experiment by Eddy. Under these conditions, Walter took the luminous doughnut from the hand of the solitary sitter, levitated it all about throughout the inside of the cabinet, and then handed it back to the sitter. All those standing in the doorway could see the luminous levitation. Then all filed in and stood in front of the cabinet. Eddy put the big luminous megaphone in the cabinet; door was closed. Crandon and Gerke were accounted for. Under these conditions, Walter levitated the big megaphone which cavorted around like a fish in an aquarium. During all these experiments the Psychic was in deep trance. Apparently Walter was able to get force from an entirely new group.

The VCO machine was now used in the glass cabinet. Walter spoke and whistled freely when the Psychic’s mouth was fully occupied by the tip. The tip was observed before and after to be in her mouth. Then under instructions we all moved over to the old cabinet and Walter did the ringing of the bell-box while it was held high by Bishop in good red light in the presence of all. Bishop and Eddy put their hands all about the bell-box as it rang intermittently high in the air. Bishop turned round 360 degrees, but the phenomenon nevertheless continued.

The preceding record is of considerable importance, but comment upon and demonstration of this will have to go over until Chapter XXIX; for the development to which the November 18th procedure points was postponed, owing to the immediate concentration during December upon the one-man performance. I may in fact give without further comment the four following records:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, December 8, 1925. Present, to left: Cotton, Dudley, Newman Gray, Crandon. Before the sitting Cotton tied the loops on hands and ankles with square knots, using number three picture wire. The Psychic then entered the glass cabinet and Cotton tied the loose ends of ankle and wrist wires through the eye-bolts and sealed the loose ends with lead seals. He then fastened the head by a piece of heavy twine to the eye-bolt in the roof, coming down to a leather collar which he locked on the Psychic’s neck with a padlock. The possible excursion of any extremity did not exceed two inches.

The sitting then began and Walter came through promptly. He jested and then talked earnestly for the most part to Cotton, saying that all the churches should be one; based on the central idea of good behavior by all of us, because this plane is merely one
for the development of character. He urged us to try to get the
spiritual point of view which is that most of the things which worry
us here are not worth it. He said you must only be sorry for
those who do not see this light and try to help them.

We then proceeded to try out the VCO machine. The single
tip was passed through opening in the front door by Cotton and
put by him in the Psychic's mouth, she remaining lashed as before.
The door was then closed. Shortly the Psychic blew up the
machine and then Walter proceeded to whistle and talk with per­
fect freedom; the luminous corks remaining ten inches apart in
level. Under these conditions, Walter finished by giving the
following poem:

Live thou each day as if it were thy last.
Unerring forces are at work unseen by you.
Take thou no hurried look into the past.
Live thou each day as if it were thy last.

Walter then proceeded to give a one-man sitting to Cotton.
The rest of the sitters were in the hall and the door was guarded by
Dudley. Cotton now put the luminous doughnut through the small
hole in front door. After a while we all could see Walter’s terminal
playing with the doughnut and finally Walter seized it, levitated it
across the cabinet as high as five feet above the floor and down to
two feet from the floor. The whole levitation lasted three and one­
half minutes, and at the end the doughnut was thrust by Walter
out through the opening in the west side of cabinet. At the end
of levitation the Psychic was in trance.

We now transferred to the old cabinet and Walter talked and
whistled and joked and gave us a general good time until 10:15 p.m.

We note that starting with the above séance we have a leather collar
padlocked about the Psychic's neck, as a surer means of head control
than the tie of cloth previously used. For the present, the rope from
this collar runs to the top of the cabinet, as before. Ultimately (see
pp. 345, 360), by way of final improvement in the head control, this
rope will run to the back of the cabinet.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, December 11, 1925. Present: Mrs.
Brainerd, Miss Spence, Bixler, Harlow, Mrs. Harlow, T. Hyde,
Crandon. Bixler tied the wires on the Psychic's ankles and wrists
to the satisfaction of himself and everyone else present and then
tied these wires to the eye-bolts in the glass cabinet. He locked
the leather collar on the Psychic's neck and lashed it to the eye-bolt
in the roof. The excursion of any extremity could not exceed
three inches.
ONE-MAN SITTINGS

The VCO machine was first tried but the collar made the Psychic cough so much that the experiment was postponed.

Then a one-man sitting was given first to Harlow and second to Bixler, all others being accounted for outside the room in the hall. The Psychic was in trance. The lone sitter put the luminous doughnut through the opening in the front door. Walter's terminal could be seen grasping the doughnut and he then took it. He ordered the lone observer to stand and thereupon Walter levitated the luminous doughnut all over the cabinet as high as five feet six inches, both to right and left and over the Psychic's head to eighteen inches behind her head, and finally threw it out on the floor, probably through the west hand-opening.

The big megaphone was now put in the right front door of the glass cabinet by Harlow and everyone being accounted for behind Bixler and everyone standing, the megaphone was seen to levitate and dive about all through the glass cabinet like a fish in an aquarium.

The head was now released and the VCO machine brought out. Mrs. Brainerd put the glass tip in the Psychic's mouth, the hands and the feet remaining lashed. The front door was then closed and locked and after a time the Psychic blew up the machine into position of instability and Walter then proceeded to whistle the tune which was on the victrola, then "Yankee Doodle" and then the "Red, White and Blue," and then talked freely. At the end of this time the wire controls were inspected by Bixler and Mrs. Brainerd. All were pronounced to be as originally made. The Psychic was then released and the sitting was adjourned to the old cabinet.

Here after a time Bixler was told to pick up the bell-box, walk about the room with it and turn 360 degrees. This he did. During that time the bell-box rang with irregular intermittency. The experiment was finished when the box came accidentally in contact with Mrs. Brainerd's head. Walter invited them all to come again to see more advanced phenomena.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, December 12, 1925. Present: Graham, Mr. and Mrs. [Charles C.] Woolley, Newman Gray, Crandon. The Psychic was fastened in the usual way with steel wire by Graham and Woolley. Whereupon Walter came through with great cheerfulness, levitated the doughnut within the cabinet for each of the gentlemen separately while all the others were accounted for in the doorway. He then levitated the three-pound luminous megaphone under the same conditions. The voice-cut-out machine was then used with 100 per cent success.
After this we moved to the old cabinet and Walter rang the bell-box while Graham lugged it about the room as far as seven feet away from the Psychic, at all levels. It rang intermittently and irregularly.

Sitting closed at 10:30 P.M. On going downstairs Graham sat by the Psychic and was able to visualize to her satisfaction a complete picture of the home of her birth and childhood with many details. He was also able to see and describe accurately two dogs who existed at that time.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, December 18, 1925. Present: B. Eddy, S. Eddy, G. Eddy, Richardson, Mrs. Richardson, Crandon. Walter came through promptly with very strong whistle and voice. He had some difficulty and humor in placing the various Eddys. He finally called our newest visitors Sherwood, Hardwood, Oak, and finally Oakey. We had fifteen minutes of conversation and whistling till Walter got his force gathered.

Under direction of Walter the VCO machine was now brought out. The door of the glass cabinet was held open by a stool. The Psychic had already been lashed, all five extremities, and after a while she blew up the machine. Whereupon Walter whistled, trilled, whistled "Yankee Doodle" on request and recited his stanza beginning "Live thou each day as if it were thy last," etc., with much emphasis on the last word and especially clear enunciation of the st in last.

Then S. E. sat in front of the cabinet with the luminous doughnut. G. E. was in contact with the lashed left hand and S. E. from time to time was in contact with the right lashed hand. S. E. had fastened or observed the fastening of all the Psychic's extremities and the sealing of all the wires before the sitting. The other sitters were in the hall, B. E. standing in the doorway and answering for the presence of all the other sitters behind him so that no one was in the room but the Psychic, the two Eddys and Walter. S. E. held the doughnut in through the front door hole. Walter flirted with it a while and then took it and levitated it beautifully all over the front portion of the cabinet as high as five feet and to both sides. It was finally dropped and then the experiment was repeated.

Next the door of the cabinet was held open with the stool. The luminous three-pound megaphone was put in the right front corner. All observers retired to the doorway and were accounted for. Whereupon Walter levitated the megaphone all over the front half of the cabinet and finally threw it out with great force.

5 See pp. 84, 396; also open reference No. 12, Vol. 2.
When the Psychic had come out of her trance we moved to the old cabinet. Whereupon after some talk Walter said that his force was pretty well gone and closed the sitting at 10:30 p.m.

The procedure typified by the above record is evidently a new one, one of general applicability, and one adding greatly to the evidential values of the séances. The whole complicated question of a confederacy from various quarters of the circle, employing more than one accomplice in a given sitting and shifting the immediate locus of the fraud from moment to moment to meet the momentary conditions of observation enjoyed by the innocent sitters, goes at once and permanently into the discard with the inauguration of this séance-room technique. The whole question of Crandon’s essential rôle in the phenomena becomes likewise a dead issue. The lone sitter gains a personal assurance against circular confederacy which is unmatched by any other conceivable séance arrangements; and his personal assurance is transferable to his reader or his auditor to a larger degree than is the case with older procedures of sitting. The detached critic who realizes that the hypothesis of fraud can be maintained only at the cost of a very extensive confederacy among the sitters finds this confederacy now taking on added characteristics of universality and spontaneity which must give him greater hesitancy in the promulgation of this theory than has ever before been forced upon him. The absence of the circle enables the lone sitter to concentrate completely upon what is going on as of the séance action proper, and his report, alike of phenomena and of control, can therefore be much better trusted than in the routine circular séance. Indeed, it becomes difficult to catalog all the advantages of this style of sitting, all the points of pre-existing doubt which it meets or helps to meet.

From the date of the last record, above, the one-man séances ceased to be so much an end in themselves, and we therefore bring the chapter to an end at this point. The reader will find, however, as he goes on, that the procedure is retained for use at numerous junctures where it is of particular availability; and that in fact the one-man séance or the one-man phenomenon occurring as an episode of a general séance, is now a regular part of the Margery case.
CHAPTER XXVII

The Bell-Boxes: to November, 1925

From the Séance Records with Comment by the Editor

We have described the SAB (Scientific American bell-box) in all detail in Chapter X; and in this same chapter, plus a brief space at the end of Chapter XI, we have brought its routine use in the séance room down to July 9th. We have now to trace the history of this and such other bell-boxes as performed after that date, and down to a point where we may again find reason for interrupting the narrative. And the first thread which we must here pick up is that of the ringing of the Hole Bell-box without visible means of access to its mechanism. This trick, which we first met in Chaps. XI and XIV for a time seemed about to become a regular part of the Lime Street menu. It was done again on July 21st, “under strict conditions of double control with anklets, wrist-bands and head-band all visible where they should be. Hunt held the Psychic’s two hands and Granger held Crandon’s two hands and head; and Walter rang this bell repeatedly the number of times requested by various sitters.” One must now raise a serious question as to the means employed by Walter for this act. Even the hostile critic, I suppose, will concede that all normal means of entry to the box are sealed, and that for fraud of any sort only the Psychic’s feet are available. Manipulation, with these, of a wire at least eighteen inches long, in such way that both ends of this wire shall simultaneously make contact with small screw-heads, would be a remarkable performance in full light. Doing it in darkness seems quite out of the question. So we are reduced to a choice between a teleplasmic conductive member running from one end of the box to the other, and a supernormal means of entry to the box by Walter. But he has failed to gain supernormal access to so many closed containers that I strongly prefer the former alternative. An apparent drawback thereto would lie in the fact that operation of the gimmick circuit with a wire always leads to visible sparking, which has never occurred, within any sitter’s observation, when Walter rang the box. But the assumption that sparking would occur with a teleplasmic bridge between the two contacts, as freely as it would with a bridge of
copper wire, is a large one and one that may well be contrary to the facts.

This picture of the genuine psychic use of a machinery introduced for purposes of deceit is a highly diverting one. We find it repeated on July 22nd and 27th, under the same conditions. Concentration upon teleplasmic phenomena then threw the telekinetic aspects into the shade for a while, and my discovery of the gimmick in the HB ensued before it could be restored to its place in the séance routine. With this discovery, of course, it was permanently excluded from the séances, though it remains in Crandon's possession as an exhibit of extreme interest. Complete reference to its history occurs on p. 189.

While this HB and other Harvard apparatus was in the house and before it began to find its way into séance use, there ensued a brief series of demonstrations with the SAB which were quite noteworthy. Five successive evenings on which it was used (not five successive séances) saw something novel in the way of conditions or performance. The dates, and the portions of the records pertaining to the SAB, follow:

June 27th (1925): Walter proceeded to work on the SAB in red light. He rang it in red light the number of times requested by Hill and Dudley, respectively. Then he ordered the red light on again, and we were able to see the slow, complete excursion of the flapper.

July 5th: Walter had the SAB examined by the newcomers, then rang it the number of times requested in red light by Hubbs, Brown, Jr., and Mrs. Hubbs; with 100 per cent success. He then had Murray pick up the box three times in red light and turn each time through 360 degrees. During the first episode the bell rang; during the second it did not; during the third it did. During the second episode, while Murray was turning around Brown rang the bell [by normal depression with his hand], to show that it was operative although Walter was not working it.

July 6th: Walter showed the bell-box ringing in red light in response to a request made after the light came on. Hodges and Mrs. Hodges in succession lifted the box and turned through 360 degrees, the bell ringing after being lifted. Walter had Hodges put his finger in the angle between the contact board and the top of the box, and he then rang the bell, pinching Hodges's finger by the depression of the flapper.

1 The usual procedure with bell-box work, of course.—J. M. B.
July 8th: Walter proceeded to ring the SAB the number of times requested by each sitter in order, the request being made in the same period of red light with the ringing. He then had Foss pick up the SAB, and it rang intermittently while Foss was turning around. This was repeated for Mrs. Southworth. Walter then asked Foss to put his finger between the contact board and the top of the box, and Foss could feel the flapper press on his finger as the bell rang.

July 9th [Crandon’s record]: Walter came through with a ring on the SAB in the dark. Later he rang it the number of times requested by Bigelow and Bird, with perfect success. Finally, he permitted the following test, for which he took eight minutes of preparation in darkness after the details had been agreed upon. In red light Bird called for two longs and a short; these were given; in the same continuous period of red light, Bird and Richardson examined the box for connections as it stood on the table, then removed it, withdrew with it into the bedroom, and examined it thoroughly with negative result. The red light was on continuously from before the request and the ringing, until after the box had left the room.

July 9th (my record): In red light, with the bell-box on the table, I called for two long rings followed by one short. These were given. In the same continuous period of red light Richardson and I examined the box thoroughly for connections, finding nothing. We then removed it from the table, took it out of the room, and examined it externally and internally in full white light, with negative result. Red light in the séance room continuous from before my command until after the box had left the room.

The experiments in which a sitter’s finger is squeezed by the descending flapper are not reported with all possible clarity. This pinching was effected as a separate episode, with the box standing on the table and ringing in a new interval of red light; not while it was held aloft. It can accordingly be claimed that the ringing in the sitter’s hand is done by tampering with the spring, that on the table by means of a mechanical connection to the flapper. But this latter claim suffers severely on the 9th; I doubt that such a thread could be disconnected in red light without the move’s being observed, and I am certain it could not be left connected during my examination of the box on the table, without detection. In any event, we make progress when we drive the skeptic to picture a lightning passage from one fraud to
another in the same séance; this is considerably more difficult than an initial selection of a single fraud to be employed on a given date.

The next item to which we turn consists in a slight change in the design of the SAB: the addition of a spot of luminous paint on the top of the contact board, so that motion of this board might be looked for in the dark, or eclipse of the spot by Walter’s terminal observed. The spot was not large enough ever to give any picture of the eclipsing terminal, so such eclipse could never add anything to existing knowledge or existing indications of validity. Motion of the flapper, moreover, if observable only through motion of the spot, will have occurred while the box is standing on the table in the dark; and will not meet any theories advanced by any sane critic as to how such ringing is engineered. One might hope, through careful watching of the spot, to observe an absence of motion that would defeat the theory under which the Psychic manipulates the spring as the box stands by in darkness; such manipulation would involve some motion of the contact board, even if there was a second free hand to prevent this from being too noticeable. But the record conveys no indication that this observation was ever attempted. We may, therefore, ignore the bright spot.

On this date (July 14th, 1925) there occurred bell-ringing without any feature requiring description. The same is true of the 19th, Dudley acting as “engineer”; except that we might mention the successful prosecution of the test under which the bell refuses to ring when carried about after Walter has “removed his force.” Hereafter we shall regard this test as part of the routine, and omit it from special mention. The performance of the 20th, in the dark, was notable for the control:

During this ringing Hill had the Psychic’s left hand and knee, and her head-band could be seen where it should be. Litzelmann held her right hand and Crandon’s two hands, and Crandon’s chin rested on Litzelmann’s hand. The Psychic’s two anklets were visible, and her two feet rested on Litzelmann’s feet.

For a few days here, “the Code bell-box with the luminous covers and luminous plunger” was used in Lime Street. This was an improvement upon the Harvard version of the Dingwall bell-box,1a in which not only the horizontal platform but also the vertical shank of the plunger

---

1a Pages 118, 123, 305.
THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

was made luminous. It was among the apparatus donated to the Lime Street séance room by Code, and I infer that its novelty appealed to Walter. He rang this on the 20th, his hand being visible grasping the plunger; and again on the 21st and 22nd, with the same result.

Routine ringing of the SAB without feature occurred on July 21st (Hunt and Granger engineering, 22nd (Bullard and Davis), 28th (Mrs. Bonbright), 30th, 31st (Misses Conklin and Clancy); August 8th (Davis, Mrs. Davis and Hill), 9th (Davis and Mrs. Davis), 17th (Bentley), 30th (Zeligzon); September 20th (Mrs. Price and Dudley), 26th, October 2nd (Saunderson), 3rd (Fessenden) and 16th. During this period the following excerpts from the record involve something a bit beyond the ordinary:

July 27th: After some preliminary trials in the dark, Walter rang the SAB the numbers of times requested by De Wyckoff, Fogg, and Miss Boring, respectively. Then in good red light Miss Boring picked up the SAB, and after it was in the air it began to ring intermittently and irregularly while she turned a complete circle standing, and set it down on the table. It then stopped ringing in the same period of red light, without intervening darkness.

August 3rd: He proceeded in red light to ring the SAB the number of times requested by Cotton. This he did twice successfully, then allowed Cotton to pick up the box; it rang and stopped in the air while Cotton turned a complete circle.

August 15th: It rang intermittently while he [Foss] had it in the air and turned himself completely around, the whole phenomenon beginning and ending in good red light.

I include the episode of the 3rd in spite of its ambiguity; it does not clearly appear whether the ringing stopped permanently while the box was still in the air. On the 15th I was present, and the ringing did clearly come to a stop while Foss held the box poised above the table prepared to lower it thereto. If this were due to the release of pressure against a tricked spring as the downward motion began, I should certainly expect to get one tinkle out of the bell through reaction as the motion comes to a more or less abrupt end against the table;

---

2 Page 125.

3 One might plead that the interval between her picking it up and its starting to ring was infinitesimal, and that the very irregularity of ringing supported the claim that a tampered spring was jarring into and out of contact. But why, then, did it stop ringing after it had been deposited on the table?—J. M. B.
but nothing of the sort happened. And if the spring is not sensitive to this jar, how can it be sensitive to jars received while being held free in the air?

Sept. 1st: In red light Abbott then picked up the SAB and as he stood with it in his hands it rang intermittently, the whole phenomenon beginning and ending in red light.

This is again ambiguous, like the entry for Aug. 3rd. The fact that similar ambiguity exists in the record for Aug. 15th, but that I can there testify to the favorable facts, is sufficient justification for including the other two records under the suspicion that they may represent the same sort of action. For Sept. 3rd we have the same ambiguity in connection with a ringing engineered by Coughlin.

Oct. 23rd: Walter gave instructions for the red light to be turned on again, and Hamilton was told to pick up the SAB. At this moment Crandon was called to the telephone and was out of the room for about four minutes. During this time Hamilton carried the SAB over to the window at least ten feet from the Psychic, and it kept ringing intermittently and irregularly throughout the trip. On his return to the circle he passed the box, still ringing intermittently, to his neighbor, and so it was handed around to every sitter, continuing to ring intermittently throughout.

As has been chronicled elsewhere, Margery was out of Boston during the last days of October and the early ones of November; and when she returned home the glass cabinet was in use. On two occasions the bell-box was rung with Margery wired into this. On the very first dates on which the glass cabinet was used, Nov. 7th and 8th, we have seen that, with the door of the cabinet closed and the bell-box on a table outside, "Walter had no difficulty in reaching his terminal out through the small hole in the front door and ringing the SAB." And on the 10th, under somewhat different conditions, it again rang: "Crandon was instructed to hold the bell-box in through the partly opened doorway and to put the luminous doughnut on the flapper. Walter then proceeded to ring the bell repeatedly, his terminal being visible on the doughnut as he pressed."

After these two dates the bell-box was not used in the glass cabinet; and we therefore defer giving its further history until we have brought other aspects of the mediumship up to the 1926 stage.
CHAPTER XXVIII

The Wooden Letters: A New Instrument for Cognitions

From the Séance Records with Comment by the Editor

Concerning one feature of the glass cabinet little has yet been said, because we have not yet had occasion to use it. For such phenomena as in their very nature require a table provision must be made. In place of an independent unit with legs, it was elected to supply the cabinet with a shelf-like member, freely removable, to fit in place across the opening of the doorway. When thus inserted, the shelf is 30 inches off the floor, 11½ inches deep from front to back. It projects into the cabinet to exactly these 11½ inches, since its outermost edge is flush with the front of the cabinet. In this position, the distance from the knees of the lashed Psychic to the inner edge of the shelf is 9 inches. From the point at which the wire lashings bear on her wrist to the nearest point of the shelf is, at either side, 8½ inches. I mention the wrist in this connection rather than the hand or the corner of the port, since any effort to reach the shelf with her hand would be made by a pivoting at the wrist, using the loop of wire as a fixed bearing point.

For the séance of January 5th, 1926, a new idea (Richardson's) for identification phenomena was for the first time presented to Walter. The entire séance was given to this, so I may quote the record in full:

The Psychic was lashed with wire at all five extremities, as usual. On the shelf in front of her, in the dark, thirteen large wooden letters such as children play with were distributed in an order more or less known to Hill but to no one else. These were four inches square over all, and one inch square in structural cross-section. The Psychic did not even know the nature of the objects on the shelf. The door of the cabinet was closed.

Trance came on almost at once and Walter spoke and whistled in a most cheery and alert manner. He spoke of a song his Mother used to sing him asleep with. He then said: “It made me so sad that I cried and after that she sang ‘Juanita,’ which was almost as bad.” Whereupon he began whistling “Juanita” against the victrola music. He said he would play with the letters and keep us entertained but he was really busy on his big stuff.
Among the letters put on the shelf were enough to make up the name Walter and that was the only word any of us had in mind. Nevertheless Walter said shortly, "Judge, why didn't you put another L in? I have HEL." Whereupon we heard letters falling to the floor in the back of the northeast corner of the cabinet. Shortly more letters fell and Walter said: "You will find H E L in the back corner; you will find M A between the Psychic's feet." All this was done with the door of the cabinet closed and then he suddenly ordered it open, saying that there was too much force in it, and he feared he would break the glass. Then the Judge said, "Is there a number there, Walter?" And Walter after a while said, "Yes, Judge, here is a 2." Later several of us failed to distinguish this 2 from a 5 in the dark, but in the light it was easy. Hence Walter did in the dark what was only easy for us in the light. He then handed Mrs. Richardson an S, telling her what it was. He then threw another under Dr. Richardson's chair and told him it was a T. All these identifications were 100 per cent correct.

We had no plan for segregation of letters which he might spell words with and the method used was his own. There was no light at any time during the sitting and at the end all the lashings were found to be intact.

The identification of the letters rapidly became a feature of the new "standardized séance," but in so far as it is necessary to describe any further the performances of individual sittings, I propose to abstract them and give them in the present chapter. For January 13th:

Walter shortly said: "Now while I am getting things ready, put some of the wooden letters on the table." Kearns thereupon went into the back room alone and took out about a dozen wooden letters, brought them into the dark séance room, and put them on the shelf table in front of the unconscious Psychic. Thus no one in the room could know what the letters were except Kearns. Walter had the door shut for a while and then ordered it open and picked out in series a J, a 3 and a W, throwing them at the feet of Kearns. The identifications were all correct. During this episode and immediately after it the integrity of the wire lashings was confirmed by B. Eddy.

January 14th: The shelf table was then put in and letters were put on it by Hill, known only to him. Walter then shuffled the
letters about a lot, talking to himself as it were as to what word, if any, he could spell out of the nine letters and one number which were on the table. After about five minutes he threw out to Hill, naming each letter as he threw it, the letters S A K E. He then threw a G to Mrs. Frothingham and a C to Crandon, naming each before he threw it. The identifications were correct in each instance.

January 18th: Morse went in the dark into the back room and brought back, without looking at them, a bunch of the large wooden letters. These he put, still in the dark, on the shelf in front of the Psychic, and Walter proceeded to throw them one at a time at Morse, naming each one as he threw it successfully.

January 21st: Under instructions Miss Ball went to the back bedroom and brought back a handful of the large wooden letters, which she piled on the shelf without knowing what letters they were. Walter then proceeded to throw them back at Miss Ball's feet, naming each one as he did so. He did this correctly in every instance but one, where he called it an S and it was a 2. Miss Ball said, "Is not that a 2, Walter?" And Walter replied, "I guess it is. I am an opportunist."

January 23d: In the dark Hill then took a double handful of large wooden letters and put them on the shelf in front of the Psychic. Walter proceeded to throw out three of these letters, one at a time, naming each one as he did so; namely, T, 8, and C. Each cognition was correct.

January 24th: Walter then went on to identify the wooden letters. He got mixed on two, calling D an O. The interesting part of it is that the outline of the hole in both was an identical octagon. He mixed a C and a G also. Six others were correct.

These six excerpts seem sufficiently to characterize the identification performance; we need not quote the records further save in so far as they indicate some element of novelty or unusual rigor. Nor need we cite all the evenings on which identification of letters was done; these will be cited in another place. Notable incidents in connection with the letter work include the following:

February 4th (1926): "Besides the lashings, tactual control of the Psychic was maintained continuously by Gerald and Rand."

March 4th: It is customary, as the detailed quotations above indicate, for the sitter who selects the letters from the stock, and puts

2 Chapters XXIX, XXXVII.
them on the shelf in front of the Psychic or (later procedure) in the basket, to grasp them carefully between two fingers in such fashion as to insure no knowledge on his part of their identity. But this very absence of knowledge, while it rules out telepathy in explanation, also suggests the prior concealment of other letters known to the Psychic and the substitution of these. So on the present date, to rule this out:

"Walter then directed Van Arsdale to put on two more letters in the dark, but this time to know what they were before he put them on (the shelf). These Walter identified with his usual speed."

March 8th: "Then [after the routine identification of letters unknown to any sitter] he identified two letters which Reilly picked out in the dark with knowledge of what they were."

March 13th: The above variation was repeated with Morse handling the letters.

March 23d: The record for this date is of considerable importance, for on it was based a double change in procedure. It reads:

Walter came through promptly in good spirits and went to work on the cognition of the wooden letters. This he did with 100 per cent perfection, and then had a sitter put on two letters which the sitter knew. These were promptly recognized also and thrown out. Two letters were put out through the right-hand hole.

After the sitting Davis tried in vain to beat the VCO machine. But he was able with head triced up as the Psychic's is, to pull his head forwards far enough to pick up the letters with his teeth. Walter, in later conference, suggested that we put the letters hereafter in a basket on the floor of the cabinet and also fasten the Psychic's collar horizontally backwards to the back panel of the cabinet, thus meeting this criticism.³

To one versed in the ways of sleight-of-hand and misdirection of attention, there is a distinctly suspicious element in Walter's double suggestion of the above record. The one innovation of fastening the Psychic's collar horizontally to the back of the cabinet instead of vertically to the roof, as heretofore, would be ample to meet the weakness in control developed by Davis. When Walter supplements this suggestion with another one that moves the letters from the place in which they have always been deposited to another, the keen critic must wonder whether this is not so that, having been obliged to give up the means previously used for getting hold of them, the Psychic may be

³ See pp. 332, 360.
able to get hold of them in a new way: to be specific, with her hands. The basket in question has a long handle, and it is not immediately obvious that, with her hands lashed, she might not be able to get a finger hold on this; after which it may be that she could work along the handle until she got the basket in her lap and the letters in reach of her groping hand. The wire control is severe, and the honest critic would only want to experiment in an effort to see whether this would work. Fair or unfair, however, the critic must have his attention drawn in this general direction by Walter's double change in the conditions, which was put into effect for the next séance. But very fortunately, in this and the immediately following sitting, the suggestion is cleanly met; for on the 26th:

The Psychic having been lashed as usual but with the new head control, Walter proceeded not only to name correctly and levitate unknown letters from a basket on the floor of the cabinet, but also letters from the shelf in front of the Psychic.

If we are to think in terms of fraud here, we need a reaching rod and a confederate; this seems the unanimous verdict of the skeptics. The necessity for the tool is fairly evident. That for the assistant arises out of the fact that even were the Psychic able to secrete it about her person in such way as to evade whatever search she might undergo—a variable factor and therefore a dangerous one—her bonds would probably prevent her from infallibly bringing it out and into use and disposing of it after use. For all this the simpler and safer measure by far would be a confederate to pass her the rod and to receive it back from her when she was through with it. One attending all the glass-cabinet séances would be very much impressed with the fact that neither Crandon nor any other single person nor even any small number of given persons would always have this opportunity; but of course with respect to Crandon or any group of two or three persons one at least of whom could be found on the roster of each séance, the records in the nature of the case cannot make any showing of innocence against this theory. I suppose it may even be advanced against the one-man sittings; though with more difficulty there than in general sittings. Except by specific testimony by some sitter that at a given séance or séances he kept active watch for such a move and was able to satisfy himself that none was made, I do not see how the suggestion on which I here comment could be disposed of. And I suppose that if this testimony were given, the elastic skeptic would
fall back on the claim that, at these sittings, the Psychic had the rod in her own possession from the beginning, and was able to bring it into action.

On the 27th both the shelf and the basket were again used as depositories for the letters; and Walter made but one error in eight identifications, mistaking a W for an N. And some of the letters which he recognized he disposed of by thrusting them out through the right-hand port hole. This is pretty well filled with wrist, and would be further filled with partly retracted hand if it were attempted to get the letters out through it by normal manipulation of the hand.

On April 1st he did the letters with equal success from the floor and from the shelf. After this, for numerous dates from April to September, detailed records are given in Chapters XXIX and XXXVII which include among other things the letter-identification act. In general it may be said that this act shows no further development that is not amply covered by these full records. So with the reminder that Chapter XXXVII lists all the occasions on which the letters were used and for which the complete records are not elsewhere given, we may close the present chapter.
CHAPTER XXIX
The Standardized Séance, in Two Parts
From the Séance Records, with Comment by the Editor

The record for November 18th,\(^1\) 1925, shows the first approximation to a procedure which crystallized in early 1926, and which has ever since that date been habitually followed in what Crandon characterizes as introductory or elementary séances, designed to initiate and instruct persons with no wide experience in psychical matters or no previous contact with this mediumship. The routine finally hit upon for these séances is usually carried through with no material deviation. It involves putting the Psychic into the glass cabinet under all appropriate precautions; after which she goes into trance and so remains while there are produced levitation phenomena and identifications of personal objects or wooden letters or both. She then awakens from trance and while the wire controls of her hands and feet are maintained, her head is freed from its collar for her greater comfort while a performance with the VCO is given. At the conclusion of this test, there is due and solemn inspection of the controls, followed by release of the Psychic. The entire company then moves across the room to the old cabinet, where are presented in intermittent red light the bell-box (SA model, ordinarily) and perhaps other phenomena.

This idea of combining the basic features of both cabinets in a single séance is a bold one, and of course quite a departure from ordinary séance practice. It originated, as stated, on November 18th, and the words of the record: "Under instructions we moved over," leave no doubt that the procedure was Walter's own invention. It will be seen that these sittings combine two types of control for telekinetic phenomena; they do not afford a mixture of the telekinetic and teleplasmic aspects. These, Walter always has and presumably always will keep pretty well apart.

An adequate summary of the standardized séance in its ultimately crystallized form was given in the Journal of the A.S.P.R. for July, 1926.\(^2\) Here we are concerned with the historical and critical aspect, and to some degree with a greater showing of details. The

---
\(^1\) See page 331; last paragraph of this record.
\(^2\) Page 404.
concentration upon the one-man sittings in the glass cabinet persisted throughout December; the sitting of January 5th was given over to an experiment of another sort. But starting on January 13th, 1926, there was a group of sittings in which Walter had on his mind nothing more serious than the development of the standardized séance; and he pursued this theme with success. On the date named the Psychic was disrobed and examined by Mrs. Ellis, and was then lashed into the glass cabinet by several of the strange sitters in concert. There followed identifications of the wooden letters as described in detail on p. 343; and the record tells us that “during this episode and immediately after it the integrity of the wire controls was confirmed by B. Eddy.” Then:

Ellis was now told to put through the small opening in the front door a luminous doughnut, and to hold this in his hand. All the other sitters were gathered behind Eddy in the doorway of the room. Shortly Walter's terminal seized the doughnut and levitated it all about in front of the cabinet as high as four feet from the floor. Controls were examined before and after this performance.

Walter then called for the luminous three-pound megaphone to be put in the right front corner of the cabinet and the door to be left open. All sitters being gathered in the doorway and accounted for, Walter levitated the megaphone as high as the Psychic's head, waved it about and threw it out of the cabinet with great violence.

At the end of this experiment Walter was heard to talk, the voice being located about 18 inches to the east of the glass cabinet and outside the cabinet. He had never done this before.

The Richardson VCO machine was now brought forth and put on the table in front of the open door of the cabinet. Walter woke the Psychic out of her trance. Kearns, having tested himself the patency of the machine, put the glass tip in the Psychic's mouth. All sitters now gathered in the doorway of the room and were accounted for. The Psychic blew up the machine into a position of instability. Whereupon Walter whistled a beautiful obligato to the victrola tune and then said:

“Live thou this day as if it were thy las-s-s-s-t.”
“A great gray goose flew across the river.
It flew way across with its mouth full of liver.”

3 Chapter XXVI; in which, on December 11th and 12th (pp. 333-4), the germ of the standardized séance is again seen.—J. M. B.
4 See page 342.
In some ways this was the most brilliant demonstration of the voice machine which we have had.

The lashings were now declared to be intact by all the visitors and were then cut and the Psychic entered the open cabinet. It was now after ten-thirty and the force was low. The Psychic’s hands and feet were accounted for and Crandon’s, left wrist accounted for with luminous bands. The Psychic’s feet were also in contact with Weston’s and Eddy’s, respectively. Despite this Weston had several touches, the bell-box was rung on the table, and loud raps were heard on the north wing of the cabinet.

Both in the glass cabinet and in the open cabinet Walter said two sentences during the evening in good red light, the voice apparently coming from behind and above the Psychic’s head.

The standardized sitting now became the order of the next few days; and I may give without further comment the five records which follow:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, January 14, 1926. Present to left: Richardson, Crandon, Mrs. Frothingham, Mrs. Richardson, Hill. The sitting was in the glass cabinet. The Psychic was lashed in with steel wire on her ankles and wrists; and her head was fastened aloft as usual.

Trance came on almost at once and throughout the sitting it lasted without a break. It was unusually deep with no restlessness. Walter came through almost at once in cheery mood and called attention to the deep trance; saying “She’s dead. That’s the way I can get her when you people are here. The conditions are perfect.” The shelf table was in and on it the doughnut, basket and some wooden rings. Shortly Walter ordered all these removed and the basket put on the floor of the cabinet, door open, doughnut in basket. The basket was then levitated, danced all about, lifted above the Psychic’s head at least two feet behind her head, around the cord which fastened her head to the ceiling. This was then repeated. Walter when asked whether he used two hands to pass the basket around the vertical cord gave no direct answer but said he would let us see it in red light some time.

[There now ensued the identification of letters and the activation of luminous paint; these portions of the record are given in full on pp. 343 and 390, respectively, and we need not duplicate this material here.]

The luminous plaque was then asked for and put in the cabinet on the shelf table but it, too, had not been lighted up and so could
THE STANDARDIZED SÉANCE, IN TWO PARTS  351

not be seen. Walter said, “So you can not see it. Very well, I will make some lights of my own.” Then areas of lights such as Walter had made before but much bigger could be seen to the left of the Psychic’s left shoulder, with black lines here and there across them. These moved about freely and were taken over, on request, to the east side of the cabinet in order that Mrs. Stinson, who was present but not in the circle, might see. The biggest areas were estimated at 20 x 20 x 24 inches square; it was apparently a filmy light with no thickness. Walter said “that is my accomp­lice.” He ordered it to get down to the floor and so it did. Walter said “Can’t you see a profile?” Later he asked us to see a “little figure.” We thought we might but it was a strain on the imagination. These “ghost lights” apparently did not reflect on the glass sides of the cabinet. At the end of it Walter said, “Wait till you see this kind of light six feet tall. I will make that one hair on the Judge’s [Hill’s] head stand up straight.”

Throughout the sitting there was much levitation of small megaphone, of basket, and of doughnut, thrown in as it were by Walter as an incidental to other phenomena.

The record of the basket action, in the second paragraph of the above document, deserves passing comment. It is self-evident that we have here either a complete delusion of the sitters or a striking instance of genuine telekinesis; that with the Psychic bound as she was, continuous travel of the basket around and around the cord joining her neck to the ceiling is impossible on any basis of fraud. It is not always the case that a circumnavigatory telekinesis is necessarily valid, but in the present instance there are no circumstances permitting escape from this necessity.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, January 18, 1926. Present to left: Dennett, Crandon, Morse, Miner. Mrs. Stinson present, not in the circle. Glass cabinet. The Psychic was tied as to extremities and head by the visitors, who declared the controls to be absolute.

Trance came on within a minute and Walter spoke in loud voice and whistled with unusual vigor. All phenomena of the evening were especially strong, doubtless explained by the fact that Dennett is more or less mediumistic. All other sitters having gathered in the doorway, Dennett sat in front of the glass door of the cabinet and put through the hole thereof the luminous doughnut. After a few minutes it was apparent to all that the doughnut had been taken from Dennett’s hands. It levitated all over the cabinet and then was put out through the right-hand arm-hole.
Next the large luminous megaphone was put in the cabinet and under the same conditions this was levitated all over the front of the cabinet and high above the Psychic's head. Similarly the small basket with luminous paint on its handle was taken by Walter from Morse's hand and then levitated all about.

[There now ensued the letter identifications of p. 344, which we need not cover twice.]

Numerous lights were made by Walter to dance all about in the cabinet in front of the Psychic.

The Psychic was then allowed to come out of her trance and the VCO machine was brought into action. Mrs. Stinson went downstairs. Morse held his hand over Crandon's mouth, Dennett put the glass tip in the Psychic's mouth, then all stood back. Walter proceeded to whistle and joke and talk and recited poetry, ending up with "Tell this to the slippery, slithery scientists: 'Live thou this day as though it were thy la-s-s-s-t'." During this time the luminous floats were 14 inches apart in disequilibrium, a very striking and successful proof of the independence of Walter's voice from the anatomy of the Psychic.

We then moved over to the open cabinet and brought forth the SA bell-box. First Morse and then Miner lifted the box and turned 360 degrees with it, the box ringing irregularly and intermittently while they did so.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, January 21, 1926. Present to left: Richardson, Crandon, Miss Ball, Dudley, Hill. The Psychic was lashed in the cabinet with steel wires as to ankles and wrists and with leather collar and rope for head. Walter came through shortly in cheery mood and almost at once directed Dudley and Miss Ball to change seats. He seemed to like Miss Ball and was soon calling her Maddy.

The Psychic was in deep trance almost at once and Walter directed that all the sitters but Miss Ball collect in the back of the room while Miss Ball passed through the opening in the door a luminous doughnut. This she did. After a few passes Walter took it away from her and levitated it all about the front of the cabinet and then put it out through the easterly side opening.

The next experiment was the levitation of the large three-pound luminous megaphone from a position on the floor in front and to the right of the Psychic, all over and about within the cabinet, and finally outside of it, where it was thrown violently on the floor. Walter now did levitation of the luminous basket containing the doughnut, lifting it from a shelf placed in front of the
Psychic, waving it all about, most of the time in a horizontal position.

[There next ensued the letter identifications of p. 344, under Miss Ball's supervision; and as on the few preceding dates, we avoid duplication by omitting part of the record here.]

The Psychic now came slowly out of trance and Richardson's VCO machine was put in position on the table in front of the Psychic. Miss Ball, having determined that the machine was in working order and that the tubes were patent, put the tube in Psychic's mouth in red light. We all then retired to the back of the room and the roll was called to prove it. The Psychic now blew up the machine to a position of disequilibrium and then Walter proceeded to laugh, whistle and talk freely for about thirty-five seconds, ending up with:

"Live thou this day as though it were thy l-a-s-s-s-t-t." This test was perfect. The voice was never louder.

Walter now directed us to have a very dim red light which really gave very little illumination, but Walter kept referring to it as "Now we are having phenomena in red light." We nevertheless look on the episode as encouraging us to believe that he will work towards red light. The red light was now turned on half strength and he did excellent levitation of the large megaphone, talking freely also in the red light. These phenomena mark distinct advances.

Walter now directed Mrs. Richardson to go down stairs and bring up the xylophone which is used for a dinner gong and she did so. It was put on the shelf in front of the Psychic in trance with the hammer alongside. Walter began to play it almost immediately, striking clear definite intentional notes. Miss Ball tried to hold everybody's hands at once. Then the door of the cabinet was closed and locked by Miss Ball and Walter still went on playing the instrument freely.

On request, Miss Ball put her nose in the doughnut on the shelf in front of the Psychic and Walter caressed her head and neck and then on her request made a second attempt and pulled her hair hard enough to hurt her.

The Psychic now came out of her second trance and we moved to the old cabinet. Here in full red light Walter allowed Miss Ball twice to pick up the bell-box and as she turned around a complete circle, standing erect and holding the bell-box in her hands, the bell-box each time rang intermittently.
Sitting at 10 Lime Street, January 23, 1926. Present to left: Holmes, Richardson, Crandon, Hill, Mrs. Baker. Sitting in the glass cabinet. Holmes made, watched or examined the application of all wires and of the collar strap. He conducted the Psychic into the séance room and after all extremities were fastened to his satisfaction he applied lead seals to the ends of all wires.

Walter came through promptly, the Psychic being in deep trance. He greeted the newcomers and the rest of us. After a time spent in talk he directed Holmes to hold the luminous doughnut in through the opening in the closed front door. This was done by Holmes's left hand while he kept his right in contact with the Psychic's left hand; Mrs. Baker was in contact with the Psychic's right hand. Walter did the levitation of the doughnut, taking it from Holmes's hand and carrying it all over the front half of the cabinet and finally dropped it to the floor. It was picked up and the experiment repeated and after good levitation he then put it out through the right-hand opening.

The large luminous three-pound megaphone was next put, by Holmes, in the right front corner of the cabinet and Walter proceeded to levitate it with door of cabinet closed. Then on request of Holmes it was repeated with the door of the cabinet open, Holmes having, at the time of the levitation from the floor, tactual control of the Psychic's two feet and left hand, Mrs. Baker at the time of the levitation also having tactual control of the Psychic's right hand, all wire lashings of course being as above described in addition. Walter then did levitation of the small basket with three luminous markers on the handle. Each piece of apparatus was put in the cabinet after passing through Holmes's hands to rule out the possibility that they were attached to strings or wires. In the dark Holmes then took a double handful of large wooden letters and put them on the shelf in front of the Psychic. Walter proceeded to throw out three of these letters one at a time, naming each one as he did so; namely, T, 8, and C. Each cognition being correct.

All apparatus was now removed and the Psychic was allowed to come out of trance by Walter. Richardson's VCO machine was brought forth, and the pipe was handed to Holmes who found it patent and in working order. He then put the glass tip into the pipe, he having had the tip in his possession throughout the séance. All sitters now moved to the back of the room. Holmes put the tip into the Psychic's mouth and put out the light. A roll-call was taken of all present who were found to be behind Mrs. Baker and Holmes. The Psychic then blew up the machine to a state
of disequilibrium and Walter proceeded to whistle and talk, and finally recited his poem which begins: "Live thou this day as if it were thy l-a-s-s-s-t-t." Then Walter asked Holmes what he should whistle. Holmes replied, "A hymn: *Onward Christian Soldiers.*" Whereupon Walter whistled that piece and then recited his parody on it beginning:

"Onward Psychic soldiers, marching as to war,
With the cross of science proudly borne before."

The test lasted forty seconds. The luminous markers remaining fully fourteen inches different in level. At the end of that time the light was turned on, Holmes removed the tip from the Psychic's mouth and immediately tested the tube to see if it were in working order. No criticism was noted.

The luminous doughnut was put on the shelf in front of the Psychic. Holmes put his nose in the doughnut and Walter proceeded to caress his hair.

With Walter's approval we now moved to the old cabinet and Walter instructed Holmes to pick up the box. As he did so it rang intermittently and Holmes standing turned around 360 degrees, the bell-box continuing to ring intermittently until he put it down. This was now repeated with Mrs. Baker holding the box and as it rang intermittently she walked towards the windows, 14 feet away from the Psychic; a beautiful and continuous performance.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, January 24, 1926. Present to left: Ridgway, Hodges, Crandon, Rodenburg, Foss, Mrs. Hodges, Adler, Dr. and Mrs. Brown, J. H. Brown, Mrs. Stinson. The Psychic was lashed in the glass cabinet by the newcomers, who declared the controls to be perfect. With deep trance Walter levitated the doughnut, the big megaphone, the basket and then went on to identify the wooden letters. He got mixed on two, confusing D and O. The interesting part of it is that the outline of the hole in both was an identical octagon. He mixed a C and a G also. Six others were correct. He then proceeded to use the VCO machine with brilliant success beginning and ending in the red light. We then moved to the old cabinet and Walter proceeded to ring the bell-box intermittently in the red light while it was in the hands of Ridgway and Mrs. Hodges, respectively, while they turned around 360 degrees. Ridgway is tall and held the box at least seven feet in the air.

The séance of January 23d, above, marks the climax of control to this date. The procedure here permitted Holmes and Mrs. Baker
is tantamount to simultaneous use of the old personal and the new mechanical control. A certain type of skeptic is satisfied with nothing short of this; he requires the personal testimony to assure him that there is no trick of escape from the mechanical controls, and the mechanical control to assure him that there is no release from the personal control and no error in its reporting. We shall meet this skeptic again and again in the later history of the mediumship; so it will be of importance to bear in mind that his viewpoint has already been met, and by sitters whose detachment from the case and whose personal honesty cannot be questioned or improved upon.

Standardized sittings which require no particular discussion and no full reporting were given on numerous subsequent dates. Some of them will be referred to in some detail in other chapters, in connection with striking presentations of particular phenomena. For the present purpose we may complete the record by tabulation. The reader who seeks fuller information of the sitters present is of course referred to the chapter in the second volume giving this information.

Feb. 3d: D (doughnut), M (megaphone) and B (basket) levitation, letters, VCO; no record of responsibility for wiring; letters handled by Howard. In old cabinet: SAB (Scientific American bell-box), activation of luminous paint.5

Feb. 4th: D, B and M levitation, letters, VCO; lashing “by the visitors without aid or assistance”; letters handled by Gerald and identified under continuous tactual control of the Psychic by Gerald and Rand. SAB, activation (in old cabinet; this will be clear in the following entries and will not again be specified).

Feb. 19th: letters, B and M levitation, VCO, activation (all in glass cabinet); no record of responsibility for lashing; letters handled by De Wyckoff.

Feb. 21st: letters, B and M levitation, VCO; lashing by Pierson and letters handled by Pierson. SAB.

The séance of February 22d led to the production of a record entirely independent of Crandon’s, and one of whose existence he has been ignorant until he finds it here in print. While the action was in no sense distinctive, the opportunity of presenting in parallel his record and the other one of which I speak is not to be overlooked. It is to be noted that the presence of the Smart-Aleck sitter did not interfere at all with the production of the phenomena. It will also be noted

5 See Chapter XXXII.
that this sitter, in spite of his objectionable behavior, made a rather more than usually satisfactory skeptic, in that he did not wait until the next day or the next week or the next year to express his objections, but gave them vent on the spot. In so doing, he afforded Crandon opportunity to demonstrate that he does not wilfully withhold any pertinent fact from his records. He might be criticized for making his opinion of Bullitt a part of his record; but he has conspicuously come up to the mark by recording the failure of the phenomena to impress this sitter. Likewise he has recorded Sherburne's damaging discovery, even in the face of the facts that some, at least, of the other sitters remained ignorant of it, and that Sherburne himself admitted his belief in the unique character of his own whistling trick. With these remarks we may pass at once to the two records for the evening, after which the tabulation of ensuing dates will be resumed without further comment.

We, Florizel von Reuter and his mother, Grace von Reuter, hereby testify that we experienced a sitting with Mrs. Crandon, known in mediumistic circles as Margery, on the night of February 22, 1926, in Boston, at the residence, 10 Lime Street, of Dr. Crandon.

I, Grace v. Reuter, certify that I assisted at the disrobing of Margery, and thoroughly examined the dressing gown in which we wrapped her, after which I controlled her hands until she was led into the glass cabinet on a floor two stages higher.

There she was wired in the glass cabinet, hands and feet, so that any movement of extremities was impossible. Her head was bound to the ceiling of the cabinet by a thick rope which fastened around her neck, so that she could not move her head without danger of suffocation.

During the trance her hands were controlled by gentlemen present. The room was lighted by dim red light. We were permitted to examine the cabinet with an electric torch, also the room to exclude the possibility of hidden assistants. The door was closed and our chairs placed in front of it.

In spite of this rigid control, the following phenomena occurred:

a. Independent voice speaking, while Margery's voice was controlled by a "voice-cut-out machine."

b. Large megaphone with illuminated ends was raised in air and revolved.

c. Three wooden letters taken from a number of letters placed by one member of the investigating committee on a board in front
of cabinet were thrown out of the cabinet, the voice of "Walter" naming them as they fell.

d. The medium, after removal from glass cabinet, was seated in wooden cabinet and the bell-apparatus placed in front of her. Room darkened, the bell rang, but was considered nothing phenomenal. Later in red light, bell rang while apparatus was lifted in the arms of my son. During this experiment, the medium was not bound, and her right hand was controlled by the left hand of Dr. Crandon.

During the time that the red light was on, one could control perfectly that the medium made no movement.

At the end of séance, bell-apparatus was examined and found to be impervious to movements or shaking except when touched upon the lid.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, February 22, 1926. The sitters present were: Bullitt, von Reuter, Mrs. von Reuter, Hill, Sherburne, Greene, Mrs. Greene.

The sitting was first in the glass cabinet. All the newcomers took part in lashing the Psychic but even then the silly skepticism of some of them made them constantly feel to see if her extremities were still bound during the sitting.

The first experiment was with the wooden letters, placed on the shelf in front of the Psychic in trance. They were put there by Bullitt. Walter quickly identified and threw out three letters. In spite of a search of the Psychic having been made by the two women, Bullitt was convinced that selected letters could have been held between the knees of the Psychic and thrown out.

The next experiment was levitation of the big megaphone which was done beautifully; all the observers being against the doorway, the nearest one being six feet from the Psychic.

The next experiment was with the VCO machine, all the important parts of it being carried out by Bullitt. Later Sherburne, who has practiced at the trick all his life, whistling while he had a pipe in his mouth, was able to whistle faintly while the VCO machine tip was in his mouth. He is the only one who has ever been able to do it and the execution of the whistle in no way resembled the sharp clear-cut notes of Walter.

The sitting then adjourned to the old cabinet and Walter rang

---

6 von Reuter in conversation with me says this is an error; that he officiated here.—J. M. B.
7 See pages 275, 360.
the bell-box in the red light with the box held successively by Mrs. Greene and von Reuter.

During the sitting Walter several times had to curse out Bullitt, who disengaged himself from his neighbor and was pawing around in the cabinet. Walter hardly dared to bring forth his rods because of this. Bullitt showed a mixture of ignorance of research, and the behavior of a smart-Aleck.

Feb. 26th: Letters, M and B levitation, VCO; no record of responsibility for lashing; letters handled by C. L. Hyde. SAB, M levitation, touches, identifications (of personal objects).

Feb. 27th: Letters, M and B levitation, VCO; lashing mainly by O’Brien; no record of responsibility for letters. SAB, touches; with respect to the latter the following excerpt from the record is pertinent:

Under similar strict conditions [of double control] Walter pulled O’Brien’s hair, and the latter declared that he thought this had been done by teeth. Thereupon the experiment was repeated with O’Brien controlling not only the Psychic’s left hand but also her head; and Mrs. Baker controlling her right hand and both of Crandon’s hands. Under these conditions O’Brien got a pull at the back of his hair that made him cry out in pain.

Mar. 4th: Letters, M and B levitation, VCO; lashing “by the men”; letters handled by Van Arsdale. SAB, activation.

Mar. 8th: Letters, identifications, VCO; lashing “in the usual manner” by the visitors; letters handled by Sawyer. SAB, activation.

Mar. 12th: Letters, B, D and M levitation, VCO; no record of responsibility for lashing; letters handled by Bradley. SAB, activation.

Mar. 13th: Letters, M, B and D levitation, VCO; lashing by Little and Morse; letters handled by Morse. Raps.

Mar. 22d: Letters, M levitation, VCO; lashing by Swift and Baker; letters handled by Swift. SAB, activation, scales (for the first time in a standardized séance). The megaphone levitation in the glass cabinet under wired control merits the following quotation from the record:

—J. M. B.

8 Her position between Crandon and O’Brien made specific control of Crandon’s head superfluous; he could not have got past her with it to operate upon O’Brien.

9 See Chapter XXXVI.
Next, with the door [of the glass cabinet] closed, he lifted the heavy luminous megaphone. It took much force to do this, as it got stuck between the medium and the wall of the cabinet. While it was up in the air moving about like a great fish, one of the men sitters was in contact with each of the Psychic's hands, the door of the cabinet was closed, and Crandon was adequately controlled.

Mar. 23d: Letters, B, D and M levitation, VCO; lashing by Davis and Winslow; no record of handling of letters. SAB, scales. It was at this séance that Davis found it possible partly to beat the head control that had been in use to that date. Following his demonstration, the séance of March 26th, in spite of its restricted personnel, was of a double importance. It saw the first trial of two innovations—one designed to meet Davis's discovery, the other to eliminate the possibility uncovered by Sherburne on February 22d. We may let the record speak for itself, referring the reader to page 275 for a full description of the remodelled glass tip for the VCO machine:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, March 26, 1926. Present to left: Mrs. Stinson, Crandon, the Psychic. This sitting was to try out two things: First, the new glass tip so arranged as to fill completely the orifice of the lips and thus make it impossible for the middle hole through which the machine is blown up to be anywhere in the mouth orifice except the middle; and, second, to test out Walter's cognition and levitation in the glass cabinet with the head controlled by a cord running from the collar back horizontally to a screw bolt in the back panel of the cabinet.

The Psychic having been lashed as usual but with the new head control as written above, Walter proceeded not only to name correctly and levitate unknown letters on the shelf in front of the Psychic, but also to levitate and name letters correctly from a basket on the floor of the cabinet.

The VCO machine with the new glass tip was now used. The machine was blown up and Walter proceeded to talk and whistle freely. He whistled "Old Black Joe" on request and then, when asked to recite some of his last poem, he modified it by saying: "Live thou this day as though you had a past."

There had been at one sitting a lawyer, Sherburne, who for many years, as a chronic joke on his friends, had developed the ability to hold a pipe to one corner of his mouth and whistle with the other

10 See pages 332, 345.
11 See pages 275, 358.
corner. There is probably not another man in the next ten thousand who could do this, but he said: “I can only do it by putting your glass tip in the extreme corner of my mouth, with the end against the side of my tongue. If you could make a tip, the orifice of which is maintained in the middle of my mouth, you have me beaten.”

Sitting closed at 9:15 p.m. after Walter had thrown four baskets all over the place in excessive good spirits.

The séances immediately following the above may be disposed of by tabulation of the bare essentials:

Mar. 27th: letters, M levitation, identification (of personal objects), VCO; no record of responsibility for lashing but it is evident to one familiar with Lime Street routine that a large share in this would be assigned Overstreet; letters handled by Overstreet. SAB, scales, activation.

Mar. 30th: letters, B and M levitation, identification, VCO; lashing by Johnston, MacIntosh and Furman; letters handled by Eddy. SAB, scales.

Apr. 1st: letters, B and M levitation, identifications, VCO; no record of responsibility for lashing or letters. SAB, scales.

Apr. 6th: B levitation, letters; no record of responsibility for lashing or letters. SAB, scales.

We come now to four standardized séances in connection with which the recording is on an entirely different basis from that met in those of the current chapter. Alike on this ground, and to provide a pause for survey of the exact development attained by the standardized séance at this date, we may terminate the present chapter here and give a new head to the four evenings in question. But before we come to these evenings, in Chapter XXXIV, we must bring certain other aspects of our story more nearly up to date, so that the chronological sequence may not suffer too much in the interests of the topical.
CHAPTER XXX
A Distinguished Sitter and His Reaction
By the Editor

John Haynes Holmes is pastor of the Community Church in New York; and I think all the other Unitarian and non-denominational clergymen of the metropolis would gladly echo the statement that of their number he is easily the most famous. He is likewise one of the editors of Unity, the Unitarian weekly. His attitude toward psychical research and Spiritualism has always been one of interest, but an interest which must be recognized as a very one-sided one. It had impelled him to keep up with the published reports of the case; and in response to Hoagland's Atlantic article it had moved him to an editorial, of which the following extract completely characterizes his outlook upon the subject:

If anything could be definite and final, this is it. Margery, like every other medium ever adequately investigated, is consciously or unconsciously a fraud. To us this is an ineffable, an indescribable relief. If any medium ever proved his case, we should fall into despair indeed. For if the dead have no better occupation than tipping tables and ringing bells, if they have no higher mentality than that revealed in the communications vouchsafed us by the séances, then we do not want to die.

Following the appearance of this editorial, Holmes found himself involved in two exchanges of correspondence. The one was with Professor Keith, who replied to the editorial in a lengthy letter seeking to instruct Holmes in the generalities of psychical research. His reply was pretty cocky; for instance, it contained the sentence:

My mind is at least closed to the extent that I shall never take the trouble to read anything further about Mme. Paladino, and in the same way I shall never waste another moment of time on Margery.

Professor Keith's reply to this letter pursued the matter quite relentlessly, and in the meantime Holmes had had some light from another source; so that when he published, in Unity for March 1st, 1926, his
A DISTINGUISHED SITTER AND HIS REACTION

entire correspondence with her, he did so rather by way of recording a liberalization which his viewpoint had undergone; and he signalized this liberalization particularly by means of a footnote to the above sentence, in these words:

I am ready to withdraw this statement as unfair. I shall keep an open mind toward Margery until at least my own first-hand experience can guide me.

In the meantime, the second correspondence referred to above was well under way, between Holmes and Crandon. The latter had seen the November 6th editorial, and had at once been struck by the possibility that if the writer thereof could be persuaded to gain some first-hand knowledge of the subject, his strength of mind was such that he would not be afraid or ashamed to alter even so emphatic a published viewpoint. The extreme worthwhileness of an attempt to bring about such an alteration led Crandon to write Holmes, inviting him to attend a séance. The proposal was at first rebuffed in much the spirit of the above quotation from the Holmes-Keith letter; but the simultaneous progress of his correspondence with Crandon and Professor Keith, plus his own native intelligence and fairness, made him see that this attitude was too radical. There remained some very concrete doubts in his mind: such, for instance, as the question whether he was expected to report his observations as absolute facts, or merely as facts within his best knowledge. Further correspondence with Crandon cleared these points up; Crandon's very sane attitude toward the Walter personality appealed to him; and the upshot was that he attended his first Margery séance on January 23rd, 1926. In the interval, he had put himself through an intensive course of reading in the attempt to catch up on the favorable side of the published discussion. In particular, he was impressed by the M. H. V. pamphlet. His first séance was not his last; but a chronological pursuit of his contact with the case requires that we set down next parts of an editorial which he wrote after his first visit to Lime Street, and which appeared in Unity for March 8th, 1926. Referring to his previous statement and then to M. H. V., he says:

After reading this pamphlet we feel in honor bound to state to our readers that, in our judgment, it opens up the whole question once again and thus completely discredits our previous editorial

1 See page 354.
Margery has not been proved a fraud. On the contrary, the explanation of her marvelous performances on the ground of fraud seems to have completely broken down. The reality of what she is doing under strictest control is established, and the spirit hypothesis is one which must be at least considered. In saying this, we are shaking the convictions of a life-time. But we are interested in convictions only as they are consistent with truth, and truth is what we want. Incidentally, thanks to the courtesy of Dr. Crandon, we are ourselves having sittings with Margery, and thus seeing things for ourselves. For the first time we are witnessing phenomena which are impressive. What they mean we are not prepared to say, but our mind, like our eyes, is wide open.

One cannot sufficiently praise the candor and courage of this statement. Holmes's attitude toward the convictions of a life-time shines with particular brilliance in contrast with McDougall's.\(^2\)

Holmes is a very busy man, and cannot get to Boston save at rare intervals. Ever since January, 1926, whenever he is in or near Boston he makes a point of getting to Lime Street for one or more séances; and his name recurs several times in the list of sitters. Nor has he shunned the burden of public and private support of the mediumship. Following the above editorial, he had a letter from Prince, imploring him not to "commit" himself until Prince had had an opportunity to inform him about the case; and attempts to drag him out by the coat-tails were also made in the name of Houdini and others. He has not consented to be dragged; without any display of prejudice pro or con he continues his interest in the phenomena, and his imperviousness to extraneous considerations such as public favor or private scandal.

\(^2\) *M. M.*, p. 476.
CHAPTER XXXI

Another Committee

By the Editor, and from the Records

At some risk of repeating what has been said in Chapter XVI, we must now turn back to survey the situation created by my "official" séances of 1925; first of all taking account of my own viewpoint as brought into this program. My contact with the Margery case had been unique in more ways than I can conveniently catalog. When I was introduced to it in November, 1923, I was a comparative newcomer in psychical research. I carried a large presumption of general scientific competence, while being obviously free from any fixed ideas about the generalities of psychical phenomena. With reference to the particularities of this case I had equally clean hands, having been a total stranger to the medium and to all of her friends. From that date to the August sittings in 1925, I enjoyed more séances, a greater variety of phenomena, and an incomparably better opportunity for extra-séance observation of the Psychic and her immediate family and friends, than any other person whose initial qualifications in the three respects just mentioned could by any possibility be compared with mine. The very fact that the fraudulence of the mediumship cannot be maintained without giving me the position of accomplice in the séance room and press-agent outside it is ample evidence of all this. And this unique exposure to the mediumship has entirely convinced me of its validity.

A double duty is accordingly imposed upon me in my further contacts with the case. I must endeavor to obtain proof of validity which shall make the same appeal to the absentee critic as to the observer present through a long series of sittings. At the same time I must seek for all possible data on the precise nature of the phenomena, the precise conditions under which they do or do not occur, the psychic modus operandi, and the underlying prime causes. And prosecuting these two aims more or less simultaneously, it must be evident that I may meet complete defeat in the one direction while scoring a conspicuous success in the other. This was in fact what had happened to me during the summer of 1925. In the evidential phase my enter-
prise had been a failure; in its collateral scientific phase it had been a distinct and altogether worth-while success.

Now there had been, and in the nature of the case there could be, no definite plans as to the duration of my official study of the mediumship, or the number of sittings to be given me. These factors necessarily had to depend upon the course of events as we went along. There must, however, come a time at which we shall wish to pause and look behind us with the surveying eye; to ask ourselves how we are coming along; and particularly to decide whether we shall stop or go on. The vehicle through which all this was done was a report rendered by me to the Research Committee of the Society's Trustees, dated December 10th, 1925. In this I said:

I call particular attention to the fact that no consecutive program was followed out. I had drawn up a statement of intentions, in great detail, which gave major place to examination of the telekinetic phenomena of the mediumship. This program was followed at the first three sittings, at which I had substantial direction of the procedure, to such degree that I did numerous things the use of which Crandon could not see, or to which he was more or less actively opposed. Thereafter, Walter's or Crandon's will was insidiously substituted for mine, in a way which I could never quite put my finger upon for purposes of effective resistance. The upshot is that my records of these sittings must be taken as detached documents. As such I feel that they are important and a justification of the work done. But of course my orderly progress with the case was defeated, and I feel that nothing was added to the pre-existing proofs of validity; with the exception of the independent voice, which stands better than it did by virtue of the work done with Richardson's machine. This, however, is only incidentally connected with my study of the case, and would have been done as well without my cooperation as with it.

The report went on to discuss matters of personnel. It had been hoped to secure for me adequate academic or technical aid, from persons who were not open to the objection of prior contact with the case. The summer season was the major factor in defeating this hope. Questions of control, of arrangement of sitters, of illumination, etc., were discussed, and recommendation made for future procedure. Then I dealt with the matter of investigational range, in the following terms:

Of all investigators to whom the case has been exposed since the beginning I am in the unique position of not having any urge
toward the rapid promulgation of final conclusions of some sort. I have therefore been the only one who can study the case carefully and slowly, seeking no undue speed toward any particular end, but simply publishing my records of observed facts as I go along.

In every case where an investigator or a group of investigators has felt the urge toward a conclusion of some sort, their published conclusion has been unfavorable. It was so with the Harvard group of 1923, with the Scientific American Committee, with the McDougall-Worcester examination of late 1924, with Dingwall, with the Code-Hoagland enterprise. It is clear that this is inherent; nobody can rapidly reach and publish a favorable conclusion. The facts are too new and strange; the investigator must have a long time to accustom himself to them and to satisfy himself that there is some hope of an orderly explanation for them, before he can be expected to give a public pronouncement favorable to them.

Published unfavorable conclusions are of no permanent scientific merit save as they turn out to be in line with the ultimate facts. They are, however, here and now a serious embarrassment to me. They disturb the mediumship and interfere with its results. They set the public mind against the mediumship and against our work in general, thus setting us back in the sense of getting public credit for our results. This public discrediting of our field and our cases makes it more difficult than it should be for me to get adequate assistance at the points where my work impinges on other fields of science.

Further, I find that Walter and Crandon are not able to keep my work separate from that of other people who are investigating the case simultaneously. Three times I have gone to Boston for sittings by appointment, to have my investigation merged into Dr. Richardson's without my prior knowledge or my consent. I have no criticism of Dr. Richardson's aims or of his program. But I was doing something different. If it is impossible for Walter to follow two distinct lines of research at the same time, in two separate series of sittings, this is an argument, not for dealing with two investigations as though they were one, but for trying only to deal with one.

Partly in the text of this report and partly through personal interview, I put before the Trustees at this time my opinions as to the way in which the Society should proceed in its future work with the Margery case. I was under no handicaps in my pursuit of the sci-
entific problems involved; I felt it profitable to go to Boston whenever these called me there. But in the attempt to determine whether or no the mediumship were susceptible of a demonstration of validity that would meet the standards held out by intelligent skepticism, I was doubly handicapped. I was handicapped in the séance room by my friendship with the Crandons, as the report set out in detail. I was handicapped out of the séance room by my known conviction of validity, which in my case as with a long line of distinguished predecessors from Crookes down, is popularly distorted into a prejudice toward validity. So on every ground, it seemed best to confine my future work with Margery to the scientific aspects; and for the Society either to abandon the task of proving here and now, to the man in the street, whether the mediumship were valid or not, or for it to seek a new agency through which to attempt this proof. Such new agency might of course be an individual or a committee; all that was necessary was that, on the part of individual investigator or of committee members, there exist an open mind, an absence of recorded judgment, and a complete freedom from prior acquaintance with the Crandons.

While my report was in preparation, I had discussed all this with individual Trustees, and there was a unanimous feeling that further effort should be made for the publishable verdict. Before the report was submitted the matter had progressed to the point where the nucleus for a new Committee had been found, in the person of Dr. Henry Clay McComas, Professor of Experimental Psychology at Princeton. He seemed in every way eligible; he was distinctly interested; and he thought it probable that he could make acceptable recommendations for filling out the Committee. In the interim he went to Boston for a preliminary contact with the case. Crandon's record of this occasion (December 15th, 1925) is the only one available:

Using the glass cabinet, the Psychic was wired in and fastened in the usual way by McComas. Walter came through promptly and McComas, after introduction, immediately asked if he could put his hand over the Psychic's mouth. To this Walter replied, "Some time but not tonight." He then proceeded to ask Walter about Walter's occupation and to this Walter replied that he was busy under orders working on a problem of communication in order that anyone might act as a medium. Pressed for details, Walter said it was a problem in wave lengths.

We then proceeded to try for a sitting alone with McComas with levitation of the doughnut within the cabinet, the other sitters
being all in the hallway. This was tried for twelve minutes without results, the Psychic being in trance. This was the period of the catamenia and it was physiologically improper to sit. Nevertheless Walter now proceeded to use Richardson's VCO machine with all of us standing in the doorway. McComas tested the patenty of the tube and put it in the Psychic's mouth. Several times her mouth got tired and he had to take it out for a rest, but finally the floats were blown up and Walter recited his poem:

"Live thou this day as though it were thy last"—and whistled at great length. The whole demonstration lasted a minute and a half. McComas then took the tip from the Psychic's mouth, tested it and observed that it was patent and in working order.

Walter now directed everyone to go down stairs except Richardson and with him had a private conference. On reassembling Walter instructed Richardson to hold the doughnut within the cabinet, whereupon Walter performed the general free levitation of the doughnut in the cabinet. One of the reasons of the difficulty tonight is apparently the fact that Walter had to use teleplasm derived from the right ear of the Psychic.

The Psychic was now released from her lashings by McComas who found all controls as they were before the sitting. We now adjourned to the old cabinet and after some talk Walter allowed McComas to pick up the Scientific American bell-box, turn 360 degrees and put it down again. This was repeated, the second time being very well done with irregular intermittency of the ringing.

While Crandon was out at the telephone and under conditions of double control, McComas received several touches.

As a resident of Baltimore, McComas is acquainted with members of the Johns Hopkins faculty. When it came to naming his colleagues for a Margery inquiry, he passed over his immediate associates of the Princeton faculty and nominated Dr. Robert W. Wood, Professor of Physics in the Baltimore institution, and Dr. Knight Dunlap, its Professor of Psychology. The former gentleman, particularly, is known as one of the leaders in his field for America. Nothing specific was known by me or any of my Trustees regarding qualifications or disqualifications of Wood and Dunlap for psychical research; they were accepted by the Society on McComas's judgment and say-so. The entire group went to Boston in late January, 1926; and on the 26th there was held an entirely informal séance for the purpose of intro-
This was the first meeting of the Commission of Inquiry of the A.S.P.R. to study the phenomena of the Margery mediumship. This meeting, however, was only for getting acquainted and was not part of the official study of the case. Walter came through promptly, but slightly acid; partly reflecting the Psychic's strain and fear of a new Committee and partly because the company did not talk freely. The sitting was held in the old cabinet.

It was quickly noted that Wood could only hear in part the whispered voice of Walter, and Dunlap heard nothing. Both these gentlemen admitted it, Wood saying he could hear the lightest whisper better than the rather strident whisper, and Dunlap saying that he had not heard a whisper since childhood.

Walter now proceeded to work with the Scientific American bell-box. He instructed Dunlap to pick it up in the red light and he did so, turning round 360 degrees and then putting it back; the bell rang intermittently during this time. On a repetition of the experiment Dunlap held the box aloft between his eye and the light, Dunlap's back being towards the Psychic. The bell rang intermittently and finally stopped and then, while still in that position, Dunlap asked Walter to ring it again and he did so. This had never been done before.

Walter then made the unlighted doughnut glow two or three times, and then after we lighted it up he moved it about on the table more or less. The Psychic was in trance throughout.

The necessity of some sort of working agreement as to what may and what may not be done by a group of investigators strange alike to the case and to Crandon is evident; and such agreement is always exacted by Crandon of a new investigator or a new Committee. In the present instance, the following document, which seems entirely self-explanatory, was worked out between the several parties and signed prior to the first official séance:

CONVENTION between Dr. L. R. G. Crandon and The Commission of Inquiry of the American Society for Psychical Research organized to study the phenomena of the "Margery" Mediumship.

1. The Commission shall be represented by a chairman who alone shall be authorized to speak for the Commission in official contact with the case and in the conduct of the investigation.
2. The sittings shall take place in Boston but not all necessarily at 10 Lime Street.

3. Sittings are subject to cancellation when the Psychic's health makes it necessary.

4. Dr. Crandon or Dr. Mark W. Richardson must be present at all sittings. Dr. Crandon shall not be excluded without his own consent, but such consent shall not be arbitrarily withheld against the wishes of the Commission.

5. No psychic structure shall be touched or interfered with in any way and no light of any hue shall be turned on during the sitting except with the consent of the control (Walter). If either of the conditions of this paragraph is broken, the whole investigation shall cease at once and the episode shall be considered an admission that the Commissioners have broken their word as gentlemen and scientists.

6. The complete narrative of observational notes of each sitting, dictaphonic if possible, signed by all present, shall be handed to Dr. Crandon before another sitting takes place. Fraud or suggestion of fraud in the production of phenomena which does not appear in these notes shall be deemed non-existent and this is considered an acknowledgment of that condition by the Commissioners. But the Commissioners are under no obligation to include in such notes any statement of comment or explanatory hypotheses as to the true nature of observed phenomena. Fraud observed and noted in the record of any sitting shall be deemed to open the record of all previous sittings as to the possibility of unobserved fraud having occurred in such sittings.

7. Dr. Crandon shall have a copy of every photograph taken and he shall hold the copyright thereof. Dr. Crandon, however, agrees that the Commission shall have the right to publish the photographs in their report.

8. No news of publication of the progress of the study shall be issued except with the consent of every one involved. At the close of the study Dr. Crandon shall have the privilege of publishing the notes but only in their entirety unless the Commission does so within a reasonable time.

9. Use of the word Walter meaning "the control" and such expressions as "Walter's hand" and "Walter's terminal" etc. shall not be deemed by any of the contracting parties an admission as to the nature and structure of the mechanism so referred to.

10. It is understood that every aid and facility reasonably possible shall be afforded the Commission to pursue its study; suggestions made by the Commission as to the place of sitting, varia-
tions of control, adaptations and use of apparatus, arrangement of séance room paraphernalia, sitters, etc., shall be complied with as far as possible, and the reasons for refusing such compliance shall be made part of the narrative or observational notes if required by the Commission.

11. All matters in dispute shall be settled by a body consisting of two trustees of the A.S.P.R. and Dr. Mark W. Richardson.

January 27, 1926.

(Signed) H. C. McComas, Chairman
Knight Dunlap
R. W. Wood
L. R. G. Crandon

The Psychic’s interests being, in Crandon’s judgment, duly safeguarded by this document, the official séances were proceeded with. As a measure of recording economy, a separate statement of the control conditions in the glass cabinet was made, carrying the date, January 27th, of the first official séance. Through oversight, the séance record proper then fails to state that these conditions obtained; but it is clear from the separate statement that they did. This séance record was produced by dictation to a stenographer, present in a corner of the room with a faint red light, and a technique, new in this mediumship, was pursued under which all the Committee members indiscriminately dictated, each statement in the record carrying indication of its immediate source. The general statement of control and the record of January 27th follow:

The conditions of mechanical control for the first official sitting are what we may call control by wire lashing. It is understood hereafter in the notes of this Commission when that descriptive phrase is used that the control is in every detail similar to the following description. The expression control by wire lashing is meant and understood to be precisely as follows, throughout all subsequent notes of this Commission.

The Psychic is clad in a single garment (kimono), stockings and shoes. She and her garments are examined by a woman at the request of the Commission before and after the sitting and it is understood that if nothing of importance is discovered that nothing need be said in these records.

In bright white light now, there are tied around the Psychic’s wrists and ankles long pieces of number three picture wire. The part going around the limb is protected against cutting the skin
by rubber tubing. All knots are either made, observed in the making or tested by the Commission. A leather collar is padlocked around the Psychic’s neck by a Commissioner and the key kept in his possession.

The Psychic is now conducted by a Commissioner into the red lighted séance room and there seats herself in a Windsor chair in the Richardson plate-glass cabinet. The ends of the wrist and ankle ties are now threaded through and round fused closed-ring eye-bolts on the floor and through the sides of the cabinet respectively. They are securely tied, observed in the tying or inspected by the Commission and the ends threaded through American Railway Express lead seals and sealed by a member of the Commission. Heavy twine is tied by a Commissioner to the leather collar in knots peculiar to himself and the other end is similarly tied to a fused eye-bolt in the roof of the cabinet. The excursion for the feet is not over six inches. The excursion for the hands is not over two inches; for the head not over six inches forwards, nine inches sideways.

At the end of the sitting again in good red light the wire lashings and head control are inspected by the Commission and found to be as originally made, unless stated to the contrary in the records. The control lashings are then cut away by a member of the Committee.

McComas: At Walter’s suggestion, the light was turned on and Wood got a bag full of solid letters and Wood put a couple of handful of these letters upon a shelf which Crandon had placed in the cabinet during red light. Wood states that the letters were not identified by him when placed on the shelf.

McComas: One of the letters came forward, fell at my feet and Walter said it was the letter “K”; McComas stating it felt like the figure “4.” According to Wood’s watch, it is 9:15 P.M.

McComas: Another letter fell to floor. Walter said it was “O” and to McComas it seemed to be “O.” Dunlap also guessed it to be “O” and put it in his pocket.

Dunlap: Walter says the red light has lit up all the luminous spots in the room.¹

Wood: The letter “C” placed in the hands of Dunlap, his hands containing the luminous disc. Walter states it is the letter “C” and it is the said letter.

¹See open reference No. 13, Vol. 2.
McComas: Holding the illuminated doughnut in the palm of left hand, placed the hand on the shelf and Walter said he gave me the letter "S" which proved to be the true letter.

Dunlap: Holding doughnut, knuckles on shelf, Walter gives me the letter "U" which is correct.

McComas: I have Psyche's right hand and Crandon's left hand; Dunlap has Crandon's other hand, and Wood has Psyche's other hand.

The letter "C" fell to the floor according to Walter.

Another letter fell to the floor which Walter said was "ZED"—McComas having Psyche's right hand and Wood controlling the Psyche's left hand all the time.

McComas: At 9:32 p.m., according to Crandon, Crandon removed the shelf.

Dunlap: Dunlap holding basket in front of cabinet felt a good, strong pull on basket. Dunlap held on and Walter let go.

McComas: I have control of Psyche's right hand; Walter takes basket and after moving it up and around, outside of cage, Walter drops basket on the floor.

Dunlap: McComas makes the estimate that basket was raised about 5 1/2 feet, Wood estimates about 5 feet and Dunlap less than 5 feet.

McComas: Just before levitation of the basket, the luminous point nearest the cabinet disappeared on my side of the basket. I had control of Psyche's right hand throughout the episode.

Dunlap: Wood estimates the basket was in levitation ten seconds and Dunlap and McComas estimate less than ten seconds. Dunlap states pull seemed to be straight in toward the cabinet.

Dunlap: During holding of basket, pulling of basket and levitation of basket, Dunlap was controlling Crandon's right hand with his (Dunlap's) left hand and McComas controlled Crandon's left hand.

McComas: McComas has his left arm all around basket and cannot feel any strings or other attachments to basket and examining the 3-pound luminous megaphone can find no strings or threads attached to it. Crandon's left hand is resting upon McComas' right; Dunlap controls with his left hand the right hand of Crandon; Dunlap's left knee rests against the right knee of Crandon; Crandon's right foot is against Dunlap's left foot and Crandon's head is on Dunlap's shoulder.

Dunlap: Dunlap now has both of Crandon's hands.

McComas: Lifting the basket so that I held it by the top, and tilting it slightly sideways, I felt a distinct pull on the basket on
Psyche’s right, which levitated the basket several inches and thrust it out of my hand.

_Dunlap_: McComas holding basket, he let go, it went back, came forward, down and up, taps and knocks. Both of Psyche’s hands were controlled during this episode.

_McComas_: With door closed and locked, the key remaining in same, McComas reached through opening in door of cabinet, levitated basket until about a foot above wooden panel of door, when McComas distinctly felt strong pressure on basket at Psyche’s right, the pressure being toward the east. In the first effort, the basket fell to the floor. This was repeated and on the second effort the basket was levitated at approximately a height of 5 feet and thrown toward the east back corner of Psyche’s cabinet. Walter invited McComas to enter cabinet to retrieve basket. On hands and knees, McComas thrust his head in as far as Psyche’s knee on Psyche’s left side. In this position, Walter hit him on the head with the megaphone several times. The megaphone was originally on the west side.

_Dunlap_: Dunlap was controlling Crandon’s hands, feet and head throughout the preceding experiment.

_McComas_: The episode of the basket was repeated and basket was thrown to the west back of Psyche as before. The basket in this episode went back of cabinet, came forward, and struck cabinet front several times. According to estimate of McComas, basket was in the air on the level of McComas’ chin while standing, approximately 30 seconds.

_Wood_: Cold breeze felt on left cheek.

_McComas_: Megaphone now in levitation, now partly out of the cabinet, partly towards the luminous disc on Wood’s head. Megaphone has big end pointed that way. McComas holding Psyche’s right hand; Wood holding Psyche’s left hand. Megaphone is now out of cabinet.

_Wood_: Megaphone out of cabinet, trying to hit luminous disc on my head; megaphone makes repeated contact with my forehead.

_Wood_: Holding luminous disc at door of cabinet, luminous disc taken from fingers and levitated for 20 seconds in the cabinet.

_McComas_: I have control of Psyche’s right hand. We had a complete circle while levitation was going on.

(Signed) H. C. McComas, Knight Dunlap, R. W. Wood.
The Commission’s second séance was held on the following night, January 28th. The action was largely blank, and what phenomena were obtained were preceded by a very long period of waiting. The conditions of sitting were different from those of the first official séance. Crandon’s own record covers the action of the séance quite as well as the one dictated by the other sitters during the séance; and certain collateral facts and claims it covers better. With the obvious reservation that the members of the Commission would not accept all these collateral elements, we shall then save space and get along faster with our story by using Crandon’s record:

Sitting in the old cabinet: Miss Barbero, secretary, was seated at a table behind the cabinet with a dim red light by which to write. The Psychic’s wrists and ankles were so sore from the tight wires of the previous night that she and Crandon sat tonight with luminous band controls sewed on and with the hope of getting some of the red light phenomena of which we have had so many examples.

Trance came on almost at once but Walter did not speak for about twenty minutes, at which time he announced that he was going to try for visible teleplasm and asked for the luminous coordinate board. This was vitalized and put on the table. During the next hour Walter spoke but rarely and then to make fun of Dunlap who constantly felt for the Psychic’s feet, or to admonish Wood to keep his hands still and where they belonged.

A mass giving a silhouette extending as far as the second inch mark on the board was seen by all coming forth over the Psychic’s edge of the table and going back. This was accompanied by groans suggesting labor pains. Nothing more was accomplished and Walter did not say good night.

At the end of the sitting both Dunlap and Wood complained that the Psychic had held their fingers so tight that they were numb. The Psychic seemed greatly exhausted.

About 1:00 A.M., the Psychic being asleep, Crandon was wakened by Walter² and he asked Walter why he tried for teleplasm at the second sitting with this group, who properly should not see it until they had had many sittings. Walter replied: “I was trying a little psychological experiment to see how these men would behave. Wood during the whole sitting kept pawing about over the abdomen and thighs of the Psychic. I did not dare bring out the teleplasm under these conditions. It was to stop this that the Kid held on so tight to Wood as to hurt his fingers. We will

sit only in the glass cabinet hereafter where we will be safe from such behavior. These men, excepting McComas, don’t hear everything and don’t talk. The result is a heavy air of concentration and boredom which is hard to work under. We will do the best we can."

A catamenial reaction in the Psychic followed January 29, ten days ahead of time; showing a physiological effect of the efforts of this sitting.

Before this sitting, while the Psychic was down stairs, the rest were gathered in the séance room. Wood put forward the idea that Walter recognized the letters by the sound they made when they struck the floor. This does not seem to be a tenable theory. The Psychic did not hear this remark nor did anyone tell her of it. Nevertheless, during the 1:00 A.M. conversation, Walter said, "What a fool idea that was of Wood’s that I tell the letters by the sound they make on the floor. I always name them before they hit the floor.” Here is a clear-cut case of Walter’s knowing something of an event in the top room of which by no chance could the Psychic know.

Reference to page 374 will indicate how it was possible for Wood to free his left hand for purposes of exploration; Dunlap sat at his left. Inasmuch as I have done the same thing myself when the occasion seemed to demand it, ³ I am in no position to protest on general principles against Wood’s action. Indeed, the absolute prohibition against the investigator’s use of his hands is evidently one of those things which would be of great aid to the fraudulent medium, and the necessity of which in a genuine case is not immediately apparent. Especially in view of the large probability that the maintenance of the unbroken circle is entirely a subjective factor, it seems most rash to condemn a reasonable degree of exploration. On the other hand, our clear belief that where the phenomena occur genuinely they are the product of a teleplasmic machinery makes it self-evident that too much pawing about in the vicinity of the medium might have unfortunate effects. It is perhaps worth nothing that on the occasion cited in the preceding footnote, when my own pawing resulted in evidence favorable to the medium, there was no suggestion from any of her supporters that I was out of order; but it is equally true that my pawing was not extremely close to her or over an extremely wide region of space. In the absence of general principles upon which all parties may agree,

³ See M. M., p. 399.
this business of tactual exploration of the region around the medium must be considered on its merits every time it arises. That some adverse weight ought to be attached to the present episode may be granted but I am equally in no doubt that Wood, in pawing about the medium, would do so to an objectionable degree.

For the third Commission séance, held on January 30th, we may return to the record dictated by the official sitters. The séance, despite Walter's dictum to Crandon on the morning of the 29th, was held in the old cabinet with personal control of the Psychic; this the record omits to state specifically.

**Wood:** 9:10. I am holding Margery's left hand, her left foot is near my right foot, her knees are in contact with my right hand.

**Dunlap:** 9:10. I am holding Margery's right hand with my hand, knuckle down on her leg just above the knee, her right foot on my left foot. I have Crandon's left hand in my right and the combined hands are resting on Crandon's left knee.

**McComas:** 9:10. I have Crandon's right hand and it is resting on his knee, also his head is on my shoulder and he has a capital "C" painted on his sleeve. There is a luminous spot on Psyche's forehead, a luminous band on each sleeve and a luminous band on each ankle. The bell-box is on the table in the usual position, that is to say, the platform shelves toward the west (toward Wood).

**Dunlap:** 9:15. Wood rang the bell.

**Wood:** 9:25. Control very close; no manifestations.

**Wood:** 9:30. Psyche states that the circle is not properly completed as my hands are touching Dunlap's. Control changed so as to avoid contact of my hand with that of Dunlap. No sign of trance.

**Wood:** 9:40. No signs of trance; no signs of anything. Asked Psyche if she was uncomfortable or wanted the controls changed and she said no, she could stand it as long as we could. Psyche laughs at this.

**Wood:** 9:45. Wood suggests that he and McComas change places, which was done.

**Dunlap** 9:52. Psyche's right hand contracting strongly, gripping my left hand, continuous contractions of the fingers.

**McComas:** 9:53. My control at present is, my right knee against Psyche's left knee, my left ankle against her right ankle and my fingers around her wrist.4

---

4 Sic. See open reference 18, Vol. 2.—J. M. B.
Wood: 9:55. Wood suggested that the Psychic’s knees be in contact with each other and it was done. Crandon said this would probably prevent the protrusion of the Psychic’s teleplasmic rods which are supposed to issue from the thighs.

McComas: 9:59. The control of the two knees by my right hand has been discontinued.5

Dunlap: 10:05. Psyche breathing hard, squeezing my hand.

McComas: 10:07. Psyche’s left ankle raised into my lap, my right hand upon Psyche’s knee and I am holding her hand.

McComas: 10:17. Walter said, “No, she isn’t. Hold your horses.” My control consists in holding Psyche’s left hand and Psyche’s feet are in my lap.

Dunlap: 10:17. I am holding Psyche’s right hand, resting slightly above her knee and her right foot is now on my left foot.

McComas: 10:20. Walter evidently trying to get force enough to do something. He says, “I never saw such a bunch of stiff’s in all my life.” He also says, “Talk about dead people; My God!”

McComas: 10:22. Some conversation between Walter and the members of the circle. Not to be published, says Walter.

McComas: 10:24. Margery’s querulous voice said, “I am in awful pain, don’t feel good anyhow.” Walter replied, “Nobody gives a damn, if you are.”

McComas: 10:26. I have both of Psyche’s ankles in my lap and her left hand in my right hand.

Dunlap: 10:26. I have Psyche’s right hand in my left hand, held upward in the air and it is moving somewhat as she twists.

McComas: 10:30. Something cold and moist slapped me on my hand. Just a moment after, Dunlap remarked that something cold struck him on the hand. I have both of Psyche’s ankles in my lap.

McComas: 10:31. My hand just came in contact with a small, ribbed substance which was immediately removed from my hand. I have Psyche’s left hand in my right.


McComas: 10:32. Cold, rod-like substance touched me on thumb and immediately disappeared. Psyche’s head constantly moving. Psyche twisting and groaning. Both her ankles are now in my lap.

5 See open reference No. 18, Vol. 2.
McComas: 10:35. Psyche constantly repeats, in querulous voice, that she does not feel good.

McComas: 10:36. Luminous doughnut is placed on the table and between myself and the doughnut appears a dark, round-like structure, which waves up and down. The rod-like structure has reappeared.

McComas: 10:37. Walter's voice: "Hold your horses, I will show you in a minute."

McComas: 10:38. The rod-like structure moved the doughnut a couple of inches toward Wood.

McComas: 10:40. Apparently, rod-like structure is lying right across doughnut. McComas requested Walter that it bend to right angle. Psyche twisting and writhing as the rod moves.

Dunlap: 10:41. Psyche moved Dunlap's hand over into contact with a cold, smooth, cylindrical something.

McComas: 10:42. Psyche reached over and pressed the back of McComas' hand on a cold, moist substance.

McComas: 10:45. McComas' hand directed to the substance, which he holds between thumb and forefinger, made some slight impression on same. It seemed like a cylindrical substance about 3½ inches in diameter with a hard, bone-like center or axis. Just before this instance, Psyche's voice said "I feel bad here" and pushed my hand up to the point on this cylindrical substance.

Dunlap: 10:47. The "thing" cold and smooth and soft on my fingers. Psyche's right foot now on mine.

McComas: 10:47. Psyche's left foot on my right foot.

McComas: 10:49. The rod-like structure moved the doughnut.

Wood: 10:50. Something touched my fingers again.

Dunlap: 10:50. The "thing" picked up the doughnut in Wood's hand and moved it around against my head.

Dunlap: 10:51. Psyche presses my hand against "it" again.

Wood: 10:53. My hand was on the table holding the luminous doughnut, teleplasmic rod fell in the palm of my hand, feeling like a rigid rod covered with soft leather. It was placed between my thumb and finger which were holding the doughnut. I squeezed it very hard, which produced no ill effect. The rod then slipped through the doughnut and raised it in the air.

McComas: 10:53. Psyche reached over and pulled my left hand over and placed it upon the teleplasmic structure.

McComas: 10:54. Released control of Psyche's right hand though the bracelet is now visible and has been visible throughout.
I now resume control of Psyche's right hand. During the interval in which I did not hold her hand, Wood did have her hand.  

**McComas:** 10:55. Psyche has taken my right hand and laid it firmly on the "teleplasm." The "teleplasm" is now removed. In this case it was on her hand.  

**McComas:** 11:00. Both of Psyche's ankles are in my lap. While speaking, felt a touch of "teleplasm" on my little finger. The "teleplasm" apparently against Psyche's right leg, above the knee.  

**Dunlap:** 11:02. Back of my hand touched by "it" again. It is now touching my fingers.  

**Dunlap:** 11:04. My hand was put over and between my fingers. I felt of "it." It is cold, soft, with rigid ruler-like core. I cannot say whether it is a single or multiple core.  

**McComas:** 11:05. Received rather sharp touch on left hand which is resting on the table, I should judge about a foot from her body, just the other side of Psyche's two ankles.  

**Dunlap:** 11:07. The teleplasmic rod picked doughnut out of my hand, held it several inches above the table, moving it around. In levitation now.  

**Wood:** 11:07. Holding both Crandon's hands during this levitation.  

**McComas:** 11:09. Doughnut waving up and down, sideways; now seems to be nearer to me. Doughnut now resting on table. Psyche has taken right leg from my lap and put it on Dunlap's foot.  

**Wood:** 11:10. Doughnut starting to rise from table with upward movement parallel with movement of luminous band on Psyche's head.  

**Wood:** 11:12. Doughnut is now moving again without any movement of Psyche's head.  

**Dunlap:** 11:12. While levitating, teleplasmic rod struck my fingers. A moment ago, rod touched my fingers again.  

**McComas:** 11:14. Doughnut has dropped to the floor. Several minutes levitation of doughnut.  

**McComas:** 11:15. At my request my hand was taken and placed upon "teleplasmic" rod. The "teleplasmic" rod was standing up in the air. My hand closed around it. Apparently it is very firm with a slightly ruffled effect.  

**Dunlap:** 11:16. I have the rod in my hand. Psyche put my hand over and put the rod between my fingers, pushing my hand along so that the rod pushed through my fingers several inches. It was cold.

Dunlap: 11:18. On cheek, scratching my ear (McComas touching my hand), rapping me on the top of the head and on the back of the head.

Dunlap: 11:19. Walter rapped on the table with the teleplasmic rod, stating he was rapping on my head but he did not. (Joke.)

Wood: 11:20. During the rapping episode, I was holding Crandon’s head in my left hand and Crandon’s face was in contact with my hand.

Dunlap: 11:21. During the rapping phenomena and when I was touched with the rod on the head, I was holding Psyche’s right hand and Crandon’s left hand.

McComas: 11:21. During the time that the teleplasmic rod was striking at Dunlap’s head, Psyche’s ankles were in my lap. One of them passed out at the time but came immediately back, then both of them were out and came back immediately. Psyche’s body was twisting and turning constantly. Psyche turned around in her chair and was apparently over on her right thigh at the time of the strokes upon Dunlap’s head.

McComas: 11:23. McComas feeling Psyche from thigh to knee finds tights. This search made at Crandon’s suggestion.

Dunlap: 11:23. Dunlap finds that Psyche has silk bloomers (tights) on.

McComas: 11:25. Several times Psyche’s left hand slipped through mine so that I had her wrist for a moment, but I have always been in contact with her hand or her wrist.

Dunlap: 11:25. I have had Psyche’s right hand all the time as I recollect.

McComas: 11:26. Psyche said, “I have cramps here” and taking McComas’ hand, placed it on her abdomen at about the umbilical region. McComas can feel a belt. (Dr. Crandon adds that the Psychic is at present unwell.)

McComas: 11:30. Psyche has one foot in my lap and one foot on the table and I have her left hand.

McComas: 11:31. Psyche’s right leg went to the floor and came back again. Walter’s voice informs me I am a liar.

McComas: 11:32. Psyche’s two feet are down now resting on my foot and on Dunlap’s foot.

McComas: 11:32. Just before Psyche came out of the trance, she drew my hand over, placed it on her stomach, just below the umbilical region and it remained there for possibly 10 seconds.

McComas and Dunlap: 11:33. We have broken our control.
The Stenographer (Miss Barbero) reported that she examined and found the Psychic unwell before the sitting and found her unwell after the sitting.

There was nausea and vomiting of the Psychic after the sitting.

Sitting closed at 11:35.

(Signed) H. C. McComas,
Knight Dunlap,
R. W. Wood.

While all this was going on in the séance room, a sequence of events was unfolding outside the séances, the theme of which consisted of acute dissatisfaction by Crandon with reference to the conduct and qualifications of two members of the Commission. By way of demonstration that this attitude had nothing of the ex post facto element in it, I reproduce the following text of a letter written by Crandon to Walton, in the latter's capacity of Counsel to the A.S.P.R. and Chairman of the Committee on Research of the Society's Trustees. It was dated January 27th, and accordingly antedated the first formal séance as well as any production of dictated notes by the Commission. The full letter, omitting only salutations, etc., reads as follows:

The first meeting of your Commission of Inquiry with Margery occurred last night. It was unofficial and only with the idea of getting acquainted.

We find, to our astonishment, that Dr. Wood can only hear a whispered voice of a certain intensity and that Dr. Dunlap has not been able to hear a whispered voice since childhood. Both these scientists are distinguished and delightful gentlemen and were it not for the importance of this inquiry to the whole scientific world we should not speak of this impairment. We feel that the whispered voice of Walter, to say nothing of the occasional musical and other audible phenomena, is perhaps the keystone of the mediumship, and we feel little doubt that the whole inquiry will be slowed up or even perhaps be unsatisfactory because of this condition. In any case please make note that we make exception to this condition before there has been an official sitting.

With reference to Wood's dictation of 10:53 on January 30th, Crandon points out that the behavior here constituted a clear-cut violation of article 5 of the preliminary agreement. The Crandons likewise claim that the most serious results flowed out of this violation, beginning with the nausea and vomiting chronicled at the end of the
record. According to their statement, the catamenia originating out of the séance of the 29th was aggravated on the 30th and remained for seventeen days. During this period the Psychic was in bed for four consecutive days, and she suffered a loss in weight of nineteen pounds. For several days she had persistent crossing of the eyes, violent headache, and other alarming symptoms. No normal diagnosis of her illness could be made.

Against the allegations that they did anything harmful to the Psychic, the Commissioners have vigorously defended themselves. This defence has for the better part taken the direction of a flat denial that she displayed any illness or distress in their presence. In this denial they of course have to meet the equally flat testimony of the written record. A gentleman speaking more or less explicitly in their behalf, on reading the printed proof of the record asked me very pointedly whether I knew positively that this sentence was in the original document. Being in Boston a few days later, I took the trouble to get access to this document, carrying the three holographic signatures of Messrs. McComas, Dunlap and Wood. There can be no slightest question but what it is in its original state, without alteration or addition of any description; and it carries the sentence admitting nausea and vomiting in the séance room. I cannot sufficiently condemn the flagrant departure from recorded facts which is committed when these three "investigators" now deny that there was any visible evidence of ill-being on the Psychic’s part; nor the reckless determination to maintain at all costs the hypothesis of fraud, which is seen in this offhand willingness to charge forgery against the Crandons when a clause of the record turns out to be irreconcilable with that hypothesis. To this we return in a later chapter dealing with the Commission’s long-belated report.

The Commissioners do not stop with the mere denial that the Psychic was ill in their presence. They display the strongest disbelief that catamenia was present as claimed, overruling in this detail the verdict of their own female secretary who examined the Psychic and found that it was. And of course while they are not in a position to deny that a serious illness ran through the ensuing two weeks, they obviously can, and do, deny that it was caused by any of their actions; and with this, they give more than a hint of their belief that it was brought on by nervous collapse following the realization that her tricks had been found out. They cite the sittings given on February
3rd, 4th and 6th as evidence that there were no immediate ill effects following that of January 30th. Here, of course, they quite ignore the interval between the 30th and the 3rd, sufficiently long for a four-days' prostration; and they point to the interval of almost two weeks between February 6th and the next sitting on the 19th, implying that if the Psychic was ill it was during this interval and from independent causes. The Crandon story of course is that she was prostrated for the days immediately after the 30th; that she rallied and gave three séances despite a bad general state of health; and that it then became clear that she must have a rather extended vacation from sitting.

Speaking indirectly and unofficially on behalf of the Commission, a New York physician suggests that even though the medical men in contact with the case were at loss for a diagnosis in normal terms, he can tentatively supply this. He states that during the late winter of 1925–6 there was prevalent throughout the Eastern states, though falling short of epidemic proportions, a visitation of nervous influenza with certain symptoms suggesting “sleeping sickness”; and he says that it is evident to him from the account of her symptoms that this is what Margery had. I think we may be assured that there was no lack of competence or disinterestedness to make this diagnosis at the time, had it been in accord with the facts; and in this connection I would emphasize that not Crandon alone, but Richardson and Goodall, were in attendance and agreed upon the impossibility of any diagnosis in terms of normal pathology.

We need go into this argument no further than to say that naturally, in view of the Psychic's condition, further Committee sittings were postponed sine die, while negotiations were put under way between Crandon, Walton and McComas as to the membership of the Commission. During the course of these negotiations, Crandon prepared a document comprising all his reservations and objections against any of the members of the Commission. This document included the following articles:

1. One Commissioner “has not heard a whisper since childhood.”
2. Another “can hear only soft but not sibilant whispers.”
3. The Commission went to luncheon with McDougall, the principal critic of the mediumship, before any official sitting, and gave undue credit to what he told them.
4. One of them showed his state of cerebration by inferring that
Walter names the wooden letters by the sounds made as these strike
the floor; whereas in fact, aside from the inherent absurdity of
this claim, Walter always names them before he throws them out.
5. This article comprised a citation of Wood's unauthorized
handling of the teleplasmic rod, with the subsequent condition of
the Psychic.
6. (See 11:10 dictation, January 30th.) One of them dictated
that a motion of the doughnut corresponded with a motion of the
Psychic's head. He then failed to record that the doughnut was
immediately levitated and moved in all directions in the air for
a considerable period, without any motion of the Psychic's head.
Only after Crandon threatened to stop the investigation at once
was this second series of motions recorded, with the statement of
their apparent independence of the medium's head; and following
this, the offending member of the Commission lapsed into what
Crandon regarded as a sullen silence for the rest of the evening,
making no further contribution to the record except for one report
of routine control.
7. In his "Old and New Viewpoints in Psychology," published
in St. Louis as recently as 1925, Dunlap had made the following
statements with reference to psychical research which, Crandon
contended, showed him to be a biased judge, from whom an unpreju-
diced consideration of the case could not be expected:

The best combination for investigation in psychical research
would be the joint work of a trained psychologist and a Burns
detective (p. 92).

In every [psychical] investigation in which a trained psy-
chologist has control, the claims are not substantiated (p. 93).
[The italics are mine to emphasize that he did not say "have
not been," but employed rather a more generalized form of
statement.]

In every case in which a competent investigator has been
allowed to examine fully into the alleged phenomena of tele-
kinesis, the result has been the discrediting of the medium's
claim (p. 97).

The blight of Spiritualism is to be combated primarily by
education in simple facts of scientific psychology (p. 112).

It is profitless to go into all the discussion which ensued. It can
be adequately summarized with the statement that Crandon finally
insisted upon the withdrawal of both Wood and Dunlap, and indicated
a complete willingness to go on with McComas. The question of
replacing the objectionable members was discussed; several names were mentioned; but in behalf of none could any endorsement beyond that of McComas be offered. This was not sufficient in Crandon's view; for McComas had sponsored Wood and Dunlap. For any new members, Crandon wanted some verification of McComas's judgment, from some other source. The upshot was that the project for replenishing the Commission languished until the colleges had closed for the summer and the faculties had dispersed.

In the meantime, a new project had been fathered by Walton. When I was appointed Research Officer to the A.S.P.R., it had been the intent to have two Research Officers permanently. Prince resigned his place after I had occupied mine for a month; and no successor had been appointed because no eligible candidate had been found. McComas had a sabbatical half-year coming to him for the fall term of 1926. It was now proposed that he accept a temporary appointment as Research Officer to fill the existing vacancy from July 1st, 1926, until such time in 1927 as he had to return to Princeton; and this project was carried through.

As part of his duties in his new position, McComas carried the responsibility for the Society's work with Margery during the period of his incumbency. He brought into this what appeared to be a most sympathetic attitude to the mediumship, and a complete freedom from the prejudices which had obviously tainted his late colleagues. As evidence of this, there exist numerous letters exchanged between him and Crandon, of which the two following are by all means the most pertinent. From Baltimore, on February 5th, 1926, he wrote the following, the italics being mine:

I find that I have a hundred and one things to attend to before going back to Princeton. I would much prefer corresponding with you instead of making a trip to Boston for a conference. I am afraid that you and Mrs. Crandon were disappointed in the sittings of last week. Please do not feel that way about them. The Commissioners are very genuinely interested in the phenomena. It seems to me that our first sittings were just about what we all really wanted. We saw a variety of phenomena and have got somewhat oriented to the problems.

I sincerely hope that Mrs. Crandon will soon be quite well again.

On April 23rd, 1926, writing from Princeton, McComas produced a more important document, clearly demonstrating the great divide
existing between himself and at least one of his former colleagues.
Parts of the letter revolving about suggested new personnel and pro-
cedure need not interest us. But the following paragraphs are of
extreme permanent importance:

I was very much pleased to get your letter of April 20th, and
to learn of your kindly feeling toward me and willingness to go
ahead with our investigation.

Dr. Wood’s conduct is a matter of keen regret to me. His
association with the Harvard men seemed to give him an attitude
which he certainly did not have when I first invited him to join
the committee. His attitude toward the committee was about
as inconsiderate as his attitude toward you. We could not get
hold of him for conferences or to make plans. He came late to
the sittings and left in haste to catch his bus. I constantly hoped
that he would change his attitude and make some contributions
to the investigation through his profound knowledge of photog-
raphy. Since our last sitting I have written him twice and have
received no replies. I shall make no further effort to have him
coopcrate with us in any way. Inasmuch as I was responsible for
inviting Dr. Wood into the committee, I want to apologize for his
conduct, both at the sittings and when enjoying your hospitality.
Doctor, I am really very much chagrined and mortified. Some of
the things that occurred annoyed me greatly, but I felt the wisest
policy was to ignore them.6

It will now be seen that the Commission was hopelessly moribund,
and that the most one could hope from it would be a report of some
sort. But there were difficulties involved in getting this. One member
of the Commission was going on with the mediumship, and would hardly
be able to attach his name to a report of any sort pending the outcome
of his further exposure. The other two members were in process of
adding to and modifying their records, and pending the completion in
their minds and on paper of this trick, so familiar to one who has
followed the mediumship, they could of course not issue the final inter-
pretation of their observations which a report would imply. The
full extent of this campaign by Wood and Dunlap to make their

6 These italics are mine. They refer to conduct and attitudes by Wood, in the
seance room and in the Crandon house outside the seance room, which it has not
seemed worth while to describe in any detail but which Crandon found very much
out of place. That his view was shared at the time by McComas is something which
we shall wish to remember at a later point in our narrative.—J. M. B.
observations fit into the preconceived ideas which Dunlap was known and Wood was now suspected to have had; the course of McComas's further contact with the case; in fact, all the factors leading to a situation where a belated report was finally possible—these must all go over into our second volume, awaiting the moment when we reach them in the chronological development of the case. We may therefore leave the Commission here, divided against itself to the point where one of its members apologizes to the Crandons for the conduct of the others and consents to the elimination of both of them from his further work with the mediumship.

See open reference No. 15, Vol. 2.
CHAPTER XXXII

The Psychical Activation of the Luminous Paint

By the Editor

With the séance of January 14th, 1926, held as usual in the glass cabinet, Walter presented perhaps the most unexpected and the most surprising of all the phenomena that he has invented since the beginning of the mediumship. The Psychic was lashed in the glass cabinet, quite in the usual way; and she was in trance. We may let the record speak for itself:

He then called for the big megaphone, which has the zinc-sulfide paint on the upper and lower margins; but this paint had not been activated for this sitting. The megaphone was therefore entirely invisible in the dark. In asking for the megaphone, Walter produced the following parody on a familiar verse:

Backward, turn backward, 0 Time in your flight
And bring me a megaphone just for to-night.
I am so weary of yelling and squealing,
I'm sure that a megaphone would be appealing.
I am so tired of cages and wires
I welcome all men by calling them liars.

Walter was told that the megaphone was black and that it would do no good to levitate it because we could not see it. Hill said: “Walter, the paint is not vitalized.” To this Walter replied: “Why shouldn’t I ‘vittalize’ it,” mispronouncing the word as indicated, with humorous effect. This word seemed to please him, and he used it, it seemed, a hundred times in the next half hour.

The megaphone was placed on the floor in the right front corner of the open cabinet. We first saw it when what was evidently the upper end suddenly became luminous. At this time the megaphone apparently was horizontal, just below the level of the Psychie’s head. Crandon had made a bet with Walter that Walter could not light up the megaphone. Now the big end became slowly but definitely luminous, very bright; and at one time we could see apparently Walter’s fingers holding on to this zone of luminous paint. He thus “vittalized” both ends of the megaphone three or four times, indulging at the same time in the liveliest telekinetic
motions of the same, talking all the time to the megaphone as though it were intelligent. This vitalizing of the luminous paint through a means not to us apparent was a new phenomenon.

This is not, as one might at first thought hope, that long-sought ideal of the psychical researcher: a phenomenon which is necessarily valid because it could not occur other than through genuine psychic means. It does constitute a good attempt at such self-verification; but if we mean what we say when we speak of the absolute impossibility of production by normal means, it does not quite hit the bulls-eye. The fact is, the luminous paint can be made to glow by exposure to any source of electro-magnetic waves of higher order than those given off by itself—which is to say, of shorter wave-length. This would of course include the ultraviolet, and would give the skeptic full license to play with the idea of small, easily concealed flashlights with a heavy ultraviolet component in their beams—this presumably being a matter of the lens rather than of the filament. It is also a fact that if the luminous paint be clandestinely compounded or diluted with one or another chemical—anthracene, for example—its reaction-speed to ultraviolet exposure will be greatly quickened. In the same way one might approximate fraudulently the instantaneous fade-out of February 6th (see record, below) and later dates; since these chemicals glow only while under actual exposure to the invisible short-wave energy. So far as comes within the knowledge of any authority that I can cite, these suggestions exhaust the possibilities of fraud. So if one be willing to postulate an ingeniously concealed source of ultra-violent energy on the Psychic's person or in the walls of the room, one can make a stab at explaining the present phenomena on normal grounds. This explanation, I hope, will make an even larger demand upon the reader's credulity than the hypothesis of universal confederacy, or any of the other fantastic notions that have to be brought into play to explain away the generality of Margery's phenomena. If I am right in my estimate of the relative degree of phantasy, the present manifestation brings us further along the road to categorical proof of validity than we have heretofore come. But inasmuch as the Psychic, in the absence of all control and observation of any sort, could obviously prosecute the frauds outlined in this paragraph, we do not have the rock-ribbed, automatically valid psychical phenomenon, genuine because it could not occur through normal means under any conditions whatever.

Walter did not make his new accomplishment a séance-room com-
monplace, but he did repeat it from time to time. On January 26th, in the presence of the new-born Committee of the A.S.P.R., he did it, as a reference to page 370 will indicate; and here again the Psychic was in trance. But it was the doughnut that was used for the stunt, rather than the megaphone. Again on February 3rd, "the non-luminous doughnut was now put on the table and Walter made it glow from an unseen source of light on request." As on January 26th, this was done in the old cabinet, without the lashed controls; but unlike that occasion, the psychic activation of the paint now came with the Psychic conscious and normal. This date also appears to mark the establishment in Crandon's mind of the assumption that Walter's psychic means of activation was parallel with our normal means, involving exposure of the paint to an invisible source of light, of ultraviolet or even more occult character.

The séance of February 4th added something to the new manifestation, again in the old cabinet and with the Psychic normal:

The Dingwall bell-box painted with zinc-sulfide paint but wholly unactivated and invisible was now put on the table. Now on request Walter made it glow brightly as from some unseen source of light. It was interesting to observe that he could make it glow when an observer's hand was held horizontally two inches above it. In other words, such a hand so placed did not screen off whatever it was that activated the paint.

A repetition of this, with further trimmings, was offered on the 6th; and I think there is a large suggestion here that the activating process is not one of exposure to light or pseudo-light. One might perhaps think of it as a chemical or pseudo-chemical effect; or even as an effect of pure ideo-dynamics. It really is no more absurd to think of Walter's successfully willing the paint to become luminous than it is to think of his having at his disposal apparatus sufficiently physical to activate it by means substantially like those we employ. The record that provokes this speculation reads as follows:

Dingwall's bell-box, the top of which is painted with zinc-sulfide paint, was put on the table; but it had not been activated by exposure to white light. Nevertheless, on request Walter was able to make it glow and become dark again at will. Then at request, Walter traced a "7" and an "H" with his terminal, and made this glow so that we could read it.

4 On the table or on the dark zinc-sulfide paint?—J. M. B.
The italics are mine; and the passage italicized lends support to the speculations immediately preceding this citation. If we assume that the control is adequate to exclude the use of the ultra-violet flashlight (the record being not sufficiently explicit about the conditions of this séance to make this other than an assumption for the present date), the fact that the light can be made instantly to fade out and fade in at Walter’s command seems to deny equally a pseudo-normal mechanism working through some psychical instrumentality. It is also of interest to note that on the present occasion the Psychic was in the old cabinet, and without trance; “catamenia was present and we should not ordinarily have sat; but Dr. Holmes’ unexpected visit made it seem desirable, even though the phenomena under these conditions can never be brilliant.” Catamenia is one of the several conditions that often impel Walter to resort to trance for phenomena ordinarily produced with the Psychic normal; but on this occasion the sitting was entirely in the old cabinet and without trance.

On the 19th, with the Psychic lashed in the glass cabinet and entranced, “he now called for the big megaphone, the paint on which had not been activated. He promptly made this glow.” On the 25th, in the old cabinet and without trance, “he made the top of the Dingwall bell-box, which was covered with zinc-sulfide paint but not activated, glow and fade at the request of the sitters.” The italics, which are mine, mark a new departure, and seem to justify the comment of the record, “beautifully done.” On March 4th, again in the old cabinet without trance, the test of February 4th was carried a little further when “Walter now made the top of the Dingwall bell-box glow on request, and even with Van Arsdale’s hand placed flat on it.” On the 5th, this was repeated: “the Dingwall bell-box was put on the table, Eddy’s hand placed upon it, and Walter made the non-vitalized top glow nevertheless.” This, too, was in the old cabinet without trance. Again on the 8th, and under the same conditions, Sawyer’s hand was placed upon the top of the bell-box and this was activated despite the obstruction. And on the 12th and 21st this was done with an unnamed sitter officiating.

The record for March 22d informs us that “Walter now made the unactivated top of the Dingwall bell-box glow on request, and even made it glow when Swift had his hand down on it. Then Walter completely eclipsed the box top and exposed it alternately again and again.” One wonders whether there was a variation from previous
technique here which justified the use of this new word. It is conceivable that heretofore the activated paint had faded out, not instantly but very rapidly; and not by dark encroachment from any one direction but by actual fading over its entire surface at once; and that on the present occasion, the dark encroachment was seen rather than the uniform fading. It is also conceivable that what had previously been described as fading was in reality eclipsing; and that the divergence from the norm which would be implied in a true fading out at speed rather than with the normal slowness is beyond Walter’s reach.

On the 27th and under Overstreet’s hand the psychic activation was carried out. Further speculation as to the matter of eclipsing vs. true fading is provoked by the record for April 10th, which tells us:

Walter now made the unactivated Dingwall bell-box glow under the hands of two sitters, then made part of it glow, then totally eclipsed it. This would seem to depend on some source of ultraviolet light controlled by Walter.

The record for April 15th\(^5\) chronicles the psychic activation, and repeats the assumption of the one immediately preceding. On the 17th he did it again. On the 25th, he did it in my presence and under conditions permitting tests of a rigor and a range not previously attained; all this is described in the complete séance record (pp. 408–9). And with this climax, we may well elect to regard the psychical activation of the luminous paint as holding nothing more of novelty for us; so that its further occurrence becomes a matter for mere citation by title in Chapter XXXVII.

\(^5\) Crandon’s own record; not Dudley’s record of pp. 397 ff. Dudley verifies from memory that the activation occurred and was omitted from his record inadvertently.

—J. M. B.
CHAPTER XXXIII
Margery and Other Psychics
From the Séance Records

Certain episodes of the *M. M.* book, together with the Foss sitting of September 28th, 1925,\(^1\) carry the large suggestion that when Margery sits in the presence of another medium or another person of mediumistic trend, the results are usually interesting. On two evenings in March, 1926, this condition was met; and the resultant records are here presented without further comment.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, March 9, 1926. In this sitting the active psychic was Dr. Gordon, an amateur psychic from New York. He sat in front of the old cabinet, which was provided with black curtains. He was back to the cabinet. There were present, to left: Mrs. Baker, Richardson, Hill, Crandon, Mrs. Richardson, Reilly, Margery, and the Psychic, Dr. Gordon, again.

Trance came on within a few minutes and directly Gordon’s chair was moved with much noise back into the cabinet. Then from the cabinet came an unintelligible sentence which Reilly said came from “The Dweller on the Threshold.” Then another more or less muffled voice came announcing itself as “Dr. Newman.” This voice said that he had given a sermon in 1901 which he wished now to correct in view of greater knowledge and he then went on for about twenty minutes with a sermon. In the meantime as trance went on, an occasional expressive and low whistle was heard from Walter, apparently within the cabinet. Shortly after this a small basket came flying across the room from the direction of the cabinet, just missing Crandon’s head.

When the sermon was done there was an immediate loud crash on the Dingwall bell-box, whereupon Walter said: “Round one in favor of Dr. Newman.” Walter went on whistling more or less cheerfully and said amongst other things that he was greatly pleased with this meeting. “Getting lots of force, thank you kindly.”

Then there came through a lisping falsetto voice from the cabinet in which Gordon still was. Voice was recognized by Reilly

---

\(^1\) See page 82.
as that of "Elsie." Then began an exchange of remarks between Elsie and Walter that held us in side-splitting convulsions of mirth for twenty minutes. This had to be suppressed, however, for fear of offending the feelings of Mr. Reilly. Walter said: "Speak up, Elsie, you seem to have some difficulty. Apparently you were all finished but your palate." Elsie replied: "Walter is a bad boy. I shall have to kiss him." To which Walter replied: "Elsie this is so sudden, spare me. Now, Elsie, make some lights. Don't keep your light under a bushel or at least move the bushel." To this Elsie replied: "How can I make a light if you stay in the way." Finally Elsie got tired and said she had to go. To which Walter commented: "Would'st break my heart?" Then Elsie was silent for a time and somebody said: "Elsie is supposed to have lived as a child about one hundred years ago." "I thought so," said Walter. "That's the kind of language I am talking to her. Elsie, art thou croakedst? Stick it thon out a little longer."

After a time Gordon announced that there were a number of boys present and gave names such as Luther, Martin, Philip, Mark, John and a few others. Then various whispers could be heard coming from the cabinet in which there was no one, both Psychics being outside the cabinet. There were apparently several distinct overlaps of the voices and the whistling while both Psychics were talking. The curtains of the empty cabinet bulged out, as with a great wind, several times. Some sitters thought they could make out three whispers simultaneously and another observed that two whispers overlapped Gordon's voice. Then Walter and apparently two others whistled a kind of trio, Walter keeping time by beating on the Dingwall bell-box very successful blasts of near music. Walter finally said: "I think we will have to go now. The plank is greased.”

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, March 14, 1926, in the old cabinet. Walter came through promptly and talked for five minutes and after that was not heard from until the end.

Shortly Graham went into partial and after five minutes into complete trance. Crandon received for about fifteen minutes a vague luminous impression as of a human figure standing between him and Graham. Walter was asked about it and said, "Yes, that was me." There were distinct cold breezes coming from cabinet all through the sitting. Graham was considerably exhausted by the experience. It seemed apparent that Walter had discovered in him a physical medium.
CHAPTER XXXIV

Four Séance Records of Outstanding Character

By E. E. Dudley and the Editor

The séance of April 15th, 1926, stood out in the judgment of Crandon as something quite out of the ordinary routine, on account of the presence of Richards. This gentleman is from London; and Crandon's record says of him: "sent by Dingwall." It was taken for granted by the Crandons that Richards had been specifically sent by Dingwall to examine the current phenomena and to report back to him. This doubtless was an exaggeration, especially in view of the fact that at this date Dingwall must have been in some degree aware of the impending parting of the ways between himself and the S.P.R., and of his own resultant withdrawal from psychical research. But he was an acquaintance of Dingwall, and Dingwall did introduce him to the Crandons and so was responsible for his presence. The temptation to regard his sitting as of extra importance was an obvious and natural one. This attitude found expression mainly in an arrangement whereby, during the séance, Dudley was to draw up notes on which he would base a séance record approximating the character of my own. The dictaphone was not used; Dudley made his notes partly in the dark and partly in the intervals of light; partly in longhand and partly in shorthand. The record which he drew up and signed turns out to be almost a verbatim transcript of these notes. In the accuracy of detail and the preservation of the séance sequence it of course is vastly superior to Crandon's memorandum, drawn up as usual on the following morning; and I give it in full. In order to preserve the better its documentary character, I follow Dudley's style in designating sitters, etc., by initials, as follows: Richards = R, Sterling = S, Walter = W, Mrs. Stinson = Mrs. S, Crandon = C, "light" = Lt, E. E. D. = Dudley, west = w, east = e. He designates the medium "Psyche," a name often applied to her by her friends.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, April 15th, 1926. Sitters: Psyche, Mr. Richards, Dr. C., E. E. D., Mr. Spencer(?).¹ Mrs. Stinson outside circle.

¹Actually Sterling. This parenthesis, and the two others below, are part of Dudley's original record.—J. M. B.

W. came through after a few minutes and asked R., following introductions, to pick out four letters, put them in a basket and place basket on shelf. Done. (Omission: When fastening Psyche, R. secured collar about neck and examined knots in white light.) Continuing: W. knocked basket off shelf twice and spilled letters. R. replaced on shelf. The third time W. told R. to put in new letters and anything else he pleased. Done. R. put basket on shelf, and very shortly W. threw out a letter, saying that it was a "C" or a "G," but he couldn't tell which. Taken by S. He then threw out another, a "Y." Taken by S.; correct. Then said there was a "D" on the shelf, and threw out a "note-book" which R. said was correct. R. retrieved the "D." O. K. S. reported "C." O. K.

Luminous basket placed on shelf by R., after inspection. W. attempts levitation and drops it behind Psyche to her left. Retrieved and replaced by R. W. levitates it high above, to both sides, well behind Psyche. Touches roof of cabinet and also taps glass at her right. Hand fastenings checked by R. and S. during levitation. W. drops basket to Psyche's left. R. retrieves it. S. takes place near Mrs. S. R. puts basket on shelf, locks cabinet door and stands in front of and controls C. and D. W. levitates basket and drops it at Psyche's left again. R. unlocks door, retrieves and replaces basket, locks door, but there is no further levitation. Psyche brought out of trance, collar removed by R. in white light after examination of ties.

In red light VCO put on shelf; inspected by R., who tested tube and mouthpiece separately, inserted mouthpiece in tube, placed mouthpiece in Psyche's mouth and returned to circle. R. controlled hands and mouth of C., while S. controlled ditto of D. At R.'s request, W. whistled Yankee Doodle. At C.'s suggestion he repeated: "Live thou each day as though you had a p-a-s-s-t!" Unusually well done. Mouthpiece removed and again tested by R. in red light. Mouthpiece cut loose by R. and S. after thorough inspection of ties in white light.

Sitting continued in old cabinet. Order: Psyche, R., D., S., Dr. C.
Bell-box on table. S. picks up and turns 360 degrees. Rings at start and finish. R. picks up and it rings a little longer. R. picks up again, and, while it rings intermittently, walks to book-case, turns around, returns, hands it to D., who lifts it high, turns and brings it down, handing it to S., who turns around and replaces on table. Intermittent ringing throughout, but continued after placing on table. Sparkling very noticeable. R. turns back flapper and feels around contacts; replaces flapper and ringing immediately commences. Removed by R. for later examination.

Scales placed on table by D. Balance without weights in red. R. puts 4 on w. pan. Dark . . . Lt.; pans balance. Dark . . . Lt.; pans balance. R. and S. pass hands under pans, around scales, between Psyche and C. and scales. No effect. Dark. R. removes weights, puts one on e. pan. Unbalanced. Dark . . . Lt.; balanced. W. pan off by R. Unbalanced. Dark . . . Lt.; still unbalanced. R. puts apparently empty pan back into w. frame and scales unbalance toward w. with one weight in e. pan (pan had been on platform opposite side of scales from Psyche). Dark. W. tells R. to remove w. pan, keeping it level. Light. R. does and e. goes down. R. replaces pan and scales unbalance toward w. Dark . . . Light; balanced; W. tells R. to remove either pan. He takes e. pan with weight in it. Dark . . . Lt.; balanced; R. replaces e. pan. No change in balance. Static, especially at w. end. Dark . . . Lt.; slightly unbalanced toward w. or "light end." W. told S. to press down on either end to feel force. Done on e. end; w. end rises. Dark. R. puts finger on e. pan and feels unbalanced force. Dark . . . Lt.; S. picks up scale unit about 15" while R. presses down on "empty" w. pan and feels unbalanced force. Later estimated as 2-5 oz. Scales removed by D.

Crandon's record is identical with the above in all essentials, save that at the end it chronicles the activation by Walter of the non-vitalized surface of the Dingwall bell-box. Dudley verifies orally that this occurred and was inadvertently omitted from his record through his concentration upon other things. Crandon's record, of course, is neither so detailed nor so sequential as Dudley's, and we may well save the space which it would occupy.

Dudley, I take it, is amply conscious of the great inferiority of the recording procedure which he here practiced, as compared with dictaphonic recording. In my judgment, this inferiority is so great that the record drawn up subsequently from memory is more valuable than

---

1a This paragraph looks forward to Chap. XXXVI.
the one by holographic notes made during the séance. The difference between the demand upon one's conscious attention made by talking and by writing is a matter which every person must have observed; one can talk continuously while driving a car through heavy traffic, while even if there were some device whereby one could write without removing one's hands from the wheel, it is evident that one could not write and drive simultaneously. For some of the European mediumships, with their long intervals of inaction between isolated, simple, phenomena, the holographic record impresses me as feasible; with Margery's rapid-fire continuity of action I should never attempt it. If for any reason I am unable to make my Margery records by dictation in the séance room, I shall always make them by memory out of it. Dudley obviously disagrees with this judgment; and with the one reservation that his record must represent to considerable degree the observation of others rather than of himself, I will grant that he makes a better showing in behalf of the possibility of simultaneously observing and writing down than I should have supposed to be possible.

The one question which the preceding discussion leaves open is: why not use the dictaphone, as I had done during the preceding summer? When I first saw Dudley's record, it raised this question in my own mind. At a very early date the question was answered.

It will be realized that I had not been in Boston since October, 1925. I had not seen the glass cabinet itself nor the procedure of the standardized séance; I had not observed the revival of the scales, nor the new trick of psychic activation of the luminous paint, nor any of the other current phenomena or the current improvements in old phenomena. On April 23rd and 24th I was in Boston for the purpose of catching up with the case; and in the séances of these two dates the entire standardized procedure was twice gone through with in my presence.

It had been my supposition that I would make dictaphone records for these two séances, and as soon as I arrived in Lime Street I moved toward clearing the dictaphone for action and insuring the presence in the séance room of a supply of blank records. This move was at once checked by the active opposition of Crandon, who made it clear that he was strongly hostile to the use of the dictaphone in the séance room. He finds this procedure "complicated," without being able to show me wherein the complications lie. He objects to the noise of dictation, which in my judgment is no more objectionable than that of the séance-
room conversation and the music. He insists that the dictation, done by the chief observer present, distracts the attention of that observer from the more vital business of observation; whereas I have recorded my own judgment that it does nothing of the sort to any serious degree. We remain permanently unable to agree, however; and the point is one of those upon which Crandon's opinions are so firmly fixed that it were profitless to attempt active opposition. The result is that the dictaphone is not used any more when I go to Lime Street. In its absence, where Dudley and others are inclined toward holographic notes, I lean entirely toward the record from subsequent memory, drawn up as soon after the séance as possible. It loses the detail and the sequence of the holographic record; but what it loses here it gains in giving the recorder a much more careful and detailed fund of observation. What one can remember from this fund is more useful than what one can jot down at the moment of superficial observation. With this explanation, I pass to my records for April 23rd and 24th. Contrary to my usual custom, they are drawn in the first person:


Above order applies to first part of sitting, held in glass cabinet with all formalities. The wires were put in place about the Psychic's wrists and ankles, and about the screw-eyes, by the Libbeys, Sampson, and myself. I examined with care all I did not myself do, and found all thoroughly O. K. I put the collar on and attended to all details of its tying. With chair in initial (and identical final) position, the cord running from the collar was so tight that it gave a musical note when struck; and there was no audible or other indication of the chair's being moved during the sitting. At end of sitting, a deep furrow could be plainly felt in each ankle, where the rubber had bitten in; and it was with considerable difficulty that scissors were sufficiently to be inserted under both ankle and wrist wires to cut them.

[There here ensues some 700 words of description of the glass cabinet and the wire control, which I saw on this evening for the first time. Since this material is fully duplicated elsewhere in the current volume, it may be omitted in this place.]

On the present occasion, the knots, etc., in the wire were examined at the end of the glass-cabinet part of the sitting, and each pronounced undisturbed by the sitter who had originally tied it. The rope to the collar was so tight that at the end of the trance period Walter stated he was unable to bring her out of trance
unless and until it was released; so a white flashlight, shielded to prevent shining in her eyes, was handled by Crandon in such way as to enable me to unlock and unbuckle the collar. The tie of rope on to the collar is permanent, similarly with the tie of the rope to the staple in the rear wall; the ensemble lying on the cabinet floor when not in use.

The first “act” consisted in the identification, by Walter, of wooden letters placed in the cabinet by me. These letters are about four inches high, an inch thick, and an inch in section through each limb. There are numerals from 1 to 9 as well as all letters, some in duplicate or triplicate. I selected four in the dark, handling them with two fingers and at one point of the wood so as to insure against knowledge by myself. All four were placed in a large, dark basket which I, on Walter’s instructions, put in the front of the cabinet at the Psychic’s right. There was complete hand control throughout the circle, but not hand contact with the medium, Walter stating that under the conditions this drained rather than aided her. The end sitters therefore placed one hand above and one under the controlling hand of the neighbor; and save for the release of my right hand for purposes of executing Walter’s requests, or of Crandon completely to leave his seat for the same purpose, this hand control of the sitters was uninterrupted throughout, according to the statements of all involved.

Of the four letters first given, Walter made identifications, throwing each letter out on to the floor after naming it. These were then laid aside in separate places for subsequent check. Three had been named correctly; in a fourth instance what Walter took for a K turned out to be an M. Crandon makes the point that I “could not” correct the error in the dark. He should say “did not”; or “did not try to.” The fact was that on the following night I was easily able to distinguish between K’s and M’s. It is my recollection that I made the correction, mentally, at the time; but of this I am not certain—I may have put the block in my pocket without any examination. The mistake would seem to indicate a pseudo-tactile rather than any other type of perception.

Sitters were now called upon to contribute objects to be identified. H. Libbey put in the basket a cigarette holder; A. Libbey a half dollar, I a small comb, Sampson a box of lozenges which were life-savers in all but name. Walter identified the latter very completely in terms of the description which has just been given, stating specifically that they were not life-savers, after having made a pun

\[2 \text{ See page 377.}\]
on that name and likened them to the objects in question. The cigarette holder he said was like a pencil but not a pencil, then he named it correctly. My comb and Libbey's coin were in the basket at the same time; Walter identified each correctly, giving the denomination of the coin, which was important, since I knew from hearing that it was a coin which Libbey had deposited; and he attributed the coin to Libbey and the comb to me. It is my impression that something was said indicating the sequence of actions, i.e., my deposit of my comb, a remark indicating that I had made my deposit, then Libbey's audible deposit of the coin; but of this I am not wholly certain. In any event, the attribution in distinction from the identification was attempted again on the following night; see pp. 406-7, 435-6, 440-1.

The next episode consisted in telekinesis of the small basket, touched at three points on the handle with luminous paint. The shelf was called for—a portable affair that fits into the cabinet in front of the Psychic and does service in lieu of a table. Crandon put this in place and returned to his place and to control. At Walter's instructions the basket was put on the shelf by Sampson, to whom I handed it. He laid it on its side, and it began to rock back and forth. At first each excursion carried it out of balance and it fell to the floor. Finally Sampson found a position for it in which this did not occur, and it swung back and forth nicely, rotating on what would have been its vertical axis had it been standing erect. The visible result was a dipping first one way and then the other of the luminous spots. After a few dips, Walter called for red light; Crandon was slow; and by the time we had the light the action had ceased. Several repetitions were more fortunate, the basket oscillating for some time after the light went on. The Psychic was dimly visible, the basket much better so. The light was competent only to prove that the basket was really there and moving; for exclusion of fraud we must fall back upon the control, which would most certainly prevent the attachment of any mechanism, even so simple a one as a silk thread. It should perhaps be specified that the motion was "projected out of darkness into light"; i.e., that it started in darkness and continued after the light came on. In each case it damped and died out with fair promptness; Crandon's count of 14 seconds for one episode surely includes the portion in darkness.

As a minor variation, the identification of letters known to the sitters was now attempted. I got two letters and passed them to Libbey, Jr., and to Sampson. They were K and Q, and so identified, silently, by each of us. Walter named them correctly; he
and Crandon were in some hope that the sitters would not have agreed among themselves. These letters, like the prior ones, were tossed out of the cabinet on to the floor only after they had been named. The earlier ones were tossed out the open front (the door being open), on Sampson’s side. The present two were thrust each out of one of the handholes, with considerable difficulty in finding a passage, of course.

At this point, consultation between Walter and Crandon determined upon the voice machine as the next step. The Psychic was accordingly brought out of trance, after the collar had been released as indicated above. The hands and feet remained lashed during the voice-machine episode.

The VCO demonstration went off brilliantly. Prior test in the other room had satisfied the new sitters of the fatuity of trying to beat the new, enlarged mouthpiece.\(^3\) I blew through the mouthpiece from the butt end before and after to prove its operativeness; and through the tube moving the floats to prove that this was in order; this indirection is necessary since one may not put in one’s mouth the mouthpiece which the Psychic is about to put in hers. All mouths of eligible suspects (Crandon, Bird, Hyde) were controlled by one of the strangers during the actual demonstration. I inserted the mouthpiece in Margery’s mouth and removed it at the end. She blew the floats into position, held them there, and Walter whistled and spoke brilliantly, for two minutes or more. There was no false start or accidental collapse of any sort; the whole thing went off smoothly with no hitch at all. No slightest unsteadiness of the floats during the demonstration.

The Psychic was now cut loose after all appropriate examination of the knots, etc.; and we moved to the old cabinet. Here the order, clockwise, ran Margery, Sampson, Bird; Hyde and the two Libbeys in an order not clearly recalled; Crandon, Margery. SA bell-box on table rang spontaneously two or three times in the dark; it had been examined by one of the Libbeys before the séance, though a bit perfunctorily. Red light ringing in the hands of sitters was the next order, and was done with success. First Sampson handled it, and it rang almost continuously, with one or two sharp breaks, from a second or two after he picked it up until some seconds after he had set it down and the light had gone out.

In the next red light interval one of the Libbeys handled the box; handed it to the other, who handed it to Hyde, who handed it to me. I took it over to the bookcase and returned and set it down

\[^3\text{See page 275.}\]
on the table; I and at least one other turned completely around while holding it. All this occurred in the one long period of red light, and as before, the bell pealed continuously; no hit and miss, no short ringing, but one long peal, quite constant in duration and intensity save for one or two sharp, clean breaks; and ringing into the darkness after being set down on the table. On both occasions I was unable, because of angles and distance, to see the initial depression of the board or the quiver accompanying a break in the ringing. While carrying the box, I felt very plainly the vibrations of the ringing bell. Sampson now lifted the box to verify that it does not ring automatically when thus disturbed. It gave no slightest symptoms of ringing.

The scales—a Comstock’s old No. 4 outfit, which has never been taken away from Lime Street—was now put on the table. It was not on the tumblers as formerly, but this issue is met by the fact that it was brought to the table anew for this episode, and moved somewhat by me after it had been placed. Everything done was projected out of darkness into light, and projected back again before the psychic influence went out of action. I do not regard this as a great disadvantage under the present conditions and with the present performance, but merely record it as a fact. It means, of course, that the red light would come on to find the scales in a supernormal state of balance or unbalance in which they would remain until after the light went out again. The episodes were:

One-to-nothing load (the same checkers as weights that were formerly used) passage from dynamic to static balance. That is, the unevenly weighted pans were oscillating up and down, without touching the platform, when the light came on; and this action damped out until they came to rest at approximately equal level. Same load, same action; but sitters were instructed to explore thoroughly on all sides of apparatus by sweeping of arms as well as under pans with pencils. Nothing found and no effect upon the manifestation.

Same load, same action. Sampson under instructions removed the empty pan on his side, and the other crashed, without dismantling anything. Sampson examined pan and empty cradle. Against orders, through misunderstanding, he turned upside down the pan which he had off the scales; and Crandon expected to see normal action after this pan was replaced. Replacement of the pan, however, was followed by instant resumption of the supernormal balance, showing that nothing had been “spilled out” of it.

2a Again anticipating Chapter XXXVI.
Same load and same action, but with the rôles of the pans reversed, the checker being now on the west instead of the east pan.

Five-to-nothing load; same action, with examination during occurrence as in the second episode with the scales.

At this point the victrola began to run slowly and squawk fearfully. It developed that the rubber friction wheel was badly worn, and reduced practically to a mass of jelly. This was not known to any sitter, however. Walter made no claims, implicit or explicit, about the stoppage; but he remarked that he had to go anyhow, and went promptly. It struck 10:30 within a few seconds of his good night. It is stated that this is regular, that he always "beats it" sufficiently before 10:30 to beat the striking clocks, but no earlier than is necessary to do so. This reminds me strongly of Cartheuser's séances, wherein the control tells what time it is as he is about to go. (See open reference No. 16 in Vol. 2.)

24th: Circle: Margery, Dudley, N. Gray, Miss Carpenter, Crandon, Bird (at Margery's left). Outside circle, behind Bird: Mrs. Stinson. Sitting held entirely in glass cabinet.

Following the gesture of the previous evening, it was decided by Crandon to seek Walter's consent to a fairly elaborate test in identification plus attribution of objects. For this purpose, several sitters placed each a single object in the basket. I contributed an ashtray from the bookroom; Mrs. Stinson an old pen-knife which she believed and Margery disbelieved to have belonged to Walter; Gray a leather wallet or case, flat and obviously empty or containing a modicum of papers; Dudley a small barrette; and while I saw all these items go into the basket, Crandon, quite without intention of secrecy, slipped in without my knowledge a wooden clothespin which had been used at the Harvard sittings.

The basket containing these items was put by me in the front corner of the glass cabinet, at the psychic's right, all the lashings having been duly seen to, for the most part by Dudley and me. The rope from collar to back of cabinet was not quite so taut as the night before; all the points of tying were wholly satisfactory, and were adequately inspected by Dudley and me, before and after. Trance came on within a minute or at most two, as had been the case the night before.

The basket was handled considerably, and apparently with some degree of roughness. The ashtray was identified, but attributed to Mrs. Stinson, Walter making a few sarcastic remarks to the general effect that Ma shouldn't help herself to the furnishings of the house, that she had been drinking and now she was smoking, etc.,
etc. Her puzzled reception of these remarks made it evident that she didn't know what Walter was talking about, and he dropped the ashtray for the moment without attempting any correction. He passed to the clothespin and identified it as having to do with the Harvard boys; and he attributed it to me, scolding humorously that I should bring the Harvard atmosphere in with me. He did not make it at once clear that the object was a clothespin; and not knowing what he was talking about, I was probably unable to reply to his remarks without betraying that something was again wrong. Ultimately the direct statement was made that the article was a clothespin, and Crandon spoke up to verify this; its attribution to him followed, I should think naturally and normally.

The barrette was next dealt with; and with conspicuous success. It was described as "something from a lady's hair, but not a comb," which impressed us all as a very happy statement from a man, who might very likely not know it by its exact name. And it was attributed explicitly and without any indication's having been thrown out, to Dudley. Mrs. Stinson now spoke up and asked Walter what else he found in the basket and didn't he recognize it, hadn't he seen it somewhere before, etc., and presently in response to this demand he claimed the knife as his own.

Walter conversed a bit about the demonstration just attempted, which had been very frankly on an experimental basis. He said that objects of some degree of personal association ought to be used, rather than mere random objects contributed from nowhere in particular by individuals. We therefore repeated the experiment: I contributed my cardboard case with three automobile licenses, Gray a silver card case, rather thick, curved to fit a pocket, and containing three cards; and Dudley a trick hairpin invented and manufactured by himself, which has a short, central tine between the two regular legs, and which, on seeing it later in the light, I thought would offer extraordinary difficulties of identification by any tactile or pseudo-tactile process.

Walter first handled what I took to be my own contribution but what turned out to be Gray's. He identified it as a card-case, with something in it—cards—two of them—no, three. He attributed it to me, and in the light of my case and its three cards I acknowledged it, asking Walter to proceed with the attempt to read what was on the cards. Walter said they were engraved cards, which was the fact but which of course I took to be wrong; and after dropping them momentarily, he returned to them to read my name in full—J. Malcolm Bird—on them, which of course was wrong and a product of the erroneous attribution. He identified,
described with complete accuracy, and attributed to Dudley the trick hairpin. Then he picked up the cardboard case, but abandoned it without dealing satisfactorily with it.

It might be well to chronicle that on the previous evening, as he instructed us to put objects in the basket for identification, he said: "and for God's sake, put in something besides penknives. Everybody that comes into this room has a penknife, Birdie; I've identified thousands of them." Further and of decided importance in view of the closeness of the Psychic's bonds: the half dollar was fumbled in the attempt to return it, and it lay on the floor of the cabinet for some time. But later, Walter picked it up, and returned it in the smaller basket.

The next episode on the 24th, was the identification of letters unknown to the sitters. I put four of these in the basket in the cabinet, and all were correctly named by Walter and then thrown out the front or the handholes. Throughout this part of the sitting, the basket was batted about in the cabinet much more viciously than the night before.

The small luminous basket was now placed on the shelf, and a duplication in all respects of the previous evening's balancing act was given. There was the same difficulty in finding a place and position where it would not fall to the floor. When this was found, the act proceeded as the night before, with the addition of a large tendency for the rocking to check abruptly, almost with a jerk, as the light went on. In this connection, it may be of significance that the full strength of the red light was here used, far brighter than the night before.

A period ensued in which the luminous basket was levitated high and far inside the glass cabinet, moving about with freedom. Some discussion then ensued with Walter as to what he should do next. He was somewhat more choosey than usual, rejecting the VCO machine, the notion of bringing the Psychic out and moving to the other cabinet, etc. The bell-box was placed on the shelf in the glass cabinet and he rang it once or twice. Then at his own motion his latest trick was shown to me, for the first time.

The large megaphone was introduced into the cabinet, on the Psychic's lap or on the shelf. It carried a band of the zinc sulfide paint, but this had not been activated and hence was wholly dark and invisible. But after the megaphone had been in the cabinet for less than a minute, the strip of paint flared up faintly and was clearly though not at all brightly visible as a semi-circle of light.

4 A very important episode, which will receive comment on page 415.—J. M. B.
It faded out to invisibility and faded in again; and after two or three repetitions, while it was dark I asked permission, on its next fading in, to reach in and grasp it in verification that what we saw was actually the luminous band on the megaphone. This test was permitted without hesitation and with complete success, the megaphone being wholly recognizable by virtue of a bad crack in the large end.\footnote{This incident, too, is put in its place in another chapter; see page 394.—J. M. B.}

In the same way the small end of the megaphone, a plain luminous plaque, and a luminous coordinate board were successively activated by Walter and made to glow for a succession of brief intervals. Five to ten seconds of visibility seemed about the limit.

Walter said good night, but lingered; and while he lingered talking, it struck 10:30. Both on this and the previous evenings, there were several occasions when he talked distinctly and fairly loudly\footnote{The record does not say that this represents the sitting order, but Dudley is confident that it does so.—J. M. B.} while the red light was on.

Above record from sketchy memoranda made after séance, slightly amplified Sunday morning, April 25th, and drawn up in the present form from these memoranda and from the memories which they evoked, April 28th and 29th. In the latter connection, use was made of Crandon's own record of the 23d, so far as my memory was clearly in accord with this document.

For the first of these two evenings, Crandon prepared his usual record; I conserve the space which it would take up since it differs in no fundamental from mine and is far less complete. For the second evening he did not bother about a record of his own, letting mine serve the purposes to which his is ordinarily put.

The spring of 1926 brought out one more séance at which a full record was prepared independently of Crandon's; this time, by Dudley. I give it complete save for two long passages detailing Walter's conversational quips:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, May 14th, 1926. In glass cabinet. Present: Webster, Mrs. Webster, Mrs. Bingham, Crandon, Mrs. Hale, Mrs. Lindsay, Johnson.\footnote{Mrs. Stinson behind Webster, Dudley behind Mrs. Webster.} Mrs. Stinson behind Webster, Dudley behind Mrs. Webster.

Apparatus inspected by all. VCO tested by Webster and Johnson. Bell-box examined by the Websters, Mrs. Bingham, Mrs.
Hale and Johnson, the latter explaining it to the others. Ties placed on wrists and ankles by Crandon and added to by Johnson. The Psychic secured in cabinet by Johnson (right foot, collar) and Webster (left foot and hands). With exception of right hand, the ties were most weird; Walter remarked on the awful bunch of knots.

Walter manifested in less than one minute. Webster picked out letters in the dark, put these in basket and basket in cabinet on floor. Basket levitated by Walter, who threw out one letter at a time. "Here's one for you, for the nice lady, a U for you." Mrs. Hale couldn't locate it; Johnson tried; Walter said it was between the two chairs (Mrs. Hale's and Mrs. Lindsay's); correct. It was a U. Next letter: "H, for Hell and happiness." Johnson says O. K. Next M or more probably W, for Mrs. Hale; O. K. Next J for Johnson; O. K. Next O for Mrs. Webster; O. K.

Various articles placed in basket in dark. Walter identified large and small handkerchief and "a small metal case with some small things inside." O. K.

Luminous basket on shelf, shelf placed by Crandon, basket by Webster. Rocked off to floor several times but finally rocked three times in bright red light. Levitated in large arc and from side to side and then thrown to back of cabinet. Hand controls checked by Mrs. Hale and Walter, who also checked foot control.

Shelf removed by Crandon. Large megaphone in cabinet by Webster. Levitated to about four feet and then out in front of cabinet and from there to floor.

Walter started talking; [and a long paragraph of the record devoted to his conversation is omitted].

VCO brought in at 36th minute of séance. Inspected by Webster. Johnson unlocks collar. Webster puts mouthpiece in place. Dark. Walter tells the Psychic to blow it up. Whistles beautifully and repeats test poem in very loud whisper which had many of the qualities of a hoarse voice. Crandon's and Dudley's mouths under control. VCO again checked by Webster in white light, as before.

Psychic released by Johnson. Sitting started in old cabinet at 40th minute of séance. Circle: Psychic, Webster, Mrs. Lindsay, Johnson, Mrs. Webster, Mrs. Bingham, Mrs. Hale, Crandon. Mrs. Stinson behind Mmes. Lindsay and Bingham; Dudley behind Mrs. Bingham and Webster. Walter manifested almost as soon as light was out. [A long paragraph devoted to his humorous remarks is eliminated.]

---

7 See open reference No. 19, Vol. 2.
Bell-box picked up by Mrs. Hale, who turns around while it rings. Sets it down. Again in red light picked up by Mrs. Lindsay, same result. Picked up by Johnson, who turns around, hands it to Mrs. Hale, to Mrs. Bingham, to Mrs. Webster, to Mrs. Lindsay, to Webster, who goes to front of room, turns around, returns to table. Examined then by Webster in white light. Ringing started and stopped in red light each time, except last time when it stopped in white light.

Scales brought to table by Crandon. Examined while balancing without load, in white light. Webster takes weights. Dark. Light. Webster puts one on east pan. Unbalanced. Dark. Crandon says gravity is working; Walter says levity is working. Light; Walter is right. West pan down on base. Webster passes arm between Psychic and scales; Mrs. Hale between Crandon and scales. Webster passes hand over west pan, Mrs. Hale under east pan. Dark. Walter tells Webster to remove west pan and hold it in hand, keeping it level. Light west pan removed. Scales unbalance to east. Crandon plays light on scales and on pan which Webster holds in left hand. Webster replaces west pan and scales again go down on that side. Dark. Crandon says that Webster tipped the pan on edge as he held it, and asks Walter how he stayed on. “Oh, I’m used to that by this time; I hung on by my eye teeth.” Walter tells Webster to put all weights in either pan and Webster puts them in east pan. Scales unbalance although previously somewhat unbalanced toward west. Dark. Light. West pan down on base. Webster passes hand around and over pan and around beam. Mrs. Hale feels under east pan. Dark. Walter tells the Psychic that as soon as light comes on she is to leave the circle. Light; scales balance five-to-none; Psychic leaves circle and stands near book-case at west of room. Scales continue to balance while Crandon plays white light on beam and pans. Psychic returns to circle in red light. Dark. Walter tells Johnson to lift scales. Light. Johnson lifts them about eighteen inches, while they balance, in red light. Then Crandon plays white flashlight on scales and underneath and on table.

Total duration of séance, one hour six minutes.

The above scales episode, like the earlier ones of the present chapter, anticipates Chapter XXXVI. The latter chapter in fact would better have preceded the present one; but this fact was not observed until after the pages had been numbered and numerous cross-references had been made to them; so that the transposition which clarity suggests is vetoed by expediency.
CHAPTER XXXV
The Further History of the Bell-Box
By the Editor

Like the VCO machine, the illuminated basket and the wooden letters, the bell-box (SAB model) passed through a more or less definite evolution toward better performance under better conditions, and then settled down into an approximately standard performance for the standardized séance. We have traced its history through the developmental stage; it remains now for us to chronicle its routine use and to mention whatever of outstanding performance this led to.

We left the SAB in Chapter XXVII at the point where it had twice been used in the glass cabinet, under conditions not particularly impressive. On November 18th, which has already been noted as the sitting in which the germ of the standardized séance using both cabinets was first seen, it was used in the old cabinet rather than in the glass one; and during the period in which the double séance was emerging out of its chrysalis, this instrument was used only on nights when the old cabinet came into play. Dates and engineers (sitters who stood up and moved about holding the ringing box) of the featureless performances, and details of the feature ones, are as follows:

Nov. 18th, 1925: Bishop.

Dec. 11th: Bixler. "The experiment came to an end when the box accidentally came into contact with Mrs. Brainerd’s head." Under a theory of fraud one would have to visualize it as thus receiving a sharper jar than it ordinarily receives when set down on the table. Under a theory of genuineness this is not the case, since other factors than the physical shock may have caused the cessation.

Dec. 12th: Graham.

Dec. 15th: McComas, twice; the second time with unusual "irregular intermittency" of ringing.

Dec. 19th: an unusual display of the visible ringing of the box by the teleplasmic hand; see page 452 for the full record.

Jan. 13th, 1926: ringing in darkness only, "with luminous con-

---

1 Chaps. X, XI, XXVII.
2 See page 348.
3 For discussion of this term, see Jour., A.S.P.R.; July 1926, p. 390.
control of Margery's wrists and Crandon's left, and contact control of Margery's feet."

Jan. 18th: Morse, Miner.
Jan. 21st: Miss Ball.
Jan. 24th: Ridgway, Mrs. Hodges.
Jan. 26th: See full record, p. 370; and compare Dunlap's experience here with Mrs. Crunden's to which we immediately come.

Feb. 3rd: this is one of the most important episodes ever obtained with the bell-box; for "Walter rang the bell intermittently, and even stopped and started it on request while Mrs. Crunden (a perfect stranger despite the temptation to confuse her name with the Psychic's) stood up and turned completely around with the bell-box in her hands."
The critic who adheres to the notion that these red-light ringings of the bell while carried about are due to tampering with the spring will, of course, have to deny that this happened; he cannot explain it away. If he asks why it doesn't occur oftener, I can only say that Walter pictures his command over the foot-loose bell-box as not ordinarily clean-cut enough to permit it. He can start and stop the ringing from moment to moment as he finds himself able; but doing this to order he says is altogether too extravagant of force. Whether you like this plea or not, is your own affair; I merely quote Walter.

Feb. 4th brought out another incident strongly contradictory of the tampered-spring theory. Griscom and Gerald were the engineers. The latter was so enthusiastic in his handling of the box that he struck it against the chandelier; whereupon the ringing stopped for some ten seconds. Under the theory it is difficult to see just how one could so strike the box as to bring about this result; certainly, if the contact board hit the chandelier, as seems most likely to happen in view of the uppermost position of the former and the height of the latter, the bell ought to ring more persistently. But if one ignore this difficulty, one must at least grant that after a blow putting it out of contact for ten seconds, during which Gerald continued to move the box at least sufficiently to bring it back to the table, the spring ought to be so hopelessly out of a contact position as to require fresh manipulation in order to ring the bell. But the bell rang just as Gerald got it back to the table.

Feb. 21st: Mr. and Mrs. Pierson.
Feb. 22nd: von Reuter, Mrs. Greene.
Feb. 25th: N. Gray, C. L. Hyde, T. Hyde. "At the end of one of these experiments he allowed C. L. Hyde to lift the flapper of the box to see that there was nothing under it, then to restore it to its normal position; after which the bell rang intermittently." That it would do so if the ringing occurred as a result of manipulating the spring is not at all obvious.

Feb. 27th: O'Brien, Major Stimpson.

March 4th: Van Arsdale, Miss Lohman. "The box was then deposited in Van Arsdale's lap; he kept it until after the sitting, when he examined it to his satisfaction." Are we asked to believe that Margery restored the spring to non-contact position while the box lay on Van Arsdale's lap, and without his observation?

March 5th: Weston. While Weston had the box in air, Ellis raised and replaced the flapper; the bell resumed its ringing.

March 8th: Sawyer, Reilly; and Sawyer was given the same test that Van Arsdale had on the 4th.

March 12th: Bradley, the Mmes. Bigelow. "While the bell was ringing, he allowed a white flash-light to be played on it and it continued ringing intermittently, though Walter said later that it dissolved his material." This test, of course, has no bearing upon the hypothesis of fraud by a tampered spring.

March 21st: A. Gray, Wilson. The test of lifting and lowering the flapper while the box was being carried becomes at about this date a matter of routine.

March 22nd: Swift, Collier.

March 23rd: Davis.

March 27th: Overstreet, Mrs. Wilde.

March 30th: Johnston.

April 1st: Engineer not named.

April 4th: Murray, Clinton and N. Gray, one after another in a single interval of light. Clinton was "then" directed to verify that it did not ring whenever picked up; whether in the same light interval does not appear.

April 6th: Rogers, Bixler, Harlow and one of the ladies, all in one episode as on the 4th. The same additional test was made with the same ambiguity in the record.

April 10th: Holmes and four others in succession.

April 15th: see full record, page 397.

April 23rd: see my full record of page 401. The bell-box is not
ordinarily used in the glass cabinet, constituting rather a part of the routine of the open cabinet. The present episode is very important, not alone on the general ground that it denies the hypothesis that this distinction is due to the necessities of fraud; but equally because the fraud by tampering with the spring would be so utterly out of the question in the glass cabinet.

April 29th: see full record by Tillyard, Chapter XLII.
May 5th: carried "from hand to hand."
May 8th: handed in turn to every sitter.
May 14th: see Dudley's record, page 409.
May 16th: Murray, Miss Comstock.
May 18th: "sitters" unnamed.
May 19th: "all the sitters."
May 23rd: Riddle, Davis.
May 26th: Pierce, Taylor.
June 1st: Marston; Carter followed by all other sitters, in an extremely long test, with the flapper being raised and lowered by each person who took the box, and with the test at the end to show that the bell does not always ring when picked up. The record sounds more than usually as though this occurred in the same red-light interval, but is not specific on the point.
June 8th: Manney.
June 18th: Pierpont, followed by all others.
June 29th, July 2nd, July 6th: all without mention of individual sitters.
July 7th: Allinson, Mrs. Floyd.
July 15th, 19th, 26th: no mention of individual sitters.
Aug. 24th: "Ellsworth."
Sept. 2nd: no mention of engineer.
Sept. 15th: Overstreet; first alone, later followed by five others.
Oct. 13th: Van Allen alone; then followed by seven other sitters.
Oct. 19th: an item comparable to those of Jan. 26th and Feb. 3rd. Mrs. Hill was acting as engineer; and the bell rang in red light on the table, before she had touched it to pick it up. It was silent as the light went on, then rang; and it continued to ring for a considerable time, probably until after she picked it up though this is not altogether clear from the record. In any event, it rang a good peal, and not the single tinkle which would have been got by pulling off a pre-
viously connected thread. Bond then engineered the bell-box and had the same experience.

Nov. 4th: Samuel, Thwaites.

Nov. 6th: Levinson; first alone, then followed by others. "He then came back to the table and the box was in turn passed through the hands of every sitter. During this time it rang at irregular intervals and was examined in red light and white at the end of the same period." Whether to conclude from this that the box stopped ringing spontaneously and permanently, and was then examined without interval of darkness; or that it was examined while being passed about and while ringing intermittently—this is not clear.

Nov. 16th: engineer not named.

Nov. 19th: Weigle, McComas. "During all this time the box rang intermittently and irregularly, and was then examined in the same period of red light with addition of white flashlight." This at last seems reasonably clear, and it seems self-evident to me that we have a chronicle of bell-box action which, in its totality, will yield to no theory of fraudulent operation.
CHAPTER XXXVI

The Rehabilitation of the Scales

By the Editor

Chapters XXXV, XLII and XLI.III of M. M. chronicle the placing before Walter, by Comstock, of an ordinary chemical balance from the laboratory; the development of levitation phenomena using such balances, with unequal weights on the two pans; and the development, by Comstock, of bigger and better and more nearly fraud-proof balances. The story there terminates with the performance of July 20th, 1924; and with the statement that "on August 3d they had passed so definitely out of the picture that they were removed from the table and laid distinctly aside."

The scales remained in the séance room after thus passing out of the picture, however; and every once in so often the possibility of returning to their use would be discussed by the sitters, or even by Walter. The first real move in this direction came on October 4th, 1925; the scales were ready for use on that evening but Walter said that he would resume with them some other time. They are next heard of on March 16th, 1926. There is no indication in the records for immediately preceding dates of any agreement or discussion with Walter leading up to this evening's restoration of the balance as a standard séance tool; but I imagine such discussion must have taken place, if only because of the matter-of-fact way in which the present record brings them in, without explanation of any sort, plus the way in which this séance was given over wholly to the scales. The record reads:

Walter came through promptly and promised us shortly that he would make some paraffin gloves of hands such as the world had never seen.¹ He then called for the scales to be put on the table and it was so done. He then asked that they be arranged with four weights in the east and none in the west and later four in the east and one in the west pans. This was done and after a lot of preliminary fiddling in the dark, the light was turned on and the scales

¹The superlative character of any performance is of course always a matter of opinion. With this reservation, it is to be pointed out (see Chapter XLI) that the present promise, which few or none of the sitters could have taken very seriously, was made good within three months.—J. M. B.
we were balancing perfectly with a load of four to one. This was repeated several times. Walter then directed Dudley to lift platform, scales and all while thus balancing and at that time Richardson was to feel under the table and swing his whole arm in an arc down between the Psychic and the table, showing there was no connection.

Next, while the scales were balancing, with these uneven loads Richardson was told to lift the pan near him off the scales but to hold it horizontally "for fear I get spilled." This was done and when the pan was off gravity worked, but immediately the pan was restored to the west end of the balance, the balance against gravity at once reappeared. The séance was held in the open cabinet.

The description of the scales and of their manner of use as set down on pages 344-5 of M. M. must now be modified in connection with their restoration to activity at the date to which we come. The provision for electrical recording was abandoned; the mercury basins were left empty in the platform and the trailing wires were dismantled from beneath the pans. The jelly-glasses were also abandoned as a stand for the unit, since this was to be brought to the table by a sitter, placed by him at random, and freely displaced during the séance; it was felt that under such conditions the glasses would give no additional safeguard against wires or threads, and would increase the danger of accident to the scales. The celluloid cover too, unless specifically mentioned, may now be assumed to have been absent. And one omission in the existing description must be made good.

In all precision balances it is customary to mount small riders on the horizontal beam. These may be moved back and forth, and fastened in any position by set-screws. The purpose is to enable an exact balance to be struck between the two sides of the unit at any time, regardless of temporary conditions of temperature, etc., etc. If the scales do not balance exactly, one rider or the other may be moved until they do. Riders of this sort were present on Comstock's final No. 4 scales from the beginning of their use; the photographs of the present volume will show their size and location, and the grooves in which they run. They are not ordinarily used in the séances, since it is not ordinarily a matter of moment whether the empty scales balance perfectly. But they will occupy a prominent place in Chap. XLV, and we must therefore have their physical character before us.

After the start obtained on March 16th the scales continued to occupy a prominent place in Walter's attention. On the 17th there
was again a complete séance, given over to them. There seems to be
sufficient of interest in the two records, one by Crandon and one by
certain other sitters, to warrant giving them both in full:

On account of the health of the medium we expected only a quiet,
simple sitting with a good deal of red light; and, therefore, with
less careful control because of the nature of the phenomena ex-
pected. The circle had careful contact only with the medium’s left
hand and F. H.’s right hand.

Walter came through promptly with the familiar whistle in
fine form. After a few sentences in a whisper, the small megaphone
was used for perhaps three minutes and then dropped with a clatter
on the floor.

Walter selected the scales for demonstration. We examined
the wooden table, without any metal screws or points, the wooden
stand beneath the scales and the apparatus. It was very difficult
to establish an exact balance, or to keep the pans from swinging
and the cross bar from oscillation. The wooden weights or check-
ers were examined.

At first one checker, then two were on one pan with the other
empty. Soon after there were four versus one. After a few min-
utes of preparation and conversation, in which Walter said, “Go
on and tell a story. Don’t pay any attention to me; I’ve got to
work this up first,” we heard the scales being moved, and under red
light saw the pans in equal balance, absolutely quiet. In succeed-
ing moments of red light the right pan was hard down on the table,
quite against gravity principles.

There followed a dozen various demonstrations. The pans at
Walter’s suggestion were repeatedly moved about, held level, “So
you won’t spill me off,” he said; then replaced. Afterward the
scales were lifted, the table searched; Ellis passed hands and body
between table and medium. Then Kent and Eddy searched the
surrounding air, examined the scales in good clear red light.

Walter’s sense of humor was very active. He likes this sort of
play. It presents a paradox. For instance, Mrs. Eddy said:
“Gravity works until Walter steps in.” Quick as a flash Walter
laughed and said, “Then levity comes,” with a very pat double
meaning.

We then in red light transferred the weight on the right pan in
case anything was influencing its position on the scales. Within
ten seconds after leaving the pans swinging and changed, Walter
called for red light again. They were held steady, immovable, and
in absolute balance as Walter chuckled: “Absolute gravity, you
see.”
We commented on the delicacy necessary to establish an immovable even balance. We had tried for several minutes without success, the bar swinging back and forth. There seemed to be greater accuracy present than we could exert in full light. Then Walter suggested that Eddy examine the pan at the level of his nose, under the white flash light (rarely permitted). There was evidently nothing visible. He was told to hold the pan level for the reason given above.

Eddy asked Walter if he would speak in two different places with the maximum variation convenient. The first voice evidently was fifteen inches to the left of the medium's head, as last seen in the red light; and immediately within one second eighteen inches to the right—a distance of between two and two and a half feet. But Walter said we would have a full evening on the voice soon, and he did not want to try out anything new but the scales.

The trance was light throughout. Walter was in strength and in very clever and chatty mood. He seemed happy and deeply interested with the demonstration. After the sitting the discussion touched upon the accuracy and delicacy of adjustment, and the principles involved to assert a steady balance between unequal weighted pans or the apparent increase of weight in the right pan by any means discernible. We again searched the scales for thread or wire, or any possible intervention. Walter said he was using no visible terminal, but merely an energy under his directing will. The question of the visibility of this possibly psychic terminal in ultraviolet rays, and a moving picture film taking this terminal, closed a most interesting evening.

(Signed) Albert Kent
D. Brewer Eddy
Josephine R. Eddy
Arthur M. Ellis

The above record is self-explanatory; we now pass to Crandon's:

Sitting in the open cabinet, the scales were in position on the table in front of the Psychic. Before the sitting all sitters examined the scales, lifted them up and completely satisfied themselves as to their condition. The six checkers used as weights were examined and tested by Eddy and stayed in his possession. Walter came through promptly and indulged in lively repartee; one line was a very good double entendre. Eddy said, "When Walter comes in, gravity departs." Walter instantly added, "And levity comes in." The experiments were as follows:
Walter showed in red light an empty west pan swinging up and down in perfect balance over against the east pan with three weights in it. He then did the same with one in the west and four in the east. He then showed four against one balancing perfectly without any swing. This is a thing we are almost unable to do normally because the balances are so sensitive that they swing like a pendulum for many minutes. Walter now directed Eddy to stand up and carry out an experiment as follows:

The balances were swinging, perfectly balanced, with a load of three to nothing. Eddy picked up the empty pan whereupon gravity immediately dropped the full east pan. Holding the empty pan horizontally (by direction) close under his nose, Eddy examined the empty pan while Crandon turned a bright white searchlight on it. The pan appeared to all to be empty. Eddy now put it back in its holder on the west side, whereupon it immediately lifted and balanced the east pan containing three weights. Next, by direction, Eddy shifted the pans, east to the west, west to the east, so that the west now had four and the east one. Walter immediately balanced them as well as he had the other way.

Next, by direction, the four-to-one load was balanced in red light. Eddy put his hand along the bar of the balances and all round every side of them while at the same time Ellis, using his right arm, cleaver-fashion, brought it down from the level of the Psychic’s head to her feet between her and the balances on the table. He encountered nothing.

Asked about it, Walter said that he put a substance which might be called energy on the unweighted pan; that is about all he knew about it.

The record for March 21st informs us, incidentally, that a sitting was attempted on the 20th, resulting in total blank. These blanks do not always get recorded; Crandon counts them as approximately thirty in the four years, plus, of the mediumship. The sitting of the 21st was apparently intended as part of the scales sequence, the other phenomena offered being a spontaneous move on Walter’s part. The entire record may therefore be inserted at this point:

Sitting in the old cabinet, Walter came through in spite of the total blank of the night before, saying about that episode merely that he did not have enough force to come through. After a lot of talk and repartee and answering questions for various sitters, he proceeded to work on the balances and there he made a four-to-one, three-to-none and finally a four-to-none balancing
stunt. He allowed Wilson to lug the scales round the room while he maintained this balancing contrary to gravity. He allowed the empty pan to be taken off and inspected in white light and when pan was restored to its position on the scales again balancing of nothing against four reestablished itself, all in the same period of red light.

Walter next put through the stunts of the bell-box; ringing it intermittently while both A. W. Gray and Wilson lugged it round the room, lifting it high and low, turning the flapper back, both quite unable to explain it.

Next the Dingwall bell-box, not vitalized, was put on the table and Walter proceeded to make it glow at will, even when hands were upon it.

After the preliminaries of these three sittings had been disposed of, Walter’s command over the scales seemed established; and he now abandoned the special sittings for the balance work, making this a part of the standardized sittings. Thus, on March 22d:

The scales were now brought forth, and Walter balanced first a two-to-nothing and then a four-to-nothing load. He maintained this phenomenon in action while Baker carried the whole scales around the room. When they were returned to the table, the empty west pan was lifted by Swift, whereupon the loaded east pan fell sharply. The west pan was now examined with a white flash and found to be apparently empty. It was put back, having been carefully held horizontally all the time. At once the apparent anomaly of the balance between empty and loaded pans was reestablished. All this was in the same period of bright red light.

The scales gave a featureless performance in the standardized séance of March 23d; then, on the 27th:

Walter now proceeded to the scales and successfully balanced in red light a two-to-nothing and then a four-to-one load. He then allowed Overstreet to take the empty pan out and verify its apparent emptiness; then to put it back on; whereupon gravity again ceased to work as it had during the absence of the pan, and the four-to-one load balanced perfectly. He then allowed Overstreet to pick up the scales while it was balancing a four-to-one load; the balance was undisturbed, with gentle oscillation up and down.

With the scales now a recognized feature of the standardized séance, we find some performances which need be cited only by date;
THE REHABILITATION OF THE SCALES

with others involving some element that requires a complete quotation from the record. Of these latter occasions I find the following:

March 30th: The scales were brought to the table and Walter produced balancing with a two-to-nothing load and then with four-to-nothing. He did this both statically and with the scales in motion as they balanced. He then allowed Johnston to pick off the empty pan. Gravity at once came into play. When the empty pan was put back on the empty west arm of the scales, it at once lifted the opposite weighted pan; all this being in the one period of red light. Eddy was allowed to put his forefinger on the loaded pan to estimate the weight that Walter was exerting.

March 31st: The scales were carefully examined and calibrated by Hill before sitting. Walter balanced a two-to-nothing and then a four-to-nothing load, both statically and in oscillation. While this balancing was going on Hill, Dudley and Richardson severally put an arm down in a vertical plane between Margery and the table from the height of her head to the floor; another put a pencil back and forth between the base of the unit and the bottoms of the balancing pans; and a third passed his hands all around the scales above and below and in close relationship to the top bar. The phenomenon continued throughout all this. Next the west pan was taken off while balancing the loaded east pan, and now the empty frame at the west continued to weight down the loaded east pan.

This it will be seen is a variation from previous experience; heretofore when the apparently empty pan has been removed the other one has crashed. It therefore appears that Walter's influence upon the scales is not a fixed quantity, but is variable at his pleasure. The rather obscure wording of the following record means that the two experiences were given consecutively on the same date; the first time the empty pan was removed the loaded one crashed and the second time it remained suspended in air:

Apr. 1st: Walter demonstrated the presence of his force in the empty pan when this was taken off and returned; then its presence on the brass framework on repetition of the experiment; the load was four-to-none. He showed this four-to-nothing balance with the sitters passing their hands between Margery and the

---

1a If the distinction between a static and a dynamic balancing of the unequally loaded pans is not immediately clear from these adjectives, M. M. may be consulted (p. 281) for further details.—J. M. B.
scales; and all about everywhere; and finally he showed the same balance contrary to gravity under the glare of a bright white flash.

Apr. 4th: The scales was placed on the table and found to balance truly. A four-to-one load was placed, west and east respectively. Walter immediately balanced this load in red light and later showed the pans oscillating. Next he directed that the pans, loaded as they were, be interchanged; and he again made them oscillate in true balance. He then allowed Clinton, while they hung even with the four-to-nothing load, to pass a pencil freely under the pans. He increased the load to five-to-nothing without loss of result. Brown picked the empty east pan off, and the west pan with five weights balanced with the empty east frame. Under these same conditions Walter allowed a match to be struck and the scales was carefully examined in this light while the five-to-nothing balance remained perfect.

On April 6th the scales performance added nothing new; but there is a bit of novelty in the record for the 10th:

The scales was put on the table and Walter performed many permutations. He balanced two-to-none, four-to-none, five-to-one and five-to-none loads, both statically and dynamically. During the periods of balancing he allowed anyone to pass a pencil or place a hand under either or both pans. At one time the white flashlight was played upon the entire unit for inspection. At another time the empty pans were found balancing. Holmes took the west pan off, whereupon the east pan went down, normally so far as could be judged. He put the apparently empty west pan back, and it now went down and remained down as though weighted. Similar experiences were had with empty pan vs. no pan; then with both sides of the balance stripped of their pans.

On the 15th there was the usual performance, plus one new feature: Richardson was permitted to pick the entire bulky scales unit off the table while it was in levitation, and the balance between the unequally weighted pans persisted undisturbed. On the 17th, the scales were brought out of the atmosphere of the standardized sitting for a little special study, as the following record makes clear:

This evening was devoted to a study of the phenomena of the balances. Preceding the sitting Little calibrated them to an approximation of accuracy and examined them thoroughly.

2 See page 399.
THE REHABILITATION OF THE SCALES

Walter came through promptly and greeted Eklund in a most friendly way. He then proceeded to balance a 4–1 load and then a 4–0 load, either pan being selected and the weights put on by Dr. Little. He then balanced a four load over against no pan. He then balanced a one load against empty pan, empty pan was removed, gravity reappeared, empty pan put on and it promptly levitated the loaded pan, showing that Walter's substance remained on the empty pan. During these experiments Little and Dennett freely cut long planes with their arms down between the Psychic and the table, and between Crandon and the table. Little freely examined the scales, during a flash of white light, while in levitation.

Walter gave a brief exhibition of his power to vitalize an area of the luminous paint even with a hand resting on it.

Again on the 18th the glass cabinet was ignored and the entire séance was held in the old cabinet with major attention upon the scales:

Walter came through in good mood, listened to some organ music for a while and then ordered a more lively tune. He devoted himself to the scales with the addition of the celluloid cover. Under these conditions he levitated 4–1, and at one time, while the victrola was being adjusted, maintained this balance for 80 seconds. ALL IN GOOD RED LIGHT. At another time, while levitation 4–1 was present under the celluloid cover, the Psychic, under instructions, got up and left the room and then came back. During all this time, at least 50 seconds, the levitation of the scales was maintained.

Crandon observed that it appeared that Walter put something on the empty pan, because just before the light went on the celluloid cover was tipped up so it hit Crandon's forehead.

I need not here repeat the details of the scales performance given in my presence on April 23rd, nor that shown to Tillyard on April 29th. The scales action of May 5th needs be cited only by title; likewise that of the 8th. On the 14th, not only was the white flash allowed, as was now becoming so usual, but a five-to-none balance was maintained while Margery left the cabinet, and again while Johnson picked the entire scales unit up clear of the table. For the 16th we need the record:

3 My italics.—J. M. B.
4 Crandon's emphasis.—J. M. B.
5 See pages 405-6.
6 See page 489.
6a See page 411.
The scales was brought out and Walter got a one-to-none balancing perfectly while all kinds of examination and tests in red and white light failed to reveal any normal technique. He then established balance with a four-to-one load, and had the celluloid cover put on while this balance was present; this balance was now shown to us statically, then swinging. Finally with the celluloid cover and a four-to-none load, Murray stepped into the cabinet and lifted the whole unit: scales, cover and platform beneath. Easy swinging balance was maintained throughout this experiment, covering a minute and a half in good red light, with white flash to examine the details. Walter then "extricated" himself, and gravity was seen to be working as usual.

On May 18th the scales performance included a dynamic balancing of a five-to-none load with Margery out of the cabinet. During the latter days of the month four records were got from which I must quote bodily:

May 19th: The scales was brought out; it did a one-to-none load, a one-checker-to-no-pan load, and a five-to-none load, both static and dynamic. This last he maintained with a good swinging action after Margery left the cabinet, and with good white flash-light playing on it. Emerson was allowed to pick up the whole balance unit while the one-to-none load balanced truly.

May 23rd: The scales was brought out and Walter did the one-to-nothing, the one-to-no-pan and the five-to-nothing levitations, both static and dynamic. He added a new term to this. He balanced the five-to-none load; Margery left the cabinet until she was nine feet away; Davis entered the cabinet and sat in her chair; Riddle picked up the scales and lifted them eight inches off the table; a white flash was played all over the outfit; and at the same time a sitter put his hand above and below the pans, over the bar, and between Crandon and the table. The scales remained balancing by levitation until Margery was back in the cabinet, probably ninety seconds in all, and all in the same period of red light.

May 26th: The scales was brought out and Walter balanced a one-to-none, a one-to-no-pan, and a five-to-none load, using either

---

7 In an interval of darkness.—J. M. B.
8 I caution the reader not to conclude that the levitation was terminated in this red light. This would be contrary to custom and I wholly doubt that the record means to imply its occurrence.—J. M. B.
pan. With the one-to-none load, Pierce took the empty pan off and gravity asserted itself; when he put this pan back it again acted as though the heavier one. Finally, with five-to-none load balancing in red light, Margery left the cabinet, Atkinson entered it and sat in her chair, Nichols raised the scales six inches clear of the table, Crandon put his hands and feet in custody of Pierce and Mrs. Bentley, and a flashlight was freely played upon the whole scales unit, while two sitters felt in all parts where it seemed at all pertinent to feel. All this occurred in one period of red light, and took some ninety seconds.

June 1st: The scales was now put in action, after being examined thoroughly in white light. In red light Walter balanced the one-to-none and the six-to-none loads; in the latter instance Smith having elected on which pan he would put the weights. In the one-to-none test Marston picked the empty pan off and gravity reasserted itself; then he put the empty pan back and it again levitated the loaded pan. The one-to-none load was then shown in free oscillation. While the six-to-none load was in balance, Smith picked up the whole outfit and it was examined thoroughly above and below in white flashlight.

The scales continued throughout the year to be employed regularly in the standardized séances (see Chapters XXIX, XXXIV, and XXXVII) of the sort from which the above episodes are taken. There was seldom if ever anything new; like the VCO machine, this instrument seemed to have attained a fixed pattern of demonstration. We may therefore consider that our discussion of it is closed save in so far as it enters into the action of séances of which, on some other ground, we are obliged to give a complete account. Such a séance will occupy the first four chapters (XLIV–XLVII) of our second volume; and others will occur somewhat later to which we can at this moment give only an open reference (No. 20 of these).
CHAPTER XXXVII

The Further History of the Standardized Séance

By the Editor

The detailed records given in Chapter XXXIV are typical of the standardized séances of this period. These séances follow very largely the same model, yet in many of them there is action sufficiently distinctive for description in some detail. The generality of the standardized action, however, need not be so described; to do this would be an extreme waste of space. I therefore proceed in the present chapter to give the routine details of all standardized séances for the balance of 1926 which are not otherwise covered. For some of these, details of the action that are worthy of perpetuation are set down in other and more topical chapters (on bell-box or scales, for instance); for others, I give brief excerpts from the records herein.

April 20th (1926): Identifications (of personal objects, as always when this word is used, B (basket) levitations. From the record:

During all these cognitions Walter seemed to lift the basket [containing the objects offered him] up. Hill felt of all controls between every two experiments, and once when he was so feeling, the basket brushed across his head about four feet from the floor.

May 5th: letters, identifications, B and M (megaphone) levitations (this word will be omitted hereafter), VCO. (In old cabinet, as always:) BB (bell-box).

May 8th: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO. VCO engineered by James. BB, Sc (Scales).

May 18th: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO. BB, Sc.

May 19th: letters (engineered by Cox), identifications, B, M, VCO (engineered by Cox). BB, Sc. From the record:

The basket went all over the cabinet, around the Psychic’s head to a height of 5½ feet, and was finally thrown behind her. The megaphone was lifted not only in the cabinet but outside the front thereof to a distance of at least two feet. It was finally put on the floor¹ about 3½ feet in front, and Walter was still able to lift it up and move it about.

¹By the sitters.—J. M. B.
May 23rd: letters, B, M, VCO (engineered by Riddle). BB, Sc. From the record:

[The basket or the megaphone or both] went above and behind the Psychic's head and all over the cabinet. Then the basket was shown rolling on the shelf in red light for 30 seconds; then there was a new exhibit. The light was turned on, the basket was seen lying on the shelf in front of the entranced Psychic. We could hear a creaking of the basket as though a hand grasped it, but we could see nothing of this. The basket then began to roll, in increasing excursions. All this in red light.

May 26th: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO. BB, Sc. From the record:

Next he levitated the basket all about in every direction, while at the same moment the sitters confirmed the positions of the lashed extremities. He finally carried the basket around and about the Psychic's head and threw it in the back of the cabinet.

Next the three-pound megaphone was levitated all over the cabinet and on request Walter put his terminal over the upper luminous ring and eclipsed it. He finally threw the megaphone out on the floor, and while it lay there at least two feet from the cabinet he kicked it about and levitated it.

May 28th: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO. BB, Sc. "Jones" was present, and part of the time in trance, being apparently used as a co-medium. The paraffin bucket was present and gave out noises as though it were being worked with, but the action of the standardized séance went on through this and constituted the motif of the evening. The basket was levitated "above and behind the Psychic as far down as her shoulders, then up and all about, rapping on the roof of the cabinet." Sitting in the medium's chair with the handle of this basket in my mouth and the basket extended straight up, I find that I cannot come within eighteen inches of doing this; and my torso is of course considerably longer than Margery's.

June 1st: letters (engineered by Marston), identifications, B, M, VCO. BB, Sc. From the record:

The basket was levitated all over the inside of the cabinet, behind the Psychic's head and down to the floor in front of her.

2 But not her head.—J. M. B.
3 See Chapter XLI.
4 See open reference No. 21, Vol. 2, for the bearing of this observation.
THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

Next the three-pound luminous megaphone was levitated all over the cabinet and finally thrown out three feet in front of the Psychic. In this position it was moved about and erected by Walter's terminal.

June 3rd: letters, identifications, B, D (doughnut), M, VCO. In the old cabinet Walter stated he had little force left and closed without any further phenomena.

June 6th: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO; and the teleplasmic display described later. The identifications included a thimble, contributed by Dudley and attributed to him by Walter.

June 8th: letters, identifications, B, handkerchief levitation, VCO. BB, Sc, activation of luminous paint.

June 11th: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO. BB, Sc:

Walter did movement of the luminous basket in the red light, and then levitated the basket for a period twice as long as usual, with great slowness but sureness of direction, all over the cabinet, behind the Psychic and down by her feet.

June 15: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO; “all critical action by sitters was carried out by Diefenbach and Hardy.” BB, Sc:

While the basket was rolling on the shelf in red light, Pierson was permitted to stand and pass his hands freely between the basket and the entranced medium, encountering no obstacle.

June 18th: letters, identifications, B. Sc.

June 22nd: letters, identifications, B, D, M, VCO. BB, Sc.

June 25th: letters, identifications, VCO. BB, Sc.

June 26th: letters, identifications, B, D, M, VCO (Cobb engineering). BB, Sc. From the record:

He said: “give me a big basket as well as a little one; I need a big one to put my force in.” Thereupon he lifted both baskets as one unit, and levitated them all over the cabinet with great crashing and noise.

June 29th: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO (Hammond engineering). “During these levitations the end sitters were allowed to confirm the lashed condition of the Psychic.” BB, Sc.

---

6 See page 438.
FURTHER HISTORY OF STANDARDIZED SÉANCE 431

July 2nd: See Chapters XLIV–XLVII.

July 6th: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO. BB, Sc. Signora Papa was allowed to wave her hands between the Psychic and the rolling basket.

July 7th: letters, identifications, B, M. BB.

July 19th: identifications, B. BB, Sc, identification of cards.

A memorandum of the séance, prepared for me at my request by Nelson, reads as follows:

1. Levitation of basket, with luminous rings, six feet or more above floor and thrown outside of cabinet.

2. Naming of different objects placed promiscuously into basket. My cigar cutter was immediately identified and thrown outside of cabinet.

3. Ringing of bell in box: Just before the sitting and in good bright white light, I examined this box to my entire satisfaction, and certify that it was of simple construction, containing only two dry cells and a common house bell with wire connections to a piece of board hinged on one side at the top of the box, for the purpose of making the necessary connection. It was in perfect working order. I padlocked the box myself. During the sitting this box was placed on a table in front of “Margery,” and in good red light it rang intermittently. In this same light I lifted the box off the table, the bell now ringing steadily, and at head’s level I turned round in a complete circle. The bell stopped ringing after my placing the box on the table again. After this phenomenon and when the control had ceased operating the bell, to verify that a constant connection had not been made, I again lifted the box and verified that there was no constant connection, as the bell did not ring again. I very particularly kept the box in keen and constant observation, and certify that during the ringing of the bell and when it stopped, it was not tampered with by anyone present.

4. Tipping of scales: With equal observance I examined these scales which were in perfect working order. In good red light the scales were weighted down, by one of the sitters next to me in a proportion of four to one. In the same red light the scales were balanced and made to move up and down, nobody being nearer than two feet away from them. All hands of those near the table were perfectly controlled, including “Margery’s.” These scales were first on the table. They were lifted by one of the sitters, and proven to be in as good working condition as when on the table.
5. Naming of cards selected outside the room by different sitters, seen only by those who selected them, and duly marked for identification. In total darkness, one at a time, selector himself not knowing which card he had chosen from those selected, cards were placed on the table and correctly named by control—"Walter."

(Signed) O. P. NELSON.

July 26th: letters, identifications, B, M, VCO. For the last-named, "he introduced a new feature; he had Hyde and Nichols stand at either side of the door of the cabinet and clasp hands within an inch of the top of the open tube, to prove that no sitter tampered with this." BB, Sc.

July 28th: the first five minutes Crandon was out of the room.

Levitation of the small basket was done by Walter’s new method of putting it inside the big one. This levitation was very brilliant, going to the roof of the cabinet and making raps everywhere. Finally the whole outfit was pushed out of the cabinet door and held in mid-air in the center of the circle. While this position was held, Walter instructed Walton to feel the Psychic’s right hand and follow up her arm to her mouth, where he found nothing of importance. Walter also pointed out that he spoke while the basket was actually in levitation.

Following the séance, the summer was given over for the most part to experimental work in teleplasmic phenomena, and during September, most of the standardized séances were part of a sequence which we must describe elsewhere. For the present chapter we have the following entries: August 16th: B, baryta water experiment of a later page.

The record supports a statement which we have made once or twice in other chapters and, incidentally perhaps, explains the omission of some of the usual phenomena when it says:

The Psychic is far from well. Her weight is off twenty pounds; she is pale and her nervous system is more or less ragged. Her son has just broken his arm. Nevertheless we sat.

5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 See, respectively, open references Nos. 21, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27 in Vol 2.
October 3rd: letters, B, D. BB, Sc. From the record:

Walter called for a doughnut, which was brought in too bright. Then he lifted a second doughnut, not so bright, all over the front of the cabinet. Next the two doughnuts were levitated, on non-parallel courses and at different speeds; with each rotating, first in one plane and then in another, as it rose. Then while both doughnuts were in air and in motion, Martin put his hand over the Psychic’s mouth and found nothing there; and at that moment Walter spoke. While the doughnuts were in the air Walter’s terminal was clearly seen by all. It seemed to be a three-pronged affair. At one time it crumpled a doughnut; again one of the times was thrust through the hole in a doughnut.

October 13th: letters, identifications, B, VCO. BB. October 19th: letters, identifications, B, D, VCO. BB, Sc. Bond engineered most of the episodes; and in view of his presence an unusually full record was produced by Crandon. The phenomena seem to have flowed along with rather greater eclat than usual, but there was nothing really new and no unusually good conditions, so we need give no quotations.


During the balance of the month, the Crandons were so engrossed with their preparations for a vacation trip through the west, covering the entire month of December, that no sittings were held. The evening of December 1st was given over to a small group of friends who chatted with Walter on the eve of the departure. A few séances were given in various parts of the country incidental to the trip, but these are dealt with elsewhere. We have accordingly come to a stopping place, so far as the story of this chapter is concerned. We accordingly bring the chapter to a close, pausing only to emphasize that the citations from the records of July 28th and October 3rd constitute its high spots.
CHAPTER XXXVIII

Identification Phenomena in the Glass Cabinet

By the Editor

We have seen how, during the period in which the routine of the glass cabinet sittings was being worked out into a tentatively final form, Walter and his sitters did not at all bother about identifications acts—whether of cards, personal objects, or what not. We have seen how, starting January 5th, 1926, the identification idea was taken up again, but with the aid of a new instrument in Richardson's wooden letters. Finally, we have had occasion to record, without comment, the fact that there was a return to the use of personal articles contributed by the sitters, without any corresponding abatement in the performance with the wooden letters. But we have seen this only as an abstract fact; we have not at all gone into details.

The first date after the birth of the glass cabinet on which the personal identifications were attempted was February 6th, 1926; and thereafter, at odd moments, Walter reverted to this theme. I give the following excerpts from the records, without further comment:

February 6th: On [Walter's] request, Holmes put an object from his pocket on the table. The luminous controls remained immobile, but nevertheless after about three minutes Walter said: "Take your spectacle case away." As a second experiment, Walter in the midst of a conversation with Holmes said: "Better take your pencil off the table and write that down." Both these identifications were correct.

February 26th: Walter identified several objects taken from the sitter's pocket under strict conditions of double control, and all successfully.

March 8th: The next experiment consisted in identification of an object from the pocket of Sawyer, and second from that of Reilly.

March 30th: Johnston now put something from his pocket in the basket, and Walter declared in about a minute that it was a jack-knife, and threw it on the floor.

1 Chapters XXII (p. 291), XXV, XXVI.
2 Chapter XXVIII.
3 Pages 402, 406, 410; and Chap. XXXVII. See, also, Chap. XXXIX.
April 1st: He then did cognition of a pencil of Cotton's and a pocketbook of Joy's.

April 15th: In addition to the letters, he told Richards to put some object from his own pocket into the basket. Walter identified this as a note-book, correctly.

April 20th: Hill was asked to put something in the basket. He did so, and put the basket [as usual] in the right front of the cabinet. After a minute Walter laughed, and said: “Did you get that at the Harvard Club?” [There was quite a bit of chaffing between Walter and Hill at this point, together with a slightly off-color *double entendre* by Walter, making it evident that he had recognized Hill's object as the wire suspension from a pad of toilet paper. The record gives this in full; and after some chatting with Mrs. Richardson about the circumstances of his world and about Mark and John,] Walter then recognized in the basket a package of paper matches put in by Ekland. Mrs. Richardson put something in, and Walter described it as a hankerchief rolled up and with a knot in the end, which was correct.

April 23rd, 24th: See my full records, pp. 402-3, 406-7, respectively. Careful appraisal of these records makes it appear to the candid critic that while Walter made quite a go out of the identification of the various objects offered him on these occasions, his efforts to attribute them to their several owners exhibit certainly the results of normal suggestion, if not of conscious normal inference. Perhaps the correct viewpoint here is that, in the obvious presence of a necessity for the exercise of a different type of supernormal cognition, it becomes more difficult to exclude normal working of the medium's or of Walter's mind. We are familiar with analogous situations in the ordinary types of clairvoyance and psychometry, and understand thoroughly that in direct proportion as the medium's normal mental processes are prevented from interfering with the psychic ones, the success of the latter increases. I think this comment should be read into pp. 440-1 of Dudley's Chapter XXXIX. And in this same connection, I should like to point out that after Dudley has contributed a plurality of curious "feminine appurtenances" of his own invention, there is a temptation to normal inference that he is the owner of any out-of-the-ordinary object of the sort that turns up in the basket when he is present.

---

*Where Hill customarily went of an evening.—J. M. B.*
April 29th: Walter next asked Dr. and Mrs. Tillyard each to put something personal in the basket. This was done; and Walter promptly threw them out and named them as a brooch, and a pair of tweezers in a cloth case. These identifications were perfect.\footnote{Cf. Tillyard's record, pp. 484 ff.}

In addition to the above episodes, the period covered by these citations saw also the identifications given in the detailed records of Chapter XXXIV. I ought also to point out that, as implied by several of the above entries, a procedure gradually grew up during this period under which the objects for identification were collected in one of the luminously marked baskets, by Crandon or some other sitter (more usually some other), and placed in the cabinet in this basket. The collection was usually taken in such a way that the sitter handling the basket would be aware only by accident of the nature of each individual's contribution; but of course, equally he would, except by accident, be aware of who had and who had not contributed.

The recording, it will be observed, is quite spotty. Sometimes the nature of the articles involved is specified, sometimes not; sometimes the contributors are named, sometimes not. There is, of course, no more reason why we should attempt a complete and detailed account of all the episodes under this head than all those under any other. And I think I may very well take advantage of Dudley's offer to assume the burden of describing such identifications as, in his more frequent presence, have occurred in such a way as to impress him and lead him to his independent recording.
CHAPTER XXXIX

Walter’s Cognitions During the Summer and Fall of 1926

By E. E. Dudley

Among the varied phenomena of Margery’s séance room there is one group that presents many interesting problems: the cognition of personal objects in complete darkness. All sorts of opportunities arise for statements by Walter revolving about the use, the associations and the ownership of the articles as well as about their mere names. Frequently some or all these elements are unknown to some or all of the sitters. Walter shows an ability to identify articles with good speed, and to deal rather well with questions of form, color, texture, odor and special uses. The character of the control, whether personal or mechanical, seems to affect the results not at all.

Walter always gives his descriptions of the articles vocally. Of course to say that this voice is independent when the VCO machine is not in use at the moment may lay one open to criticism. However, the Walter voice shows no perceptible change in any of its qualities under this control, and for this reason I assume the propriety of calling the vocal effect independent in all cases. There is usually good indication that the article under identification has been levitated or otherwise manipulated in a fashion clearly supernormal.

I propose no very serious attempts at interpretation, but merely an intelligent cataloguing of certain incidents occurring, for the better part, in my presence. On June 3rd, 1926, the basket collection was taken up by Wiggin, and he put the basket containing the articles in the cabinet, on the floor, whence as determined by the sound it was promptly levitated. This sound indicating the levitation of the basket with its articles is a regular feature of the identification performance, and may be assumed always to have occurred unless this is specifically denied.

Walter spoke up promptly: “Sairy, this is a bad place for pearls; better take them before I drop them.” Mrs. Litzelmann’s pearls were removed by Wiggin and restored to her. “Here is a loose-leaf note-book; I think it belongs to Conant.” Conant acknowledged this and asked how many rings there were on it. Walter: “Let’s see: one, two, three, four, five, six. Six rings and two hinges. Is that right?”

437
Conant had to admit that he didn’t know; subsequent check showed that Walter’s count was correct. He named the next object as a mirror, going on: “I’ll have to take a look at myself.” He was asked who had put it in. “I don’t know; can’t get a single vibration out of it. But if I were to guess, I’d say Miss Off.” This was correct. “A pencil; I’m going to draw a picture of the bride in Conant’s book. I’ll draw another of Gerke.” There were sounds of rustling paper, but later examination disclosed no pictures or other marks recognized by Conant as extraneous. Both Miss Off and Mrs. Wiggin admitted having put in pencils. Walter then announced a hairpin as belonging to Mrs. Gerke (the bride) and a match contributed by Wiggin; both these were correct.

All identifications here were correct; most of the owners were given correctly though Walter admitted one of these was a guess. That he could get no vibrations from the mirror may well be a most significant statement. Only six of the sitters contributed anything, and all contributions were dealt with.

On June 6th there was another instance of identification of an owner in which the facts were not in accord with the probabilities. After Overstreet had passed the basket around and Walter had received this, he said almost at once: “Somebody is reckless, putting glasses in here.” Stewart admitted having done so and they were returned to him, normally. A few seconds later the basket was again levitated, and Walter said: “Dudley, what’s the idea of carrying a thimble around with you?” This attribution was correct. He threw the thimble to the floor, and went on to identify a package of cigarettes, a fountain pen, money and other small articles. There were two ladies present, the thimble was the second article identified and neither lady had been excluded by the preceding identification, the thimble had been in my pocket no more than two hours, and it had been shown to no one present. Certainly I was far from the most probable contributor for this article.

The sitting of June 8, 1926, was marked by a unique identification which may shed some light upon the form of the teleplasmic terminals and the extent of Walter’s powers of perception. After the basket had been passed around by Manney, Walter proceeded to the cognition of personal articles in the usual manner. He identified a handkerchief saying: “A handkerchief; I am putting it out through the right-hand hole. It is a lady’s handkerchief.” (Checked later) Pro-
ceeding, he said: "Someone is getting reckless, putting a watch in the basket! Wait: I am not so sure this is a watch. It looks like a watch but I can't find any place to wind it. . . . No, it isn't a watch, but what is it? Somebody knows how to keep quiet; I don't hear a word! Now just wait a minute. . . . Ha, ha! a compass and it is all lighted up. See it?" At this point the compass was held up so that all the circle could see the luminous dial and luminous needle. It was closed when put in the basket and was still closed when the basket was returned after the remaining articles, four in number, had been identified. When asked why he didn't name the owner of the compass he replied, "I was too busy trying to find out what it was."

A test of the pressure required to release the catch holding the cover closed, shows a minimum of 18 ounces and a little experimenting should convince anyone that a fairly good imitation of a hand is almost a necessity in manipulating the compass as described.

At the following sitting, on June 11, as soon as the new sitters had been introduced Walter said to me correctly: "Hello, Mr. Compass. You pick the darndest things to put in the basket." The "collection basket" as he calls it, was passed by Twachtman. Walter first described a bracelet as made up of "two wires with blue stones in it. Lapis— what's the rest of it?" "It belongs to Mrs. Good-enough." (Correct) Then he said: "Here's a comb, I hope there are no bugs in it!" Silence for a time, then, "Maybe it isn't a comb. . . . Let's see. . . . Somebody's got a broad smile on!" Well, we will pass that up for now. Here's a ring with a stone in it." He then discovered a coin, a Canadian five cent piece, he called it, and attributed it to Arkin, who agreed; but later we found that the coin was an obsolete United States silver five cent piece. Suddenly, Walter broke out with the question: "Dudley, what did you put your rule in for?" This was correct. It was a 6-inch wooden scale and its deep graduations did feel somewhat like the teeth of a comb.

Walter asked Twachtman if he had anything in the basket and, upon being told that there was something more, asked to have the other articles removed and the basket returned to the cabinet. In about ten seconds he said: "Here, Twachtman, take the basket (it was held out at a convenient height), you will find your tie clasp snapped into the side of the basket." This was confirmed by Twachtman who said that it was loose in the basket when the latter was last returned to the cabinet.
Walter identified the construction of the bracelet, the color of the stones, but could not get the whole name, lapis lazuli, although, as was shown after the sitting, this name was perfectly well known to Margery. The problem of the scale was solved after some study but he did not say who was smiling. Those in constant touch with Walter will remember how frequently he does designate the guilty person. The statement of ownership might be a guess but this would not square with the accuracy of many earlier tests.

At the séance of June 15, there was an interesting minor error of identification—interesting, because almost anyone, possessed of his normal powers of perception, would have made the correct statement. At this séance, after the identification of the first four items in the "collection," Walter said: "Here is a metal piece that isn’t money. *Aluminum or lead.* A check; like a coat or baggage check. It is covered all over with words. It is not money; it may take the place of it." This was especially good as the article was an aluminum token to be used as payment for a return trip on the ‘bus’ line which issued it. The particularly interesting feature is the failure to differentiate between *aluminum and lead.* On the other hand he gave a very good description of the token as to form, lettering and approximate use.

In pursuance of the plan of these tests I present one which provides further evidence as to the form of the terminal or terminals used in these cognitions and also gives an indication of the rapidity and accuracy of his manipulation of these articles. It occurred on June 18th. The basket was in charge of Pierson who put in three wooden letters which were properly named and thrown out by Walter. He described the subsequent "collection" as a handkerchief (Mrs. Twachtman), "a whole pocket-book," "keys in a leather case" (Russell), "a bill case" and "something like a barrette" (a collar clasp). Apparently the name "barrette" was not known to Walter prior to the sitting of April 24th, for at that time he asked the name of the "article" which he had described. In about five seconds he added: "Here is a celluloid box—here is the cover. (Heard to strike the floor). And here is the rest of it. (Remainder of box goes to floor.) There is a piece of chalk in it. I am going to break it in two pieces. (Two pieces hit the floor and roll about." Dudley, I don’t see where you get all these female appurtenances, anyway!"

To understand the value of this test one must know more of the
box. It is about $\frac{5}{8}$ inch wide by $\frac{1}{2}$ inch deep and $2\frac{3}{8}$ inches long, with a tightly fitting cover, the edge of which is flush with the bottom of the box. There are two small, curved finger cut-outs, $\frac{3}{8}$ inch long by $\frac{1}{8}$ inch high, in the lower edge of this cover; the finger and thumb of one hand must be fitted into these cut-outs before the cover can be removed with the other hand. After trying this test on several quick-witted ladies I found that, with eyes closed, they took from 4 to 5 times as long to open the box as Walter required. I also found that most women thought that the "chalk" was a lip-stick. Lip-sticks were not in common use at the time Walter Stinson lived here. As a matter of fact it was a stick of polishing rouge for the nails. The question still remains; why should Walter think that chalk was a "female appurtenance?" If it was more than a casual guess it seems to call for a causal explanation. In any case the box is so difficult to open that we are almost forced to conclude that Walter used the equivalent of two hands and that these hands had fingers which were at least as well developed as some which have been seen over the luminous plaque and luminous cross-section board.

At the sitting of June 22nd, Walter identified first, among a number of articles, "a whole pocket-book which some trusting soul has put in the basket," and continued: "Let's see what's in it. Shall I tell what is in it?" The lady who owned it assenting, he said, "There is a tin box with some flour in it. Someone must be going to do some cooking." The description was correct. But why flour rather than powder?

At the sitting of November 4th (1926, as throughout the present chapter), Walter added an interesting feature by inserting some unexpected evidence of his own. The "collection" was taken, and Walter promptly announced a watch which, he said, was put in by Samuels. (Wrong. It was Thwaites.) He then said: "It is a hunting-case watch. Hear the cover? (Sound of cover being snapped shut several times.) You ought to have your crystal fixed. It is broken or something." Thwaites explained that the cover had been cut out to take the crystal and the inner bezel was empty. Walter then identified a locket "a case—a plush case, such as medals are put in; it's got glass on one side. A daguerreotype?" He began by assuming that it belonged to Samuels and no one corrected him although Samuels did not admit ownership. After he had spoken of a possible daguerreotype he wanted to know who put it in the basket. Mrs. Richardson admitted having done so. If telepathy is to be
stressed, we must note that she has been a regular member of the circle since June, 1923, and yet Walter did not "guess" that she had contributed the plush case.

Walter now handed the basket to Thwaites, who removed his watch and, after putting it to his ear, replaced it in his pocket. The other articles were distributed and the VCO was put into place. After the floats had been unbalanced Walter said: "Colonel, when you look at your watch you will find that the hands have been changed. I changed them from your time to my time, to fourth dimensional time."

Up to this point there was no indication that this was other than the usual type of Walter cognition test. This additional information was announced by Walter, in independent voice and under test conditions. A subsequent inspection by Thwaites and the writer showed that the watch had been set back 20 minutes. This was almost certainly a two-handed job.

There are many other instances which demonstrate Walter's ability in this game of cognitions and testify to his quickness, accuracy and versatility. One more may be mentioned, very briefly. At a sitting held November 16th, the writer found a peculiarly shaped metal device on the floor of the séance-room and put it in his pocket. Later, when the collection was being taken, he dropped it in the basket. After Walter had identified the other articles he said: "Dudley, did you put in anything?" Dudley: "Yes." A slight delay while a necktie was being removed by its owner and then Walter said, "Ha! this is a pipe cap. It belongs to Prof. Adamson (?) who was here last week." As a matter of fact I did not know what it was and put it in the basket with the expectation that Walter might not be able to tell anything about it.

It is important to note that, as a general rule, articles are placed in the "collection basket" without making any sound which might disclose their identity. Also, that those who are familiar with this work refrain from giving any indication that they have made contributions. The writer and many others have been careful to keep these test articles out of sight and to say nothing about them until Walter has made the identification. The sole exception to this rule, if it may be called an exception, occurred in the first portion of the cognition tests of April 24, 1926, and in that case no one but Mr. Bird could have known about the barrette. It is obvious that articles of personal adornment may not properly be classed as completely
evidential under a non-telepathic heading; but they have some evidential value if they are placed in the basket without any accompanying comment or sound. Such conditions would increase the difficulty of a normal cognition but there have been so many indications that Walter can, under favorable conditions, perceive the sitters and their clothing, even in complete darkness, that it seems unwise to assume that he has no knowledge of the articles so presented.

For a further discussion of the classification of these identification acts and of their philosophy, the reader is referred to Crandon's admirable summary, in the A.S.P.R. Journal for June, 1926. This article should be regarded as an important contribution to the history of the mediumship, and, like so much of the other literature cited in the present volume, should be read into this record.
CHAPTER XL

Vagrant Sittings in the Old Cabinet

By the Editor

From the moment when the glass cabinet was first introduced, it became the very definite custom to use it for at least the opening part of all s\'ances, with a few well-recognized exceptions. One instance of these is the series\(^1\) of sittings in the old cabinet aimed at the rehabilitation of the scales; and similar series aimed at other specific ends for which the immediate control of the moment was not the immediate issue were also held partly or wholly in the old cabinet. Likewise, when Crandon and one or two old friends like Adler would go into s\'ance for conference with Walter, the glass cabinet was unnecessary and was ignored. Finally, once in a while, when sitting just for the sake of sitting and with no definite goal in view, it would occasionally be the consensus of opinion among those present that the glass cabinet was too much bother. The present chapter is for the purpose of completing the record by reading into it the phenomena of several of these more or less nondescript sittings, in the old cabinet.

On December 22nd, 1925, Walter had an appointment with the two young men from "Tech.," Conant and Gerke; and he had said that it was to be an entirely friendly, chatty affair—"a joke night" was in fact his expression. So the old cabinet was used to save trouble. Walter, coming through promptly, said he was alone and his forces were low. In addition to the presents for the two special invitees,\(^2\) which obviously did not in any way tend to relieve the occasion of the label put on it by Walter himself, there was levitation of doughnut and coin, under conditions of strict double control.

On January 1st, 1926, the record tells us that "Walter was all set for the glass cabinet, but said he would see what he could do in the old one." It does not appear at whose motion the change of plan was made. The action included levitation of megaphone and basket, with touches. "Practically always, when any phenomena were going on, Weston's left hand held the Psychic's right and both of Crandon's." The

---

1 Chapter XXXVI.
2 Page 68.
VAGRANT SITTINGS IN OLD CABINET

Psychic went into trance for practically the whole séance; this unaccustomed condition for phenomena in the old cabinet was attributed to the presence of the several strange sitters.

February 6th saw what appears to have been a sociable evening in honor of Holmes. The Psychic and Crandon wore luminous controls on ankles and wrists, and she had a luminous headband. Catamenia was present, and perhaps afforded the reason for sitting under the less formal conditions. There were identifications, activation of the luminous paint, and excellent levitations of doughnuts and megaphone. These "were put on the table by Mrs. Baker, who saw that there were no strings attached to them."

On March 5th, for no reason indicated, the old cabinet was used. Trance came on almost immediately, being again blamed on the strange sitter. There was bell-box action, after which:

The rest of the sitting consisted in efforts to develop a rod which could be seen over against the luminous plaque. This was shown three or four times, but only as a small tip, the Psychic's forces being apparently low. [No physiological reason for this is mentioned.]

A very successful séance in the old cabinet fell on May 16th. After the routine display of bell-box and scale described in the chapters devoted to these, the record goes on:

A white handkerchief, with luminous paint in spots on it, was put on the table, and Walter proceeded to do some of the best levitations he has ever shown with it. Murray held the Psychic's left hand; Mrs. Brown held her right hand and Crandon's two hands throughout. Walter passed the luminous handkerchief down under the table, and out and up the far side of the table, making a complete circle. This would seem to require two terminals to do it, or else one terminal must have passed through the substance of the table. Next a luminous doughnut was put on the table with the handkerchief, and Walter shortly passed the latter through the former, and then repeated all the levitations, whirling the mass completely around Murray's neck, then completely around the Psychic's head, then up 5½ feet, and then out towards the other side of the circle 5 feet. An imp with mischief seemed to accelerate the glowing mass as it shot around with incredible rapidity.

3 See pages 434, 392.
4 See page 414.
He next did some stunts showing the luminous handkerchief and doughnut to one sitter at a time, and then making it wholly invisible. It seems likely that he used the megaphone for this purpose, though the technique must have been difficult, and must, according to our understanding, have required the use of two terminals. The Psychic was never in trance.

Extremely important observations were made concerning the voice during this séance. The Psychic, during the sitting, ate three peppermint lozenges, and as she talked, we could tell that one was constantly in her mouth. Nevertheless, Walter talked and whistled with his usual freedom throughout the sitting. At one time, the Psychic indulged in a long yawn, and in the very middle of it Walter gave a long whistle. This again proved a complete physiological independence in Walter's voice.

The séance of July 15th, as indicated elsewhere, was not held in the séance room at all, but down stairs, in the room where I ordinarily sleep while stopping in Lime Street. The action and the collateral statements of the record are of extremely miscellaneous character, and I dispose of them here for want of a better place to put them. According to the record:

Walter came through almost at once, the voice seeming to be about a foot above and one foot behind Crandon's head. Previous to the sitting, the Psychic had gone into the regular séance room to get the bell-box, and there she had been faced by a bright white light, six inches in diameter, so she reported. Walter now said that this was part of his apparatus. He kept us going for an hour with merry wit and jest. He rang the bell-box intermittently while the two strangers each lugged it about the room. He then made a light about two feet high which wandered all about the circle and made tangible contact with every sitter. During the most of the phenomena, double control by personal contact was in effect.

The voice machine was now used and worked perfectly with double control.

Matienza now reported that Walter was pulling at his watch chain, and shortly after that his watch, chain, and pen-knife on the other end of it were taken from his waistcoat pocket and put on the table very gently where all could hear it tick. Next it was put with similar gentleness on the floor, and Walter said he thought he would not pick it up from the floor because it might slip and break.
CHAPTER XLI

Paraffin Gloves under the Co-mediumship of Dr. Hardwicke

By the Editor, and from the Records

Nobody will accuse Dingwall, either on his showing in the Margery case or as a matter of more general principle, of being a lenient critic. Surely if he has a fault as a psychical researcher, it is that of giving undue weight to factors adverse to the medium and too little weight to those of a favorable trend. Yet I am betraying no confidence when I say that, in conversation with me, he has agreed that one factor alone in Margery’s history is of such enormous weight, affirmatively, as to make a definite adverse judgment quite out of the question until this factor has been completely eliminated. The factor in question, curiously enough, is not a physical but rather a human one. It may be briefly set forth, as follows:

Time and time again, some person (ordinarily but not invariably a man) of unimpeachable antecedents and conspicuous position and no prior connection with the mediumship or with the Crandons themselves, has been brought into their séance room by some chain of circumstances; and has immediately become the center of old or new phenomena in a fashion which can be fitted into the hypothesis of fraud only by assigning him the perfectly definite role of wilful accomplice. This, of course, may happen once, or even twice, and be regarded with a certain degree of equanimity. Bank cashiers and ministers, doctors and lawyers, men from all walks of life with previously impeccable records, do every once in so often go wrong and commit robbery or arson or murder under a temptation which happens to steal upon them from a weak side. By the same token, when hundreds of respectable citizens are exposed to the works of a female medium who is alleged to be a trickster and admitted to be too attractive for her own best good, it is not at all out of the human average to picture a certain percentage as affected to the point where they are willing to participate in fraud. But:

Starting with my own first exposure to the mediumship in late 1923, and running right down to the present date, the Margery séance room has again and again and again been the scene of some-
thing which the impervious skeptic can only regard as a fresh outbreak of confederacy from a new and unexpected and eminently respectable source. It is a colossal problem in psychology to say why exposure to the wiles of this one woman so universally corrupts the incorruptible. It is equally a colossal problem to explain just how confederacy has been initiated with such an endless series of strangers, with no single failure to function. Does the lady herself make the advances, or does the new sitter who aspires to an active rôle have to put out the first feelers himself? How does it happen that no single person,\(^1\) having rejected her advances or suffered her rebuff or seen himself supplanted by a newer and more favored aide, has ever "spilled the beans" to the extent of telling us what he did and how he did it and how he was persuaded to do it, or of giving evidence equally damaging in some slightly different direction? Infatuation for the Psychic is given as the motive leading all these confederates into the game; how then does she maintain this elaborate organization free from any disruptive outbreak of jealousy on the part of any of its members? And above all, aside from these operating difficulties, we must deal with the question of averages and probabilities.

If one cashier of a given bank defaults, that is accepted as something that is bound to occur, in the long run. If his successor defaults, that may be a coincidence. But if over a period of years, incumbent after incumbent of this position in this bank is prosecuted and convicted as a defaulter, we shall look for the explanation somewhere else than in the law of averages. Is it not possible that there is a defaulting president who is clever enough to make these others his "goats?" Is there not some other explanation that possesses the inherent mathematical probability which we must deny to the one that appears on the face? And in the same way, is it not evident that there comes a point in Margery's history when we must stop generalizing about her charms, stop generalizing about the human weakness that makes it so easy for her to develop confederacy among her sitters; and ask whether the thing has not gone to a point where the more probable explanation of this long history of alleged confederacy from respectable sources is to be found in some other direction? It passes the limits of easy belief that so many people of good repute and a fair degree of fame should, on first exposure to Margery's phenomena, develop a willingness to aid her and find a means for doing so. Whether

\(^1\) I exclude Code's story as patently unworthy of credence.
one choose to look at it from the human side or from the severely mathematical one dictated by the law of averages, in order to support the belief that Margery's phenomena are a monumental fake we must credit the incredible about her sitters.

As I have indicated above, my own confederacy would come first on the list historically, and perhaps also first in point of intrinsic importance. A great deal occurred during the *Scientific American* examination of the mediumship which even Houdini could explain away only on the allegation that I had falsified the record in his absence and played the part of active accomplice in his presence. The same charges have to be leveled against Carrington. They have to be leveled against Richardson. It is not an entirely negligible factor that they have to be leveled against Crandon; for though he is the medium's husband, there must exist a very appreciable possibility that he would not thus coöperate in fraud, even with his own wife. Careful examination of the circumstances under which Messrs. Goodall, Murray, Litzelmann and De Wyckoff have sat will easily add them to the list of essential confederates. In the case of De Wyckoff, his wife's knowledge and consent would seem necessary; and the same necessity applies in only less obvious degree to Mrs. Bird—she will testify that Houdini realized, and was puzzled by, this. A few other names would have to be added to the list of accomplices of 1923–24—notably those of Messrs. Adler and Cross; but with them as with Goodall, Murray and Litzelmann, old acquaintance with the Crandons robs the allegation of some of its inherent un-plausibility.

It is, in fact, not until we come into 1925 that we find any conspicuous case to add to that of Carrington and myself—any instance of a person of professional standing and general repute, a total stranger to the Crandons, against whom must be levied the charge that his appearance in the séance room has initiated an immediate and active confederacy. The second such instance would involve Hill. The first such instance, and the one about which this chapter revolves, deals with a gentleman who is a physician of high standing in the city of his residence, and who has professional connections outside the field of routine practice. When this chapter and the following one were first compiled and put into type, he felt that these connections would be prejudiced if his part in the mediumship became generally known; so I employed for him the pseudonym "Jones."

1a See open reference No. 28, Vol. 2.
But the unexpectedly long interval which has elapsed between the preliminary stages of compilation of the present volume and the final ones of publication has modified the situation which previously existed, and made it now permissible to identify him as Dr. Henry Hardwicke, of Niagara Falls; and to point out that while no further account of his presence in Lime Street will occur in this volume, he constitutes one of the focal points of the story which Richardson tells in the A.S.P.R. Journal, starting in May, 1928. In the interests of economy, having made this explanation and identification, I allow the name to stand as "Jones" in the text of these two chapters.

He sat for the first time on October 16th, 1925, and I have held out his three sittings at that time for description here in topical rather than chronological sequence. On the first date the bell-box was rung and the luminous basket was levitated; and the Richardson voice machine was used with brilliant effect—all this, despite the fact that the Psychic was, as Crandon uncryptically puts it in his memorandum of the séance, "not feeling well in several respects." On the following evening, Jones was again present, and again with his wife. He had never met either of the Crandons prior to these dates. This séance was carried through, more or less against Crandon's better judgment and despite the fact that the Psychic's physical condition was unfavorable to sitting. I quote Crandon's record:

Walter came through with pleasant greeting for everyone, and ordered the bell-box removed from the table. Shortly after this, when various members of the circle spoke to Jones, he did not reply; the Psychic reported that she thought he was unconscious (he was at her immediate left in the circle). This was confirmed then by his falling forward on the table; and there he lay for half an hour, partly supported by the sitters on each side, and apparently in deep trance. After about twenty minutes, Walter ordered the light on for two seconds. This was done; and we beheld a teleplasmic hand and half of a forearm lying on the table in front of and in contact with the vertex of Jones's head. We were given no further view of it; but he remained in trance nearly half an hour longer, and we were told by Walter to leave the room immediately at the close of the sitting at 10:30.

This was the first time that Jones had ever been seized or had acted as a medium. The production of this hand was amazing to us all. Every hand in the room was obviously accounted for.

2 In Lime Street; see p. 84 for his first contact with Margery.—J. M. B.
At the end of the sitting Jones was covered with perspiration and rather shaken in spirit, and complained of ache in his right ear.

Oral report by Crandon and others of those present adds a little to this. At one time early in the séance Walter referred to the fact that "The Kid" was ill and that little or nothing could be expected. On instructing that the light be turned on, he made it plain that Jones was the center of visual interest, his words being approximately: "Turn on the light and look at Jones; this is going to be good." A little later he remarked, with a chuckle, that when he couldn't get "it" (the teleplasm) from one place, he got it from another. All this, with Jones's trance, is of importance mainly as indicating consciousness by Walter of Jones part in the proceedings, and absence of any possibility that Jones was an innocent bystander, used as a foil by the medium without his knowledge. His own testimony with regard to the reality of the trance will be inserted at the proper point. For the present, we have only to give the record for the next night, October 18th:

Walter came through in about ten minutes and said practically nothing except "Be quiet, please." Directly after this Jones was taken again in trance, but seemed, however, not to be so deep as last night and, from time to time, during a full hour and ten minutes he would occasionally talk to Dudley or Crandon. Apparently a different voice spoke through him twice, but we could not identify the communicator. Then Walter allowed two seconds of red light and we all beheld a sheet of perfectly white teleplasm more or less rectilinear in shape over the skull and face of Jones as he lay on the table. No other view was given, but after this Jones began to complain of his right ear as of pain, and told Crandon that something felt like blood pouring out of it. Then he said, "He has taken enough teleplasm out of me to make a horse. It is piling up on the table. Go to it Walter, I'm game." Shortly after this, every sitter first and last was touched in face or on head with what appeared to be feathers or tail-like ends of bits of plush. Hamilton was touched fourteen times, Dr. Brown six times, Crandon eleven times and the touches went even to the extreme end of the circle fully six feet from either medium. The general opinion seemed to be that the thing was a bird-like materialization. After due time was given, perhaps five minutes, for this materialization to be reabsorbed, the sitting closed.
Following this séance, Jones was not again present in Lime Street until April 30th, 1926. In this interval, and right on the heels of the séances just described, there fell the inception of the glass-cabinet developments and the course of preliminary experimenting in search of definitive procedures for sitting with this apparatus. While this was going on Walter gave no spontaneous display of teleplasm and the sitters were little interested in that aspect. But on three widely separated dates there arose good reason for showing the teleplasm to certain particular sitters: to Walton and the Eddys on December 19th, 1925; to the Baltimore Commission on January 28th, 1926; and to Holmes on March 6th. The record for the second of these dates has been given; those for the two others are here inserted, this being the place where they are in best continuity with the rest of the story.

Sitting of December 19th, 1925, at 10 Lime Street. Present, to left: S. Eddy, Walton, G. Eddy, B. Eddy, Crandon. As the Psychic sat in the cabinet, she threw her head forward in her hands as though already very sleepy. Her hands were very cold. Trance came on immediately and Walter made no other sign or sound. After about nine minutes Walter began talking, greeting everybody and was in a fairly earnest mood. He asked the sitters if they understood the ethics of the séance room, especially that no psychic structure is to be touched without Walter's permission. They understood and agreed. After three minutes more Walter directed the red light to be turned on for one second and we beheld a crude and rudimentary white left hand on the table, connected with the Psychic's body by a cord. During the two hours that followed we had about twenty exposures of this structure, which varied in size, shape and got slightly darker in color as the evening went on. Just before this structure appeared Walton declared himself to be touched on his right hand. From time to time one sitter was allowed by Walter to handle the structure and each did, feeling apparently no bone-like structures in the fingers or in the palm, but as they reached the wrist they all agreed that it felt as if it contained a bone-shaped core, highly resilient like the bone of the fetus.

After a period of this examination the bell-box was put on the table and Walter then showed us the visible teleplasmic hand ringing the bell-box the number of times requested as by S. Eddy and later by B. Eddy, and later by Walton. While this ringing was going on, at one time S. Eddy and another time Walton were allowed to hold the wrist and we could see that the ringing was

---

3 Page 376.
not done by a pull down in the direction of the cord, but that the cord or wrist firmly held the hand itself, humped itself and the fingers rang the box. Then the hand was placed on the combined hands of S. Eddy and the Psychic and Walter said "I will now ring the box in the air with the force from that hand." Thereupon B. Eddy picked up the bell-box and it began to ring intermittently and did so continually as he turned 360 degrees and until he put it down, the phenomena beginning and ending in the same period of red light. As he turned and the box came between his eye and the light, he was able to look under the flap and see that there was no mechanism.

The next phenomenon used the luminous basket. The hand was seen holding on the handle. The hand was then seen in the dark to put the luminous doughnut in the basket. The hand then was seen in the red light bearing west on the handle and S. Eddy pulled east on the handle. The pull was estimated at three pounds and was in a direction at right angles to the Psychic.

Shortly after this S. Eddy got a violent slap in the face. It sounded like a boxing glove hitting him but he stood it like a good sport. The hand was seen several times to pick up the doughnut and crumple it and wave it about.

The Psychic’s hands and Crandon’s hands were visible, of course, during the red light periods and well controlled during the dark periods. It was always known where the Psychic’s feet were. The trance was uneasy with groans as if in labor. As the sitting went on Walter got more cheery and talked and whistled freely.

The luminous plaque was put on the table and there Walter deposited the same left hand of which we had seen so much, moved it to any place that B. Eddy requested, and gave its complete silhouette on the plaque. Finally towards the end of the sitting it assumed a rectangular form with buds or protuberances seen, enough like a hand made into a fist. This was gradually withdrawn and the sitting closed at 11 P.M., with no trace of the structure to be seen.

Those who felt the hand declared it to be apparently a left hand; that it was cool or even cold, getting colder as the night went on, resilient like rubber, having no fingernails but evident grisly bones. The cord was described as one to one-quarter inches in diameter and the end of the hand began as an angular joint. There was no pulse in the cord, but it felt vibrant as though alive.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, March 6th, 1926. In the old cabinet. Present, to left: Holmes, Mrs. Dennett, Dudley, Dennett, Mrs.
Baker, Crandon. Mrs. Stinson was in the background. Trance came on almost immediately. The Psychic wore five luminous markers and had been searched by Mrs. Baker before the sitting and had been conducted by her with hand control into the séance room. She had on bathrobe, stockings and shoes.

Walter came through in cheerful mood and greeted everyone. He said there should really be no sitting tonight because of the Psychic being tired and there having been a lot of irritating publicity in the newspapers during the week. The Psychic's left leg went into Holmes' lap shortly and after about fifteen minutes, filled with story telling and general conversation, a solid object was seen to flop on the table, partly obscuring a luminous doughnut there. This was shortly shoved across and showed a complete crude hand over the doughnut; it seemed small because of the vertical silhouetting. On request this hand was put over on Holmes' hand and later in the evening it was put on the back of his head when he laid his face down on the table. When on the back of his head, Holmes said it was big enough to cover the whole of the back of his head. In other words, it was much larger than a hand. He described it as feeling cool and like a fairly solid jelly, not wet, no odor.

The terminal was now shown in full lying on the luminous plaque and while there was seen to move as a hand. It repeatedly struck Holmes' arm and hand and he was at least four times allowed to feel of it with his fingers. Finally red light was allowed and we saw on the table a thin, crude, five-fingered right-hand. From the wrist there was a cord like an umbilical cord, though flattened, which extended down between the thighs of the Psychic, both of whose feet were now in Holmes' lap, and thence extended upwards.

Everything that Holmes asked for in the way of control, exhibition of the terminal and action by the terminal in the way of telekenesis, was carried out. Among other things Walter showed us the hand ringing the bell-box, not in red light but with the mass to be seen over the luminous spot on the bell-box flapper. Another exhibit was when on request he made the hand completely eclipse the doughnut which is four inches in diameter. The hand also went through the form of handshake with one of Holmes' fingers.

By engagement of several weeks standing, Jones was to be present from April 30th until May 3d, 1926. By great good fortune there was also present on May 1st, a gentleman who has come to play a part in
the Margery case quite as active as Jones's, though of a different sort; this will be described in Chapter XLIII. For the present, he need merely be visualized as an observer of more than the average scientific training and competence, and more than the average of demonstrable detachment from the Crandons. I refer, of course, to Tillyard.

There had arisen a definite project to try, in Jones' presence, for paraffin gloves. No move in this direction had ever been made in Lime Street since the more or less abortive sitting of May 17th, 1924. Whether the return to this theme in Jones' presence was provoked in the first instance by Crandon or by Walter I cannot say, and I doubt that Crandon's own memory is clear on the subject at this date. But there had grown up a definite agreement by Walter to try the paraffin again at this time, and more or less of a promise that he would make good. Of course, both in his and in Crandon's mind, the renewal of this experiment was associated with the idea that there was present, with Jones, a teleplasmic structure that was in some way more responsive to the paraffin treatment that Margery's own teleplasm. But that the latter was visualized as playing a by no means negligible part in the performance will be clear from the fact that Walter indulged in a good deal of preliminary warming-up with the paraffin bucket, starting as early as April 20th. On this date, the paraffin was offered him in a metal pail, which pleased him none too well; in addition, the cameras were not ready, as they ordinarily are when teleplasmic programs of any sort are under way. So he side-stepped the paraffin and gave an ordinary telekinetic show instead. The practice with the paraffin actually came off a few days later, as the two records which now ensue will make clear:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, April 26th, 1926, in the old cabinet. To left: Richardson, Hill, Mrs. Richardson, Crandon, the Psychic. Conant for photographs, and Mrs. Stinson in the background.

Under instructions previously given by Walter, three inches of melted paraffin was floating on top of seven inches of water, all at 212 degrees at the time it left the stove downstairs. It was in a papier mache pail, Walter having forbidden a metal pail. It was first put on a stool about six inches from the floor in front of the medium, but was later transferred to the floor under directions.

Walter came through shortly and seemed to be in good form. We soon heard him dabbling about in the pail, and then he called for a pail of cold water to be put alongside of it.

4 M. M., Chapter XLI.
The medium was searched by Mrs. Richardson before the séance and was clad in kimono and stockings only. Walter said this was still an experimental meeting, and later said that he doubted if the pictures would be first-class. From time to time each sitter was touched apparently with a shell of hard paraffin, Richardson and Crandon being particularly favored. The victrola acted badly and Crandon had frequently to leave the circle to wind it. At such times the Psychic was entirely under control of Dr. and Mrs. Richardson.

Two photographs were taken at the moment Walter directed, one of them after a very brief flash of red light. At this flash we saw something cruelly like a hand hanging in the pail on the edge nearest the Psychic. After each flash the Psychic’s whole kimono and the white stretcher in the pail remained luminous for a half minute or more.

The victrola finally gave out altogether, and at about 10:30 Walter insisted that this same group gather tomorrow night to continue the experiment.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, April 27th, 1926, in the old cabinet. Present to left: Richardson, Hill, Mrs. Richardson, Crandon, and the Psychic. Conant and Mrs. Stinson in the background. The Psychic was clad as usual, having been examined by Mrs. Richardson before the sitting. She was also examined after the sitting with negative results.

Walter came through shortly and commented on the new electric victrola, saying that we should not be too sure that our troubles with it, caused by him, were over. In front of the Psychic was a pail full of water and paraffin and beside that a pail of cold water. From time to time we could hear the terminal flopping about in the paraffin. After a while there were frequent touches of Richardson’s hand and of Crandon’s head by Walter’s terminal covered with paraffin. After a while we were allowed to see, apparently floating on the paraffin, a long yellowish hook-shaped body. Later Walter’s terminal, covered with paraffin in the form of a hand was seen in red light resting first in the hand of Richardson, and later in that of Mrs. Richardson. It was also deposited in the dark in Hill’s hand. It was either a solid cast of a hand, or it was a paraffin glove still containing Walter’s terminal. It seemed to gain in weight each successive touch that it touched Richardson, which makes him think that the shell was thickened by a new dip again and again. There were two periods of red light in which we were allowed to see the hand lying in that of Richardson and Mrs. Richardson. Paraffin was dropped and
PLATE 34. PLASTER CAST, STRIPPED FREE OF PARAFFIN, IDENTIFIED BY DR. CRANDON AS THE FIRST SHELL MADE ON APRIL 30, 1926 (SEE P. 457). THE RECORD WAS WRONG; THERE WERE ACTUALLY TWO RIGHTS, APPARENTLY IDENTICAL, CLASPED SO LIGHTLY THAT THEY FELL APART IN HANDLING; THIS IS THE BETTER OF THEM. OBSERVE ITS ANATOMICAL IMPERFECTIONS, WHICH ARE REWARDED AS SUPPORTING ITS SUPERNORMALITY OF ORIGIN.
PARAFFIN GLOVES UNDER CO-MEDIUMSHIP

smeared all over the edge of the pail nearest the Psychic, but there was none on the floor and none was found on her hands or person, or that of Crandon. Finally Walter seemed to feel that the glove was done, and then to his great distress it slipped from his grasp and fell into the pail. He said it was easier to do each successive time and that before long we would have the largest and best collection in the world.

Jones arrived as per schedule, and there is nothing that need be said in the way of introduction to the record of his first sitting:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, April 30th, 1926, 9 P.M., in the old cabinet.

Present to left: Jones, Richardson, Hill, Brewer, Eddy, Mrs. Richardson, Crandon, Psychic. In the background were Conant, Miss Lord and Mrs. Stinson. There were three cameras set up.

There was no sign of Walter until about five minutes, when it was apparent that Jones was in trance. Margery did not go into trance for about forty minutes, but from that time on both were in trance. Walter spoke shortly, and was full of energy and kept us convulsed with laughter throughout the evening. The pail, with melted paraffin floating on boiling water, was in front of Margery, and on the edge of it was built a shelf of black cloth and wire on which paraffin structures might be laid after making. A pail of cold water was alongside. Much agitation of the paraffin was heard, sounding like a big fish in a pail, and Walter kept us in constant fear that he would lose what he was making. He said that he was using teleplasm from Jones, and at certain apparently critical periods he begged us all to chant: "Jones, sit still." This we did for minute after minute. At another time he said that the two mediums were fastened neck to neck [teleplastically, of course] while he used them. Again he said: "Oh, for a male medium always!" Walter's voice constantly broke into a partial bass tone. After a while there was a big plunge in the water pail, and we could hear gurgles of air apparently coming out of some hole as it filled with water. Again the same thing was apparently lifted out of the water, and a pint of water, more or less, could be heard running out of the hollow structure. At three different intervals he allowed us to see on the pail shelf—the veranda, as he called it—the paraffin structure. The first was, apparently, as he had promised, a right and left hand clasping each other and of different sizes. This was crude, as Walter said it would be because it was a first
attempt. The second structure was a wonderfully perfect right hand, both palm and back being well made. It was short and fat. Walter advised against pouring plaster into it because he said in this instance the outside was better than the inside. The third structure involved apparently an effort to make two hands again. In the first and third, on looking into the small hole out of which Walter must have dematerialized, it was obvious that there were good fingers in the mass.

The conditions were so strict that photographs were taken to show how the structures were delivered. The sitting closed at 10:15 P.M.

Before going on with the second of these sittings, of May 1st, I may conveniently cover a few details which are not made clear in the record, quoting for this purpose from Crandon's letter to me dated May 12th:

The Psychic was searched before and after each sitting. The cold water pail was searched before the sitting. The temperature of the paraffin was 212° Fahrenheit when it left the kitchen, and 170° at the end of the sitting. Walter would not work in the galvanized pail, so the boiling paraffin and water were poured into a papier maché pail [each night, after being brought upstairs in the galvanized pail in which they had been heated]. The heat took the varnish off the inside of this papier maché pail so that the paraffin had an individual pink color. All the hands were large and masculine. They resembled in no way the hand of either medium, and they were certainly not feminine. Holmes [on May 1st] was told to pull the glove out of the cold water pail, and did so. The mold was found to have the fingers hyper-extended, and the thumb was especially broad. The hand was a fair image of that of Holmes. Walter joked at him, and accused him of making the hand, and asked him how he liked being called an accomplice. The one made that night we filled with plaster of Paris and presented it to Tillyard, to show Sir Oliver [Lodge] and others, and to take home with him. There were imperfections in all the molds, but each one showed that the dematerialization took place through an orifice not over an inch in diameter. They all were different in actual measurement and in proportions from the one made in your [i.e., Bird's] presence two years ago. It seemed as if for all this work Walter used Jones, who was in trance throughout while Margery was in trance only part of the time.

5 May 17th, 1924; M. M., Chapter XII, as cited above.
Plate 35. Back and front views of a paraffin glove, identified by Dr. Crandon as the second one from the séance of April 30, 1926 (see page 458, extreme top). Aside from this and the shells of plates 34 and 36, other shells indicated by the records as having been delivered are available for examination at 10 Lime Street but cannot be identified by date and so are not here illustrated.
PARAFFIN GLOVES UNDER CO-MEDIUMSHIP 459

The remarks of the above letter will make more intelligible the record, prepared by Crandon as usual, which I next present:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, May 1st, 1926: in the old cabinet.
Present, to left: Jones, Tillyard, Dudley, Laura Crandon, Holmes, Mrs. Tillyard, Crandon, Psychic. Mrs. Stinson was in the background. She is Walter's [and Margery's] mother, 78 years old, and nearly unable to move on account of general arthritis.

In front of the Psychic was a papier maché pail filled with boiling water on top of which was floating four inches of melted paraffin. This burned off the varnish of the pail, and thus the fluid was tinted pink, which served to identify it. Beside this pail was a galvanized pail full of cold water.

Walter came through promptly and within five minutes Jones was in trance. Five minutes later Margery went into trance. Shortly after this Walter said, "This is too good; I'll have to show it to you. Turn on the light." This was done, and we beheld the two psychics, side by side, both unconscious and snoring deeply. About ten minutes later we were allowed to turn on the red light again, and we saw all over the left side of Jones's head a hanging mass of teleplasm. Tillyard was allowed to feel this with the back of his hand, and reported that it was warm and soft, more or less like wax. We now heard sounds as though a fish were flopping about in the paraffin pail, mixed with an occasional plunge in the cold water pail. Just preceding this the surface of the paraffin glowed occasionally with a psychic light, and similar glowing areas could be seen near Margery's head and over her chest. Other lights were shown over the pail, as though they came from a flat surface. They were visible to some of the circle and not to others, and then the first group might not see it while the second did.5a

After about forty-five minutes of great agitation in the pail, Walter told us that the hand he was making was done, that he thought we probably could not make a cast of it because parts of it had collapsed, and that he felt his technique would improve with practice. Before the sitting Dr. Holmes had explored the galvanized pail full of water to see that it contained nothing else. Now he was told by Walter to fish in the pail. He did so, and pulled out what we were later allowed to see was a good glove of a right hand. The thumb was excellently well made, the fingers were more or less fused and somewhat collapsed. Later plaster of Paris was poured into

---

5a See M. M., pp. 199–201.
it as far as possible to give it permanency, and then the whole was presented to Tillyard by Margery, that he might take it with him as a souvenir.

Examination of the hands of everybody in the room before they left the circle failed to reveal any sign of paraffin on them. The glove which had been made was obviously masculine, and the thumb bore a striking resemblance to that of Holmes. It was pink, exactly matching the color of the paraffin in the bucket, stained as this was by the coloring matter from the papier mâché.

On July 6th, 1926, Tillyard, stopping in England on his way home, lectured before the [British] National Laboratory of Psychical Research on his experiences with Margery. The lecture was published in full in the British Journal of Psychical Research for Sept.-Oct., 1926; and reprinted in the Journal of the A.S.P.R. for December of the same year. It seems desirable, in view of the extreme importance of Tillyard's position as an absolutely detached corroborator, to depart here from the convention of covering existing literature by citation only, and to quote in full such of his remarks as have to do with the sitting of May 1st. It will be appreciated that the reporting of his lecture in the third person is a canon of British journalism:

Dr. Jones was present at the second séance which the lecturer attended, and, as far as he could see, most of the teleplasm used in forming the psychic hand or glove obtained that evening was formed in this manner from this strong physical medium, who went into trance alongside Margery herself. It took about thirty minutes to produce a large mass of teleplasm and to pile it up on Jones's head. The lecturer asked for leave to examine it and handle it in red light, and this was granted by Walter. Just as he was stepping forward to examine it, he heard Dr. Crandon say to Mrs. Tillyard that the medium would groan when the teleplasm was touched; and, sure enough, as soon as he touched it, Jones emitted a deep groan, though he was sound asleep. It seemed at the time that it was the suggestion made by Dr. Crandon which reacted on the subconscious mind of the medium and made him groan, but the lecturer learnt afterwards by inquiry that the medium always groans when the substance is handled, although he is certainly not conscious of any pain. The lecturer carefully examined the mass of teleplasm and stated that it was white and somewhat shiny, rather like the white part of a large cauliflower cooked and served with white sauce, or perhaps a better simile would be that it was
PLATE 36. THIS GLOVE IS IDENTIFIED BY DR. CRANDON AS THE ONE MADE ON MAY 1, 1926, IN THE PRESENCE OF DR. TILLYARD AND HOLMES. THE PARAFFIN, AN EIGHTH-INCH THICK, WAS NOT MELTED OFF BEFORE IT WAS GIVEN TO DR. TILLYARD AND TAKEN AWAY BY HIM (SEE PAGE 462, BOTTOM). IT IS A MASCLULINE RIGHT HAND AND HAS FEATURES SUGGESTING THE HANDS OF AT LEAST TWO OF THE SITTING.
like a plate of cooked sheep's brains. As for what it felt like, it was most difficult to describe this; he could not think of any living tissue which gave him either the appearance or feeling of it exactly. One got a very strong impression of great turgidity and firmness, something like that of a well blown-up pneumatic tire, but there was also a suggestion of a living response to pressure, like reciprocation from a friendly hand-pressure.

In the formation of the psychic hand, it was, as had been already stated, Dr. Jones who provided most of the teleplasm, though Walter said that he got most of the "power" from Margery. In this experiment, two buckets were provided, one containing almost boiling water on which was floating about four inches of hot melted paraffin wax, while the other contained cold water. The lecturer had control of these two buckets and sat with his face almost over them so that he could see and hear everything that went on in them. The hot bucket was made of papier maché stained red, and this caused the wax in it to become pink by the end of the experiment; the teleplasm itself, on the other hand, was shining white, and, if any paraffin molds had been secretly introduced from outside fraudulently, they also would have been white; the psychic mold finally produced was exactly the same pink tinge as the wax in the bucket and had clearly been extracted from it. [This of course is not necessarily demonstrative; one might visualize the use of the pink bucket with the soluble coloring matter as a deliberate dodge by a very clever fraudulent operator, who would then have to be thought of as having carefully experimented to determine the precise shade which the paraffin would absorb from this dye, so that a previously prepared glove might be given this shade.—J. M. B.

When Walter said he was ready to begin, he asked the lecturer what part of his [Walter's] anatomy he [Tillyard] would like to have dipped into the pail for the psychic mold. The reply given at first was that he would like to see a thumb-nail carefully modeled. This, said Walter with a chuckle, would be very easy, and soon afterwards one heard a gentle dip of something into the pail. The lecturer then changed his mind and asked for a mold of the whole thumb, which Walter at once agreed to do. This operation took five or ten minutes, and involved a number of dippings and transfers to the cold water and back. Then the lecturer deliberately changed his mind again and said that he would like a whole hand with wrist complete. Walter demurred somewhat at this, pointing out that he had practically completed molding his thumb and that the hand would be uneven; however, when pressed, he said
he would do his best, and for about fifteen or twenty minutes the dippings into each pail alternately proceeded. Suddenly there was a big splash in the hot bucket and an object was heard to fall right into it; immediately Walter's voice was heard swearing roundly and calling on Mark [Richardson], his assistant, to come quickly and help him as he had badly damaged the mold. After a lot of splashing and some more dippings into the cold pail, Walter announced that his job was finished but that it would be found to be somewhat imperfect around the lower or wrist end; he then instructed one of the sitters, Dr. Holmes, to come forward and feel in the cold bucket and lift up whatever he might find carefully on to a leather cushion placed near by for its reception. This was done, and red light was turned on gradually while the mediums came out of trance. Dr. Jones came round more slowly than Margery, and when he was examined it was seen that his left ear was considerably inflamed around the place where the teleplasmic cord had been seen emerging.

The psychic mold was allowed to cool and was then carefully examined by all present. It was not closely like the hand of any person in the room, but showed considerable resemblance to that of the lecturer in having the knuckles strongly double-jointed and in being rather short and broad. The thumb had a less broad nail than the lecturer's and was much smaller than Jones's, though otherwise not dissimilar. The whole hand was quite unlike's Margery's, and all agreed that it was a male hand but much too small to be Jones's, quite apart from many obvious differences in shape. Walter claims that it is a model of his own hand; what the lecturer could be certain of was that it was not a model of the hand of anybody present at that séance in the flesh.

The lecturer then exhibited the psychic mold to the audience, pointing out that it had been filled with plaster of Paris to preserve it, but that owing to partial collapse of the fingers, which had less wax around them than the more carefully molded thumb, the wax had not filled the finger cavities completely, and therefore it would be useless to melt the wax away to get a plaster mold, as the finger portions would be misshapen.

5b A hostile critic on reading this, wants to know 'What did he do to help?' I reply with the utmost candor that I haven't the least idea. I presume this response strikes the critic who asks the question as highly ineffective; while in view of the fact that the spirit hypothesis is not being urged upon any reader of this volume, his original query strikes me as a ridiculously over-strained attempt to pick flaws.—J. M. B.

6 Sic: of course he means plaster.—J. M. B.
PARAFFIN GLOVES UNDER CO-MEDIUMSHIP

Jones was to remain in Boston for two more days; Tillyard had to go on after the evening of May 1st. Two more séances were held, directed at the formation of paraffin molds through Jones’s mediumship; and for these I am forced again to rely entirely upon Crandons’ records:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, May 2nd, 1926, 9 p.m.; in the old cabinet.

The pail of paraffin was prepared as usual with the pail of cold water alongside it. The Psychic was searched and her single garment examined by Mrs. Brown before and after the sitting, with negative results.

Walter came through promptly and talked us all into good humor. Jones entered trance shortly, and Margery followed him. There came a faint luminosity over the paraffin pail. Very soon after this a flopping sound could be heard first in one pail and then in the other. This went on more or less for 45 minutes. Then Walter said: “Well, I’ve done something. The way to deliver these things is in a pail of cold water; they’ll collapse otherwise.” When the light was turned on we found on the piazza of the pail two molds. One was of a fat masculine right hand, the fingers partly flexed. The other was a mold of two masculine hands, both rights, palm to palm, and bowed from finger tips to wrists in such a manner that no hand could normally get out of them.

Walter said good-night at 10:10 p.m.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, May 3rd, 1926; 9:15 p.m., in the old cabinet.

Walter came through shortly and ordered the table to be put in the circle over the pail of hot paraffin and the pail of ice water. [A paragraph dealing with identification of playing cards in the early part of the séance is omitted here, being given elsewhere.]

The table was now removed, the water pail having been explored by Dennett and found to contain only water and ice. Much agitation of the two pails was heard for the next half-hour. In the meantime Walter entertained us with talking, serious and light. He said: “I’m not using the Kid tonight, I’m using only teleplasm from Jones. The Kid is only an accessory to the crime.” As he went on plunging from one pail to the other he composed some newspaper headlines, thus:

Margery Gives Ghosts Cool Reception at Lime Street.
Entertains Ghosts in Pail.
Refreshments: Paraffin (H) and Ice Water.
In a more serious mood he called new attention to the fact that "this is only kindergarten, except in its implications." He told Jones early in the sitting to sit regularly Saturday evenings in a home circle and try to develop, and that he [Walter] would try to get to him. Shortly after this he said: "This paraffin stays too hot, I guess I'll cool it." Whereupon with the greatest celerity the galvanized water pail was picked up and a quart or more of water poured into the hot paraffin. A moment later he did the same thing again. During this time Richardson had possession of both Jones's hands and Margery's left; while Mrs. Richardson had both Crandon's, and Margery's right. The ice had been thrown out of the pail earlier, and in the pouring act no water was spilled.

At the end of the sitting a good right-hand mold, masculine, was found on the pail shelf, and a hand with forefinger extended like an index. All the other fingers and the thumb of this hand were found floating, separately, in the cold-water pail. The index finger, attached to the main portion of the hand, was bent somewhat towards the stump of the middle finger.

Sitting closed at 10:30 p.m. No paraffin found on any hands.

Hardwicke as we shall immediately see enjoyed further contact with the Lime Street sittings; but when he came again, while the phenomena were of a wholly teleplasmic nature they did not take the direction of a successful paraffin-shell production. This department of the mediumship is of course to be recognized as a direct forerunner of the thumbprints to which so much time was given in 1927, and to which we shall come in due course; but so far as the shells themselves are concerned, we come at this point to the end of the story. It is quite characteristic for Walter to drop a given category of phenomena thus abruptly; sometimes after having got it to a logical climax and sometimes without having successfully done so. Proponents of the mediumship regard this versatility as a strong point and its attackers insist that it is a fatal weakness. In any event, it is distinctly a Walter habit; though of late, he has also apparently developed the ability to go back and repeat a phenomenon out of the past which he has shelved.

---

7 See open reference No. 29, Vol. 2.
8 See McDougall's remarks about the red herring; Journal, A.S.P.R., June, 1925, pages 302-3.
9 See open reference No. 34, Vol. 2.
CHAPTER XLII

Further Teleplasmic Phenomena with the Aid of Dr. Hardwicke

From the Séance Records, with comment by the Editor

The extremely successful experiments of Chapter XLI in mediumistic collaboration led to a very definite project to have Jones come to Lime Street at more or less stated intervals. Only one of these visits materialized, but it was of extreme interest. Another natural consequence of the séances of April 30th-May 3rd was a sharp revival of interest, alike on the part of Walter and on that of the sitters, in the teleplasmic side of the mediumship. Pending Jones's next presence, several evenings were given over to this.

On May 6th the Psychic was "tired from the materializations of the recent sittings, and Walter said the force was low, but he had isolated and saved up some force left over from Jones, for future use. Though the molten paraffin was present, he declined to use it." Instead he reverted to the almost abandoned theme of playing-card identifications, and then "went on to produce some faint but distinct and beautiful psychic lights." On the 11th, there was another incident which I think Walter would have us regard as part of this sequence. The record reads:

The sitting was scheduled for Eddy and his group, but since all could not come it was postponed. Margery, however, felt a strong urge to sit, which was almost irresistible. Walter came through at once, and said: "It was lucky you sat tonight. I was holding on by my teeth. Everything would have been lost if you had not sat." He worked on the luminous basket and handkerchief for about an hour, talking all the while, and saying that he was attending strictly to his important business; but he gave no details.

On May 15th, there was something more concrete, in a sitting held wholly in the old cabinet:

This was supposed to be a developmental séance only, and so it proved to be. Walter came through promptly and for some minutes whistled a beautiful improvisation to the "Prisoners'
The paraffin had been brought in boiling, with the idea that it might be used. The Psychic went into trance promptly, and a lot of flopping about was heard in the paraffin and in the water pail. Several times he told us to listen, and we could hear as much as a pint of water being poured out of something into the water pail. Richardson was touched several times, with what was apparently a paraffin mold, on the back of his hand.

After about forty minutes of this, Walter suddenly said, “Now I’ll show you something, turn on the light.” We beheld the face of the Psychic quite covered with this thick white teleplasm, with a long hook-like projection from the region of the nose, looking like a caricature of a nose, perhaps eight inches long. Crandon, on the side, could see it move. With the next exposure, some two minutes later, this proboscis-like process was twelve to fourteen inches long, and as we watched it, the exposure to light apparently caused it to wilt downwards. Walter said that he was molding some teleplasm to the face of the Psychic, with the idea of making a cast of the mold in paraffin. He said also, that that rod we saw in the region of the nose was one of the rods with which he did much of his levitation; that it was the kind of rod described by Crawford; that the Psychic was covered with such projections all over, like warts on a cucumber; that he could make anyone of them grow out to do whatever job was at hand.

On our saying we would sit for progress again a week from tonight, he said, “Oh, not so long, we must go on now that I have steam up.”

There exists a supplementary memorandum by Hill, revolving mainly about certain subjective factors of the above séance, but including also the following:

Mention ought to be made of the lateral motion of the proboscis, seen by myself and, I am sure, by Dudley. This introduces a feature other than a mere sagging under the disintegrating power of the light.

On the 20th and 25th (May), there were additional sessions with paraffin and teleplasm. The two records may be subjoined, with no further comment.

Sitting of May 20, 1926, in the old cabinet. Walter came through promptly, the melted paraffin being in the cabinet.

As the running chatter of comment and wit went on, we heard occasional flopping in the hot paraffin, the Psychic being in deep trance. Walter said that he was working on three things industri-
ously, and that we had to sit to help him get on with them. He said that Jones had left enough stuff behind him to make a masculine hand from; that Walter is working on the phantom; and he is seeking to make a rod of sufficiently density to withstand the light, in order that shortly we may photograph the table in levitation showing the rod which lifts it. As an earnest of this promise, Walter gave us three views of a fourteen to eighteen inch hooked rod protruding from the region of the Psychic’s nose. The last three inches of it moved laterally, like a cat’s tail. The hole was about one inch in diameter, and its base seemed nearly to cover the Psychic’s face. It was pinkish in color, and evidently moving. It was the longest rod we have seen.

The sitting closed at 11:30 p.m., and it was interesting to observe that downstairs, later, the Psychic complained that the bridge of her nose was sore. Towards the end of the sitting the Psychic’s mouth could be heard working, and Walter said, “You can hear her swallowing the ectoplasm.”

Sitting of May 25, 1926, in the old cabinet.

Trance came on in less than two minutes. The pails of hot paraffin and cold water setting in a new box for the purpose were in front of the Psychic, and from time to time we heard dipping in each pail. Most of the time when the dipping was heard there was control of the Psychic’s two hands, each by two persons, and of Crandon also. At the end of the sitting a poorly formed right-hand paraffin glove was found on the shelf of the pail. Just before this, Walter exclaimed in despair because he dropped it apparently as he was getting out of it, and it fell into the paraffin pail. We are inclined experimentally from this, to have more paraffin in the pail hereafter so the dip can be deeper.

Besides a lot of interesting and valuable talk there was one new and very striking feature to the sitting. The talk included a statement by Dr. Eddy that he felt that individual survival had been in no way proved by us, that there was no satisfactory evidence that Walter is what he pretends to be. On this Walter commented, “I can proved myself to be what I am in as many ways as you can prove your identity.” Someone asked Walter how far away he was when he left us, and to this he replied, “A long distance, but perhaps only really an inch.”

We were allowed two red-light views of a proboscis process

---

1 Referring to a project often discussed between Walter and the frequent sitters, which as yet has led to nothing. It seems unnecessary to particularize about it here.—J. M. B.
growing from the region of the nose. One was about fourteen inches long and the last five inches of it bent downwards as we watched it. The second view showed a process one inch in diameter in the form of a spiral or corkscrew, the base diameter of the curve of it was about four inches. All sitters saw it and Walter ventured no explanation except that it was preparatory to the structure which we would later see holding up the table.

Regarding the next appearance of Jones in Lime Street there was uncertainty and misunderstanding; so that he arrived unexpectedly on May 28th. On the evening of that date, a sitting was held, with Jones present and in intermittent trance. The phenomena were entirely telekinetic; and though Walter stated that he had got a great deal of force or material out of Jones, the séance action was in no visible respect different from Margery's telekinetic routine.

It had been agreed between Crandon and myself that I should attend when Jones was again present; and following his unexpected arrival, Crandon got in touch with me by long-distance telephone on the evening of the 28th. I had planned a motor trip in another direction over the Memorial Day week-end; it was a simple matter to change my itinerary and go to Boston instead. I arrived in good time for the séance of the 29th, which by prearrangement with Walter was given over entirely to an effort to get further paraffin gloves. Inasmuch as there would therefore be nothing in the way of séance action to record, I decided to forego any attempt to use the dictaphone and to give my entire attention to matters of control and of observation. My séance record, drawn up the following morning, starts with a brief memorandum of Jones's connection with the mediumship, which I have here covered and so may suppress. Taking it up at the point where it first deals with new matter, I give it complete from that point:

There had been considerable experimenting by the sitters in the effort to determine the best sort of paraffin for séance use, and the best way to handle it. Problems had arisen in connection with the temperature and the depth of paraffin in the bucket which suggested the trial of a hot bucket containing paraffin only, without any water; in conjunction with the usual cold bucket containing water alone. At the same time an effort was being made to find a more suitable paraffin; and for the present evening that in use was the sort employed in the preparation of microscopic specimens. This is of course a very superior product, in its way; whether its
particular properties would render it more, or less, suitable for the technique of psychic molds was not known, and no attempt was made to determine this in advance. An experiment was thus transferred into the séance-room which could perfectly well have been made and which should have been made outside the séance.

Crandon attended to the melting of the paraffin, and when it was brought upstairs it was so hot that the start of the séance had to be postponed until the bucket had cooled somewhat. Relieved of the limiting factor introduced by the presence of water with its fixed boiling point, the contents of the bucket kept getting hotter and hotter the longer it remained on the stove; and when we attempted to sit, the temperature was somewhere in the neighborhood of 300° Fahrenheit. When we finally brought the bucket into the séance room and started the sitting, it was still so hot that it smoked and gave off a very noticeable odor as of scorched wax.

The glass cabinet was used, and the two mediums were placed in it face to face. Margery was at the back, Jones at the front with his back to the door. Between them, a foot or so from the floor, was a wooden shelf-like structure with holes large enough to receive the buckets and permit these to enter to about one-third their height. This was necessary to avoid danger of spilling. The quarters were extremely crowded, and the sharp edges of the shelf were in constant violent contact with the shins of one or the other medium. Jones’s chair was ultimately pushed by its entranced occupant part way out of the cabinet.

The whole program revolving about the paraffin, we did not bother to lash the feet of the mediums. The only foot control attempted lay in my verification of the fact that, without a free hand to aid the process, neither of them could shed a shoe; plus the total absence of any paraffin on their stockings at the end of the séance. Hand control was by the customary wire lashings; Margery’s hands being lashed at the rear ports of the cabinet, which I had never before seen in use, and Jones’s at the forward ones. I put the wires around all four wrists myself, and likewise attended myself to the lashing of all four to the eye-bolts in the outer walls of the cabinet. At the end of the séance I found that my knots had not been disturbed. Over and above the obvious fact that the lashings were too tight to permit escape, the deep marks left by the lashings upon the mediums’ wrists offered a guarantee of the continuity of hand control.

4 Contrary to previous practice in sitting for paraffin shells.—J. M. B.
5 See page 467. A photograph of this box will appear in Vol. 2.
Margery’s trance was approximately as usual, although certainly not so restless as ordinarily. Jones’s was an extremely restless trance, with constant violent struggling against the lashings to a point where the cabinet creaked and shook severely. From time to time there was partial emergence accompanied by violent profanity about the “damned wires.”

We sat for something like half an hour before the paraffin was introduced into the cabinet. During this interval there was a lot of conversation from Walter, and considerable whistling. The latter was of dual character; in addition to Walter’s accustomed performance there were feeble imitations stated to be by John. The two whistles came simultaneously and at various moments; once there was a sustained duct accompaniment to the phonograph for ten or fifteen seconds; but for the most part the overlap between the two whistles was not so sustained as this, although clearly present from time to time.

The luminous megaphone, basket, and doughnut were placed on the stand in the cabinet by me. Walter requested that I do this without touching Jones, but I found Jones’s knees wherever I explored. When I so stated, Walter said it was all right, it didn’t matter if I did touch him. This might be interpreted as accommodation to the existing circumstances; or it might be fitted into the ideas as to Walter’s hypnotic background advanced by Till-yard in his letter to Crandon.⁶

There was sustained brilliant levitation of these three objects. The doughnut was levitated first alone and then placed in the bottom of the basket for further levitation. The megaphone and basket then went into levitation simultaneously, and for some minutes they moved freely about in the cabinet. Their paths were quite independent both in locus and in velocity; there could be no question at all but that they were held by independent terminals. They were carried to a height permitting their bumping against the roof of the cabinet, and in general they seemed to range through the entire free space within the cabinet.

At one point during this stage of the sitting we were given red light to look at the mediums, and we found a teleplasmic protuberance of some sort on Margery’s face. I likened it to a horn, and somebody else to a butterfly wing. It was not very large, and it was in no degree luminous in the dark. I think it probable that the chief reason why we got no repetition of this was the

⁶ These ideas are sufficiently defined by this reference and no quotation from the letter seems necessary.—J. M. B.
FURTHER TELEPLASMIC PHENOMENA

extreme disarrangement of Margery's robe. Walter remarked about this a little later, and warned us not to turn on lights at the end of the séance until it had been fixed.

Ultimately Walter called for the paraffin, and with considerable difficulty, in all the red light which the arrangements of the room permit, Crandon, having poured the paraffin out of the galvanized bucket in which it had till now remained and into the papier maché one, was able to lift this very clumsy and dangerous burden over Jones's head and deposit it in its seat between the psychics. [My original record here described the bucket and the arrangements for its use; this has been covered and may be omitted.]

Those present included Dudley, Crandon, the two Richardsons, and myself. I was seated directly in the door of the cabinet in such a way that invasion would have been out of the question—and of course this waives entirely the point that Jones is an enormous man (230 pounds) over whom nobody could possibly climb in the dark without a fearful racket. All emphasis should be placed upon the control conditions in connection with the fact that for a long time after the paraffin and water buckets were put in place there was continual noise of working in these two buckets. The noises were not such as could be produced by kicking the buckets. They were very emphatically as of dipping, first into the one bucket, and then into the other, and ultimately on several occasions they were as of the dropping of a fairly crisp finished product upon the shelf.

Walter expressed on several occasions much difficulty with the paraffin, and finally he stated that he was not at all pleased with his product and that he was going to destroy it. This remark was followed by a noise as of dropping something into one of the buckets. After the séance two observations were made, checking up the good faith of all this.

The paraffin was altogether unmanageable, either because of its inherent characteristics, or because of the extreme heat to which it had been subjected. It was altogether too granular to permit adequate molding. I took a small piece of it, and rolled it into a ball between thumb and finger. After a very little of this treatment, it became the consistency of overdone fudge and fell apart in much the same way that this material does. It would have been quite out of the question to make a decent mold with it.

The paraffin bucket at the end of the séance was at a more or less critical temperature, the bulk of its contents being still liquid, but the parts in contact with the sides of the pail having begun to crystallize against the pail. In the bottom there was a large
mass whose solidity was barely such that we were able to detach and recover it. It was obviously a fragment of a hand mold, showing particularly the hollow character at what we took to be the ball of the thumb.

The outcome of this séance, therefore, was profoundly unsatisfactory. To be sure, strong and persistent action of some sort was obtained in the pails, for which no adequate explanation appears to be available. But that is not so much to the point, as is the fact that a definite result in the way of a finished mold was to have been produced, and failed to occur. Entirely because of the use of the séance-room as the theater for an experiment by the sitters, which should have been conducted elsewhere and at another time, conditions were set up which, on the assumption of genuineness, would have prevented Walter from producing the scheduled phenomenon, at this time when a positive result was so greatly desired. As a consequence, there was brought about a parallelism with the course of events which would be expected from a fraudulent case—failure of the phenomena to occur under a critical and competent observation and control. Moreover, if one insists upon the unsuitability of the paraffin as the primary physical cause of this failure, what is one to say to the critic who accepts this plea, but lays the whole thing up against an extremely clever premeditation by Crandon and the Psychic? Aside from insisting that I am not the only critical and competent outside observer, and that the phenomena do not have to occur under my eye in order to be valid, there is little enough that one can say.

If, however, the paraffin-mold aspect of Jones's co-mediumship scored a fiasco in my presence, the purely teleplasmic aspect achieved, on the following evening, the most brilliant verification imaginable. This was (approximately, not exactly) the third anniversary of the mediumship, and the idea was to have the old original circle (minus Cross 7 of course), plus the two mediums. In addition, Jones, Jr., was to be present. Despite his father's completely non-psychic history up to the time of coming in contact with Margery, this young man of eighteen years has a most decided history of random and undirected mediumship. As early as his third or fourth year, disturbances in his room would be of such force as to waken the entire family. He had been in Boston on the 29th, but not at the séance. On the 30th

7 See M. M., page 15.
he was to be present, in order to add every possible favorable factor to the psychic environment.

As another reproduction of the past atmosphere, I was to occupy my traditional position of 1924, outside the circle in the space between Crandon and Margery, controlling the junction between their hands and controlling their feet intermittently. This made it again necessary to give up any notion of using the dictaphone. My record is based upon rough memoranda made after the séance, and amplified and brought into finished form the following evening in a New York hotel:

Séance of May 30th, 1926: 10 Lime Street. Sitting held entirely in the old cabinet. Circle, clockwise: Margery (in the cabinet, as usual), Jones (at the end of the table, outside the cabinet), Dr. Brown, Adler, Mrs. Brown, Jones, Jr., Crandon, Bird (not an integral part of the circle, but in position of control outside [as indicated above]), Margery again. Outside the circle, in the northerly half of the room: J. H. Brown, Dudley, Murray, Mrs. Murray, Newman Gray, and an acquaintance of Jones from his home city.

Margery was not in trance at any time during this séance, and accordingly had her first noteworthy experience in first-hand observation of teleplasm. Jones, Sr., was in trance throughout. In this connection it may be stated that he falls into trance with great ease and promptness; on the 29th he was off long before Margery. On the present occasion he slumped forward on to the table almost with the extinction of the light. His trance was restless and talkative; but not so much so as the night before, and without the intervals of semi-waking. Jones, Jr., was in light trance from time to time.

A collection of luminous articles was available behind the corner of the cabinet, but was not called for. The entire proceedings revolved about the production, apparently from Jones’s ear, of what constituted by far the largest mass of teleplasm yet seen in Lime Street.

The intended character of this manifestation was not at all obvious in its beginnings. With Jones entranced, head on table, we all saw what we took to be a psychic light of the 1923–24 model. It was perhaps the size of a lemon, of approximately elliptical outline, and rather more clean-cut edges than would be necessarily implied by the reference to psychic lights of a prior period. Part of the time it was stationary on the table, and part of the
time in considerable motion. There seemed absolutely no reason to connect it organically with Jones, and I am sure no sitter had so connected it in his mind. After this light had been present for some moments it began to increase in size. Presently it was apparently oblong; perhaps six inches long and two to three inches across. It stood up vertically and in this position bobbed vertically up and down through a range of perhaps a half foot. Presently it dawned upon the sitters that the thing was growing. I think this constitutes an adequate description of this stage of the proceedings. The thing continued to grow longitudinally, but little, if at all, in the lateral sense; and it continued to move vertically and now, to some degree, in other directions. At all stages, here and later, the edges were decidedly clean cut, as though we were dealing with a definite object rather than an indefinite luminous area. The direction of growth which I have described above continued until we had a luminous object apparently fastened or held to the top of the cabinet and extending to the table. It stood, or lay, in a slight arc, and retained its essentially long and narrow outline.

It was not until after it had reached the stage just described that organic connection with Jones began to be evident. Some sitter presently exclaimed that the lower end was draped over Jones’s head on the table, and it became very soon evident that this was the case. This lower end began to develop to a large degree until the bottom part of the luminous matter had taken on a large bulbous outline which seemed to correspond very closely to the general size and shape of Jones’s head.

Dr. Brown, immediately adjacent to Jones’s head on the table, verified the general impression that his head was quite wholly draped in luminous matter.

The next stage was one of the most striking things I have seen in this séance room. Assuming the organic connection with Jones to have been by a cord to the ear or nose, this cord was either dark or so overlain by the general mass as not to be noticeable. The effect which now began is best described in terms of the following simile. Imagine the long, narrow, luminous zone to be a snake with its tail coiled or otherwise fastened to the top of the cabinet and its large flat head overlying Jones’s. Imagine the body of this creature as being rapidly turned upward in an arc concave upward, and the head as being raised from its contact with Jones at the end of this arc. Imagine each of these arcuate movements as being followed by a stretching process, and picture the stretching as across the table in the direction of Jones, Jr.
Imagine each of these stretchings as accompanied by a pronounced growth of the forward end, or head.

This occurred anywhere from ten to twenty times and was accompanied by a phenomenon visible for the most part only to Crandon and to myself. That is, we saw plainly silhouetted against the luminous mass on our side a dark object which we took to be Walter's teleplastic terminal. The obvious inference was that the teleplasmic mass was not alive in its own right, as its behavior might suggest; but that it was inert and being manipulated by this dark terminal. Walter, on interrogation, said that this was correct. He said that this terminal was developed from Margery, as always, and that this represented her sole contribution to the action of the seance. For the most part the silhouette was not seen in any critical position. That is to say, we might see the rod portion of the terminal silhouetted against the center of the luminous mass, and nothing more. But on various occasions we saw also the single or double finger-like process at the end of the terminal.

The prima facie reason for the behavior of the luminous mass which I have just described was to draw power from Jones, Jr. He was in trance, more or less collapsed on Crandon's right shoulder. For quite a time each forward surge of the luminous mass culminated in actual contact with his head or face; and each contact of such sort was accompanied by a rather sepulchral groan from Jones, Jr. After this had gone on for quite a time, it very definitely stopped, and Jones, Jr., was suddenly and unexpectedly found to be out of trance.

The luminous mass continued to be present for anywhere from fifteen to thirty minutes after this tapping of Jones, Jr., had ceased. Motion and change of shape continued, but not on a very liberal or very interesting scale. One extraordinarily interesting incident occurred, however. We were given a very brief interval of red light to look at it, Crandon being instructed to turn light on and immediately off. We saw the whole mass draped from the top of the cabinet and hanging in a long, sweeping curve to Jones's face and head, which was largely covered. A simile suggested by several sitters was that of too-granular paraffin or of a taffy pull. After the red light went out again we noticed a considerable increase in the luminosity of the mass. The effect was just as had been observed earlier in the year when Margery's own white lace-like teleplasm had shown a heavy luminosity following its exposure to flashlight. Thinking in terms of the most obvious expression along conventional lines, Crandon and one or two of
the other sitters consulted as to the ultra-violet content of the red light. They agreed that this was slight.

Measurements taken after the séance showed that the teleplasmic mass, at its maximum, was somewhere between 60 and 80 inches long. This measurement was made from the top of the cabinet to a point on the table which all sitters agreed had been reached by the mass. No such marker existed for the width or thickness, and the best evidence here would seem to come from the moment of red light visibility. At this moment I took the mass to be somewhere in the neighborhood of six to eight inches wide and perhaps an inch or two thick at its thickest point. The process of disintegration was more or less parallel to that of production. The mass retained its connection with Jones's head and was detached from the cabinet, but it did not collapse, so one may infer it was held from above by a teleplastic terminal. Its lower end remained fixed in position and size, while it shrank from above. Presently it attained an approximately vertical position and straight-line outline, standing up from the medium's head to a height of perhaps a foot. Only then did shrinking begin at the lower extremity. Presently we had what to all appearances was a simple and isolated psychic light of a long, narrow shape. This bobbed up and down, and each excursion seemed to be accompanied by a diminution in size. At the end there were three very noticeable discontinuous drops in size, luminosity, and clearness of outline (all three simultaneously). After the second of these drops, what was left seemed to lie on the table, in a position where Jones's head hid it from most of the sitters. After the third drop it was all gone; and with considerable promptness Jones was out of trance and Walter was gone.

This sitting was featured also by the dual whistle described for the 29th. Nothing need be added to what was there said, except perhaps that Crandon credited John with an improvement in technique.

After the luminous mass had been detached, and while it was still rather extensive, it hung in the air in two limbs, and Walter's voice was heard, apparently issuing from the point of juncture. Practically all sitters were agreed in placing the voice in the region of the upper part of the teleplasmic mass.

Whenever I wished to do so I was permitted to verify the integrity of the hand-hold between Margery and Crandon. Brown likewise was in a position to make the analogous observation between Margery and Jones, since Margery's arm was carried out onto the table by Jones's in order that his head might rest on their
two arms rather than on the table. This put their handclasp on the table immediately in front of Brown, and made it simple for him to verify its integrity without dropping Jones's left hand. At various critical points of the séance he and I simultaneously checked up the condition at these two points of control.

Jones came out of his trance in a state of mind which he aptly describes as "fighting mad" with Walter. He states that this is quite usual; that at the moment of emergence he always feels this violent grievance, which usually takes the form of mild threats (and profanity) as to what he would do to Walter if he could get his hands on him. It ought to be specified that with complete return to normality this passes off entirely; that Jones is thoroughly interested and altogether willing to be subjected to Walter's control. His own observations of his symptoms after trance and during moments of semi-emergence are interesting and should be of value. He writes me:

To obtain an account of the sensations experienced when going into and coming out of trance, one would be forced to transcribe them at once; for each trance is different in some respects from the others. When depending upon one's general memory, all these experiences run together, and might be described with great lack of accuracy. However, in the main, the following may be taken as a most general type of the experience:

The first sensation seems to be that of a detachment from the rest of the group, a loss of interest in what is going on about me. This is accompanied by extreme lassitude and heaviness, lasting for various periods. The next feeling is one of motion forward and back, at first gradual as though the body were swaying and the chair stationary, then with increased rapidity until the chair and the room are included in the motion. Then everything falls into space and keeps on falling. There seems to be no stop that I am conscious of. A buzzing sound now begins to make an impression upon my mind; I realize that the motion is now from side to side and diminishing apparently in the same ratio in which it increased. Then words and touches from the group begin to register; but even after consciousness has fully returned, the side-to-side motion continues, but working toward the center of the body and toward a gradual consequent fading out.

There is absolutely no sense of time lapse. Going in and coming out are one motion, instantaneous, in the face of the fact that the other sitters tell me an hour has elapsed. Nevertheless I always have a very strong feeling of being familiar with all the details of
the séance as these are talked over afterwards, as though I had been there. Yet if any such description is left unfinished, I cannot carry it on.

Again, there is a feeling of having met someone, or talked out a very delightful conversation, of which one is unable to recall a word, while still retaining a distinct impression of its joy and beauty. This is a most baffling feeling.

Jones of course is an M.D., yet it is natural enough that in many of the highly technical aspects of neurology and psychiatry he is little better informed than any intelligent layman. The present chapter has been read in proof by Dr. Hyslop, who is a practicing neurologist; and he has supplied the following comment:

The description of the mental state succeeding trance is interesting in that it presents features which one sees commonly in certain types of epileptiform attacks. Certain writers have drawn attention to the occurrence of somewhat similar phenomena in various types of lesions of the temporosphenoidal lobe. The impression of the patient that he has experienced something familiar, yet which cannot be definitely recalled partly because the impression seems to be fleeting, is known as the *déjà vu* phenomenon.

The temporosphenoidal cortex is phylogenetically very old. Its correlation both with taste and smell, which are primitive forms of sensation, and with rather peculiar states of consciousness, have been occasion for speculation.

I am unaware of any data giving information as to what may go on in the brains of mediums as an accompaniment of trance. In a series of three sittings with Mrs. Piper a few years ago I made the following observations:

As trance approached breathing became slow and deep, the left pupil contracted, mild cyanosis occurred and Jacksonian twitching appeared in the fingers of the right hand. These phenomena reached their maximum intensity as Mrs. Piper entered the trance. Once trance was established, respiration became less labored and the cyanosis disappeared. When coming out of the trance the finger twitching re-appeared, and both pupils at first were quite small. This series of events occurred each time I saw Mrs. Piper. These phenomena point toward some physiological alteration in the left cerebral hemisphere of Mrs. Piper, and warrant the conjecture that her trance is associated with temporary physiological changes.
CHAPTER XLIII

A Distinguished Sitter from Abroad

Compiled by the Editor, from the Séance Records and Other Sources

The existence, in Boston and Cambridge, of an active group of anti-Margery propagandists has been hinted at in previous chapters, as well as in material previously published elsewhere. The terms in which this propaganda is conducted need not be exposed in detail or subjected to a detailed refutation; for such details are of no large bearing upon the scientific questions which the mediumship puts at stake. The validity of the phenomena is properly to be adjudged on physical grounds alone; and no matter what may be done by the irreconcilables in prosecution of the thesis that nothing good can issue from Lime Street, no valid scientific end can be served by taking any part in these personalities. A decent regard for the historical verities, however, makes it necessary to show that much of the contemporary objection to Margery's validity does consist in organized propaganda, mainly from a single source and a tainted source.\(^1\) To such degree as may be necessary to show this we must be permitted latitude to diverge from strictly scientific consideration of the strictly scientific aspects of the case.

With regard to the existence of the adverse propaganda there is a certain question of fact at issue. General inquiry directed at persons of responsibility in the department of psychology at Harvard or in the Boston S.P.R. always elicits the reply that these persons have circulated no reports adverse to the morality, etc., of the medium or her husband or her sitters; that they have engaged in no adverse propaganda, etc., etc. One of them, addressing Margery in person, had the temerity to state, above his signature, that he had never spoken ill of her. Prince has seized every opportunity to deny that the Boston S.P.R. has any official position adverse to Margery or indeed that it is sufficiently interested in the case to be the haven for adverse propaganda; and if we interpret this statement in the strictest sense as denying merely the occurrence of a personal equation from an impersonal organization, it is of course quite true. In the face of all this,

\(^1\) See page 14, and open reference No. 35, Vol. 2.

479
it becomes highly pertinent to introduce four eminent and disinterested witnesses.

Dr. F. C. S. Schiller, past President of the (British) S.P.R. and a psychical researcher of experience and distinction unsurpassed by any living person, was present at the Philosophical Congress held in Cambridge in the early summer of 1926. Naturally he saw much of the anti-Margery personnel, from McDougall down. Writing in *The Nineteenth Century,* he tells us that he was exposed to anti-Margery propaganda which impressed him as irrelevant and inexplicable. His precise words are:

The hypothesis of fraud is in this case seriously embarrassed to suggest a motive for the action of the Crandons. The alleged motives that were whispered into one's ears at Boston last summer by the active anti-Margery party, though often libellous, all seemed psychologically improbable and insufficient.

The italics are mine; I employ them to stress the fact that this very eminent authority testifies to the reality of the propaganda and the irresponsible fashion in which it has been prosecuted.

Further testimony comes from a source not less well known to psychical science—Mr. F. Bligh Bond, whose study of automatic writings has had the highly pragmatic results which he emphasizes in the Clark University Symposium. Mr. Bond has had no opportunity to testify in print; but in a private communication to me he says:

On my arrival in Boston in December, 1926, I was received with cordial welcome by many persons of good standing among whom I soon became aware of the existence of a strong anti-Crandon propaganda. To my surprise this did not center on the question of the reality or otherwise of Margery's phenomena; though their genuineness was usually denied I was not asked to subscribe to this opinion. But I was impressed on all sides by arguments of a personal nature principally directed against Dr. Crandon, who was assailed in his moral and professional reputation alike. There were vague reflections upon the honor of his household. I was told in so many words that, if I cultivated the society of the Crandons or in any way allied myself with their cause, I should forfeit my social standing in the city and lose any influence which I might enjoy. The stories told me were specific, and took every conceivable and

2 July, 1927; Vol. CII, No. 605, p. 58.
3 *The Case For and Against Psychical Research*; Clark University, 1926.
inconceivable form; some being fantastic to a degree and others mutually contradictory. In no case was any definite authority given; but it was speedily apparent to me that I was expected to receive these stories without question as to their authenticity.

Bond's testimony added to Schiller's would make it appear that any stranger coming to Boston with credentials putting him more or less in the confidence of the McDougall-Prince-Worcester faction ought to expect an exposure to this sort of thing. That such is in fact the case would further appear from conversation which I have had with Miss May Walker, the peripatetic unofficial representative of British psychical research, and from letters written by her to Bond and to the Crandons which I have seen. Miss Walker, as we shall see later, had two sittings during 1926 in which the conditions did not impress her as adequate for the exclusion of fraud. Combining her observations to this effect with what she had been told by the Boston antis, she concluded that the mediumship was a monumental imposture. She called upon me at my office in late 1926 or early 1927, and in a long interview tried to make me realize the gravity of my own position—I was responsible, more than any other person, for whatever of credit the case enjoyed; and where would I and my Society be when the bubble burst? But in June, 1927, Miss Walker had further séances in which every question left open by her previous experience was completely disposed of, and in which she saw an abundance of phenomena which she could not possibly regard as other than genuine. While she was under the impression that the case was bad, she had written to her many European friends telling them this and retailing a considerable portion of the libelous anti-Margery gossip which she had picked up. In her oral expressions of regret for this to me and in her written expressions of regret to the Crandons and to Bond, she is highly explicit as to the existence and the unpublishable details of the anti-Margery slanders.

Finally we have the case of another gentleman who came a long way to attend the Philosophical Congress in Cambridge—Dr. R. J. Tillyard, F.R.S., of the Cawthron Institute, Nelson, New Zealand. Tillyard is an entomologist, in public or semi-public service, and I am told that his reputation in his field is world-wide. He has been sent, by his government, on an almost world-wide mission in search of parasites which

---

*See open reference No. 30, Vol. 2.*
might be imported to New Zealand to prey on insect and other pests now rife there. He brought with him to Boston an interest in psychical research which was made the keener by virtue of the fact that he had never seen any of the phenomena; he brought also advice from Sir Oliver Lodge to the effect that there were two things in America which he must not miss: Niagara, and Margery. His connection with the Philosophical Congress brought it about that he met McDougall as inevitably he did the Crandons. At this point, it becomes in order to let him tell his own story; it is of course British reporting custom that throws it into the third person:

At that time the lecturer did not even know "Margery's" real name until he looked it up in the Scientific American, and even then he did not know her address, so he wrote to her, "Mrs. Crandon, Boston." The letter found its billet, and a kind reply reached him from Dr. Crandon, telling him to let him know when he was in Boston and to come and have dinner with him, after which a sitting would be arranged. Owing to a motor accident he was three days late in getting to Boston, and instead of a week, as he had hoped, he could spend only three and one-half days there. One of the evenings was booked for a dinner which the biologists were giving him, and the other evenings, namely April 29th and May 1st, he spent with the Crandons. It was one of the most extraordinary experiences he had ever had in his life. He did not know whether those present realized the stir Margery had caused in that quaint old city of Boston, the center of American intellect and culture. It was strange to find the intellectual University of Harvard in the throes of a mental, if not a moral, revolution because of one woman. He could only refer to it in the way in which it had reacted on him.

The hospitality of Boston was very marked. He was the guest of professors who showed him every kindness; in fact, there was nothing too troublesome for them to undertake on his behalf. One of them had a car and offered to run him around wherever he wished. But when he mentioned 10 Lime Street, they begged him not to go to that place. One professor of Harvard told him it was a thoroughly bad place, that his honor would be stained forever if he went, that no decent man or woman should set foot inside that door, and they even insinuated that Margery was a descendant of

---

They did their best to stop him going, but when he asked them if they had ever been they said they would not think of going, that the woman was a vampire, and so on, and that he would be thoroughly compromised if he went. He told them, however, that they could not “put that over” a New Zealander, and he decided that he would go; so one of them finally consented to drive him there.

He decided to see Professor McDougall before he went, and with him he had three hours’ conversation; in other words, the Professor talked to him for three hours, partly on his own theories of psychology and partly on the wickedness of the Crandons. The lecturer said to him, “If this is so, will you put me up to a few tips?” whereupon McDougall said that he thought Crandon employed a magnet in the scales experiment, and he gave him a little child’s magnet to take with him to test this effect; he also gave him several other “tips.” He listened to all that McDougall had to say, and agreed with him that possibly the whole thing was a gigantic conjuring trick, though McDougall, in answer to his direct challenge, could not bring any definite evidence of fraud against Margery. All he could say was that she was far too clever to allow fraud to be evident, but he did not believe that she did the things in question except by fraud. That was the attitude of these men throughout, and on going later through the various departments of Harvard he could see that that University was thoroughly materialistic. It was the most materialistic university he had ever come across. They had no time whatever for anything that contravened the tenets of materialism. They held that if a thing was not provable on a materialistic hypothesis it must be a fraud.

Tillyard, as he tells us above, sat on April 29th and May 1st, 1926. His record for the second of these dates, originally published in the British Journal of Psychical Research,8 we have had in full in Chapter XLI, and we have seen that it fully verifies the occurrence and the reality of the phenomena. His record for the 29th was similarly published in England; and similarly, in order to have at least one detailed account of every vital séance in the present volume, we depart from our usual procedure with previously published material and give it here too:

6 My italics.—J.M.B.
7 Which Tillyard used to test the Lime Street scales, with negative result.—J.M.B.
8 1, 6; Jan.-Feb., 1927; pp. 150ff.
First Séance, Thursday, April 29th, 1926.—In this record M stands for the medium, Margery (Mrs. Crandon), C for Dr. Crandon, R for R. J. Tillyard, P for Mrs. Tillyard, D for Mr. Dudley, Mr. L and Mrs. L for Mr. and Mrs. Litzelmann respectively.

At 6:30 p.m., R and P dined with Dr., Mrs. and Miss Laura Crandon, Mrs. Stinson (Margery’s aged and infirm mother) and a young Mr. Gray. The latter said good-bye and left after dinner. The rest of us adjourned upstairs to the book-room on second floor, and were joined between 8 and 9 p.m. by Mr. Dudley and Mr. and Mrs. Litzelmann.

At 9 p.m. the whole party moved up to the séance room on the fourth floor. P took M into the bedroom opposite and examined her and her clothing thoroughly. M wore only a wrapper, which she took off and allowed P to examine inside and out, and thin stockings and shoes, the latter tied on with bows of ribbon which could not be tied and untied by the feet alone; M took her shoes off and showed them to P, who also examined M naked except for her stockings. P was satisfied that there was nothing concealed either about her or her clothing.

P returned with M, not leaving her side until she was completely tied up in the cabinet. The latter was a well-constructed one with plate glass sides, back and door. Strong brass eyelets were let into the floor, sides and back, and bolted on the other side of the wood. By means of stout picture-wire made of a number of strands, R then bound M’s hands and feet tightly into position, the hands being placed first through small slits in the sides and tied outside. To ease the pressure, the wires were passed first through ordinary rubber tubing just long enough to encircle wrists and ankles; each limb was fixed as tightly as possible and could not be withdrawn, and each was tied strongly with five or six knots, so that it required a pair of very strong scissors to cut the medium free after the séance. M’s neck was also fixed by R, into a position drawn well back by means of a leather strap, so that M had barely enough movement to lean her head sideways to right or left. P examined R’s knots and passed them after pulling two tighter; she also examined M’s wrists and ankles for double-jointedness to see if she could in any way slip through the loops, but found this quite impossible. The neck collar was padlocked into position by R, who pocketed the key.

The circle was formed as follows, naming from left to right of the medium: R close up to M and in control of her left hand by holding when considered necessary; Mrs. L; C; P; Mr. D next
open door of cabinet on right. Mr. L sat just outside the circle between D and P. P kept her foot on D's all the time. Old Mrs. Stinson sat apart through (1) and (2) only, well outside circle to left.

Before beginning, all the apparatus was examined carefully. The Victrola (gramophone), rheostat and red light were in the positions mentioned in published works of these séances. The cabinet, however, was a newer one, and was placed about middle of that side of the room opposite the red light and Victrola, the medium facing the door, which was a strongly-made new one with a lock not penetrating through to the outside, so that it could only be opened or shut from within.

Inside the cabinet on right side was fixed a maximum and minimum thermometer, which C set, before the séance, by means of a small magnet; the temperature was read as 72° Fahr. and was found to have risen only slightly after the séance.

At the start, the Victrola was turned on to play softly a new negro melody record by Judge Hill; by means of an electric device, the needle switches back to the beginning when the record is done, so that the music is kept up all the time.

Lights out. M in trance, verified by red light at intervals. Almost at once "Walter's" voice (W) came through as a hoarse whisper, "Hello, hello," with occasional whistles, and soon began to talk freely and wittily, mostly from rather high up inside cabinet to right. W referred to R as the "insect man" and "bugologist." He whistled part of the tune in time with the Victrola.

1. Letters and Basket Experiment.

A flower basket with a high wicker handle was used, having three bars of luminous paint on handle and dabs on the sides. Outside cabinet behind R's chair was placed a large box containing some fifty or more letters and figures carved in wood, 3 or 4 inches long. In the dark, R was told first to pick out as many of these as he cared to, without feeling them enough to recognise (this to rule out telepathy) and to drop them into the flower basket; this he then placed in front of the medium on a cross-board fitted into the open front of the cabinet. Walter said he would name them as desired. R then asked him to pick out one and name it. W rocked the basket to and fro gently, whistling to himself all the time; finally the basket tipped over towards the medium and we could hear one of the wooden numbers being fumbled with and extracted. W then said "Here is one of them; it's a K. I will throw it at the lady." He at once threw one block so that it
hit P’s feet in the dark. P felt for it, picked it up in the dark, felt it all over and announced that it was a K all right.

W then took out a second block and said it was an 8. This was thrown as before to P, who picked it up in the dark and verified that it was an 8. The third block was announced by Walter to be an E and was thrown as before, P verifying it as correct.

When the K was thrown and verified, C said to P in explanation, “Now you see, Mrs. Tillyard, there are three points about that K,” whereupon W broke in with a chuckle, “No, there aren’t; there are four points about a K, ha ha!”

For the remaining two blocks, R asked that they be determined and thrown out together. W said they were a 4 and a Y and then threw them out together, but they did not fall as far out of the cabinet as the single ones. P felt for and picked up both and verified that W was correct.

W then said that the “bugologist and the lady” might put into the basket any objects they liked and he would tell them what they were. R took out of his pocket a pair of curved entomological forceps in a small green baize cloth holder, and placed it in the basket. P took off a heavy silver and amethyst brooch. W first extracted the forceps and stated that they were “a sort of tweezers,” and threw them out on the floor. R then asked whether there was anything else to note about them, and W at once said “Yes, they are covered with cloth.” He then tossed P’s article out saying that it was a large brooch.

When R remarked to W that he used a considerable amount of force in throwing the articles out, he replied, “Yes, force, not oatmeal,” causing a good deal of laughter.

2. Levitation of Basket and Luminous Doughnut.

For this experiment the same luminous basket was used, and, in addition, the “luminous doughnut,” which was simply a large ring of thick paper cut out into the form of a doughnut, 4 inches in diameter, and covered all over with luminous paint.

First of all, the basket alone was used. R placed it on the shelf in front of cabinet. W rocked the basket about, singing gently to it “Hush a bye, baby” and also whistled very sweetly and clearly. He then turned the basket on its side with handle towards M and dragged it across shelf. Finally he lifted it off the shelf and it floated and waved about high up in the cabinet, twisting, turning and gyrating in all directions. After a while it was returned to shelf and light was called for.
In red light, R was handed the doughnut and told to put it in the basket and place both on the floor. With lights out, W then rocked and pulled basket and doughnut towards medium, making a great to-do and freely swearing at the mix-up he was getting into owing to the number of wires and other things in the way. W finally got the doughnut out of the basket and it rose into the air and floated about right up at the top of the cabinet. W then said he would put the doughnut outside, and, after again freely cursing the wires in his way, he succeeded in doing this, the doughnut passing through the small wrist-hole at the right side of the cabinet; the doughnut then floated in a circle in the air outside the cabinet and fell on the floor outside.\footnote{And what is the oblique explanation of this?—J. M. B.}

After lights were on, P picked up the doughnut and tried to pass it through this wrist-hole; she found that it was too large to go through as it was wider than the aperture, but she succeeded in pushing it through by folding it up first.

3. \textit{Independent Voice Test.}

For this experiment, Dr. Mark Richardson's new apparatus was used. This consists of two parts:

(1) A mouth-piece made of glass with three holes in it all leading to a single outlet; it is so shaped that, when placed in the mouth, one hole can be covered by the upper lip, one by the lower, and a third, on an inwardly projecting part, by the tongue.

(2) A large U-tube partly filled with water and provided in each arm with a cork float about \(\frac{11}{2}\) inches long marked with luminous paint. The bore of the U-tube is such that an open end could not be stopped up by M's thumb, though a large male thumb might do it. One limb is open, the other is connected by a long rubber tube to a reservoir-bottle which in turn is connected by means of a second tube to the glass mouth-piece.

Both R and P tested this apparatus thoroughly in the light. When the glass mouth-piece is placed in position in the mouth, air can be forced into the U-tube so as to raise the float in the free end and lower that in the closed end; the tongue can then with some difficulty be placed over the end hole and the unequal position of the floats maintained with care for forty or fifty seconds. If the tongue be moved, the floats wobble up and down, and if any attempt is made to speak or move any part of the mouth, face or tongue, the floats at once revert to normal position. M with practice can hold the floats in strongly unequal position for about two minutes, but it is not easy.
With full light on and M out of trance, R placed the mouth-piece in position in M's mouth and told her to blow into it and seal the third opening with her tongue. This she did, the floats registering about a foot difference in level. Lights out. W's voice at once spoke clearly from high up on right side of cabinet, well above M's head. While the luminous floats remained constant in position, R had his right hand holding M's left and his left placed over Mrs. L's mouth; P had her right hand over C's mouth, her left over D's mouth, and Mr. L placed his mouth over P's left arm, sucking the flesh above the elbow. Thus every mouth in the room was controlled except only those of R and P.

W talked thus freely for some time, even interspersing his voice with those of the others, including M.\(^{5b}\) R then asked him to whistle, which he did with remarkable skill and clearness, in time and tune to the Victrola record. R then said "That's all very well, Walter, but I wonder whether you could speak outside the cabinet?" With startling suddenness there came a sepulchral whisper from close behind R's left ear, "Look-out or I'll get you," followed by sardonic chuckles. R nearly jumped out of his seat. As a finale, W from quite low down in the cabinet, recited in a clear, impressive voice four lines of a poem beginning—

"Live thou each day as if it were thy last."

Later on, red light and even white light was turned on but W continued to chat with all present. M being out of trance could hear him and joined in the conversation; at one point at least, her voice and W's were speaking together.

At the second séance, as an additional test, R asked W to intermingle his voice with those of all the other sitters in turn. This he did readily enough, talking while C was speaking to R, and then while each other sitter was talking, right round the circle.

At the end of the above experiments, M was carefully examined by R and P. No knots were found displaced and everything was exactly as when control began. A large pair of scissors had to be used to free M's hands and feet, all of which showed red lines from the pressure of the rubber bands. A sample of the wire and rubber was kept by R as an exhibit. The neck was freed by unlocking the padlock on the strap.

M then moved to a smaller curtained cabinet situated in position shown in published diagrams of room. M sat in a chain in red light nearly all the time; no special controls except holding

\(^{5b}\) After her release from the VCO.—J. M. B.
hands for circle; no trance. Order of circle from left:—R, D, Mrs. L, Mr. L, P, C on right of M.
A table was placed in front of the medium about a yard away.

4. Electric Bell Box.

This apparatus, by now well known, consists of a wooden box containing electric batteries and wires, and carrying above it a hinged flap held up at an angle of about 20 degrees by means of a steel spring, not coiled but merely bent. If this flap were pressed downwards with four or five ounces pressure, it makes contact with a copper process below it, and the electric bell in the box rings.

R asked W to ring the bell, which he did, several times, in red light; long rings, short rings and also continuous ringing.

R then lifted the box off the table and told W to ring the bell, which he did at once. P and other sitters also tested him in this way and he always complied.

Finally, the complex “completing the circle” experiment was made. R picked up the box and told W to ring it; this he did. While it was ringing, R carried the box right away from the table to the book-shelves nine feet or more away, turned round through 360 degrees, dodged about, lifted the box high up and low down, making sure there were no wires or threads about. He then returned and handed the box, still ringing, to D, who was next, and he went through the same performance, the bell still ringing; D passed it to the two L’s in turn and they to P, all doing the same stunts. The bell was rung all the time in good red light.

During part of this experiment the telephone bell rang and C was called away to it; W’s voice and the ringing were not affected by C’s absence. W also talked and whistled all the time that the bell was ringing.

5. Comstock’s Scales.

The bell box was removed and a specially built chemical balance designed by Comstock was placed on the table in full light in front of the medium.

R and P examined this carefully; the metal parts were made of brass, the pans of wood, and the whole apparatus was as delicate as a fairly good chemical balance should be. With empty pans, the long pointer registered zero, as it did also if the two pans were interchanged. Five wooden chequers (draughts) were provided; no trance and red light.
R was told that he could use as many chequers as he liked and place them on either balance, and W would then tilt the balance with the empty pan down. R figured that most people would put weights into the pan next them, so he put one chequer in the further pan; W at once, in red light, caused the empty pan to swing down against gravity. He did this again with white light from an electric torch on; both P and R looked and felt all around, over and under the balance and passed their hands between it and the medium, but could find nothing.

R then put on a second chequer and W repeated his performance. Finally R put on the other three, making a total weight of five chequers against nil, and still W tipped the empty scale downwards. When R did this, W said "That's gravity; now I'll show him the action of levity," and at once the empty scale was tipped downwards. W explained that he got into the pan!

In white light, a general talk and discussion with W followed, M being out of trance. W showed much animosity against Prof. X, whose name was mentioned to him.

Later on W sent two messages to X through R; but, needless to say, the latter did not deliver them when he met him the next day; they were:

"Tell him a live ghost is better than a live rat."

(This clearly referred to X's experiments with white rats which P had seen being done the day before) and (in a hoarse, sepulchral voice)—

"Tell him I'll meet him again SOON—OVER HERE."

(C explained to R that X and Y had abused their hospitality in an unpardonable way and would not be welcomed to any further séances.)

Tillyard in his London lecture has given us some account of the sort of things that were said to him in Cambridge; but other documents of a more private nature exist in which he is more explicit. There is, for instance, the indignant letter which he wrote to McDougall from his ship, after his hurried departure from Boston. There is his further correspondence with Crandon, with whom he maintains touch. Keeping his hand on the pulse of public opinion and of publication as he does, there is the manuscript which he prepared on reading McDougall's *Psycbe* article. This manuscript was offered to the British Journal of Psychical Research and to my own Journal; the former could not

---

9 See page 12, for citation and extract.
use it on account of its having been forestalled by another contribution from a different source; I held it for partial quotation in the present volume. Tillyard's experience with McDougall in particular, moreover, was not confined to Boston; he was in Europe simultaneously with McDougall, and testifies to the latter's course of action there. Thus, in a letter to Crandon under date of April 9th, 1927, he says:

McDougall has done a lot of very effective work in England, as you can tell by the changed attitude of men like Feilding. He is an expert in human psychology and plays the right card in every case. In the case of the S.P.R. he is running the "word of a gentleman" stunt, which takes the aristocratic Englishman every time. So Code is to be believed, purely on his own word of honor.

I must in conclusion of this chapter give space to one expression by Tillyard which goes into another field than that of verifying the experiences of Schiller, Bond and Miss Walker. He tells Crandon:

I am deliberately staying outside the spiritualistic movement because I want to examine these psychic phenomena purely in the light of biology. They hang together with the processes of embryology and creative evolution and must be studied as an unknown portion of biological science. Probably when the truth is known we shall find that spiritualism correctly expresses the religious as contrasted with the scientific aspect of the phenomena.

This is the statement of a thoughtful scientist, who gives thoughtful and unbiased attention to anything that occurs in his presence—no matter how far wide it may fall of his previous experience.
Margery
TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER PAGE
XLIV: The Margery Teleplasms: Observations and Generalizations........... 493
XLV: Unusual Teleplasmic Phenomena in 1926................................. 503
XLVI: Notable Sittings in 1926. Houdini’s Last Contact with the Case..... 514
XLVII: Miscellaneous Episodes of Late 1926................................. 540
XLVIII: Margery in Winnipeg,—Three Séances of December, 1926. By T. Glen Hamilton, M.D.................................................. 556
XLIX: Telekinesis of Early 1927................................................ 568
L: The Butler Apparatus....................................................... 588
LI: Five Outstanding Records of 1927...................................... 607
LII: Teleplasmic Structures and Telekinesis................................ 626
LIII: Telekinesis of Later 1927.............................................. 653
LIV: Telekinesis in 1928 and 1929......................................... 672
LV: Photographic Experiments in 1927-8.................................. 699
LVI: The McComas-Wood-Dunlap Commission and Its Report............. 715
LVII: Post-Trance Recording of Séance Cognitions...................... 749
LVIII: The Boston-Venice Cross-Correspondence........................... 763
LIX: Cross-Correspondences. Transmitted Matter Selected in Absence of All Mediums ..................................................... 777
LX: Another Cross-Correspondence with Margery’s Whereabouts Unknown. 797
LXI: The Chinese Script and Cross-Correspondences..................... 807
LXII: General Summary of Cross-Correspondences......................... 837
PREFACE.

The proposed plan of presenting as Proceedings of this Society, a complete record of the Margery Mediumship from January 1st, 1925, was worked out by J. Malcolm Bird as Research Officer of the Society. He completed the first volume of the proposed record, which was published in 1928. When Mr. Bird ceased to be Research Officer of the Society, he had prepared considerable material for publication as the second volume of the series. The work was not complete and the Society decided that the method of treatment adopted by Mr. Bird could be improved upon. Mr. Bird’s idea had been to describe all the classes of phenomena that occurred in certain periods, thus making it necessary to skip from one subject to another in what seemed to be a confusing manner. In the present volume it seemed much better to change the plan and to treat certain phases of the mediumship in full bringing those phases down to the end of 1929. This, of course, results in the omission from this volume of many classes of phenomena that have occurred during the same period, which phenomena must be discussed at some future time. It is believed, however, that the method here adopted will prove more effective and of greater interest to the reader.

During the period covered by this volume, the production of fingerprints constituted an important part of the phenomena. It had been the intention to include a full description of the fingerprint phenomena in this volume, as they have been most important and a dominant feature of the mediumship during the period in question; but recent developments in regard to the alleged similarity between the “Walter” prints and those of a living person have made it necessary to do so much work in re-classifying and re-studying these phenomena that it became advisable to omit that portion from the present volume and present it elsewhere when complete. We are glad to assure
our readers that presently it will be completed and we believe to their satisfaction. The above circumstances may, at least to a considerable extent, explain the delay in publishing this volume.

The present volume, therefore, consists largely of a discussion of telekinetic phenomena and cross-correspondences.

In the first volume Mr. Bird adopted a plan of making what he called "open references", referring thereby to references to be inserted in the first part of the second volume, directing the reader to some place therein. In examining these open references in the first volume it has become apparent that it is impractical to carry out this plan. The subjects to which many of these open references refer are omitted from this volume. In many instances what Mr. Bird had in mind in inserting his "open references" is not apparent. Therefore there is herein no attempt to fill out such references. The preparation of the material presented in this volume was done by various persons under the general editorial supervision of the Research Committee of the Board of Trustees. The authorship of one chapter is indicated in the text and credit is here given for the remainder. Chapter XLIV was written by Doctor Crandon; Chapters XLVI and LVI were written by Mr. Walton; the Cross-Correspondences chapters by Doctor Richardson and the others were written or compiled from the records by Mr. Dudley.
The Margery Teleplasms: Observations and Generalizations

When, in a mediumistic séance, objects move and the usual normal causes of such motion, such as lifting by hand, foot or head, strings, wires and levers, magnetism, electricity, wind, gravity or radioactivity, are excluded, such motion is, nevertheless, no miracle. We have only something supernormal, repeated again and again: supernormal because we cannot explain it in normal ways.

Our observation of such telekinetic phenomena in the Margery mediumship leads us to believe that they are all carried on by a material known as teleplasm. It should be noted, however, that Walter never uses this word or its older equivalent, ectoplasm. He apparently holds force and matter to be one, being thus in harmony with the very latest developments in orthodox physical theory. He appears to feel that his material and the animating force are identical. He applies to either alone, or to both in conjunction, the term energy.

Nevertheless, from the viewpoint of sensorial experience, the word teleplasm is quite essential, and it will be used without further apology. It appears that the definite physical qualities which this substance exhibits in the performance of its many phenomena depend on a greater or a lesser density, or viewed from the other angle, a greater or a lesser tenuity. Thus when a small basket rolls on a shelf in front of the Psychic and the observer passes his clasped arms through the entire zone between the Psychic and the basket, we believe that the teleplasmic rod from the Psychic's body is either so tenuous that the arm of the observer passes through it without breaking it, or that the rod by some means comes from a fourth direction. When the scales are made to balance a four-to-none load in red or white light, we have evidence ¹ of the presence of a form of

¹ M. M., Chap. XLIII.
teleplasm invisible to the eye and intangible to the finger, not seen when photographed by a glass lens but visible when photographed by a fused quartz lens. Here is apparently a psychic structure, invisible and intangible, but nevertheless emitting or reflecting an ultra-violet light. Again, when under perfect conditions of control, but in the dark, sitters receive touches by a teleplasmic terminal, we have this material in a form tangible but, presumably, invisible. Finally we observe teleplasm at the maximum density seen in this mediumship, when in good red light we see, feel, handle, weigh and take the temperature of the teleplasmic mass on the table in front of us. When the substance has this density our senses not only record it, but the glass camera lens, as well as the quartz lens confirms what we see. The varieties of teleplasm here described may be due merely to differences in density but probably the differences are much more complex in origin and development. They may be allotrope forms as distinct as those of carbon, namely: charcoal, graphite and diamond; and from this viewpoint a careful analysis of their physical characteristics is extremely important. Bird\(^2\) has suggested one way in which the various observations which are made of the teleplasm may be systematized with orthodox scientific theory; and while dissenting from some of the details of his hypothesis, it is cited here in emphasis upon our complete belief that the phenomenon is a natural one, and in no sense a miracle.

The mass which comes from the trunk, and sometimes from the ears of the Psychic, is a light brownish gray color as seen in the red light. There is a distinct variety, however, coming from the right ear which is a dead white in color, like wax, or slightly yellow: the color of noodles. Both these forms are entirely opaque.

The temperature has been taken twice by having the mass laid on a chemist's thermometer. One time it was 40° Fahrenheit and the other time 42°. The room temperature at the time was 70°.

The weight of a crude teleplasmic hand has been judged to be between four and six ounces.

The teleplasmic hand pulls against a sitter, both the sitter and the materialized hand having hold of a basket. The strength of the pull has been estimated several times as from four to seven pounds. A teleplasmic hand banging down on top of a spring-operated bath scales has recorded 36 pounds.

The mass is cold to the observer’s hand, and has a clammy feeling. After the contact is broken the sitter would declare that his hand must be wet but that is a sensation only. William Blake 3 described it as “wet with the water that wets not”. The mass is more or less like new rubber in consistency and resiliency but the rubber feeling is more than the mere action and reaction of squeezing rubber. The mass often squirms and appears to have life in itself. This liveness is further confirmed by the fact that if the sitter squeezes the mass, however gently, and quite in the dark, without announcement of the squeezing, the Psychic will groan as if hurt. At times the mass almost seems to be made up of individual fibres of live longitudinal cords about one-sixth of an inch in diameter. This is especially the case with the cords joining it to the Psychic’s organism.

If one of the crude hands is palpated deeply, we find what appear to be normal bones; in the right relation but rarely enough of them. Thus the fingers seldom present more than two phalanges; the terminal one being then missing. Finger-nails may or may not be present. At one time one finger showed as if it were a fusion of two fingers with the distal phalanges split and bearing two finger nails. All the metacarpals may be missing with the carpals present. The forearm may contain one long bone or two, as in the normal. There is generally no muscular enlargement of the upper part of the forearm. It appears to be only skin over the bone.

The gray masses that form the crude hands are attached to the body by something closely resembling an umbilical cord.

-- 1757-1827.
This cord is one-half to one and one-half inches in diameter. It appears as if twisted, as an umbilical cord frequently is. There is no pulse in it. About six inches from the edge of the table between the table and the Psychic, it frequently, but not always, has on it a kind of ruff or cuff similar to the circular metal flange which is put on the mooring-line of a ship to prevent rats from crawling aboard. The cord is of the same origin as the umbilical cord of an infant. The white masses of teleplasm overlying the Psychic’s face have cords of somewhat different character, issuing from the ear and the nose. In each case we infer that the teleplasm has been extruded from the particular anatomical orifice to which the cord attaches; but this is only inference.

The complete hand and forearm may appear three minutes after the beginning of the sitting or may not appear for half an hour. When first seen coming from the ear, for example, it looks like a waxen plug in the external orifice. After a period of five or six seconds, the light is put out for half a minute up to three minutes, and is then put on again, under instructions, and we find the mass has grown down the side of the face. The hand, now put on it in the dark, can feel it swell, push and extend itself downwards and forwards toward the mouth of the Psychic. The next view may show it partly covering the face of the Psychic and the next completely covering it. This living mass may then extend downwards in a kind of a white sheet until it reaches the table or even the floor. When it gets this size there forms, as if for better exhibition, a long proboscis having its base on the nose, divided more or less like the four legs of the Eiffel Tower. The long staff of this grows forward parallel to the floor and over this the teleplasmic sheet hangs like a tent over a ridge pole. The largest one we have seen was about 24 x 84 inches. This sheet, which Walter calls his “shining garment,” appears sometimes as a smooth uniform mass, or like coarse or fine lace. Walter declares, and close examination confirms, that the lace, however, is lace in appearance only. The sheet is more or less like the omentum on a sheep (which comes wrapped around a leg of lamb),
namely, one perfect and complete sheet, in some places translucent and in others dense and thick. This growth from the ear may be luminous in itself or may be only luminous by absorption following a white photographic flash. The actual amount of light coming from it is probably very small. It appears to be slightly bluish.

The experiments of Geley with the medium Kluski led us in the summer of 1924, in the presence of members of the Scientific American Committee, to provide molten paraffin to see what Walter could do with it. The paraffin was a zone about five inches thick, melted, on top of a zone of five inches of boiling water. It was about 212° at the beginning of the experiment and about 180° at the end. The experiment was a new one to us and the control conditions were only fair. A "swishing about" was heard in the paraffin pail. Bird was told to carry the pail across the room, and shortly he was told to look in a black cloth near where the pail now was. In it he found a paraffin glove with a narrow wrist. The next day this was poured full of plaster of Paris, the paraffin then was melted away, and the result was a cast of a hand with narrow wrist, showing normal human skin-markings, bones and other complete details of normal anatomy. It had no measurements like those of the Psychic or Dr. Crandon.4

This experiment was not repeated until 1926, at which time numerous hands and parts of hands were molded in paraffin, starting at the time of Tillyard’s visit. The control conditions were better and the results were gloves, some of them full size, some reduced in all measurements, all masculine, all right hands, none of them having a deformed index finger such as Margery’s husband has, and all of them having the same tint in the wax which the pail of wax had. Concerning the fraudulent production of the paraffin gloves, our experiences are the same as those of Geley, who says:5 "We are perfectly certain of the supernormal origin of ours, not because we judge that they cannot possibly be imitated [under any conditions], but because all

4 For full details see M. M., Chapter XLI.
5 Clairvoyance and Materialization; translated by De Brath; pp. 246 et seq.
the conditions under which they were produced leaves us no possible doubt on the facts."

Another specialized form which the teleplasm takes on is what Walter calls his "talking apparatus." The Walter voice which has been described many times is proved, apparently, by mechanical means to be independent of the normal use of the anatomy and physiology of the Psychic. But so far as we know, to form the words there must be developed a teleplasmic structure in some way similar to the living human organ used therefor. To confirm this we have many times seen and photographed a teleplasmic structure which Walter says he uses for the production of the independent voice. There is almost no similarity, however, between this structure, as we see it, and the human voice-producing mechanism. It is possible that in the dark his mechanism "flowers out" to resemble the human structures. In the light it resembles nothing human.

Walter's speaking mechanism may be described as follows: There is a mass which may be either gray or white, about 4 x 2 x 2 inches, resembling the size and shape of a potato. Its contour is irregular. At times, as we look at it, it seems to simulate a small face much like the dried heads of the head hunters of the South Seas, heads from which the bones have been removed. To the top of this structure from the right ear there is a white cord one-sixth to one-quarter of an inch in diameter, smooth. From the little mouth, as it were, of the potato-like face there comes a structure much like the human umbilical cord, one-fourth to one-half of an inch in diameter, twisted, and 8 to 12 inches long. This enters the right nostril of the Psychic. The white ear cord and the twisted cord to the nose are long enough to allow the central mass to rest on the Psychic's right shoulder or her chest or her face or her left shoulder. We have many photographs of this structure and the photographs confirm what our eyes see. (See e.g., illustrations in Vol. I, Ch. XVI.) We have handled the mass and find it like other teleplasmic masses, cold and yet vibrant with life. The fact that this structure is attached to the nose explains probably why any and every sitter is not allowed to
put a hand over the Psychic's mouth whenever he chooses, as a test of the independence of the voice. This experiment of hand over mouth of the Psychic during the Walter voice has been done many times (Comstock, Carrington, Bird, Richardson, Hill). Walter explains, however, that when he allows this experiment his voice apparatus must be detached from its usual sources of origin and attached to some other part of the body of the Psychic. This apparently is a considerable feat even for Walter, and when he does this experiment he says he can do no other the same night.

At the end of the phenomena the mass from the ear takes two to four minutes to disappear. On exposure to red light of the masses of every origin there is immediately seen a kind of shrinking as if the light were inimical to it, or similar to that of meat suddenly exposed to a very hot fire or cautery-iron.

The disappearance of the mass may be observed. It seems to go back to the orifice whence it comes. The last moment of disappearance we have been allowed to see twice. It is difficult to describe. The mass shrinks in volume, but not continuously. The last view shows considerable mass and then all at once there is nothing. It is comparable to the cloud of white water-vapor seen coming out of a factory exhaust pipe. At first a large, white, opaque, substantial-looking cloud or mass—then all at once there is nothing. The recent climbers of Mt. Everest called attention to the fact that snow at high altitudes does not go through a liquid stage when it disappears. The evaporation is direct: Solid—then gas. First there is snow—then there is nothing.

The terminals have been seen and felt and most of them photographed in many forms. The mass may be amorphous, perhaps roughly like a small French loaf or like a dirigible balloon in shape. In the second period of red light it may be shown that this mass has taken on the form of a crude hand with five fingers or sometimes with two of the five fingers fused together. Sometimes the hand is observed to have a terminal with four fingers and a thumb with all the extremities long, perhaps seven inches, coming to a sharp point, the region of
the palm shrunken; the whole hand being like a caricature of a hand, or the hand of a nightmare figure. The hand, however, may show itself in every detail of improving perfection up to what appears to be a complete hand. There may be nothing corresponding to integument. That is, the surface may look like the cross-cut surface of an animal tissue, like liver or lung. It may be covered with a thick, humpy skin like that of a toad. The finger nails, as has been said, may be absent or incomplete. The rod may be single, with a curved hook on its end, or it may be double as if a thumb and forefinger only. The shape apparently is determined by the telekinetic problem before it.

When the amorphous teleplasmic mass is developed from the lower part of the body, it is usually discovered by the sitter whose right hand controls the Psychic’s left hand. His hand discovers a large, soft, rubbery, cold, uniform mass, more or less like the after-birth of a baby, resting on the left thigh of the medium. This mass is then shortly heard to flop on the table in front of the medium. At times it is put from the thigh to the table by the left hand of the medium still held by the right hand of the observer. This motion seems to be automatic, protective or maternal. The subsequent motions of the amorphous mass or even of the crude hands are not towards the medium as if pulled by a cord, but seem to be definitely self-propelling. The motions, however, appear gradually and then stop as if the energy were, for the time, exhausted. Dingwall introduces an excellent British word to describe the motion. He says “The mass slithers along.”

A very worthy part of the privilege and duty of scientific observers is to confirm the findings of others. A matter of years after our first experiments with the teleplasmic mass, as here given, were made, De Brath’s translation of Geley’s last book describes the appearance and action of the teleplasm in a manner quite similar to ours. It is well worth quoting:

The volume of substance extruded is variable, sometimes abundant, sometimes scanty, with all intermediate grades. In a few instances it covers the medium like a mantle.

—-  

The substance may be white, grey, or black, the first being the more frequent, possibly as being more easily observed. Occasionally all three colors are visible at the same time. The visibility of the substance is variable; it occasionally is stronger or weaker. To the touch also it varies according to the form it takes at the moment, seeming soft and inelastic when widely spread, hard, knotty, and fibrous when it forms cords. Sometimes it feels like a spider’s web, but in the thread-like form it seems both stiff and elastic.

The substance is mobile. Sometimes it develops slowly, ascends and descends over the medium’s shoulders, breast, or knees with a creeping movement; sometimes its motion is very quick, appearing and disappearing in a flash. It is highly sensitive, and this sensibility is communicated to the medium, who feels painfully any touch upon the substance. If the touch is rough or prolonged, it produces a sensation in the medium comparable to a touch on raw flesh.

It is sensitive even to rays of light. A bright and unexpected light perturbs the medium, but this effect of light is also very variable; in certain cases even daylight is endured. The magnesium flash causes the medium to start violently, but the substance can stand it; this allows of instantaneous photography.

In the effects of light on the substance and its reaction on the medium, it is difficult to distinguish between what is really painful or only reflex; but whichever it be, it interferes with experimentation. For this reason cinematographic photographs have been unsuccessful, with the exception of one taken by Schrenck-Notzing. Besides its sensitiveness, the substance seems to show a kind of instinct analogous to that of the invertebrate animals. It seems to have the same kind of distrust as a defenseless animal, and protects itself by retreat into the body from which it has issued. It seems to fear being touched, and is always ready to avoid this by reabsorption.

It has a constant and immediate tendency to organize itself, and does not long remain in its primitive state. Often this organization is so rapid that its first amorphous state is scarcely seen at all; at other times the amorphous substance and more or less complete forms embedded in the mass can be seen at the same time; for instance, a finger on the fringe, or even heads and faces wrapped in the substance.

The crude formations, simulating perfection but far from it, are really of great confirmatory value. Geley puts it thus:7

These simulacra, whose metaphysic origin is indisputable (and this is a crucial point), have disconcerted and worried many observers. “One would think,” said M. de Fontenay, “that some malevolent imp was laughing at the observers.”

---

7 Loc. cit., pp. 188ff.
But these simulacra can easily be explained. They are the products of weak power using still weaker means of execution; it does what it can, and rarely succeeds, because its activity, diverted from its usual course, no longer has the certainty of action which normal biologic impulse gives to a physiological act.

During the whole time that the phenomenon of materializations lasts there is obvious physiological and psychological rapport with the medium. The physiological link is sometimes perceptible as a thin cord of substance connecting the form to the medium, much as the umbilical cord unites the embryo to its mother. Even when this link is not visible the physiological connection is close; every impression received by the teleplasm reacts on the medium, and conversely. Everything goes to show that the teleplasm is the medium herself, partially externalized.

The defects in some materializations do not imply fraud, but quite otherwise.

What, then, is the cause of these defects? Our present knowledge enables us to answer this question. Since teleplasmic formation is a function (a) of a dynamic and material externalization of the medium and (b) of ideoplastic organization of the externalized elements, it is easy to understand why perfect materializations should be few.

To build up in a few seconds an organ or an organism biologically complete—to create life—is a metapsychical feat which can but rarely produce a perfect result. That is why the great majority of materializations are incomplete, fragmentary, defective, and show lacunae in their structure.

The forms are seldom other than more or less successful attempts at hands, faces, and organisms. But in these attempts we find almost always the marks of creative power, the sign-manual of Life. In these rough forms the enigma of universal life—the relation of the Idea to Matter—is revealed in the splendor of its beauty.
CHAPTER XLV

Unusual Teleplasmic Phenomena in 1926

The first presentation of teleplasmic structures of the type hereunder consideration is described in Chapter XLI (Vol. I), which should be read in this connection.

JUNE 5, 1926: The séance began at 9:00 p.m., with the following circle: Margery, "Monty" Harwicke, Dr. Overstreet, Richardson, Newman Gray, Dudley, Hill, Mrs. Richardson, Crandon. Walter manifested after about three minutes and, after Overstreet had been introduced, said, "Light on, table out, pails in (hot paraffin and cold water pails in box frame), 'Monty' in place of Mrs. Richardson, Dr. Overstreet at the left, then close up the circle." As soon as these changes had been made and the light turned out Walter added, "I said, close up the circle. Get it as compact as possible." The chairs were brought closer together and nearer the cabinet.

Splashing was heard in the paraffin pail and Walter remarked, "My, that paraffin's hot," adding, a little later, "I was just testing it."

When asked about a remark that he made at the last séance, about the storage of energy in one of the sitters, he said, "You cannot make use of that force but it would make the holder of it feel young." Overstreet asked him how he perceived the owner of an object (presented for cognition) and Walter replied: "I perceive the vibrations much as you detect anything by smell. In coming into this life I have to put on the senses of this life much as you put on an overcoat. It is not considered pleasant work by many and they would not attempt it unless they had to. They would not do it because they are not interested as I am. I have to make special preparations for different tests if I am to see things in a physical sense, and I have to know beforehand so that I can draw from the circle the particular form of energy which will enable me to build that sense. I have to clothe myself with different energies for different things, but the teleplasm I take from the medium or mediums."

Following a talk with Overstreet about a friend of his who was ill there was an extended discussion of methods of perception and a description of what might be called the limitations of time and space from Walter’s viewpoint.

Crandon, Harwicke and Overstreet reported touches, the latter four times as with a firm object. Splashing was heard in the paraffin pail, and Walter again said that he was testing the hot
wax, then asked for red light. With the mantel light on at nearly full brilliancy everyone saw a proboscis projecting horizontally from a conical mass of white material covering most of the Psychic's face. The proboscis was cylindrical, about $\frac{3}{4}$ inch diameter, and estimated by Dudley and Hill as about 10 inches long. (Cran- don, seated at right angles to the cabinet, thought it about 18 inches long.) The light seemed to affect it for it became limp about six inches from the end and hung downward. With the light out Walter said that he could make it luminous, and at once a luminous mass seemed to detach itself from a point corresponding to the former position of the end of this proboscis, descend to the level of the Psychic's knees, change from oval to globular and back again, form an oval about 5 inches by 10 inches approximately at the level of the Psychic's head, then return to her lap. Starting from there it developed into a ribbon about 3 inches wide by 3 feet high, then collapsed. A few seconds later, in red light, the proboscis was seen as a cantilever supporting a sheet of white material about 6 to 8 inches wide (depending on the point of view) and nearly 3 feet long, with a bottom width of 2 to 2.5 inches and, at the top, approximately 1.5 inches thick. It appeared to be solid; i.e., it did not seem to be fabric-like; while the proboscis was slightly curved as though carrying a load. In the succeeding period of darkness a luminous mass was seen in the same position. This grew taller and narrower until the top appeared to be more than 6 feet above the floor, the width being from $\frac{4}{5}$ to 5 inches. While the top remained stationary the lower end developed until it reached the level of the box frame around the pails, whereupon there was a sharp rap as though the wood had been struck with a solid object.

In a subsequent period of red light the proboscis had grown about 5 inches longer, and a filmy, lace-like mass, creamy white in color, was draped over it. This was about 12 inches wide at the top and hung in folds and streamers to a length of about 30 inches.

Following the above observation in red light there was a period of darkness in which the mass (now luminous) extended to the top of the cabinet, while the lower end swayed about and approached M. Hardwicke. Hill said that it seemed very cold in the vicinity of this mass. A red-light view of the extended structure showed it as a lacy mass about 6 feet long, and in strips 2 to 3 inches wide. It gradually faded from view in the subsequent period of darkness.

In closing the circle at 10:32 p.m., Walter said that the paraffin was not very good and he was afraid he could not use it.

The controls were checked at intervals during the dark periods and were visually checked in red light. Hill checked the Crandon-Margery link once during the presentation of the luminous teleplasm in darkness.
The séance of June 6th, unlike the above, was held in part in the glass cabinet. Most of the descriptive matter given below is taken from Crandon’s record, and concurred in by Dudley. There was no expectation that visible teleplasmic phenomena would be presented in what was planned as a standardized séance. It began somewhat later than usual: at 9:25 p.m. Only that part dealing with the luminous phenomena is presented at this point.

After cognitions of articles, rocking of luminous basket on shelf, removal of shelf and levitation of the small basket (the one with luminous bands on handle), Walter asked that one wooden letter be placed in the large (non-luminous) basket and that the latter be placed on the floor of the cabinet at the Psychic’s right. Judging from the subsequent sounds this basket was levitated well up in the cabinet, then a luminous patch appeared in the vicinity of Margery’s head. This patch became longer, developed into two vertical streamers, each about 3 inches wide, which united at their upper ends and became one streamer which waved about and bent over as though dipping into the basket. The latter was faintly visible in silhouette as the end of the column passed downward, and seemed to be about on a level with the Psychic’s face. This dipping action was repeated; Walter saying that he had the basket full of energy. At times the luminous mass appeared to be about 8 inches in front of the cabinet, at others it waved about inside the cabinet, and even behind the Psychic’s body. On one of its excursions to the front of the cabinet the end reached to the floor. It finally disappeared in the region of the medium’s right knee. This part of the séance came to an end with the introduction of the VCO at about 9:50 p.m.

The sitting of July 3d was marked by the presentation of considerable masses of luminous teleplasm, the descriptions of which are taken from Crandon’s record as follows:

July 3d: In the old cabinet. Trance came on almost immediately; and before long, luminosity appeared in the region of the Psychic’s lap and then became faint. Shortly after this Hill said, ‘Walter, what are you doing to me? I feel numb from the collar bone down.’ Walter laughed at him and said, ‘I have a surprise

1 The sitters, reading clockwise as usual, were: Margery, Overstreet, Mrs. John Stewart, Crandon, ‘Monty’ Hardwicke, Mr. McCord, Edison Brown, John Stewart. Outside, in same order: J. F. Adler, Mrs. Brown, Dudley, Newman Gray, Mr. Burns.

2 The sitters in order as above were: DeWyckoff, Hill, Mr. and Mrs. Litzelmann, Mrs. DeWyckoff and Crandon.
for the Judge. I am now taking stuff out of the Judge, my material which I stored away in him some weeks ago.” Thereupon, we saw a faint glow of light, eight inches in diameter, in the region of the Judge’s abdomen which hovered about and then went over to Psyche. Later the Judge said something about sensations in the region of his navel. Whereupon, Walter said, “Yes, that is my naval base where I keep my battleships, the rest of my armor I store in the room here. That means my airplanes and guns, so don’t flash any bright light here after the sitting.”

The luminous material now developed with great rapidity, until it reached the top of the cabinet and nearly to the floor, and spread out from DeWyckoff’s side to nearly three feet in width. Walter gave us, in all, eight views of the luminous teleplasm in bright red light. It hung like lace over an 18-inch proboscis from the Psychic’s face, the Psychic’s scalp and upper half of her face being covered with dense white stuff. Walter said the proboscis is gray stuff from the Psychic, and the white lace material comes from Hill. It went six and one-half to seven feet up from the floor, and it could be seen to shrink and shrivel whenever light was turned on. At another view, not only was the mass hanging down from the face but on top of it was built a perfect cone of lace reaching from the nose up to the top of cabinet, two to three feet, shaped like the conical head-gear of women in the fourteenth century.

Walter said, “This teleplasm is like a bathrobe, a shining garment. Into this people from my side want to come through if I let them, and then the garment molds itself to fit each one’s form and becomes thus transfigured into the spirit’s image. No one can get in unless I let them. It illustrates the old Bible word ‘transfiguration.’” Every member of the circle got touches. The luminous structure could be seen approaching the person, and then the touch was reported. Many times the luminous stuff took on the form of the canopy that is shown round the faces of “extras” on psychic photographs.

The sitting of the next evening was held in the old cabinet, as was usually the case when development work was in progress. The following description is taken from Crandon’s report, as is that of the succeeding séance.

Walter came through promptly, saying, “I didn’t expect to see you folks here tonight.” Asked how he happened to be there, he replied, “Oh, I have to be around to protect you people from other visitors.”

The Psychic was now in trance, and shortly a luminous mass

---

8 The sitters were: DeWyckoff, Adler, Mrs. Brown, E. W. Brown, Mrs. DeWyckoff and Crandon.
was seen in the region of her lap. This traveled all about in stately and dignified motion, and from time to time throughout its motion Mrs. De Wyckoff had control of both Crandon’s hands and of the Psychic’s right, while De Wyckoff always had her left. Walter took a megaphone, strung a luminous doughnut on the top of it and passed it down under the table in a direction away from the cabinet, and up over the table in a complete circle three times. This had to be done either by two terminals, or by one terminal capable of penetrating the substance of the table.

**July 10th:** In the old cabinet, the Psychic went into trance shortly, and in about five minutes Walter greeted us. He said in effect that he felt that the public was now being admitted too much and to the detriment of advanced work, and begged that we give him just one year of concentrated sittings and after that the public would see such finished work as to close all argument. He said, “Have no more than one public meeting a week.”

The Judge then spoke of certain sensations in his waistcoat, and shortly thereafter the sitters saw a luminous cloud, perhaps eight inches in diameter, form at his waistcoat, detach itself, and float over to the Psychic’s lap. Thereupon, and thereafter, a great luminous cloud developed, of which we were given five views. In good red light it was a thick white, plastered all over the face with a proboscis sticking out, and from that trailed down to below the table a long, lacy extension, perhaps eight inches wide, and four feet long. Under the influence of the light we could see the proboscis wilt as if soluble in light. Occasional dips in the paraffin and waterpail could be heard, and the light kept frequently going down into the paraffin. At the end Walter said that he had wrapped his force in part around the pail containers and in part, he had restored it to the Judge as to a thermos bottle. On being told that we must empty the papier-mache pail into the galvanized pail, or else we couldn’t get the paraffin melted, he said: “Very well, then, I’ll store it somewhere else, but do not come into this room tomorrow and do not let any light into it until your next sitting three days from now.”

The sitting of July 16th presented an interesting sequence of telekinetic and visible teleplasmic phenomena, the descriptions of which are abstracted from Dudley’s report of the séance:6

The pail of hot water carrying about two inches of melted paraffin on its surface was in place in the box frame, together

---

4 The sitters in order, as above: Richardson, Signora Fidella Dinsmore Papa, Hill, Mrs. Richardson, Crandon. Outside: Dr. Zeligson, Miss Laura Crandon, Miss Carmen Matienza.

5 The sitters were: Richardson, Dudley, Russell Conant, Hill, Mrs. Richardson and Crandon. Outside: Mr. and Miss Matienza and Miss Laura Crandon.
with the pail of cold water; the box occupying the space where
the table is ordinarily placed. (See Plate No. 37.)
Margery was reported (by Crandon) as in trance very quickly,
and Walter manifested almost at once. He did not attempt any
more finger prints,7 seeming to prefer to talk on a variety of
subjects. Dudley had suggested the desirability of testing the
temperature of one of the psychic lights (which almost always seem
very cold) and Walter said that he would let the former put
a thermometer in one and see what would happen. (A maximum
and minimum thermometer was arranged in a wooden holder for
the purpose of this experiment but there has been no opportunity
to complete the test.)

Hill reported touches on the right leg, below the knee, on the
left leg in a similar place, then a firm touch on the thigh, followed
by simultaneous touches on the insides of both thighs as with
two terminals. He reported other touches below the knees. Cran­
don reported touches on the face, hand and leg, in order; Conant,
on the leg; and Richardson stated that he was touched several
times on hands and legs. Dudley noted that Richardson's left
hand moved under the pressure of one of these touches, and that
there was a sensation as though a cold body were present. Both
Hill and Richardson described these touches as giving the sensation
of a contact with a real hand. Dudley was touched on the right
knee, quite firmly, as with a terminal about 2½ inches in diameter,
with four small knobs round its edge. Richardson reported simul­
taneous touches on his left knee and right leg. While all these
touches were taking place Mrs. Richardson reported double control
of the Crandon-Margery link and of Crandon's right hand.

Hill reported that his trouser leg was being pulled, then that
his foot was lifted and placed on the edge of the box, and his
shoe lace was being untied. He added that something was moving
up inside his trouser leg, that his garter was being unfastened
and the stocking pulled down; following this with the statement
that he felt a touch on his bare leg as of a cold hand. Walter
said that he was doing all this. Hill added that his stocking was
pushed up and, after two trials, the garter was fastened. Walter
said, "You ought to get some new garters," and told him to take
his foot down. Hill admitted that the elastic was badly stretched,
that he needed new garters, and noted that the operation of
fastening this somewhat inelastic garter would seem to require
the equivalent of two hands.
The sound of splashing was heard in the paraffin pail. A little
later there were two views, in red light, of the proboscis previously
described. It grew out of a white mass on the Psychic's face,
its center about on a level of the upper lip, projected horizontally
about 18 inches, and tapered with an average diameter of approxi­

7 Imprints on glass, plastic material not having been introduced till later.
PLATE 37. BOX FRAME SUPPORTING FIBRE PAIL OF HOT WATER AND PARAFFIN, AND METAL PAIL OF COLD WATER FOR PARAFFIN GLOVE EXPERIMENTS. NOTE CLOTH SHELF AT RIGHT, ON WHICH FINISHED CASTS WERE PLACED, AND POSITION OF PSYCHIC'S CHAIR. IN SOME SEANCES THE PARAFFIN PAIL WAS AT THE PSYCHIC'S RIGHT.
mately one inch. As soon as the red light came on it drooped quickly at a point about half way from its base, much as wax would act under the influence of heat.

Walter said that he had accomplished a great deal at this sitting and asked for the next on Wednesday of the following week; adding that he wanted the chairs left as they were except that Hill and his chair should be at the medium’s left.

The sitting closed at 10:50 p.m., having lasted almost two hours. After the séance it was seen that there was a long approximately cylindrical mass of partially melted paraffin floating on the fluid wax, and that this bore a marked resemblance to the shape of the proboscis already described: as though Walter had been trying to make a paraffin mold of the structure.

The sitting of the next evening, also abstracted from Dudley’s notes, was held in the old cabinet, with the pails of melted paraffin and cold water in their box as before. 8

JULY 17, 1926: Margery was reported as in trance, and Walter manifested promptly, talking about a poem which he said that he had in process. He ragged Hill about referring to him as ‘‘It’’ (as the latter had done in conversation in the book room, but in Margery’s absence), then said that he was “going to tap Hill’s naval base for some energy,’’ and asked him to relax. Hill reported firm touches on his abdomen, over navel, and a cold, drawing sensation as though something were being pulled out. This continued at intervals until, at last, a luminous patch was seen floating about between Hill and the Psychic. This was first noted by Hill, and later by the others in the circle as it became brighter. At first it had no distinct outline, was of irregular form, and might have been 3½ by 6 inches. It changed rapidly in size and shape becoming a more brightly luminous strip about 2 inches wide and from 2 to 3 feet in length, which suddenly collapsed to form a disk about 8 or 9 inches in diameter. Taking the form of a loop it seemed to have been held at the top as on a rod, and to be elastic, so that the lower part of the loop formed a narrow oval. The circumference was about 1½ inches wide, and the whole appeared self-luminous. The loop became a strip about 3 to 4 feet in length which moved rapidly about. At times the lower end was near the floor, at others the upper end would be at the level of the top of the cabinet. As it moved from side to side it changed in width and length from moment to moment, its luminosity varying from bright to dim and back again, occasionally fading out altogether for a few seconds. It again became a luminous disk-like

8 The sitters, in order: Hill, Richardson, Dudley, Walton and Crandon. Throughout these séances Hill and Dudley compared notes as to the dimensions and form of the teleplasmic structures and were in as close agreement as would be possible considering the different angles of view.
mass which was quiescent and horizontal in the region of the Psychic's lap, while Hill reported further touches over the abdomen, and a repetition of the drawing sensation.

Again the mass became active, taking the form of a rather thick column about 18 inches high which moved about the circle near the floor with great rapidity and with a dancing motion. Passing in front of Hill it danced back and forth in front of Richardson, across in front of Dudley, and then in and out between Walton's knees, the latter reporting a firm touch on his right knee as the column came close to him. It then came close to Dudley's knees, then passed quickly to a corresponding position in front of Richardson only to move rapidly to Walton.

All these movements were made close to the observers, they could look down on this luminous column and see it clearly. There was neither sound nor odor accompanying its movement, but there was a distinct sensation of coolness as though one were in the presence of a very cold body which was absorbing heat energy, even through the clothing of the sitters.

The column returned to the vicinity of the Psychic's lap and, after a brief rest, rose in a tall, narrow column to the height of the cabinet, and at this moment Hill and Crandon reported that the cabinet moved forward about three inches.

There followed a series of transverse movements of the column, now about 4 feet long, some of which occurred with great rapidity. In a subsequent period of red light the Psychic's face was seen to be almost covered by a large mass of white teleplasm of triangular prismatic form, the long dimension of the base being horizontal, the apex about 5 to 6 inches from the nose, while the remainder hung down to the point of the chin. Projecting horizontally from the apex of this mass was a proboscis about 12 inches long, such as has already been described, on the end of which was another mass of teleplasm of irregular form, and having an average diameter of about 6 inches. This seemed rather thin and normal to the axis of the proboscis, and extended farther to the Psychic's right than to the left.

After this inspection in red light the structure appeared again in columnar form, moved back and forth in front of the cabinet, then remained motionless with the upper end approximately at the level of the top of the cabinet. Walter called for red light, which disclosed this self-luminous material as a long, lace-like mass descending from the cloth covering the top of the cabinet, broadening out into a thick mass of fine folds some 8 inches wide and curving toward the medium's right where it was draped over the proboscis, which was now rigid, about one inch in diameter and 12 to 15 inches long. It was as though the whole of the lower part of the luminous drapery had been caught up and hung on this curious rod-like structure which, in the meantime, had lost the irregular disk that had been supported, target-like on its end.
In this instance, as in some other séances, the proboscis had not been luminous but the teleplasmic drapery had been visible up to the moment the light was turned on; i.e., the observation was continuous from darkness into light.

After the light was turned out Walter asserted that the stuff which looked like veiling was actually solid (i.e., had no holes in it), and that a photograph would show it as such. He explained that we saw only a portion of the material.

The luminous mass seemed to be gradually absorbed into Hill's body and, as Crandon notes, the former had some nausea at the close of the sitting.

The data presented in the subjoined abstract are from Dudley's notes:

July 23, 1926.⁹ The box carrying the pails of hot paraffin and cold water were in place as at the last sitting. Walter spoke soon after Margery was reported as in trance, saying, "I didn't expect you tonight because of the heat." Throughout most of the sitting, which lasted from 9:00 until 10:30 p.m., Hill was reporting touches on various parts of his body. He stated, repeatedly, that he was touched on the head by a cold terminal, also on the right arm and hand, on the knees, thighs and abdomen, and during the early part of the séance he noted numerous touches on the upper part of his abdomen, saying that contact was maintained for appreciable periods. At his request he was touched by a two-pronged terminal which, as he said, had a rocking motion and seemed to have prongs more than 2 inches apart. He reported a touch at the same time that Crandon reported one on his face. The latter reported a long-continued touch like that of a wet floor-mop drawn across his face, and another that felt like a contact with a boxing glove. During several of the periods when Hill was reporting touches Hyde stated that he had double control of the Crandon-Margery link and of Crandon's right hand.

While Crandon was out of the circle fixing the phonograph Hyde controlled Margery's hands and left leg at a time when Hill reported simultaneous firm touches on his right arm and wrist.

After Crandon returned to the circle Hill's glasses (suspended on a ribbon round his neck) were removed without the ribbon touching his ears and, after about ½ minute, the ribbon was hung round Crandon's neck and then removed. At the close of the sitting the glasses were found on the cloth shelf attached to the paraffin pail.

Richardson placed his left hand on Hill's left knee and reported that he was touched by a large, round terminal.

⁹ The sitters, in order: Hill, Richardson, Dudley, Mr. F. Hyde and Crandon.
Walter said that the heat made the teleplasm sticky and asked us to listen. Everyone except Margery (who was reported as in trance) heard repeated sounds such as are made when adhesive plaster is pulled off the roll, or when a new rubber sponge is squeezed and released. It was agreed that the sound came from a point above the pails of paraffin and cold water.

During a brief interval of red light a large mass of white teleplasm was seen covering the whole upper part of the medium's face.

Near the close of the sitting Hill reported that Walter was doing something to his shirt, then said that he was touched on the abdomen. After the red light was turned on following Walter's good-night, we saw that Hill's shirt was hanging down outside his trousers in front, and he said that Walter had pulled it up and out.

During the séance of August 16th, which was supposed to be one of the standardized sort, a faintly luminous column was seen over the table in front of the old cabinet shortly after the change had been made from the glass cabinet. No further manifestations of this sort were recorded until the séance of October 1st, and this again was supposed to be a standard glass-cabinet sitting.

After the circle\textsuperscript{10} had reformed in the old cabinet the S.A. bell-box was presented and engineered by Mr. Hamlin; then Walter told Hill to relax. The latter reported a pulling sensation in the abdomen, after which a luminous cloud about 3 inches in diameter was seen in front of him, at about the level noted above. Hill had already stated that he felt a strong vibration of the gluteal muscles, and had experienced touches on the hand, thigh, abdomen and, later, on both thighs simultaneously. The light moved about rapidly in front of the Psychic, well forward of her knees and 3 to 3\(\frac{1}{2}\) feet above the floor, in an approximately oval path, then returned to Hill where it formed a mass about 6 inches in diameter which, he said, pressed on his abdomen. The luminous structure became a long narrow column in the space between Hill and the Psychic, rose and fell and swayed about, at times reaching a height of 3 to 4 feet with the upper end nearly 6 feet above the floor. The illumination increased, decreased, then increased again; finally, it disappeared altogether.

Crandon notes that the luminous pins (which had been placed in Margery's hair at the beginning of the séance) remained visible and without movement during these manifestations.

\textsuperscript{10} The arrangement of the sitters during this part of the séance was as follows: Dudley, McComas, Richardson, Hamlin, Mrs. Richardson and Crandon.
McComas asked to be touched upon his bald spot, to which Walter replied, “I could hardly touch you anywhere without touching the bald spot.” Then McComas put his face on the table and said, “Now, Walter, slap it.” To which Walter replied, “This stuff isn’t the slappy, bald-spotty kind.” Nevertheless, he touched and pressed on McComas’s head; and McComas described the terminal as soft and cool.

Aside from the fact that in several of these séances the checks on the nature of the control are excellent, a very important feature seems to be the fact that the sitters observed the structures in darkness, then continued to observe these self-luminous masses in somewhat greater detail in red light, and, in some instances, carried this observation through to a subsequent period of darkness; with ample opportunity to observe the nature of the control during the red-light periods.

It was noted that following an exposure to red light the teleplasm either became luminous or, if it had been luminous before, the luminosity showed a marked increase. Walter spoke of this as a very objectionable feature, from his point of view, although it would seem to be of considerable evidential value in the way of limiting the theoretical possibilities of normal production—if such are to be seriously entertained.

The color of this material, when self-luminous, appears to be a blue-green, but when it is very bright it approximates a light blue which is almost white; yet it seems to have very little actinic value.

There were numerous observations by the various sitters to the effect that these luminous phenomena are accompanied by low-temperature effects, but this does not seem to be invariably the case. It seems unwise to attempt an explanation of the nature of these remarkable phenomena in the absence of more complete data of an instrumental sort; it is, however, apparent that they exemplify a phase of the séance-room manifestations which is deserving of a most thorough study with a view to determining both the nature of the energies involved and the method by which they are controlled.
CHAPTER XLVI.

Notable Sittings in 1926

Houdini's Last Contact with the Case

While the International Philosophical Congress was holding its sessions in September, 1926, at Harvard University, Dr. Crandon arranged a séance on September 14th in honor of Dr. Hans Driesch, Professor of Philosophy at the University of Leipsic, who was attending the Congress. Dr. Driesch, sometime President of The Society for Psychical Research (London), was familiar with the general history of the Margery mediumship and the character of the phenomena obtained. He had pronounced opinions as to proper methods of control and made numerous suggestions to improve the glass cabinet control (described in Chapter XXV) which were adopted and are described in the report of the sitting. Present at the sitting with Dr. Driesch were Dr. H. C. McComas, Dr. H. B. Alexander, Professor of Philosophy at the University of Nebraska, Dr. H. C. Longwell, Professor of Philosophy at Princeton University, Miss May C. Walker of London, Mr. E. E. Dudley and Charles S. Hill. The general conditions of control were set forth in the following paper signed by these sitters:

Boston, Sept. 14, 1926.

At the Margery sitting held this evening at 10 Lime Street the details of the control were:

(A) Search of Psychic and clothing with searched kimono by Miss Walker. Satisfactory to Miss Walker.

(B) Braided steel picture wire threaded through rubber tubing tied tightly around each wrist and ankle with several knots, plus individual knots by McComas, Alexander and Longwell.

(C) Strips of surgeon’s tape fixed longitudinally on each forearm over wire lashing.

(D) Surgical tape wound two or three times round each forearm both above and below wire lashing and over longitudinal strip.

(E) Blue pencil marks running over both tape and its juncture with skin on each forearm in several places.

514
NOTABLE SITTINGS IN 1926

(F) Cabinet thoroughly searched.

(G) Medium's hands controlled by Miss Walker who had been in charge of medium during search of cabinet.

(H) Medium with hands controlled by Miss Walker brought in and seated in cabinet.

(I) Ankles and wrists lashed into screw bolts of cabinet by McComas, Alexander and Longwell.

(J) Head controlled by padlocked dog-collar fastened to rear of cabinet; locked by Alexander.

(K) At conclusion fastenings cut and reported as intact and in original condition.

(L) Surgical tapes removed after examination disclosed they were intact and the junction of pencil marks over junction of tape and skin exactly as originally drawn.

(M) No traces of any tampering with any control feature.

H. C. McComas
H. C. Longwell
H. B. Alexander
May C. Walker
Charles S. Hill
E. E. Dudley

Two records of the sitting were made, one by Crandon and one by Dudley. They are abstracted as follows:

Dr. Crandon's Report.

The Psychic was lashed in the glass cabinet. The voice machine was tried out by all the strangers before the sitting, and all failed to be able to talk or whistle while using it. The Psychic was searched and dressed by Miss Walker and all the lashings were by the strangers.

Walter came through promptly and greeted all the strangers. In the dark, Alexander picked out four wooden letters with thumb and forefinger, and put them in the big basket at the Psychic's right, front. Walter levitated this basket, named the letters and threw each one out as he named it, and all cognitions were correct. Personal objects were now put in the basket and all were identified correctly. One of them was called "calling card" which Walter immediately changed to "visiting card." The small basket was now put in the big basket and Walter levitated the combination as high as five feet in the cabinet and then out into the very center of the circle fully thirty inches in front of the cabinet front. He also touched with the basket the hands of Alexander and Longwell and then withdrew the baskets back into the cabinet. He next had a small luminous basket put on the shelf by Alexander and then Walter rolled it freely in red light; next this was repeated with Alexander passing his arm freely between the Psychic and the
rolling basket; next this experiment was repeated feeling above, around and below the basket and finding no normal explanation.

The Psychic's head was now released and she slowly came out of trance. The voice machine was now put into action by Alexander who took care of all the critical actions. It was blown up by the Psychic and Walter proceeded to whistle and talk freely and to recite poetry. On a second trial Walter indulged in a conversation with Longwell lasting about thirty seconds while the Psychic maintained the voice machine in disequilibrium.

The Psychic was now released from the lashings by the same persons who had made them, all lashings and controls inspected by all visitors and all agreed that they were as they had been at the beginning.

The circle now moved to the old cabinet. Here Walter rang the bell-box intermittently while it was passed about from hand to hand to all sitters, and several of them turned around while holding it. While ringing again in red light examination of the box was made in the same period of red light, and also under white flash light, with negative findings. When the flapper was restored to its normal position, still during the same period of red light, it did not resume its ringing, showing that Walter's energy had been removed.

Then followed a period of questions and answers between sitters and Walter. One of the sitters seemed to feel that Walter jested too much and we got the impression that Walter's extremely good nature was somewhat dampened by the questions of a highly technical philosophic character concerning the time concept which were put to him.

**DUDLEY’S REPORT.**

The circle for the glass-cabinet portion of the séance, reading from Margery’s left, was composed of Alexander, Longwell, Cran- don, McComas, Miss May Walker, Hill. Dudley sat behind the circle between McComas and Miss Walker. The wooden letters identified by Walter were Y, Z, U, and Q. Miss Walker asked Walter for a “W,” whereupon the latter explained that there wasn’t one in the basket and he (Walter) didn’t select them. When the basket was passed for articles to be cognized, and had been put in the cabinet, Walter audibly wondered what Dudley had put in (he had not contributed this evening); then, referring to an article the latter had put in at a recent sitting, said: “Wasn’t that a gauge?” Dudley: “Yes.” Walter: “A screw gauge?” Dudley: “No. Do you want it again?” Walter: “No, I don’t, but I’ll get it yet!” (This was a most interesting experiment in connection with Walter’s ability to recognize small tools which he might have seen or handled but which Margery would not be likely to recognize. He entered into the game with great enthusiasm and, as will be shown in the next séance, made a direct hit on an unusual
tool.) Walter identified a fountain pen, calling card, key, and a ticket. Someone asked (of the ticket): "Where to?" Walter: "Ticket to nowhere." McComas, trying to trip Walter on the account of a previous encounter, asked, "Are you going to hit me on the head again?" Walter: "I didn't hit you on the head. That wasn't the place." McComas then spoke of Walter having hit Wood on the head after having said that he was going to touch wood, to which the latter replied: "I didn't hit Wood, that was Dunlap...."

In connection with the levitations of the baskets I find a slight addition in my record in that, after the levitation, the small, luminous basket was dropped in the back of the cabinet, and Walter asked McComas to go in and get it. The latter found this impossible and suggested Longwell in his place (for reasons of lateral displacement), but Walter countered with the suggestion that McComas stand up and put his hand behind Psychic's right side, behind her head. McComas did so, and while feeling around in this locality, reported that he heard Walter's voice coming from behind and to the right of Margery. McComas did not find anything and, withdrawing slightly, asked Walter what it was that he was supposed to find. Walter replied: "The big basket." McComas again felt around in the cabinet and was again unsuccessful; so Walter told him that the basket was behind the chair, near the side of the cabinet. On the third attempt, just as McComas's hand touched the basket (as he said) it fell to the floor of the cabinet, causing him to remark, "It must have been balanced there." Walter: "There is nothing to balance it on. I was holding it!" (It is true that there was no projection which would serve as a suitable support.) McComas then said that he had checked the position of Psychic's hands, and had heard a voice in the cabinet which was not hers.

After the V-C-O test, and resumption of the sitting in the old cabinet the circle was formed as follows: Margery, Hill, McComas, Alexander, Longwell, Miss Walker, and Crandon. Dudley outside, behind Longwell. The writer finds that his record of the tapes applied over the wire ties of the wrists, shows that in addition to the longitudinal tapes, circumferential bands were added above and below the wire ties, thus holding the latter securely in place.

The second sitting for members of the Philosophical Congress was held on September 15th, primarily for Dr. Driesch, with Dr. H. A. Overstreet (Professor of Philosophy in the College of the City of New York), who came with McComas, and Dr. Hyde (a lady who is Professor of Psychology in the University of Nebraska) as another new sitter. With Dr.
Driesch came Dr. Helmuth von Glasenapp (Professor of Sanskrit, University of Berlin).

Margery and her clothing were searched by Miss Walker and Dr. Hyde, before and after the séance, with negative results. The wire ties were applied under the supervision of Miss Hyde, Miss Walker, and Drs. Driesch, Overstreet, von Glasenapp, and McComas. An additional feature of control is noted in the following report by Crandon.

The first part of the sitting, held in the glass cabinet, was so arranged that the sitters formed two rows, the inner circle comprising Margery, Driesch, Miss Hyde, Crandon, Miss Walker, von Glasenapp, and Overstreet. Behind them were Richardson, McComas, Hill, Dudley and Mrs. Richardson, maintaining tactual control except as to the right and left hands of Dr. and Mrs. Richardson, respectively, and well outside the zone of the phenomena. From Crandon’s report we find that:

I. After the wire lashings were put on the wrists they were fastened, in addition, to the wrists by surgeon’s tape, and blue pencil marks were made in all directions crossing from tape to skin and making it impossible to remove the control and restore it to the same place.

II. On the suggestion of Driesch and in imitation of the technique used by Schrenck-Notzing, a large number of pins with luminous heads were put along the principal lines of the Psychic’s garment, thus showing the outline of her body at all times. All the controls were applied and fastened by the strangers and they all agreed that the Psychic’s conscious or unconscious performance of the physical phenomena was ruled out before we started.

Walter came through promptly and entertained us all with facetious remarks concerning the disappointment of certain pious sitters when they learned that there are no streets of gold, no wings, and no harps on the other side; and he made a few general jokes concerning Alexander, who sat last night. The following phenomena then appeared:

(1) Correct cognition of wooden letters picked out in the dark by Driesch with thumb and forefinger, and put in the basket on the floor at the Psychic's right front. Telepathy thus excluded.

(2) Levitation of small luminous basket within big basket as high as five feet, well above the Psychic’s head and then out at least thirty inches in front of the front of the cabinet.

(3) Cognition of personal objects put in the basket by the sitters.
NOTABLE SITTINGS IN 1926

(4) Rolling of the luminous small basket on the shelf in front of the Psychic in good red light. This was repeated while Driesch waved his hand between the Psychic and the rolling basket.

(5) The Voice-Cut-Out machine was set up and after examination by Driesch it was put by him into the Psychic's mouth. The lights were then put out and Crandon’s hands and mouth were put in custody of Miss Hyde. Overstreet at the same time, standing, put his hand near the open top of the U-tube, thus preventing anyone putting his hand down on it. The Psychic then blew up the luminous floats and Walter talked and whistled freely, pronouncing all kinds of hard syllables and whistling a tune as requested. Test lasted thirty seconds.

(6) The Psychic was now released from lashings; they having been declared by those who applied them as being in the state in which they were at the beginning.

(7) The circle now moved to the old cabinet and Walter rang the bell-box while Overstreet turned a complete circle holding it in his hand; next this was repeated and the box was passed through the hands of five different sitters, two of whom turned a complete circle while it was being done.

(8) At the suggestion of Driesch, double control was made, namely, Miss Hyde held Crandon’s two hands and the Psychic’s right hand; Overstreet held Hill’s hands and the Psychic’s left hand. Then Walter, under those conditions, picked one of the luminous pins out of the Psychic’s robe and we could all see it sailing through the air and in all kinds of circles, and it finally was stuck into the top of the bell-box.

(9) This experiment was now repeated beautifully.

(10) The doughnut was now levitated and we could all see Walter’s terminal across it or sticking through the hole. This appeared again and again under conditions of double control as described above.

(11) The doughnut was now put on top of the bell-box. Driesch put his nose in the doughnut and Walter, under conditions of double control, pressed on the back of Driesch’s head and made the bell ring.

(12) This was repeated for Miss Hyde.

(13) This was repeated for von Glasenapp.

(14) There was some talk and discussion with Walter and the sitting closed.

The room was searched before the sitting by all sitters who so desired. Miss Walker did this with some thoroughness.
At one stage with a luminous pin Walter spelled his name out in writing in the air.

Dudley made a supplementary report of this sitting which is abstracted as follows:
Walter identified the following wooden letters: Q, X, D, Z, in the above order. In cognizing the personal articles which were placed in the basket he referred humorously to "a handkerchief about the size of a table-cloth," and then proceeded with other articles, saying: "I've got everything from soup to nuts." One article which he attributed to me (correctly) he described as a gauge. This was correct, and he added, "A wire gauge?" Dudley: "No." Walter: "A screw gauge?" D.: "Not exactly." Walter: "A thread gauge?" D.: "Yes." Walter: "Well, you might call it a screw gauge." Dudley assented to this since some mechanics do use that term. It was, in fact, a folding gauge for screw threads, and under tactual examination could hardly be identified at all without unfolding and separating the individual elements sufficiently to note the teeth and the fact that they differ in number and size on each of the many leaves. When Walter came across a picture frame he refused to carry the experiment further, saying that the glass was loose and he was afraid of injuring the teleplasm. During the levitation of the two baskets (one inside the other) the smaller basket was removed from the larger while both were well up in the cabinet, as judged by sounds and the movement of the luminous bands on the handle of the smaller one; the latter was then levitated freely, and well out in front of the cabinet. Referring to an incident of the previous evening, when a sitter had remarked that Walter had mind but no intelligence, Walter said: "Overstreet, if you had been here the other night you would have laughed in the wrong place and spoiled it all!" Overstreet admitted that this might have happened.

The V-C-O was especially successful, and Driesch checked the apparatus before and after the test. The Psychic was then released by Dr. Hyde, who carefully checked all the controls.

In connection with paragraph (8) of the above report, Hill specified the position from which Walter should remove the luminous pin: from the breast of Margery's bath robe. The operation was performed with great deliberation.

In addition to the above experiments, the scales were put on the table near the close of the sitting, were examined in white light and loaded 1:4, by Overstreet. In a subsequent period of white light they balanced kinetically, and again, after a brief period of darkness, continued to balance while Overstreet lifted them from the table and turned toward the east, with white flash light turned on them.

The séance closed at 10:55 P.M., having lasted 1 1/2 hours.
Dr. McComas was deeply impressed with the phenomena occurring under such strict control, and remained in Boston over the week-end to undertake a venture with Houdini, who was appearing at a local Boston theater. Professor Overstreet also remained to take part in what McComas thought might be a definitive test for the mediumship. Accompanied by Dr. E. W. Brown, McComas approached Houdini on September 17th with a challenge to produce under identical conditions of control similar phenomena to those that had been obtained at the sitting for the professors. Houdini readily agreed. Immediately after the conference the following ex parte memorandum was prepared:

Sept. 17, 1926.

Memorandum of conference with Houdini at his room in the Majestic Theater.

(1) Houdini stated that he could, and would be delighted to repeat the "Margery" phenomena for a group of gentlemen to be selected by Dr. McComas of Princeton.

(2) He urged that the apparatus used be the same as that used by "Margery," and to this Dr. McComas and Dr. Brown agreed.

(3) Houdini suggested that the same committee wire "Margery" into the cabinet that later wires him, and to this Dr. Brown and Dr. McComas agreed.

(Signed) H. C. McComas.
E. W. Brown.

Inspired with a great enthusiasm to submit Margery to a control that would not only be so efficient and rigorous as to exclude every possible chance for the fraudulent production of phenomena, but serve also to test the powers of Houdini to produce like phenomena under like conditions, Dr. McComas, assisted by Dr. Overstreet, began preparations for a séance to be held on Saturday evening, September 18th. It was the frankly expressed belief of McComas that under the controls that had been devised no normal production of phenomena was possible even by so great a magician as Houdini, and that psychic research under the astute leadership of McComas was about to score a notable victory over its arch-enemy. Margery cooperated gladly and agreed to submit to any measure of control that was desired, so long as it left her able to breathe
and physically unharmed. A stenographer was obtained to make
the narrative record as complete as possible and the transcribed
account was duly signed by all the sitters. Every form of
appropriate control that experience or ingenuity could suggest
was applied, including the luminous pins that Dr. Driesch con-
sidered so important, but nevertheless a brilliant program of
phenomena followed that left the sitters completely at a loss
for any explanation other than a super-normal one. The steno-
graphic record of this outstanding séance is as follows:

The medium was searched and dressed in bloomers. Mrs. Rich-
ardson applied two-inch-wide surgical adhesive bands around her
waist, the band covering the top of her bloomers and the skin above
the bloomers, and an adhesive band around each

Search of the
Medium

leg of the bloomer in the same manner. The
wrapper was searched and a pair of shoes, not her
own, were put on her feet. Mrs. Richardson
made blue pencil, continuous lines, from the adhesive bands to her
skin, on legs and abdomen. Mrs. Richardson also attached surgical
tape to the tops of the stockings and the skin and made similar
continuous blue pencil marks. All of this was inspected by
McComas and Overstreet.

All members of circle removed coats and vests in library and
were thoroughly searched by McComas and Overstreet, this search
including collars and neckties. These gentlemen also made a com-
plete search of each other. Upon completion of the search, all sitters
joined hands and proceeded under this hand control, from the
library to the rear room on top floor.

Overstreet applied a strip of the same width surgical adhesive
tape over the slipper and cross-wise around the left ankle of the
medium, joining the same under the instep of the slipper and then
in various places covering the joint between the top of the slipper
and the stockings. Blue pencil marks in diverse directions were
made. The same course was pursued in regard to surgical tape and
pencil markings on the right foot by McComas.

McComas dictating: Dudley tied a No. 2 picture cord around
Margery’s right ankle, making first a square knot and then a surgi-
cal knot, leaving, when the limb was relaxed, only sufficient margin
for the insertion of the tip of finger. The same procedure, exactly,
was carried on with the left ankle. Dudley tied the same grade of
picture cord on Margery’s right wrist with first a square knot and
then a surgical knot, leaving as a margin, width for the insertion
of a finger tip. Same procedure was carried out with the left wrist.

McComas went over the wiring of the bell-box, examined it,
and locked it.
Overstreet inserted luminous pins in the sleeves and body of the robe of Margery and also examined the surgical fastenings on the bloomers. McComas added luminous pins to both feet.

Dudley bound the wires which controlled the wrists with surgical tape in a figure eight, completely covering the wrist band; and McComas made numerous blue-pencil lines from the tape to the wrist.

Overstreet, Dudley and McComas carefully examined the cabinet before the Psychic was led in.

Dudley dictating: The securing of the right hand in the cabinet was done by passing one of the free ends of the picture wire through the eye-bolt, the other free end being passed through from the opposite direction, the two crossed over the eye-bolt, tied with a square knot, then with a surgical knot in such manner as to allow a distance of less than three-quarters of an inch between the knot and the eye-bolt. In addition, a standard lead seal was passed over the two free ends, slipped close to the eye-bolt, and compressed with a pair of pliers.

The right foot was secured to the eye-bolt in the floor by passing the free ends of the picture wire through the eye-bolt and tying and sealing in exactly the same manner as for the right hand. The left foot was secured in exactly the same manner.

The left hand was secured to the eye-bolt on the outside of cabinet in exactly the same manner as was the right hand, sealed, and the distance from the knot over the wrist to the eye-bolt measured as less than one inch.

Overstreet attached collar to the Psychic, the distance from eye-bolt to lock being $3\frac{1}{4}$ inches. McComas dictating: The length of the cord from the collar to its attachment at rear of cabinet is $35\frac{1}{4}$ inches.

Surgeon’s plaster was passed round and round the lowest two inches of the thighs, around the knees and down the legs two inches, thus binding the knees tightly together. Blue pencil crossed the line from plaster to skin above and below.

The door to séance room was locked and key left in the door.

McComas dictating: A luminous pin was inserted in surgical tape round each wrist. I carefully explored Margery’s mouth with my forefinger, going over upper and lower gums.

Overstreet dictating: I examined her ears and hair.

During entire search and lashing, the Psychic’s skin was in a normal condition and her limbs and body relaxed.

9:45 P.M. Music started.
are two concentric segments of circle thus, and each sitter’s left leg is in front of his neighbor’s right leg. Overstreet’s right leg and hand are in contact with Mrs. Richardson. McComas’ four limbs are controlled by Richardson.

Overstreet in complete darkness picks out any four letters of wood from box, puts them in the tall basket and puts the basket in Psychic’s right front of cabinet. He picks the

**Experiment 1** letters with thumb and forefinger so that he is not able to identify any letter.

Walter spoke in about a minute and a quarter after the opening of the sitting, and whistled.

The basket is heard to crackle and hit the side of the cabinet and Walter says, “There’s an ‘E’ for you, Overstreet,” and Overstreet picks up the letter and confirms it as ‘E.’” Walter says, “Here’s an ‘X’ for McComas,” and throws it out of the cabinet. McComas found the ‘X’ on the floor behind his feet after sitting. Walter says, “Here’s an ‘N,’ come right in and find it at the Psychic’s left.” Overstreet confirms the ‘N.’

The basket is heard hitting the side of the cabinet.

Psychic went into trance within two minutes of the beginning of the séance and snores are heard from time to time.

10:01 P.M. Violent crackling noise from the region of the basket.

10:02 P.M. Basket thrown out and landed on the floor in front of the cabinet. End of Experiment 1.

Overstreet has put some personal object, known only to him, into the basket, put the basket into the Psychic’s right front of cabinet and basket rattles at once. Walter’s conversation goes on continuously. The basket rattles for about four minutes, Walter talking all the while; then the basket is thrown out and Walter says, “Overstreet put some of his clothes in, his necktie.” Overstreet confirms this. End of Experiment 2.

At this point red light is turned on. McComas examines the right hand control. Overstreet examines the Psychic’s mouth, and left hand control. The shelf is put into the cabinet by Crandon, in front of the Psychic. Overstreet now puts luminous basket, lying on its side, on the shelf, midway between front and back edges of shelf. Just before this, white flash was flashed through the cabinet in particular reference to the Psychic’s face. Nothing was observed. The shelf was moved and replaced by Overstreet in red light, and he looked at the Psychic’s mouth at the same time.

The luminous basket began to roll on the shelf. Walter called for red light. The basket rolled without falling. While it was rolling, in red light, Overstreet put his hand and

**Experiment 3** forearm between the Psychic and the rolling basket, above and below the shelf. The basket now was rolled off the shelf in darkness. While the basket was rolling, Walter was whistling and talking.
10:12 P.M. Now the shelf begins to shake and rattle. Walter was whistling all the while the shelf was rattling. Overstreet and McComas each put his hand on the Psychic’s mouth and found nothing. In white light, McComas and Overstreet felt for a period of twenty seconds at all quarters of the Psychic, searching for rods and apparatus and found nothing. The luminous basket is now placed on the floor of the cabinet, to the Psychic’s right front, and the shelf is removed by Overstreet. Walter now told Overstreet to put the small basket into the big basket and the luminous doughnut into the little basket, and the whole combination in the Psychic’s right front of cabinet. This was done.

While Walter whistled an accompaniment to the victrola, the luminous basket was heard to crackle and was seen to rise to the region of the Psychic’s lap. Violent motion and crashing of baskets is heard. Continuous talk by Walter about his baskets. The doughnut is now seen to be rising out of the bottom of the small basket and presents itself vertically. The small basket is now levitating, moving between the doughnut and the Psychic. The doughnut now follows it. The basket goes up to the height of the Psychic’s head. The doughnut moves vertically and not in tune with the basket. The two are now in the air at the level of the Psychic’s head. The basket went over her head and fell, leaving the doughnut floating in front of the Psychic, at the level of her head. At this juncture, by direction of Walter, Overstreet put his hand over the Psychic’s mouth, while the doughnut remained vertically in the air so that he could see it. The basket and the doughnut were two feet apart during their simultaneous levitation and they were not in line with each other. The doughnut at the level of the Psychic’s head, right front of cabinet, is rotating. It rotates as if held on a terminal as a wheel on an axis. Walter calls attention to this fact. McComas can see the doughnut but the other sitters cannot. In other words, Walter shows the bright side of the doughnut and then the dark side. Under instructions of Walter, McComas puts his hand in contact with the Psychic’s hand out through the right hole. Overstreet does the same on the left and also puts his other hand on the Psychic’s mouth, the doughnut remaining in the air, visible to all, at the level of the Psychic’s head. Walter is whistling. The doughnut moves all the time.

Let it be noted again that while Overstreet’s hand was over the Psychic’s mouth, the doughnut was up, in motion, and Walter was whistling or talking.

Overstreet now, in white light, went in after the basket, to get it out of the cabinet. At this time all sitters were able to see the Psychic completely.

Walter now told Overstreet to put luminous basket in big basket. Under instructions, Overstreet put the shelf in, in red
light, and then put the luminous basket on the shelf on its side. Walter then ordered it changed to standing up.

Walter tells that the shelf was in unevenly and it was so found and corrected. It, meaning the basket, was thrown on the floor. Overstreet replaced it.

Walter said, "This will be a long sitting. McComas got you into it, now let him get you out of it."

The basket is now seen to be between the Psychic’s chair and the east side of the cabinet. The basket now fell to the floor in front of the cabinet and Walter said, "Don’t touch it." Walter ordered the shelf removed by Overstreet. The basket now moves on the floor, in the center of the circle, outside the cabinet.

10:46 P.M. Cold air is felt coming from the cabinet by at least three sitters. The breeze is now felt by all but two of the sitters. Violent raps are heard on the west side of the cabinet, made by the basket.

10:49 P.M. Walter’s instructions; everyone left the room but McComas and Overstreet. Roll call was taken, Richardson guarding the doorway. The glass door of cabinet was closed and it was locked by Overstreet but before it was closed Overstreet put his hand on the Psychic’s mouth. Roll call was taken again and everybody was out but Overstreet and McComas.

The basket is knocking against the front of the cabinet, above the Psychic’s head, about 4½ feet from the floor (about the height of my chest). Walter whistles while this levitation is going on. The basket is being levitated against the left side of the cabinet, facing forward on the side of the Psychic and to the front, Walter still whistling. Now the basket is being thrown down. The door was opened and the Psychic was observed under white flashlight and experiment closed. The basket is on the floor of the east side of the cabinet. It started this experiment on the west side of the cabinet. This last note applies to the big basket and now the big basket is thrown out of the cabinet from the west side.

The voice machine was put out on the table in front of the Psychic. The floats were activated by white light. The tube was examined and blown through by Overstreet and the apparatus was put in the Psychic’s mouth by him, her mouth being free from everything as observed by all sitters to the best of their ability.

The collar was now removed from the Psychic by Overstreet and she has come out of trance. Overstreet takes charge of Crandon’s two hands and his mouth. Everyone’s mouth is controlled by his neighbor. McComas controlled open end of U-tube. The Psychic now blew up the voice machine to a difference of level of about ten inches and Walter talked, recited poetry, whistled, pronounced difficult words, repeated any word that the sitters asked.
NOTABLE SITTINGS IN 1926

Then Walter added, "Notice that the floats are slowly coming to level, which could not be done if the pipe was blocked. The Kid is leaking." The experiment lasted about thirty-two seconds, and at the end of it, in both white and red light, the Psychic seemed to have apparently nothing in the mouth and she was examined and searched by Mrs. Richardson.

The lashings were now cut by McComas and were observed by all sitters to be as they were at the beginning. All pencil marks were observed to be as originally put on.

11:17 p.m. The circle now moved to the old cabinet. Overstreet was on the left and McComas on the right of the Psychic. Trance came on at once. The circle was made but with no foot control.

11:20 p.m. The bell rang in the dark. There was no movement of the luminous pins on the Psychic's body or arms. Hand control was reported as complete, as was also hand control of Crandon.

11:30 p.m. Brown, in the red light, picked up the bell-box, walked three feet away from the table, turned 360° and the box rang intermittently several times as he was doing it. It was ringing intermittently in white light.

Overstreet, in the red light, picked the box up, walked over to the bookcase; the flap quivered, but no ringing came. He brought it back. Half a minute later, in red light, he picked up the box and it rang intermittently as he walked to books, nine feet from the Psychic, turned 360°, walked back to circle, handed the box to Smith, who handed it to Dudley, who handed it to Brown, who handed it to Richardson, and while it was ringing still, the white flashlight was played upon it ringing in Richardson's hands. Richardson now put it on the table. Nothing abnormal or supernormal was found under the flap and the flap was restored. The bell did not ring. This ringing all took place in red light, beginning and ending in the same period of red light.

McComas removed the bell-box. Brown put the scales on the table and they were seen to balance evenly. All in red light. Overstreet took charge of the checkers used as weights. Walter said his forces were getting low. He was far from home.

Sitting ended at 11:40 p.m.

Hill unlocked the door.

The wiring on both ankles was found to be intact and the taping under instep of shoes and over ankle also intact, with markings as they were originally placed on the McComas dictating same. This also applies to both wrists.

Overstreet and McComas both observed the taping was on the waist line of the Psychic's bloomers and also the tapes at the extremities of the bloomer legs and the limbs, and everything was as originally arranged. The taping above and below the knees was intact. The Psychic resumed her own shoes and the borrowed shoes were searched and found to contain nothing.
The sides and back of cabinet were examined by Overstreet and McComas and seals were found intact. The interior of the cabinet was also searched by McComas and Overstreet in the presence of Dudley, disclosing nothing of a suspicious nature.

H. C. McComas,
H. A. Overstreet,
E. W. Brown,
Charles S. Hill,
M. W. Richardson,
E. E. Dudley,
J. L. Richardson,
L. R. G. Crandon.

Following the séance, opinion among the sitters was almost unanimous that Houdini would not live up to his promise as reported by McComas, but would in some way escape from a test that all believed would, if carried out, be fatal to his pretensions. McComas alone insisted that his understanding with Houdini was so clear and explicit that it could not be evaded. On Sunday morning, however, McComas turned up at Lime Street with the following letter from Houdini which left him quite nonplussed, because it contained suggestions of procedure not previously discussed by him and was quite plainly the beginning of an escape.

Address until Sept 25th
Majestic Theatre, Boston.
Sept. 18th, 1926.

Dear Dr. McComas:

Confirming our conversation last night, so there is no misunderstanding, I will be delighted to sit in at a séance of "Margery's" but have been repeatedly told that my absence was preferable to my presence.

In view of the circumstances of which you told me—that the Crandons are willing for me to test the medium or sit in at a séance and are willing for me to test their so-called phenomena or illusions, will do so gladly. As you may not know the history of the case, I was bitterly attacked when I said that in my presence Mrs. Crandon presented nothing to prove she possessed any psychic power.

At this time I would ask that I be permitted to take three or four college professors with me. To be fair to the medium, she can do her stuff in my presence and I will go right in and duplicate them, or if you wish, I will stop her from doing anything by having her controlled properly. Or I will go into the séance room, make notes of the tests and the next day prevent her from doing any-
thing (by keeping her under proper control) and promise faithfully not to injure her in any way.

If this is your desire and if you get me the same apparatus, wires and things she uses or has used, the exact lengths and measurements, I will guarantee to duplicate everything she does under the same conditions, not stricter conditions, but the same.

One thing I would like to call your attention to—mal-observation. You might think she does certain things in a certain way and describe it to me, whereas it will be entirely different before my eyes. So I ask that everything be measured. Every test carefully spoken over before I am secured so I can prove without a shadow of a doubt that her tests are performed this way, because the lady is subtle and changes her methods like any dexterous sleight-of-hand performer or any medium I have examined. Also give me ample time to make all arrangements during my stay in Boston.

Sincerely yours,
(Signed) HOUĐINI.

P.S.—As I am in town all day Sunday and have no evening performance that will give us all of the time we want for any tests or experiments. It must be borne in mind that secret paraphernalia may have to be contrived to perform some of the tests. If so, I will explain these tests until I have time to get same made.

Upon reading Houdini’s letter Crandon wrote the following letter to McComas and received from him the following reply:

Dear Dr. McComas:

You were given an opportunity last night to witness Margery’s phenomena under your own conditions and control and before your own committee.

The letter from Mr. Houdini to you, dated Sept. 18th, which is before me, purporting to set forth his understanding of an arrangement for a séance with Margery, at which he should be present, and following which he undertakes to reproduce phenomena, etc., does not confirm in any respect our understanding of your proposal to us which was that you would make a record of last night’s séance, describing the conditions of control, etc., phenomena observed, etc., submit a copy of the record to Houdini by noon today and that he would this afternoon or evening, under the same conditions, in our séance room, in the presence of his own committee and yours reproduce the phenomena described in your record. For this purpose I was glad to admit him and his associates to our séance room, and I am of course, ready to go through with the arrangement I made with you either today or at an early date.

Yours very truly,
(Signed) L. R. G. CRANDON.
Dear Dr. Crandon:

Your letter of this morning correctly states the arrangement which I made with you in regard to Mr. Houdini and I am sure that despite his letter of the 18th, which, as you point out to me, seems to contradict it, there will be no misunderstanding between him and me, as to what I understood the arrangement to be.

I will take the matter up with him at once and communicate with you further.

Sincerely,
(Signed) H. C. McComas.

Armed with these two letters McComas and Overstreet went to Houdini's hotel and in a conference which lasted some two hours or more, explained to him fully and in minute detail the nature and extent of the control to which Margery had submitted on the previous evening, and the phenomena that had, nevertheless, occurred. Houdini then promptly declined to proceed further with the plan, and the somewhat naïve ambition of McComas to bring Houdini to book and at the same time establish the super-normal character of the Margery phenomena, went for naught.

Houdini had escaped from the academic net that had been set for him in all sincerity by the professor, but his wistful longing to enter again into the house of people whom he had publicly attacked and misrepresented so violently quite overcame him, and he angled for the privilege of once more attending further séances, as appears from the following letter of Crandon:

Sept. 23, 1926.

Mr. Harry Houdini
Majestic Theatre
Boston, Mass.
Dear Sir:

I am this morning in receipt of a registered letter from you dated Sept. 20, 1926, return receipt requested, reading as follows:

"In view of the many rumors, some not so complimentary to me, have heard that you are perfectly willing for me to attend a number of séances during my stay here in Boston. Am inquiring whether this is the truth as I hear a great many things that may be distorted. If you would permit me to come to the séances, I would be very glad to do so, after any of my performances this week."

Sept. 19th, 1926.
In answer I beg to reply as follows: On Sept. 17, 1926, Dr. Henry C. McComas of Princeton conferred with you, which conference resulted in an interchange of three letters on Sept. 17, 18 and 19. Dr. McComas desired to have you attempt to duplicate the Lime St. phenomena under the same conditions. You, thereupon, proposed that Dr. McComas and Dr. Overstreet of the College of the City of New York, in whose integrity you expressed perfect confidence, should hold a sitting with "Margery" on Saturday evening Sept. 18 under whatever conditions of control they deemed satisfactory. That by noon Sunday, Sept. 19, they should acquaint you in detail with the happenings at the séance and give you a complete description of the control, whereupon, you would on the evening of Sunday, Sept. 19, at No. 10 Lime St., Boston, enter the glass cabinet, submit to the same conditions of control, and duplicate the phenomena in every detail. That proposition from you was adopted. The séance was held on Saturday, Sept. 18 under the strictest conditions of control ever applied to any medium, in spite of which the physical phenomena were positively startling. Drs. McComas and Overstreet conveyed a complete oral report of the entire sitting with its controls to you at the Adams House at the time set by you. After a protracted delay you appeared at the Hotel and received their report. When you learned the nature and completeness of the control not only of the medium but of every person present, you flatly refused to make the attempt. I am informed by Dr. McComas that you stated that you could not suggest any more effective control than was employed at that sitting and admitted your inability to duplicate the phenomena under similar conditions without the assistance of a confederate. However, startling phenomena took place in a searched and locked glass cabinet with every person save Drs. McComas and Overstreet excluded from the séance room.

Unless you continue your custom of attacking the integrity of every one whose views do not coincide with your own, you will hardly venture to claim that either of these learned observers were confederates.

Since, in spite of every argument, you, of your own volition, refused to carry out your own proposal, the matter is at an end.

In as much as the only value which could possibly be attached to your presence at Lime Street would be because it would afford some amusement to watch your attempts to duplicate these phenomena, and since this you very wisely decline to do, there seems no other compelling reason for your coming again to Lime Street. You will please recall that we already have in our file three different records of sittings where psychic phenomena occurred each of which records bears your original autograph signature of approval. These are sufficient.

Very truly yours,

L. R. G. CRANDON, M.D.
To this letter Houdini replied as follows:

Houdini, 278 West 113th Street, N. Y.

Sept. 24, 1926.

Special Delivery
Registered, return receipt requested.
Dr. L. R. G. Crandon,
10 Lime Street, Boston.

Dear Sir:

When Dr. McComas called on me, I distinctly said in front of witness, that knowing the Crandon's method of reporting for protective purposes I want to hand you, meaning Dr. McComas, an outline of my procedure. Instead of talking things over would write, so my statements could not be garbled.

The enclosed is a copy I gave Dr. McComas and which he said he would have you read, although it was not originally intended that you should have this letter. He informed me the next day that he had given you the letter. From same you can check up my statements. At no time was I willing to come to your house alone—always wanted a number of witnesses.

Please don't use the usual tactics of waiting until I leave and then grant me permission to come to a séance. I am sending this to you special delivery, registered, and I will be at the theatre all day waiting your reply.

Sincerely yours,
(Signed) Houdini.

The incident was closed by the following letter from Crandon:

10 Lime Street,
Boston, Mass.

My Dear Houdini:

Sept. 24, 1926.
7:30 P.M.

Thanks for your note received one-half hour ago.

Sunday, Sept. 19, 1926, Professor McComas of Princeton and Professor Overstreet of the College of the City of New York were here waiting for you to keep your agreement to duplicate, in front of your own witnesses and ours, the Margery phenomena under the same conditions of control to which she always submits.

After you learned, from a two hour conversation with these two gentlemen, the detailed rigidity of the Margery control you discreetly and wisely declined to come.

1 See Houdini's letter of Sept. 18, to McComas, pages 528-9, supra.
NOTABLE SITTINGS IN 1926

If you now have changed your mind again and want to risk it, I have no doubt you can make arrangements with Dr. H. C. McComas, 109 Broadmead Street, N. J.

Sincerely,

(Signed) L. R. G. CRANDON.

Nothing further was heard from Houdini, and one of the strangest characters of his time, who devoted the last years of his brilliant and unique career to a bitter and unrelenting attack upon the genuineness of all alleged psychic phenomena, thus passed from the scene with a lost opportunity to mark his exit. He died October 31st, 1926. If the séance action described to him by two learned psychologists was the product of fraud and trickery, Houdini, creator of mysteries, super-magician, master illusionist, prestidigitateur supreme, and greatest conjuror of his time if not of all times, could surely have uncovered or duplicated the guilty technique which, on his theory, had eluded the observation of all others. If, on the other hand, the phenomena were super-normal and Houdini sincere in his announced willingness to search out the truth,¹ he might have rendered a service in establishing the facts that would have added a crown of glory to his career. Great man he was in the authentic field of his talents; but in the serious work of psychical research, to which he thought his talents called him, he must in the end be classed as a great failure, contributing little but fruitless controversy and self-advertising.

On the following evening, September 19th, a sitting was had, but not under rigid conditions, since no plans had been made for further sittings of this sort. McComas and Overstreet were present with two strangers, and much of the conversation during the latter part of the séance revolved, perforce, about the attempt of one of the new sitters to get Walter to confirm a curious, mechanistic concept of the means by which prayers are answered, and some very fixed ideas regarding the conditions surrounding a future existence. Hill controlled Margery's left hand, with Overstreet and Walton sitting next in order at his left, Crandon controlling the right hand as usual.

striking feature of this séance involves a novel test of the old (S.A.) bell-box, a test which was really initiated by Walter.

SEPTEMBER 19, 1926. Trance came on promptly and Walter spoke almost at once, saying: "What are you doing here? I thought I was going to have a night off and watch Houdini get tied up. . . . He was afraid to come. He wouldn't have liked to be tied up in that cabinet; I would have talked to him."

After some further conversation along the same lines, the bell-box (which had been placed on the table before the séance began) emitted peculiar sounds. The luminous dot in the center of the flapper was not visible to Dudley (who stood up). Walter said: "I'll show you something none of you know," and asked for the light. In red light it was seen that the contact mechanism (consisting of two boards, hinged at one end, and carrying the spring and contacts) was resting on edge on the table, at the side of the bell-box next the Psychic. 2 In a succeeding period of darkness the bell rang again, while, with the light on, the flappers were seen on top of the box but crosswise. (The connecting wires were, of course, still intact.) The bell again rang in the dark but when picked up by Overstreet in a succeeding period of red light (with the flappers dangling) it did not ring. As soon as the apparatus had been replaced on the table and the light extinguished, Walter said: "The next time, Walton pick up the box and Overstreet support the flapper." This was done in red light, and the bell rang intermittently as they turned with the box, making one revolution. White flash light was turned on the box and flapper throughout this test. When the apparatus was replaced on the table the hinged flapper was left near the end of the table next to Overstreet, and the box nearer the center of the table.

With the light out Walter asked that the flapper be turned over, and in the succeeding period of light the bell was silent; however, as soon as the flapper had been turned upside down

2 It was learned that the box had fallen to the floor since the last sitting, and it is assumed that this fall loosened the screws sufficiently to allow of removing the flapper mechanism from the box proper. I found that the screws did not project far enough to form a very secure fastening.—E. E. D.
the bell rang vigorously. The light was again extinguished and Walter asked that the flapper be again turned over. The experiment was repeated with the same results; i.e., the bell rang after the flapper was turned over. This was followed by several more repetitions with exactly the same results. Dudley, watching the operation closely, noted that the flapper did not change its position between the periods of light; that the side that was uppermost at the close of one experiment was still uppermost when the light again went on. The two boards forming this mechanism are almost exactly the same size, are of the same material; hence, are of nearly the same weight (allowing for the very small difference due to the weight of the spring attached to the board that is normally on the bottom). The separation of the two boards due to the spring seemed to be normal at the beginning and end of the experiment, showing that considerable weight must be applied to cause closure of the contacts. Taking all the facts into consideration, that could be determined by the series of observations, it seemed apparent that the operation was not produced by a normal connection. The mechanism acted as though the board that was underneath when the light went on was always the heavier one by a sufficient margin to depress the spring and close the contacts; and that this was true irrespective of which board was underneath.

As soon as Walter had finished with this test, one of the new sitters entered the lists with a series of questions for which he demanded answers. After a long and painstaking effort to satisfy the gentleman, Walter quoted from Voltaire: "To be uncertain is disagreeable; to be certain is to be ridiculous." This seemed to find its mark for the sitter answered: "How does it happen that a mere mechanic like you, Walter, got a chance to read Voltaire?" Walter replied, "Here's another,"

---

5 This incident may be regarded as a hint for future experiments under more satisfactory conditions of control. However, there was sufficient light to give good assurance against any normal attachments to the flappers, while the rotation could take place in either direction at the will of the sitter, a fact which argues strongly against the probability that any normal means were used to produce the ringing. This argument applies with far greater force to the first experiment, when Walton and Overstreet turned a complete circle, side by side, while the bell rang intermittently.
and recited some poetry which was not recorded, closing with the remark: 'That, I got digging sewers.' His voice, at this point became louder and huskier (distinctly vocal) as he added: 'You're all snobs; the street cleaner, the sewer digger or the kitchen worker may be more spiritual than the white-collared person who is so sure that he is God's representative. When, in the next life, you find yourself slipping down the sluggy sides of the cliff you may be glad of the helping hand of the more spiritual street cleaner. The domestic in your kitchen may be an old and tried soul; some of you are certainly fresh souls.' This little homily seemed to miss its mark, as judged by the conversation after the sitting, but it showed that Walter could manifest considerable emotion when the provocation was sufficient. The sitting closed at 10:15 P.M., having lasted exactly one hour.

October 3, 1926. While this sitting was for a wholly friendly group the control was made just as severe as that of the 18th. Dudley and Dr. Martin applied the wire ties to wrists and ankles and made the ties in the cabinet, Martin securing the collar. Mrs. Brown searched the Psychic and her clothing and applied the adhesive tapes as described in the earlier record. Martin examined the séance room and the cabinet with a flash lamp; he also put a number of wooden letters in a box and kept this under his control until the light was turned out, when he put the whole into the large basket and the latter in the cabinet at Margery's right. He left the cover on the box so that no one would be able to see even the top letter. As soon as Walter spoke the basket was levitated from the floor, the cover of the box was thrown out, and Walter said: 'Here is a remarkable coincidence. It wouldn't happen once in a thousand times. The first letter is the same as on the last test: a Z.' He then identified the following: Q, O, O, and commented on the tightness with which the last letter fitted the box and, while working to get it out, threw out the Z, which was shortly followed by the W. The latter was in the bottom of the box and

---

4 The circle for this part of the séance was: Margery, Martin, Mrs. Brown, Crandon, Dr. Brown, Adler, J. H. Brown, Dudley.
was an exceedingly tight fit. Martin stated that these were correctly named and were in their proper order. (Ordinarily the test is made by random choice of the letters in the dark, so that the sitter will not have any conscious knowledge of their nature. This variation is interesting even though the results might be attributed to telepathy if the method were often used.) Martin told Walter that he had put a personal article in the basket—a small piece of metal. Walter answered, “I can tell that before I get within six inches of it.” Dudley: “What kind of metal is it?” Walter: “What kind of metal is a key made of?” Dudley: “There are two kinds (ordinarily).” Walter: “Well, this is the other kind. Here, Dr. Martin, take the basket and get your key, I can’t find it.” The basket dropped to the floor and, with the red light on, Martin removed the key (a small brass key of the Yale type).

The shelf was placed in the cabinet and the small basket placed thereon. Crandon placed the shelf and Martin the basket. The latter rocked in the dark and then in the light, while Martin passed his hand and arm between the basket and the Psychic. With Walter’s consent, Dudley passed his hands and arms completely around the rocking basket, touching the top and bottom of the shelf simultaneously when passing into the cabinet, bringing the tips of the fingers together at the back of the shelf, and circumscribing the locus of the phenomenon, while the basket continued to rock without any perceptible change in rate or amplitude.

The basket and shelf were removed and Walter asked for a luminous doughnut. Crandon brought one in but Walter said it was too bright (it was sufficiently brilliant to light up the face of anyone within three feet of it). At Walter’s request, Martin put it in the large basket, and then asked to have this basket removed and replaced by the small basket with luminous bands. He levitated the small basket, dropped it, asked to have it put in large one, and then levitated both, removing the

---

5 With the exception of this incident, Crandon was not involved in the action centering about the cabinet. The placing and removal of the baskets, etc., being done by Martin or Dudley.
small one while both were in the air (as determined by the brilliant luminous doughnut in the bottom of the larger basket), and dropped the small basket to the floor. He asked Dudley to put the small basket back in the large one, and as the latter did so he noted that there was a marked resiliency in the support of the large basket. The two baskets were then levitated higher; the small one was removed to the Psychic’s lap; while the large one, as it would appear, was wedged against the side of the cabinet and the forward edge of the chair arm. The small basket was then levitated and dropped to the floor. The doughnut was removed from the large basket and held in a three-fingered terminal in such manner that it was bent to an obtuse angle along one diameter. The illumination was sufficient to show the three-part structure very clearly, the long, slender digits being about the size of a lead pencil. While thus held it was turned in all directions, and was held at the front of the cabinet while Martin checked the Psychic’s mouth.

Walter then asked for another doughnut, which was provided by Crandon. This was placed in the large basket, the whole levitated, the doughnut removed, dropping to the floor of the cabinet. Dudley replaced it in the basket, which was held out from the cabinet in a convenient position. Walter asked for the other doughnut, which was placed in the large basket, the latter levitated and the doughnut removed.

The two luminous rings were then seen in motion at the same time, sometimes in the same direction but at different rates, again in opposite directions, while Martin again checked the fact that Margery’s mouth was not involved in the operation in addition to the observation that Walter spoke from time to time while the levitations were in progress. The brighter doughnut fell to the floor near the front of the cabinet, and was moved while close to Dudley’s left foot (hence beyond the reach of Margery’s right foot). The small basket moved forcibly against Dudley’s left leg in a manner suggesting that it was being held firmly.

Walter requested that the medium be released from her bonds. Martin and Dudley checked all ties, found them exactly
as originally applied with all pencil marks unchanged, and released her from the cabinet.

The circle was reformed in the old cabinet as follows: Margery, Martin, Dudley, J. H. Brown, Adler, Mrs. E. W. Brown and Crandon. The bell-box and scales were successfully tested with Martin engineering. The former rang intermittently in white flash light, while carried about, and while on the table, but ceased ringing after it had been examined externally and the flapper replaced, thus indicating (since the separation of the contacts was normal) that there had been no tampering with the spring.\(^6\)

The flapper on this bell-box is 8 inches long, and the pressure required to close the contacts, if applied at a point one-inch from the free end of the flapper, is approximately 11 ounces (av.). These measurements were made with the spring at its normal tension: i.e., with the flappers separated to approximately their usual distance as observed by the writer during a considerable number of séances.

\(^6\)As outlined on p. 119.
CHAPTER XLVII

Miscellaneous Episodes of Late 1926

While many of the elements entering into the séances recorded below are not strictly telekinetic in character, and some others are almost wholly subjective in content, there does not seem to be any more logical place to include them than in the present chapter. Most of them were omitted from the first volume for lack of space, and may be treated somewhat more fully at this time than would have otherwise been the case.

The first séance in this group was previously overlooked and is presented here merely to complete the record. The report is by Crandon; the sitting seems to have been held in the old cabinet, as was that of the previous evening. The sitters, in addition to Margery and Crandon, were: Miss Laura Crandon, Mr. J. H. Brown, his son and daughter-in-law; a wholly friendly group who sat for one-half hour beginning at 9:30 P.M. on September 6th, 1926:

Walter came through at once but seemed surprised that we were sitting. He had a friendly talk with Brown’s son and daughter-in-law, made one or two touches, and then rang the bell-box in red light intermittently while the box was passed around among the sitters. The box was then put down, cover lifted back for examination, cover put back; then in the red light intermittent ringing was repeated again and again. Walter then rang the bell in dim red light the number of times requested by Mrs. Brown.

The scales were now brought out, and Walter balanced statically and in oscillation a four-to-one load in bright red light, while free examination in all directions was made by Brown, Jr.

In the abstracted reports given in several of the chapters on Telekinesis the reader will find brief statements as to the rolling of the small basket on the shelf in the glass cabinet. This was described at some length in pp. 401-ff, Vol. I, which records appear to cover some of the earliest presentations of this phenomenon. In the following abstract from the notes of
Bond and Dudley it is interesting to note that the area between the basket and the Psychic was completely circumscribed in two passes of Bond’s arm and hand; furthermore, the standard wire ties were supplemented by adhesive tapes at wrists and ankles, across which Bond made marks with a blue pencil, and he states that these marks were undisturbed at the close of the glass-cabinet part of the sitting.¹

October 19, 1926. Following application of wire ties and tapes as noted above, there were the usual cognitions of wooden letters which, as Bond notes were correct with the exception that Walter mistook a B for a figure 8. The large (non-luminous) basket used with the letters was then passed for articles to be cognized by Walter. The second article in the basket had a most interesting effect: Walter said: “Here is a queer little stone—like slate. There are some strange markings on it. I get curious sensations when I pick it up. I should like to study it. It has some strange vibrations. I will tell you more about this stone later. It seems to take me back a long way. Has it something to do with the roof of a building? I get the sound of bells. I don’t like them. They are so loud they confuse my thinking.” Dudley notes that Bond asked: “Can you tell me about it? I don’t know its history.” Walter: “I don’t either but I’d like to.” (Note by Bond. The stone is a piece of carved slate stone from the older church [Norman] at Glastonbury which was burned in 1184. It was dug up in recent years.)

A basket with luminous patches on the handle was laid by Bond along the surface of a movable shelf in front of the Psychic. This was rolled to and fro by Walter in the dark. The red light was turned on and the rolling motion continued. Bond was allowed to pass his right hand and arm down between the basket and the Psychic’s lap, for the whole length, and states that while his fingers explored the whole lower edge of the shelf, he encountered nothing tangible at any point. The shelf did not appear to move although the basket continued to rock. It was also noted that Bond made a similar exploration from beneath the shelf with like result.

The levitation of the luminous basket (with shelf removed) was done under excellent conditions: while the basket was held horizontally and projected about 2 feet from the front of the cabinet, Bond and Tolman checked the right and left hand ties and Tolman placed his hand over the medium’s mouth while Bond felt of the foot ties.

¹ The circle was arranged as follows: Margery, Bond, Mrs. Tolman, Crandon, Hill, Dr. Pease, Mr. Tolman. Outside, in the same order: Mrs. Hill, Richardson, and Dudley.
In the old cabinet, the bell-box was engineered by Mrs. Hill, Bond, and in turn by everyone else in the circle except Crandon, passing through eight hands and ringing intermittently for each person.

The scales were engineered by Bond, with a 1:4 load, Bond and Tolman making passes around scales, and Bond passed pencil under pans, in red light, after which he lifted the scales unit about 18 inches above the table in white light from flashlamp.

The record of October 29th, 1926, was withheld from its more appropriate place in Volume 1, with the expectation that it might better be presented in connection with several other séances which appear in a succeeding chapter, but because of the nature of the phenomena it seems more appropriate to present it here. The first part brings out a very interesting error in an identification of a specially marked playing card presented by Professor Longwell:

Longwell, in the dark, now broke the seal of a newly bought pack of cards and put one of them out, after having marked it with a pencil. He had in his pocket red and blue pencils, and did not know which he had used. In about five minutes Walter declared the card to be the six of hearts, and said that the pencil mark wasn’t clear to him because it was on the back of the card, and in the same color as the scroll work. Longwell now, therefore, marked the card with a knife and Walter described this new mark as a half moon. The second card put down was identified by Walter as the seven of diamonds, with an X mark over it in blue pencil, plus a knife marking that consisted of three holes, one each at top, bottom and side. A third card he identified as the jack of clubs. All these cognitions were perfect except that the second card was the diamond eight; but it is only fair to say that the blue pencil mark covered completely one of the pips.

The second part of the sitting was given over to an experiment which Mr. Breaker was anxious to try. His interest in the particular form of supernormal photography known as “skotographs” is well described in the Journal, March, 1927. Eight very sensitive dry plates were laid out on the table in front of Margery, in groups of four, Longwell assisting Breaker. Bird reports that Breaker had these plates developed and prints made by a commercial photographer, and that the
prints were submitted to Bird with the statement that the curious light streaks shown thereon might not be of normal causation but with no claim that they were demonstrably super-normal. As it is stated that these prints are not suited for reproduction, and since Mr. Lescarboura, to whom they were submitted, seems not to have come to any very definite decision, the experiment may be dismissed with Walter’s comment, “I don’t know whether there is anything on them. I haven’t had any experience with this sort of work and don’t know how much light to use.”

On November 9th, further experiments were made by the regular group, using dry plates of ordinary sensitiveness. While the plates were exposed, gelatin side up, on the table, a small, relatively bright and clearly defined luminous spot was seen over the table. Dudley estimated its dimensions as approximately $1\frac{3}{4} \times \frac{5}{8}$ inches, and its duration as about six seconds. This moved about quite freely, as though under control, but there were no changes in the photographic plates to indicate that they had been exposed to light. The luminous patch was bright; yet, apparently, lacked actinic power. This incident points to another and very interesting field of investigation which should not be too difficult to explore, at least, so far as concerns its outermost edges.

The sitting of November 16th was of the standardized glass-cabinet sort in which the basket was again held well out in front of the cabinet while Cathron and Gray checked the security and position of the Psychic’s hands, feet and mouth. This was followed immediately by further levitations of great freedom and scope. The V-C-O was checked by Gray and controlled by Cathron, during a successful test.

In the old cabinet an interesting incident occurred in con-

---

2 He is of the opinion that the marks are due to scratches, friction, etc., but admits that it is difficult to explain the presence of white marks on a black background unless these are negative prints. Breaker told the writer that he was going to take the plates to a commercial photographer to be developed and printed, and assured Bird that these were direct prints.

3 The data given are compiled from Dudley’s notes. The sitters, in order, were: Margery, Judge Gray, Dudley, Crandon, Mr. Johnson, Mr. Dunn, and Mr. Cathron. Outside the circle: Mrs. Ellison and Mrs. Dunn.
nection with both the bell-box and the scales. When the former was placed on the table Walter seemed to be having some difficulty with it, finally remarking, "Say, Dudley, what's the matter with the bell-box? My energy doesn't stick; it slips off." Dudley replied that he did not know that anything had been done to it. After some further delay Walter made it ring and it continued to do so intermittently while Cathron, Gray and Mrs. Dunn engineered it. When the scales were placed on the table and loaded 1:3, the east or light pan was lower than the three-weighted pan in red light. When the weights were changed, at Walter's request, to a 1:4 loading the scales showed an uneven balance, although, ordinarily, they balance evenly with such loadings. Passes were made by Cathron and Gray with the pans still in kinetic unbalance, and in white flashlight. As soon as the light was turned out Walter said, "Dudley, what did you do to the rider when you took it off?" To which the latter replied, "I did nothing to it except weigh it,\(^4\) and put it back exactly where I found it." Walter: "Something is wrong. I can't get a perfect balance any more. It used to balance exactly but since you took that rider off I can't do anything with it!" After thinking the matter over, Dudley said, "I made no physical change whatever in either the rider or the weights but I did leave the weights (wooden) in the sunlight for a few minutes when I was marking them." Walter: "That's it. The sun melted the ectoplasm and that's why I can't make them balance. I had them fixed just right to get an exact balance, and now they are way off." It was learned, after the séance, that the bell-box had been left in the back room during the morning hours, when the sun could shine on it. This is the only time that this has happened, so far as can be learned. While these comments of Walter's are not capable of scientific checking as to their accurate description of cause and effect, they may cast a little light on the reason why he prefers to have his séance equipment left in darkness.

The séances next in order are largely devoted to the sub-

\(^4\)The weights were numbered and accurately weighed, as was the rider.
jective side of the Walter personality in conjunction with the controls of another medium. Whatever the conversation lacks in evidential value may, perhaps, be compensated for by its interest in other directions and to those readers who wish to get a somewhat clearer picture of this phase of the mediumship. The apparent interaction between the two control personalities has many elements of interest, paralleling that of Chapter XXXIII, but including rather more telekinetic action than was noted in the earlier instance.

The séances referred to below revolve about the presence of the medium William Cartheuser in Lime Street, and Bird's prior contacts with him at Lily Dale, the Spiritualist center in New York. The first of these Lily Dale sittings was on August 23rd, 1925, from about 10:00 A.M. to about 1:30 P.M.; the second, on August 29th, at 7:00 P.M.—according to Bird's report. The results of these may be condensed as follows: Cartheuser's little-girl control, Elsie, apparently gave way to an entity purporting to be the Walter of the Lime Street séances, and the latter made several statements and replied to Bird's questions in a manner which was not particularly evidential of Walter, nor of anyone having original and specific information as to the events in Lime Street, while some of the remarks would indicate a complete misconception of the facts on the part of the communicator. There was more or less profanity connected with these alleged communications; its form and application being rather more indicative of an attempted impersonation of a character whose true personality was not comprehended than of a direct communication from the Lime Street Walter.

Bird notes that there was a possibility that Walter might have attempted to communicate through Cartheuser so he wrote Crandon immediately after the séance of August 23rd, stating that he had had what purported to be a visit from Walter, and asking the former to attempt to get a verification or disclaimer. When this matter was presented to Walter at the sitting of August 27th, he refused to say more than, "Tell Birdie that I will talk to him direct, when he is here." This opportunity did not present itself until October 19, 1925, the record of which
sitting was given on p. 270, with the exception of Bird’s report of his conversation with Walter, which follows:

Walter came through promptly, and after some casual conversation Bird interrogated him with reference to his alleged appearance to Bird in two sittings given by the medium William Cartheuser at Lily Dale in August (full accounts of which are found in Bird’s confidential documents pertaining to his Lily Dale trip). Walter would not deny specifically and in so many words that he had been present in Lily Dale, but all his remarks leaned strongly in the direction of a cryptic denial and it was clear to Bird and to all the other listeners that this was the purport of his responses. Through normal or supernormal means, however, he had a good deal of knowledge of these Lily Dale sittings; though Bird had been extremely careful that there should be no leak through him. Walter knew the medium’s name, and pronounced it correctly: Kar-theu'-ser, whereas any person with knowledge of German would say Kar'-toy-ser in preference to the barbarous Anglicization involved in the “correct” pronunciation. He knew the name of one of the controls as Alice, which it will be noted is phonetically similar to and stenographically identical with Elsie. He credited the bulk of the séance-room conversation to “Alice”; and it is to be noted that Bird, in his first memoranda, had tentatively and with absence of conviction attributed this major rôle to Elsie, settling upon Daisy as the free talker only after some correspondence with the other sitters. . . . (Personal comments omitted as not germane to the subject under discussion.)

Walter knew that there had been a good deal of swearing done in his name in the Lily Dale sittings. He had considerable specific knowledge of the medium’s appearance and manners: including the hare-lip and the resultant peculiarities of diction, the inferiority complex and the apparent childishness of mind. This seemed to be the extent of his actual knowledge.

It is worthy of record in addition to the above that Walter characterized the Cartheuser mediumship as Bird has characterized it in his own mind: as possessing elements of genuineness, and as of much potential importance if the rubbish could be swept away. He indicated that the telekinesis as well as the messages were to be regarded as having a basis in validity. Without actually saying so, he made it rather clear that he wished us to regard the impersonation of himself as the work of Elsie and other mischievous controls, rather than something to be charged against the medium himself; but even on this basis, he recognized the Margery book (which Cartheuser has read) as the major source of information.

Nothing further developed in connection with the above sittings, but as a result of Cartheuser’s close connection with
the work of the New York Section of the Society he came to Boston in October, 1926, and was present at the Margery séances of October 16th and 17th. The following reports are Crandon’s, but Dudley has included certain additional information covering his personal experiences and observations, which latter were made from a point in the circle almost diametrically opposite Crandon’s position. As a means of differentiating between the two parts of these reports Dudley’s interpolations will be placed in square brackets and identified in Note 6. With these explanations the reports follow in order:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, October 16th, 1926; in the old cabinet. On the table was a silver cup containing three rose-buds, on the floor on the side opposite Margery stood Cartheuser’s four-foot, three-section collapsible trumpet, unilluminated. The sitting was in darkness throughout, with hand control only.

Margery went quickly into trance and during the evening Cartheuser was in trance perhaps one-third of the time. The first physical manifestation was when everyone in the circle was tapped on the head or face with one of the roses. Walter came through shortly and said that this was done so that Cartheuser’s control could get the vibration of every sitter and get acquainted with them. Shortly after this, after a lot of merry talking with Walter, the metal trumpet was heard to move about and then apparently from its large end, at the farthest possible distance in the circle from Cartheuser, a loud whisper was heard saying, ‘‘Hello, mother. I love you mother. Preserves, preserves, preserves. Two women. Cat, C-A-T, Cat.’’ Then Walter commented, ‘‘Trust John to be around where jam is.’’ Then the same voice of John said, ‘‘My love to sister.’’ (Later Mrs. Richardson declared that the two maids had been putting up preserves recently, that the cat was always around and in the way, and that in the year when John, her son, passed over there was only one sister, two more having been born since.) A tenor voice now made an effort at singing and later a treble or falsetto voice did some singing.

[The trumpet struck Dudley lightly on the face, then, a little later striking his glasses as from the left (the side away from Cartheuser) but at such an apparent angle as to give the impression that the trumpet was pointing toward De Wyckoff, seated at Dudley’s left.5 Walter advised Dudley to remove his glasses when this incident was reported, and the latter did so. The trumpet dropped to the floor, became separated into two sections, which

5 The circle was as follows: Margery (in cabinet), Cartheuser (at her left and outside the cabinet), Hill, Dudley, DeWyckoff, Richardson, Mrs. DeWyckoff, Mrs. Richardson, and Crandon.
were subsequently used separately by two different voices, one of which talked to Hill and the other to DeWyckoff. During this part of the séance and that just preceding, Walter talked or whistled while the trumpet voices were heard. His voice and whistle did not appear to come from a point near Margery but more from outside the cabinet, well in front of it and higher in the room than is usually the case.  

Then came a voice declaring itself to be Crawford for Mr. DeWyckoff. Asked if it were "W. J.," the voice came back, "No, G. W. and I am not lost." (This seemed evidential to some degree to Mr. DeWyckoff.)

A mass of luminous teleplasm was now seen coming from Hill’s abdominal region which built up as high as six feet from the floor, at times waving about, changing in width from four to twelve inches. Speaking from the region of this column of light Walter gave a talk on hygiene addressed mostly to one of the sitters. He recommended apples, saying, "An apple a day, will keep Walter away." And then made a couplet by adding, "An onion a day’ll keep everyone away." He then prescribed a diet thus: "a bowl of mush or oatmeal for breakfast; some nice soup for luncheon; and then anything you want for supper provided you don’t eat it."

[Dudley was patted gently on the forehead, and, a little later on the left leg below the knee, followed almost instantly by a touch on the right knee which, in turn, was repeated as a series of sharp taps, as though by a soft hand. DeWychoff and Mrs. DeWychoff also reported touches on knees and lower legs.]  

The table was now moved away from Margery about three feet and everyone got touches on the head and two people were touched simultaneously at opposite sides of the circle, Walter again saying, "The visitors are going around the circle getting acquainted with your vibrations." The accuracy and precision of the touches precisely on top of head, or on cheek, or nose, should be noted. Hill’s eyeglasses were taken off with perfect dexterity. John’s voice improved as he went on talking. Many times Walter’s voice and John’s voice were heard simultaneously and the psychic light was seen by all at the same time. Again at one time there were three voices heard speaking at once: Walter’s, John’s, and a treble voice. Hill was being touched and the psychic light column was seen, all at once. Again the treble voice was heard with Walter’s whistling and at the same time the flowers were being tossed about. The luminous column or "shining garment" as Walter calls it, from time to time would go over to Hill and seem to get reinforcement.

---

6 The same footnote will be used to identify the remaining notes added by Dudley, in this and the following séance.

7 Such reports of touches, cold breezes, etc., reported by one or more persons are, necessarily, on the authority of the one reporting them.
MISCELLANEOUS EPISODES OF LATE 1926

It then would move to the very center of the circle, grow to six feet high, and the voice of Walter was heard coming always from the very top of it just as if there were a speaking head on the top of the partly materialized six-foot figure. The top of the figure was seen sometimes well above the cabinet top and nearly to the ceiling. Hill’s chair was pushed several times from behind, towards the center of the circle. He said now that he was stroked on the face as if by a hand and the hand was perfumed—not as by the rose-buds.

[Hill reported that his nose was pulled and twisted vigorously, then was pushed, very hard.]

Commenting on the meeting of ministers October 13th, Walter said, “It is their opinion that I am a spirit of low mentality,” saying this in a most affected Bostonese manner. Walter then explained that the tone of a spirit voice depended solely on the instrument (the medium) which he uses. The voice depends on the medium’s anatomy, although not in any normal way.

The sitting closed with a few more words on the care of health and Walter said: “Thou art the master of thy shape.”

October 17, 1926: Sitting in the old cabinet.

Walter came through promptly, Margery being in trance and about twenty minutes later Cartheuser went into trance and they both stayed in trance until the end of the sitting. All the sitters on the west side experienced touches, the table was moved away from Margery, and many sitters were touched with the flowers from the vase on the table. The luminous teleplasm came forth from Hill, as usual. It was very brilliant, and at least four feet in height. We then had the entirely novel experience of seeing the luminous column enclose one of the roses and carry this about, which was regarded as a marvelous demonstration. We had again the experience of the night before, of Walter talking nearly always from the upper end of this luminous garment as if his head were there but not visibly materialized. This column of luminous teleplasm moved as far as 54 inches away from either psychic.

Shortly after this a distant falsetto or child’s voice came through Cartheuser’s trumpet as far away from the psychics as possible in the circle. It gave the name of Francis which was not recognized; of Mary, then Mary Pratt which was not recognized; and then Martha concerning which nothing was said.

Walter then gave some more talk on hygiene and diet, urging us all to eat less and to be more spiritual.

---

8 The sitters were: Margery, Cartheuser, Hill, Dudley, DeWyckoff, Mrs. Richardson, Richardson, Mrs. DeWyckoff, and Crandon. Outside the circle: Dr. Brown, Mrs. K. Brown, J. H. Brown, Mrs. Frothingham, and Dr. Cobleigh.

9 See Chapter XLV.
Then Cartheuser's regular control, a child named Alice,\(^\text{10}\) came through his trumpet and talked at great length. She said that she was born in Germany, had passed over at the age of five, which was now ten years ago, and that she was a cousin of Cartheuser.

Addressed to Mrs. Brown: Alice continued in her clear treble voice, which gave no similarity to the ear to the voice of Cartheuser. He has a cleft palate and cannot speak without its peculiarity showing itself. "I get Jacobs, Jacobs, Mrs. Jacobs, towards the south from here. Did you lose your job? Ha! Ha! You treated her, gave her massage, gave her iodine." Mrs. Brown states, apropos of this: "I was a trained nurse. One of my last patients was Mrs. Jacobs, whom I do not know to be dead. I treated her at the Deaconess Hospital, which is south from here. Mrs. Jacobs used to joke with me that I was going to lose my job when I got married."

Alice then came through with: Margaret Colberg, Coldwell, Caldwell. This is the exact name of Mrs. Brown's mother wholly unknown to Cartheuser.\(^\text{11}\) Alice then continued, "Here is a man who was said to have committed suicide. He didn't. It was accidental. Tell his wife."

While this was going on Walter in the background was trying to teach us technique; he said, "Don't ask direct questions, don't concentrate on questions. Things are much more likely to come through if you don't get tense." While this was going on, the four-foot column of light, which seemed to represent Walter, was seen to assume a position as if it were an outline of a person sitting on the far edge of the table, back to Margery, and swinging its legs, a picture which Walter had promised us over six months ago, and that we now saw for the first time. We could then see this figure of light reach over forwards from the table to the floor and bring up the trumpet as if to hand it to Alice.

Another whispered voice came through the long trumpet saying, "Hello, Hello," and then began to whistle the air of the tune being played on the victrola. Here Walter broke in and said, "That's Alec! I had to let him through or there would be no peace here tonight. Now, Alec, you whistle the victrola tune and I'll whistle something else." Whereupon, Alec continued to whistle the victrola tune and Walter whistled, "Tramp, tramp, tramp, the boys are marching." "Alec" refers to Captain A. W. Cross, a former member of our circle, now deceased.\(^\text{12}\)

To J. H. Brown: Alice speaking said, "Here is Martha for you. A sweetheart." To this Mr. Brown replied, "No, my wife."

---

\(^{10}\) Both Crandon and the writer heard the name as Alice, as spoken by Walter; therefore, this name is used in these reports to identify Cartheuser's soi-disant child control of this evening although she is usually called Elsie.

\(^{11}\) The surname (Caldwell) may be obtained from M. M.

\(^{12}\) See M. M., page 14.
Alice came back quickly saying, “Isn’t that a sweetheart?” Then she said, “Here’s a little grandson for you and you have just had a letter with a proposed journey in it.” Brown confirmed the grandson deceased, and that he had just got a letter asking him to make a visit in Chicago.

The big end of the trumpet now headed over to Crandon: Alice speaking said, “Here are two for you: one is Elizabeth, Elizabeth P., Elizabeth Pillsbury, Pillsbury flour, and here is Mary, Mary Ann. Both send all their love to you.” These are the correct names of Crandon’s two grandmothers. Then to Mrs. DeWyckoff came from Alice: “Here is Sarah, no Sadie, for Minerva (evidential to Mrs. DeWyckoff).

[The column of luminous teleplasm developed in a curious manner, almost as though it was the central portion of a living figure, and floated from the vicinity of the cabinet through or across the table and out into the circle almost to DeWyckoff, who was seated exactly opposite Margery. From Dudley’s position (at DeWyckoff’s right) the column then appeared to be about 1½ inches thick and nine or ten inches wide, with its upper end approximately 5 feet from the floor. The luminous mass retreated to the cabinet, and again returned to approximately the same position; while Walter’s voice was heard as from the top of this column, saying, “I am coming. Look out, I’ll get you!” Dudley replied, “Come ahead.” The column approached to a position in front of and to the left of Dudley, distant from his left shoulder about two feet, then a hand-like grip fastened on Dudley’s hair just above the forehead and pulled it vigorously, as though a force of two or three pounds were exerted. This pull was at the proper angle to have originated at the height of the left shoulder of a tall person standing at the point indicated by the column of light. There was no slightest indication of fumbling or inaccuracy in the act of grasping the hair and no contact with the skin. This action was reported by Dudley, as the column again returned to the vicinity of the cabinet (at the east side) and became less luminous. J. H. Brown, from his position outside the circle at Dudley’s left, asked Walter to pull his hair, to which the latter replied, “You want a good deal but you are such a good fighter that I will do it.” The column again floated (no other word quite describes the effect) out to about the same position as before; Dudley’s hair was again pulled in the same way and with the same certainty as at first, then Brown’s hair was pulled, also without any sign of fumbling. Brown was leaning forward so that his head was above and approximately in line with those of Dudley and DeWyckoff. The luminous column again disappeared in the cabinet, fading gradually until it disappeared. This fading was uniform, not as though there had been a reduction in its dimensions, but merely a change in luminosity. The voice, as it came from the vicinity of the upper end of this luminous column, sounded as though it was produced in something approxi-
mating a normal vocal apparatus; it had overtones that are not usually heard in the Walter voice, whether produced with or without the use of the small fiber megaphone.

Then came interesting conversation between Alice and Walter and their voices overlapped at least fifty times during the sitting. Alice seemed to be rather pert and up to date in slang, quite different from the nervousness of Cartheuser. She used such expressions as "betcha quarter"; "hold your horses" and then speaking of somebody having died, Alice said, "she flew the coop didn't she?" Walter said to Alice, "What do I say about this bunch when I get back from a sitting?" Alice replied, "Once you said, 'That's a —— of a bunch.'" Then Walter said, "Alice, you better go home now, you're getting all tired out and you're putting my nose out of joint. Goodnight, darling." Then Alice said, "Goodnight."

During the sitting Alice would not allow anyone to stand up, saying that he scared Cartheuser, making him think something was going to be done to him, and she commented about "that man who keeps stretching his neck out, make him keep it back." This referred to Dr. Brown, who, from his place behind the circle, kept putting his head between those of Cartheuser and Hill.

Throughout this séance Dr. Brown maintained a continuous but unobtrusive contact with Cartheuser, seeking any indications that the latter might be making normal use of his vocal cords while Hill reported continuous control of the latter's left hand, and was certain that Cartheuser did not leave his chair. The voices which were heard did not present the slightest evidence of the pronounced lisping which characterizes Cartheuser's normal speech. Walter's voice, as indicated above, seemed far more like a normal male voice than at any other séance; while the séance action was marked by a greater freedom of movement on the part of the "control" than is usually the case. There was no indication that anyone was normally free in the circle; while the luminous phenomena accompanying or preceding telekinetic activities were strongly indicative of supernormal functioning.

Instead of setting the following brief reports apart in another chapter it seems desirable to include them at this point, noting that they have to do with the sittings held at various places in the United States and Canada during the vacation trip
of December, 1926. This trip was broken up by stops at many
cities where friends of the Crandons had asked them to call,
and was punctuated with several lectures.

The first stop was at Cincinnati, where a lecture was given,
A lecture was scheduled at Chicago, and a séance was given
at the home of Mr. H. H. Riddle, on December 6th, at
which some twenty-one persons were present, many of them
connected with the faculty of Chicago University. The fol­
lowing record is by Crandon, and is a condensed account of a
somewhat standardized séance marked by a great deal of
conversation by Walter. A combined report was presented by
three of the sitters, testifying to the completeness of the search
of the medium, the fact of strict control of Crandon and Margery
during certain luminous phenomena, and the freedom and exact­
ness with which Walter functioned. Crandon’s report follows:

Walter came through in good form, though the surroundings
were entirely strange. The cabinet consisted of a three-way screen,
and the control was exercised by two professors. Despite all this
and despite the critics who declare that Lime Street and the alleged
trick apparatus therein are necessary to Margery’s phenomena,
the sitting went forward with brilliant success.

Psychic lights floated about the cabinet and came out of it
toward each sitter, and not only the seven in the circle but all others
in the room saw them. The bell-box was rung intermittently in
red light, while several sitters, one after another, lifted it and
turned it around 360 degrees. It was then examined in the same
period of red light and no normal explanation discovered. A lumi­
nous paper ring or “doughnut” was put on the table and Walter’s
teleplasmic terminal was seen grasping it and then levitating it
all about, high and low in all directions. It was then put on the
floor, on the side of the table away from the Psychic, and Walter
lifted it from the floor up to three feet above the table top, all
under conditions of strict control by strangers.

Walter then made cognitions of personal objects put on the
Table by sitters, with 100 per cent success. After this Walter
opened a “forum” and answered question of sitters with his usual
wit and wisdom.

From Chicago, the Crandons proceeded to the Pacific Coast;
and one of the places where they were entertained was at the
residence of Stewart Edward White, the novelist, in Burlin-
game. Two very informal and friendly séances were given here, on December 15th and 16th. Crandon prepared a brief record covering the two occasions, which is given herewith:

Control was maintained throughout by White and Mrs. White, one on each side. Walter came through promptly and in good spirits. Great sheets of mobile teleplasm appeared waving about, at one time simulating a complete head. The mass, which was self luminous, crossed the table, touched one sitter after another, pulled the hair of each on request. A mass of it piled itself on a photograph plate placed on the table. The results of this will be reported later.

The luminous "doughnut" was levitated all about under strict conditions of control and Walter's hand could be easily seen by all, doing the trick. The doughnut then fell on the floor and there in view of all, could be seen the teleplasmic terminal picking up the luminous ring and lifting it 4½ feet from the floor to high above the table.

The Scientific American bell-box was now brought into action. In good red light, Walter rang the bell-box, with irregular intermittency, while the box was handed about the room from one sitter's hands to another's, several of them turning 360 degrees while holding it. It was then examined by all in the same period of good red light.

The sitters were keenly critical but were also intellectually honest and free. No previous convictions or philosophy of a lifetime stood in the way of obvious and well-observed facts.

Walter talked at considerable length with White. It is interesting to observe the points of contact and agreement between Walter's philosophy and that of White's "Credo."

The next stop was at Winnipeg, where Dr. Hamilton has been working with several mediums for a number of years, and getting most interesting results, some of which are referred to in Chapter XLVIII. Hamilton has an enviable reputation in the medical and surgical world, and has exhibited many of his photographs of séance-room phenomena to the members of a recent Medical Congress in Winnipeg. It was a foregone conclusion that a trip to Winnipeg meant sittings there, and three were held: on December 21st, 22d and 23d, in various premises. Hamilton was present at each and made careful records, which he has been good enough to contribute to the present volume. This chapter, which is complete in itself, follows the present one, but before closing this account it is
necessary to note the fact that a sitting was held at Niagara Falls, on December 26th, for old friends and relatives. Crandon’s memorandum is all that is available and is given below:

Walter came through promptly, greeted everyone, and then proceeded to produce a large mass of luminous teleplasm. He levitated the doughnut freely and rang the bell-box as it was carried around the room by different sitters, each turning through 360 degrees.

Hardwicke\textsuperscript{13} was present, but no attempt was made to differentiate between him and Margery as possible sources of the phenomena, and it is not recorded whether or not he became entranced. On the following evening, in Buffalo, he was not present; but the phenomena appear to have been quite as good:

Walter came through in excellent spirits and greeted us all by name. Then, besides the usual display of levitation, a great sheet of luminous teleplasm was developed four feet high by four inches wide. Then came a new phenomenon: the luminous teleplasm was piled on the table in a kind of cone near a sheet of blank paper. On the paper, now thus illuminated, could be seen a perfectly formed hand in the act of writing. The control of the hands of both the Psychic and her husband was perfect during all this period. When the sitting closed a poem of no mean quality was found, written and dedicated to Mrs. Mary Gray, whose eighty-eighth birthday was next day.

This vacation trip served to bring a change of scene to Margery and Crandon, while permitting many people to see phenomena in new surroundings. It does not appear that the difference in location was disadvantageous; on the contrary, the presence of new and interested groups seems to have acted as a stimulant. The apparent fact that not a few of the sitters in one or another of these séances had shown evidence of possessing psychic energy may have been a contributing factor in the successes which are noted.

\textsuperscript{13} See Chapters XLI, XLII.
CHAPTER XLVIII

Margery in Winnipeg
Three Séances of December, 1926
By T. Glen Hamilton, M.D.

It is safe to say, probably, that no phenomena observed for many years have excited so widespread an interest, nor provoked so much controversy as those observed in the presence of the Boston medium, Margery. As students of psychics are aware, observers of these phenomena are usually found in three divisions: first, those who declare the phenomena to be consciously fraudulent; second, those who declare them unconsciously deceptive, and third, those who consider them to be not only absolutely genuine, but also to be among the most brilliant ever recorded in the history of metapsychic science. It is with the hope of assisting those who have not as yet had the privilege of sitting with Margery, to decide to which class the phenomena belong that I present a brief report of three sittings given in Winnipeg, December 21, 22 and 23, 1926. Before proceeding to give this report, a brief résumé of my own experiences in the field of metapsychics is perhaps advisable.

My interest in this subject dates back now many years, in fact to the time when the early writings of W. T. Stead first appeared in the English Review of Reviews. Following this, for some years, I remained what might be called an interested sceptic but through reading came, gradually, to hold the opinion that here was a field demanding investigation and hoped that some day I should find both opportunities and leisure for such experimentation. The opportunities, although delayed, finally came. In 1918 and 1919, I came in contact for the first time with a number of mediums—more or less developed—who gave me the privilege of closely studying the phenomena manifesting
through their various psychic faculties; among these, automatisms, clairvoyance, thought-transference and telepathy. As the majority of these phenomena appeared to be unexplainable by the theories offered by orthodox science, my attention was increasingly directed to the literature on this subject—particularly to the books written from the more scientific point of view, such as the writings of Myers, Lodge, Barrett, Flammarion, Crawford, Schrenck-Notzing—to mention only a few of the eminent authorities in the field of research.

The outstanding event in my psychical research experience, however, occurred in May, 1921, when it was my good fortune to discover signs of incipient physical mediumship in a woman I had known for many years and whom we shall call Elizabeth M, and to be given the privilege of developing these faculties under conditions of my own choosing. Three months later, I began definite experimentation, my interest centering particularly in the physical phenomena which from the first were unusually powerful and sustained. These experiments—as already mentioned—were conducted wholly under conditions of my own choice; in my own home; in a room set apart for the purpose; with witnesses chosen largely from the members of my own and other professions; and at all times under the closest possible scrutiny and control. Under these conditions, then, the Elizabeth M mediumship was from its inception steadily progressive.

For the first two years we observed and experimented with powerful contact movements, raps, blows, non-contact movements, levitation (both with and without contact), clairvoyance. Early in 1923, the deep trance supervened, accompanied by veridical automatisms both hallucinatory and motor. A little later we were able to obtain wax impressions of a number of ectoplasmic forms (parts of fingers and toes) and even succeeded in securing a few examples of what is known as "direct writing." I may remark also, that we were enabled to secure many photographic records of these telekinetic phenomena and as well of the various phases and degrees of trance—two types of phenomena in which I have been greatly interested.
It will be seen then, that through the study of this mediumship—continuing now over a period of six years and numbering many hundreds of experiments—we have had unusual opportunities for gaining considerable knowledge of the three main types of psychical manifestations—telekinesis, ectoplasm, cryptesthesia. Needless to say their reality—to me, at any rate—is unquestionable.

The second important milestone in my study of metapsychics was my introduction in October, 1925, to the much-discussed "Margery" mediumship. I was at this time on my way to Philadelphia to attend a surgical convention, and remained over at Boston in the hope that I might obtain the privilege of attending a few sittings with this well-known medium. With that splendid hospitality which so many have enjoyed, Dr. and Mrs. Crandon invited me not only to attend a number of sittings, but also to become their guest—an invitation which I gladly accepted. Previous to this time, I had known Dr. Crandon both through his writings on surgical subjects and as a Harvard clinician, and was now indeed delighted to find in the psychic researcher as true a scientist as had been manifest in the eminent surgeon. During my stay in Boston, I attended in all eight sittings and saw, under satisfactory control, many of the brilliant phenomena associated with this medium. I witnessed, repeatedly, successful manipulations of the "doughnut," apparently by a teleplasmic terminal; I observed the intermittent ringing of the Scientific American bell-box in good red light, without any visible contact; and as well I saw and felt ectoplasmic structures which to my mind were undoubtedly of psychic origin. In addition, I was privileged to take part in a tête-à-tête test with Dr. Richardson's justly famous voice-cut-out machine, and found it to be absolutely fraud-proof and 100 per cent effective in proving the independence of the "Walter" voice. I witnessed as well a number of other successful tests with this machine. At one of these sittings, I witnessed also one of the most arresting incidents in my research experiences: a trance so profound that the medium's respira-
tions were reduced to six to the minute. To the layman, perhaps, this is of little significance but to one accustomed to watching for signs of danger in deep anesthesia, an occurrence of this nature is indeed an exceedingly alarming one. Undoubtedly this affords a very strong additional proof of the genuineness of the Margery mediumship.

This, then, very briefly reviews my somewhat unusual opportunities for metapsychic study and experimentation—a résumé which brings me now to Dr. and Mrs. Crandon’s visit to Winnipeg (which transpired during a holiday trip across the continent to the Pacific Coast and back by way of Canada) December 21 to 24, 1926.

**FIRST SITTING**

Dr. and Mrs. Crandon after five days of continuous traveling arrived in Winnipeg at 5:30 in the afternoon of December 21st, and after a short stay at their hotel came to dinner at our home where a number of guests were present to meet them. Following dinner, Mrs. Crandon consented to give a sitting and those present, seventeen exclusive of Margery and her husband, were kindly invited by Dr. Crandon to attend.

The room in which this sitting took place is situated on the second floor and has, for the past four years, been used as a laboratory for conducting experiments with the local medium, Elizabeth M. This room is about ten by twelve and has two windows and one door, the windows being closed to exclude white light by coverings of builder’s paper securely fastened to the inside window casings by wooden strips, and the door opening into a hallway in plain view of a large open stairway. The séance furnishings consist of an open wooden cabinet, a deal table (after Crawford), wooden chairs, cameras, flashlight apparatus, ventilating fan, and other equipment which need not at this time be enumerated.

Margery’s preparations for the sitting were simple but adequate. Accompanied by Mrs. Hamilton, she retired to a bedroom where she removed all her clothing, putting on a bathrobe which we supplied and replacing her stockings and slippers
after they had been carefully scrutinized. Mrs. Hamilton affirms that there was nothing concealed about Margery’s person. Margery was then escorted to the séance room which, it should be noted, she had neither seen nor entered before.

The medium having been placed in the cabinet, a circle was formed to her right as follows: Dr. Crandon, Dr. N. J. MacLean, Dr. J. A. Hamilton, Mr. E. L. Taylor, Mr. D. B. McDonald, Mrs. Cummings, Dr. T. G. Hamilton, and "Elizabeth M." The ten other persons present sat immediately behind this circle, many of them between it and the door. Among these were Mr. W. J. Cummings, Mr. and Mrs. E. R. Mullineaux, and Mrs. T. G. Hamilton. It will be seen by this arrangement that Margery’s left hand and Elizabeth M.’s two were available for control by myself and her right and Dr. Crandon’s two by Dr. MacLean. This control was established and maintained.

The lights having been turned off, and the music (gramophone) started, Margery in about three or four minutes went into trance; in about two minutes a voice which can only be described as a hoarse stage-whisper was heard issuing apparently from a position somewhere near the medium and about the level of her shoulder or slightly lower. This, of course, we knew to be the voice which purports to be that of the medium’s deceased brother—the now famous "Walter."

Dr. Crandon, after introducing "Walter" to the company, reminded him that he was now in his native country; to this Walter replied with several expressions of appreciation of the "Canucks"—as he called them—a slang term with which most Canadians are familiar. Dr. Crandon then further remarked that he understood that Walter, many years before, had been in Winnipeg and it would be interesting if he ("Walter") would tell them something of his experience at that time.

Walter at once replied: "That was a long time back—I was only eighteen at the time. I did not stop in Winnipeg but went on... O Lord! where did I go to? Minnedosa—that’s it. I was on a threshing machine; I remember that it was a good wheat country.” He went on to say that he surely
ought to go to heaven as he had worked for twenty hours out of the twenty-four, for $1.25 per day. He also asked if there wasn’t a place called Selkirk and said that he had been there for a short time.

To the Manitobans present these remarks of Walter’s were very interesting. The names of the two towns were given correctly. His statement that Minnedosa (about one hundred and thirty miles from the city) was in a good wheat country was also correct. The “old-timers,” however, were even more impressed by Walter’s apparent knowledge of the long working day which at one time (corresponding largely to the time indicated by Walter’s alleged age when he came West) frequently prevailed during the rush of the threshing season. Wages were, of course, much lower then than now and the amount mentioned by Walter would, I believe, be considered at that time a usual wage for a young and inexperienced lad. It is to be noted that Dr. and Mrs. Crandon having always lived in the East would in all probability know nothing of these localities and of the labor conditions of this time.

Walter now asked for the “doughnut”—the luminous cardboard ring—and it was placed on the table in the center of the circle. In a few moments the doughnut was lifted above the table and for some time continued to circle freely about, being carried directly in front of several of the sitter’s faces. These said they could see the dark terminal coming through the opening. Walter remarked that it had been compared to a rat’s nose. During the whole time occupied by this manifestation, I was careful to observe that Margery’s left hand, along with Elizabeth M.’s two, was under my certain control. Dr. MacLean said from time to time that his double control was also satisfactory.

The famous bell-box had been brought by the medium from Boston. Immediately before the sitting it had been carefully examined in bright light by many of those present. It was now placed on the table and the full ruby light turned on. Margery could be plainly seen sitting motionless in the cabinet
with her head resting gently to one side. Walter continued to speak at intervals. Then came the amazing proof of the presence of an independent intelligent force: Three men in turn, Dr. MacLean, Dr. J. A. Hamilton, and Mr. E. L. Taylor, took the box in their hands, rose to their feet, turned slowly a complete revolution, the bell meanwhile ringing intermittently. With the fourth to repeat the procedure, Mr. D. B. McDonald, who was farthest from the medium the bell rang only during the first part of his revolution. The ringing of the bell started and stopped in good red light.

Following this experiment the red light was turned off, and Walter continued talking. Suddenly he announced, "I'm going to keep in the background—this other medium is going into trance." This was found to be the case and shortly the writing automatism peculiar to "Elizabeth M." made its appearance.

Margery in the meantime remained in trance; Walter continued to talk and among his remarks were many witty comments on the "Elizabeth M." phenomena. These latter comments, I may say, were not only exceedingly humorous but as well were undoubtedly based on an accurate knowledge of the "E. M." trance manifestations, for he used repeatedly two nicknames occasionally applied by E. M. while in trance to two of her trance personalities—names which she did not use herself on this occasion, and which were certainly not known to either Margery or Dr. Crandon.

Following his work with the two mediums, Walter's ability to use the teleplasmic terminal was further demonstrated, as well as his ability to cognize in the dark—by finding two pencils which "E. M." had flung on the floor while entranced. The first pencil Dr. MacLean said he felt Walter trying to place in his outside breast pocket. He failed, however, because there was no such pocket; Dr. MacLean was wearing a dinner jacket. This Walter presently discovered, remarking disgustedly, "This man has no pockets." The pencil fell. Dr. MacLean picked it up and found it to have been accurately described as to its point, eraser, size, etc. The second pencil he said he would "stick in
the crack' (of the cabinet), but at my request he placed it in my hand. This also was accurately described.

The latter part of the sitting was taken up by Walter answering many questions from various sitters regarding his alleged present environment and general moral and ethical problems. Walter's answers were both interesting and thought-provoking.

Second Sitting

The second 'Margery' sitting in Winnipeg took place on the evening of the 22nd, immediately following a dinner in Dr. and Mrs. Crandon's honor given by Mr. Isaac Pitblado, K.C., LL.D., and his wife at the Manitoba Club, and was held in the same séance room as the one of the preceding evening.

Margery, as at the first sitting, disrobed and put on a dressing gown in the presence of Mrs. Hamilton. After taking her place in the cabinet, the sitters were placed from her right in the following order: Dr. Crandon, Dr. R. J. Blanchard, Dr. A. Gibson, Mr. Hugh Reed, Mr. Isaac Pitblado, Dr. J. D. Adamson, Dr. T. G. Hamilton, 'Elizabeth M.' Fifteen other observers were seated or standing about the room, among whom were: Rev. E. G. D. Freeman, Dr. and Mrs. Creighton, Dr. and Mrs. E. A. Jones, Miss Edith Lawrence, Mrs. Harold Shand, Mr. W. B. Cooper, Mrs. Hamilton and Miss Margaret Hamilton. Double control on the right was exercised by Dr. Blanchard; I again acted as controller on the left.

Walter came through in about two minutes, whistling and talking and among others was introduced to the doctors present, to Mr. James Leslie, for many years a member of both the British and American Psychic Research Societies; and to Mr. Pitblado, K.C., our dinner host. Walter in his inimitable style, chatted and joked with each in turn.

The first phenomenon manifested was one which had not appeared at the previous sitting—a brilliant display of luminous teleplasm. For a report on this I shall here rely on signed progress notes made by Miss E. Lawrence, who has frequently
during the past four years acted as recorder for the "Elizabeth M." phenomena. These notes follow:

Dr. Crandon: "Don't be tense—relax, Walter likes an easy atmosphere . . ."

A psychic light appeared and moved about. Walter said it came from the medium's head. Walter called it his "celestial garment." It came first as a small oval-shaped body of about three inches length. It increased in length gradually to about four feet long and two or three inches wide. It moved constantly, though sometimes laid on the table. It undulated and billowed—wavering like northern lights. Walter said: "Keep your eye on it, it will look like moonlight. It is what ghosts' garments are made of." Someone asked, "Is it visible to you, Walter?" Walter said: "I see it in a different way. It is as real to me as this cabinet (he knocked the cabinet wall) is to you." This light moved about for about ten minutes and then gradually disappeared.

Faint moans were occasionally heard from the medium during this manifestation. This display was intently watched by the twenty-three observers in the room—the objective nature of the phenomenon being beyond question.

The next experiment was the "doughnut" manipulation which presented several features not given on the previous evening. Again we quote from Miss Lawrence's notes:

It appeared to rise slowly from the table, passing close to the face of some of the sitters. Some said they saw the black terminal of teleplasm coming through the opening. Then Dr. B. asked, "Could he take it off my head?" Walter said, "Put your nose on the table." He did so. Dr. Crandon put the doughnut on Dr. B.'s head and in a second or two it was seen to move. Dr. B. said it felt like something hard. All the time Dr. B. had hold of Dr. C.'s two hands and Margery's right. Then Mr. P. asked if he would pull his hair. Walter: "Put your nose in the doughnut on the table." Soon Mr. P. said, "He pulled my hair but it did not hurt." Then Walter asked Dr. B. to put a fifty-cent piece in the hole in the doughnut on the table. Almost immediately the doughnut was slightly elevated and some raps were made as if with the edge of the coin. Walter: "Is that your money, Dr. B.? I'll prove it to you"—and the money dropped to the floor with a typical jangling sound of a coin.

Walter now asked for the bell-box; this was placed on the table. Before going on to detail this experiment I may say that among others, Mr. Hugh A. Reed—a highly-trained elec-
trial engineer, carefully examined the box in bright light and pronounced it fraud-proof, so far as electrical tricks were concerned. This of course means that the bell can only be rung by depressing the flapper or by bringing to the box an external physical means for short-circuiting it. With this we will again turn to Miss Lawrence’s notes:

The red light was turned on so all could see the box. Walter asked Dr. B. to take the box in his hands. He held it a moment, watched the flapper moving up and down, the bell keeping up an intermittent ringing. Dr. B. now while holding the box turned around in a complete circle once. Then he passed the box to Dr. G. who likewise made a complete rotation. He handed it to Mr. R. who repeated the rotation and handed it to Dr. Adamson and Dr. A. to Mr. P., each of them rotating in a similar manner. Mr. P. placed the box on the table. All the while it was intermittently ringing.

After the bell-box experiment, Walter talked for some time—joking, teasing and one might say “preaching.” He closed the séance with these words:

“Continue your work; get an interest in psychic research; you will some day have a scientific religion. Good night! God bless you.”

Immediately after the sitting, in a room adjoining the séance room, Margery removed her dressing gown, stockings and shoes under the close scrutiny of Mrs. Hamilton and Miss Kenneth Haig—the latter one of the best-known lady journalists in Western Canada. They found nothing whatever concealed about her person.

Third Sitting

The third and last Margery sitting in Winnipeg, while both brief and informal, was in some of its aspects quite as arresting as the two preceding ones. This sitting was held at the residence of Mr. and Mrs. Pitblado during a small impromptu gathering of social nature which had been arranged after Dr. Crandon’s lecture at the Fort Garry Hotel on the evening of December 23rd.

After an hour devoted to chatting and refreshments in the drawing room, our hostess, Mrs. Pitblado—some time after
midnight—suggested that we see whether or not "Walter" could speak to us under such informal conditions. Margery signified her willingness to "try" and in a few moments, after a few preliminary arrangements such as securing a small table, arranging chairs in a corner of the dining room, the circle was formed.

Eleven people, including Dr. and Mrs. Crandon, sat in the group and in the following order to the right of the medium: Dr. Crandon, Mrs. Hamilton, Mrs. P., Miss P., Mr. P., Mrs. Shand, Mr. W. R. Cottingham, Mrs. C., Dr. T. G. Hamilton, "Elizabeth M."; Margery. Double control on the right in this instance fell to Mrs. Hamilton while I as before exercised double control on the left.

The trance came on within a few minutes after the light was turned off and Walter quickly came through. He chatted for a moment or two—among other things remarking that he had not bothered to attend the lecture, and then said: "Well, what do you want me to do; I can’t do anything if you don’t give me something to play with." The hostess then procured a glass dinner bell which was placed on the table in the center of the circle. The bell was at once carried out beyond the table, now to this side and now to that: one could easily determine its position by its sound. Often it was heard under the table tapping on the wood. Walter would from time to time joke and chuckle and say, "Catch it if you can." Having only the one "plaything" Walter was, of course, limited to this one type of physical phenomena. I was extremely careful to verify my control of Margery’s hand during this manifestation. Mrs. Hamilton also declared her control to be positive.

I may say that the voice phenomenon was at this sitting unusually impressive: here we were a small group sitting quietly in a room which the medium had entered for the first time only a few moments before; with no music; no cabinet; no equipment of any kind; and yet the "voice" was undoubtedly a reality. At times it was difficult indeed to realize that our experience lay without the bounds of the normal.

I have now witnessed the Margery phenomena eleven times:
eight times in the Lime Street séance room under conditions of careful control; twice in my own experimental room also under positive control; and once in the home of an acquaintance (third Winnipeg sitting) under arrangements entirely impromptu—and in each instance typical Margery phenomena occurred.

Considered objectively, two conditions only were common to these three environments—the presence of the psychic (Margery) and the absence of white light. From this it is to be seen, then, that apart from these two requisites, the Margery phenomena are in no wise dependent on any particular or prepared surroundings. This being the case, we have obtained strong additional proof of the genuineness of this mediumship. I have no hesitancy in again stating that I am quite convinced that the Margery phenomena are not only genuine but are also among the most brilliant yet recorded in the history of metapsychic science.
CHAPTER XLIX

Telekinesis of Early 1927

The number of sittings per month given by Margery rose to a maximum in 1924, then decreased quite rapidly during the years 1926 and 1927.

There were several reasons why this should have been the case. During the early days of the mediumship the phenomena underwent almost continuous modification; their evolution was most interesting, and, not infrequently, of a startling nature. But after the rapid evolutionary period had passed and the study of the phenomena had entered its more critical phase, it became evident that very frequent sittings were neither desirable nor necessary. It was also apparent that there was a relationship between the results obtained and the amount of energy that the sitters and the medium could contribute. Walter insisted on rest periods, and there were many indications that these were necessary and beneficial.

With the beginnings of a more intensive study of a few phenomena it soon became clear that the introduction of large and varied groups of sitters, many of whom had or might have only a casual interest in the effects displayed, retarded the more important scientific work. Walter said, on more than one occasion, “I can’t convince the whole world one at a time. Someone has got to take somebody’s word for something.” He quite frankly discounted the value of the so-called “educational séances” and suggested that more attention be given to scientific work. Thus, whenever it became necessary or desirable to present phenomena to a group of sitters who were not well acquainted with the more intricate problems of research, he

---

1 Geley noted that the sitters are an important factor in the production of good phenomena: See Introduction, Clairvoyance and Materialization; also his comments on investigators, and the energetic factors of physical mediumship. See, also, Experiments in Psychical Science, by W. J. Crawford, p. 131.

2 Attempts to bring these phenomena to the attention of persons who, however highly placed, were neither well informed nor experienced in the field of metaphysics, resulted in much the same sort of destructive criticism as that described by earlier investigators in this field.
tended to focus on a few of the effects which were spoken of as constituting the "standardized séance." Such séances included the glass-cabinet control with telekinesis, and subsequent telekinetic and voice tests in the open cabinet under tactual control.³

The necessity for the rigid tiresome control of the glass cabinet with its inevitable delays, began to disappear as the more experienced investigators insisted that it was no longer necessary; that it had established the fact that supernormal phenomena were produced. Nevertheless, the glass cabinet was used for occasional sittings, where extreme rigidity of control was deemed essential, until late in 1929.

It is obvious that an evolutionary development of the phenomena may, quite properly, be accompanied by a change in the method of control. Such changes have been made from time to time⁴ in accordance with the established policy of the students of the mediumship; which is to obtain the important phenomena under different conditions of control, so as to learn whether or not these phenomena are conditioned by such methods. The first change in control, following the introduction of the glass cabinet, was the addition of surgeon's tape to the wire ties. This was, in a sense, a by-product but it developed into a standardized control for certain test sittings held both in and out of Lime Street.

With the introduction of more intensive experimental programs, such as the baryta tests, the cross-correspondences and the finger prints,⁵ Walter found it inadvisable to expend much time or energy on the simpler telekinetic phenomena. But when these special programs were finished or were in temporary abeyance, telekinetic phenomena were often presented, either incidentally or as a major part of the séance.

Most of the séances immediately following the return from the western vacation were given over to general subjects; the first two, however, were scheduled for a continuation of the

---

³ See section on control, Chapters XXV and XXIX.
⁴ E.g., Driesch's control with luminous-head pins.
⁵ Which will be treated in a later volume.
baryta tests. The sitting of January 6, 1927, was of this latter type but Walter found it impossible to do more than make certain preparations; hence, most of the séance was devoted to conversation which revolved very largely about the incidents of the recently completed trip, Walter’s reactions to some of the amusing incidents, and comments on some of his early experiences in the vicinity of Winnipeg. The early part of the sitting involved some interesting telekinetic action that was so spontaneous and characteristic of Walter that it deserves inclusion.

The Psychic was secured in the glass cabinet as to wrists and collar by Richardson and Dudley. (The feet were not secured since they would not enter into any action in connection with the proposed Baryta test.) The standard, to which the armored tube connected to the wash bottle was attached, was fastened to the shelf in the cabinet with a wooden clamp (carpenter’s clamp) at the Psychic’s extreme right, so that the end of the tube was well beyond the extreme reach of her head.

Walter came through promptly and commented on the arrangements, saying, “The shelf is all right for Mark when he doesn’t have to make a precipitate (in the Barium Hydrate sol.), for he doesn’t have to stand here, but I’ve got to stand somewhere. When I come into physical matter I have to have some place to work; perhaps not so much as when I had my physical body, but some space, and this shelf gets in the way. I don’t care if it (the equipment) is farther away. That doesn’t matter so long as I have room to get around.”

Dudley removed the shelf and clamped the standard to the table so that the clamp would come close to the outer side of the arm of the Psychic’s chair, if the table were pushed well into the cabinet. This was done in dim red light, after which the light was turned out. The flexible tube had a ring of luminous paint near its tip to aid in marking its location. This ring was repeatedly eclipsed while it was quite outside of Margery’s reach.

After some further conversation, Walter said: “There is too much apparatus here; I don’t need it all. When you work with apparatus you want it as simple as possible, don’t you?” Dudley: “Of course.” Walter: “Well, I don’t need all of this and I am going to change it.” The table vibrated strongly at intervals, accompanied by squeaks as of wood rubbing on wood. Shortly thereafter Walter said: “I am going to hand you something, Dudley.” The latter held his left hand open above the outer edge of the table; the wooden clamp was placed exactly in his

58 A small table with two legs shorter than the others so the top would be level when the short legs rested on the floor of the glass cabinet and the other legs were outside the cabinet.
hand—in proper position to be grasped—and without the slightest fumbling. Walter: "Got it?" Dudley: "Yes." Walter: "All right. Ha, Ha! I didn't need that so I took it off. It got in my way." (The clamp had been set up very firmly at the time the apparatus was arranged, as noted above.) The nature of the sounds and the manner in which the table vibrated, as interpreted by Dudley, whose hand was resting on the table, indicated that the clamp had been worked from side to side until it was finally released; an operation necessitating the application of considerable force, first in one direction and then in the other but parallel to the Psychic's body. The position of the clamp was such that the Psychic's right knee might have contacted the side of the wooden clamping screw but not in a manner to move the clamp away from the adjacent side of the cabinet, since there was not enough space to permit the insertion of a knee. The screw was not backed off because no sound was heard such as must have been made if that had been done; while a test after the sitting showed that the setting was unchanged. It is Dudley's opinion that it was not even theoretically possible to move the clamp transversely by pressure applied to the wooden screw without breaking the screw. Therefore, it seems apparent that since the Psychic had no free hand she could not have removed the clamp by normal means. These facts, taken in connection with the exact placement in Dudley's hand in the dark, constitute strong evidence of supernormal telekinetic action accompanied by a marked expenditure of energy. Dudley's position at one end of the table, and Mrs. Richardson's at the other end, gave the former a very complete control of the locus of the phenomenon; sufficient to warrant him in stating that there was no interference from the circle. 6

A few moments later Walter said to Dudley, "Did you feel that?" Dudley: "No, what was it?" Walter: "Did you feel the table vibrate?" Dudley put his hand on the table and felt a curious vibration, not a hammering but as though the table throbbed. Walter continued, "Put your ear down to the table." Dudley did so but heard nothing and said so. Then there came a peculiar rhythmic throb which continued for 10 or 12 seconds, and sounded as though it was in the body of the wood; as though the whole table were in vibration. This was repeated at intervals while Richardson, Mrs. Richardson, and Crandon felt the vibration. Walter, in explanation, said: "I am charging the table; I have to recharge everything. It [the psychic energy?] has leaked out during the last month." There followed the conversation noted in the introductory remarks, and the séance closed at 10:35 P.M.

6 In any event, application of the necessary force from a point outside the cabinet would have tended to overturn the table or move it outward, unless someone stood practically against the outer edge of the table. No one did stand there, and there was no such tendency or movement of the table.—E. E. D.
The séance of January 17th was given over entirely to conversation, although preparations had been made for fingerprints. That of the 18th resulted in prints in wax and on paper, while that of the 24th was a glass cabinet sitting (in part), and is reported below:

Margery was secured in the cabinet in the standard manner (see Chapter XXV) by Dudley and Dunning, under the supervision of the various new sitters who were present. Walter correctly identified three or four wooden letters that were presented in the large basket, after which this same basket was passed for "the collection," and he identified at least six articles, among which was a half-dollar that he called a half-crown. He then asked for the small basket (the one with a circular base, which he is accustomed to rock on the shelf in the glass cabinet) and Crandon handed him the small basket that had been used for levitations. Judging from the movements of the luminous markers on the handle of the basket, Walter tried to rock it on the shelf, but without success. It went to the floor three times, and was replaced by one of the sitters, was turned end for end several times while on the shelf, and, finally, Walter asked what was wrong with it. Crandon suggested that it had become deformed; whereupon Walter picked it up and hammered it violently on the shelf; tried to rock it again, and then exclaimed in a most disgusted tone of voice, 'Where's my little basket?' This is the old one and it's square! What's the idea? Find the other basket.' The other one could not be found so Walter contented himself with levitating the small "square" basket.

The VCO test was completed in the glass cabinet with marked success, while Dunning controlled the apparatus. The ties were carefully checked and found undisturbed, and the Psychic was cut free, the sitting continuing in the old cabinet, with Dunning controlling at the left and Crandon at the right. The (S.A.) bell-box was engineered by Dunning, who carried it to the west book-case and back, after it had rung intermittently while held by Mrs. Murray. When Dunning replaced the box on the table he turned back the flapper and inspected the contacts in white light (the red light having been on throughout). The bell rang as soon as the

---

8 Large basket passed from sitter to sitter for reception of articles to be cognized by Walter. All in complete darkness.
9 The body of this basket averages 5 1/4 inches in diameter, is 6 inches high; the handle projects 12 1/2 inches and is provided with three luminous bands, each one inch wide. The basket weighs 4 ounces.
10 This basket is 4 inches high, is rectangular; the average length of the long side being 5 1/2 inches, and of the short side 3 1/2 inches. The handle projects 11 inches and has three luminous bands as above. It weighs 3 ounces (Av.).
flapper was replaced but ceased a moment later, in the same period of red light.\textsuperscript{11}

The séance of January 25th was planned for finger prints but none were made, most of the sitting being devoted to conversation by Walter. Dudley had prepared a special light by means of which he hoped to learn more about the reaction of teleplasmic structures to certain wave lengths. This was arranged in a standard dark-room lamp box, and consisted of a filter which passed only a narrow band of light waves in the green (wave lengths to which most three-color plates are insensitive), and was equipped with a device for varying the area of the lighted surface. This was tried near the close of the séance, but Walter said that the light was too bright (a 25-watt, tungsten filament lamp was in the box), so plans were made for a further test with a smaller lamp at a succeeding séance. After this preliminary test the red lamp on the mantel was turned on dimly, and in this illumination, while bi-lateral double control was applied, the small megaphone\textsuperscript{12} was levitated from the floor and placed on the table at Margery’s left, the edge of the megaphone being approximately flush with the inner edge of the table. The red light was then increased to about half strength. After a few moments of general conversation, Bond (sitting next to Richardson, who controlled at the Psychic’s left) said that the megaphone was moving. The other sitters, who were in position to see the table clearly, saw the edge of the megaphone that was away from the medium tilt upward. Dudley put his fingers under this edge, then somewhat less than one inch from the table, and felt this edge oscillate; then move upward about one-half inch. He did not follow the movement beyond that point. The megaphone continued to tip very slowly, until it fell over into Margery’s lap. The light was ample for checking the controls, and it was clear that Margery did not move throughout the operation. Walter chuckled, and said, “You’ll have to watch out for Bond’s eagle eye. He caught that movement before the rest of you.” He then sug-

\textsuperscript{11} See Note 29.  
\textsuperscript{12} Weighs 6 oz., and has no handle.
gested that he could do a certain amount of work in the light—as was confirmed by the results obtained with the Butler apparatus of a later date.  

At the séance of the 27th the green light was used with a smaller lamp (2 c.p.), and was placed at the south end of the mantel so that the light shone on the table but not on Margery’s face. At first it was quite dim, and while thus in use a voice, claiming to be that of Jimmie Frothingham, spoke to Mrs. Frothingham. “Jimmie” talked for several minutes, and when asked how he came in, answered, “I came on Walter’s coat-tails!” Walter spoke after a bit, and said that he could stand a little more light. The illumination was increased until the whole top of the table was clearly visible. Walter said that he could not make any thumb prints this evening; whereupon the metal dish (for cold water) was thrown about with considerable violence. (Walter said that Jimmie did this.) Walter talked for some time in this light, and then asked for more light, followed, a moment later, by a command to turn it on full brilliancy. As he failed to talk in this illumination, it was reduced somewhat, and he then asked that the lamp box be turned toward the wall so that only reflected light would reach the table. As soon as this had been done he again asked for full brilliancy. This prevented him from talking, so a slight reduction in luminosity was made, and Walter then said, “I will be able to work with it full on when I get a little better used to it, but you can have it that bright for all the glass-cabinet sittings.” The dishes were rattled about on the table; the cloth (used in the hot-water dish) removed; the megaphone that was between Crandon’s knees and the table, on floor, was levitated and moved up Bond’s leg (Bond was second on the right of Crandon) three times, then to Mrs. Richardson’s knee, then to floor. The first levitation was under double control of the Crandon-Margery link. 

Bond and Mrs. Richardson (with linked hands) held Bond’s handkerchief above the corner of table nearest Bond; while Walter tried to take it away from them. He seemed to have trouble in grasping it, but finally pulled it away and put it against Richardson’s face, then over Bond’s face; touched Mrs. Richardson with it, placed it in contact with the hands of Crandon and Mrs. Richardson, where it was held for a few moments, and then back with Bond. 

There followed some further conversation, after which Walter attempted to put the metal dish on Richardson’s head, and just failed to make it balance. The dish fell to the floor with a loud clatter, and rolled to the séance-room door. Walter remarked,

---

13 See Chapter L.
14 The sitters in order: Richardson, Mrs. Frothingham, Dudley, Mr. Hyde, Bond, Mrs. Richardson, Crandon. Outside: Mrs. Stinson.
TELEKINESIS OF EARLY 1927

"That lit right over the colored maid’s head. She won’t sleep tonight!" After some further conversation, carried on in the same illumination, the séance closed at 10:10 p.m., having lasted a little over one hour.

Throughout the telekinetic operations the structures involved were invisible, although there was sufficient light to show that Margery was not normally involved, nor was anyone else in the circle. The light was not as bright as might be desired, but it was a marked advance over the preceding séances. It was particularly interesting to note Walter’s reaction to the experiment, especially his whole-hearted interest in carrying it as far as possible on the first real test.

February 2, 1927. The finger-print program was still uppermost in the minds of the sitters, but Walter appeared to be having trouble in getting it under way, although two prints had been made on one piece of wax on January 18th. The sitters for this evening were Margery, Richardson, Dudley, Bond, Mrs. Richardson, and Crandon, with Mrs. Stinson seated outside the circle. While no finger prints were made, there was a certain amount of telekinetic phenomena of a unique sort, as noted below:

Margery insisted on bringing the cat to the séance room, for no reason that she could explain. After most of the group had been seated but before the séance-room door had been closed, the cat ("Yellow-Boy", by name) escaped into the upper hall. Margery insisted that he be brought in so Dudley captured him, brought him back in spite of some protest on the cat’s part, and turned out the over-head light.

Walter came through promptly, and began talking to the cat, calling him "Tom" and coaxing him into the cabinet, finally getting him to climb into Margery’s lap. This was checked by Crandon and Richardson. Walter added, "It is a good proof that the Kid is in trance, for the cat ran his claws into her\(^{15}\) and she never said a word." Dudley proposed that the green light be turned to one side but Walter suggested waiting until Saturday evening when we would try a lot of experiments with it. In the meantime the cat had escaped from Margery’s lap, and after Walter had talked to Bond about some personal matters he called the cat again, saying, "He won’t stay in the Kid’s lap because...

\(^{15}\) Examination by Margery and Mrs. Richardson, after the séance, disclosed scratches on the former’s body.
there is something queer about it. He senses me in place of her and he doesn’t understand it.” Finally, the cat came into the cabinet at Margery’s right, and Walter said that he picked him up by the tail. The cat yowled once, and then was quiet. Crandon, at Walter’s suggestion, felt of the cat and reported him very quiet, and that his fur felt cold. Walter: “He’s all in; his tongue is hanging out and his tail is stiff. If we don’t get rid of him pretty soon he is liable to croak on us and that wouldn’t do. There is too much energy around her (Margery) and it affects him. Dudley, put on the overhead light and let him out.”

Dudley turned on the light and opened the door. The cat walked out very deliberately. The overhead light was turned out and the circle reformed. Dudley asked Walter if teleplasm could be taken from the cat, to which Walter replied, “Sure, want to see it? Put out the light.” The green light was turned out, and Walter continued, “Here it is.” A luminous mass about the size of a small orange was then seen on the table in front of Richardson. This moved about over the table; elongated until it became a column some fourteen inches high and one and one-half inches wide; grew larger and then smaller; sank into a pool at Richardson’s end of the table (such a pool as would be formed by a viscous substance); after which it grew taller and wider than before, dancing about over the table, and touched Richardson’s right hand. The luminous column moved back into the cabinet at Psyche’s left, and returned to the table top. Richardson asked Walter if he could take it from any animal, and the latter replied, “Of course: it’s fundamental stuff.” Question: “Can you build it into a human body?” Walter: “Sure, I can.” (Another hint for future experimentation.)

Most of the remaining conversation was of a personal nature, and it ended when Walter announced that he would be ready for finger prints at the next sitting. The séance closed at 10:10 p.m., the elapsed time being 70 minutes.

The séance of February 5th was carried out wholly in the glass cabinet, following quite closely the general lines of that of January 24th. The green light was on the mantel, and was lighted throughout almost the whole of the séance, giving sufficient illumination at the opposite side of the room so that the faces of all the sitters could be seen, although somewhat dimly. Margery was secured in the cabinet as to wrists and collar only, the circle being formed by Dudley, Crandon, Harriet

---

16 The cat acted peculiarly after the séance and for several days thereafter. He spent much of the day-time hours sitting quietly in a corner of the kitchen “staring at nothing” and paying no attention to the members of the household—which was quite unusual, for him.
Richardson, Bond, and Richardson. The séance action was as follows:

Walter came through after a few moments delay and asked for a reduction in the light. After several trials it was decreased about one-half, with the results described above. The small basket was placed in the large one and both were placed at the right front of the cabinet, whence they were thrown out in the direction of Bond. When returned, the small one was levitated to about the level of the chair arm, and then pushed straight out in front of the cabinet, dropped to the floor, and recovered. With the shelf in place, the small basket was rocked with the light out. Then Walter referred to the last glass-cabinet sitting, saying, "You gave me a square basket and expected me to rock it. Think of it: a square basket! I said, Come on basket; and it never budged! Couldn’t get it to move; thought I had lost my technique. And John was standing there, looking on, and said, ‘What’s the matter with you, anyway?’ I took the basket up and thumped it good but it didn’t help any; and a whole bunch of people here waiting to see the show! Put on the red light.” With a combination of the red and green lights the basket was rocked.

At Walter’s request, Bond turned the basket around and it was rocked in the new position. Walter then said that he was going to remove the shelf, and, in spite of Crandon’s protest, proceeded to do so. After getting one end on the floor he attempted to pass the upper end to Dudley but the board slipped from his grasp just as Dudley’s hand touched it, and fell to the floor outside the cabinet. Although both lights were on at the time the board was largely in the shadow cast by the sitters. (The board is 36½ inches long, 9½ inches wide, ¾ inch thick, and weighs 7½ pounds.) After some further conversation about the work planned for succeeding evenings, and a promise to make further experiments with the lights, the sitting closed at 10:50 p.m.

The next glass cabinet séance of this series was on February 7th. Cognitions of letters were given first, with one incident where Walter expressed uncertainty between D and O. Levitation of the small basket ensued, and when it was found impossible to get this above the Psychic’s head, the presence of cata­menia was recorded as probably responsible for the deficiency in force. Similarly, when the VCO machine was tried out, Walter could talk and whistle freely while the tip was in the Psychic’s

---

17 The larger basket averages 8½ inches square, is 5½ inches high, and the handle projects 12½ inches above the rim of the basket. It has no luminous markers. Weight 13 oz. (Av.).
18 These two colors gave a much better illumination than either alone.
mouth, but whenever she tried to close the holes and blow the floats into disequilibrium she would drop off into trance. When the move was made to the old cabinet, the bell-box and the scales were both brought out. Mather got as far as nine feet from the Psychic with the ringing bell-box, and he held the entire scales unit up from the table while white flashlight was played upon it, without interrupting the supernormal behavior of the pans, which balanced evenly under a 4:1 load.

On February 12th, in the presence of a large group of sitters, another glass-cabinet séance was held. The cabinet was thoroughly searched before the séance; while Margery was searched by or in the presence of several women members of the group. The wire ties were applied by strangers and carefully checked in the presence of the whole group, both at the beginning and end of this part of the séance, all of whom expressed themselves as satisfied with their security and the fact that they had not moved. The wooden letters for cognition were selected at random by Dr. Levi, and were correctly identified by Walter. The selection resulted in a peculiar coincidence, since the letters were O, O, O, C. There followed cognition of varied articles, rocking of basket on shelf, and, with shelf removed, levitation of the basket well out in front of cabinet, while Drs. Levi and Davis checked the position of the Psychic's feet and hands. Differing from some other séances of this period, the VCO test was made in the glass cabinet, and was not only very complete but more than usually satisfactory. After the change to the open cabinet the bell-box was lifted by Levi, who turned around while the bell rang intermittently; it was then passed around the circle through the hands of seven sitters, several of whom turned around, while the last (Hardman) took it outside the circle. It was then examined in white light, and rang after the upper member had been replaced. The scales balance with a 1:4 load and with a 1:3 load, in bright red light. Levi picked up the scales unit while it was balancing, and when he returned it to the table he examined the scales in white light, passing his arm clear round the scales while they continued to oscillate. Walter expressed himself as well pleased with the composition
of the circle, saying that if he could have one sitter in particular as regular member of the group he could "take the roof off."

An unusual sitting was held during the afternoon of February 15th, in Crandon's absence, and will be reported in full in Chapter LI; while on the evening of the same date another sitting was held at which nine ministers were present in addition to Dr. Davis, who had been largely instrumental in engineering the afternoon séance. The phenomena, checking of controls, etc., were similar to those of the séance of the 12th; hence need not be repeated; while the séance of the 17th was practically a duplicate of the above but with a somewhat different group. On the 15th Cobleigh, and on the 17th Davis passed his hand and forearm between the Psychic and the basket as it rocked on the shelf in red light. In each séance the above sitters respectively controlled Margery's mouth during levitation of the basket in the glass cabinet. There was an interesting incident on the 17th, in connection with the scales test: the scales balanced approximately with a 1:4 load, and perfectly with a 1:3 load. Under the latter loading, and in red light, Davis added his pocket comb to the normally heavy pan. Without any intervening period of darkness the scales continued to balance with the added load. The comb weighed approximately 7.5 grams, so that the total load on the west pan was approximately 26.25 grams, and the unbalanced (normal) load approximately 20 grams (\(\frac{3}{4}\) oz, Av.).

The séance of February 21st was held in the old cabinet. After some cognitions, including the reading of several advertisements and the correct determination of a bill (also presented by Mrs. Davis) as an old one of $1.00 value, Walter touched the head of everyone in the circle separately and pulled each one's hair.19 He levitated the luminous basket all over the region above the table, and showed his single20 terminal over the limb.

---

19 Although the record does not make the specific statement it is probable that, as is usually the case, the sitter bent over the table with his nose approximately over the center of the luminous ring. In all similar instances (wherever reported) this may be understood to be the case.

20 A rod-like terminal which, in accordance with previous observations, seems adapted to develop additional finger-like processes such as would be needed in handling coins, etc.
of the doughnut. He picked up a fifty-cent piece from the table, and rapped with it alternately on the table and the floor. He rang the bell-box in red light while it was passed around the circle.

On March 4th a standardized séance was held, using both cabinets, to which the description already given for February 15th and 17th applies in detail. Holmes was the sitter who insulated the rolling basket from the Psychic,\(^\text{21}\) and he and Miss Haven engineered the bell-box episodes.

Again on March 5th, this time in the early stages of a séance in which thumbprints were produced, there was routine telekinesis in the old cabinet, Cannon engineering the bell-box and Mrs. Cannon the scales.

March 17, 1927. This sitting was held at the home of Mr. and Mrs. Roland Baker, Chestnut Street, Boston, during Cran­don's absence from town. There were eight sitters, including Margery, who was controlled by Mrs. Baker and Bond. After the screens over the windows had been properly arranged and the red light reduced to a satisfactory point, the sitting continued with the Psychic under continuous control. The controllers state that they maintained complete control of her hands, feet and knees. There were successful cognitions of four articles placed on the table in front of the Psychic; ringing of the bell-box in red light while Miss Cowen and Whitney held it, both of whom turned a complete circle; movement of luminous dough­nut on table; levitation and rapping of coin on table. During the period just prior to and while the extra screen was being placed over the window by Whitney, a luminous structure was seen just below the level of the table and about eighteen inches from Margery's body. This was described as roughly tri­angular in shape which changed to something about the size of a man's thumb. When a ray of brighter light came through the curtains Bond reports that the teleplasmic process became much more brilliant, and appeared to be about eight inches long, "running up slantwise in the direction of the table." Mrs.

\(^{21}\) As was done by Cobleigh and Davis on Feb. 15th. This convenient term will be used hereafter without further explanation.
Baker reported touches twice, when control was reported as complete throughout the circle and the control of the Psychic was perfect as noted above. At one point in the séance a rounded protuberance was seen, obscuring about one-third of the luminous doughnut. The report was prepared by Bond and Whitney.

On the 21st, after finger prints had been obtained, the bell-box was rung in red light while Fife, and later Barss, held it and turned completely around. Both held it up to the level of their eyes against the background of the mantel lamp and watched the movements of the flapper as the bell rang intermittently. The bell stopped ringing after Barss placed it on the table (still in red light) and was then examined in the same period of red light and with the aid of white flash light. The examination against the light was carried out in each instance after the holder had turned around, and while the box was approximately six feet from the Psychic.

At this date a hiatus was reached in the finger-print program as a result of a plan to await further expert opinion on the prints already obtained while the Butler apparatus, described in the next chapter, was not yet on hand. Advantage was taken of this fact to hold several standardized séances for the benefit of some of the long roll of applicants for sittings. Five sittings were held for this purpose, using both the glass cabinet and the open cabinet in each instance.

March 22d: There was a very thorough preliminary examination and experimentation with the VCO by the visiting professors; together with an equally thorough examination of the bell-box, the séance room, and the glass cabinet. The Psychic was searched by the wives of two of the professors, and was secured in the cabinet by Drs. DeMille and Mark, while Drs. LeFavor and Mark occupied positions at her right and left. Crandon was under the control of two other professors. There

---

22 In each instance I observed the movement of the flapper, and noted that the ringing of the bell occurred when the flapper was depressed.—E. E. D.

23 See pp. 119, 120, for the significance of this remark.
were cognitions of wooden letters and personal objects; repeated rolling of the luminous basket on the shelf while it was insulated by Mark and one other sitter; levitations of the basket in the cabinet; and, while it was outside the cabinet, Mark controlled the Psychic's mouth, and then, in conjunction with Le-Favor, checked position of hands and feet. The VCO test was carried out under glass-cabinet control (excepting collar) with marked success; Mark and Le-Favor controlling. The controls were checked, the Psychic released, and sitting resumed in the old cabinet where the bell-box test was engineered by Mark and Mrs. Mark.

The twelve strangers present were members of the faculty of Simmons College (a Boston institution for women), under an arrangement made by Dr. Brewer Eddy.

March 24th: The séance was similar to the above but with a different group. The rolling basket was insulated by Howell in the first instance, and Miss Eddy in the second. The VCO test (under glass-cabinet control) was controlled by Emerson and Howell. The bell-box was used during the sitting in the old cabinet and was engineered by Miss Eddy and Emerson.

April 9th: This was a glass-cabinet séance in which the conditions were somewhat more rigid than usual. Dudley applied the wire ties to wrists and ankles, after which they were further secured by several turns of surgeon's tape24 applied by Crandon, all of which was under the supervision of Dingwall, who then cross-marked the tapes to the skin with blue pencil. With Margery in the cabinet, Dingwall fastened the collar, while Dudley secured the ankle ties to the floor bolts so tightly that the feet could not be raised. The wrist ties were as short as possible, so short, in fact, that the left wrist tie had to be remade since the wrist cramped against the edge of the opening.

24 This method of supplementing the wire ties with surgeon's tape was first used at the séance of September 14, 1926. (Margery states that she suggested it as an additional precaution.) Only the wrists were taped at first, pencil marks being used to locate the tapes.
in the wall of the cabinet. Dingwall inspected all ties while they were being made. The séance did not get under way until 9:45 p.m. The small basket, put on the shelf by Dingwall, was knocked to the floor; replaced by Fife, it rocked in darkness and again in red light while Dingwall passed his arms between the basket and the Psychic. In darkness the basket started rocking while Dingwall had his hand between it and the medium. Cognition of wooden letters, all correct, was followed by levitations of the basket, ending with basket being thrown over Dingwall's right arm as it was outstretched. The séance closed at 11:00 p.m., without return to the old cabinet. All ties were checked by Dingwall and Fife, as well as by Dudley.

April 10th: The conditions were similar to those of March 24th. There were fourteen persons in the séance room, including Margery. The wire ties were applied by Dudley (without the use of adhesive tape) and were checked throughout by Dr. Livingood. There were correct cognitions of four wooden letters and numerous personal objects (all in darkness, as usual), followed by rolling of luminous basket on shelf in darkness, and again in light, while Livingood touched first the knees, then the chest of the Psychic. It continued to roll while he made passes between her body and the shelf. The basket was levitated outside the cabinet (shelf removed), rotated while thus held, and fell to floor, where it moved about. The large basket, which was also in the cabinet, was handed to Livingood, who said that he had to pull hard to get it away from Walter. The VCO test was controlled by Livingood, and was marked by whistling, the repetition of a French Canadian verse with which Livingood was familiar, and whistling of Suwanee River. Richardson controlled the open end of the tube. All ties were checked by Livingood, who then cut them and the séance was resumed in the old cabinet, where the bell-box test was engineered by Livingood and Miss Silsby. This was followed by the scales, which

-- Both Dingwall and Fife examined the cabinet after Margery left it. The former sat in the chair and asked me to check the distance from his knees to the underside of the shelf, which was approximately six inches.—E. E. D.
balanced in red light with a 1:4 load, and while Livingood lifted them about three feet and turned through 60° to the left, in white flash light, while the scales balanced kinetically.

April 12th: Crandon’s record for this sitting notes a considerable number of strangers (seven), and dismisses this date with the statement: “The procedure of this sitting was the same as the one above.”

This was followed by two sittings at which the new apparatus was used (as described in the following chapter under the dates of April 19th and 22d), after which there were two sittings in the old cabinet, all of which were of routine character, as follows:

April 26th: The telekinetic action (aside from a note on the new B-B) is reported as, “He rang the old bell-box 100% performance, for Prof. Nearing and Miss Cobb,” and “worked the scales 100%.”

April 28th: The major part of the action centered around the new glass bell-box (see following chapter), after which Walter worked the scales, first with a 4:1 load, then with a 1:4 load (Bird engineering).

May 10th: A standardized séance was held in which the regular wire ties were applied by Coleman and Thomas, after Margery and her garments had been examined by the ladies of the party. Coleman and Nearing occupied seats next the cabinet and were told (by Walter) to check the condition of the ties at any time they pleased during the séance. Under this control there were correct cognitions of wooden letters; rocking of basket on shelf while it was insulated by Coleman, and the basket pushed off the shelf while Coleman and Nearing joined hands in front of cabinet and all controls in the circle were reported as complete. This was followed by a tug-of-war, first between Walter and Nearing, and then with Coleman, after

---

20 Routine procedure for such séances.
27 Unless the sitter can assure himself of the security and effectiveness of these wire ties he may feel that this additional checking is essential; however, if he has been tied in the cabinet in the manner described in Chapter XXV, he usually overcomes his scepticism. Sometimes Walter permits such checking without notice; at other times he does not. The phenomena do not appear to differ in the least as a function of this difference in the procedure.
which the two latter checked the controls. The VCO was used while Margery was still in the glass cabinet, first being tested by Nearing. Coleman controlled the open end of the tube, while Thomas controlled Crandon. Coleman checked all ties, after which the Psychic was released and the séance continued in the old cabinet with both the old and the new bell-boxes, the former being engineered by Miss Doherty and Thomas. The scales were tested in red light with a 1:4 load, while Coleman picked them up and turned to the left. (He picked up the metal structure only, leaving the wooden base on the table.)

May 13th: This séance was held in the old cabinet beginning with the new bell-box and continuing with the old one. Mrs. Ferranti engineered the old one, and while she was turning around with it in red light (the bell ringing) the bell in the glass box began to ring with the light on in the box, and with partitions in place and staggered but not fastened in place. Ferranti engineered the scales in red light with a 1:4 loading, turning completely around while white light played on them. The large megaphone was levitated freely, followed by levitation of the luminous doughnut, with silhouetting of unidigital terminal.

The séance of May 21st is exceptional in several ways: not only as regards rigidity of control in both the glass cabinet and the old cabinet, but because of the number of independent reports. Crandon and Dudley made reports as usual, while Bond made another report which was concurred in by May Walker, who added further comments on her impressions of the results obtained during the glass cabinet part of the sitting and the tests with the glass bell-box. Since the treatment of the Butler apparatus is to be taken up in the succeeding chapter no serious break in the continuity of treatment of these new devices

28 If the floats are displaced by air pressure and the open end of the tube is then plugged, the floats will remain stationary; hence, the top of the tube was rimmed with luminous paint and a sitter guards it with one hand.

29 The old Scientific American bell-box in its final form; and the Comstock scales shown on p. 418. Both pieces of apparatus were used in the séances noted in this chapter.

30 Controllers were Ferranti at Psyche's left, and Crandon at her right, with Mrs. Ferranti sitting next to the latter.
will result from presenting the reports of this séance somewhat fully. The following is taken from Dudley’s record.

Miss Walker and Mrs. Palmer searched the Psychic and her garments before the séance; the wire ties were applied to wrists and ankles by Palmer and Dudley, the former making the ties in the cabinet after Miss Walker had conducted the Psychic thereto. The former secured the collar about Margery’s neck, padlocked it, examined and tested the ties at wrists and ankles and added more knots of her own devising. She also tested the possibility of forcing the Psychic’s hands back through the openings in the cabinet and found that it could not be done. The door of the cabinet had been removed to permit access to the right hand of the Psychic. Fife sat at this side and Professor French at the other side of the cabinet, each maintaining tactual control at all times when the séance action does not indicate that they were checking the phenomena in other ways.

French put five wooden letters in the large basket, and placed the latter in the right front of the cabinet. Walter named three correctly and dropped two in the cabinet. The shelf was then put in the cabinet by French in red light, who examined the small basket and placed it on the shelf where it immediately began to rock, in darkness, continuing to rock in red light, and while French made simultaneous passes above the basket and below the shelf in such manner as to circumscribe the basket. Miss Walker asked Walter’s permission to make the same test, to which Walter replied, “All right, but don’t wear that frilly shawl.” She repeated the test described, while the basket continued to rock; Fife and French stating that they had control of both hands of the Psychic. Miss Walker then tested the controls of the feet. Walter remarked, “If you believe in your wire ties I don’t see why it is necessary to keep control of her hands; but do as you please.”

Miss Walker unlocked the collar; the VCO was placed on a small table in front of the cabinet; French tested the device, and placed the mouthpiece in Margery’s mouth. The first
piece slipped and had to be replaced. On the second experiment, Walter repeated a short verse and whistled freely while the floats remained unbalanced. Fife controlled the open end of the tube, while Crandon was controlled by Miss Walker.

Miss Walker examined the inside of the sleeves and the bath robe of the Psychic, then examined the ties, after which the latter were cut and the sitting resumed in the old cabinet, French controlling at the left and Crandon at the right, with Miss Walker next, in position to exercise double control. Under these conditions, and while Miss Walker had double control, the glass bell-box\textsuperscript{31} was operated as follows: a vibration of the bell hammer with slight sparking at the contacts but without internal red lamp; ringing without lamp; ringing with the light dimmed, as though obscured somewhat; followed by ringing with lamp at full brilliancy and, at Miss Walker's request, ringing intermittently three times. Both Bond and Miss Walker state that, "when the bell was ringing and the bulb glowing it was possible to see the whole of the box interior as well as the hands of the sitters, and there was no 'foreign body' visible within the glass chamber."

\textsuperscript{31} See Plate No. 39, p. 589, and description, pp. 589-592.
CHAPTER I

The Butler Apparatus

Among the sitters at the séance of February 12, 1927, was Wallace K. Butler, an Electrical Engineer residing in Woods Hole, Mass. Mr. Butler's interest in the telekinetic phenomena which were presented, together with his inventive ability and genius for developing simple and effective apparatus, resulted in an important contribution to this phase of the mediumship. After his initial sitting he designed and constructed a number of devices by means of which telekinetic action can be demonstrated in a field of illumination of brilliancy sufficient to disclose any normal operation of the mechanism, thereby greatly strengthening the evidence for the supernormality of many of these phenomena. Much of this apparatus was so designed as to focus the attention on the phenomena themselves, while relegating the problem of controlling the medium and sitters to the background or, as in the case of the glass bell-box and the sisyphus, making such control non-essential.

Butler's apparatus was gratefully accepted at Lime Street, and was used extensively, as will be seen in this and subsequent chapters. Many of these devices were brought by him and were under his personal observation and control until presented in the séance room for Walter's consideration.

By request, Butler has contributed descriptions of all the devices described herein, and Crandon has had photographs taken of some of them. Wherever new devices are referred to in the séance reports the descriptions will be given. Whenever changes are made which might affect the evidence, their nature will be noted at the appropriate point in the record. The above refers particularly to the Little Theatre, the sistrum and the glass bell-box, all of which underwent several mutations in the course of the experiments. There are added certain technical
Plate 38. Butler's glass bell-box, front view, with arrow showing form of passage to reach flappers. See text, page 589 ff.

Plate 39. Butler's glass bell-box, back view. Electrical connections to flappers are on the nearer face of the glass partition; hence, protected from tampering so long as the glass cover is fastened.
data on the pendulum, the glass balances and the sistrum, in order to supplement the séance records.

The first installment of apparatus from Butler reached Lime Street in time for the séance of April 19, 1927. It consisted of three pieces, as follows:

**All-Glass Bell Box.** This device is pictured on the facing page. It consists first of a rectangular box, approximately twelve inches wide, eight inches high and eight inches deep. It is constructed entirely of sheet glass, cemented for rigidity within a light framework of angle brass. The box is open at the top; but is provided with a removable glass cover which fits tightly and can be padlocked in position. The floor of the box is of plate glass. The vertical sheet of glass forming the front of the box does not extend the entire length of the box; an open space about three inches wide is left at one end. Three inches behind this front wall there stands a second vertical glass partition, of the same actual length as the front wall, but with the open space at the other end. Three inches behind this central partition there comes a third, rearmost partition, of length corresponding to the other two; its open space is again reversed with reference to that of the central partition, and hence at the same end of the box as the opening in the front wall. The result of this arrangement is to form a staggered or winding entrance to the actual interior of the box, through which the human hand cannot be intruded to ring the bell mechanism; and which it seems would constitute an effective barrier against the entrance of any mechanical device for such operation. All the partitions are spaced by glass strips and are securely cemented in place, their outer edges being faced with chamois to obviate contact of the teleplasm with the (presumably) uncongenial glass.

Within the box, at its rear, behind the third partition and between this and the rear wall, there is a vertical sheet of plate glass the entire length of the box. This glass slides in vertical grooves and when the box cover is off it can be lifted out. On it is mounted the bell mechanism.

This mechanism consists of an electric bell actuated by small dry cells, the contact being engineered by bringing together two
small wooden flappers. These flappers are strips of wood about three inches long, an inch wide, and a quarter-inch thick. Each of them is freely suspended from a horizontal pivot at its upper end so that they hang face to face, about an inch apart, upon the front of the removable glass support and opposite the open space in the third partition. These flappers are so designed that any manipulation of the box in the way of swinging, tilting, etc., will merely cause them to swing in synchronism, remaining parallel to one another. The electrical contact necessary to ring the bell, on the other hand, can be established only by direct action upon the two flappers, from their respective outer faces, swinging them together at their lower edges; and by way of further enforcing this necessity, all contacts, wires, etc., are placed upon the back of the plate glass support.

In the photograph, the glass faces of the box and the glass partitions are not clearly distinguishable. The chamois faces of the three partitions are however plain and they define the position of the glass. It will be seen that the opening in the front partition is at the right of the photograph, that in the central partition it is at the left, and that in the third and innermost one is at the right again. The fraud-proof character of the apparatus is further conserved by placing the bell at the left end of its support, so that a hand or other apparatus reaching in to manipulate the clapper by direct action would have an even longer and more winding passage to negotiate than one groping for the wooden flappers. By way of additional emphasis, a heavy black line has been inserted in the photograph, indicating the course which the invading hand would have to take to reach the flappers which ring the bell. This line is carefully drawn in front of the chamois strips or behind them, as the case may be, and its position with reference to them affords the final clue to an adequate understanding of the picture and the description.

The long horizontal strip of metal across the top of the box is the locking mechanism. Like all other metal parts, it is of brass.

The photograph emphasizes that the wooden flappers do not carry contact members on their face, but are carried on short
shafts pivoting in sleeves penetrating the glass plate on which the bell-battery-light assembly is supported. Behind this plate, in the narrow space between it and the solid side wall of the box, are the two contact members actuated by the flappers. Thus, the latter are completely enclosed when the cover is fastened down.

Prior to the latter part of December, 1927, the glass partitions were not fixed in their staggered position, hence could be moved from one side of the box to the other or removed altogether. Walter found it difficult to control the flappers exactly while the partitions were fixed in the most difficult position. (See note 3.)

Not less important than the bell is the red-coated flashlight bulb shown in the picture. This is wired in parallel with the bell circuit so that, when not needed, it can be unscrewed and the bell will still ring. With three cells of battery in use and the bell operating, this lamp gives an illumination somewhat greater than two candle-power (estimated). This is sufficient to light the whole interior of the box and clearly define the faces of sitters four feet away. In such an illumination it must be evident that almost any extraneous physical structure would be discernible, if within the confines of the box.

When the box was first made the flappers swung freely and, in order to complete the electrical circuit, they had to be brought together exactly on the vertical line half way between their pivots. A very slight deviation from this central position, or failure to bring the flappers into actual contact, would prevent the bell from ringing. It has been noted that when various sitters were testing this box with the glass partitions out, they found it very difficult to hold these flappers in their exact central position. As first made, the flappers were unpainted. A little later Butler enameled them white. Since they were exactly under the red-light bulb Walter found considerable difficulty in controlling them. At a still later date they were arranged so that they did not swing freely, but as this change is beyond the limits of the more important experiments it does not affect the evidence given in this chapter.
From the above description it should be clear that, with the cover fastened down and the light on in the glass box, it would be quite out of the question for any extraneous mechanism to operate the flappers without being readily detected. The introduction of one or several partitions increases the difficulty of obtaining access to the flappers, but the supernormal rating of certain phenomena is not necessarily a function of any labyrinthian passage.

The entire apparatus is constructed of non-magnetic materials, with the exception of the necessary magnetic circuit of the bell. This precaution, unnecessary as it may appear, may serve to dissuade certain disingenuous critics from trotting out their old standby, "the magnet explanation."

*Eiffel Tower.* A circular plaster base supports vertically a small wooden rod about ten inches high. On this rod slides a wooden spool coated with luminous paint. At the top of the rod is fastened a brass disk, from numerous points on the circumference of which are strung linen cords to the plaster base. Another cord runs spirally from top to bottom of the entire device, being knotted to each vertical cord at each point of intersection. The net effect is a series of meshes approximately one inch square surrounding the central rod. The resemblance to the Eiffel Tower is sufficient to have led to spontaneous application of the name. As a sort of semi-humorous effect the French name is employed in Lime Street, and the séance records are followed in this respect.

This device is for use in total darkness, the phenomenon desired being a sliding of the spool to the top of the rod. It is not impossible for the fingers to reach the spool; so it is possible to bring the spool to the top by this means. The process is however a slow and laborious one, for a stop has to be made at each mesh to transfer the grip around the obstruction. If the spool is observed to slide smoothly up the mast, this means of fraud is excluded and such a hypothesis must center about the possibility of a thread connection of some sort. If the spool goes clear to the top and makes contact with the brass plate, it becomes extremely improbable that a thread is being used.
PLATE 40. "EIFFEL TOUR" ON STAGE OF LITTLE THEATRE. THE NET CURTAIN IS ROLLED UP ON TOP OF THE BOX. SEE DESCRIPTION ON PAGE 592, COVERING CHANGES IN CONSTRUCTION.
The construction of the spool is such that any thread, to be effective, would have to be attached to the spool (presumably at the lower edge) and be detached after the levitation. If the spool dropped from the uppermost position, as it did in most cases, the critic might assume that such a thread had been used and then pulled free. However, the device was frequently examined before and after the séances and no evidence of such an operation was discovered. It would require some time and patience to make such an attachment. During one of the later séances the spool was levitated while the device was on the mantel, high above the heads of the sitters. The device is so light that even a moderate transverse pull would be likely to tip it over.

Plate No. 40 shows the Eiffel Tour in position in the Little Theatre, which will be described later. In the preliminary séances it was used without this, free on the table.

*Electric Tripod.* Three small wooden arms, about fifteen inches long, are pivoted together at one end, so that they may take any position from parallelism to a separation of 120 degrees. At the free end of each is a small horizontal flapper, or paddle. Each of these paddles, when depressed, completes an electrical connection. These three connections are wired in series with a bell, which then rings when and only when all three paddles are simultaneously depressed. The idea is to see whether the teleplasmic arm can deal simultaneously with the three contacts when these are at their widest separation. This device, like the Eiffel Tour, is illustrated in connection with the Little Theatre.

In addition to these devices Butler had presented another ingenious mechanism which was not used in the séance room. It had been examined and tested in the book room by the sitters and, since it enters into the action of the séance which follows, it will be described here.

*Selective Indicator.* A disk of hard rubber six inches in diameter is caused to revolve in a vertical plane, being driven by a small motor. Disks of paper of the same diameter are secured in place upon this rubber base, by means of a smaller disk which screws down over the first one and leaves a half-inch
margin of the paper disk exposed. The smaller rubber disk has on one side numerous segments of equal angular value, each displaying a different color; and, on the other side, the alphabet. It is reversible so that either side may be placed uppermost. Mounted on the same base is a horizontal flapper which, when depressed, brings into action an arm that carries an inking device, so that the plain paper annulus around the smaller disk is marked at a point opposite a given color or letter. Means are provided for varying the speed of rotation. The device is intended for use in the dark, and is evidently susceptible of various uses. Its immediate purpose was for cognition by Walter of colors and letters; the cognition to be indicated by the mark on the paper disk at the appropriate point. No illustration of this apparatus seems necessary.

For the séance of April 19, 1927, the first three pieces of apparatus were present in the séance room. The last named was, as noted, still in the book room. One of the sitters had depressed the ink marker and left a heavy black mark on the paper, but not opposite the marker itself, since the disk had continued to rotate after the mark was made. All the apparatus was carefully examined and tested before the séance began.

The following abstract is taken from Dudley's report.

The Psychic was controlled by Martin at the left and Crandon at the right. The glass bell-box was on the table. Two of the three partitions were in but moved to one side, thus allowing reasonably free access to the flappers. The Tripod and the Eiffel Tower were also on the table. Walter was introduced to these devices and whistled appreciatively. He rang the bell on the tripod while all the legs were in contact. He then carried out the following tests with the glass bell-box:

(1) Asking to have the light bulb removed, he rang the bell several times briefly, and then with several long rings. The sparking at the bell contacts was sufficiently bright to light up the faces of all in the circle and show that no visible extraneous object was holding the flappers in their central position. Walter was heard working in the box and finally asked Crandon where he had put the lamp. The latter explained that he had not removed it but had unscrewed it a little.

1 Dependence for control being placed on the light in the glass box.
(2) The lamp lighted and the bell rang. There were several short rings and one or two long rings. With the brighter and more continuous illumination the control of the apparatus was seen to be complete. The faces and hands of everyone in the circle were clearly seen. Margery flinched each time the lamp lighted.

(3) The bell rang but without the light. Again it rang and the lamp lighted, presumably having been screwed in by Walter. Again it rang with the light on and then, while the bell rang, the light decreased in brilliancy about thirty per cent as though it had been surrounded by a fog. While the light was thus dimmed Dudley saw the bulb slowly unscrew in its socket until the light went out while the bell continued to ring. This was repeated twice and each time there was a preliminary dimming of the light before the bulb unscrewed.\(^2\) The slightly irregular coating of the bulb provided a ready means for detecting its rotation. Dudley saw no extraneous mechanism by means of which this rotation could be accomplished. Margery's hands were more than two feet from the box at all times when the light was on. The box was less than two feet from Dudley as he leaned forward to study this operation more closely.

(4) Walter explained that in operating the flappers he used cylinders\(^3\) somewhat like those he had shown us in connection with the balances.

(5) Martin held down two of three contacts on the tripod (these were spread well apart at the time) and Walter operated the third contact. While doing this he also caused the bell to ring in the glass bellbox. These points of contact were approximately two feet apart.\(^4\)

(6) Walter was now asked about the color device downstairs and said, "I will give you the colors on the disk in order, and the color opposite the mark." There was a pause after which he spoke again, saying, "I have sent the hired man." There was a further delay and then Walter remarked on the delay and announced that he was looking to see where the "hired man" had gone. His voice sounded muffled and as though it came from close

2 It would appear that this operation on the lamp itself provides complete control of the locus of the phenomenon, dependent, of course, on the testimony of the observers. Obviously it is a difficult matter to unscrew a lighted lamp in the absence of any visible operating mechanism. The bulb is of the spherical type (used in flash-lamps) and rated at 2.6 watts. It seems probable that the preliminary dimming was caused by the teleplasmic structure, which, however, was not sufficiently dense to permit of determining its boundaries in spite of the closest scrutiny.

3 The mechanism for holding the flappers together and central was invisible. If they were held so tightly together that one could not move with reference to the other continuous ringing would result. But the slightest departure from such central position, while the flappers were thus held, would open the circuit, since the flappers would, under this assumption, tend to remain off center.

4 Simultaneous telekinetic effects two feet apart, and in light.
to the floor at the west side of the cabinet. Finally the message was delivered as follows: "The colors on the disk are orange, yellow, white, black, light red, green, dark brown, dark red and light brown. The mark is opposite the black." Walter added, "The hired man used to be a painter." A later check showed that the mark on the paper was opposite the black and that the colors were quite accurately given.5

(7) Following some further talk by Walter, Mrs. Richardson said, "The spool is at the top of the tower." Walter: "I'll prove it." The spool dropped with an audible "bang." Everyone in the circle saw it drop but no one had seen it rising.

On April 21st, after the work in the Glass Cabinet was completed Walter again attacked the glass bell-box while Margery was in the old cabinet. Its condition was as previously described; the open side was toward the medium. The bell rang without the light on and then, with the light on (but somewhat dim), it rang several times. Still, there was light enough to check the fact that the operation was apparently supernormal. This was followed by a protracted ring with the light at full brilliancy. Walter objected to the intense concentration of the sitters, saying that it interfered with his work in the bell-box.

On April 22nd, George Valiantine6 was present. It was known, on the 19th, that he was coming but Walter had said that George would have no part in the séance of this date. However, he (W.) relented during the last half of the séance and several of Valiantine's "controls" used the trumpet. The first part of the séance was devoted to the glass bell-box, with the Eiffel Tour as an auxiliary. The following is taken from Dudley's record.

Valiantine was in the cabinet at Margery's left and was controlled on his left by Brown. Crandon controlling at Margery's right as usual. There was no control of the Margery-Valiantine link, but the nature of the phenomena made such control unnecessary.

The glass bell-box was on the table and in the same condition as at the last séance; two partitions in place but not fixed. Trance came quickly and Walter began to experiment with the bell-box.

---

5 It is my recollection that Margery had left the book room before the mark was made on the paper. However, this experiment lacks any great evidential value, as was recognized at the time.—E. E. D.

6 A well-known American medium. Both the DeWyckoffs and the Cannons had many sittings with him, and the latter brought him to Boston on this and several subsequent occasions.
It rang with the lamp unscrewed (although it had been screwed in when the séance began), and then it rang with the light on. The lamp lighted but the bell did not ring then; while the light was still on the bell began to ring. This was a clear indication that the hammer of the bell was restrained in some manner. Again, while the light was on the bell rang in a muffled fashion, just as it does when the hammer is partially restrained by the finger. At no time was there any visible evidence of an extraneous structure to account for these operations. At the close of this test the moveable partition next the flappers was found in front of the flappers.

The luminous spool in the Eiffel Tower was pushed slowly to the top, but not until the luminosity had decreased somewhat from its initial brilliancy.7

It could not be determined exactly when the moveable partition in the bell-box was pushed over from its first position. In any event, this point is not a very critical one, since the important phenomena were presented in the light. The box was carefully examined before and after the séance.

The record of the April 26th séance gives only an outline of what happened in connection with the bell-box. Apparently both the old and new bell-boxes and the scales were operated. It is noted, however, that Walter again lighted the lamp in the glass bell-box without ringing the bell. It would seem as though the control of the locus of the phenomenon, through the illumination and consequent ease of inspection, should place these phenomena in the class of those which are controlled by the apparatus in which the action is produced.

On April 28th and May 3rd, the new apparatus was again operated in the presence of the old. On the first of these dates there were presented "all the permutations of experiment with the new glass bell-box, ringing the bell with no light, giving the red light without ringing the bell, giving bell and light together, and dimming the light during the ringing of the bell; always with no visible structure or agency doing it." Bird notes, from his own memorandum, that the glass partitions were not in the bell-box, but the visibility in the red light from the apparatus was excellent and that from the contacts (in absence

7 Both the enclosing mesh and the spool were covered with dots of luminous paint. Walter has repeatedly said that it is difficult for him to work in close proximity to this luminous paint when it is at its maximum brilliancy.
of the red light) was not bad. The record for May 3rd (Cran-don’s record as is the above) describes some of the most impres-sive phenomena:

Walter carried out the following phenomena:
(1) Ringing the glass bell-box with and without turning on the red light. This was with the approach to the ringing apparatus “staggered” by means of the glass partial partitions.
(2) With both bell-boxes on the table, in dim red light [from the glass bell-box lamp] he rang both simultaneously, but not in rhythm with each other. He then allowed the Scientific American bell-box to be lifted by Mrs. Ferranti and she turned completely around. The ringing of both bells continued intermittently, irregularly, and not in rhythm with each other throughout.

During the more difficult new experiments the Psychic groaned considerably.

In the standardized séance of May 10th, after moving to the old cabinet the new apparatus as well as the old was presented to Walter; and he “rang the glass bell-box with the red light off, then with red light on.” Following this, the Butler appa-ratus was used in the séance of May 19th, and again in the séance of May 21st, which was given in full at the end of the previous chapter.

At the May 23rd séance, Butler was present in person, and he brought with him further apparatus, one piece of which has already been mentioned. In so far as this new apparatus was used at the present sitting, it comprised five pieces as follows:

The Little Theatre. This device consists of a rectangular wooden framework about twenty inches long, fourteen high and eight deep; supported in an upright position upon a light wooden trestle which raises it some ten inches above the surface upon which it is placed. Its entire front is formed by one glass sheet, approximately eighteen by twelve inches; its back by sheet metal, bent to form two vertical concavities. These areas are painted white to serve as reflectors; and within each are placed an upper and a lower electric lamp of red glass. The symmetric placing of these four lamps within the body of the theater, plus the uniform reflecting power of the back surface, insures an even lighting of the glass front. A further factor in this direction is introduced, with red tissue paper screens
placed behind the glass. In its modified form the tissue paper screens were replaced by ground glass. The lamp bulbs were coated with red lacquer. Each lamp is 16 c.p. and of the carbon filament type.

Across the entire width of the glass front, and about three inches above its lower edge, runs a plate glass shelf four inches wide, supported at either end by brass brackets. The general idea of the device is that various pieces of séance apparatus shall be placed for operation on this shelf, where their working will be subject to a maximum of observation and control. The lamps already described provide the facilities for observation. For control, when desired, the glass shelf, or stage as we shall hereafter call it, can be practically enclosed by glass wings which pull out from the ends of the theater assembly. There is also a hinged glass cover that folds down from the top like a hood; and a sheet of plate glass that may be dropped into slots in front of the stage. The wings and this last named sub-stage enclosure were always in place during the tests. With the glass cover lowered the stage is practically enclosed, since access to it can be gained only through the front. The illumination is controlled by a variable resistance wired in series with the lamps; the actuating mechanism of the rheostat being two horizontal paddles or flappers at the back of the theater, on either side. The idea here is that Walter shall himself regulate the light according to his immediate needs from moment to moment.

The paddles are counterweighted to minimize the force required for their depression. They operate ratchets that move the rheostat arm step by step, to right or left, according to which paddle is depressed. Starting with the lamps extinguished, depression of one paddle illuminates the field with a dim but

---

8 The photographs of the Little Theatre show it as it was at a much later date. At this séance the top, bottom and wings of the stage enclosure were of wood. The stage and sub-stage front were glass; while in place of the hinged glass cover there was a curtain of fish-net, fine enough to protect the stage from normal intrusion when lowered, but not fine enough to prevent proper observation of the phenomena. When the scales were in use this was rolled up on top of the theatre. The glass wings and glass cover were applied after June 16th. The theatre being returned to Lime Street on July 15th.
uniform red light; and each succeeding depression of the same paddle augments the illumination until a bright red glow is present. At any stage, depression of the other paddle cuts down the lighting by one stage. After the eye is accustomed to the semi-gloom of the séance room, any object placed upon the stage is silhouetted against the field and stands out in sharp relief, even with the minimum illumination. The paddles are placed at the rear of the outfit so that, in operating them, Walter may be exposed to the minimum of reaction of his teleplasm to the light. The plates, with their captions, will make clear any element of this description which may appear ambiguous.

Butler Mechanical Bell. It is necessary to attach the inventor's name to this, because of the existence of prior mechanical bells by Dingwall and Code. This one consists of a small wooden platform about three by eight inches, at one end of which is mounted an ordinary bicycle bell. A horizontal paddle or flapper is mounted at the opposite end, so linked with the bell that a slight downward pressure will cause the latter to ring. A suitable spring then returns the flapper to its original position. This bell was designed particularly for use on the stage of the little theater.

Glass Balances. These consist of a glass standard supported on a brass base made of angles and shaped like an elongated letter H; at the top of the standard a cap carries the pivot which supports the beam. The latter is a ¼-inch glass rod or tube strengthened by a wire stay. A small eye on the under side of each end of the beam carries a wire tripod, from the ends of which depend the suspender threads which are attached to the edge of the pans. The pans themselves are fiber rings three inches in diameter, across the bottoms of which are stretched open nettings of fiber. The weights are small glass squares, weighing approximately 1/8 oz. (Av.) each. The pivot is approximately 8 1/4 inches above the base. The beam is 10 1/8 inches long between pan suspensions. When the pans are in balance their bottoms are approximately 1 3/4 inches from
PLATE 41. AN EARLY FORM OF THE LITTLE THEATRE, WITH MECHANICAL BELL ON STAGE.

PLATE 42. GLASS BALANCES ON STAGE OF LITTLE THEATRE AS IN THE SÉANCE OF JUNE 16, 1927. EAST PAN LOADED. SEE PAGE 600.
PLATE 43. SISYPHUS ON STAGE OF LITTLE THEATRE, WITH NET CURTAIN LOWERED. SEE PAGE 601.
Plate 44. The Little Theatre with vane on stage and net curtain lowered. This is the first form of the device as described on page 601.

Plate 45. Little Theatre, back view, showing rheostat.
"ground" (in these tests the glass stage). A weight of 2.5 grains will deflect the loaded pan one inch; while 5 grains will practically ground it. This description applies to the glass balances used in the early experiments. Subsequently, a different and less sensitive balance was provided. This may be described as follows:

In the center of a light support of angle brass are pivoted two brass strips, one above the other. These form the arms of the balance, whose over-all length is about ten inches. The pan supports are so linked to the arms that irrespective of the tilted position of the arms and of the consequent difference in level of the pans, these always stand on an even keel.

_Sisyphus._ So named in reference to the Greek legend. A light frame-work of brass, fifteen inches long, supports two glass strips set at a slight angle to each other so as to form an inclined trough which, in turn, forms an angle of about 23° with the base. On this track is placed a hollow, red celluloid ball 2½ inches in diameter. This has three equatorial black stripes at right angles to each other. It weighs 130 grains.

The only position which the ball can occupy under the influence of gravity alone, is against a stop at the bottom of the track. When the apparatus stands on the illuminated stage of the theatre any movement is readily observed. Further, by watching the plainly visible black stripes, it becomes immediately apparent, if the ball proceeds up the track, whether it is rolling, or being dragged as on the end of a string. The entire device is of course of non-magnetic materials.

_Vane._ This, like the Butler bell, the glass balances and the Sisyphus, is designed primarily for use on the stage of the little theatre. A glass plate ten inches square is supported vertically on a wooden base, and there are stencilled on it the eight major points of the compass. A blunt wooden arrow is pivoted at the center of this plate, with sufficient tension to hold it in any position. There is a paddle at the head of the glass plate by means of which rotation of the vane may be achieved.

With all this new apparatus present, the séance record (May
23rd) describes the action in the following terms, there being in each case a description of the apparatus which is omitted:

(1) The mechanical bell was rung on the stage, without any light. Walter asked that the spring be made less tight for next time.

(2) With the balances on the stage, Walter ordered that all the weights, twelve in number, aggregating about 1½ ounces in weight, be put on one pan. He then proceeded in front of the luminous screen, to oscillate the balances as though they were equally loaded.10

(3) He repeated this experiment, beginning the motion in the red light and continuing in the red light throughout.11

(4) The Sisyphus was placed on the illuminated stage, and the ball was made by Walter to roll slowly up the fifteen-inch incline, and to roll slowly back at the same speed. We could see clearly that it was rolling and not dragging.12

(5) Walter moved the weathervane through an angle of twenty degrees, several times, on the illuminated stage. In none of the experiments did we see any sign of the mechanism that performs the movements. The Sisyphus seemed to be hardest for Walter to do.

The May 29th record tells us:

(1) He made the glass balances act as though entirely unloaded. The west pan containing ten glass weights (about 1¾ ounces); the east pan, nothing. They balanced statically and in oscillation. The experiment was repeated, Button putting two ten dollar gold pieces in the west pan; and Walter made them balance both ways.

(2) Walter made the celluloid ball of the Sisyphus roll slowly up the glass incline, and then slowly back and forth13 several times. It went down as slowly as it went up, and not as if by gravity.

10 Another of the numerous instances in which Walter operates a new device under new conditions and without practice.

11 It has been suggested that this phenomenon does not wholly meet the most rigid requirements of phenomena in the light, in that there was a period of darkness before the balancing began.

12 Clearly, the important points are that it rolled and that it moved slowly. In the absence of any visible operating structure a slow movement would be classed as supernormal even though the ball was dragged, but when it rolls without visible control a normal explanation seems out of the question.

13 As a rule the ball stops before it reaches the top of the incline, and then returns slowly (two to three seconds) to the bottom and repeats. From Walter's remarks on the difficulty which he experiences in performing this experiment in front of the lighted background, we gather that it is somewhat of the order of trying to control a red-hot copper ball with an icicle; the light taking the place of the heat (to us) and the teleplasm reacting to it as an icicle would, in the former case.
(3) Walter rang the bell in the plate-glass bell-box. While it was ringing intermittently, Button turned the box around so that the only entrance was toward him and then picked it up and then turned himself and the box through an angle of 360 degrees. The box continued ringing intermittently all through the experiment, and then stopped.\(^{14}\)

All these experiments were in good red light.

Interceding séances at which other apparatus was present, and those withheld from the present chapter for display here, we have had at this moment eleven consecutive at which the Butler apparatus was present either exclu-

sively as the piece de résistance. We have had in this period standardized séance of general attendance, and another at which in many of its procedures was like the standardized séance at which there was a small and deliberately selected audience. Save for a few more occasions like that one, we have no more standardized séances; the practice of public sèances has been definitely abandoned as constituting too great a drag on a mediumship whose fundamental raison d'être is scientific. For the balance of the year, practically sèances will be given to two programs: the development of sub-print sequences and the experimentation with the apparatus. Two sèances, of June 16th and 24th, are to complete the preliminary stages of the latter procedure were consecutive, and apparently represent a brief taken, by Walter or by the sitters, from the thumb-prints. The records of both sèances, as taken from notes, follow:

June 16. The Psychic was controlled by Butler and Crandon. When Butler is present, he sat at the left. Walter came promptly and, after working with photographic plates and paper, proceeded with the following experiments with the apparatus:

1. The glass bell-box was presented but Walter said that he would not work it. It was removed. The Little Theatre was on
the table and Crandon put the glass balances on the stage. They were in balance with empty pans. With the light on (first step) Walter asked for one weight. This was put in the west pan by Crandon. The loaded pan then rose slightly. Another weight was added and the loaded pan dropped slightly and then rose again. The addition of another weight caused the west pan to rise slightly higher. The light or empty pan was now down on the stage. The scales then balanced statically, i.e., the pans were at approximately the same level. Immediately they began to dance up and down in time to the music. There was no visible contact and both were horizontal. Walter then asked that a jackknife be added to the load. Richardson attempted to put his pocketknife on the loaded west pan but failed to get it exactly in the center of the result that it fell to the table. On the second attempt succeeded and the loaded pan was grounded, but it immediately rose and the empty pan tipped up at an angle as though hit by the front edge. There was no visible connection to the west pan for these operations. The experiments were carried out in a continuous period of illumination. The only access to the west pan was through the front opening, the netting screen having been thrown back on top of the theatre. The scales were then and Richardson obtained his knife.

(2) The Sisyphus was placed on the stage. After to be attempting to roll the ball up the incline but without Walter took the matter in hand. The ball rolled slowly up the incline, paused a moment, and then as slowly rolled back.

(3) The Little Theatre was removed from the table glass bell-box again presented. The cover was off but all were in place in staggered position. The bell was rung the light. It then rang several times but not very loudly, with the cover in place and the slides as before the glass partitions (slides) removed and the cover on rang while Butler lifted the box high in the air and the

---

15 The theatre was in the first form, with wooden top, bottom and transparent glass, with the exception of the knife, there could be no charge that heavy weight was substituted for a lighter one. Also, all the weights were pan, and this obviates any such assumption as the above. Furthermore, there are no net, so nothing can be concealed in or on them. The fact that the beam oscillated in time to the music indicates that the invisible force controlling their movement was not applied eccentrically, as was the case in experiment was a very important one. In effect, each increment constituted a new experiment carried out in front of a continuously illuminated ground which permitted of complete visual control of the locus of the knife. There were, then, four experiments under these conditions. Since the knife was removed, with darkness between during which John was asserted (by Walter) to be attempting to roll the ball up the incline but without Walter took the matter in hand. The ball rolled slowly up the incline, paused a moment, and then as slowly rolled back.

16 Stage enclosed except that the cover was thrown back.
(3) Walter rang the bell in the plate-glass bell-box. While it was ringing intermittently, Button turned the box around so that the only entrance was toward him and then picked it up and then turned himself and the box through an angle of 360 degrees. The box continued ringing intermittently all through the experiment, and then stopped.\textsuperscript{14}

All these experiments were in good red light.

including séances at which other apparatus was present, and

including those withheld from the present chapter for display
here, we have had at this moment eleven consecutive
at which the Butler apparatus was present either exclu-

exclusive as the 

Piece de resistance. We have had in this period
standardized séance of general attendance, and another
which in many of its procedures was like the standardized
at which there was a small and deliberately selected
ese. Save for a few more occasions like that one, we
ere no more standardized séances; the practice of public
on has been definitely abandoned as constituting too
drag on a mediumship whose fundamental raison d'être
scientific one. For the balance of the year, practically sole
will be given to two programs: the development of
ub-print sequences and the experimentation with the
apparatus. Two séances, of June 16th and 24th, are

to complete the preliminary stages of the latter pro-

ce were consecutive, and apparently represent a brief
aken, by Walter or by the sitters, from the thumb-
iments. The records of both séances, as taken from
otes, follow:

\textbf{SEANCE 16.} The Psychic was controlled by Butler and Crandon.

1. When Butler is present, he sat at the left. Walter came

promptly and, after working with photographic plates

naker, proceeded with the following experiments with the

apparatus:

1) The glass bell-box was presented but Walter said that he

ld not work it. It was removed. The Little Theatre was on

not clear whether the red light in the box was on or off. However, it is

ote that the ringing was intermittent while the box was being carried
ake this bell intermittent, the flappers must be displaced more or less from
osition and then returned exactly to that position. Obviously this is

delicate operation than that involved in making the S. A. bell-box
the table and Crandon put the glass balances on the stage. They were in balance with empty pans. With the light on (first step) Walter asked for one weight. This was put in the west pan by Crandon. The loaded pan then rose slightly. Another weight was added and the loaded pan dropped slightly and then rose again. The addition of another weight caused the west pan to rise still higher. The light or empty pan was now down on the stage.

Scales then balanced statically, i.e., the pans were at approximately the same level. Immediately they began to dance up and down in time to the music. There was no visible contact and both were horizontal. Walter then asked that a jack-knife be added to the load. Richardson attempted to put his pocket-knife in the west pan but failed to get it exactly in the center of the result that it fell to the table. On the second attempt he succeeded and the loaded pan was grounded, but it immediately rose and the empty pan tipped up at an angle as though hit by the front edge. There was no visible connection to the side for these operations. The experiments were carried out in a continuous period of illumination. The only access to the stage was through the front opening, the netting screen having been thrown back on top of the theatre. The scales were then reset and Richardson obtained his knife.

(2) The Sisyphus was placed on the stage. After total darkness between during which John was asserted (by Walter) to be attempting to roll the ball up the incline but without success, Walter took the matter in hand. The ball rolled slowly to the top of the incline, paused a moment, and then as slowly rolled down to the bottom.

(3) The Little Theatre was removed from the table and the glass bell-box again presented. The cover was off but all were in place in staggered position. The bell was rung in the light. It then rang several times but not very loudly, with the cover in place and the slides as before. The glass partitions (slides) removed and the cover on the bell rang while Butler lifted the box high in the air and...

---

15 The theatre was in the first form, with wooden top, bottom and ground which permitted of complete visual control of the locus of the experiment. It was, then, four experiments under these conditions. Since the theatre was transparent, with the exception of the knife, there could be no charge that heavy weight was substituted for a lighter one. Also, all the weights were pan, and this obviates any such assumption as the above. Furthermore, nothing can be concealed in or on them. The fact that the beam oscillated in time to the music indicates that the invisible force controlling their movement was not applied eccentrically, as was the case when the knife was added to the load.

16 Stage enclosed except that the cover was thrown back.
way around while light was playing on it all the time, while it rang intermittently. The flappers, recently painted with white enamel, were seen to be in contact in their central position but swung apart as Butler was about to place the box on the table. Walter asked to have it left on the table as it was. (The intermittent ringing indicated that the flappers moved very slightly from the central position and returned exactly to center each time. That the movement was slight was determined by the observation that they seemed to remain central throughout the test.)

In the description of the Sisyphus experiment no time interval was given in the writer's notes. Estimating the interval from this distance, it may have been approximately three seconds for the movement from one end of the incline to the other. The ball did not slide; it rolled. The sequence of the bell-box experiments provides an excellent check against the assumption that some extraneous structure, however fine, is involved in the ringing under such conditions. Butler, the designer and maker of the device, is also one of the most critical observers of its functioning. He was studying it carefully throughout the experiment and was satisfied that no normal means were used to make the bell ring. In connection with the remarkable actions of the glass balances, it will be desirable to compare the conditions existing during this séance with those of later dates.\(^{17}\)

June 24. Fife controlling at the Psychic's left and Crandon at the right. Trance came quickly and Walter manifested promptly. After introductions to the new sitters he refused to consider fingerprints, saying that he had set that for next week. He then proceeded with the following phenomena:

1. Walter asked for the old (S.A.) bell-box. It was put on the table and rang in the dark but when Bernstein lifted it twice it failed to ring. On a third trial it rang as he turned around with it. Replacing it on the table he examined it in white light and turned back the flapper. When he replaced the flapper the bell rang again, still in the red light.

2. The glass bell-box was put on the table and rang but without the internal red light. It then rang while white light was played on it. After a brief delay it rang again with the red light now turned on, presumably by Walter. Walter then attempted to ring it while it was held in the air by Mrs. Scott, by Bernstein and by Mrs. Bernstein, without success. Again he tried while Fife held it. This time it rang intermittently while Fife turned around with it and continued to intermit while it was replaced on the table and the open side turned away from Margery, then turned back. It was now ringing continuously and Fife, at Walter's request, turned it on its back. The bell stopped ringing when

\(^{17}\) Temperature in séance room approximately 70° F.; Barometer, 30.11; Humidity, 67 per cent.
the box had turned through an angle of about 50°. After the box had been returned to about the same angle, on its way to its normal position, the bell rang (with the internal red light on) and continued ringing so long that the light disturbed the medium. It rang again (while on the table) while the white flash light was turned on it. Walter objected to the white enamel on the flappers, saying that it dissolved his energy.

(3) The Comstock balances were put on the table. Mrs. Bernstein, making her own choice, put four weights in the east pan and one in the west pan. In a subsequent period of red light the scales balanced kinetically. Bernstein then picked them up and turned part way around while Crandon turned the white flash light on the scales, which continued to balance as before.

(4) The VCO test was successfully carried out with Scott guarding the top of the tube.

Walter said that after the finger prints were finished for the summer he wanted fewer sittings; that it was too hot to bring out the teleplasm. For this date the temperature was approximately 72°; Barometer, 30.12; humidity, 78 per cent.

The next three chapters contain further descriptions of the use of the Butler apparatus under conditions which have led to some very important evidence bearing on the supernormal nature of the phenomena.

---

18 The act of turning the box on its long axis should not change the tendency of the flappers to remain central if they were held together as above, nor if they were held central by a system of symmetrically disposed struts. If, however, they are held together somewhat lightly and centered by a single strut (presumably teleplasmic) extending from one of them and at an angle to the back plate, it is conceivable that this turning operation would introduce an unbalancing moment when the flappers departed a certain distance from the vertical. Also, the flappers would return to their central position when the box was returned to this critical angle.
CHAPTER LI

Five Outstanding Records of 1927

As was noted in Chapter XLIX, the development of the mediumship in 1927 focussed largely on certain specific phenomena, interspersed with relatively few "standardized séances" for new sitters. Occasionally, however, it seemed desirable to give certain of the better informed students of the subject an opportunity to examine the phenomena under more rigid conditions of control.

In January, 1927, Mr. Hamlin Garland, novelist and biographer, was elected to the Board of Trustees of the A.S.P.R., and was named Chairman of the Committee on Research, largely because of his public position and his interest in and experience with the physical phenomena of mediumship. Several of his articles and novels contain a psychical element which is treated in a manner that indicates his conviction as to the supernormality of the occurrences that he describes. He makes no secret of his belief on this point, but seems strongly inclined to the animistic interpretation as contrasted to the spiritistic. He believes that the objection to light in mediumistic séances is a function of the medium's doubts or fears, and has no physical basis.¹

Garland's interest in the phenomena, coupled with his optimistic viewpoint, led him to believe that if he could have a sufficient number of séances under very rigid control he could bring conviction to many sceptics—who were not present. Hence, he arranged for a series of sittings with Margery under conditions which were approximately his own, except that it

¹ Apparently the effect of light in mediumistic séances involving physical phenomena should be determined by laboratory methods. Since mediums are persons whose powers vary, there is little reason for assuming that all will react alike to the same stimuli. Furthermore, there is some slight basis for believing that the animistic subject (i.e., the one who may control his own psychic energy even when it is exter­orized) may function supernormally in light that would inhibit (in most cases) the phenomena which are believed to be truly mediumistic.
seemed desirable to have someone present who was somewhat familiar with the conditions which usually prevail, but not with any idea of interfering in any way with the effectiveness of his work. This arrangement resulted in a preliminary séance, and two others at which he imposed his own control. Naturally, such experiments should be presented in full, and, for the convenience of the reader, may well be collated in one chapter.

In addition to these séances of Garland's and the one for Miss Walker, there is an earlier séance which, because of the conditions under which it was held, the personnel of the group, and the nature of the results obtained, certainly deserves a place in this chapter. The record was entirely by the late Dr. Ozora Davis,' and was concurred in by Mrs. Davis and Mr. Bond. 2 Since it carries its own introduction and *raison d'être* it is appended at this point:

_Séance of February 15, 1927: 4:45 P.M._ Bond, Dr. and Mrs. [Ozora S.] Davis, Mrs. Stinson and Mrs. Crandon had been discussing the criticism often waged against the Margery phenomena to the effect that Crandon's presence in the séance room cast suspicion upon his collusion in the production of the results. The suggestion was made that sittings without his presence were desirable, and it was agreed that an experiment should be made at once. Therefore, on the spur of the moment the five persons named above went to the upper floor of the house and the acts that followed took place from 4:45 to 5:40 P.M.

Before going into the séance room, the party gathered in the neighboring room. Mrs. Davis made an examination of the Psychic and assured the others that she could detect no signs of any articles concealed about her; she wore a bathrobe over her clothing and Mrs. Davis put on a short Chinese coat. Then Davis cut out the tube and the wires 3 and securely wired the wrists and ankles of the psychic. Mrs. Davis conducted her to the séance room. All the precautions which could be suggested were carried out.

On reaching the séance room the group was seated in the order:

---

1 At that time, President of the Chicago Theological Seminary.
2 Dr. Davis did not sign this report, but Bond states that the former wrote the whole of it, that it was concurred in by all the sitters, and presents a true picture of the séance. Dudley heard Davis express his complete satisfaction with the sitting and with the supernormality of the phenomena.
3 Rubber tubing used as a protection against cutting the flesh (see p. 318). The tubing provides an additional obstacle to slipping the wrist ties in either direction, since it tends to adhere to the skin.
Margery, Bond (holding her left hand), Davis (controlling the red light), Mrs. Stinson, Mrs. Davis (holding the Psychic’s right hand in addition only during the final levitation). There was a space of two chairs between Mrs. Davis and the right hand of the Psychic until the final levitation of the baskets. The psychic was tightly and effectually wired into the glass cabinet, both hands and feet. The latter had not more than three inches extreme lateral play—none vertically. The buckle of the neck-collar was wired up by Davis.

Walter’s whistle was heard within a minute of the first darkening of the room. Bond, at the Psychic’s directions, had picked out with finger and thumb five wooden letters (not identified by him) and placed these in the larger basket. He also, unknown to the other sitters, added a packet of cigarettes. He placed the basket by Walter’s direction within the cabinet by the Psychic’s right leg, on the floor.

Walter almost immediately threw out the letters, identifying them in turn as U, W, M, L, E. These were also in turn identified by Bond and Davis, who retained them. Walter threw out the packet, saying, “Here, Bond, take your cigarettes.”

Walter whistled two well-known airs, very clearly.

Walter next asked that the shelf be placed in the cabinet. This was done by Davis. At Walter’s request Bond then took the smaller luminous basket and laid it along the shelf. Walter rocked this basket in red light in sight of all, and Bond then put his hand and forearm along between the Psychic and the basket, touching the shelf all along its edge, but felt nothing. All the time, the rocking continued gently, but finally ceased, and began again as soon as the light was shut off.

Mrs. Davis then, at Walter’s request, took the basket and laid it on the shelf. The same rocking was repeated in red light and Davis placed his arm and hand between the Psychic and the basket, as before.

Walter then gave explicit instructions that the sitters were to do exactly as told, affirming that this was very important. Dr. and Mrs. Davis and Bond assured him that they would do so. He was whistling in a strong, clear way a familiar tune, in which Davis joined him. He said, “Now don’t fall over one another and hurt yourselves.” We understand that Mrs. Stinson’s lameness prevented her sharing in the action.

Walter then asked for the luminous basket to be placed within the larger basket by Bond and the two to be placed in the cabinet at the right of the Psychic’s feet. Sounds were immediately heard, the fibers of the basket were creaking, its action was apparent from the movement of the luminous bands. Walter fretted and grumbled at what he said was the catching of the basket in the Psychic’s clothing. He said: “She has a bathrobe on. Why has
she got a bathrobe on at this time of day?" Mrs. Davis said, "To keep from being cold." Walter said, "Well, you have one on too; and you look like an old Chinese woman." This was due to the fact that Mrs. Davis had slipped on a short, padded Chinese coat. The luminous spots soon showed the small basket to be in free movement in the cabinet, when it must have reached the height of five feet. Then Walter directed Mrs. Davis to control the Psychic's right hand, which she did. Bond was instructed to control the psychic's left hand, which he did. Both affirm that the hands were wired as at the beginning, according to their feeling, and were also under their manual control. The basket was meantime moving slowly.\(^5\) Then Walter instructed Davis to come into the cabinet and control Psychic's mouth, which he did with his right hand. The definition of her nose and lips was clear and the control was perfect. She was somewhat restless and moaned occasionally, in a way disturbing to him and Mrs. Davis. Davis' left shoulder and arm were rubbed and touched by the basket, as it moved out into the room, within less than a foot of his eyes. Thus the basket was obstructed flatwise, into the room, entirely clear of the cabinet, according to the estimate of Davis. It was finally dropped at Mrs. Stinson's feet, and the sitters were told to take their original positions. Walter said that his force was going fast, and, although he had suggested that the small basket be placed in the larger one, he said that he must go. In response to an expression of thanks from Davis, he said, "No living man could have done these things."\(^6\)

He then said goodbye.

The Psychic came out of her trance quietly. Davis released the collar, which was firmly wired. He examined and cut the wiring of hands and feet. The wiring was as originally fastened. Davis vouches for the firmness and impossible release of all knots, with which his old training in the telegraph office gave him experience.

---

Garland's first visit resulted in the séance of May 19th, which was regarded as of a preliminary nature; hence, he made no report. Crandon made his usual record, and Mrs. Richardson prepared an independent report. The circle was as follows: Margery, Hamlin Garland, Wallace K. Butler, Crandon, Mrs. Tapley, Mrs. Hamilton, Mr. J. G. Falkenrath (Sao Paulo, Brazil), C. S. Hill. Outside the circle: Dr. and Mrs. Richard-

---

\(^5\) Italics by the editor.

\(^6\) There would seem to be no escape from the verdict of supernormality short of attacking the validity of the record or the powers of observation of the sitters.
son, Mr. Dudley, Mr. Bond. Both of the above records are given in full:

May 19th: Crandon's Record. Walter came through promptly and greeted all the sitters. He then carried out the following experiments:

1. Cognition of wooden letters put in the basket by finger and thumb of Garland. The letters were named and then thrown out and the readings were 100 per cent correct.

2. Rolling of small luminous basket on shelf in front of the Psychic in red light.

3. Repetition of same with Garland passing hand and forearm freely between the Psychic and the rolling basket. He at the same time standing between the rolling basket and all the other sitters.

4. Demonstration of the independent voice by the use of Richardson's VCO machine, Falkenrath protecting the luminous opening of the voice machine.

The lashings, which had all been done by Garland or Butler, were now cut by Garland and the head released from the padlock collar. All were found as originally placed. The circle now moved to the old cabinet with Garland on the left and Crandon on the right. Here Walter carried out the following experiments.

5. Ringing of the plate glass bell-box both with and without the turning on of the red light by Walter in the box at the same time. When this was done no hand could be seen ringing the bell.

6. This was now repeated with Garland having control of both the Psychic’s hands, and Mrs. Richardson having control of both of Crandon’s hands.

7. The S.A. bell-box was now put on the table with the glass bell-box. Walter now proceeded to: (a) ring the glass bell-box with its red light on and (b) ring the S.A. bell-box while Mrs. Richardson turned a complete circle with it in her hands. The two bells rang simultaneously, the ringing was irregular and intermittent, the boxes were not in rhythm with each other, and the red light in the room was turned on during all these experiments.

8. Walter made the [Comstock] balances oscillate with a four-to-one load. The weights were put in either pan at the pleasure of Garland and the balances oscillated as if equally loaded.

9. This was now repeated with Garland holding the complete balance unit in his hands and turning a circle of his whole body with it. As this went on, the white flash light was turned on the whole outfit and on every part of it and underneath it. While the balances were thus behaving on the table, at another time, Garland

7 Dudley was so busy about other matters that he failed to complete his record for this evening.
passed his hand between the Psychic and the balances, and Mrs. Richardson did the same between Crandon and the balances.

* * * * *

May 19th: Mrs. Richardson's Record. The first part of the sitting was a regulation glass-cabinet one, the Psychic being lashed and the knots tied or supervised by newcomers. Trance came on at once, and Walter joined in the conversation, saying that Garland was correct when he stated that often a medium would have one cold and one warm hand, during a sitting. This, he explained, was because the controls generally used only one half of the medium—the right. Followed a 100 per cent performance of:

2. Cognition of objects (trance).
3. Rolling of basket in red light (trance).
4. Voice machine (medium awake). Garland sat at medium's left controlling the letters, etc. [throughout part I of the séance].

Part 2. Old cabinet, Psychic in trance. Walter rang glass bell-box, with and without its red light, which he operated himself; rang S.A. bell-box; rang both together, intermittently, irregularly; while Garland held the S.A. box and turned around with it—all in good red light. Walter spoke at least twice, in red light.

The experiment with the scales was now performed perfectly. Garland lifted the apparatus, Mrs. Richardson did likewise, and thorough examination in white light could show no signs of fraud. The scales continued to balance a four-to-one load. Walter said, in response to questions, that he could make visible the cylinder which holds down the light pan, but that it was unwise to use so much force.

Hill's first appearance at a sitting after an absence of six months, called forth from Walter a prolonged and varied whistle which was equal to a page of words. [There were various remarks about the health of Hill and Mrs. Hamilton, and the teleplasmic phenomena revolving about Hill, which Mrs. Richardson recorded but which are suppressed because of their personal nature. The record concludes with the observation:] The voice was particularly strong and could hardly be called a whisper—more like a husky tone.

* * * * *

The next sitting, in order of their dates, is that reported by Miss Walker and Mr. Bond, whose record reads as follows:

May 27, 1927: Record by Bond and Miss Walker.

Note. The apparatus employed at this sitting is new, and has been made and presented by a recent sitter, Mr. Butler, hitherto a stranger to Dr. and Mrs. Crandon. The "Theatre" with its various objects was used on this occasion for the second time.
only and "Walter" the control has not yet had opportunity for learning how to manipulate the parts with certainty.

Present on this occasion (clockwise). Psychic: Mr. Bligh Bond (controlling her left hand); Mrs. Gray: Mr. Rhys Williams; Miss Gray: Miss May C. Walker; Dr. Crandon (right).

Psychic was disrobed and examined by Mrs. Gray and Miss Walker and was clad in bathrobe, stockings and shoes only. She was led to chair in the old cabinet which is built of light wood framing covered with cloth. There was no mechanical control of hands, feet or head, as this was not needed in view of the nature of the phenomena expected.

Trance supervened quickly after the turning out of the red light at 9:15. Walter whistled in about two minutes and spoke, greeting all the sitters. Phenomena followed as detailed below:

1. The theatre had been placed on the small rectangular table rather to the left of Psychic and a little in advance. Bond took charge of the rheostat handle which can give eight grades of illumination. The experiment commenced in darkness. Presently Walter was heard fumbling with the apparatus and he asked Bond to turn on the dim light. In moving the rheostat a flash occurred which disconcerted Walter who said it dissolved his teleplasm, or his structure. Walter then exclaimed that he knew there was something wrong as he could not get under the apparatus to work in front. He said the legs were folded. Crandon remembered then that he had omitted to extend the four legs on which the theatre stands free of table and this was accordingly done. The box now stood several inches clear of the table top and, at Walter's request, close to the right front angle of the table top.

2. The balances were now placed by Crandon on the stage and the red light switched on. All sitters could plainly see the balances in silhouette against the red illuminated background. These balances are made of non-magnetic material, the pans being of netting and the shaft and beam of glass. The weights used are small glass squares. At Walter's request, ten of these were put by Bond into the pan on right (facing front) and thus holding down the pan with about 4 ounces weight.

The net curtain was lowered and almost at once the pan was seen to rise and fall repeatedly, then remain in poise for a period. Finally the weighted pan was seen to rise for the full height, the empty pan resting on the bed of the stage. In this position the scales remained for an appreciable interval. All sitters had a clear

---

8 Description of theatre omitted; see pp. 598-600.
9 In subsequent séances it will be noted that Walter ordinarily controlled the increase and sometimes the decrease in illumination.
10 In its first form the legs folded. After reconstruction they were made rigid.
11 The weights had not been checked at that time. Each one weighs approximately \( \frac{1}{4} \) oz. (Av.); therefore, 10 of them would weigh approximately \( \frac{11}{4} \) oz. (Av.).
view of the whole of the illuminated field and all agree that there was no visible contact of any object with the scales during the time. No opaque body, filament, or shadow could be seen and the apparatus seemed to move of its own accord. The net curtain appeared to be undisturbed. Owing to the position of Psychic behind the plane of the red glass she was invisible. Bond certifies that he maintained control of her left hand and Crandon, the right.

(3) The balances were removed by Crandon and another apparatus consisting of a V-shaped glass chute making an inclined plane, held on light supports with wire stays, was brought and placed on the stage. At the lower end of the chute a ball of light celluloid, translucent, with opaque rings around its equator, was placed in the trough of the chute. The net curtain was lowered as before and the red light turned on by rheostat to give a good illumination. All parts were clearly visible to every sitter. After about half a minute's interval the ball was seen to vibrate and rise little by little, slowly and in irregular stages, towards the center of the height of incline. Then it fell back a short way and again rose. The ball was seen to be revolving as it went, the equatorial band turning over. Finally the ball reached the top of the incline and after a slow return to a point rather lower than midway, it dropped suddenly to the base. Again, no foreign body or any shadow seemed to approach any point of the apparatus and the illuminated field was nowhere dimmed during the movement of the ball.

In answer to a question, Walter said that he did not use teleplasm for these experiments, but they were performed by withdrawing energy from each and all of the sitters. He explained that if he could not get the energy from the sitters he had to take it from the Psychic but this he tried to avoid. Hence, he pointed out, it was of great importance that the sitters should be of the right kind to give their energy. Walter said that teleplasm was not used by him for these experiments. Teleplasm, he reminded us, was in itself quite inert until vitalized by energy and that is why he is sometimes quite unable to give motor power to the teleplasm. The invisible energy he uses for this can be collected and localized and he would be able later to look this inside a sealed glass receptacle (the bell-box being mentioned) and work from within in white light. All sitters present on this occasion Walter vouched for as being ready or able to contribute energy.

(4) Glass Bell-box. The sisyphus was now removed and the new glass bell-box presented by Butler was brought. This had been readjusted by Butler since its last use and the red bulb light was not available as it was called for in haste for this occasion. Unfortunately Crandon, in removing the sisyphus tripped over the

12 The Sisyphus; see p. 601.
electric conduit wire which lay on the floor, and as a result, the red lamp could not be turned on. The connection was severed. Walter said it did not matter. "Go ahead," he said, "I shall know what to do, and you shall see something."

Bond, at Walter's request, found and brought an electric torch which was handed to Crandon. The bell-box was placed on the table, which had been shifted to a position directly in front of the Psychic. Control of both the Psychic's hands was resumed.

Walter now asked the sitters to keep up light conversation whilst he worked, and not to concentrate too heavily upon him. The bell then rang, the only illumination being the spark made within the glass chamber on contact of the metal levers. Walter asked Miss Walker to place her hand over the Psychic's mouth during the ringing of the bell. To do this, she had to interpose herself between Crandon and the bell-box. She stood up and leaned across Crandon. The Psychic's mouth was closed and the bell continued to ring whilst Miss Walker's hand was over her mouth.

Walter now called for a handkerchief to be used to moderate the glare of the torch when used on the bell-box. This was provided by Crandon who placed it on top of the box. As the bell rang, Crandon turned the flash upon the box and the bell continued to ring, all present clearly seeing the box and table top fully illuminated together with the circle of sitters and the Psychic in her chair. The handkerchief was seen to be suspended over the side of the box so that the light filtered through it into the box.

Miss Walker now at Walter's request lifted the glass box from the table in her two hands, the ringing continuing during the period of lifting. The box was then returned to the table and a second time Miss Walker was called upon to lift it. This time there was no handkerchief to break the rays of the torch. As before, nothing was visible either within or in the neighborhood of the box which could account by contact for the movement. The bell continued ringing whilst held by Miss Walker, with one or two intermissions of a marked nature. The whole circle was clearly illuminated and any physical object within or approaching the bell-box would have been visible in the bright light. The Psychic was seen reclining in her chair and Miss Walker noticed that her mouth was closed.

Walter then said he must go, and after a few minutes further conversation, during which he assured Williams of the serious nature of the intent which underlay his apparently frivolous talk, the sitting broke up shortly after 11 p.m.

We, the undersigned, attest the correctness of the foregoing notes which were drawn up immediately on the termination of the

---

13 The mantel lamp controlled by a rheostat at Crandon's right. Fortunately the flash lamp provided adequate illumination.
sitting by Miss Walker and Bond, and transcribed by Bond on
the following morning.

MAY C. WALKER.
FREDERICK BLIGH BOND.

* * * *

This séance of May 27th, 1927, was even more impressive as
regards phenomena and control than the last (May 21st). If
one rules out absolutely fantastic surmise, there

Addendum by Miss Walker

was no way in which to account for the movements
of the scales, the ball, or the mechanism of the
bell-box, by normal means. The phenomena hap­
pened right in front of the background of red light in the cases
of the scales and the ball. The wire netting prevented any inter­
ference from the front by the sitters and any such interference,
whether by the Psychic or a sitter, must have been seen. Walter
allowed me to put my hand on the Psychic's mouth while the bell
was ringing on the table, and when I picked up the bell-box in my
hands I could see the Psychic's face and both hands controlled.
Mr. Bligh Bond had control of the Psychic's left hand behind
the little theatre so nothing could be done behind it by manipulation
on the part of the Psychic. During the actual occurrence of all
the phenomena there was maintained a double control of the
Psychic's right hand by Crandon and myself and Crandon's right
hand was grasping my left arm which he also put up to his mouth
to rule out any probability of its use in this connection.

MAY C. WALKER.

* * * *

The next case in this group is the sitting of June 10th, 1927,
for which Garland prepared his own record, which is reproduced
in the Journal, February, 1930. As given below (with the date
added) it conforms to the above with the exception of such
omissions of titles as will make it follow the style of other
records.

In arranging for this sitting I had requested the use of a room
in a neutral home and a control so different that the current
criticisms of methods in Crandon's house

Garland's record of June 10th, 1927

would not hold. I realized that a sitting in
the prepared séance room at 10 Lime Street,
would have far less value than one held in
a place of our choosing, but as I had difficulty in finding such
a place, I suggested, as a compromise, that the sitting be held in
the home of Richardson, whose methods of control had met with
my approval.
It is only fair to say that I approached this sitting as a seasoned investigator of more than thirty years' experience, and that I would not condemn any psychic on the records of one sitting. I had held more than two hundred somewhat similar sittings, fifty-five with one person (a woman); and I knew how little is necessary to prevent any phenomena which are a subtle mingling of mind and matter. I had as my official companion in this experiment, Mrs. Mary Derieux, Secretary to the Research Committee of which I am Chairman.

So much for preliminaries. We dined at Richardson's house in Newton, and as neither the Psychic nor her husband was present, we had perfect freedom to discuss her and her mediumship. Richardson, who had held many sittings with her, pleased me by his frankness, his clear thinking, and by his ingenious methods of testing out phenomena. The only other sitter, Fife, did not arrive till eight o'clock.

When dinner was finished, I helped Mrs. Richardson clear away the table, curtain the windows and roll up the rugs, while Mrs. Derieux met the Psychic and took her to an upper chamber to see that she brought no apparatus of any kind into the séance room. A three-fold screen about five feet high served as cabinet. Over the top of this we placed a cloth. The table I shoved against the door leading to the kitchen, and in the little den off the dining room, which had no outlet but a window, we placed our stenographer. She had a shaded lamp and the door was nearly closed, during most of the sitting.

In an arm chair between the wings of the screen I placed the Psychic; and with the aid of Mrs. Derieux passed a tape around each of her wrists. This tape, at my request, was stitched by Mrs. Richardson to the sleeve of the Psychic's kimono. I then folded the tape tightly, doubled it and hammered a tack down through both folds of the tape and the kimono, thus securing each wrist to the chair arm by loops in the middle of the tape. There were no knots to be untied. The two ends were then carried out to the side and firmly tacked to the floor. All discussion of knots or 'trick handcuffs' or 'trick screw-eyes' was eliminated.

Mrs. Derieux, under my direction, passed another tape twice around each of the Psychic's ankles and joining the ends of this tape to the ends of the tape which confined her hands, I tacked them to the floor together. The feet (which were clothed in stockings and slippers) had more play than the hands, but I was not greatly concerned about this, for we were after phenomena relating to the hands.

Mrs. Derieux then tied a ribbon tightly (too tightly I feared) around the Psychic's neck and knotted it to the high back of her chair. The play of her head was only a few inches at most.

To all this the Psychic submitted cheerfully although the heat was intense and her position necessarily most uncomfortable.
Fife had brought with him several sheets of paper especially prepared to receive finger-prints, and also some cakes of wax to be used for the same purpose. A kettle of hot water and a dish and cloth were in readiness as was also Richardson’s voice-cut-out machine and a small basket with illuminated handle. The doors were then closed and we took our places.

Fife controlled the Psychic’s right hand and I her left, and when I say controlled, I mean that I held it so firmly that it could not and did not participate in any of the phenomena.

Mrs. Derieux sat next to Fife; Richardson was in the center and controlled the light, which had a red as well as a white bulb.

From this point I will follow the notes made by the stenographer, who set down what we called out to her. She sat in the den with the door only a few inches ajar and did not emerge until the sitting was over.

Immediately after the light went out, Walter whistled merrily as if signalling his presence and then, in a curious guttural tone, took charge of the sitting. At his request I moved a basket containing several wooden letters from my right and placed it in front of the Psychic’s feet. I had no knowledge of what these letters were. While each of us reported “hand control perfect,” Walter could be heard manipulating the basket.

Walter throws out a letter and says it is a Z. Garland picks it up and announces that it is a Z. Walter throws out a second letter and says it is a Z. Correct. Walter throws out a third letter and says it is an M. This is confirmed by Mrs. Derieux. A fourth letter is thrown out and is said to be an O, and this confirmed.

Walter then passed the basket to Garland. (Later one of the Z’s was found to be an N—a mistake easily to be understood.)

Let us stop for a moment and analyze these very simple phenomena, reported as they happened, for they have important implications. The room was very dark. The Psychic not only wore stockings, but slippers with a strap across the instep. Her ankles were twice encircled with tape and the tape was nailed to the floor. The doubter will be forced to either one or the other of two charges: either that the Psychic kicked these letters from the basket and identified them as they fell, or that some one in the circle acted as confederate. So far as the Psychic’s hands were concerned, they had nothing to do with the manipulation of these letters. If she identified them with the tips of her slippers, she did very well. This precise perception of objects in the dark is one I have often noted in other psychics. It is inexplicable to me.

However, the phenomena we most desired were finger-prints on the paper or on the wax. I resume the notes.—

Fife places on a small table in front of the Psychic, a package of plain white paper for finger-prints. At the request of Walter, Fife turns the paper over. Walter then said that he had placed both his hands on the two topsheets of the paper.
At this point we broke the circle. Richardson lit the red bulb and Fife removed two sheets of the paper from the top and one from the bottom. We then resumed control. The Psychic appeared to be in a trance with her hands and feet exactly as I had confined them.

At Walter's request the small basket with illuminated handle is placed on the table by Garland, and the large basket is placed on the floor in front of the Psychic. In the basket Mrs. Derieux at Walter's request places two objects. Hand control perfect. Walter stated that an object placed in the basket was a lady's handkerchief. Correct. Walter throws out unexpectedly another letter and says it is an L. Correct. Walter also throws out a piece of money from the basket and names it correctly. (It was a silver quarter, I believe, and to touch this with her toes was the Psychic's only possible connection with it.)

At this point the small basket on the table began to move and we all bent over to see if we could detect a cause for it. Mrs. Derieux and Fife both reported two white prongs around the handle of the basket. I could see only a wavering, swiftly darting shadow. The basket fell and was replaced by Mrs. Derieux. It had a feeble, agitated movement as though a very slight force were operating against it.

Basket now rolls over to the left; control is announced to be perfect.

At the suggestion of Richardson (or Walter), I now put my hand over the Psychic's mouth so that it could not be said that she blew the basket over, or operated a rod with her teeth. This is the only time that I released control of her hand during a critical period.

With control resumed, every hand in the circle being clasped, the basket was lifted and shaken and waved about in the air. There was a convulsive movement of the Psychic's knees, at one time, but her left hand remained tightly clasped in mine and Fife reported the same control of her right hand. So far as her left hand was concerned she had nothing to do with the handling of the basket.

Basket falls upon the floor and Walter throws a small object across the room and says, "There's a piece of your basket." The big basket was thrown out in front of the Psychic and lands in Mrs. Derieux's lap. (Later this piece of the basket was found and identified by Mrs. Derieux.)

At this point the light was turned on. We examined the fastenings and found them undisturbed, except that one of the smaller tacks had given way. The Psychic's feet were in her slippers and in the same position as when I looped the tape around her ankles. The straps of her slippers were buttoned and the tapes undisturbed. The ribbon around her neck was precisely as we had tied it and the tacks and stitches of the tapes on her wrists were unchanged.
All the phenomena, thus far, were familiar to me. I had recorded much more startling telekinetic happenings under much sterner test conditions scores of times, hence I was a bit disappointed. I was eager to find the finger-prints which Walter had said were on the paper, this was the novelty to which I addressed my interest.

We now passed to the experiments with the wax. It must be borne in mind that while the Psychic was free of her bonds, she remained seated in her chair and her hands were controlled by Fife and myself. If she had any part in what followed the fault is our own. I can answer for her left hand.

While the red light was on, Fife placed a shallow dish on the small table in front of the Psychic, who sat silent with lax hands and averted face. Into this dish Richardson poured some hot water, and Fife laid across the dish a band of folded cloth a few inches wide. This was to receive the tablets of wax on which we hoped to get finger-prints.

Under Fife’s direction Mrs. Derieux now placed on the cloth one of the marked pieces of wax. Walter said the water was not hot enough. Fife added some more. Walter then said, “Gee, that water’s hot!”

The light was turned out and I resumed control of the Psychic’s left hand. Fife declared his control of the right equally firm. Walter called for the red light saying, “The water is too hot.”

As the red light was again turned on, we found the cloth out of the dish and on the table. This surprised me for I supposed it to be in the dish.

If Walter did this, as the notes give it, this is the most significant of all the happenings up to this moment, for to take this cloth from the dish and place it where it lay, required the use of two hands. I am not certain however, that the order of events is precisely as here set down. The experiment with the wax failed on account of the hot water which had melted it, and it may be that Fife had lifted it out in preparation for a second experiment. On this point I must remain noncommittal.14

There now remained the very valuable experiment with the voice-cut-out machine. This was of particular interest to me for I had carried on many experiences with these voices in broad daylight and in the dark with trumpets and without trumpets, but had never quite satisfied myself that the psychic's speech organs and the “spirit voice” were entirely disconnected.

---

14 The cloth is usually found on the table after the wax has been removed from the hot-water dish (that is what the cloth is for: to assist in drawing the wax from the dish). Fife states (in a supplementary report) that when Walter asked for red light he (Fife) found the wax on the cloth on the table, removed the wax and put it on the mat outside the circle. He added, subsequently, that he did not touch the cloth after placing it in the dish, and prior to this latter action.

15 Probably this should read “psychic’s.”
The voice-cut-out machine is quite simple. A wide flat glass mouthpiece at the end of a rubber tube connects with two tall upright glass tubes in which some illuminated balls are suspended. While the Psychic blows into the tube, these balls are held in unstable equilibrium. I placed the mouthpiece between the Psychic's lips and resumed control of her left hand while Mrs. Derieux held her palm above the open end of the upright glass tube, thus doing away with the suggestion that the balls were moved by someone from the top.16

Under these test conditions while the Psychic's breath was busied with the tube, Walter whistled and sang and spoke much more clearly than at any other time during the evening. Apparently the Psychic's organs of speech had nothing to do with the production of this voice, and as I have held speech with a similar "spirit voice" in a sun-lit room, I am not disposed to charge anyone in the circle with deception.

At the close of the sitting, we addressed ourselves to the fingerprints. Under the white light, Fife brushed powdered charcoal over the two sheets of paper which had been taken from the top of the packet, and on which Walter declared he had placed both hands. Slowly, as we watched, Fife uncovered eight fingerprints which he declared had been made during the sitting.17 Upon later study he decided that the thumbprints were "Walter's" and not those of any person in the circle. Certainly they were not those of the Psychic. She did not lift her left hand from the chair arm, during any of the critical moments of the séance.18

While the control was not as perfect as I could have made it with more time, and the circle slightly larger than I had planned, the conditions were such as to break the force of all the criticisms made against the procedure at 10 Lime Street. First of all Crandon must be counted out, and unless we are to consider Fife and Richardson as confederates, this sitting under my own control removes all talk of a trick cabinet, trap doors, and the like. There was no suggestion of fraud. The Crandons appeared most willing that Mrs. Derieux and I should have the best possible opportunity for testing Walter's powers, and it is only justice to say

---

16 The writer seems to have missed the point. The tube is guarded to prevent normal closure of the open end after the water column is unbalanced, thus stabilizing the column in that position. The floats are corks carrying match-sticks covered with luminous paint.

17 Fife describes these as "latent" prints which should be developed promptly "with proper powder." The powdered charcoal (made at the time) was not fine enough to complete the development. He says there were prints of 8 fingers and both thumbs.

18 This is a curious statement. The determination of whether the finger-print pattern is that of one person or another is by a comparison of the ridge patterns. Perhaps he meant to absolve Margery from any participation in the normal production of the prints. If so, he appears to have been very successful.
so. We are to have another sitting on entirely neutral territory with only the Richardson's, myself and two assistants present. This will eliminate other of the criticisms which lie against our sitting at Richardson's.

It is only in this way, by many tests repeated many times, that any conclusion can be reached. No man by a single sitting can render a judgment for or against a mediumship so baffling and so candid. After hundreds of similar experiments, I am certain of only one fact and that is that these phenomena belong to the field of unexplored biology.

The second Garland sitting occurred nearly three months later but in the interests of continuity in the treatment of these reports it can best be given at this point. While it involves the presentation of a finger print in wax, the latter experiment occupies such a small portion of the séance, that it seems undesirable to segregate it from the balance of the séance action.

Although Garland had obtained excellent evidence of supernatural action under his own control, he felt that there might be room for some objections to the conditions because the séance had been held in the home of a friend of the Crandon's. With the idea of meeting and overcoming any such criticism he arranged to have Margery sit at the residence of a friend of his, with whom the Crandons had no prior acquaintance. The personnel for this séance was selected by Garland, save that Crandon wished to have one person present who might be regarded as representing the Psychic. Crandon was satisfied to name Fife, and Garland felt that no one who would be satisfactory to Crandon would be less open to criticism from other quarters. Garland was not limited as to the control that he might use, except by the agreement that it should not cause injury to Margery.

Garland was Chairman of the Research Committee of the A.S.P.R., and this séance was a part of his official program. He left with the Society a stenographic record of the séance and a paraphrase of this record which includes comments as to his reactions to the phenomena. From the latter it would appear that he is certain that the Psychic's hands had no normal part in the phenomena, but in view of the nature of the control and
the text of the stenographic record it would seem that a more inclusive verdict might have been reached. Bird noted that Garland added certain longhand notes to the copy of the stenographic notes, and these have been inserted as footnotes in the subjoined presentation of the record. 10

September 1, 1927, 64 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Mass.

It is understood between Crandon and the sitters that all sitters shall sign these dictated notes as written; and that any additions thereto shall be put in as notes at the end, each one signed by the dictator thereof. It is further understood that these notes contain everything of significance that happened at the sitting.

Sitters clockwise were: Mr. Hamlin Garland, Mrs. Jennie LeRoyer Chamberlin, Dr. Frederick Peterson, Mr. Joseph E. Chamberlin, Mrs. Frederick Peterson, Mr. John W. Fife, and Margery. The sitting began at 9:00 p.m.

The lashings were as follows: Garland nailed the sleeve of Psychic’s kimono to the chair with long tacks. 20 In addition to this a tape eighteen feet long was looped about Psychic’s wrist, stitched to the kimono, nailed to the arm of the chair, and the ends were then carried back several feet and nailed to the floor. As a further precaution, a second tape was tied in a square knot to each wrist and the ends of the tape carried around over and under the arms of the chair and then the ends nailed to the floor on each side, out of reach of Psychic. In the same way the ankles were encircled by the tape, nailed to the floor 21 at her feet, and then the ends were carried out of Psychic’s reach and nailed to the floor.

Trance came on at 9:10 and Walter appeared whistling merrily and greeted the sitters. Fife told Walter that he expected a fingerprint, and Walter whistled. Walter then asked for the basket with the letters in it. Garland reached back for the basket and placed it in front of the Psychic’s feet, and then resumed his control of her left hand. Walter moved the basket, and said, “Hello, Garland, how are you?” Walter then threw a letter from the basket which he identified as an M. Garland picked up the letter and said he thought it to be a W. Walter asked him to hold it up and said, “You’re right, my boy, it is a W.” Walter then threw out another letter and identified it as being a Z, and this was confirmed by Fife. Other letters thrown out and named correctly by Walter were: X, R, another Z, and a number 8. Garland could not find the letter R when it was thrown out of

10 The record is altered only to the extent necessary to make the style conform to that of other reports (i.e., omission of titles in the text).
20 Garland nailed the sleeves of the Psychic’s kimono to the chair with four long tacks to each wrist.
21 Some slight movement was possible for the Psychic’s feet but they were clothed in silk stockings and slippers with straps over the ankles.
the basket, and, therefore, Walter told him to look behind his chair, which he did, and there he found the letter.\textsuperscript{22}

Walter then passed the basket to Garland and asked him to put some object in it. Control is broken while each sitter places some object in the basket for identification by Walter. Garland then placed the basket under the table, several feet from the Psychic, at Walter's request. Control is then resumed. Walter is then heard to reach for the basket. The first object identified was a spectacle case belonging to Mrs. Chamberlin; the second, a bottle of pills confirmed by Fife; the third, a pair of scissors in a little case, confirmed by Chamberlin; the fourth, a poker chip, confirmed by Garland; the fifth object was described by Walter as being as large as a Canadian five-cent piece, having many slits, and very much like a Chinese coin. He then dropped it into Garland's hand. This turned out to be a Washington token for a street car. Walter's description of it was entirely correct. Walter then threw out a letter N which was confirmed, and then he dropped the basket on the floor. Garland picked up the basket and placed it on the table and then put another object into the basket. The basket can be heard moving around and then Walter dropped the object on to the floor and said it looked like a part of a watch chain. Garland asked Walter to examine the ends of it and Walter requested him to put it in the metal dish on the table, about 3 feet away from the Psychic. Walter put it in Garland's hand and then Garland put it in the dish. Walter identified one end as being different from the other and said that there was a groove in the middle of it. This object turned out to be a curiosity\textsuperscript{23} of some kind which Walter had never seen before.

Fife then broke his control in order to put some hot water in the dish on the table in preparation for the making of fingerprints. Garland asked for a left fingerprint, and Walter said\textsuperscript{24} he would give him one. The hot water was put in the dish, with the cold water dish beside it. Walter asked Fife to break a piece of wax in half, which he did. Control resumed. In about forty-five seconds something was heard to drop into the dish and Walter told Garland to put his hand in the cold water dish. Garland asked for a left fingerprint, and Walter said he would give him one. The hot water was put in the dish, with the cold water dish beside it. Walter asked Fife to break a piece of wax in half, which he did. Control resumed. In about forty-five seconds something was heard to drop into the dish and Walter told Garland to put his hand in the cold water dish. Garland did as he was requested and removed a piece of wax and laid it on the table in back of him. The red light was turned on more brightly and the cloth was found outside the dish and folded up in a roll and there was no wax in the dish containing the hot water.

\textsuperscript{22} The piece which Walter took for the figure eight was the letter B, of similar shape.

\textsuperscript{23} The object turned out to be a printer's quad of a kind that Walter had never seen before; it had the Lord's Prayer in microscopic form on one end and a groove on the side.

\textsuperscript{24} The report in the \textit{Journal}, February, 1930, quotes Walter as saying, "You don't want much, do you?" Fife notes that this print was of the Walter right thumb.
Garland then moved the illuminated basket, with the doughnut in it, to the center of the table. The basket was levitated and moved in a circle. Mrs. Peterson said she saw something that looked like a cloud around the basket. Walter then passed the luminous doughnut to Garland. Garland placed the doughnut on the table and Walter levitated the doughnut in the air, above the basket, and then down below the table, almost to the floor. Then it slowly rose and went towards Garland. Walter wished to give it to Garland, but he did not take it and it dropped to the floor. Garland picked up the doughnut and put it on the table.25

Walter asked Mrs. Peterson to put her nose in the doughnut. Mrs. Peterson did as she was requested and Walter pulled her hair. Walter then threw the basket from the table on to the floor and then it slowly rises and is then in a standing position about two feet in front of Fife. Walter requested that Garland put his nose in the doughnut, which he did and he felt something ruffle his hair. Mrs. Chamberlin put her nose in the doughnut and Walter touched her head with the basket. The basket is then levitated up in front of Psychic, put on the table and then on the floor and is moved a considerable distance from Psychic's feet. Red light was turned on during the entire sitting. (It was however very dim. Most of the circle was perfectly dark. Mr. Garland remarked that the darkness made the test of the coin all the more valuable.)

The sitting closed at 10:25 P.M.

Mrs. Chamberlin searched the Psyche before and after the sitting, to her satisfaction.

The lashings were examined by Garland and found as they were at the beginning of the sitting. Garland added the following longhand note: "A tack-hammer was necessary to free the Psychic's hands and feet."

25 Garland asked Walter to show his hand above the illuminated disk. Walter did so but his hand was only in the shadow.
CHAPTER LII

Teleplasmic Structures and Telekinesis

The preceding chapters on telekinesis have been devoted to a record of the effects observed and the circumstances, more or less detailed, surrounding their presentation, but there has been no adequate discussion of the means by which they are produced. Perhaps nothing more than a tentative hypothesis may be advanced at this time to cover the functioning of these telekinetic mechanisms; nevertheless, by collating some of the more important observations of the experimenters in this field, we may arrive at a better understanding of this phase of the subject.

The physical phenomena of mediumship present many examples of the action of force in the absence of any visible or tangible mechanism by or through which such forces can be normally applied. Yet, if a body is moved we know that a force has been exerted and, given the necessary data, we can determine its intensity and direction. Sometimes, under particularly favorable conditions, we see the mechanisms (or parts of them) of telekinesis. At other times the camera records the presence of an otherwise invisible structure. More often, however, these structures are not seen and we postulate their presence in the light of the observed effects.

Irrespective of whether such structures are visible or invisible the scientifically-minded investigator endeavors to determine their origin, study their modes of application and evaluate their effects, so that they may be properly related to the general body of scientific knowledge.

It was in pursuance of this method that Dr. Crawford, by carefully conducted experiments and exacting analysis of the results, endeavored to bring the subject of telekinesis out of the shadowy realm of the mysterious and into the domain of
physics and mechanics. As a result of his studies of the psychic structures of the Goligher circle he found that the psychic "operators" made an intelligent adaptation of the means to the end; that the psychic structures were proportioned to the weight and size of the objects to be controlled or to the nature of the desired movement, and were adaptable to the widest range of percussion effects. Thus, the smaller rods, such as were used for levitating the lighter objects, could produce sounds like the tapping of a pencil or those made by a bouncing ball; while the larger structures might be used in imitation of a trotting horse or to produce "sledge-hammer" blows which shook the whole house.

From the literature of this subject we learn that many experienced metapsychists assert the reality of both the visible and invisible teleplastic structures, and that they have presented a very considerable amount of carefully documented evidence, with excellent photographic and instrumental records, in support of their contentions.¹

The form variables of these psychic structures seem to be limitless, as are their concomitant qualities. They may simulate mechanical structures, simple or fabricated filaceous materials, as well as the whole range of "living" organisms from the simplest to the most complex. Thus, we find them manifesting as animal or bird forms; as fragmentary and apparently dis-connected anatomical members, or as a complete and seemingly living human being such as "Katie King." They may suddenly change their shape, color or density, appear glass-like or opaque, become self-luminous, or produce a wide variety of tactual or thermal sensations. Yet, in all their varied manifestations, they are characterized by the power to appear and disappear with astonishing rapidity, leaving behind no traces of their fleeting presence except in the memory of the observers, unless one is fortunate enough to record their forms by photography.

¹ See Ectoplasm and Clairvoyance, by Dr. Gustave Geley; Thirty Years of Psychical Research, by Prof. Chas. Richet; Phenomena of Materialization, by Baron Schrenck von Notzing; also, Experiments in Psychical Science and The Psychic Structures of the Goligher Circle, by Dr. W. J. Crawford. See also vol. 1.
or in some plastic substance, or their energetic effects by instrumental means. ²

Teleplasm may exude from the surface of the body or from the natural orifices as a gas, a liquid, a "plastic protoplasmic paste," or as threads (such as the "cobweb" effects so often referred to); but it is also possible that it may be taken out in the form of energy (the fundamental energy or electrical charges comprising the atom) and then organized into any of the multitudinous forms noted above. We may assume that such an energy, manifesting while thus temporarily released from its matrix of matter, may be used directly or indirectly (as a catalyst) on the ether or the gases of the air to produce certain energy transformations; electrical, magnetic and luminous effects, psychic odors, or inorganic structures²a such as have been described by Crookes and others. But quite irrespective of whether these metapsychic phenomena are of the energetic type, as described above, or are effected by the use of visible or invisible structures they seem to be conditioned by a psychic energy which is directed toward the attainment of a definite goal. Such a goal may be the production of certain phenomena (in which case the urge may come from the medium directly or through suggestion from the sitters) or, as seems to be the case with the Margery mediumship, it may be proof of the independence of the "psychic operator."

Among the most interesting manifestations of this teleplasmic substance are those resembling threads or fabric. The former sometimes emanate from the fingers, as noted in the cases of Eva C. and Stanisława Tomczyk. Ochorowicz, who made

² See Harry Price's valuable paper on Thermal Variations, given at the Third International Congress of Psychical Research, Paris, 1927, reviewed in Journal A.S.P.R., November, 1927; also Mr. Price's article in this Journal, May, 1924, on his experiments with Stella C., which have placed the phenomenon of temperature variations in connection with mediumistic phenomena on an experimental basis. A further record dealing with energetic phenomena is found in the book Rudi Schneider, by the same author, and in his articles in the Journal, January-July, 1930.

²a The term 'teleplastic' is more inclusive than teleplasmic; since the former also includes those forms which may not be composed of substance drawn from the organism of the medium or sitters; e.g., structures which seem to be composed of inorganic matter, yet appear and disappear as mysteriously as do the teleplasmic forms.
a careful study of the latter’s mediumship, referred to these thread-like forms as “rigid rays,” and some of the best examples of his photographs of these remarkable phenomena have been reproduced by Richet; two groups in particular being most interesting. Two pictures show, respectively, scissors and a match-box suspended in a manner that is strongly suggestive of a normal thread connected to the hands of the medium but, as Richet points out, the negatives are sharp and prove that no visible thread was present. Presumably there was a filament of some sort but (like most of the structures of the Goligher circle) it was invisible. Richet emphasizes the fact that the photographic image of certain teleplasmic threads is discontinuous. This may be interpreted to mean that certain parts of the structure (which might be described as nodal points) were sufficiently condensed to record in the negative, while the remainder was not so organized as to reflect light.

Schrenck-Notzing refers to Crawford’s report of these thread-like forms and to his own observations with Tomczyk; while Commandant Darget describes the production of visible teleplasmic threads by Eva C. A double-page cut (Fig. 129) shows a considerable mass of teleplasm presented by the latter medium, which seems to be supported by a cylindrical cord of darker teleplasm. The latter appears to be semi-rigid and is twisted and knotted in a most peculiar manner. Geley gives an excellent description of the variations in color, size, rigidity, and other characteristics of these threads which he observed during his experiments with Eva C.

A more recent case is reported by Professor Blacher, University of Riga, in Zeitschrift für Parapsychologie, October, 1931; in connection with his experiments with the medium Mrs. Ideler. The threads were examined microscopically and chem-

---

3 Loc. cit., Figs. 11 and 11a, opposite p. 424, and Figs. 12 and 13 following. Also pp. 428, 432, 437, 440 and 441; also Annals des Sciences Psychiques, 1919, v. 19, p. 82, by Prof. Bozzano.
4 The first two mentioned above.
5 P. 440, loc. cit.
7 Loc. cit., p. 325.
ically with very interesting results, as will be seen from a perusal of the preliminary report which has been reprinted in the Journal, A.S.P.R., February, 1932.

When such cords or filaments seem to be rigid they are often very smooth and resemble wires. Some of the photographs made at the British College of Psychic Science, and others made by Dr. Hamilton, in Winnipeg, present such effects very clearly. So deceptive are these appearances that acceptance of their supernormal character rests very largely on the testimony of the investigators and the photographer as to the conditions of control.

There were notations that thread or hair-like manifestations occurred during the early stages of the Margery mediumship but they did not seem to play a very important part in the phenomena until the winter of 1924-5. Crandon’s record for December 3rd, 1924, describes the small megaphone as floating freely in the cabinet, and without apparent means of support although viewed repeatedly in red light, and that during one of these red-light inspections a flash-light photograph was taken by Conant. This photograph does not show any trace of a supporting mechanism, although the record states that a quartz lens was used. Another photograph, not published, shows the same megaphone levitated in much the same manner but supported by a white cord similar in size and appearance to that which is seen in connection with the voice mechanism. It seems proper to assume that the first-named levitation was also a function of a teleplasmic cord, although invisible. During the séance of January 13, 1925, when a mosquito-net covered frame was on the table, covering a luminous doughnut and other articles, Crandon reported seeing “two black shadows like that of knitting needles, across half the luminous ring, and once the ring moved slightly.” The parallelism with the “rigid rays” of Ochorowicz is interesting. During the sitting of July 25th, 1925 (according to dictaphone report) all the sitters concurred in noting that the white cord, extending from the Psychic’s

9 M. M., p. 468.
10 See pp. 206ff and Figs. 16, 17, 18 and 19.
right ear to the voice mechanism that rested on her shoulder, stretched and contracted as she moved her head. This observation was made in a two-minute period of red light. At another séance, when the above-mentioned cord was under examination, Richardson noted that it felt like cold cooked spaghetti. In general, the visual and tactual examinations of this substance as well as the photographic records of its many appearances in thread-like forms, indicate that it is denser and more massive than most normal threads of this size.\(^{11}\)

The various forms in which it manifests are too numerous to mention in a short introduction, but there is another which has several points of unusual interest. During the glass-cabinet sitting of October 19, 1926, the small basket was being held "by some attachment or grip a little way in front of the Psychic’s left foot and on looking down from above, without leaving hold of the Psychic’s left hand, I (Bond) observed moving across the ‘d-nut’ over its surface, what had the appearance of a series of dark fibers knitted into a kind of rope about an inch in average breadth but irregular and in one or two places seemingly divided into strands. . . . Both seemed to emanate from the neighborhood of Psychic’s left ankle.” The luminous d-nut was on the floor near the Psychic’s left foot.

As another indication of the many forms of this substance we may quote from Bird’s report of the séance of July 16th, 1925, during which it was noted that the temperature and humidity were very high, and that Walter had indicated that the oppressive heat prevented him from working with the melted paraffin. Bird states that, throughout three evenings, he "was driven to constant rubbing and scratching of his face by a sensation different from anything he has ever before experienced through heat alone, and which he thought might correspond to Margery’s ‘cobwebs’ " (see M. M., p. 193). This fits in well with Walter’s statement of a later date, to the effect that the teleplasm melts and runs down, and may appear as

\(^{11}\) Where a normal thread hangs in an irregular form the teleplasmic threads give the impression of being very heavy for their diameter, and as though there were none of the residual stresses which cause fabricated structures to kink and twist.
threads; also that he takes his energy out through the pores. It is interesting to note that those from whom Walter has said he can take energy have, at times, and under certain temperature conditions, felt this same "cobweb" effect without, apparently, associating it in any way with a withdrawal of energy.

Another interesting item dealing with these thread-like structures is found in C. S. Hill's report of the séance of August 19, 1925. Without an apparent context in this or any earlier séance reports, Walter stated: "Of course sometimes one may see a string or what looks like a string in some phenomena. That doesn't mean a fraudulent string. It's like the cord to the ectoplasm. Some day I'll make a string like that from the Kid's head, down her back and then up front and let you photograph it."

When such phenomena are merely observed, and not systematically studied, there is a tendency on the part of certain critics to interpret them in terms of fraud, on the assumption that if a structure looks as though it were of normal origin it must be of normal production; hence, it is quite unnecessary to learn whether it is or is not what it appears to be. In this connection it may not be out of place to quote Geley's cautionary statement, based on long experience with these anomalous structures:

"Another fact that may give the appearance of fraud is the strange aspect of the ectoplasmic substance. It may assume the likeness of more or less visible filaments, giving the unaccustomed observer the impression of threads intended to move an object fraudulently. At other times it assumes the appearance of light woven stuff like muslin, and photography shows the web. This has often been thought proof of fraud in cases of quite genuine metapsychic phenomena."

Perhaps the most difficult of all these visible structures to evaluate are those which appear spontaneously and simulate normal threads, wires or anatomical members. In the absence

---

12 See Geley, loc. cit., p. 21.
of control a determination could hardly be made unless there were certain anomalies in the form, color or behavior of the structures which would be sufficiently definitive of their normal or supernormal origin. The rarity of such phenomena as compared to those in which the telekinetic mechanisms are invisible, warrants a somewhat fuller treatment of the séances in which visible structures appear.

The foregoing discussion finds a specific application in the phenomena presented at the sitting of July 15th, 1927, in connection with some of Butler's apparatus. The fact that the phenomena were presented in the light and in an enclosed space which was at a higher temperature than the very warm room, may have been instrumental in bringing the operating mechanism into visibility; whereas, in other séances, similar effects were produced without any suggestion of a visible structure.\footnote{The temperature of the enclosed stage would be higher than that of the room, since the heat from four 16 c.p. lamps was focussed on the back-drop. This would raise the temperature a certain amount, even though a considerable resistance was connected in series with the lamps. No temperature reading was taken on the evening in question, but it was uncomfortably hot in the séance room. The outdoor temperature at noon was 92°; there was but little wind; while the Weather Bureau records show that the barometer stood at 29.98 inches, the humidity was 80 per cent. It is probable that the room temperature was not less than 90° F.}

Before presenting the records of this sitting it is necessary to describe a new device that Butler brought on that evening:

*The Pendulum.* This consists of a glass standard, supported on a frame of brass angles, carrying a horizontally pivoted member at its upper end. This latter member is a tube about $11/64$ inch diameter and $21/4$ inches long. From a point near the front end a $1/16$-inch brass wire depends, to which is affixed a red celluloid ball $23/8$ inches diameter. Near the back end of this pivoted member a similar wire projects upward and is cast into a lead counterweight, the top of which is a little less than $17/8$ inches from the center of oscillation. The center of the pendulum bob is about $75/16$ inches below the pivot. The unbalanced weight of these elements, measured at the center of the pendulum bob, is 32 grains. If the pendulum is deflected through an arc of 30° and released it will oscillate from 17 to
20 times before coming to rest. Therefore, the system is relatively free from friction. If a force of 1.2 ounces (av.) is applied horizontally at a point on the counterweight arm \(\frac{1}{4}\) inch from the center of the pivot, it will deflect the pendulum through an arc of \(35^\circ\). The pendulum bob will move about 4 inches while the short arm moves less than \(\frac{5}{32}\) inch.

If the above force is applied through a thread of No. 60 sewing cotton and the latter is permitted to become slack while supported 13 inches from the pendulum, it assumes an irregular catenary curve. There are kinks and irregularities in the thread due to residual internal stresses. If, however, a well-stretched braided cord or silk thread is used the curve is much smoother. If such a thread is subjected to a tension of as much as 8 grains (hardly enough to produce a barely perceptible deflection of the pendulum) it remains almost straight when the pendulum is approximately in its central position.

If such a pendulum bob is to be deflected within the approximate limits described it is evident that the most suitable and most economical structure for the purpose will be of the order noted above, and that, wholly aside from any question of normal or supernormal operation, we should expect that the operating mechanism would be thread-like.

The applications of the above data will be seen in connection with the phenomena reported in connection with this and similar séances.

Three reports were made after the séance: by Crandon, Bird and Dudley. If it be recognized that Crandon was dependent very largely on the statements of others for his knowledge of what was going on on the stage, and that his record is, therefore, the result of his interpretation of those statements added to such observations as he could make directly, it will be seen that the three records are in general agreement as to the facts. The detailed differences are pointed out and discussed wherever this seems necessary. Since this is one of the few instances in which the mechanisms of telekinesis seem to have come out into
visibility under excellent conditions for observation, it has seemed best to give the reports in full.

The apparatus used was the Little Theatre,\textsuperscript{14} the glass balances,\textsuperscript{15} and the pendulum. The Theatre had been reconstructed, and, together with the pendulum, was brought to Lime Street on the evening of the séance. In accordance with Butler's statement, these devices were never out of his sight until put to use in the séance room.

The arrangement of the apparatus in the vicinity of the cabinet is shown in Fig. 2, page 652. A low bench was placed in front of the table to provide room for such apparatus as was not on the stage at the moment. Thus, when the sitting began, the scales and the sisyphus were on this bench. Two guest sitters were outside the circle, approximately as indicated. Since Butler was somewhat behind the Theatre he was not in a very good position to see all of the operations in detail but, by bending to his left, he could see the whole front of the stage and its approaches, if the lamps in the Theatre were lighted. Crandon and Richardson had a somewhat foreshortened view of the apparatus on the stage, due to their position. The reports follow:

\textbf{CRANDON'S REPORT OF SÉANCE OF JULY 15TH, 1927}

After a few tries, Walter was able to start the pendulum swinging, with a good red-light background; and he could apparently arrest it anywhere in its excursion,\textsuperscript{16} shorten the excursion, and in every way show that he had control of it, though the manner of the control was not evident to the observers. The second time this was tried, Bird had control of the Psychic's right hand, Crandon's two hands, and Crandon's mouth.\textsuperscript{16a}

The all-glass balance was put on the stage, and Bird was

\textsuperscript{14} See pp. 598-600 for detailed description; see also line cuts in connection with this chapter on page 652. The theatre had just been reconstructed with glass wings and hinged glass front. The wings were parallelograms; hence the hinged front hung straight down. With the front closed the lower edge of the hinged section was in approximate contact with the upper edge of the sub-stage enclosure.

\textsuperscript{15} See pp. 600-601.

\textsuperscript{16} The pendulum did not swing past the center. All movements made toward the west of the center.

\textsuperscript{16a} Which, as Bird notes (Par. 5), would be quite as significant as it would have been if it had occurred in the scales test, following.
told to put 5 weights in either pan. The first trial at balancing this uneven load was a failure. The second time, in red light, the empty pan went down and the full pan went up and they oscillated evenly.17 Bird and Dudley observed a thread, apparently attached to one of the free guys of the empty pan, extending out from it about 30° and perhaps 3 inches long.

At the next trial the thread was not seen; two weights were found on the west pan and one on the east pan, and Walter made them balance. The thread was found at the end of the sitting, attached to the hook at the end of the balance arm.18 It was a flimsy dark brown or black thread; not sewing cotton.

At the end of the first successful experiment with the scales, Walter asked Bird whether he saw the point. Bird reported the thread, thinking this the point which Walter would make. But no: Walter told Bird to feel of the scales, and Bird did so, to his surprise, finding that Walter had lowered the glass partition over the front of the stage.

A thumb-print experiment came next, after which Walter made a try at the Sisyphus,19 but apparently his force was not equal to it.

**Bird's Report of Séance of July 15, 1927**

(As this report was submitted it contained a very large number of explanatory and expository foot notes, which were not a part of the original record. Such of these as seem necessary to explain the record or the operations are brought into the text in square brackets, and either in whole, in part (in quotes) or paraphrased. In the latter case the letters PP are prefixed. Cross references to my own report may prove of further assistance in evaluating the phenomena. For convenient reference, paragraph numbers have been added. E. E. D.)

(1) Butler's Little Theater was in use; first with the pen-

---

17 The oscillation was slight. See Note 30.
18 See Note 36.
19 For description see p. 601.
dulum, then with the scales; the sisyphus was to have been used but was not reached. 20 The Theatre was set on the table, which was slightly quartered, at Margery’s left and in front of her; there was ample space for her to enter the cabinet at the east, and the table was not moved over (into its more usual position) after she entered. 21

(2) Almost immediately on extinction of the room light, the red light in the Theatre was lighted by Walter, to its first or second stage. 22 It is believed that once or twice during the evening he put it out himself; but almost always, he had Butler put it out for him. 23 Usually he lit it himself, though occasionally he had Butler do this too. 24

(3) There was a prolonged dark interval, followed by a red-light interval, in which the pendulum moved through a wide amplitude, stood steady for a moment in elevated position, etc. 25 Dudley reports 26 a thread-like connection fastened to the projecting mass slightly above the point of suspension, and leading off to the (psychic’s) right and down, apparently passing out of the Theater. 27 It was taut when the position or action of the pendulum was such as to suggest that the thread was under tension.

20 See C.’s report above, and D.’s report, par. 4.
21 Thus placed for convenience in attaching the extension cord supplying current to the theatre. The table was not moved because to do so would disturb this connection.
22 Thus giving an excellent illumination of the stage enclosure. See also Miss Walker’s report, May 27, 1927, p. 616.
23 The position of the theatre brought the extinguishing switch close to Butler. On the hypothesis that Walter used a teleplasmic terminal to operate these switches, the switch for reducing and extinguishing the light would be in a relatively inconvenient position.
24 Butler states that Walter turned on the lights on each occasion but that he (Butler) turned them off at Walter’s request, and adds, “but did not release control of Margery’s hand, as the flapper was within easy reach above our hands, and easy to operate.”
25 See D.’s report, Par. 2. Apparently Bird did not note the first small movement of the pendulum.
26 Reported after the séance, not during the séance action.
27 Actually not visible beyond the confines of the glass wing.
(4) With the scales,\(^{28}\) after one or two displays without motion in red light, Bird was called upon to put five weights in the west pan, having the option of which pan to use. The next display showed this pan inert on the ground.\(^{29}\) The next showed the pans in substantial static balance.\(^{30}\) The east pan was strongly tilted, and there was a sharp elbow in one of the suspender threads. Attached to this elbow and running off and down apparently to the lower front east corner\(^{31}\) of the Theatre, Bird saw a thread-like connection.

(5) The scales performance had been started with the glass front of the Theatre raised, to facilitate placing of the weights in the pan. With reference to the fact that he had himself lowered this,\(^{32}\) Walter now spoke up and said that we had all missed the point of the display. Of course the glass front is seen with difficulty, if at all, in the red light; and we had been concentrating on (looking through it) the scales unit. So none of us observed the condition of the glass front. Bird, however, misinterpreting Walter’s remark, asked: ‘‘You mean the thread connection, Walter?’’ Walter said ‘‘No,’’ he didn’t mean this: and explained what he did mean,\(^{33}\) giving us a new exposure of red light to show it. The thread was gone and the pans were normal, the weighted one grounded. The meaning of Bird’s remark had to be explained to Crandon, who then set up the claim that Bird had double control during the levitation of the scales. Walter had to support Bird’s correction that this double control had been during the pendulum episode before Crandon.

\(^{28}\) The pendulum having been removed to the bench and the scales substituted. The hinged glass cover was thrown back on top of the theatre at this time.

\(^{29}\) I.e., the glass stage.

\(^{30}\) My recollection is of a slight oscillation in a vertical plane. See also report of séance of June 16, 1927, and reference in Note 22.

\(^{31}\) As B. described this situation after the séance and subsequently, the point of application was near the pan, as would be indicated in the sketch, Fig. 1, page 652, and in the séance of June 16th. Had the direction of pull been as stated here, the pan and its suspender cords would have been pulled off at an angle away from the end of the scale beam. Apparently Dudley’s discussion of the apparent offset in the suspender cord resulted in several misunderstandings of the actual situation, which were not cleared up by subsequent experiments with the theatre.

\(^{32}\) B. comments, in a footnote, that this was an important point. Walter raised this point spontaneously.

\(^{33}\) Compare D.’s report, Par. 9.
into the basket from immediately above. Following the observation by Bird and the discussion of the thread by the sitters, Walter was heard fussing in the dark with the scales. He gave one or more views of them in red light with the pans in approximate balance, both free in air. At least one weight had been dropped to the floor and at least one had been moved to the east pan; there therefore exists a good degree of probability that the equilibrium as seen was normal. The statement here made covers the visible results so far as Bird could determine it; audibility being relied on for the statement that one weight was on the floor. ["Thus, if from a four-weighted pan a single weight be dropped to the floor and a second transferred to the one-weighted pan, both will have two weights, whereupon they will balance normally, with a fairly good approximation to the accustomed effect of static psychic equilibrium."] (PP. At the point in the séance when) "we had a red-light interval to verify the condition of the front of the Theatre, the scales were in normal unbalanced rest; evidently they were unevenly weighted; presumably they retained their original 4:1 discrepancy." Later, when in the absence of any thread seen by any

43 As a result of a somewhat extended experience with these scales phenomena the writer recognizes that the number and distribution of the weights are the critical points, and has always been careful to record those facts as accurately as the circumstances would permit. The writer's record shows a 2:3 loading. Admittedly, the glass weights are somewhat difficult to see, but the pans were from 7 to 8 inches below the line of sight; hence the weights were visible. These glass weights weighed approximately 60 grains each.

44 The sequence of events at this séance was unique in my experience. For this reason I find it possible to reconstruct a part of the séance action which was not recorded at the time. As has been noted, the pendulum was on the stage with the cover down when the séance began. The rest of the apparatus was on the bench in front of the table. This was convenient to Bird and less so to anyone else except Richardson. The latter rarely places and removes apparatus. Bird usually handles the apparatus when he is present. It is my clear recollection that he made all the changes in the apparatus at this séance, and that when he put the weights in the west pan one of them fell to the bench in front of the table. Bird felt around for it in the dusk below the edge of the table, found it, and put it in the west pan with the others. I am confident that this was the only weight that was dropped at this séance. Therefore, all five weights were in the west pan, as Bird says in par. 4.—E. E. D.

45 Aside from this footnote, there is no other indication of a 4:1 loading, either in Bird's report or in any other report. The weight of the evidence indicates that there were two weights in the east pan at this time and the remaining three were in the west pan; hence the scales were normally unbalanced. The pans were, however, in approximate balance under this normal unbalance of approximately 60 grains. See Note 30.
sitter they gave an approximation to psychical static balance, they were probably weighted alike; so their behavior can be regarded as normal." "I saw two weights in the east pan where only one had been before; hence, at least one had been transferred. . . . I cannot, of course, be sure that there were, in the east pan, only the two weights which I saw. If there were three, there could not have been a normal balance because there were not six weights available—only five.”"

The above report, minus the foot notes, was written (in part) on July 15, 1927, and finished the next day (according to the evidence presented by its writer), and was then mailed to himself at Hyslop House by registered mail. It was opened on July 30, 1930, by Mr. Bond and witnessed by him, Mrs. Bigelow and Miss Wellman. They stated that it was their opinion that the envelope had not been previously opened.

Dudley’s Report of Séance of July 15, 1927

(This report is compiled from my records, written the same evening. Parenthetical explanations are inserted wherever these would make the meaning clearer. The introductory statements, descriptions of apparatus, etc., which have been given at an earlier point, are omitted herein. A supplementary discussion of the phenomena is added and the paragraph numbering is made continuous although the report proper ends with paragraph 10. This séance was scheduled for finger prints, but since Butler had returned the reconstructed Theatre and brought the new pendulum these were used.46 At various points in the record and discussion I shall introduce statements by Butler, wherever they are pertinent to the question of control.)

(1) Butler had placed the Little Theatre on the table, with the pendulum on the stage, and had closed the glass front. This was its condition when Margery and the balance of the sitters

46 Walter’s insistence was on the finger-print experiment; hence he turned to that at the earliest possible moment.
entered the room. Butler states that the apparatus was never out of his sight from the time he brought it to the house. The circle was formed and the mantle light extinguished after control had been established. There was, therefore, no opportunity to make any attachments to the pendulum without Butler's knowledge.

(2) The light (in the Theatre light box) was turned on, and, after a time, turned off. The stage was completely enclosed. There was considerable activity within the Theatre; sounds as though the pendulum stand were being moved about and hitting the glass. The light (behind the stage) was turned on. The pendulum bob moved slowly toward the west about one inch to one and one-quarter inches, and then as slowly returned to its central position. The pendulum then moved farther to the west, to an angle of about 45° or a little less. The movement was slow and very steady. It remained stationary for a few moments and then as slowly returned to center. As it approached the limit of its (outward) travel the counterweight (the upper part having been partly in the shadow of the backdrop frame) came fully into view against the illuminated background. At this time I saw a fine cord of some sort which was (apparently) attached just above the pivoting point of the pendulum (assembly). (A subsequent study showed that this point would be approximately one-quarter inch above the pivot.) The cord extended to the east wing of the Theatre and slanted downward slightly (about 10°). When the cord was slack (after the pendulum returned to its central position of rest) this latter point of (apparent) contact with the east wing did not change its position. (The slack was between this point and the aforementioned point on the pendulum structure. See Fig. 1, page 652.)

(3) The experiment was repeated. (That is, the pendulum again moved to the west in the same manner as before and again returned slowly to its central position, the cord becoming taut and slack in the same way as before and the apparent points of contact remaining as before.) The cord hung in a uniformly
smooth curve when slack. I studied it with great interest. No knots, loops or loose ends were seen at either end. (It is my recollection that it was smooth, of uniform size and density, and formed a dark line against the luminous background.) As it developed after the séance, I alone saw this cord. I thought that Bird had seen it also. The cord seemed to lengthen and shorten in its own length (i.e., between the apparent points of support).

(4) During the pendulum movement Bird said that he had double control of Crandon’s hands and Margery’s right hand.

(5) The light was extinguished. Crandon suggested putting in the glass scales (on the stage). Walter: “Is there any hurry?” He took his time, and again the light went on. The cord was no longer visible. The pendulum was removed (to the bench in front of the table) and the scales were put on the stage (being taken from the same bench).

(6) Bird (at his choice) put five glass weights in the west pan (of the scales) at Walter’s request. The light was extinguished. There was considerable activity for about one minute; then the light went on. The scales were seen in balance kinetically. The left or east pan was tipped up at an angle of about thirty degrees. The cord suspender leading to the front of this east or unloaded pan was offset below the wire spreader for a certain distance (as it appeared to me) and then proceeded straight to the edge of the pan. The scales moved as though (actuated) by a physical connection of some sort. I saw no such connection.

(7) Walter said: “You all missed the point.” Bird: “Do you mean the thread?” Walter: “You all missed the point.” The light was out at this point and Walter (presumably) put it on and continued, “Feel of the stage.” (My record says “stage” but he may have said “scales.”) Bird tried to do so and found that the glass cover was down although it had been up (folded back on top of the Theatre) at the beginning of the

---

47 See description of pendulum, p. 633.
48 See Note 44.
scales test. Walter said nothing further about the thread at this point. The light was put out.

(8) A little later, with the light on, the scales were in approximate balance with two weights in the east pan and three in the west pan. Apparently these had been changed by Walter. The light was turned out. There was considerable talk about the thread (referred to by Bird). (It is not in my report, but is quite clear in my memory that Walter said something about “a thread for Birdie.”) The light went on again and a piece of thread or yarn was seen hanging at the east end of the scale beam. It hung loosely, and was readily seen against the lighted background. Bird removed the thread.

(9) The scales were removed from the stage (to the bench) and the Theatre was removed from the table to give room for the finger-print experiment. As a result of the first attempt, Walter dropped the wax on the floor. The second and third pieces carried prints (of the Walter right thumb) which were interesting but not very good. Walter said that it was too hot for good work and ordered the Theatre returned to the table. (This was done.) The Sisyphus was (removed from the bench and) put on the stage but Walter found himself unable to work it, and ordered the sitting closed at about 10:50 p.m.

(10) After the séance, in the book room, Bird showed me the piece of “thread” he had taken from the scales. He held it in his hand under the bright reading lamp and we examined it. He said that it was different from the one he had seen attached to the scales. I suggested that it looked like yarn; like a raveling from the curtains of the cabinet. He agreed that it did look like yarn. (I did not handle this thread. So far as I know, it remained in his possession. He spoke of it as though it was of no particular importance.) At this time he told me that he saw his thread attached to the scale unit close to the pan. I noted that this would not account for the curious offset in the

50 See Note 34.
51 This was about five to six inches long and has been correctly described as dark and fuzzy, looking in every way like yarn. Its characteristics were readily determined under this strong light.
suspender cord, as I saw it. (It was at this time that I discovered that Bird and I had not been talking about the same thread, and that he did not see the one operating the pendulum.) There followed a somewhat general discussion of the phenomena of the evening.

(11) In writing up this séance I sketched the east scale pan and its suspension, as it appeared to me. Some time later, after talking this over with Bird, I went into the matter more thoroughly in an effort to solve the anomalous behavior of this suspender with its curious offset. The pull on the scale pan had been downward, in a straight line, just as was the case during the June 16th séance. In fact, it acted in exactly the same way as when Richardson put his knife in the weighted pan and the empty pan went down. A single experiment was enough to show that if the elbow had actually been present in the suspender cord (the one nearest the point where the downward pull was exerted) the pan would have remained level instead of being tipped. A study of the scales showed that from a certain position, the tripart spreader or tripod attached to the scale beam and carrying the three threads supporting the pan would be deflected by the eccentric pull in such manner that one of the legs would be obscured by the scale beam, and the angle of the front leg (the one above the apparent point of attachment of the teleplasmic thread) would present the illusion of an elbow in the suspender thread. This illusion would exist for no other sitter near me. I therefore agreed with Bird, that the pull on the east pan of the scales was, as he said at the time, close to the pan. The above situation is shown in the sketch of the scales on the stage, as is the approximate position of the residual thread. (See Fig. 1, 652.)

**The Phenomena Viewed from Various Angles**

(12) *The Pendulum Experiment:* This has several interesting angles. The slow and steady movement of the pendulum bob was noticeable. If it had been produced by a normal thread the latter would have to be actuated from outside the Theatre.
Such a thread, if attached at the point observed by me, would contact the pendulum assembly at a point one-quarter inch above the pivot. This point of attachment would move less than 5/32 inch in moving the pendulum bob 4 inches (somewhat less than the observed séance movement). Any slight irregularity in the pull on such an alleged thread would be multiplied more than twenty-five times in the movement of the pendulum. But, the pendulum moved slowly and steadily. In order to produce the observed effect by normal means the following conditions appear to be essential: Considerable practice; a complete freedom from interference; a clear view of the apparatus and an unusually steady hand. The forces involved are so slight (see description of pendulum, heading these reports) that the tactile sense is an insufficient guide. The pull for maximum displacement is but little more than an ounce and one-quarter, while that for one-half inch displacement is very small indeed (a matter of a few grains). Thus, if such an assumed thread were pulled through a distance of 1/64 inch a little more rapidly or slowly than during the preceding or succeeding 1/64 inch movement, the pendulum bob would move in a decidedly jerky manner; since these irregularities would be multiplied 25 times.

(13) Such an assumed normal operation by means of a thread passing out of the Theater involves its passage by the front edge of the wing (see Butler's description of the device). This edge is smooth; there is nothing to prevent such a thread from slipping downward when slack. It did not do so. Therefore, if unsupported, it must be actuated from some point higher than the point of attachment to the pendulum; that is, from a point more than forty-five inches above the floor, a height at least as great as that of the mouth of the tallest person seated in the circle. But, let us assume, for the sake of the argument, that it could have been supported against this smooth glass wing in some manner not yet discovered. There would then be an unsupported length of thread outside the Theater, extending to this hypothetical operator who, presumably, can see the pendu-

52 Remembering that, at this séance the edge of the wing was in a vertical plane.
Unless one assumes that the tension due to this unsupported length of thread is very much less than eight grains, the twelve- to thirteen-inch length within the Theater will remain approximately straight even when the pendulum is in its central position (assuming that it could return to center while subjected to such a load). In practice, however, it hung in a smooth catenary curve when slack.

(14) If we are to assume a normal thread we must devise a method of attaching and detaching it, and we must find someone who could do so without detection. The top of the pendulum counterweight comes within three-quarters inch of the under side of the glass top of the stage. The glass cover was closed before the séance began; it remained closed while Margery entered the cabinet, and Butler supervised the apparatus. He states that no one had an opportunity to make such a normal attachment. Everyone was seated and the circle was formed before the mantel light was turned out. Butler, as designer of the apparatus, had a very definite interest in maintaining control of Margery and Richardson. He states that he had continuous control of Margery's left hand throughout these experiments, and that she did not leave her chair, nor make any noticeable forward movement. The top of the Theatre is four feet from the floor, the front of the stage (the sole opening) is more than fifteen inches from the back edges of the paddles and it sits on a table twenty inches wide. Margery is slightly less than five feet six inches tall. Evidently she is eliminated from any oblique considerations in connection with these Theatre experiments. Richardson and Litzelmann state that they maintained continuous control and Fife says that he did not release my hand, nor Litzelmann's. My left hand was in continuous contact with Bird's right except for those red-light periods when Bird was making the changes in the apparatus, as noted elsewhere. He was in control of Crandon and, during a part of the pendulum test, had double control. He was in the strategic position to exercise proper control of the experiment, and this was the reason why he was given that seat. The guest sitters are automatically eliminated from the problem by reason of their position outside the circle.
(15) The construction and arrangement of the apparatus, the location of the sitters in relation thereto, the control and the nature of the phenomena, all combine to indicate that we were not dealing with a normal structure; but there are certain other considerations which enter into the problem. This actuating structure was not visible beyond (to the west of) the pendulum. No knot, loose end or loop was visible where it contacted the pendulum assembly. It seemed to shorten and lengthen in its own length, i.e., between the pendulum and its apparent point of attachment at the east wing of the Theatre, in a manner quite consistent with the slow and steady movement of the pendulum. When this filament was slack it hung in a smooth curve, showing not the slightest trace of kinks or irregularities such as are commonly seen in threads or strings.

(16) Turning, now, to a consideration of the scales test; we find that there was ample opportunity to determine whether there was any normal attachment to the pans when the scales were put on the stage, when they were seen in normal static balance against the lighted back-drop, when the load was placed in the west pan with consequent elevation of the east pan, and again when the scales were unbalanced with the heavy pan grounded. I saw no attachment at these times. Bird does not indicate that he saw anything of the sort at this time, nor did he do so in his subsequent conversations with me, while, because of his operations on the scale unit, his opportunity for exact observation and testing was even better than mine. Evidently the opportunity for making an assumed application of a normal thread was limited to the period between the point to which Note 29 applies and that, a few moments later, when Bird felt for the scales and found the glass front instead. If a normal thread were used it must be removed, and this must also be done in the above period; unless one wishes to assume that Bird could feel for the scales with the light on and the empty pan nearer him elevated at least two inches above the stage, and yet a thread could be attached to this pan and be invisible to

Admission of the existence of teleplasm in this mediumship and of ideoplasticity in connection with its form variables provides a logical basis for the assumption that this filament could be lengthened or shortened at the will of the psychic operator.
him! The residual thread was clearly seen under no more favorable conditions (except, perhaps, its size and fuzziness). The above would seem to constitute a distinct limitation of opportunity, but there are other limitations imposed by the nature of the apparatus, its location and relative inaccessibility. From my experiments with the freely suspended scale pans I can state, with some positiveness, that one would need the free use of both hands to attach or detach a normal thread to or from the pan suspender at the point described by Bird, and without leaving any indications of knots, loops, hooks or the like. This means that the assumed normal operator would have to operate from the front of the Theatre, and do this without the knowledge of anyone in the circle. The time element, as noted above, is an important factor.\(^54\)

(17) In view of the fact that Bird and I agreed that the residual thread was unlike anything we had seen in connection with the Theatre experiments, it is clear that it has no part in the action in front of the stage. It is, furthermore, just the sort of mystification that one expects from Walter, and is not so very different in principle from his spontaneous contribution to the Sistrum experiments, as described in Chapter LIII.

(18) Walter’s attempt to work the Sisyphus was a failure, for which he did not apologize, merely remarking that he hadn’t enough energy. Whatever we may think of this reason we must at least admit that we do not know enough about the laws governing these phenomena to dispute with him on this point.\(^55\)

(19) Immediately following these Theatre experiments three thumb prints were made on two pieces of wax; hence, if

---

\(^{54}\) Another interesting point which seems worth some consideration is: The empty pan was pulled down so that the front edge was almost or actually in contact with the front edge of the glass stage. When this point of contact is viewed from a certain angle the edge of the glass presents the illusion of a dark line extending toward the lower east corner of the theatre. All of which supply a further argument for photographic recording of such phenomena.

\(^{55}\) In discussing the effect of heat on teleplasmic structures Walter said, during the sitting of July 21, 1927: “When it is hot and the pressure is low the teleplasm runs down; it drops like treacle. It is apt to come down as threads. I can’t always tell when this happens. If I am working these big things with lots of room I can do it in hot weather, but these small scales and things on the stage don’t give me room enough; the energy melts and strings out and may be visible.” Compare temperature and pressure for the sèances of June 16th and for this sèance.
we accept them as of supernormal origin, there were teleplastic structures in use which were, presumably, much larger than would be needed for the relatively light work in the Theatre.

(20) It is a matter of common observation that Walter adapts his teleplasmic tools to the work in hand. The visibility or invisibility of such mechanisms of telekinesis may well depend on both the physical and psychical factors of the séance which are pictured\(^{56}\) as conditioning the presentation of teleplasmic phenomena. Thus, after collating all the facts bearing on the telekinetic phenomena of this séance, and studying them in relation to similar happenings in this and other mediumships, it seems apparent that another and very interesting record has been added to data on the subject of thread-like teleplasmic structures.\(^{57}\)

\(^{56}\) See Geley, _loc. cit.,_ also Crawford, _The Reality of Psychic Phenomena._

\(^{57}\) Three years after the date of this séance and on the eve of the severance of his connection with the Society as Research Officer, Bird, for the first time, expressed to the Research Committee of the Board of Trustees an opinion that the "threads" observed by him and Dudley were of normal production and indicated fraud in the production of the séance action. At the direction of the Committee he prepared an account of the séance in which he elaborated that theory. This article was given the most careful consideration by the Committee, but, after a lengthy investigation of all the circumstances and after mature consideration, Bird's opinion and conclusions were rejected as unsound and impossible and the article as biased and unworthy of publication.—W. H. B.; D. D. W.
FIG. 1.

Drawing A shows the pendulum. "a" is the position of the thread-like structure when the pendulum was deflected; "b," its position with the pendulum at rest; "c," the apparent point of contact with the east wing.

Drawing B shows the scales with the loaded west pan in air and the empty east pan tipped up. The residual thread is indicated by the dotted line "d." The suspender cords are fine threads, much finer than the relative widths of the lines of the drawings indicate. The east pan suspender threads and tri-part spreader have been rotated slightly in the drawing, in order to show them as they would be if seen from a point somewhat to the left of the center line.

The four + marks on the "back drop" of drawing A indicate the approximate positions of the 4 lamps in the lamp box.

FIG. 2.

Arrangement of apparatus and sitters at séance, July 15, 1927.
CHAPTER LIII

Telekinesis of Later 1927

The summer of 1927 was uncomfortably warm, and the humidity was high during most of July and August. Walter had said, on June 26th, that he would do little work in August, and intimated that he found it difficult to control teleplasmic structures in hot weather. Nevertheless, he did carry through a number of finger-print séances in July, but there were few sittings during the next month.

Following the telekinetic phenomena of July 15th, there was a séance on the 26th, in preparation for the photographic experiments of the 28th, at which there was considerable telekinetic action. The next instance which seems to belong in this chapter comprises a considerable part of the séance action of August 23rd. The reports given below are by Bird and Crandon, respectively:

Throughout the séance, save at moments when he was obliged to manipulate the water vessels, Fife had the Psychic’s right hand without interruption. Bird had her left throughout the séance without interruption except once when he gave it to Pierce while manipulating the scales and once when he left the room in search of apparatus. Fife throughout and Bird except during one short interval, had their grips on the Psychic’s hands upon her corresponding knee,1 thereby affording a large measure of foot control.

The first act was given with the luminous basket with all control of the Psychic as described. This was freely levitated and rocked on the table. Amongst other gyrations it was hung around Bird’s neck and removed. After quite a lot of this, at Walter’s suggestion Pierce got on the floor under the table and controlled the Psychic’s two feet directly. Bird transferred her hand to his left and with his right reached into the cabinet to control her head. Under this absolute control of her five extremities the action of the basket continued. Bird’s hand, however, having found the top of the Psychic’s head rather than her mouth, Walter insisted

1 Compare séance of July 15th, Chapter LVII.
upon a repetition with Bird's hand directly over the Psychic's mouth. In both these episodes levitation was excellent.

During the basket levitation the doughnut was on the table right side down. On two or three occasions it was held in a vertical position and moved freely about over a considerable area.

Articles were called for for identification. Bird supplied two of the wooden block letters, which were successfully named. Pierce supplied a handkerchief of such size as to constitute a family joke; Walter with unusual promptness said, "some folks might call this a handkerchief, but I would call it a table-cloth." One or two other featureless identifications were effected and finally Hutchison contributed an object, making a remark or two which made it plain that it was a very tough proposition. It made a metallic sound as it was dropped into the basket. Walter handled it for a while and agreed that it was a tough one; presently he said that it was not one object, but two objects together, and Hutchison agreed; and then he said after another interval that one of the objects was a match-box. He fussed for quite a while but could only say that the other was like a coin but was not a coin. The object was then passed first to Bird and later to Pierce to see what they could do with it with one hand in the dark. Bird was very confident that he would not have been able to decide that the one-half of the assembly was a match-box; but this was in fact correct according to Hutchison. Pierce agreed with Bird here and neither of them had the remotest idea what the rest of the assembly was. In point of fact it was a safe deposit key, so assembled into the match-box that only the circular handle of the key could be found unless a very difficult task of disengagement were performed.

The voice machine was used successfully under the usual conditions, plus the fact that Pierce stood up and held his hand immediately above the open top of the U. Walter followed this by a series of rapid eclipses to the various sitters of the two luminous floats. Somebody rather defied him to eclipse the luminous top of the tube and he did this although no sitter could reach it without standing up.

The last act consisted of the scales. Pierce was instructed to put four weights on one pan and one on the other, at his own pleasure. He put the four on the west pan. There was excellent dynamic levitation in several periods of red light and finally while Bird lifted the scales unit off the table to a height of about two feet. The white flash was used freely together with exploration by the hands of the sitters.

Bird and Pife reported cold breezes to an unusual degree. The Psychic was in trance during the levitation, identification, and

---

2 It would seem as though Walter were trying to close every avenue to a normal explanation. This is quite characteristic of him.
thumb-print episodes. She came out for the VCO and remained out for the scales. The trance was unusually quiet as regards both voice and movement.

Crandon made an independent record, which chronicles the placing by Pierce and Hutchison of their noses in the doughnut on the table for Walter to pull their hair. There is also a bit more detail about the scales, in the following terms:

The balances were now brought out and inspected in white light. Pierce was given weights and was told by Walter to put four in either pan and one in the other. This he did, and after a minute in darkness the light was turned on and the balances were seen oscillating as though equally loaded. While this was going on Pierce passed his left hand under and over each pan, and white light was played upon the whole outfit, showing no physical connection between the Psychic or any other person and the scales. This experiment was then repeated, and while the scale was balancing in oscillation, Bird, facing the Psychic from across the table, picked up the whole scales unit and white light was played on the whole of it above and below, showing complete dissociation, as far as visible contacts went, between the scales unit and all persons in the room.

On August 30th, after the completion of the thumb print, Crandon's record tells us that:

The bell-box was put on the table and Walter rang it in the hands of Mrs. Whittemore, who then handed it to Whittemore. Each turned a complete circle with the bell ringing intermittently in the hands. Walter then did considerable beautiful levitation with the small luminous basket, throwing it on the floor beyond the table, raising it to the far edge of the table, and then putting it into Mrs. Whittemore's lap.

The séance of September 1st, at the Chamberlain residence, was marked by numerous telekinetic phenomena. It is given in full on pp. 622–625.

Following the presentation of the large number of thumb prints during the summer, with séances held on several consecutive evenings, and the hiatus in August, there was a period of comparative relaxation. The telekinetic phenomena at several séances fell into the standard form and may be summarized; on other occasions they developed in such an unusual way as to demand considerable elaboration.
September 4th and 5th: Two séances, "largely for family reunion purposes," in the presence of the Hubbs, Grays, etc.; covered by a single very brief record, which chronicles, for both evenings, basket and doughnut levitation, touches, hair-pulling over the luminous plaque, VCO and scales, "under strict conditions of control."

September 12th: At a séance held without previous arrangement with Walter, to accommodate a sitter who had to leave the city, Walter failed to appear, but John was on hand and ran through a typical telekinetic show, using basket and doughnut and touching sitters. When the hand was seen in silhouette, over the doughnut, it was designated as "thin and spidery." Such hands have been seen from time to time during the mediumship. Whether their lack of rotundity is wholly a function of the operator's lack of technique or is due to a temporary reduction in the energy supply has not been determined. Walter indicates that the latter may be the case.

September 15th: Butler had brought several pieces of new apparatus. Two of these may best be described at this point, before proceeding to a description of the séance:

**Mechanical Bell:** A wooden base on which is mounted a bicycle bell actuated by a spring-controlled wooden flapper. See page 600.

**Sistrum:** Made primarily for hand use, this apparatus comprises a small wooden frame, about five inches square, the lower end formed into an elongated handle for convenience in holding; an incidental effect of this construction being also that when the device is carried about in accordance with the routine existing for bell-boxes, the hand of the carrier is visibly remote from any of the operating parts of the box and is prevented from contacting the flapper by a broad wooden shelf which projects from the back of the frame.

Around the sides and the top is a thin wooden housing, forming a shallow open space in which are mounted a small electric bell and two dry cells. Above the bell is a vertical disk of metal, some two inches in diameter, over which is pivoted a broad arrow. The disk and the arrow are painted in contrasting
colors. Above the disk is a small red lamp, hooded, and so placed as to throw its light on the disk and the arrow.

Covering practically the entire back of the device is a light paddle, or flapper, hinged at its upper edge and held at an angle to the body of the device by a spring of light tension. Any movement of the flapper is communicated to the arrow by a train of gears; so that, as the paddle is moved, simultaneously the arrow revolves, the lamp is illuminated and the bell rings. A shield prevents access to the flapper by the hand that carries the Sistrum.

The principal elements in this gear train are the segmental gear fastened to the flapper and projecting through the backboard to engage with a larger and complete gear carrying a contact pin. The two are at right angles. A short, stiff spring prevents the large gear from disengaging, although not normally in contact with the latter. The contact pin rubs against an insulated spring, thus closing the circuit when the flapper is sufficiently depressed. Within the limit of travel of the flapper the segmental gear is normally engaged with the large gear, while the contact pin is so located as to close the circuit somewhat before the flapper reaches the lower limit of its movement. The gears are entirely beneath the disk in front of which the arrow rotates.

At this séance the Little Theatre was on the table, and both the pendulum and the mechanical bell were on the stage. The Sistrum was also on the table. The Psychic was controlled on her left by Butler and on the right by Crandon, as was the case on the following evening.

Walter was absent and John and Mark ran the séance. Both talked in independent voice. John found it difficult to operate the flappers on the Theatre and had Butler do it for him. The mechanical bell rang gently several times while the light was out (in Theatre). With light on, the pendulum swung through a wide amplitude. With light out the bell again rang weakly, (the loudness depending on the amount of pressure on the  

3 Ordinarily John and Mark do not use the independent voice but communicate by raps. In this and the sitting following John talked clearly.
flapper). It then rang loudly. Pendulum was swinging vigorously\(^4\) as the light was put on. John asked Butler to turn on the light and then put it out. At the first attempt John said that Butler did it too quickly. On a second attempt the flapper of the bell was seen to move up and down slowly. (The extreme end of the flapper was off-stage.) The Sistrum bell rang and the light went on but a moment later it rang again without lighting. This was followed by conversation with the use of the lifted megaphone. This was taken from the hands of several sitters, and used to push them playfully, so there could be no question of its actual movement, which attained a range several feet beyond the medium's reach. Very strong cold air was felt toward the end of the seance, and after the megaphone work Mark asked the sitters to break the circle, stating that he and John, through their inexperience, had to some degree lost control of the force and were trying to regain it. This happened twice; the second time faint light was requested; the medium awoke, and spoke simultaneously with Mark.

September 16th: John came in first; made his finger prints, and then gave way to Walter. The Sistrum rang with the red light on while it was on the table and while it moved about in front of the Psychic, apparently carried by Walter. It dropped to the floor, was picked up by Crandon and handed to Mrs. Richardson. It rang while she held it (and pressed the flapper), and again while it was operated in turn by Caldercott, Mrs. Cooper and Dudley. In the first three instances the red light of the Theatre was on. It was returned to its stand on the table, where the bell rang as though it had been muffled (the Sistrum light not on); the bell then sounded like an imperfect buzzer. The new scales\(^5\) (pans supported from below) were put on the stage of the Theatre and were loaded 0:4, then 0:7, with glass weights. With the Theatre light on, the scales balanced and the Sistrum bell rang with muffled gong. Walter said that Butler had made these scales so that he (Walter) had both to push and

---

\(^4\)As compared to the slow movement of July 15th, when it did not swing by the center.

\(^5\)Butler's scales, see pp. 600-601.
pull to make them work. He returned to the Sistrum and it rang several times with the light out, while it was face down on the glass bell-box. Butler put it on the stand and screwed in the lamp bulb. It rang while he was doing this and then the lamp lighted, showing the arrow deflected.

September 23rd: The Psychic was controlled by Dudley on the left and Crandon on the right. John manifested first but Walter came in a little later. The Sistrum was in use but the batteries seemed very weak and would neither ring the bell nor light the lamp. Walter said, “I can recharge the batteries.” The Sistrum was then moved about above the table, placed face down on the glass bell-box, and, after a short time, the light in the Sistrum grew brighter and the bell rang somewhat feebly. At Walter’s command, John gave the Richardson code twice via the Sistrum, the light growing brighter each time. Dudley unscrewed the lamp at Walter’s request. The bell rang louder (as it should). Walter said there was a poor connection on the under side of the bell where he could not get at it, and that the batteries were not run down. He said that he had caused the batteries of the old Scientific American bell-box to retain their vigor all these years. (It is a fact that they have continued to function much longer than most batteries do.)

September 27th: Here, again, the Sistrum’s curious action furnished the major item of interest. The following abstract is taken in part from Crandon’s record, supplemented with notes by Dudley:

This apparatus had been in the hands of Mr. Summer, a professional electrician, who could not make the bell ring or the light go on. Walter said never mind, he would attend to it. Crandon bet Walter $10.00 that he could not make it ring. After working on it for about five minutes, Walter said that all one needed to do to make it ring was to say “Bing! Bing!” He pronounced these syllables and the bell rang.

It rang strongly, as though the batteries were new; it rang while Dudley held it about four feet from the Psychic without depressing the flapper, but not when in a vertical position. Held horizontally it rang but as it was brought to within 20° of the vertical it stopped ringing only to start again when tipped forward. It acted as though there was a load on the flapper which was great enough
to depress it only when the flapper was about 40° from the vertical. (Normally the flapper stands about 20° from the body of the Sistrum.) The red light was turned on in the Sistrum during this latter test although off when first tried. It rang while in the hands of Mrs. Litzelmann and Richardson. The latter reported touches on his hand and on the Sistrum. It rang when Mrs. Richardson held it face down and when Walter held it; but not when Dudley held it and pressed the flapper. He tried this three times; then, at Walter's request, he held it with the flapper toward himself but with the Sistrum between the scales (on the table) and the Psychic. He then felt something fumbling with the upper part of the front of the Sistrum, then Walter asked that the flapper be depressed. When this was done the bell rang, but when this external pressure decreased the bell would not ring. This was tried three times, and on one test the bell failed to ring. Walter then said that he would bet Dudley that the latter could not make it ring. When Dudley asked permission to take the Sistrum home Walter at first refused, and then consented. At the close of the sitting the bell would not ring nor the lamp light.

The following is the report of Dudley's examination:

I found that both sets of battery cells had been moved downward from their top contacts: one about 1/16 inch; the other less than 1/32 inch; thus causing an open circuit. They fitted so tightly in their tubes that considerable force had to be applied to replace them. One end of the bell wiring had a loose connection (see Sept. 23rd séance) but above the base of the bell. With the batteries in place and this connection soldered the bell worked better but not every time. The bell contacts were oxidized; the hammer spring was too weak to return the hammer properly when the Sistrum was tilted sideways, and there were fine iron filings on the magnets. All these difficulties were corrected and the bell worked perfectly. However, when the right-hand battery was out of contact the bell could be made to ring by pressing firmly on the gong so that it contacted a cross-connection from the other battery; thus closing the circuit with less than the full battery voltage. When the right-hand battery was only slightly out of contact with the brass angle forming the upper contact point, a slight pressure on this angle would close the circuit. I returned the Sistrum to Lime Street, leaving it in the book room September 28th.
During the late afternoon of September 29th, Kunz and I were testing the effect of flash powder in the séance room, using an electric igniter that I had made. On our way out we stopped to speak to Margery, who was sewing in the back room on the same floor as the book room. To prove that the Sistrum had been restored to its original condition I took it from the book room to the brightly lighted back room where Margery was seated, and depressed the flapper several times. The bell rang loudly and the lamp lighted. I tried it again in the same way but neither the bell nor the lamp responded. I then pressed the flapper to the extreme limit of its travel time after time, but without the slightest effect. At no time was the device out of my control, and neither Margery nor Kunz touched it. I took it to the book room, held it under the reading lamp and, with the aid of a small piece of mirror, examined the contact mechanism while depressing the flapper. I found that the large gear had been forced out of mesh with the segmental gear, moved back about three teeth and re-engaged. Consequently, complete depression of the flapper would not rotate the contact pin on the large gear to the position of contact with the insulated spring and close the circuit. With the aid of a paper knife, I succeeded, after several trials, in replacing the gear in proper mesh. The device now worked perfectly and was in the same condition as when it left my hands the day before. I demonstrated it to Margery and Kunz without further misadventure.

The Sistrum had worked normally just before it went out of commission. As I had recently completed a thorough check-up of every part I was entirely familiar with the mechanism, and I am quite sure that I did nothing which would account for its erratic behavior. Its failure to work after several successful tests was clearly the result of a maladjustment of the gears, which could be readjusted only by the application of considerable force in a very restricted space. As the device was then made, no sudden application of any reasonable pressure to the flapper, no shaking or jarring, would throw these gears out of mesh. At the time it failed to work I felt no external pressure on the apparatus, but since the assumed locus of the operation
was wholly within the device (on the assumption that the operation was supernormal), there need not have been any component of force external to it. A normal operation of the sort described would, of necessity, have had an external component sufficiently large to be readily felt.

The disc covering the mechanism is 9/16 inch from the backboard, while the large gear is about 1/4 inch from the same surface. Apparently the lifting and turning force must be applied in this 1/4 inch space.

It now seems probable that, during the séance of the 23rd, Walter changed the gear, as above described, and this was the reason why the electrician could not make the bell ring. And that, during the latter part of the séance of the 27th, Walter had again put the gears out of proper mesh, but before letting me take it away, he returned the contact mechanism to its normal relationship and "drew a red herring across the trail" by disconnecting the batteries. For, with the gear out of its proper position, the bell could be rung by pressing inward on the contact spring. Such a pressure would produce some of the effects described in the above séance record.

October 8th: This séance, held in the old cabinet, was interesting in many ways. The old (S.A.) and the glass bell-boxes were used as well as the scales. Dr. Martin controlled at the Psychic's left; Crandon at the right, with Fife next to him. Walter spoke of the flash-powder tests of the 29th (spontaneously) and said that he was present. Dudley remarked that he seemed to have been downstairs afterward, to which Walter replied, "Ha, Ha! Well, you were so sure that you could ring that bell that I thought I would show you that you didn't know all about it." He rang the old bell-box, then the glass one but without the glass partitions and with the lamp unscrewed; rang it while Miss Johnson held it high in the air; again it rang on the table, and then he told Crandon to turn the white flash

---

6 This contact spring is well under the disc over which the arrow rotates. It is by no means readily accessible.
7 The Comstock balances.
8 Walter's propensity for "doing things" to electrical equipment has been referred to many times, both in M. M. and in these Proceedings.
on it. As Crandon did so, and while the bell was ringing, there was a brief flash of something white withdrawing from the box. The bell continued to ring, and no normal structure was visible to account for the ringing, although Dudley scrutinized the apparatus very carefully. Walter said that Crandon was too sudden and that he (Walter) had to duck. He asked for the red flash-lamp, and in this illumination the bell rang while the flappers were seen in their central position of contact. Again it rang while Dudley continued to examine the mechanism. The impression which the latter got from the earlier phenomenon was not that of some object disappearing out of the area of illumination, which was large, but rather of a structure that evaporated while in motion. Clouds often disappear in much the same way but at a much slower rate.

The sitting was continued with the scales which balanced kinetically in red light with a 1:4 load. Walter asked Dudley, who was sitting next to Martin, if he wanted to see the cylinder. Dudley assenting, Walter asked Crandon to turn on the red flash-light for 1½ seconds, when he gave the word. A moment later Walter said, "Light," and in the strong illumination from the above mentioned light everyone but Litzelmann saw a cylinder about the size of a test tube (say 9/16 inch diameter), and about 3½ to 4 inches high, near the front edge of the loaded or west pan. The scales were in kinetic balance and oscillating freely. Litzelmann, said that he did not see this (after the light had been turned out) so Walter said he would show it again. In a succeeding period of illumination the cylinder was again seen but this time it was in the center of the pan, surrounded by the four wooden weights, and leaned very slightly toward the Psychic. In appearance the structure looked like two glass tubes, one inside the other and both slightly smoky. Walter explained that this was a "sucker" and not a vacuum or anything of that sort; that we saw only the tip of it, which was, in fact, a helix made up of an inner and an outer shell "twisted round and round, just as though you took a roll of paper and pulled out the center." When asked why he used a helix he replied, "Because it can be stretched or bent when
you pick up the scales and move them around. If I used a rod I would have to be on the end of it and follow it around.’’

Q. “What happens when an arm is passed across the top of the scales and around them?” Walter: “Well, you know, it is in the fourth dimension and can pass right through your arm.” Say, Parson (to Martin), I can walk right through you just as though you weren’t there. There, I walked through you!’’ Martin: “I felt you on this shoulder (left); as though something crawled on it; but your voice stayed where it was.” Walter: “I am not in the voice apparatus. That is something that I make up to talk through but I don’t have to be in it.”

Returning to a discussion of the cylinder, Walter said that ordinarily it could be photographed through a quartz lens but not with a glass lens, and that it could not be seen.

The last presentation of this interesting structure was seen by everyone in the circle and all agreed as to its appearance. Bond, however, seemed able to see a greater length of it than the rest of the group, although, in other respects his description coincided with the others.

October 9th: Crandon’s record for this date, after indicating that the Little Theatre was initially in place on the table, tells us:

The Sisyphus was put on the little stage and after a while we all saw the celluloid ball roll slowly up the incline, then it went back and forth part way and at the same time we could see it rotate in all directions. This was made evident by the three painted equators on it, and was done in front of a bright red background.

The balances made by Butler with the supporting beam underneath were now set on the stage. Stewart was told, by Walter, speaking in good red light, to put anything he pleased on one pan. Stewart put on a bunch of keys and a brooch, total weight at least eight ounces. After a period of darkness Walter proceeded, in good red light, to make the scales oscillate in perfect balance as if evenly laden.

The Little Theatre was now moved and the big scales were put on the table. Walter made this balance with a four-to-one load in good red light, plus red search light. This was repeated with Keyes picking up the scales and turning completely around with them.

Note Crawford’s experiment in cutting across the region within which telekinetic action was occurring without interfering with the levitation.
in his hands with red light plus red search light playing upon them while they oscillated evenly as if equally loaded.

Butler's glass bell-box was now put on the table and Walter rang it freely in good red light and then rang it intermittently in the hands of Keyes, Brown and Mrs. Keyes while they turned a complete circle, each of them, with red light playing upon it. At the last, in the hands of Mrs. Keyes, it seemed more difficult because, as Walter said, his power was waning for the night.

On October 12th, after the photographic experiments detailed in Chapter LVI, Walter returned to the Sistrum. He rang it both with and without the self-contained light and then said: "It looks as though Butler had fixed it this time. I don't know as I can do much with it. Looks as though he had me stopped."

The mechanism was heard to operate but the bell did not ring and the lamp failed to light. Walter: "Ha! Ha! Here, Chief, you take it. (Passed it to Richardson.) Now try it." Richardson pushed the flapper and it did not ring. Walter: "Now I wonder what's the matter with it." Richardson tried it again and the bell rang with light on; this was repeated. It was passed to Crandon and again acted normally. It was still in normal condition at the close of the séance. Butler had repaired the Sistrum since the last experiments. He had also changed the ratio of the gears operating the arrow, with the result that the momentum of the arrow was great enough to throw the gears out of mesh when the flapper was operated suddenly. 10 Apparently Walter discovered this almost at once and took advantage of the fact to put the Sistrum out of commission, although he was still able to complete the circuit at will.

Following a number of séances devoted largely to photographic work, discussed in Chapter LVI, the séance of October 24th was given for a number of strangers. Naturally the Butler apparatus received the most attention, supported by the Comstock scales and the VCO. The following is abstracted from Dudley's report:

10 As soon as this was drawn to Butler's attention he corrected the difficulty and, at the same time, made a complete enclosure for the gear and contact mechanism.
The Little Theatre was on the table with the sisyphus on the stage. Walter turned on the light (in the Theatre), and the celluloid ball rolled slowly up the incline to about the half-way point, then rolled off the track until it rested against the illuminated glass background. It was held in that position against its tendency to roll back by some invisible mechanism. Dudley was watching this operation through the clear glass of the west wing (from his position as controller of the Psychic’s left hand). Walter asked him to turn off the light. As soon as this was done the ball was heard to strike the stop at the bottom of the incline.

The Butler mechanical bell was put on the stage (the sisyphus having been removed) and was rung several times. Dudley removed the Theatre, and the other apparatus, at Walter’s request, and put the glass bell-box on the table.

Walter rang the bell-box with the lamp out, while it was on the table and, under white flashlight, while it was passed around the circle in the hands of Mrs. Hubbs, Mrs. Harrison, Harrison, Mrs. Derieux and Dodd. The bell rang intermittently. Sometimes the white light appeared to stop the ringing, at other times it did not. The test was especially successful with Harrison. Walter remarked: “Harrison is some man! I am going to help myself to what he’s got.” Harrison said that he felt “energy going out” while he carried the box. Walter added, “Why don’t you have a circle like this all the time?” During this bell-box test the outside partition was the only one in place. Bell-box removed and scales put on table. Balanced without load, in red light. Crandon put one weight in east pan; Dudley dropped four weights, one by one, into the west pan (so that everyone in the circle could count them). West pan grounded as second weight fell. In subsequent red-light period the scales balanced kinetically with this load. Harrison picked up the scales and turned a complete circle while Crandon played the white light on them, and they continued to balance. Walter said, as soon as they had been replaced on the table, “If you could see the energy coming out of Harrison you would see a stream twisting and turning like a corkscrew.”

The VCO was put on the table. Walter asked for a luminous doughnut. It was placed, face down, on the table and at the east end. It was moved by Walter to the west end of the table, picked up, waved about over both ends of the table, in front of the VCO and back to the table; picked up again and brought out to at least a foot in front of the VCO tubes, so that the terminal was silhouetted against the luminous floats. It was then thrown and landed on Harrison’s shoe. There was double control of the Crandon-Margery link during these operations. The VCO test was then completed, Mrs. Harrison guarding the top of the tube and Harrison placing and removing the mouthpiece. The test was an unusually good one, both as to talking and whistling.
Dudley reports control of Margery (left hand) continuous, except for periods when apparatus was being changed, and that she was very quiet throughout.

**November 5th**: Dudley controlled the Psychic’s left hand except while removing and replacing apparatus; Crandon controlled the right as at the last sitting. She was very quiet throughout. Quoting from Dudley’s record:

Theatre on table with sisyphus, as before. Walter turned on the light in the Theatre; the ball *rolled slowly* half way up the incline, and then *rolled slowly* back. This was repeated twice in the same period of red-light illumination. Dudley watched this operation at close range and saw no extraneous mechanism in or near the Theatre. At Walter’s request, Dudley turned out the light and removed the Theatre.

Glass bell-box put on the table. (In same condition as in last report.) It rang without the light while on the table, and rang intermittently while it was carried around within the circle by Holmes, Golding, Mrs. Woolley and Mrs. Baker, white flashlight being used most of the time. Again, with Holmes engineering, it stopped ringing while his back was turned to the Psychic. He asked Walter to start it ringing and it rang. The Psychic showed marked reactions to the prolonged flashes of white light. VCO tested successfully with Holmes engineering.

On November 17th there was a séance, attended by Mrs. Richardson and several other ladies, to whom various communications were vouchsafed. Walter manipulated the doughnut freely, gave various touches, pulled the hair of sitters; otherwise the evening was given over to talk.

On the following evening there was a sitting for some seven strangers. Again quoting from Dudley’s record:

The Butler apparatus was again used, beginning with the sistrum. Walter’s comment was to the effect that Butler seemed to have fixed the sistrum but that he (Walter) thought that he could prevent it from ringing. It was face down on the table and it rang with the red light (its own) on. Dudley admitted that it might be possible for Walter to do as he said, to which Walter countered with: “You wouldn’t have before I played that trick on you downstairs (putting it out of commission in the light, see pp. 661-62); it would take a long thin finger to do the trick.” The flapper of the sistrum was heard to work up and down but the bell did not ring. It was passed round the circle and rang as long as it was held face downward but when, at Walter’s request,
it was held vertically, it stopped ringing. This was tried several times.

The glass bell-box was put on the table and rang with the light unscrewed (presumably by Walter, since the light was connected at the beginning of the experiment). It then rang with the light on while it was carried round the circle by Mrs. Guest, Cotton, Erwin, Mrs. Franks and her son. The green flash was turned on the box at frequent intervals during this experiment, and seemed to produce less interference than any other, while giving good illumination. Walter said that the flappers were very difficult to handle because they had to be placed exactly on center. The bell-box was returned to the table. Walter handed something to Franks with the request that it be passed to Dudley. It was one of the small cells of battery from the bell-box. He then passed out another with a similar request, and suggested that Dudley keep them.

Scales (Comstock) put on table. Balanced in red light and were then unbalanced as Franks put in a 1:4 lead (4 in west pan). In subsequent red-light interval they balanced kinetically while Cotton picked them up and turned a complete circle. When replaced on the table and in subsequent darkness, a luminous mass appeared in the east pan and the scales oscillated violently; the luminous mass rising and falling in consonance with the sounds made by the grounding pans.

VCO tested while Cotton protected the top of the tube and Franks placed and removed the mouthpiece. Franks controlled the Psychic’s left hand. Walter talked, laughed and whistled freely.

Walter closed the séance at 10:30, with the request that the red light be left burning all night.12

Walter got a great “kick” out of his sistrum experiments in mystification but, having practically exhausted its possibilities as a source of mechanical and electrical puzzles, he made no further use of it.

The next séance at which telekinesis was the order of the day was the very important one of December 3d, held at the Baker residence during Crandon’s absence on a brief European trip. The background of this sitting is adequately described at the point referred to. The record was drawn up from memory by Whitney and Mrs. Baker, the following day; and it carries their signatures. It gives us the following picture of

---

11 J. R. Cotton, not the E. H. Cotton of Chapter XIX.
12 This is a fairly frequent request after strangers have been present. Walter conveys the idea that visiting disembodied spirits try to manifest to their friends and, if they can, to get control of the energy that he has stored in the séance room. He says that the light acts to break the connection and prevent them from reforming it. Sometimes Crandon finds the light turned out in the morning. In this case it was still burning.
the séance, which it may again be emphasized was held on strange premises, and without even Crandon’s knowledge:

On the table in front of the Psychic was a silver dish and bowl of cold water. Kettle of boiling water on the hearth. Fife brought a box of dental wax. Whitney and Baker both had marked pieces in their pockets.

The medium was in trance soon after 8:30 P.M. and Walter vocalized almost immediately. Shortly after the sitters were all conscious of very cool breezes and the coldness of the Psychic’s and Whitney’s hands were mentioned. Fife reported touches and Whitney reported a touch on his “bald spot” and his shoulder.

Several articles were placed one at a time in the silver dish; a spool of thread, box of matches, cigarette box and gold bracelet were all identified. Then we were told to put on the red light, fill the dish with hot water and put in a piece of wax. Two well defined impressions were put in the wax, a left- and a right-hand thumb-print (afterwards identified by Fife as “Walter” prints). While force was accumulating for another demonstration of fingerprinting a basket was rocked and levitated from the table three feet or more, followed by an exhibition of “lights out” on the handle of the basket, sitters reporting variously on the number of lights left, sometimes one, sometimes two being extinguished for a second or two.

Dish was again filled with water and another piece of wax received a single imprint from the same thumb.

Paper doughnut placed on table was covered and extinguished when whirled and levitated.

Walter whistled and talked with animation during the whole time—ended by throwing the megaphone (which was on the floor at Whitney’s left at beginning of sitting and had not been touched by any of the sitters) at Baker.

At the request of Walter, Whitney placed the illuminated doughnut on the table and put his nose through the hole of the doughnut. Walter then pulled Whitney’s hair twice with an upward lift of approximately five or six pounds.

DECEMBER 12, 1927. A second séance held in Crandon’s absence. The following brief account is abstracted from Dudley’s record:

13 Walter says that he is doing scientific research with the sitters as subjects. By obscuring one or more luminous bands in such manner that some are seen from one angle and not from another, he gets the sitters to make apparently contradictory reports as to what they do see.

14 The sitters, in order: Richardson, Mrs. Richardson, Mrs. Millea, Dr. Rockefeller, Theron Pierce, Mrs. Butler, Dudley, Fife. Outside, in same order: Mrs. Churchill, E. B. Millea, F. B. Bond and Mrs. Pierce. Shortly after the séance began Walter asked Mrs. Pierce to change places with Mrs. Butler.
Walter asked for the luminous "doughnut," and when this was put on glass bell-box (on the table) by Fife, he levitated it several feet above the table and from one side to the other of the circle, a distance of at least five feet. He then asked for the basket, and Fife put the small luminous basket on the bell-box, whence it was immediately removed to the table top, and just as quickly returned to the bell-box. Walter demonstrated that he could change its position before any member of the circle (in response to Walter’s question) could state where the basket was located. It was then levitated to the top of the cabinet, then to each side in turn, rapped on the west wall of the cabinet, held out beyond the outer edge of the table, but dropped to the floor at Dudley’s feet. From there it was picked up and thrown to Pierce, and, falling to the floor again, was again picked up when approximately six feet from the Psychie.

The non-luminous basket was passed for a collection of articles for cognition, which were described by Walter as: a cigarette box, match, pencil, another pencil, “also belonging to an insurance man,” cough drop, and then passed the basket to Mrs. Richardson, who removed the articles and handed it to Mrs. Churchill. The latter held it above Mrs. Richardson’s head, whence it was snatched by Walter, and thrown violently into the north-east corner of the room.

Many of these operations were of such nature as to suggest that Walter was working from a point well removed from the medium. His voice was loud and, at times, very husky; distinctly masculine. During some of the levitations there was bilateral double control.

Walter worked the glass bell-box, then asked Dudley to pick it up in red light. The latter did this, turning completely about while the bell rang continuously. This was repeated with Rockwell in the capacity of engineer, and with Dudley turning the green flash on the bell. It rang the number of times requested by Millea, rang while he picked it up, raised it high, and Dudley turned the green flash on it again.

The bell-box was removed and the Comstock model scales substituted. They balanced perfectly in red light, without load. In a subsequent period of darkness Walter asked for four weights in either pan and one in the other. Fife put the 4 in the east pan and the single weight in the west pan, thus reversing the usual order, (the other loading being used because the rider is secured at the east end of the beam, and, even if it be assumed to be free, could not be of the slightest assistance in counterbalancing an excess weight in the west pan.

Walter laughed, and said, "You son-of-a-gun, you would put them in wrong. You put four in the side that I had my teleplasm in, and now I’ve got to shift it over to the other pan. Think you’re

15 The basket being used at this time as an object of telekinesis. It weighs four ounces (Av.).
TELEKINESIS OF LATER 1927

"going to fool me, don’t you? Thought that I couldn’t do it. Well, turn on the light for one second." The light was turned on for about two seconds, and the scales were seen in kinetic balance. Walter: “Dr. Rockwood, you come over and pick-up the scales and turn around with them. Dudley, you turn the green light on them.” Rockwood carried the scales (still balancing kinetically) about the circle, turning slowly, and holding them close to each sitter in turn, while Dudley played the green flash over them, the red light (mantel) being on at the same time, thus providing an exceptionally good illumination.

A séance on December 22d, in celebration of Crandon’s return, was devoted wholly to chatting with Walter on topics serious and frivolous. The next séance was on the 30th, and Crandon’s record notes extensive physical action, as follows:

Walter came through in about three minutes and greeted everybody singly and collectively. He played for a while with a new windmill bell-box of Butler’s and he then identified something which Richardson brought as being a daily calendar.

Walter then did some very extensive levitation with the luminous doughnut and on request showed his terminal slowly passing over the luminous limb of the doughnut. All could see it. Then on request he touched the head of Burchell as it lay on the table.

Walter then did some beautiful levitation and throwing about of the luminous basket, and twice threw it into the lap of the woman farthest away.

The scales were now put on the table. Burchell was told to put four weights on either pan and one on the other. Then Walter balanced the pans as if evenly laden, while Burchell lifted the scales unit, turned a complete circle, 360 degrees, the pans oscillating gently and evenly all the while in red light plus white flash-light.

Walter now exhibited the use of the Richardson VCO machine. There was some difficulty in the Psychic’s holding the glass tip because she has not done it now for many months, but at last the experiment was repeated three times with Walter whistling and joking and finally reciting the vowels a-e-i-o-u. He then defied any one of the sitters to even say “a” in the same condition.

Although several of the succeeding séances followed the routine pattern in their telekinetic content, and in spite of a considerable hiatus in these phenomena during the intense concentration on the cross-correspondences, there will be some advantage in grouping the remaining incidents in the next chapter.
CHAPTER LIV
Telekinesis in 1928 and 1929

As the cognitive phenomena of this period increased in complexity and developed into cross-correspondences of the controlled type, the telekinetic phase was relegated to the background, except in certain sittings when it was desirable to present a wide range of phenomena for visitors who were interested in the scientific study of the mediumship. From a review of previous séances it might appear that several different types of phenomena can be presented in the same séance without interference, in an energetic sense; hence, that telekinetic phenomena and such subjective activities as are involved in the cross-correspondences could be carried on in parallel. However, the writer finds, from a study of his notes, that there appears to be a considerable expenditure of energy in a successful cross-correspondence—much greater, in fact, than one would anticipate. If this assumption is correct it may explain why so few of the purely telekinetic phenomena were presented during the succeeding months, and why those few were largely of routine character. In general, an increase in the complexity of the cross-correspondences (including more than two mediums) seemed to result in an almost complete exclusion of physical phenomena, especially during the early stages of this experimentation, and vice versa. The routine phenomena may, therefore, be dismissed with the briefest mention of their nature, merely to complete the record of the number of séances held, more space being given to the description of a few séances involving special features of interest, followed by complete reports of the phenomena of the last two séances in this group in 1929.

On January 4, 1928, the sitting was devoted, in large part, to the initial phase of an experiment in post-séance writing of material cognized during the séance which, at a later date,
developed into the cross-correspondences described in the *Journal*, 1928. The glass bell-box was also used, but in slightly different form: the glass partitions forming the labyrinthian passage were fixed in their staggered position, and their exposed edges had been faced with chamois skin. Walter found these soft edges much kinder to his teleplasmic terminal, and rang the bell successfully, as usual.

A wooden box, filled flush and smooth with oiled moulder’s sand, had been provided by Butler, who suggested that it might be used as a means of obtaining impressions of the larger structures. Walter was told that he might make an imprint of a hand, foot, or face in this sand. He said that he had made a print in the sand; whereupon Dudley removed the box to the back room, and noted that there were two holes in the sand, near one corner, each about the size of the latter’s index finger. These did not show any trace of ridge markings. After the séance Margery found that her lips and the whole inside of her mouth, even to the surfaces of the gums next the cheeks, were coated with this oiled sand. So firmly did it adhere to the mucous membrane that she had to brush her mouth vigorously before she succeeded in removing it. The results were so unpleasant that she did not care to have this experiment carried further.

**January 28th:** Largely routine in character, involving levitation of doughnut through a wide arc and with marked projection well outside of cabinet, silhouetting of terminal over the luminous ring of doughnut, identification of objects, ringing of glass bell-box, and balancing of scales with 4:1 load, in red light and with white flashlight. Scales held above table by Belknap, in red light, while in kinetic balance, and flashlight photograph taken. As was done on November 21, 1927. This procedure became somewhat standardized.

---

1 Where it was examined in strong, white light.

1a See *Clairvoyance and Materialization*, p. 184. Geley notes that teleplasm: "Issues most frequently from the mouth [of Eva C.] and this is the easiest to observe; it can be seen exuding from the inner surface of the cheeks, from the arch of the palate, and the gums. It takes on different aspects—sometimes (and this is the most characteristic) the appearance of a kind of plastic protoplasmic paste, sometimes a number of fine threads."

1b As was done on November 21, 1927. This procedure became somewhat standardized.
in balance on table, before Kunz could close all the lenses; hence, Walter said that he would try again. Another photograph was taken but neither showed any supernormal structures. This was followed by the usual VCO test.

January 29th: Crandon’s record notes doughnut and basket levitations, the basket being picked up from the floor and placed on the table, at and over the side and edge farthest from the Psychic.

February 7th: An interested gathering of ministers of various Unitarian and Universalist connections was assembled in Lime Street, and between intervals of philosophical wrangling between Walter and these gentlemen about what life in the Hereafter ought to be like, a brilliant physical show was staged. The record may be given verbatim so far as it covers this:

Walter read a calendar number which Cotton put on the table, one not known to Cotton or anyone else; then he did the same for Caldecott. He levitated the doughnut all over the place and showed his fingers grasping it. He levitated the luminous basket with great speed in all directions, high and low; then threw it across the room. While Crandon was out of the room, with strict control of the medium he picked up the luminous doughnut from the floor to the table. He operated the balances with 1:4 load, arranged

\[2\] Walter has very pronounced views, quite at variance with those of the average clergyman. He has no use whatever for harps and halos, and none for a life of leisure. He strongly decries any display of emotion in connection with the transition from this life to the next. He insists upon the objective character of his own world, and upon the fact that it is as commonplace to its people as ours is to us. One might rather well express his attitude by saying that he sees no more occasion for any different attitude on the contrast between his world and ours than should exist between an Englishman and an American on the contrast between their respective countries. The situation which confronts him in the séance room in the presence of ministers always has its trying as well as its amusing aspects. One worthy cleric insisted on interrogating Walter about the adequacy of some elaborate mechanistic ideas which he had formulated to explain the efficacy of prayer. Others want to talk to him about salvation, his soul, etc. The present record remarks that “the usual number of earnest but foolish questions was asked and Walter held his own with the brightest of the sitters.” It was probably on another occasion that Walter, after half an hour’s effort to get an intelligent human reaction out of a group of exceptionally long-faced clergies, remarked profanely that if these were ministers, we might give him plumbers.

\[3\] Crandon left to answer the telephone and when he was ready to return Walter instructed Dudley to tell him to sit on the cedar chest in the hall; meanwhile Walter talked to the ministers, levitated the doughnut, and seemed to be trying to make it clear to the sitters that Crandon’s presence was not related to the phenomena. Dr. Cotton controlled Margery’s left hand, and one of the strangers had her right hand in Crandon’s absence.
on the pans by Cloud on his own option. He repeated this with Cotton in the cabinet, back to the medium, lifting the whole scales unit high.\textsuperscript{3a} He operated the VCO, which previously had been tried out by some of the sitters. As a final act he stopped the victrola.

March 28, 1928. This was a glass-cabinet sitting in which the wire ties were applied by Carter, while Mrs. McKenzie and Fife had tactual control of the Psychic's hands throughout, except for brief periods when apparatus was placed or removed. Including Crandon, there were seventeen sitters. Dudley, seated at the east corner of the old cabinet where a shaded dark-room lamp could be used, kept a record of events and times, which forms the basis of the present abstract.

There were correct cognitions of four wooden letters (a random selection by Mrs. McKenzie), followed by cognitions of personal articles ranging from a cigarette lighter to a pocketbook. Then followed levitations of the luminous basket during which Walter specifically called attention to the fact that he was talking and whistling while the basket moved about freely and through a considerable range. He referred to the allegation that he couldn't talk with the basket in the air because Margery did it with her mouth. The basket was thrown into the back of cabinet, and as Fife reached for it in red light, Walter spoke to him—in answer to the suggestion made by some member of the circle, that he couldn't talk in this illumination.

Mechanical bell (Butler's) placed on shelf by Mrs. McKenzie, and rung three times. She reported that it had been moved along the shelf toward the Psychic's right, when she came to remove it.

In preparation for the VCO test, Carter unlocked collar in red light. Walter spoke to him at this time and Carter stated that the voice came from well back in the cabinet. VCO test engineered by Mrs. McKenzie, and reported as very successful. During this experiment Crandon's mouth and hands were controlled by Carter. The latter checked all ties and removed them.

The sitting was resumed in the old cabinet with Mrs. McKenzie controlling at the left and Fife at the right, (Dudley

\textsuperscript{3a} In continuous red light with white light above and below scales.
remaining in his original position, which placed him just behind and to the left of Fife.) The scales were loaded 1:4 by Mrs. McKenzie, in red light, and were then engineered by Carter, who turned through 360° while they balanced kinetically in red light with white flashlight turned on them by Crandon. This operation covered a period of 45 seconds.

Continuous tactual control of Margery's hands reported during this sitting in the old cabinet. The scales were examined before and after the sitting by one of the professors in the group.

The séance lasted for one hour and eight minutes.

April 19, 1928. Margery and Hardwicke were in the cabinet, with Richardson controlling Hardwicke's left hand and Crandon at Margery's right. The adjacent sitters were Dr. F. B. Mocenter and Mrs. Litzelmann, respectively, with Bird sitting next to the latter. 4

Bird reported touches on left knee; Crandon said that he was touched on the head by a cold hand; Richardson reported touches first on hand then one knee (probably on right side), while Bird added that his knee was grasped firmly, as though by fingers. The table came down on the floor with a heavy thud, although no one had reported its levitation, and moved away from the cabinet. This movement was repeated several times. Richardson reported control of Hardwicke's left foot but there was no other report of control. (The position of the two mediums in reference to the cabinet made such control difficult unless this were applied from beneath the table.)

Walter spoke briefly, and almost at once a luminous mass was seen in the cabinet near Margery. It moved up, down, across to the west side of the cabinet (Hardwicke's left), down to the floor, and then back to the east side of cabinet. After a few moments of quiescence it became larger, approached the table, and, as it appeared to contact the latter, a sharp rap was heard.

At Walter's request, Bird bent forward to place his head on the table and as he did so reported that he felt something under his forehead, something that seemed to be movable and on which

---

4 This abstract is compiled from Dudley's notes, and, as noted in the text, contains numerous statements by the other sitters. The agreement as to the nature of the phenomena was good among those who were well situated to observe them, and varied with distance and angle of view of the other sitters. Crandon's report notes that the luminous arm was a left arm; also, that, throughout the séance, Walter kept saying, in a low voice, "Lots of trouble; this tandem business," meaning, presumably, three mediums in trance at the same time.
he could rock his head, but that he could not determine its size. He lowered his head to the table and both Crandon and Millea (the latter seated behind Bird) described a luminous arm that seemed to have two claws at its end, reaching out toward the back of Bird’s neck (as they estimated his position). Bird added that something took hold of his hair and pulled it vigorously, then pulled the collar of his coat as though to pull it over his head, and added that there was something on the table at this time. Everyone in the circle could see the luminous structure, although some were in a better position to describe its movements than were others. As Bird sat up Crandon described the luminous structure as stretching out almost to Bird’s face, while Bird confirmed the fact that it was very close to his face. Crandon, Bird and Millea then united in describing this phenomenon as taking the form of an arm that moved and flexed in a normal manner, the biceps swelling and relaxing. The fingers were described as visible when the hand was open, and the fist as clenched at other times. At Bird’s request, the hand struck the table a heavy blow. Walter made the direct statement that this was his arm.

Before this luminous mass took the form of an arm it varied in shape and size from that of a large orange to a column more than a foot long and from four to five inches wide, while the luminosity was even more variable, changing from a clearly defined bluish light to a somewhat vaguely defined cloud-like effect.

A flashlight photograph was made, after which the mediums (Margery, Hardwicke and Mrs. Litzelmann) awoke. All stated that they had not been asleep. However, none of them knew that the flash powder had been ignited. The séance was of 65 minutes duration.

While the evidential value of such phenomena as the above may not be as great as under more exacting conditions of control it is interesting to note the wider range of the telekinetic action and the marked increase in the intensity of the luminous phenomena when several mediums are present.

April 26th: The scales were used at this sitting and balanced in red light with a 1:4 load, placed by Comstock, at his choice. Instead of the usual kinetic balance, they were in exact static balance. Walter drew particular attention to this; remarking to Dudley that the latter had said that he (Walter) could not do this. (It is true that I had made this statement in the course of conversation in the book room. E. E. D.)

May 10th: The scales were engineered by Dudley after Grandi had placed a 1:4 load; balanced almost statically while

5 Butshowed no supernormal structures.
on the table in red light, and while carried around the circle; but in a subsequent period of red light (after about 7 to 8 seconds of darkness) were unbalanced, the heavy pan grounded. A moment later, in red light, they balanced kinetically. This sequence was again repeated; i.e., first, unbalance; then kinetic balance; followed by unbalance, and the close of the test.

May 23d: The scales were used, engineered by Dr. Pierce, as above; while the VCO test was successfully completed, also under Pierce’s control.

Again, on May 25th, both the scales and VCO were demonstrated, the former engineered by Dudley, the latter under the control of Horace Leaf.

June 3d:§

The luminous basket was levitated and while in the air above the table the doughnut (luminous) was removed from inside the basket and levitated separately. The basket fell to the floor. Crandon reported a cold terminal moving along his left arm until it touched the ring on his finger; Tillyard then described the doughnut as being held close to his face, although it was invisible to the rest of the circle; and added that three fingers and a thumb were visible over the luminous surface. The doughnut was then thrown to the floor, and the basket was levitated therefrom and held upside down over the table. Walter invited Tillyard to grasp the basket, after which there was a tug-of-war until Tillyard released his hold, stating that he was afraid the basket would be broken. The basket was levitated freely in the back of the cabinet while Tillyard held his right hand and the medium’s left hand over her mouth; after which the basket was thrown to the opposite side of the circle (directly away from the cabinet). Tillyard then reported touches on arm, hand, cheek and head, the last being described as of five fingers. Brown added that he was touched on the head; whereupon Tillyard reported that Walter grasped the fingers of his (T’s) right hand with which he controlled Margery’s left hand.

Throughout these activities the controllers reported continuous control of the Psychic’s hands.

In red light, and under the same control, a hand was seen on the table. Tillyard said that his right hand was carried across to this teleplasmic structure, and that the back of his hand was

§ The sitters in order (clockwise): Margery, Dr. R. J. Tillyard, Dr. Richardson, Mr. J. H. Brown, Mr. J. Fred Adler, Mr. Dudley, Mr. J. W. Evans (Dr. Tillyard’s assistant), Mrs. Richardson, Dr. Crandon, Dr. Edison W. Brown. Outside the circle: Mr. Kunz, with cameras.
pressed down firmly. He then described this hand-like formation as boneless, cold, with small wrist, and having five fingers with a nail on the thumb but none on the other digits; and added that it was a right hand.

These phenomena are particularly significant because of their nature, the area within which they occurred, and the continuity of control by Drs. Tillyard and Brown.

June 16, 1928. The controllers at this séance were Richardson and Crandon, with Walton and Mrs. Richardson adjacent.

Following the preparatory steps in a post-séance test, there were free levitations of the doughnut under bilateral double control, Dr. Harvey standing in front of Mrs. Richardson and controlling the Crandon-Margery link; followed by levitations of the basket under the same control. As a result of Harvey's suggestion that this latter might be done with the feet, the basket was thrown at him when he took his seat (and in darkness), and this was followed by the small soft pillow that was at the back of Margery's chair; while Walton reported control of both Margery's feet. As this control of her lower extremities continued, one of her shoes was removed and brought down on the table with a loud bang! Control of both Margery's hands and both legs reported as continuous by Walton.

The VCO test was carried out under Harvey's control.

July 14, 1928. This was a sitting in Mrs. Stinson's room on the eve of her eightieth birthday. A birthday cake was on a small table about six feet from the head of the bed, and just in front of the three-part screen that formed the extemporized cabinet. Eight candles in their holders added to the decorations of the cake. After these had been blown out by Mrs. Stinson, Margery was reported in trance. Walter spoke a few moments later, joked with his sister Clara and his mother, told stories of his boyhood, and then advised his mother to eat some of the cake. While he had been talking the cake (as it appeared to the sitters) had become enveloped in a bluish light. This cloud of light left the vicinity of the table and passed over to the bed, as Walter said, "Will you take it if I hand it to you?" Then the light returned and there was a sound as though the cake were replaced on the table. The conversation continued, carried on mostly by Walter; while the luminous cloud rose

---

7 It is understood that the Psychic's left hand guided Tillyard's hand. She seems to function as an automaton when in trance, especially when the trance is apparently a deep one.

8 This abstract is from Dudley's report of the séance.
and fell over the cake. A candle was thrown to Miss Crandon, a candle-holder to another sitter, followed by more candleholders thrown in different directions.

The luminous phenomena continued throughout the sitting, until just before Walter said good-night.

Naturally, this sitting was not held under rigid control, and the impropriety of attempting to evaluate it from a purely psychological basis is obvious, but the atmosphere of naturalness and spontaneity which marked every phase of it, as well as the sincerity and unaffected quality of Walter’s conversation, which was so obviously directed toward making his mother’s illness more endurable, constitute an interesting addition to the subjective side of the mediumship.

The sittings of November 17th and 18th were marked by levitations, etc., of routine character, in the presence of Margery and Valiantine, with Asano controlling Valiantine and Mrs. Cannon exercising double control of Crandon and Margery. On the second evening the scales were engineered by Dudley, and VCO test by Asano.

As we enter the new year we find that the telekinetic phase of the mediumship is more frequently presented and under more than average conditions of control, as might be expected from the nature of the sittings. However, it is not easy to find many new forms in which these routine telekinetic phenomena can be produced; hence, the descriptions of many of them may be condensed to a few lines, with specific references to the names of the controllers and the nature of their control.

Thus, the telekinetic action on February 23rd, 1929, was of standard form: the scales were engineered by Dudley after a 1:4 load had been placed by Pope; while the VCO test was successfully completed under the control of Pope and Mrs. Waters.

The séance of March 28th included practically the same action as the above, as did that of April 16th.

The sitting of May 3rd might have been dismissed in the

---

*The sitters, in order, were: Margery, Richardson, Dudley, Judge Cannon, Mrs. Sears, Mrs. Crowell, Mrs. Stewart, Mr. Crowell, Mrs. Cannon, Crandon, Capt. Fife. Outside: Miss Harriet Richardson. Dudley was outside when the séance began, but Walter requested that he ‘‘get into the circle.’’*
same way were it not for an interesting spontaneous contribution by Walter.

Following some cognitions of personal articles, Walter asked for the scales. These were engineered by Dudley after Crowell had placed a 1:4 load. Dudley then activated the floats of the VCO, while in the hall, and placed the apparatus on the table. The test was successfully completed under the control of Crowell. The glass mouthpiece was removed and the armored tube hung over the edge of the table next to the Psychic, Richardson and Fife remaining in control. As a rule this indicates that the séance is nearing its close, and Margery does not again go into trance, but in this instance it was noted that she had again gone to sleep.

Suddenly, the floats in the VCO tube were displaced, the one in the open leg of the U-tube rose to the very top and water spilled out on the table. Dudley exercised double control of the Richardson-Margery link, while Mrs. Cannon controlled both of Crandon's hands and Fife's right hand; the latter carried his left hand and Margery's right to cover her mouth. The float was pushed back into the tube and fell to normal water level. In the meantime, the float in the closed leg had jammed in the bend of the U-tube, thus indicating that air pressure had been applied to this leg of the water column. The water column now swung in the opposite direction, the free float descended to the bend and stuck there, indicating that the air had been partially exhausted in the closed leg. The whole VCO (see Plate 20, vol. 1) was then tipped almost to the horizontal, releasing the latter float, which returned to normal position as the VCO was again set upright on the base. The other float was still stuck in the bend. Again the free float rose to the top of the open leg and considerable water spilled over on to the table and floor.

At various stages in these operations the luminous band at the top of the open tube (five feet above the floor) was obscured by some opaque object. The control noted above was maintained throughout these maneuvers, which took place rapidly and with every indication that the equipment was under complete control of the operator. That this operator was no one in the circle was sufficiently evident to all those who witnessed these phenomena. But one person was outside the circle: Miss Harriet Richardson, and she is eliminated from any assumption of normal connection with the phenomena not only by her position but by the correctness of her attitude toward the phenomena.

May 14th: This sitting was given over almost wholly to a VCO test controlled by Mrs. Baggallay and Mrs. Pierson, with

10 The total weight of the VCO, including the iron retort stand on which it is mounted, is 7.5 pounds. It is estimated that, when tipped as noted, at least one-half of this weight is supported by the mechanism producing the displacement.
Margery’s hands and arms under tape control, and after she and the séance room had been thoroughly searched, with negative results. The door was locked by Mrs. Baggallay, the remaining sitters being in the room across the hall. Under these conditions a very successful test was conducted, continuing for an unusual length of time. In spite of the closed door, Walter’s voice and whistle could be heard in the back room.

On June 7th, there were levitations of the basket and doughnut, followed by touches on the hands of Butler and Ash, and on Mrs. Kelton’s head, while these members were held over the luminous ring. The VCO test was carried out under tape control as above. The controllers were Richardson and Crandon, with Miss Johnson and Mrs. Richardson in the adjacent chairs.

August 2d: With the same controllers as above but with Drs. Peebles and Keith in the places adjacent, the VCO test was again conducted under the above conditions, followed by levitations of the basket.

The sitting of August 4th was held at the Cabin (Point Shirley) and is reported by Crandon to have involved free levitations of the doughnut, hair pulling, touches, and placing the doughnut on the heads of Mrs. Richardson and Richardson in turn. It then fell to the latter’s chair, between his knees, and he reported that John (who purported to be operating) pressed up on the under side of the former’s right leg. When the leg was lifted in response to this pressure, the doughnut was removed. All the above are described as occurring under strict control.

August 8th: This séance included free levitations and movements of the basket and doughnut as well, above the table and of considerable amplitude, and, at times, with marked rapidity. The doughnut was hung on Grainger’s thumb and removed. Mrs. Berger controlled the Crandon-Margery link at this time while Ozora Davis controlled Margery’s left hand. The VCO test was successfully completed under Mrs. Berger’s control.
TELEKINESIS IN 1928 AND 1929

For August 24th, it is noted that Walter hung the luminous basket on Button's neck and removed it therefrom, no less than three times; then hung the doughnut on Button's thumb (right), after having placed it on the latter's right arm and removed it. Button reported control of Margery's left hand and foot; while Mrs. Jacobson reported double control of the Crandon-Margery link. The VCO test was carried out under tape control, with the same control as above in addition to Mrs. Jacobson's control of Crandon's mouth, Dr. Jacobson guarding the top of the tube. Walter repeated the Peter Piper rhyme, and whistled Annie Laurie and Yankee Doodle, with variations.

The séance of September 8th was the first for Dr. F. C. S. Schiller, and since it is almost wholly devoted to a successful cross-correspondence test, the incidental telekinesis requires no mention at this point.

The séance of the 13th was marked by considerable levitation of the basket, and the sudden appearance of an unsuspected coin in the basket while Schiller controlled Margery's left and Brown her right hand. The VCO test was carried out under similar control.

September 12th: Schiller and Brown controlled, while the report is by Crandon. A luminous phenomenon of cloud-like form and varying in size up to 4 inches broad and one foot high, appeared above the table and is noted as having passed as far as a foot each side of the table and three feet above it. There was levitation of the basket to a great height and of considerable amplitude transversely; then it was hung on Schiller's neck. It was also levitated while Schiller and Brown joined hands around it and lifted their arms well above it. Before the cognitions of articles, Walter passed the doughnut through the handle of the basket in a horizontal plane, and at least seven times. It is noted that there was no break or hesitation in this movement.

The séance of September 28th involved levitations of the basket, and rapping with coins while Martin controlled at the left and Dessoir had double control of the Crandon-Margery
The VCO test was carried out under tape control of the medium's wrists, with Dessoir controlling Crandon. Further levitations occurred on the following night with Dudley and Brown occupying the position of control. Walter touched Dudley on the right hand with the basket, while Mrs. Dessoir had double control. This was repeated as the basket swung in a wide arc across the table. Dessoir had double control at least a part of this time. The basket was hung on Dessoir's neck and he was told to grab it after Walter had removed it. He failed to hold it tightly enough and, as his grip loosened, the basket swung clear across the table, touching Dudley's right hand at the end of its travel. Control of Margery's hands reported as complete.

There were cold breezes coming from the cabinet at times; Dudley and Mrs. Dessoir noting them at the left and Brown and Dessoir at the right. Dudley observed that, at one time, this blast of cold air seemed to be equally distributed over a height of two feet and to be of approximately uniform intensity, as though it were a wind blowing from a narrow orifice two feet high.

Following the cognitions of articles and rapping on the table with a coin, as requested by Dessoir, the scales were engineered by Dudley in red light, after being loaded 4:1 by Dessoir. They balanced kinetically in red light with white flashlight, as they were carried round the circle. After they had been returned to the table and the light was turned out, the east, or laded pan struck the base sharply, as it would if normally loaded, but on Crandon's request that Dessoir be allowed to examine the scales in balance Walter asked for light and the scales were again in kinetic balance. Dessoir's right hand and Crandon's left then explored under the east pan (the normally loaded pan). As they were doing so Walter said: "Let him pass his hand

---

11 This was the first of three sittings for Dr. Max Dessoir. The sitters, in order, were: Margery, Dr. Alfred W. Martin, Mrs. Dessoir, Mr. Dudley, Miss Harriet Richardson, Mrs. Richardson, Miss Laura Crandon, Dr. Dessoir, Dr. Crandon.

12 The sitters were: Margery, Dudley, Mrs. Dessoir, Mrs. E. W. Brown, Mr. J. H. Brown, Miss Ritner, Dr. Crandon, Dr. Dessoir, and Dr. E. W. Brown.
over the pan without touching it.” As he said this Dudley was watching Margery’s face, which was turned toward the right so that the mouth was clearly visible in the red light. He states that her lips were closed and did not move, while the voice seemed to come from a point above the right shoulder and was clear and strong.

Further examination of the scales in white flashlight brought marked physical reactions from the Psychic with each exposure to white light. After the fourth of these flashes Dudley noted a prolonged muscular spasm of the left arm and hand.

At both of these séances Mrs. Dessoir drew attention to a spot of light in the séance room. This was located near the floor in the corner to the right of the door. It was, in fact, one of the small luminous markers such as are used to locate the pull-chains of lights, and in this case was built into a piece of Butler’s apparatus. Such markers are frequently used on apparatus or to indicate the position of one point with reference to another. Their luminosity is insufficient to permit of perceiving printed matter, for example.

October 2, 1929. This was the first of a series of four sittings for Lord Charles Hope, and was devoted to cognitions, levitations, the scales and a VCO test, all under somewhat different conditions of control from those used in the routine séances. Litzelmann controlled at Margery’s left and Brown at her right. ¹³

The first article cognized was “A peculiar little pencil. It has a metal clip on it.” The second was, as Walter said, “A hotel key.” This rattled as it was picked up and Walter added, “I don’t see how you got that on the table without making any noise.” The writer noted that, in neither case, was there the slightest sound when these articles were placed on the table by Hope. Hope asked Walter to read the number on the metal tag attached to the key but the latter said that it was too difficult to read, but if Hope would write on paper and present it on the following evening he (Walter) would read it.

Dudley brought the luminous basket and doughnut from the hall and put them on the table, resuming his place in the circle.

¹³ The sitters, in order: Margery, Carl Litzelmann, Lord Charles Hope, Mrs. E. W. Brown, E. E. Dudley, Crandon, Mrs. Litzelmann, and Dr. E. W. Brown.
At Walter's request, Hope controlled all the hands in the vicinity of the table; Margery's right hand being placed, with her left, under control of Litzelmann, while Hope controlled these and Litzelmann's left hand, as well as one of Brown's hands, thus exercising practically complete control of the area in front of the cabinet and of all but one hand (Brown's) in that area. Brown also controlled the Margery-Hope-Litzelmann link with his right hand. Under these conditions, and with the remaining sitters testifying to mutual control, the basket was levitated to the extreme top of the cabinet, to the east wall of the cabinet, then to the west wall, out in front and back to the east where it struck Brown on the head; it then returned to the opposite side and struck Hope on the head. The basket then moved well back into the rear of the cabinet. Normal control was re-established and Walter asked for the doughnut which, at his request, Hope had put in his pocket. With this on the table (luminous side down) Crandon put a half-dollar in the center of it. This was rapped on the table, the floor, and again on the table, and, finally, placed under the fingers of Litzelmann's right hand; all under the cross-control described above.

Walter then announced that he would move the basket and doughnut in different directions at the same time. The basket rose and moved toward the east, while the doughnut moved upward and back into the cabinet; the doughnut came forward and was waved about well up in the air above the table (approximately 3 feet) at the same time that the basket was held some 30 inches above the east end of the table. The handle of the basket was hung over Hope's neck, and the doughnut placed in the basket. Hope replaced the basket on the table, whence it was immediately removed to the floor in front of the table, presumably by Walter. The terminal holding the doughnut was clearly visible across the luminous surface when the ring was picked up from the table.

The scales were placed on the table by Dudley, examined by Hope in red light, loaded 1:4 by him, shown unbalanced in white flashlight, and engineered by Dudley in red light (through 360°) while in kinetic balance. A subsequent exposure in white light showed them still in balance.

The VCO was tested and controlled by Hope and demonstrated as on August 24th. After the mouthpiece had been removed and retested by Hope, the open end of the tube hung down as on May 3d. Suddenly, the floats were unbalanced to their maximum and remained in that position while Walter talked and whistled. Then they reversed their positions (indicating that suction had been applied to the open end of the armored tube or pressure to the open end of the glass tube) and Walter again talked. He then told Litzelmann to place his hand over Margery's mouth. The latter carried his right hand and Margery's left to her mouth, and Walter continued to talk, and whistled with the floats in their unbalanced position. He also talked and whistled while causing the floats to oscillate to various positions in the tube, sometimes
unbalanced in one direction and again in the other. He continued his experiment with the remark that he would "try another 'permutation'" and beginning with maximum unbalance in pressure, he whistled while the floats, swung to the opposite position, were held there for a few seconds, then swung back again; repeating this several times; ending the experiment with, "How do you like that, Dudley?" The analysis of this experiment of Walter's is most interesting: each time that the water column and its floats oscillated it swung through the full range that is to be expected in a liquid pendulum of this type; i.e., each swing was of slightly less amplitude than the previous one; and each time that the pendulum came to rest it settled back only a very little, remained at rest for a few seconds, and then repeated the operation in the opposite phase. The exactitude with which this liquid pendulum was controlled was very remarkable and indicated an accurate and intelligent control of the orifice in the end of the armored tube or a similar control of the open end of the glass tube, 5 feet above the floor.

Just before Walter started this last experiment, and while he was apparently applying pressure and suction alternately to the free end of the flexible tube, he asked Hope to put his hand over the open leg of the U-tube. Hope did so and reported a strong suction as his palm closed the end of the tube. All of these operations were performed while Margery's mouth and hands were reported under continuous control. As an additional variant, Walter told Margery to repeat the alphabet while the floats were at maximum unbalance. She reached the letter "G" and they remained unbalanced. This test was made while her hands were reported as controlled.

These experiments were carried out in a sitting that lasted only 65 minutes.

The séance of the following evening involved post-séance tests and levitations, the latter under somewhat less rigid control but, nevertheless, of considerable interest. The basket with the three luminous bands on the handle was swung about above the table through a range of more than three feet, horizontally, and about eighteen inches vertically, with great speed and in such closed curves as to produce an effect which may be described as imitating a swarm of crazy fireflies, if one can imagine such a thing!

The sitting of October 6th was held in Crandon's absence from the room, and was reported by J. H. Brown. Hope controlled at the left and Dr. Brown at the right. Following the presentation by Hope of two number slips, in darkness, which
Walter promised to cognize and communicate to him at some other sitting with a different medium, there were telekinetic phenomena as follows:

The xylophone was played while all hands in the circle were reported as accounted for, and under similar control the basket, with the doughnut suspended on the handle by Walter, was levitated and circled about above the joined hands of the group.

The sittings of October 1st, 4th and 11th were for the purpose of giving Walter an opportunity to make phonograph records of his voice, and were held in a local recording studio. The results were very interesting and showed that Walter had a remarkable grasp of the technique of recording the voice. The writer’s purpose in suggesting this experiment revolved about the idea that more should be learned about the independent voice in relation to microphonic reproduction and the possible application of this knowledge to future experiments of a more ambitious nature. It was obvious that Walter should be given an opportunity to acquaint himself with the apparatus and its limitations. This, he seems to have done very quickly, even to the point of adjusting the microphone to the best position to pick up the piano accompaniment to his whistling.

On October 12th, a group of the officials of the National Spiritualists Association were present, together with several other prominent members of the organization, and three unaffiliated visitors.

Post-séance tests were carried out as previously described, and, as the after-séance results showed, with complete success. They included five numbers (chosen at random), and two pieces torn from magazines. These were followed by levitations of the basket (under bi-lateral double control; Crandon and Dudley being the normal controllers) and doughnut; these, in turn, were succeeded by rapping with a twenty-five cent piece. As Walter finished with this operation he said, "Dudley, you have the quarter." The latter had felt what he supposed was a slight movement of the Psychic’s little finger on the palm of his hand but no sensation such as the coin might be supposed to produce; hence, denied its possession. Walter insisted that Dudley had the coin and the latter, after attempting to locate
it in his hand (without releasing control) was still unable to feel it and denied its presence. Walter again asserted that Dudley had it, and at this point the presence of the coin began to be noticeable. It had been placed, very gently, over the hypothenar eminence, and was at approximately the temperature of the skin. Subsequent experiment showed that the sensory nerves in this area are less responsive than almost anywhere else on the palmar surface, but even so, difficulty was experienced in placing such a coin on this spot without producing a distinct and readily identifiable sensation. Walter seemed to be enjoying his little joke.

The scales were engineered by Dudley after Wheeler had loaded them 4:1. The VCO test was controlled by Wheeler, and was marked by clear, loud whistling and clear talking. Mrs. Grover (a teacher of voice culture) stated that Walter’s whistling was of most unusual quality.

The only other sittings held in 1929 that involved important telekinetic phenomena were three held in England on December 6th, 7th and 8th, 1929. They were held at the rooms of the British S.P.R., 31 Tavistock Square, London.

The last sitting on December 8th was largely confined to the making of thumbprints and will not be discussed here. The record of the sitting of December 6th, however, is given in full and that of the 7th, except the portion that relates to fingerprint experiments.

**REPORT OF SITTING WITH “MARGERY”**

(MRS. L. R. G. CRANDON)

Friday, 6th December, 1929

8:30 to 11 P.M.

(Held at the offices of the Psychical Research Society,
Tavistock Square, London)

**REPORT**

**CONDITIONS OF CONTROL**

(Lady Barrett dictating:) The medium was completely stripped, and carefully examined with a strong electric torch—the ears and nose, throat and larynx. She was then put into tights, and over that she is wearing a dressing gown, every bit of which
has been carefully examined, and she has not been near any other clothing, nor had an opportunity of touching anything else, because I have had her hands in my sight the whole time until she came in this (seance) room.

(Dr. Woolley dictating:) The medium’s wrists and ankles are attached to her chair by strips of surgeon’s plaster; in each case the strappings are marked with several blue pencil lines, the marks being carried over the edges on to the skin. The marks were made by Dr. Brown and Dr. Woolley. The medium’s body is attached to the chair at the shoulders in such a way as to prevent her from leaning forward for more than a few inches.

When the light is unscrewed, it is not possible that any white light can be switched on by mistake or by intention.

THE CIRCLE CONSISTS OF:

(Left) Dr. F. C. S. Schiller; Dr. J. V. Woolley; Dr. Wm. Brown, M.A., M.D.; Mrs. Hewat McKenzie; Miss Mercy Phillimore; Mr. Stanley de Brath, M.I.C.E.; Miss Hyde; Lady Barrett; Capt. E. M. Bennett, M.P.; Dr. L. R. G. Crandon; Lord Charles Hope; The Medium, “Margery.”

(Behind the circle, on the right) Mr. W. H. Salter; Major C. H. Mowbray.

(Outside the circle) Mrs. Brackenbury (to attend gramophone); Mrs. H. A. Hankey (recorder).

THE SEANCE (recorded at Dr. Crandon’s dictation):

Walter’s voice came within a few minutes. He was introduced to everybody, and whistled and talked. Gave a small verse concerning Lord Hope, and other members of the circle. (Attached.) An empty basket was passed round the circle from left to right, and anyone who chose, put in some object. Everyone had the opportunity to do that, except Dr. Crandon, for obvious reasons. In other words, the control was so maintained that he could not put anything in or take anything out.

The table can apparently be moved a few inches on the floor. Walter: “That was me.”

Several movements of the table.

Sound as of crinkling paper was heard in cabinet.

Walter: “We did not get so much out of this collection; not so much . . .

‘Did anyone put in some matches?’

Lord Charles Hope: “I did.”

Walter: “They are on the floor behind you.”

‘Somebody put in a pencil?’

Miss Hyde: “I did.”
It's over in the corner. Here's a box of cigarettes.

Mrs. McKenzie: "That's mine, Walter."

Walter: "Do you want me to tell you how many cigarettes are in it?"

Mrs. McKenzie: "Yes, if you are able."

Walter: "Do you know?"

Mrs. McKenzie: "I would know to one."

Walter: "I think there are three."

Mrs. McKenzie: "I think you are wrong."

Walter: "One—two—three—four then."

Mrs. McKenzie: "No; someone must have been smoking them, then."

Walter: "Four; there are four."

Mrs. McKenzie: "Oh, I believe four is right; I think there were seven originally."

(They are heard to fall on the table.)

Walter: "Here's another pencil."

Mr. de Brath: "I put a pencil in."

Walter: "It is at your feet, Major Mowbray."

Walter: "Here's a key."

Dr. Woolley: "I put in a key."

(A metal thing was heard to fall on the floor.)

Walter: "Near Dr. Schiller."

"Here's a bit of money. I should say, is it a sixpence?"

(Dr. Brown and Captain Bennett both say they put in sixpence.)

Walter: "I have them both. You can put them in the Church collection. Here's another key."

(It can be heard to be rapped on the table, and fall on the floor.)

Walter: "Here's a ring."

Miss Phillimore: "Yes, I put in a ring. Don't you lose it."

Walter: "I have put the ring away very carefully. I have put it in the medium's pocket. That's all right, isn't it?"

Walter: "Dr. Schiller, count the cigarettes."

Dr. Schiller: "One—two—three—four. Quite right."

Dr. Woolley asked the circle how much light anyone could see. Those on the medium's right could see the faint reflection of the red light by which the stenographer writes. It is generally agreed that one could not recognize anything by that light. (The faint red light is fixed under the paper upon which the stenographer writes.)

The table is heard to move. Walter resumes his whistling. Walter calls for the luminous ring called the "doughnut," for the luminous basket and for the xylophone. (Lord Charles Hope went out this afternoon and bought a toy xylophone.) Lord Charles Hope has now put the xylophone on the table and the hammers beside it.
Walter: "Now let's have a little excitement."
The xylophone hammers rolled off the table on to the floor, to Walter's disgust. Now he is trying to tell Hope where to find them.

At Walter's suggestion the red light is put on, and the hammers are found and put on the table again. Major Mowbray says the hammers were under the middle of the table, which is precisely where Walter said one of them was.

One note of the xylophone is heard.

Walter is heard playing on the xylophone in good time, as if by the hammers, with appropriate aria which he whistled. This playing lasts perhaps 40 to 50 seconds, and then a hammer is thrown on the head of Dr. Crandon, on the right, after which the other hammer is heard upon the xylophone.

Walter: "It is a pity; you wouldn't have recognized the young fellow." (This refers to John Richardson.)

There is a sound as of a coin being struck on the table, and Walter asks if there is a Scotchman in the group?

He hits the xylophone, and makes a coin-like noise at the same time, and asks which sounds the best to a Scotchman? He wants to know in case of an emergency.

Walter: "How are you feeling, Hope? I am going to scare you now."

Sound of something falling on the floor, as if the xylophone is fallen.

Walter: "Take it up and see what it is. It is the xylophone on the floor with some money."

"And it was there left."

Walter: "Yes, it is to the left of Hope and right of Schiller."

Walter: "We are all here, thank goodness." (Referring to his crowd of helpers.)

Walter suggested the luminous dough-nut was put on the table, and it was placed bright side down.

Dr. Woolley asks where the "dough-nut" is on the table, and Dr. Schiller replies, "Towards the medium's left."

Lord Charles Hope says that the "dough-nut" is moving about on the table.

Mrs. Brackenbury takes the dough-nut out of the room to make it a little brighter, and enters the room again with some of the luminous paint on her hands and frock.

Walter: "In other words, the lady's lit up."

The dough-nut having been brought in too bright, the S.P.R. banjo and tambourine are put on the table, with the luminous side face down. Shortly after, the little cymbals are heard to strike. The tambourine is seen moving about on the top of the table. A sound is heard.

Walter: "Is that not like a freak (?) thing?"
Half the circle see the tambourine rise off the table surface into a vertical position—Captain Bennett estimates about a foot up. Walter says his medium is slipping towards the edge of the chair, the cushion pushing her out, whereupon, under instructions from Walter, Mrs. Brackenbury removes the cushion.

Mrs. Brackenbury says that something touched her arm. The tambourine is vertical again.

The tambourine is now in the air moving back and forth, and accompanied by a whistle. It is now moving three or four feet in several directions, Walter whistling, thus showing that the tambourine could not be being moved by anything in the medium’s mouth.

Walter: “What are those other things over there?”
Dr. Woolley: “Bell and zither.”

Dr. Woolley is directed by Walter to put the bell on the table. He puts it on farthest edge of table nearest to Dr. Schiller, with the edge of the bell exactly on the rim of the table.

Major Mowbray says he sees something light between him and the bell. Walter asks how many people can see the bell? Virtually everyone can see it on a low table.

Walter requests that the table be pulled away from him a little, but then he says, no, he will do it himself. And it was so done. The bell rings violently and falls to the floor.

Walter now calls for the S.P.R. zither, which is put on the table at his request. It has three luminous stripes on it. Dr. Woolley describes where he has placed it—with the long edge coinciding with the far edge of the table.

Walter says the zither looks like a battleship.

Walter, now whistling, is accompanying his whistling with playing on the zither.

Three clear notes are struck on the zither.

The xylophone is put on the table to right of the medium. We now hear notes being struck on both the zither and the xylophone in imitation of a jazz band.

This continues like a crazy German band for about 40 seconds.

Walter: “This is so heavy to hold, but I am going to do it Woolley, if it takes a leg.”

Twice a noise is heard as if the zither has fallen on the table.

---

14 The nature and amplitude of the phenomena, as well as the accuracy of the actions described, may profitably be checked against the restrictions of the mechanical control and the nature of the search of the medium and her clothing, in the light of the statements of the reporters. This note applies with equal force at other points.

15 Which arm, and on what part of the arm? Where was the arm in relation to the Psychic at the time the touch was felt? What was the nature of the touch? It is not apparent that Mrs. Brackenbury reported in detail at the time, nor that she amplified this interesting statement in the S.P.R. Proceedings, Part 117, Vol. XXXIX.
from above. Dr. Schiller and Hope both report feeling a breeze at the same time.

The luminous dough-nut by Walter’s request is placed on the table, light side down.

Walter asks, “Can anyone see the dough-nut?” Several can see the faint edge.

Walter: “The dough-nut’s under my hand just now. The dough-nut is now moving back and forth about two feet, and is apparently able to be seen by everyone.

Walter was talking while this levitation was going on.

Walter: “I will do something rather interesting.”

The dough-nut is now flashed down to the level of the floor. Everybody says he can see it, and now it goes up to the level of the table. It is higher than the table. It is now coming down to the floor again, and now it comes back and forth, moving about like a crazy fire-fly; at the same time Walter whistles. He now repeats this same manoeuvre.

Walter: “Do you like it, Hope?”

Dr. Woolley says he sees dough-nut still in the air and on the medium’s right. Now it is over on the medium’s left, down to the floor behind Dr. Schiller, where all those in that vicinity can see it. Dr. Woolley now says he sees it behind Dr. Schiller, in the air. Major Mowbray also sees it.

The doughnut is now on the table.

The tambourine on the floor at the medium’s right is now heard to be played.

Walter now instructs Lord Hope to get on the floor and hold the medium’s feet, in addition to the strapping. While this is being done, Captain Bennett holds Dr. Crandon’s two hands and two knees.

At the same time the tambourine can be heard to be played, though the strict conditions of control previously described are observed. All this time the tambourine is on the floor behind the medium. Lord Hope confirms this position, that Walter has described.

Walter: “That’s enough for one night.”

Walter throws something and hits Dr. Crandon on the right ear. It is apparently the xylophone hammer. Lord Hope felt it bounce off Dr. Crandon’s left shoulder on to his right shoulder.

Walter now says that he must go, and asks that people should not use the room very much unless it is absolutely necessary. Dr. Woolley says he will keep it locked.

COMMENTS

Dr. Woolley says: The red light was turned up, and the medium’s wrists and ankles examined by electric torch. All the strapping and knots and marks were found intact, as they were at the beginning.
TELEKINESIS IN 1928 AND 1929

Mr. Salter: Mr. Salter having heard what Dr. Woolley has dictated, quite concurs.

Dr. Schiller: I also agree with what has been said, that the control is intact.

Dr. William Brown: I confirm the description of the state of control before and after the séance, as given by Dr. Woolley and Mr. Salter.

Captain E. M. Bennett, M.P.: I examined the fastening of the feet, hands, etc., before and after the séance, and am convinced that they were preserved intact throughout.

(Signed) F. C. S. SCHILLER
L. R. G. CRANDON
BARBARA MCKENZIE
M. MOWBRAY
FLORENCE E. BARRETT
MERCY PHILLIMORE
CHARLES M. HOPE
WILLIAM BROWN

For appending to original Report.

(Signed) STANLEY DE BARTH
MARGARET J. A. HYDE

The verse concerning Lord Charles Hope follows:

There was a young fellow called Hope
Who never took time off to mope.
He brought me a basket, though I didn’t ask it,
And now he will fill it, I hope.

NOTES OF SITTING

At 31 Tavistock Square, London, W.C., on Saturday, 7th December, 1929.

Medium, Mrs. Crandon.
Date, 7th December, 1929.
Time, 9:15 till 11:10 P.M.
Place, 31 Tavistock Square.
Notes, Miss W. A. Shafto.

9:15 Circle joined hands.

Order of sitters to left of medium—Dr. Schiller, Dr. Brown, Mrs. Brown, Mrs. de Crespigny, Mrs. Ashton Jonson, Mr. Ashton Jonson, Mr. Harry Price, Miss Phillimore, Lady Barrett, Captain Bennett, Lord Charles Hope, Dr. Crandon. On the couch, Dr. Woolley controlling the shoulders and arms of Dr. Crandon, beside Dr. Woolley on his right, Major Mowbray.

Mrs. Brackenbury attending the victrola.

Trance has come on.

Walter came through shortly with greetings for all the new comers and most of the old visitors. He says he isn’t going to give us anything tonight—we hope there is a twinkle in his eye.

Lady Barrett, will you testify by your word, as to the examination tonight?
Yes, I examined the medium thoroughly, as I did last night and found everything quite right about her. The control was precisely as last night, the surgeon's plaster holding the feet and ankles to the chair as before, and the pencil markings were made by Dr. Woolley and Mr. Price. Walter seemed to relent a little later and he then asked for the golden basket provided by Hope which was handed to Dr. Schiller and passed round. Each person who wanted to put in some personal object for the purpose of identification. The table was heard to move on the floor. Walter says: "Here is a cigarette case that seems to be as full as it can be"; whereupon it fell apparently on the table and then on the floor. Mr. Ashton Jonson said he put in a cigarette case which seemed to be quite full. Walter says: "We seem to have a number of them."

Walter, speaking, said: "This is like a subjective medium. Now, who would have a cigarette case which had about four cigarettes in it?" Miss Phillimore said it might be hers, whereupon it hit the table and opened and shut. Walter says: "This is very nice; someone put in a cigarette holder for me." Captain Bennett admitted he had done so, whereupon something was heard to hit the floor. Walter says: "We are having a nice time are we not, Woolley?" Here is a comb."

Mrs. William Brown said, "I put in a comb," whereupon something was heard to hit the floor. Here is an empty leather case. Mr. Price says, "Mine."

Walter adds: "I guess he took something out of it." Mr. Price, "Correct."

Walter says: "Pencil."

Dr. Woolley says, "Yes."

Walter says: "There it is, Woolley!" and something hit the floor. Walter says: "I don't know whether this is a thumb tack; it is a curious thing. It is like a nail with a big head." Hope says: "I did that; I killed Cock Robin." Walter says, "It isn't a nail, is it, Hope?"

Hope says, "Not quite." Walter feels for a time to see what it was, and said it might be damned, and threw it at Hope. Walter apologizes for the "damn." and adds two damn. Walter says: "Here is a curious pencil, a short pencil."

Dr. Woolley says, "That would apply to my pencil," whereupon Dr. Brown says, "I put in a pencil."

Walter speaking: "Here is a ring."
Mrs. Ashton Jonson says: "It is mine," whereupon Walter replies, "I will put in medium's pocket."

Here is a brooch.

Mrs. de Crespigney says: "It is mine," whereupon Walter adds, "What shall I do with that?" whereupon a sound was heard as if it twanged.

"Here is a key," and metal was heard to hit upon metal. Lady Barrett claimed the key as hers.

"I can make as much noise as that stenographer, listen": whereupon basket was heard to twang on the table.

"Here is a paper." A paper was heard crackling loudly. Walter speaking: "It is an envelope, not a piece of paper." Loud cracklings heard again.

"Music for a little while," Walter says. He says: "What is this? An envelope with nails in it or something, an envelope with beads in it or something."

Major Mowbray says: "It is mine."

Walter says: "It is on the table."

Dr. Woolley says, to Walter, "Is that the lot?" Dr. Woolley dictates: "From the time basket was on table Dr. Woolley had contact with Dr. Crandon's wrist with his own hand."

Major Mowbray: "When Walter said the envelope contained nails, it is right. They feel exactly like nails because they are mummy beads from Luxor, and they are exactly like nails."

Walter says that for these cognitions he works about a foot from the medium and the less he has to go from the medium the better. "It is my hand", he says, every time it is his hand.

Brilliant repartee between Hope and Walter.

(Here follows record as to finger-print experiments which is omitted.)

Walter orders a dim red light to let the medium out of her somnambulance.

Time 11:10 P.M.

Dr. Woolley says that when the medium came out of trance the adhesive tape and rope were examined and found to be intact, except that the tape on the right ankle appeared to have moved round about one-eighth of an inch from its original position.

Lady Barrett examined the medium after the sitting and found everything as before.

(Signed) F. C. S. Schiller
L. R. G. Crandon
Etanla Ashton Jonson
C. C. Ashton Jonson
M. Mowbray
Rose Chl. de Crespigny
Florence E. Barrett
Mercy Phillimore
William Brown
Charles M. Hope
Dr. Woolley and Mrs. Brackenbury attended all three sittings at London. They did not sign the notes and presumably the reason is the one that Woolley gave to Crandon and which is largely to the effect that he did not approve of notes dictated during the course of a sitting but that notes should be prepared later. As a matter of fact Dr. Woolley continued to make notes for a long period thereafter. He, however, did sign the following statement. The two corrections of the notes of the December 7th sitting can readily be located, although the paging above is different.

"31, Tavistock Sqr.

I have read through the typed notes of the Margery sittings held here on Dec. 6, 7 and 8, 1929, and am of the opinion that, subject to the following corrections, they are an accurate report of what was dictated by me and others to the note taker at those sittings.

7th Dec. p. 1. 1, 12, for 'medium' read Dr. Crandon.
    p. 5. 1, 6, for 'Walter' read Dr. Crandon.
8th Dec. p. 3. 1, 21, for 'right' read 'left.'
    p. 4. 1, 14, for 'divided' read 'provided.'
    p. 6. 1, 9, for 'and' read 'until' and
        1, 11, for 'strap' read 'strapping.'

(Signed) V. J. WOOLLEY.
CHAPTER LV
Photographic Experiments in 1927–8

Following the photographic work of 1925, no extensive program of this sort was attempted until late in 1927, although photographs were made on special occasions, such as that of July 28, 1927. The development of the visible teleplasmic cylinder during the séance of October 8th, and Walter’s statement that this could be photographed through a quartz lens but might not record through a glass lens was taken as an indication that he had perfected a certain degree of control over these structures.

Apparently Walter had produced the above phenomenon as a means of stimulating interest in a new photographic program, since he said, at the beginning of the séance of October 12th, that he was ready to present a series of phenomena in which the development of the psychic cylinder would be shown from the vapor form up to the point where it would be connected to the medium by a long, twisted (corkscrew-like) rod, and again stated that some of these structures would record only through the quartz lens.

From the very beginning of the photographic and observational records of the teleplasmic structures it seems apparent that Walter was endeavoring to demonstrate their genesis, evolution, and applications; e.g., teleplasm was shown in connection with the S-A bell-box, and a hint of it was seen in the experiments with Butler’s glass bell-box. Thread-like structures were shown as supports for objects and as means of actuating devices; the teleplasmic voice mechanism was seen in red light and was photographed; luminous teleplasm seen in the dark

---

1 See Chapters II, XV, XVI and XXIV; v. 1.
2 See page 653.
3 See page 663.
4 See photographs opposite pp. 476 and 480, M.M.
5 See pages 589–92.
6 See Chapter LII.
7 See Plates 16, 17, 18 and 19; v. 1.

699
was immediately displayed in the same form and location in red light and various psychic structures were seen to change form while silhouetted against a luminous background.

In the following records it will be seen that, while his announced goal was not reached, a considerable amount of interesting evidence was obtained; also, that success in this field, even when working with so expert a "control" as Walter, depends very largely upon continuity of effort.

Since the large charges of flash powder used in previous experiments caused unpleasant reactions in the Psychic, Kunz proposed to use a special method of developing plates which would permit of using very small amounts of powder without sacrificing essential details in the pictures. In preparation for the séance of October 12th three cameras were set up: two (a quartz lens, and a glass-lensed stereo) facing the cabinet, and a third camera with quartz lens at about 90° from the others. The following abstracts are from Dudley's records of these sittings, unless otherwise noted:

October 12, 1927. The scales were on the table, loaded 1:4, and after some conversation Walter gave Kunz three seconds to get ready for the first exposure, which was made with 1/8 teaspoonful of powder. Mrs. Litzelmann and Fife reported seeing a light-colored mass in the east pan. As soon as the plateholders had been changed Walter asked for a second flash; in the meantime the scale pans could be heard striking the base alternately. The flash-gun failed on several trials and another was used, which worked at the second attempt. Walter said that was enough for the present. Three plates were exposed the first time and two (those facing the cabinet) during the second flash.

After some experiments with the sistrum, the séance closed at 10:25 p.m., having continued since 9:10.

The picture, shown as Plate 46, is from one-half of the stereoscopic negative, and shows the west pan grounded, while in the east pan there is a glossy-white rod-like mass which appears

---

8 Referred to in connection with sitting of May 30, 1926; p. 473.
9 To which there are various references in connection with hand-like processes.
10 The sitters in order: Margery, Dr. Richardson, C. Ekland, F. Adler, C. Litzelmann, E. E. Dudley, Mrs. Litzelmann, J. W. Fife, Mrs. Richardson, Dr. Crandon.
11 Throughout the chapter the first number of the loading indicates the east pan of the scales, therefore the one at Margery's right.
PLATE 46. EXPOSURE A, OF OCTOBER 12, 1927, ONE HALF OF NEGATIVE MADE THROUGH GLASS-LENSED STEREOSCOPIC CAMERA AFTER THE FLASH-GUN HAD FAILED TO WORK SEVERAL TIMES. WHITE ROD-LIKE MASS COLLAPSED IN EAST PAN.
Plate 47. Exposure B, of October 12, 1927, made through quartz lens, showing hollow mass in east pan which, when magnified, looks like a miniature elephant's foot.
to have collapsed into the pan where it coiled and re-coiled on itself. A study of an enlarged photograph indicates that this structure was approximately 1/4 inch in diameter. The above picture was made through a glass lens, but the simultaneously exposed plates in the quartz-lensed cameras add nothing to our knowledge of this mass. The collapsed appearance of the mass may be directly related to the failure of the flash-gun, as noted in Walter’s comment at the next séance.

Plate 47 is from the negative made through the quartz lens facing the cabinet, and shows a curious hollow mass in the east pan, which, enlarged, bears a marked resemblance to a miniature elephant’s foot. This is reminiscent of one of Walter’s comments (at the séance of September 27, 1927) anent the appearance of one of his thumb prints, shown on the screen at the Paris Congress, that it “looked like an elephant’s hoof.” The plates used in the stereoscopic camera were not as rapid as they were supposed to be, and in this instance the negative lacks detail.

The next séance of this series was held on the 14th, and again two exposures were made as above, except that the red light was turned on before the second flashlight. As in the first sitting the flash-guns did not work well, and Walter said that since he ducked when he heard the first click we might not get anything (supernormal) on the plates. In the first picture the loading was 1:3 with the east pan grounded, and in the second the west or heavy pan was grounded, but no teleplasmic structures were recorded.

These frequent and irritating failures of the ignition apparatus stimulated some intensive experimental work leading to the development of a more reliable igniter. The writer made a hot-wire device in which a piece of “nicrome” wire was held in the bottom of a shallow asbestos trough in which the powder was placed, ignition being accomplished by closing the circuit to six dry cells in series-multiple.

Preparations were made for photographs on the 17th, but Walter said that he was collecting energy and refused to attempt any pictures, adding that he wanted another sitting on Wednes-
day, with the same group. As the séance neared its close he said, "Dudley, will you do something for me?" (D. "Yes.") "After the others have left, light the candle, put it on the table and leave it for ten minutes. No, don't put it on the table; put it in Sary's chair. Leave the red light burning." 13 Crandon: "Shall I turn it out in the morning?" Walter: "No, I'll take care of it." (The light was turned out supernormally some time during the night, according to Crandon.)

Prior to the sitting of the 19th, three flashlight photographs were taken in the book room, with Mrs. Stinson (age seventy-nine) and her sister, Mrs. Mary Gray (age eighty-nine), seated on the sofa in the corner in front of a casket of flowers, Margery being seated nearby. There was no light in the room for about five minutes after the camera (quartz lens) had been focussed, then Walter's voice, apparently coming from behind the sofa, said, "Shoot." Two pictures were taken under these conditions, and a third with one of the mantel lights turned on, after which the party (with the exception of Mrs. Stinson and Mrs. Gray) proceeded to the séance room.

The séance began at 9:05 P.M., Margery going into trance promptly. 14 Walter said that he had tried to show himself in the pictures just taken, and if we could see him at all it would be in the basket of roses 15 above and behind the heads of his mother and his aunt.

The same arrangement of cameras was used as before, and the same scales, loaded 1:4. The electric igniter (used in the pre-séance experiments) was used again, the charge of flash powder now reduced to the point where those who were not actually facing the flash could keep their eyes open without discomfort. Three exposures were made, the red light being turned on before each of them, but none of the sitters saw any supernormal structures

13 Earlier records of flashlight photography show that Walter often requested that red light be left burning, but this seems to be first time that he asked for a candle light in addition.
14 The sitters, in order: Margery, Richardson, Litzelmann, Dudley, Mrs. Richardson, and Crandon. Outside, in same order: Judge Gray, Kunz, Mrs. Mink, Mrs. Gray.
15 There are many references in spiritistic literature to the appearance of faces or forms in relation to flowers or plants. Doubtless many of these were illusory; nevertheless, the protoplasm of organic matter may furnish some of the energy needed in such manifestations.
Plate 48. Exposure B, of October 19, 1927, made through a glass lens, showing translucent cylinder embedded in white mass in east pan, and capped by a similar mass. Two other masses are attached to the east suspender; while a smaller one is seen on the angular part of the other suspender. Simultaneous quartz lens pictures confirm the presence and size of these structures.
Plate 49. Exposure C, of October 19th, also made through a glass lens. The translucent cylinder leans to the west, its cap attached to the suspender, and several smaller masses strung along the suspender rods.
in the scale pans, although Walter asked the question after each flash-light. Just before he asked for the third flash he said, "The place is just dripping with the Judge's (Judge Gray) ectoplasm. I milked him last night." (The latter said, earlier in the evening, that never in his life had he felt so tired as he did after the sitting of the previous evening.) Following the third exposure Walter announced "that was a d—— good picture," and asked if anyone had seen anything in the scale pans. Upon being assured that no one had he added, "You shouldn't have."

The sitting closed at 9:45 p.m. with Walter's request that we leave the red light on again.

The picture reproduced herewith (Plate 48) is the second taken this evening, and shows a white mass in the east pan, out of which projects a translucent cylinder which is capped with another white, opaque mass of the same sort. The camera located at the side of the cabinet proves that this cylinder leans slightly forward. The heavy pan is grounded in each case.

The third and last picture discloses this same structure, now ending in a conical cap and leaning toward the west suspender rod, to which it is attached; other masses of white material are also attached to this rod. (See Plate 49.)

The first of the three pictures showed a mass in the east pan but as the negative is not clear this is not reproduced.

If these structures had been as visible to the normal eye as was that of October 8th, it would seem as though they should have been seen during the red-light interval or when the flashlight occurred, since the charges of flash powder were small enough to permit of such observations; however, nothing was seen by the sitters; therefore it is reasonable to assume that the masses did not reflect light within the visible range. (Glass lenses will record a limited range of vibrations in the ultra-violet.)

While the new igniter gave much better results than the flash-guns previously used, it had an irregular time lag due to a non-uniform contact of the powder with the hot wire, so it

---

16 Walter often says that he has "milked" some sitter of his or her energy (but does not say so in their presence, as a rule), and not infrequently such sitters have said that they felt very tired after a sitting without, apparently, suspecting the alleged cause.
was reconstructed before the next séance and thereafter worked perfectly. 17

Following a general séance on the 24th, another photographic séance was held on October 28th, 18 at which this new igniter was used.

The séance began at 9:15 P.M., Margery going into trance promptly. The apparatus was arranged as before. The phonograph slowed down and Walter ordered someone to "get to — out of that!" The speed increased a bit, then decreased again, bringing another explosive remark from Walter, and another increase in speed. After this had happened three times one of the sitters said: "Do you know, it seems to me that the phonograph has slowed down considerably." Walter: "Ha, Ha, where have you been for the last five minutes? Do you think you will come to this séance? That's all we have been talking about for some time. You'd better cable for your mind"!

When Walter was complimented on the last pictures he replied that they were merely experiments, and he hadn't got well started; then, a few moments later, drew our attention to a luminous mass on the scales, saying, "You are not on to your jobs. That's Mr. Harrison. 19 He's a fine man, a great man; I helped myself to him. I have been very busy this last week. You know, distance doesn't make any difference to this stuff." After some further comments he suddenly told Kunz to shoot as soon as the red light was turned on, then, a moment later, told Crandon to turn it on. The flash went off less than half a second after the light came on, and Walter spoke immediately afterwards, saying, "That was pretty quick. I don't know whether I got out of the way. Maybe you caught me that time." The Psychic showed no reaction to the flash, and Walter seemed able to talk more quickly following the use of these reduced charges of powder. No one had seen any supernormal structures in the scale pan during the brief flash.

Before the next experiment the scale pans could be heard striking the base alternately, and finally Walter said, "Turn on the red light and shoot in two seconds." The east (light) pan

17 The writer arranged fixed and movable electrodes in the bottom of an asbestos trough, and connected these to the 110-volt lighting circuit through a series resistance which limited the current to approximately 21/2 amperes. Numerous tests with small charges of powder proved that these would always ignite completely and almost instantly when the lever was pulled down and released.

18 The sitters were: Margery, Richardson, Litzelmann, Mrs. Litzelmann, Dudley, Mrs. Richardson and Crandon. Outside, in same order: Mr. G. Bell, Mr. Sawin, Kunz and F. B. Bond.

19 Present at the séance of the 24th. Walter added that he got a great deal of energy from a young lady who had been present. The latter was exceedingly fatigued after the séance.
was seen to be slightly lower than the other pan but nothing supernormal was seen before or during the flash. Crandon stated that the scales were loaded 1:4, but Walter corrected him: "I took out the checker in the east pan, that made it a 0:4 load." (Confirmed in the photographs.) Kunz had further trouble with one of his plateholders, then found that the locking pin had been turned, although he was careful to leave them free during experiments. Walter seemed to be enjoying the situation hugely; said he: "I am going to put a bee in Kunz's bonnet; make him absolutely crazy; I am going to get his goat." He was working on the scales at the time, and just then the east suspender frame fell to the floor with a loud clatter, but the pan did not fall. Dudley picked up the frame and was fitting it in place on the beam, using both hands, when Walter said, "Dudley, here's the pan," and placed the edge of it under the former's left thumb as accurately as though it had been done by someone who could see perfectly. When asked where it had been he replied, "I held on to it when the frame fell." With the scales again in commission he asked Kunz to pass the plateholder that would not open to Richardson, and have the locked side uppermost; then asked the latter to hold it horizontally. Richardson reported a pressure on top of the holder, at the same time describing a column of light (seen by the other sitters) as coming down on the holder. A few moments later Walter asked for red light and the flash two seconds later. In the red-light period the scales were unbalanced toward the east or light pan but no structures were seen in the pan, as the sitters agreed, while Walter stated that they should not have seen anything. He refused to allow any more pictures this evening.

A luminous column moved about in front of the cabinet, near the scales, and while not very bright was exceedingly active. At times it diminished in height until it was only a small mass on the scale pan (apparently), then developed into a column about three feet high and three inches in diameter. When this disappeared Walter asked for the luminous doughnut and levitated it freely and over a wide range above the table.

None of the photographs of this evening show any supernormal structures in or about the scale pans. The first picture shows the pans loaded 1:4, and the heavy pan grounded. In the second, the single weight has been removed from the east pan, and both suspenders have been unhooked from the beam, the pans standing free on the base, while the last exposure discloses the same loading, the pans again suspended on the beam (see record), and the empty pan grounded. In this pic-
ture, Richardson is shown holding the plate holder in his left hand. Two of the plates which were not normally exposed carry extras in the form of a silhouette resembling the head of a man wearing a short beard. The same shadow is found in the center of one of the negatives exposed behind a quartz lens; while one of the stereoscopic negatives had been fogged over slightly more than one-half its length, as though the slide had been drawn that far. Kunz had brought these plates on the 24th but they were not used, so he left them in the dark room on the next floor; consequently these curious shadow-graphs lack evidential value. This was the first and last time that he left any plates in the house or out of his control, except as noted in the record.

Preparations were made for photographs on November 12th, but Walter said that none would be taken. On the 21st, however, the scales were again in use and the cameras set up. Kunz put two plate holders on the table, in case Walter wished to experiment with them.

The sitting began at 9:15 p.m., and Walter came through after a slight delay, Margery being in trance as usual. The first part of the sitting was given over to conversation, mostly by Walter; finally he said, "Kunz, there is no hurry but how soon will you be ready to shoot?" Kunz: "I shall be ready in about two minutes after you give the word." Walter: "Dudley, I want you to get up when the red light goes on and pick up the scales, turn round with your back to the Psychic, and when I give the word Kunz will shoot." Dudley: "But that will bring the scales too far forward; they will be out of focus." Walter: "Well, wait a minute, there is no hurry. You get up and stand behind the table, in front of the Psychic, and pick them up. All right now, get up." As he said this, the red light (mantel) was turned on by Crandon, and Margery, chair and all, were moved back from the table as though she had pushed herself backward automatically. Dudley passed in front of Richardson and picked up the scales on their platform, at Walter’s suggestion, placing the plateholders in Margery’s lap. He noted that the latter’s...
hands were controlled by Richardson and Crandon, but as he lifted the scales, which were balancing kinetically with a 1:4 load, he heard Walter’s voice as though just behind his right shoulder, saying, “I shall be right behind you Dudley,” and the remark was emphasized by three or four sharp raps between the shoulder blades, as though with the tips of the fingers. Walter gave the order to “shoot”; the exposure was made but no one saw any super-normal structures in connection with the scales, which continued to balance kinetically, although Dudley was careful to hold them so that no spurious vibrations would be imparted to them.

As soon as the flash was completed the scales were replaced on the table, then the plateholders, and Dudley resumed his seat. He is confident that Margery’s hands were under continuous tactual control during this whole operation. Walter then permitted the visitors a view of the scales, still balancing, under the green flashlight, after which he told Kunz he did not know whether there was any ectoplasm on the suspender rods23 or not, as he had been experimenting and couldn’t tell whether he had been successful, but if he had not he would try again and keep on trying until he got results. When Dudley suggested the possibility that his head might not show in the picture, Walter replied, “Fine, then we’ll have a male, headless ghost holding up the scales!” He then told Kunz to take back his plateholders and bring them Wednesday. Kunz having previously announced that he was not going to leave any plates in the room except those he had put on the table, Walter added, “I can work on any that I want and you have nothing to say about it.”

Following some further conversation on various matters, the sitting closed at 10:20 p.m.

Both sets of pictures showed the scales in balance with a 1:4 load, and no signs of extraneous structures.

At the next séance, that of November 23rd,24 the same equipment was used as in the foregoing report, and again Walter asked Dudley to pick up the scales, telling Crandon to turn on the red light. As soon as the former had the scales well off the table Walter gave the order to “shoot.” Dudley resumed his seat, Kunz changed plateholders, and Walter said, “Dudley, pick up my scales again.” As the latter took his position to lift the scales he was rapped sharply on the back, in the lumbar region, and a moment later Walter again asked for the flash. Following this exposure (the red light having been turned out) Walter said, “This picture is going to be a whiz; it will make you woozy; the scales are all covered with ectoplasm.” However, nothing of this description

23 See Note 16.
24 The sitters, in order: Margery, Richardson, Litzelmann, Miss Laura Crandon, Mrs. Litzelmann, Dudley, Mrs. Richardson and Crandon. Kunz, outside.
was seen by the sitters during either the red-light intervals or when the flash went off, while the pans continued in kinetic balance under a normal 0:5 load,25 as shown in the photograph (Plate 51.) herewith.

After the flashlight Walter continued to fuss with the scales until Crandon asked what he was doing, to which the former replied, rather tartly: "Minding my own business! You think I am trying to convince these people like S—- that I am a dis­
carnate personality, but I'm not. I don't care what they think about me. I don't want to convince them of anything. I am not experimenting for their benefit but for my own; I am doing laboratory work for those on my side."

In closing the sitting at 10:30 P.M., he said: "I want to leave a dim red light on; don't turn on any white light for awhile, and don't turn on the overhead light (red), don't touch anything on the table, file out of here without banging around the room, leave the chairs just as they are, and sit in the same places on Friday."

The first photograph shows the pans loaded 1:4, a larger white mass in the east pan and other masses attached to the suspender rods. In the second picture the load has been changed to 0:5, there is much less material in the east pan, while the miniature "elephant's foot" is poised on the beam, with other masses at various points.

The photographs show that some very curious structures were present on the east pan and on the beam, although the sitters observed nothing unusual during the flashlight exposure. The fact that they saw and correctly described other masses at other séances in the series indicates that these should have been noted if they had been visible. The pictures reproduced as Plates 50 and 51, were taken with the glass-lensed stereo-camera, but those taken with the quartz lenses are exactly comparable except as to the differences due to the angle of view.

Another picture was taken on November 25th, 1927, with Richardson holding up the scales as above, and Crandon's notes state that the former's coat was strongly pulled as he stood in front of the Psychic. The picture shows that Margery was controlled by Crandon and Litzelmann during the exposure,

25 The change in the loading seems to have been made by Walter.
PLATE 50. EXPOSURE A, OF NOVEMBER 21, 1927, MADE THROUGH A GLASS LENS.
NOTE THE SIZE AND DISTRIBUTION OF THE SUBSTANCE IN THE EAST PAN, AND THE SMALLER MASSES 'CLIMBING UP' THE SUSPENDER RODS.
Plate 51. Exposure B, of November 21st, also made through a glass lens. Only fragments of the substance remain in the pan, the suspender rods are more liberally decorated, the 'elephant's foot' of October 12th is poised on the beam, with a smaller mass nearer the pivot.
PLATE 52. DIAGRAM OF ROOM.
PHOTOGRAPHIC EXPERIMENTS IN 1927–8 709

which, however, disclosed no supernormal structure to account for the normal balancing of the scales under a 1:4 loading.

The next sitting in this group took place on November 30th, while Crandon was out of the country, the controllers being Richardson and Fife.26 When the sitting began Dudley had the seat at the Psychic’s right, but as soon as Walter came through he asked the former if he was going to lift the scales, and when Dudley expressed a willingness to do so, suggested that he change places with Fife, saying, “I don’t want too much moving about when I am ready for the photograph.”

The sitting began at 9:05 p.m., and just as Walter finished the above remarks, the phonograph stopped with a click, whereupon Walter said, “John, get out of that.” Dudley stepped back to the instrument, opened the cover, and found the brake thrown to the “stop” position, although he had thrown it off just a moment before when starting the instrument, and no one else had been near it. No normal external connection existed to account for this stoppage, and Dudley is as positive as he can be without having actually dismantled the phonograph at the time, that the stoppage was not of normal origin.27

The scales were on the table, loaded 1:4, and shortly after Walter manifested they oscillated through a wide range, continuing to do so, from time to time, as he talked to D. Brewer Eddy. Then he said, “Come around here, Dudley, and lift up the scales.” The latter passed round the west end of the table, as before, (Margery’s hands having been under continuous control as reported by Richardson and Fife), Fife turned on the red light, and as Dudley leaned forward to pick up the scales platform there was a powerful tug at the back of his coat which nearly caused him to sit down in the Psychic’s lap. With the scales lifted nearly 12 inches, the flash was set off at Walter’s command, and as Dudley returned to his chair Fife turned off the light, while Walter remarked, “That’s a good picture.” Several of the sitters

26 The sitters in their final order were: Margery, Richardson, Mrs. Litzelmann, Litzelmann, Mrs. Richardson, Dudley and Fife. Outside: Kunz, Mrs. Fife and D. Brewer Eddy.

27 The phonograph in the séance room frequently slows down in an abnormal manner but rarely stops altogether unless the electric switch controlling the motor is intentionally operated. In this instance the combined brake and switch inside the closed case was operated. Reference to the diagram of the room (Plate 52) will show the position of the instrument with relation to the cabinet.

28 The writer took the position of control on the assumption that it would be easier to pass behind the table from that side but Walter asked that he enter from the west side. On the basis that the structures are supernormally connected to the psychic this connection would appear to have been made at her right.
had their eyes open but no one saw any teleplasm on the pans. They did see that they were balanced (kinetically).

The experiment was repeated, but this time Mrs. Litzelmann, Mrs. Fife, Eddy and Litzelmann all stated that they saw a white mass in the east (light) pan. Mrs. Richardson said that her eyes were closed, while Richardson was not in the most favorable position to see this pan. Walter had said that he was going to have some psychic fleas chasing themselves along the beam, and after the exposure he announced that it was a fine picture. He closed the séance at 10:10 P.M., with the admonition to put on the red light, go out quietly and leave the light on.

The first exposure through the glass lens shows a large white mass in the east pan, and the scales balanced with a normal 1:4 load, as shown in Plate 53. A smaller section of the simultaneous exposure through the quartz-lensed camera at the southwest is shown as Plate 54. This camera was closer to the table; hence, depending on the size of the half-tone, the mass may differ in size from that in the other picture, but there is no measurable difference in the amount of detail recorded as between glass and quartz lenses.

In the second picture, Plate 55, the scales are unbalanced toward the east side, (they were balancing kinetically) there is a smaller mass slightly separated from the large one in the pan, and others attached to the suspender rods and at various places along the beam, much as was described by Walter during the séance, and confirming the observations of the sitters as to the presence of something in the east pan. For purposes of comparison, the picture taken through the southwest camera is also presented, (Plate 56) but, as in the first exposure, the quartz lens merely gives a different view of the same masses of white substance. (So rapidly did the flash-gun work that the writer’s lips were caught in the act of repeating Walter’s order to “shoot!”)

When Dudley changed places with Fife at the beginning of the sitting he transferred control of the Psychic’s right hand to the latter, who stated that he maintained this control until the lights were turned on at the close of the séance. Richardson states that his control was continuous.
Plate 53. Exposure A, of November 30, 1927, made through glass lens. The mass in the east pan is reminiscent of the one shown in exposure A, of October 12th.
Plate 55. Exposure B, of November 30, 1927, made through a glass lens. The mass shown in Plate 53 has changed in form, and, apparently, parts of it are now attached to the suspender rods; while more of it is draped along the beam from which it hangs as though it were plastic.
Plate 56. A part of the picture made through the quartz-lensed camera, and simultaneously with Plate 55. (The quartz lenses were not stopped down far enough to make perfectly sharp pictures, since it seemed desirable to use the smallest permissible charges of flash powder.)
The next séance at which photographs were made was on January 9th, following five sittings of a more general nature. Three cameras were used as before, but one of those facing the cabinet had been fitted with a high-speed quartz lens which gave much better definition than the simple meniscus lens that had been in use.

The séance began at 9:15 P.M., and when Walter came in he said, "It took you long enough to get settled." He spoke of some of his difficulties in carrying out the post-séance test of January 4th, and his method of remote control of the medium, after which he discussed various other matters, then said, "Kunz, are you ready to shoot?" Receiving an affirmative reply he ordered the red light and the flash. The sitters saw nothing in the scale pans (other than the 1:4 load), and Walter said that he was not sure that he got anything (visible) as he had "to get into the harness again." (Kunz had devised a card holder which would indicate, in the picture, the date and order of its taking, and this was attached to the front edge of the table; i.e., farthest from Margery.) Before the second exposure, Walter said, "Here, Chief (to Richardson), hold this and don't say anything about it." Richardson said that something had been placed under his right thumb, and it felt like Kunz's card holder. Walter said that that was just what he didn't want him to tell; asked for another flash, and again said that he was not sure he had succeeded in making his structures visible.

As Kunz was changing plate holders he asked Walter if he touched him on the right arm. Walter: "Sure, I nudged you. Why didn't you speak of it before?" Kunz: "I was touched on the head and on the back (also)." (This occurred while he was sitting in the circle, at Dudley's right, and next to Richardson who controlled Margery's left hand.) Walter said he would do no more pictures this evening. Dudley felt of the card holder and found that the card numbered "1" had been removed from the grooved holder, and, later, that this was the card which Richardson held.

Neither of the pictures disclosed any supernormal structures; both showed the scales loaded 1:4, and the light pan grounded.

Three sittings intervened before the next photographs were taken, and on January 27th two cameras were set up, facing the cabinet: the stereo camera with glass lenses and the high-speed quartz lens camera, both mounted on a camera board on the larger tripod, so as to bring them close together.
After considerable discussion about various matters not connected with this program, Walter refused to attempt the scales, and was not at all enthusiastic at the suggestion that he levitate the doughnut while a picture was being taken. Finally, he told Kunz to set off the flash two seconds after the red light was turned on, and this was done, with the result that the doughnut (on the table) became very brightly illuminated. Crandon reached over and turned it upside down, much to Walter's disgust, who said: "What did you do that for? You busted my teleplasm all to —! You wrecked the whole structure... I had a spiral built up and it wasn't one spiral but several, one going to each sitter. Perhaps you won't be able to see all of them but you may see a part of them. It is very interesting."

Crandon reported that he felt teleplasm on his fingers, as did Mrs. Richardson and Mrs. Pearson, by contact with Crandon's hand, and Walter insisted that they must rub it off on the table. They tried to do so, but with little success, although Walter insisted that he must get all of it back, otherwise "the Kid might have the pip." (Crandon states that the mass on the table was below room temperature, and felt sticky, like vaseline.)

Another flashlight was tried, and Walter said that it would show teleplasm but his structures were all shot to pieces, then again requested the three sitters to scrape off some more teleplasm, which they tried to do. This was followed by the sound of something rubbing over the surface of the table, said by Walter to be his terminal with which he was collecting the teleplasm. After some further conversation the sitting closed at 10:30 p.m., length 1 hour 25 minutes.

The first picture presents a collapsed spiral, while the second, displays this in a very different form, almost as though it were alive.

Other photographs were taken on January 28th, April 19th and June 3rd, 1928, but none of them recorded the presence of any supernormal structures. The scales were present only at the sitting of the 28th.

With the exception of the incident recorded in connection with the séance of October 28th and that of November 21st, Kunz had control of the plates from the time they were purchased until they had been developed and printed. He testifies that these processes were all carried out in the usual manner; i.e., without any special manipulation other than the use of a developer especially compounded to bring out the detail in the
negatives. The plates which gave the best results were Ilford Iso-Zenith (700, H & D), using 6.5 grains of flash powder at a distance of 7–8 feet from the table. Recent improvements in plate manufacture and in photographic equipment for this purpose show that it is possible to get fully timed negatives with much less than one-half the amount of powder that was used in these tests.

Throughout these experiments the physical condition of the scales was constant: the brass rider was always locked in the same position, but the loading of the pans was changed from time to time, presumably by Walter since no normal changes were known to have been made. It will be remembered that the average weight of the wooden disks (checkers) is approximately 1/5 oz.; hence, the normal unbalancing effects can be readily computed. These effects, however, are by no means in accordance with expectations; since the added structures sometimes appear to balance the normal load, and at others to have no apparent effect. In some instances (described but not illustrated) the scales were in balance or unbalanced toward the light side in the absence of any visible balancing structure.

In those experiments in which red light was turned on before the flash there was continuous illumination until the completion of the exposure; hence, the sitters were enabled to observe the condition of the apparatus throughout the critical period.29 In each instance the photographs have been exactly related to the séance in which they were taken, and as to the order of their taking, by Kunz and the writer. The various simultaneous exposures through the quartz and glass lenses have been examined for possible differences in the size and contour of the structures,30 but without disclosing any such variations; yet some of the largest and best defined masses recorded by the cameras were not seen at all by the sitters.

29 The writer found it difficult to keep his eyes open when facing the flash-light; therefore, did not attempt to record his impressions of the appearance of the structures on the scales at the séance of November 30th. The cross-light from the mantel light also interfered with accurate observation.

30 A somewhat more critical test than that cited in M. M., p. 362, in that two quartz lenses were used at that time, according to the records.
It follows that if such differences actually exist there should come a time, in a series of exposures, when the quartz lens will register more of a structure than the glass lens, assuming that the differences in visibility are a function of the amount of ultra-violet light that is reflected. Walter makes it plain that his ability to produce such results depends on the coöperation of the sitters, and that the flash must be set off at the exact instant that he orders it. He has stated that with the smaller charges of flash powder the structures do not break down so completely and it is possible to take more pictures in one sitting. This seems to be confirmed, in a sense, by the fact that the psychic showed practically no physical reaction to the smaller flash powder charges; while the larger ones often produced considerable shock.

Even though the results of these experiments do not measure up to Walter’s expectations, they have furnished some very interesting and instructive pictures which indicate that photography may play an important part in future investigations of the physical characteristics of the teleplasmic substance.
CHAPTER LVI

In Chapter XXXI (Volume 1, pages 365–389), some account is given of the effort of the Society in 1926 to procure an impartial and adequate investigation and report of the Margery mediumship by persons of recognized academic standing, and of the failure that attended the enterprise. The persons selected were Dr. H. C. McComas, sometime Associate Professor of Psychology at Princeton University, Dr. Knight Dunlap, Professor of Experimental Psychology at the Johns Hopkins University, and Professor R. W. Wood of the Department of Physics of Johns Hopkins University.

The convention or agreement between Dr. Crandon and the Commission of Inquiry, dated January 27, 1926, under which the work was to proceed is printed in Volume 1 on pages 370–372. After the terms of that convention had been negotiated and agreed upon by all the interested parties a copy of it was formally transmitted to the Commission with a letter which set forth the terms of the agreement with the Society whose representatives the commissioners were to be. That letter is an important part of the documentary history of the matter, and is as follows:

American Society for Psychical Research, Inc.
Fifteen Lexington Avenue, New York
January 25th, 1926.

Gentlemen:

Dr. L. R. G. Crandon, of Boston, has agreed to submit the mediumship of Mrs. Crandon to scientific examination under certain stipulations which are embodied in a "Convention," a copy of which is submitted herewith.

The American Society for Psychical Research desires to have such an examination undertaken for the purpose of ascertaining what phenomena occur and the conditions under which they occur. It is thought that instrumental or mechanical means might be devised or adapted for automatically recording and measuring the
phenomena in various ways. The Society is prepared to defray the expenses of such a study, including traveling expenses of the Commission to and from Boston, personal living expenses while in Boston, a per diem of $25 to each member of the Commission while actually engaged in the study of the mediumship and preparing a report thereon, and the reasonable cost of securing appropriate instruments and apparatus desired by the Commission in its work. It will probably be found desirable to employ or otherwise associate with the work in hand, competent technical assistants. The Society will be glad upon the suggestion of the Commission to employ or authorize the Commission to employ such assistants where their voluntary services cannot be obtained.

The Commission will be entirely free to pursue its study of the case in its own way without interference by the Society. Copies of the narrative or observational notes of the sittings shall be furnished the Society from time to time, as well as copies of photographs taken. The Commission shall render to the Society within a reasonable time a full and complete report of all of its observations and findings for publication in its "Journal," "Proceedings," or otherwise.

Believing that you are entirely free to undertake this study and to publish your observations and findings, and that you can approach the work without bias or preconceived opinions upon the subject that might prevent a full, fair and complete presentation of the facts, the Society hereby invites you to accept membership on the Commission. If in the course of your study of the case you should desire to add other members to the Commission, the Society will be glad to cooperate with you to that end.

Respectfully yours,

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR PSYCHICAL RESEARCH.
By J. R. Gordon,
Vice-President.

To:
Dr. H. C. McComas,
Dr. R. W. Wood,
Dr. Knight Dunlap.

Nothing specific or definite was known by the officers and trustees of the Society about the gentlemen who were thus to undertake for it a responsible piece of scientific work, other than their general reputation and standing in the academic world. In the fall of 1925 the Society had addressed a general letter to many universities and colleges in an effort to find a competent expert to undertake research work for the Society. The most promising and definite reply came from Dr. Dunlap
who strongly recommended Dr. McComas, stating that he was on leave from Princeton for the current half year. This letter led to a conference with Dr. McComas who eagerly accepted the opportunity to become a paid representative of the Society and organize a Committee to undertake a study of the Margery case. He in turn urged the engagement of Professor Dunlap as the best man for the work, and of Professor Wood as an expert in problems of light and photography who might successfully develop apparatus to take a continuous photographic record of the séance room action.

The proposed personnel of the Committee seemed excellent and execution of the convention with Dr. Crandon and the formal employment of the three professors by the Society soon followed.

The Society's belief in the impartiality of the men thus employed is indicated in the closing paragraph of the letter of January 25th, and frankness on the part of the professors in dealing with the Society about the matter was assumed. Subsequent development and discoveries, however, indicate that in the case of at least one of the members of the Commission caveat emptor would have been a safer rule to follow.

In 1920 Professor Dunlap published a volume entitled "Mysticism, Freudianism and Scientific Psychology" (C. V. Mosby Co., St. Louis) in the preface of which, he contended that philosophic mysticism, Freudianism and Spiritualism (the alleged phenomena of which constitute a large part of the field with which psychical research societies are concerned), constitute a real unity and "involve an assault on the very life of the biological sciences, which scientific psychology alone is capable of warding off." He proclaimed that it is "the duty of the psychologist to enlighten the public concerning the real nature of this siren trinity." The book itself dealt more particularly with mysticism and Freudianism and the author stated that because Spiritualism "is more open and undisguised in its antagonism to science" it could be allowed to wait for a later volume, in which the Professor would deal it a death blow.

In 1925 Professor Dunlap published another volume entitled
"Old and New Viewpoints in Psychology" (C. V. Mosby Co., St. Louis) which contained an essay on "Psychological Factors in Spiritualism." This essay proceeds on the assumption, which is claimed by the author to be a demonstrated fact, that psychic phenomena are the product always of conscious trickery and sleight of hand on the part of the operator, and that all witnesses, including some of the great and illustrious men of science, who have reached a different conclusion (not being psychologists) were and are incompetent in the subject, victims of mal-observation, self-delusion, and emotional bias. He describes the student of psychical research in this flowing, if not wholly original, rhetoric:

"But your true devotee is the man or woman of failing faculties, and decreasing energies, who sees approaching inevitably the time when the golden bowl shall be broken, and the silver cord loosed; when the wheel shall be broken at the fountain and the pitcher at the cistern; when the almond tree shall blossom and the grasshopper become a burden; when the sound of the grinding shall be low, and those that look out of windows be darkened; and when at last the mourners shall go about the streets. Such a one, seeing that dread day surely approaching, when that life which was so wonderful in youth, and which even now is so dear, is about to be snuffed out like the flame of the spent candle, and lacking the secure confidence of traditional religious belief, grasps frantically at even the poor pitiful straw of psychic research, and shuts his eyes to its futility and insufficiency." (Page 103-4.)

On page 108 the Professor announced his own conviction and opinion in the matter of psychical phenomena thus:

"Slate writings, trumpet messages, spirit photographs, mysterious rappings, are all fraudulent, as are all alleged physical effects without normal physical causes. If a medium claims that something is written on a slate without normal human agency, or articles moved about, or bells rung, without human or mechanical agency; or that voices or other sounds heard by sitters are produced by other than living human beings; she is a fraud and nothing she produces is to be taken as other than deliberate fraud."

It may be that despite these and similar expressions of convinced and long held opinions published by the learned professor, he could still as a "scientific psychologist" pursue an
impartial study of the Margery case and make a full, fair and complete presentation of the facts: and such may have been his own opinion of his ability to suppress the ordinary tendencies of human nature and his justification for the non-disclosure of his published views to the Society. Few persons, however, would concede the existence of such a unique faculty even in a professor of psychology, and the event proved that he was as frail as other persons.

Professor F. C. S. Schiller of Oxford University, one of the most eminent scholars of the day, has long been an interested student of psychic phenomena. To persons like Dr. Dunlap his interest and pursuit of the subject would be evidence of declining powers or of the existence of a blind-spot in his general intelligence; yet he may be accepted as one reasonably familiar by personal association and the contacts of a lifetime with the type of mind and temperament developed in the academic professor.

In 1905 in the first number of The Occult Review, Professor Schiller published a paper in which he discussed how "the process of reducing the 'occult' to hum-drum 'science'" could be forwarded. His formula was, in some way, to make it a commercial success because then only could the prejudice against it be removed and money for prosecuting its study be obtained. Continuing Professor Schiller said:

"It is necessary to convert both the masses and the professors. Of these the former are indifferent, the latter prejudiced as well. Now nothing, and least of all a miracle, will convert a professor who has once committed himself in print." 1

Unknown to representatives of the Society, Dr. Dunlap had committed himself in print to a settled and definitively stated belief that all alleged supernormal psychic phenomena are fraudulent and produced by conscious and practiced deceit. According to Professor Schiller's dictum nothing could bring about a recantation of that theory, and the object of the Society

in appointing and financing the Commission was, so far as Dr. Dunlap was concerned at least, foredoomed to defeat.

Crandon’s objections to Dunlap on the score of his previously published belief, discovered by him after the first sitting, were immediately communicated to the Society, but did not lead him to withdraw from the convention. The disruption of the Commission’s work before it had barely started came after and because of the events of the third official sitting. Crandon’s objection to the qualification of Dr. Dunlap as an impartial judge, however, among other things, led to the subsequent refusal to submit the case to Dunlap for further study.

As recorded in Chapter XXXI the Commission attended a preliminary sitting on January 26th and held official sittings on January 27th, 28th and 30th. The Commission’s own record of the sittings on the 27th and 30th is printed in Volume 1 on pages 372 to 375, and pages 378 to 383, while Crandon’s record of the intermediate sitting is printed on pages 376–377. The Commission’s own record of the sitting on January 28th is as follows:

**January 28, 1926.**

**Sitting at 10 Lime St., Boston, Mass.**

**Time,** 9:08 P.M.

**Present:** Clockwise—Margery, Dr. Wood, Dr. McComas, Dr. Crandon, Dr. Dunlap, Margery.

**Dictating Time**

Dr. McComas: 9:15

*Psyche restless, slight groans, and Dr. Crandon states this is evidence of trance.*

Dr. Dunlap: 9:26

*Just before Dr. McComas spoke, Psyche slid Dr. Dunlap’s hand from her fingers to her wrist.*

Dr. Wood: 9:31

*Psyche’s left foot is on my knee.*

Dr. Dunlap: 9:35

*Psyche gave me her fingers.*

Dr. McComas: 9:35

*Psyche’s head came forward and rests on corner of table near the bell box.*

Dr. McComas: 9:36

*Both of Psyche’s feet are on the floor now.*

Dr. McComas: 9:31

*Psyche straightened out and is restless in her chair with her head apparently on back of chair.*

Dr. McComas: 9:35

*Psyche’s left foot is on Dr. Wood’s knee and her right foot is on floor near her chair.*
Dr. McComas: 9:41 Music stopped.
Dr. Dunlap: 9:42 Dr. Dunlap is controlling wrist.
Dr. Dunlap: 9:43 Dr. Dunlap is now controlling hand.
Dr. Dunlap: 9:50 Psyche's right hand* is in her lap.

Dr. Dunlap: 9:51 Psyche's hand is out again.
Dr. Dunlap: 9:54 Both Psyche's ankles are over by Dr. Dunlap, on the floor.
Dr. McComas: 9:56 Walter asked for illuminated plaque and Dr. Crandon went to get it.
Dr. McComas: 9:58 Dr. Crandon has just returned from the other room with the luminous cardboard plaque, has taken his seat and placed the bell box on the floor according to instructions from Walter.

Dr. McComas: 10:08 Dr. Wood suggested that the plaque was becoming dim so Dr. Crandon took it into the other room to replenish it.

Dr. McComas: 10:09 Dr. Crandon has just returned bringing plaque very much brightened. He placed plaque on the table and then placed two handkerchiefs over it.

Dr. McComas: 10:14 Walter says he has some teleplasm; it is as far as the edge of the table.
Dr. McComas: 10:15 Dr. Dunlap at this point located both of Psyche's feet, with his right hand, under the table.

Dr. Dunlap: 10:19 Psyche pushed* something on to the table* threw with her right hand.

Dr. McComas: 10:23 Dr. McComas now sitting apparently opposite Psyche; dark body appears on plaque having crossed the first cross line east and west and next to Psyche. Both Psychic's feet are under the table.

Dr. Dunlap: 10:30 Teleplasm seems to have disappeared.
Dr. Dunlap: 10:36 Teleplasm reappears.
Dr. Dunlap: 10:38 Teleplasm again appears over at third line. Teleplasm gone back.

Dr. Dunlap: 10:40 Feet both there.
Dr. Dunlap: 10:41 Both feet are down and the teleplasm is still out there.

Dr. Dunlap: 10:43 Teleplasm disappeared from my view.

* Word canceled in original and the word underneath in italics substituted.
Dr. McComas: 10:56 Walter says that he will try and give us visible teleplasm tomorrow night.

10:59 Sitting ended.

Psyché was inspected before and after sitting by stenographer, according to her statement.

The word 'teleplasm' as used by me means only that the silhouette of something appeared.

Knight Dunlap.

(Signed) Knight Dunlap (8:20 p.m., Jan. 30)

H. C. McComas 2/2/26

R. W. Wood

Crandon's record of the sitting on January 27th, prepared on the following morning, is as follows:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, January 27, 1926. At 9:08 p.m. This is the first official sitting of the Commission of Inquiry of the American S.P.R.

Present to left: Dr. R. W. Wood, Dr. Knight Dunlap, Dr. C., Dr. H. C. McComas and Psyché. The sitting was a lashed sitting in the Richardson glass cabinet. All lashings were made by the Commissioners and were found to be as made at the end of the sitting. In addition to this, during practically all periods of active phenomena, Drs. Wood and McComas had tactual control of hands and some of the time of the feet of the Psychic.

Walter came through within five seconds, was cheery and agreed to try to speak loud enough for all the sitters to hear. He was able to make good on this most of the time.

He now called for the big wooden letters 'while he was getting up steam.' He then proceeded to throw out, identifying as he did so, four letters with one mistake only, mistaking a four for a K. He then had Dr. D., with a luminous doughnut in his palm, put his hand on the shelf in front of Psyché and Walter thereupon deposited a letter on the palm and identified it as he did so. He then repeated this successfully.

The luminous basket was now put into the cabinet and the door was closed and Dr. McComas was instructed to reach through the front hole and lift the basket to that level. He did so and the basket was taken from his hand after various pulls, levitated all about and then dropped. This experiment was repeated, the levitation lasting much longer and the basket was finally thrust over

2 This note and the corrections indicated in the report were made holographically by Dr. Dunlap.
to the east back corner of the cabinet over Psyche's head. Dr. Mc. was then told to go in after it between the Psychic's chair and the east wall of the cabinet and so did with great difficulty. While he was in this position Walter levitated the three-pound luminous megaphone and beat Dr. Mc. on the head and back with it. The basket experiment was repeated again. This time taken from the hand of Dr. D. after several strong pulls and thrown over to the west back corner of cabinet with Drs. Wood and McComas in touch with Psyche's hands and Dr. Dunlap controlling the hands, feet and head of Dr. C.; the megaphone was levitated, kicked and pushed round in the area just in front of the cabinet over a period of many seconds. Dr. Wood held the luminous doughnut in the front of cabinet and Walter took it from him and levitated it all about beautifully as high as five feet above the floor and also to east and west. Dr. W. was then told to put the luminous doughnut on top of his head and he did so, sitting in front of the Psychic. Walter then levitated the luminous megaphone and hit Dr. W's head several times in an effort to "extinguish him" by putting the megaphone on the top of his head. The levitation and the contacts were successful, the extinguishment was not. The megaphone thrown with great force on the floor.

Walter talked several times in half red light and spoke to Dr. McComas when he was within the cabinet cutting free the Psychic's head at the end of the sitting.

Sitting closed at 10:59 P.M.

At the close of the sitting on January 30th Margery became ill and further sittings with the Commission were suspended. In view of the question that has been raised both as to the fact of such illness, the time of its onset, and the accuracy of the Commission's report as printed in Volume 1, there is offered here a photographic reproduction of the last page of the official report dictated at the time, signed by McComas and Dunlap on February 3, and by Wood sometime later, the exact date not being recorded. Before the stenographer's transcript was accepted by the Commission as accurate it was carefully examined and verbal and typographical corrections made by the commissioners in their several handwritings. It is to be noted particularly that correction was made in the spelling of the word "nausea," indicating clearly that this sentence was not accidentally or unwittingly included in the record, and that the facts it records were not carelessly certified to by the commissioners.
January 30, 1926.

The stenographer (Miss Barbero) examined and found the Psychic unwell before the sitting and found her still unwell after the sitting.

There was nausea and vomiting of the Psychic after the sitting.

Sitting closed at 11:33 P.M.

H. C. McComas 2/8/26

A further document written by Dr. Crandon on the morning of January 31, 1926, and immediately mailed to the Chairman of the Research Committee of the Society, must be added to complete the contemporary record of the events of the sitting of January 30th. It was as follows:

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, January 30, 1926, about 9:10 P.M. Sitting in the old open cabinet. To left Dr. Wood, Dr. McComas, Dr. C., Dr. Dunlap and Psyche.

Shortly after the sitting began Dr. McComas took the left control, changing seats with Dr. Wood. Miss Barbero acted as stenographer with a dim red light. While Doctors Wood and Dunlap were controlling, following some idea of their own, they forced Psyche’s knees together and their respective hands were in contact, thus short circuiting the Psychic out of the circle. After about half an hour the Psychic called attention to the method of control and that she was not in the circle practically and added that she could stand it as long as they could. Thereupon this arrangement was broken up. Dr. McComas took Dr. Wood’s place and then each controller had a hand and a foot in his possession. The Psychic had also a luminous band on each wrist and ankle and had a luminous marker on her forehead.

For about an hour and twenty minutes nothing happened, though the Psychic said she frequently felt herself going apparently into trance but that the attention necessary by her to keep her feet on top of her controller’s feet kept her from going to sleep.

Trance finally came on and then for about three-quarters of an hour all three observers kept reporting contacts of their hands
with a cold, rigid rod-like body, covered with a soft envelope. Dr. Wood with obvious intent described it as "like a stick covered with leather." The mass was felt on the Psychic's thighs and was felt by Dr. McComas on his hands and cheek. It was felt by Dr. Wood by his right hand and he said, "I gave it a good hard pinch, but it seemed to do no harm." (This is declared by Dr. Crandon to be an improper act because at the end of the evening before Psyche could leave the room she vomited on the floor and suffered from nausea all night). Dr. Dunlap was touched on hand and fingers and was allowed to feel at least nine inches of the rod-like teleplasmic structure. Under instructions he put his nose in the luminous doughnut on the table and was touched by this rod on back of neck and hair. During all these manifestations Doctors Wood and Dunlap controlled Dr. C's hands and were in contact with his knees and most all the time Dr. Wood's hand was held by Dr. C. against Dr. C's mouth.

The luminous doughnut was now put on the table and the rod-like structure could be seen in silhouette across it. After a while the doughnut was levitated, whereupon Dr. Wood dictated, "The doughnut was levitated and there was corresponding movement of the Psychic's head." Thereafter the doughnut stayed in the air levitating all about in many planes and in figure of "8." No dictation concerning this came voluntarily from Dr. Wood after his last remark until Dr. C. said, "Gentlemen, the last dictation gave an unfair impression. This doughnut has now been in levitation all about in all directions several continuous minutes with no corresponding movement of the head of the Psychic." Thereupon, Dr. Wood dictated these facts into the record and did not speak again during the evening.

The control of both Psyche and Dr. C. being continuous and just what the sitters wanted, the constant contact with the teleplasmic rod and the levitation accomplished constituted a very brilliant performance.

Sitting closed at 11:33 P.M.

There was printed in Volume I, on page 383, a letter from Crandon dated January 27th written after the first unofficial sitting. After the first official sitting, on January 27th, Crandon wrote the following to Walton under date of January 28th, which is printed also as part of the contemporaneous record:

"The first official sitting went off 100 per cent excellent. Your commissioners are poor at dictating records but no doubt will improve. Walter has agreed to try to speak loud enough for them to hear. They all took luncheon with McDougall yesterday but nevertheless seemed to enjoy Lime Street."
On January 29th McComas made an informal report to Button as follows (the italics being editorial):

"The Commissioners all arrived safely for the meeting last Tuesday night. We met a number of old friends of the family and had a very informal meeting. Nothing of exceptional interest occurred. We met again on Wednesday evening and all three of your commissioners were very much interested in the matters taken up. Last night we met again but nothing of any importance occurred.

We have not yet decided upon what quarters we should take. Indeed it seemed at one time as though one of the commissioners thought that our work might be through so soon that it would not be advisable to obtain quarters.

I am enclosing you a copy of the minutes of the meeting of Wednesday evening. No minutes were taken for the meeting of Tuesday night. The minutes of last night are not yet available.

In general, everything is going along nicely and pleasantly—about as we had anticipated. We are hoping for some interesting developments in the near future."

The commissioners, it may be explained, had been authorized in their discretion to obtain permanent quarters in Boston for their work. From the McComas report of January 29th it would seem that an unidentified member, obviously either Wood or Dunlap, had become convinced after two official sittings that the problems of the mediumship would be solved out of hand and after a brief examination. Whether this indicates the influence of a preconceived and published opinion that all physical phenomena of mediumship are fraudulent, or mere self-confidence in an ability to solve quickly problems that many others had found baffling and intricate, may be debatable; but in any event a hope or willingness to arrive at a quick conclusion of fraud is clearly demonstrated, because if the phenomena proved unexplainable on grounds of fraud a protracted study was obviously inevitable, and permanent quarters indispensable.

The séance of January 30th, with Margery sitting in the open cabinet was apparently a difficult one for all concerned. Trance did not come on or phenomena occur for one hour and twenty minutes. The sitters were the three commissioners and Crandon. The Commission's record\(^3\) discloses that Margery

was restless and frequently complained of distress and pain. McComas reported Walter’s point of view at 10:20 in these words:

“'I never saw such a bunch of stiffs in all my life. Talk about dead people; my God!'”

But at 10:30 a teleplasmic structure appeared and slapped McComas’s hand; then Dunlap’s; then McComas and Dunlap again; and then waved the luminous doughnut. At 10:41 Margery moved Dunlap’s hand into contact with “a cold, smooth cylindrical something”; then McComas’s hand was similarly brought into contact with the object and he held it between his thumb and forefinger. At 10:50 Wood recorded that something touched his finger; and at 10:53 Wood dictated as follows:

“'Wood: 10:53—My hand was on the table holding the luminous doughnut, teleplasmic rod fell in the palm of my hand, feeling like a rigid rod covered with soft leather. It was placed between my thumb and finger which were holding the doughnut. I squeezed it very hard, which produced no ill-effect. The rod then slipped through the doughnut and raised it in the air.’”

The sitting terminated an hour later and the official record closed with the following statement:

“'There was nausea and vomiting of the Psychic after the sitting.’”

Crandon’s record, made the following morning and printed above, contains this statement:

“'It (the teleplasmic rod) was felt by Dr. Wood by his right hand and he said ‘I gave it a good hard pinch, but it seemed to do no harm. (This is declared by Dr. Crandon to be an improper act because at the end of the evening before Psyche could leave the room she vomited on the floor and suffered from nausea all night).’”

Paragraph 5 of the convention provided as follows:

“'No psychic structure shall be touched or interfered with in any way and no light of any hue shall be turned on during the sitting except with the consent of the control (Walter). If either of the conditions of this paragraph is broken, the whole investigation shall cease at once and the episode shall be considered an admission that the Commissioners have broken their word as gentlemen and scientists.’”

---

The official record and Crandon’s record of the conduct of Wood in doing violence to the teleplasmic structure are irrefutable evidence that he had broken his covenanted word with calculated disregard of the consequences to the medium.

The paragraph of the convention quoted above was inserted to protect the psychic against just such abuse of privilege and the injury to the medium that it was feared and believed might follow thereon.

It is arguable in extenuation that Wood thought the teleplasmic structure was a fraudulent mechanism and that he was taking the quickest method to demonstrate his theory by treating it as such. But such prejudgment of the facts at the very least was inconsistent with the terms of his employment by the Society. He had no evidence of fraud on which to base such an opinion because under paragraph 6 of the convention any fraud or suggestion of fraud was required to be made part of the official record, and the record contains none. It seems clear that Wood, like Dunlap, considered the whole case a fraudulent imposition; that such opinion antedated his employment by the Society to undertake a serious piece of investigation upon academic and professional responsibility; that the existence of such bias was not disclosed to the Society, and therefore the whole enterprise was vitiated from the beginning, not only as to the Society, but as to the Crandons as well.

Such was the position of Crandon, who advised the Society that under no conditions would he ever allow Wood to enter his house again. His objections to Dunlap, less emphatic and based on other grounds than applied to Wood, in the end came to the same conclusion.

Negotiations, mainly with McComas, who was Chairman of the Commission, were carried on after this sitting, to recast the personnel of the Commission and continue the interrupted effort. Margery in the meantime was seriously ill for two weeks or more, and the facts were fully reported to McComas.

5 Unless, indeed, Wood’s use of the simile “like a rigid rod covered with soft leather” in describing the feeling of the teleplasm can be considered a claim of fraud.
On February 1, 1925, McComas, writing from Baltimore, reported to Button as follows:

"Dunlap, Wood and I had a meeting this morning and discussed the general situation. I was pleased to find that Dr. Wood is very much interested in the case, despite his disparaging remarks after the close of the last sitting. He tells me that he is so busy that he will not be able to go with us each trip to Boston. He wishes to suggest experiments for us to try and to come to the sittings when he is able. I think this a very excellent plan, and we will work along this line for the present."

This report from the Chairman of the Commission confirms the conclusion that Wood was from the beginning disqualified by a prejudgment of fraud. That he was still interested in the case two days after the last sitting was so surprising a fact to McComas in view of Wood's comments, that it had to be particularly reported. McComas was anxious to continue with Wood on the commission, however, because of his reputed skill in matters of photography, and on February 16 addressed the following letter of entreaty and exhortation to his recalcitrant colleague. That the letter advises taking an attitude of impartiality and suspended judgment, while perhaps not a perfect counsel of corporate hypocrisy, at least makes clear that McComas knew that Wood's mind was no longer open.

109 Broadmead,
Princeton, N. J.,
February 16, 1926.

My Dear Professor Wood:

I have just returned from a conference with Mr. Button and Mr. Walton. Mr. Walton was in Boston last Sunday and saw the Crandons. Mrs. Crandon has been ill in bed for the last two weeks. Mr. Walton says that she still looks very badly and has great difficulty in retaining her food. It looks like a sort of nervous breakdown. However, Mr. Walton believes that she will probably be able to go on with the sittings a week from this coming Friday.

In a very frank discussion of the whole situation it appeared that both Mr. Button and Mr. Walton are convinced that the Crandons are anxious to have the investigation continue, and are very sorry for this necessary delay. I think I know how you feel toward the whole situation. It seems to me that we owe a really good and thorough-going job to these gentlemen in New York. They are interested to have us tell them just how these individual phenomena
occur. Whatever may produce them I feel that it is up to us to explain them [in] detail. In other words I do not think we would be handling the matter acceptably if we rendered a report based on any scanty evidence. The program therefore, is this: When Mrs. Crandon is able to sit again we shall obtain our own quarters, and endeavor to take up one thing at a time. The bell box is the first thing on the program. We shall tackle it and stay with it until we are satisfied.

It is evident to me that if we are going to get ahead we must all take the attitude that we are sympathetically studying phenomena which may be genuine. To take a too critical attitude naturally arouses resentment, and that will not help us in any direction.

Please write me fully just how you feel about the whole proposition, and let me have any suggestions that may occur to you.

Very sincerely yours,

H. C. McComas.

The following exchange of letters with Crandon further indicate the efforts being made to save the inquiry and the reasons for its collapse.

Dr. L. R. G. Crandon,
366 Commonwealth Avenue,
Boston, Massachusetts.

Dear Dr. Crandon:

I had hoped to be able to come to Boston this weekend for a further conference with you, but I find that I am unable to do so, and am therefore making this brief report.

Mr. Button and I had a long conference with Dr. McComas in New York on Tuesday, and went over with him very carefully all of the points which have been raised in connection with the investigation, and as a result of our conference we are both strongly of the opinion that the future course of the investigation will prove to be satisfactory.

We have arranged with Dr. McComas to have the Commission stop over in New York for a conference with us before proceeding to Boston to resume the study. In the meantime Dr. McComas will take up with the others the various points which we discussed with him and he feels very confident that the Commission will appreciate the force of the comments which we made and adjust the future conduct of the investigation accordingly.

Dr. McComas was deeply concerned over Mrs. Crandon's health, and you will undoubtedly receive from him an expression of his sympathy and warm hope for an early recovery.

1 This letter apparently remained unanswered. See infra, page 734.
The Commission is hoping to resume the study on the 26th. Mr. Button and I are very anxious that there should be no interruption in the program as outlined.

Sincerely yours,
(Signed) Daniel Day Walton.

10 Lime Street,
Boston, Mass.,
Feb. 26, 1926.

Mr. Daniel Day Walton,
Trustee and Counsel, Am.S.P.R.,
New York.

Dear Mr. Walton:

I thank you for your letter of Feb. 18, 1926.

I clearly perceive the advantages to psychic science of going on with the Commission of Enquiry lately organized by the Society. We appreciate the liberal and sympathetic attitude of the Trustees of the Society towards the Margery mediumship. I believe that the plan of enquiry cannot be improved and that it will yield results which all must accept as valid. I agree with you entirely that this mediumship presents to the American Society a privilege, not only, but also a duty.

Three sittings have now taken place with the new Commission. Certain episodes of these sittings exemplify what constantly turns up in the accomplishment of big jobs, namely, that the plan is good but the personnel bad. The specifications in this instance are:

1. Before any official sitting had occurred, reservation and protest was made by me against two members of the Commission on the ground of their relative deafness. In my opinion, the mechanical proof of the independence of the control's whispered voice from the mouth of the psychic is the keystone of the mediumship. Such independence is proved apparently by Dr. Richardson's "voice-machine"; but the deafness of the two Commissioners shuts them out from this demonstration. A typical séance presents a proved independent voice which promises a physical phenomenon. This phenomenon now appears under conditions of control agreed to in advance as being perfect. The camera then records what the eye has seen. The conclusions from such a sequence of events must be far-reaching in a well-trained mind. A man misses much of this sequence when he is deaf.

2. I find one Commissioner, in a work published in 1925, committed to disbelief in the reality of psychic phenomena. (Quotations can be furnished.) This disqualifies a judge for this inquiry.

3. One Commissioner constantly exhibited indifference and contempt for psychic study in general and for this instance in particular. This Commissioner violated paragraph 5 of the Convention of agreement. Speaking of a "psychic rod" he dictated "I
squeezed it very hard and it did no harm.'" At the end of the sitting, the psychic vomited on the floor. This had never happened before. Catamenia came at once, and out of time, and persisted 17 days. The psychic lost 19 lbs. was in bed four days and is still far from well. In our total of over 400 sittings, with over 500 different sitters, no such assault has been made before.

4. The conduct and qualifications of the remaining commissioner are beyond criticism.

In view of these specifications, I respectfully submit that, as the chief contracting party, as the next friend of the medium, as her husband, as an experienced student of the phenomena under investigation, and lastly as a physician, it is my plain duty to exclude the first two commissioners, herein before referred to, from participation in future sittings, that may be arranged when Margery's health shall have sufficiently improved to permit resumption of the investigation.

Sincerely yours,
L. R. G. CRANDON.

On March 15, 1925, Crandon wrote Walton as follows:

"You will be interested to know that Wood broke his contract in another respect besides injuring the teleplasm. His innocent looking red light, which I allowed to be substituted for our red light, had a special screen invented by Wood so although it appeared to be dim red, ultra violet light was streaming though. Walter said 'The room is flooded with light.' And, on looking around, the stenographer and I discovered that wherever any object in our séance room had any of Geley's luminescent paint on it it had now become vitalized. The light was not on during phenomena but its periodic presence in the séance room made Walter fearful of sending out long rods. It was only used the first night.

Don't give up so wonderful a plan. The right men for it can be found."

Toward the end of March McComas inquired as to the possibility of reviving the commission. On April 3rd he sent Crandon a generous and whole-hearted expression of sympathy and regret over Margery's illness and sought for an opportunity to discuss a resumption of the sittings. This led to correspondence which must be incorporated into the record, omitting only such passages as deal with entirely irrelevant matters. The letters and telegrams follow:
April 20, 1926.

Dear Dr. McComas:

Thank you for your kind letter of April 3rd.

* * * * * * *

Dr. Wood's trickiness is discouraging. You will remember that when he turned on his harmless-looking red lamp Walter immediately said, "The room is flooded with light." This shows that Walter has a kind of eye that we have not, since we could see no light but the red. How much nearer the conduct of a gentleman, if Dr. Wood had told us what he was up to. Our attitude is just as purely scientific as his.

As to giving the "terminal a good hard pinch" this apparently was the cause of the immediate nausea of the psychic and also of uterine hemorrhage which went on for nineteen days with the loss of twenty pounds. She has never flowed over four days before in her life. The discouraging feature of this is that it should be done by an academic man of repute. When you think that we have had over six hundred sitters of every class in society, and that this man, Wood, is the first one to break his given word, are we not forced to turn to the common people for intelligent understanding, even as Jesus did?

The plan of the American S.P.R. is as good as it ever was. We shall deal no more, however, with a group of investigators. You (for whom we have great affection) and one or two others may sit, but only under strict control of our friends, with orders to deal roughly with anyone again who breaks his agreement. We have about come to this state of mind: you with not over two others are quite welcome to come and see the bell-box phenomenon ad nauseam. You may then build one of your own and try the same experiments. Then you may, if you choose, write about the bell-box after you have learned all that can be learned about it.

When this experiment is put away, exhausted and labeled, then we will proceed to another phenomenon. To give a big show is to give you psychic indigestion.

With renewed assurances of my esteem,

Sincerely yours,

L. R. G. CRANDON, M.D.

109 Broadmead,
Princeton, N. J.,
April 23, 1926.

Dear Dr. Crandon:

I was very much pleased to get your letter of April 20th, and to learn of your kindly feeling toward me and willingness to go ahead with our investigation.

Dr. Wood's conduct is a matter of keen regret to me. His association with the Harvard men seemed to give him an attitude
which he certainly did not have when I first invited him to join the committee. His attitude toward the committee was about as inconsiderate as his attitude toward you. We could not get hold of him for conferences or to make plans. He came late to the sittings and left in haste to catch his bus. I constantly hoped that he would change his attitude and make some contributions to the investigation through his profound knowledge of photography. Since our last sitting I have written him twice and have received no replies. I shall make no further effort to have him cooperate with us in any way. Inasmuch as I was responsible for inviting Dr. Wood into the committee I want to apologize for his conduct, both at the sittings and when enjoying your hospitality. Doctor, I am really very much chagrined and mortified. Some of the things that occurred annoyed me greatly, but I felt the wisest policy was to ignore them.

I have Dr. Wood’s red lamp shade with the ultra violet screen in it. I would be glad to send it on to you and have you experiment with it if you care to do so. It may have great possibilities in photography.

What do you think of this plan? Dr. Buford Johnson is a professor at the Hopkins University. A very capable and well-known psychologist, and also a very charming lady. I should like to have her and Dr. Dunlap for our further investigations with bell-box and pressure box. I am sure that both you and Mrs. Crandon would like her. If this is agreeable to you let me know and I will write her and also the Society and see what plans we can make.

With kindest regards to Mrs. Crandon and yourself.

Very sincerely yours,

H. C. McComas.

April 29, 1926.

Dear Dr. McComas:

Please be thinking over the fact that we believe that Dr. Dunlap is unfitted to hold a judicial position with regard to the "Margery" mediumship.

Although we frankly and specifically at this moment are out only to establish, with regard to your Commission, the reality of the physical phenomena, one of the hypotheses which must be considered, of course, is a spiritualistic one. Dr. Dunlap, in his book published in 1925, speaks with discouraging bluntness of "This Blight of Spiritualism." A superior court judge who had thus expressed himself on a case would not be allowed to sit.

We shall be very glad to have Dr. Dunlap take part in the study of certain standardized physical manifestations like the bell-box and balances, but we strongly doubt that he will be able to
judge fairly when he comes to the phenomena which have a subjective content.

Sincerely,

L. R. G. CRANDON, M.D.

May 2, 1926.

Dr. L. R. G. Crandon,
10 Lime St.,
Boston, Mass.

Letter just received. Will be glad to talk the matter over with you when I see you. Please wire me at once if we can have our sittings next Friday, Saturday and Sunday. I should let Doctor Dunlap and Dr. Johnson know right away. With best regards.

H. C. McCOMAS.

May 2, 1926.

Dr. H. C. McComas,
Princeton, N. J.

You are welcome May 7, 8, and possibly 9. Don't bring the others this time.

L. R. G. CRANDON.

5 P.M., May 2, 1926.

Dr. L. R. G. Crandon,
10 Lime St.,
Boston, Mass.

For me to come alone would embarrass Committee. May we not all come?

H. C. McCOMAS.

6 P.M., May 2, 1926.

Dr. H. C. McComas,
Princeton, N. J.

Dunlap not agreeable to us at present. Must know qualifications of any new members, and must confer with Walton about each one before accepting.

L. R. G. CRANDON.

May 3, 1926.

Dear Dr. Crandon:

I received your wire last night and was very much surprised to learn that you did not wish Professor Dunlap to come to the sittings at present. I can see why you would object to Dr. Wood but I am quite unable to see anything in Dr. Dunlap's attitude to which anyone could take exception. I know of no one who would approach the problems in a fairer and more scientific way than he does.

I have phoned to Mr. Button and he concurs with me, in the
opinion that if Dr. Dunlap is to be discriminated against, the work of the commission must be abandoned.

If you will think the whole matter over I believe you will agree with me that Dr. Dunlap is an exceedingly valuable man and the fact that he has published his view concerning spiritualism is all the more reason why you should convince him of the error of his ways. Indeed, he is quite as open-minded as I am and I am sure that if you permitted him to carry on a scientific investigation and he became convinced that he was wrong in what he has published he would be perfectly willing to say so.

I am willing to live up to the letter and the spirit of our convention, and have done so; but it is not possible to conduct a scientific investigation under the conditions that you now impose upon me. I have tried to see the situation from your point of view. Now won't you try to see it from mine?

With kindest regards to Mrs. Crandon and yourself.

Very sincerely yours,

H. C. McComas.

May 4, 1926.

Dear Walton:

I enclose copies of McComas’s letters and also copies of telegrams between McComas and me on Sunday.

Dunlap I think we cannot have. He has committed himself too thoroughly against this “Blight of Spiritualism” to be judicial, and his personality is very depressing. Personally, I don’t see why McComas should select the Committee, nor that he has shown any particular ability to do so. We want to know the qualifications of Committee members.

As ever, sincerely,

L. R. G. CRANDON.

May 6, 1926.

My dear Walton:

I enclose a copy of a letter from Dr. McComas, dated May 3, 1926.

I have tried to ease Dr. Dunlap out of the Commission for reasons which I have told you verbally, but that I have hesitated to put in a more enduring form in writing. It seems now that I must do so.

(1) Before there was any sitting of the Commission, I protested against Doctors Wood and Dunlap because both are deaf.

(2) I further protested, in writing, against Dr. Dunlap because of an expression of his in a recent paper on Psychical Research. In this paper he says that we cannot get rid of “This Blight of Spiritualism” until the whole matter is submitted to trained psychologists, or words to that effect. Suppose that a member of the Committee had written a paper containing the expression “This Blessing of Spiritualism.” Would he stay on the Commission?
(3) Dr. Dunlap dictating notes to a female stenographer during the sitting said, "The whatcha-may-call-it feels to me like an ——." Whether you agree with me or not, it is my decision that such a comparison constitutes behavior impossible for a gentleman under the circumstances. It was apparent that the whole sitting was to him only a joke. A true scientist would have described the terminal as to its length, breadth, thickness, temperature, degree of hardness and softness to superficial feel and to firm grasp, and other specifications. There were plenty of similes which this man could have used in the presence of the female stenographer, to say nothing of decent respect for the Psychic, even though she was unconscious in trance. Dr. McComas heard all this, and his opinion seemed to agree with mine at the time.

(4) As to bringing Dr. Buford Johnson, what reason have we to believe now that Dr. McComas knows the qualifications of a researcher? How can we expect a psychologist in the same department as Dr. Dunlap, but of a lower rank, to give an opinion really independent from his?

(5) We have fully the same right to challenge the jury that the Society has. It is only by this scrutiny that we shall avoid repetition of the failures of all previous psychic investigations. There have been scores of wonderful mediums. They have entered the seance-room without a friend. There has been no check-up as to what occurs. The medium has had no more chance of equity than the accused before a tribunal of the French Revolution.

(6) In this cause we are the donors. We are making social and professional and financial sacrifice that the Society and the world may get new precise observations in this matter, so full of possibilities. There is no medium in history so willing to cooperate, so compliant to conditions, as this one. All the glory, all the historical prestige will go to the Society and to the Commission. The medium (under her nom d'esprit) will remain nameless.

(7) Phenomena are now here to be seen, at most any sitting, under conditions of such strict control that over 400 sitters have found no flaw. Such manifestations are:

(a) Levitations of objects in a plate-glass cabinet with the psychic's five extremities lashed with wire;

(b) cognition of objects in the dark and with no contact with the psychic;

(c) mechanical demonstration that there is a bodiless voice present;

(d) the "Scientific American" bell-box is rung intermittently in red light while being carried around the room by anyone, passed through the hands of all sitters present, and examined, all in the same period of red light;

(e) chemical balances, built of brass and wood by Dr. Comstock of Massachusetts Institute of Technology, are balanced contrary to gravity; no mechanical reason is found, and yet a quartz-lens camera shows always a structure on the
empty pan. The stability, once established, continues when
the Psychic leaves the room, or when the balances are lifted
by the investigator.
Think of this wealth of well established phenomena waiting
here to be observed and recorded! All we ask is that you will
send judicially minded GENTLEMEN of intellectual courage.
Nor are we prepared to wait indefinitely, nor to interrupt the
work of the advanced group while fraud-hunters seek to enter.
In the presence of the advanced group, of such men as Dr. M. W.
Richardson, Charles S. Hill, Alfred W. Martin, Dr. Brewer Eddy,
John Haynes Holmes, we are having materializations of hands,
which are felt, temperature taken and are seen to move and act
as if directed by intelligence. We are having paraffin molds of
single and double hands. In short, this extraordinary mediumship
is advancing constantly and must be recorded, if not by the Society,
then in some other manner. If the Society fails to do it, it fails
in its duty to those whose benefactions support it.
I think a conference on this matter is imperative.
Sincerely, and with expressions of my highest esteem,
L. R. G. CRANDON.

At the date of the last letter it was clear to all that the plan
of investigation by the McComas-Wood-Dunlap Commission had
utterly failed. The financial accounts of the commission had
been settled and the enterprise was at an end.
The Society, accepting McComas’s representation of his atti-
tude and ambition in regard to psychical research at face value,
engaged him for six months to undertake as a sort of research
apprentice a general study of psychic phenomena to include the
Margery mediumship whenever possible and in such way as
might be arranged. He began his work under such temporary
appointment on July 15, 1926.
Three months later Professor Dunlap addressed to the So-
Society the following unsolicited letter, which was duly
acknowledged:

THE JOHNS HOPKINS UNIVERSITY
Homewood
Baltimore, Maryland
September 25, 1926.

American Society of Psychical Research,
15 Lexington Avenue,
New York City.
I desire to submit, herewith, my resignation from the Committee
to investigate the “Margery” case, if my resignation is technically
in order. The Crandons having definitely broken their signed
contract with us, with no formal reason given to the Committee, it would seem that we are released automatically. Certainly, our contract with them is no longer binding, and I shall assume, unless there is some point not yet made clear to me, that I am free to discuss the sittings. If a report of the work, as far as we were permitted to go, is desired, I shall be glad to submit to the Society a personal report along the following lines.

1. We were given courteous treatment and cooperation up to the time the investigation was broken off. I held myself in readiness to complete the work throughout the remainder of the college year, inconveniencing myself to do so.

2. In pursuance of our plans, we viewed the phenomena presented, and assumed that we had seen the most interesting phenomena. We were, therefore, prepared at the next sitting to commence the scientific investigation, which would have been futile previous to a general view of that which the investigation was to cover. I may say that the view had been so satisfactory that my own plans for the work were quite definite.

3. So far as my own plans were concerned, they remained as outlined at the beginning. I have no interest in looking for, or attempting to detect, trickery. My sole interests are; first, in finding interesting phenomena, and next in determining the conditions under which these phenomena will and will not occur. I know of no other method of scientific investigation.

4. As a result of our sittings, and the comparison of the results with the reports of previous investigators, I am of the decided opinion that no investigation of this case so far carried out and published has any scientific value. It is obvious that scientifically definite conditions were not established, and that much of the essential conditions were either not controlled, or are not reported. This has no decisive bearing on the question of truth or falsity of the claims for the phenomena.

5. None of the phenomena viewed were such as could not, under the conditions which obtained, have been produced without the aid of forces and methods already admitted by physics and psychology. This does not mean that they were actually produced by such means. On this point neither we, nor previous investigators, have any trustworthy evidence. (Italics Editorial.)

6. Finally, since I assume that the Crandons objected to me on the basis of my previously expressed opinion that no occult or "spiritualistic" phenomena have been proved valid, I must remark that a committee composed entirely of members already committed to a belief in these alleged phenomena would be valueless, and a

---

5 This is of course an evasion of the fact that McComas, the Chairman of the Commission, was fully aware of Crandon's decision and the grounds on which it was based. The Chairman alone was authorized to speak for the Commission and represent it in the conduct of the investigation. See Par. I of Convention, Vol. I, p. 370.

6 The Professor here distinctly misstates his previously expressed opinion.
positive report of such a committee would have little scientific weight.

Knight Dunlap.

The important part of this letter is the italicized fifth paragraph in which it is frankly conceded that the Commission had no trustworthy evidence that the phenomena observed by them in the four sittings they had with Margery were produced with the aid of forces and methods already admitted by physics and psychology. In other words, the Commission had no evidence that the phenomena were produced by normal means, though the learned professor thought they could have been so produced.

In the end intellectual dishonesty works its own undoing. A year and three months after the last sitting of the Commission at Lime Street, and after McComas had served for six months with indifferent and doubtful success in his new duties as research apprentice with the Society and had departed with the denunciation of certain members of the Society ringing in his ears over a hoax he perpetrated on them under the guise of a séance with an admittedly fake Hindoo medium presented as genuine, he got his former colleagues of the defunct Commission together and from his personal address in Baltimore sent to the Society the following communication, called a report of the Commission. Dunlap had apparently forgotten and obviously had not shown to his colleagues his letter of September 25th, and McComas found it convenient to overlook his statement to Wood, "I do not think we would be handling the matter acceptably if we rendered a report based on any scanty evidence." The paragraphs have been numbered to facilitate discussion of the document.

April 18, 1927,
4100 North Charles Street,
Baltimore, Md.

The Research Committee,
American Society for Psychical Research,
15 Lexington Avenue,
New York City, N. Y.
Gentlemen:

(1) The undersigned submit this report to you at this time for the following reasons: Dr. Crandon is taking advantage of
the delay in the appearance of a report to spread the impression that the Commission as a whole has not found unfavorably for the Margery mediumship, and also it has now become evident that Dr. Crandon will not permit any member of the Commission to carry on an investigation of a genuinely scientific character.

(2) Your Commissioners had several sittings with Dr. and Mrs. Crandon in the last week of January, 1926, which were reported stenographically at the time of the sittings. These reports were sent you immediately after the sittings and it is unnecessary at this time, therefore, to discuss the sittings in detail. The purpose of the present report is to give you the conclusions of your Commissioners based on the observations of these sittings, the reports of others, and some experiments of our own.

(3) The Sittings which were allotted to your Commissioners were for observational purposes only, and no controls devised by us were imposed upon Mrs. Crandon and no experiments were planned and consummated in the séance room. It was our intention to observe the effects Dr. and Mrs. Crandon produced and to make our experiments later.

(4) At the first sitting there were many of the friends of the Crandons present to whom we were introduced. Some of them constituted what Dr. Crandon termed his Advanced Circle. It was intended by the Crandons to be an evening in which the usual effects should be presented for our observation. There was one effect, however, which they told us was a novelty. This consisted in rendering luminous paint, which had lost its fluorescence in the dark, luminescent. A disc with a hollow center had been painted with luminous paint and had become dark. We were told that "Walter's" terminal would cause the "doughnut" to glow. When the doughnut became luminescent the friends of the Crandons exclaimed with pleasure and congratulated "Walter" upon his achievement.

(5) Dr. Wood reproduced this effect in his laboratory at the Johns Hopkins University, using a pocket flashlight and an ultraviolet filter. This phenomenon is a baffling one to people who are unacquainted with the action of luminous paint in the presence of very short light waves. Dr. Crandon had ample opportunity to employ a pocket flashlight in this way, and actually had a flashlight in his pocket on the side towards the medium at the sitting.

(6) The bellbox was featured in these sittings as an especially remarkable phenomenon. Dr. Dunlap noted the change in the tension of the steel spring during a sitting. He constructed a box in which the spring was enclosed in the body of the box, and could be adjusted for various tensions. This arrangement precluded any tampering with the spring. Dr. Dunlap was never permitted to substitute his box for the one the Crandons had been using.

7The only sitters other than the Commissioners themselves were Conant, Richardson, Hill and Crandon.—Ed.
In two boxes made after the pattern of the Crandon box the same effects that the Crandons obtained were obtained by taking the tension from the spring during the sitting, and prevented short-circuiting the connecting wires, which are outside the box in the Crandon arrangement, and which can readily be short-circuited by using a needle, thus causing the bell to ring.

(7) Your Commissioners were informed by Dr. Crandon that psychic rods protruded from the body of the medium. He stated that they were very sensitive and could perceive the pips on playing cards and could identify various small objects and wooden letters in complete darkness. At the last sitting one member of the Commission squeezed the end of such an alleged rod and neither Margery nor “Walter” were aware of the fact until it was dictated for the stenographer.

(8) Dr. Crandon had stated that the extreme sensitivity of these “psychic rods” showed how intimately they were connected with the vitality of the medium. He argued that any vigorous handling of such rods might injure the medium. After the incident above described the sitting continued for forty minutes with the rod in vigorous activity. After the sitting one of your Commissioners suggested that Mrs. Crandon remain in the cabinet until the light was turned on and that a search then be made. When Mrs. Crandon heard this she began to gag and cough as though ill. She bent forward as though vomiting and hurried from the room. An examination showed nothing upon the floor and the stomachic performance seemed simulated.

(9) In the opinion of Dr. Dunlap the “psychic rod” employed on this occasion, as judged by feeling and by usual observation in the dim light, was the intestine of some animal, showing the stumps of some blood vessels and stuffed with some substance like cotton, through which ran several wires.

(10) The next day Dr. Dunlap and Dr. McComas visited the Crandon house and did not find Mrs. Crandon any the worse for her experience; she ran up and down the stairs easily and seemed in excellent spirits. These details are mentioned because Dr. Crandon had maintained that his wife was made ill from the squeezing of the so-called “teleplastic rod.”

(11) From the time of this incident it was impossible to have further sittings as a Commission. We had provided in our Convention to have any disagreements adjusted by a Committee of three. Dr. Crandon would not have recourse to this agreement. He continually refused to have further sittings but would not give his reasons to the Commission.7

(12) In the summer of 1926 your Society engaged Dr. McComas as a Special Research Officer. He attended a number of sittings with Mrs. Crandon but was not permitted to try any tests with

7 See note 5, supra.
the medium. He succeeded on one occasion in greatly improving the controls for Mrs. Crandon but was not permitted to continue and to impose controls upon Dr. Crandon and his associates. After several months of effort to experiment he abandoned that method of investigation as impossible while Dr. Crandon had control of the situation. He then sought to duplicate the "Margery phenomena." Professor Grant H. Code, of the University of Delaware, reproduced the levitation effects excellently; he also reproduced the bellbox effect and the reading of the cards in the dark.

(13) Dr. McComas held two séances in his office at the Society’s building, using a Hindoo for the "medium." These meetings were attended by members of the Society who had had wide experience in psychic research. Some fifteen of these sitters voluntarily signed statements to the effect that these phenomena were done by no normal means known to them. Five of the sitters had seen the Margery phenomena and agreed that these were quite as good as Margery’s. These phenomena consisted in the ringing of the bellbox, whistling and whispering by the medium using a voice cut-out of the Richardson type, reading cards in the dark and the appearance of psychic lights.

(14) These effects and those obtained by Professor Code are excellent duplicates of the Crandon performances.

(15) In view of the above findings your Commission submits that the Margery mediumship is a clever and entertaining performance but is unworthy of any serious consideration by your Society.

(16) We submit further that the unwillingness of Dr. Crandon to allow the Commission to proceed with the investigation is a sufficient indication that no investigation by competent investigators employing the methods and checks required in all scientific research is likely to be permitted.

Signed: H. C. McComas, R. W. Wood, KNIGHT DUNLAP.

This document voluntarily offered as a discharge of a professional responsibility a year and more after it was known to all that the engagement had ended through the frustration of its object by the conduct of a commissioner, is but additional evidence of the initial disqualifying bias of the commission and the determination of the academic mind to discredit anything that challenges a conventional orthodox and previously published theory.

That the contact which the Commissioners had with the case was quite insufficient to afford the basis for any judgment what-
ever as to the nature of the phenomena they had witnessed is plain; and that they had no evidence upon which to base a scientific report is also admitted.

In paragraph (1), moreover, they announce that they are making the report because at last they are convinced Dr. Cran­done would not permit any of them to make a genuinely scientific investigation. The "report" therefore, is self-defined as an expression of personal views, not based upon evidence and reflecting only preconceived opinions.

As to paragraph (2) the Society was of course not interested in the conclusion of the Commissioners based on "the reports of others," and certainly up to the 9th of May, 1926, no joint experiments of their own had been made. McComas's own strictures on his colleague's conduct sufficiently indicate that no serious coöperative effort was made by the Commission at any time. The tendered "conclusions" of the commissioners, moreover, are completely inconsistent with the view expressed in the earlier personal report of Professor Dunlap printed above.

As to paragraph (3) the nature of the control that obtained on January 27th was duly described and applied by the Commissioners themselves as appears from the account printed in Volume I, pages 372-373. Whether the controls were devised by the commissioners or by other investigators is of little importance. They were in fact rigorous and effective—more drastic, perhaps, than any medium ever subjected herself to before. The suggestion that controls devised by the commissioners would have been more effective or more acceptable as effective to the academic mind, is rather subtly grotesque in view of the efforts of McComas to improve the control and make it perfect against the criticisms of Houdini. (See record of sitting September 18, 1926, Chapter XLVI, pages 521-28.) A definite discussion or specific criticism by the learned commissioners of the control that in fact obtained might have had some value; but there is no reason to believe that "controls devised by us," would have been more effective.

As to paragraphs (4) and (5), the sitting referred to was the preliminary one of which no record was made by the com-
missioners. The *ex post facto* account of it produced a year and a half after the event is on general principles of orderly procedure so obviously inadmissible as part of the record that resort need not be had to the terms of the convention to rule it out. But that document specifically required that fraud or suggestion of fraud be dictated into the record or be deemed non-existent. (See paragraph (6) of the Convention, Vol. I, page 371.) The wisdom of that requirement in the interest of truth has been repeatedly demonstrated and is confirmed by this charge of fraud revealed for the first time in this belated utterance of the Commission. Crandon denies the use of the flashlight for the purpose suggested by the Commissioners. That the Commissioners should formally seek to support their suggestion of fraud by resort to *ex parte* and *ex post facto* statements of fact conclusively ruled out by the terms of their own covenant with Crandon, does but indicate the bankruptcy of their case. Even the "scientific psychology," so beloved by Professor Dunlap, would hardly honor such technique as likely to contribute to the ascertainment of fact.

Paragraph (6) alleges that the bell-box "was featured in these sittings," and offers a theory that the bell was rung by short-circuiting the current with a needle. Accuracy seems not to be a characteristic of certain academic minds when bent on supporting a preconceived theory. The bell-box was in fact used only in the first unofficial and informal sitting of which no record was made, and so in no sense "featured these sittings." The comments made above on paragraphs (4) and (5) thus apply equally to paragraph (6) which also contains a further *suggestio falsi* that has no relation to fact. The paragraph says "Dr. Dunlap was never permitted to substitute his box for the one the Crandon's had been using." No request for such substitution was made and until this document appeared no one at Lime Street or in the Society knew of Dunlap's box-building efforts. It is to be hoped that Dr. Dunlap was not here using intentionally his skill as a psychologist to create the false impression that Crandon had specifically refused to allow use of the Dunlap box; but to the non-professional mind
the implication conveyed is plain. Such are the vagaries of
the human mind that for some persons conviction of fraud by
innuendo rather than by evidence may be possible, but as a
process adopted by supposedly disinterested scientific men in
discharge of a professional duty its use can succeed only in
convincing a fair mind that the charge of fraud has no founda-
tion in the evidence whatever.

Paragraphs (7), (8), (9) and (10) deal with the hard squee-
ing of the teleplasmic rod by Wood and the illness of the psy-
chic at the close of the séance. The hoary technique of adding
to the record to serve a present purpose is again resorted to
in an effort to escape from the cold, unemotional and damning
recital of the commissioners' own contemporaneous official
account of what actually happened. The official record says:

"There was nausea and vomiting of the Psychic after the
sitting."

In view of the challenge to the accuracy of this statement made
by the commissioners long after the event, Crandon's contem-
poraneous account becomes material. He recorded on the fol-
lowing morning before any question of controversy as to the
facts had arisen or been suggested, the following facts:

"At the end of the evening before Psyche could leave the room
she vomited on the floor and suffered from nausea all night."

The commission report elaborates and embroiders the official
record as follows:

"One of the commissioners (identity not given), suggested
that Mrs. Crandon remain in the cabinet until the light was turned
on and that a search be then made. When Mrs. Crandon heard
this she began to gag and cough as though ill. She bent forward
as though vomiting and hurried from the room. An examination
showed nothing upon the floor and the stomachic performance
seemed simulated."

Except for the young woman stenographer Crandon and his
wife were alone in the room with these three men. He denies
that any such suggestion of search of the psychic was made
by anyone. The stenographer was present for the express pur-
pose of taking a current account of what happened and she included a statement of the result of her search of the psychic before and also after the sitting. If the commissioners at the time thought that the psychic was fleeing from the room in simulated illness to avoid search, such an observation clearly constituted a "suggestion of fraud" required by paragraph 6 of the convention to be recorded in the narrative notes and its absence should be a conclusive estoppel against any claim that such was the fact and that the commissioners entertained any such theory. The result of the post-sitting search was recorded so that it cannot be urged that there was a simple case of oversight in dictating the notes. The care of the commissioners in correcting the spelling of the word "nausea" in the stenographic transcript again dispels any doubt that the narrative of facts was accurate.

After a year and a half's cogitation on the events of this tragic occasion when the pledged covenant of a man was so brutally broken, the three investigators, to protect the reputation of their confrère, united in an explanation of the matter that belies their own contemporaneous record made in the course of their professional duty, and if true, would indicate deliberate simulation of illness by Margery to evade detection of a fraud in which Crandon was necessarily an accomplice. The frequent defense of a criminal is an alibi supported by manufactured evidence. It has remained for an attempted investigation of psychic phenomena to disclose that even men of academic repute may resort to an analogous technique to support a theory previously held and published and escape condemnation for inexcusable conduct.

Paragraphs (11) to (13) relate to matters that did not come within the observation of the commission and have therefore no proper place in the report. The alleged duplication of the Lime Street phenomena by Code and by McComas under conditions of their own making may prove their cleverness at sleight of hand or as illusionists; but it has no relation to the serious investigation of the Margery case. That distinguished academicians should adopt such mountebanking as a substitute
for serious attack upon the problems of psychical research does but serve to emphasize the resistance to new ideas and strange facts developed by men who become conventional professors with an announced theory to defend.

Dunlap’s "stuffed intestine" theory of the Margery teleplasm is a rare contribution to the nascent science of metaphysics, taking rank with McDougall’s "regurgitated liver." In exchange for its expenditure of time, effort and money in connection with this Commission the Society at least plumbed for itself some of the depths of academic prejudice and learned something of the facility with which the academic mind contacting a new idea or strange unclassified facts can, on no evidence at all, announce a conclusion of fraud.
In the study of the Margery mediumship it has been noted frequently that experiments, apparently quite simple at their inception, have been elaborated, at Walter’s suggestion, to an extraordinary degree, and with results that have been almost beyond belief. This has been preeminently the case with the so-called Cross-Correspondence tests, carried out at Lime Street in 1927 and 1928.

Begun as a simple attempt at post-hypnotic control of Margery at Lime Street it ended in multiple post-hypnotic control of mediums widely separated in space; at Boston, New York, Niagara Falls, Ogunquit, Maine, and finally Venice, Italy. Moreover, incidentally, the control, originally confined to Walter, was delegated by him during one period to Chinese entities who, in turn, were able to exercise multiple influence on mediums in distant cities. Finally, and of the greatest importance, the fact came out that, even in the absence of Margery, Walter could cognize in darkness objects at Lime Street, and could transfer their characteristics in whole or in part to Margery (at Newton, Mass.), Valiantine (at New York), and Hardwicke (at Niagara Falls).

This subject will fall naturally into three subdivisions—
I (a) Mediumistic post-hypnotic suggestion, Margery present at Lime Street. (b) Mediumistic post-hypnotic suggestion, Margery being absent from Lime Street, and, II, Chinese control in mediumistic post-hypnotic suggestion.

It will be best to begin our discussion with a somewhat detailed account of the original experiment and the events which led up to it.

I had been reading Dr. T. W. Mitchell’s book on “Medical Psychology and Psychical Research”; more specially Chap-
ter I: "The Appreciation of Time by Somnambules." As is well known, if the suggestion be made to a hypnotized person that, after a certain period of time, he shall execute a certain act, the act in question will in many instances be carried out with almost mathematical precision both as to time and as to manner. Take for instance the following example, given by Dr. Mitchell:

"June 23rd, 1906, 1:10 p.m. Before I gave the suggestion the subject had been in hypnosis for twenty minutes and had no ordinary means of knowing the time. The suggestion was that in 135 minutes [due, therefore, at 3:25 p.m.] she should go into the garden and pick some flowers, which she should give to Miss A. I asked Miss A. not to let F. D. [the subject] out of her sight for an instant, to keep her away from clocks or watches until the suggestion was fulfilled, and to note the time when this took place. On June 24th, Miss A. gave me a paper, written and signed by herself, stating that F. D. gave her three flowers at 3:22 p.m., after spending six minutes in the garden."

Transferring the idea of this experiment to the Margery mediumship, I was curious, in the first instance, to see whether a suggestion made to Margery, in (mediumistic) trance, would be carried out in a manner similar to that seen in a hypnotic subject. The unique and supplementary idea then occurred to me that Walter, her "control," might in such case act as the hypnotizer. The idea had moreover a peculiar piquancy in that many observers had tried to make out that "Walter" was, himself, simply a hypnotic impersonation associated inseparably with the organization of Margery; so that, if we succeeded in getting post-hypnotic influencing, by Walter, of Margery, we should either have disproved this viewpoint, or created a very unique situation in which a secondary reacts hypnotically upon the primary who has hypnotically brought this secondary into being. I think most readers will agree that such a suggestion is preposterous; and that if we really succeed in proving post-hypnotic influencing of Margery by Walter, we shall have gone a very long way indeed toward proof of Walter's independence.

A peculiar difficulty presented itself at once. Was Margery really in trance? If not, any audible suggestion made to her
by Walter or sitters could be reproduced easily later. This difficulty was quickly removed by utilizing Walter’s well-known power of seeing and reading in the dark. For example, one evening I brought a new, unbroken pack of playing cards, unusual in that the size was about twice that of ordinary playing cards. In this pack, unsuspected by any one, was a card covered with printed advertising. By chance this card was submitted to Walter in the dark for diagnosis. Promptly he read some of the words—“guaranteed,” etc.

For our first experiment, therefore, it was possible for Walter to choose, in the dark, material unknown to any one else. He could then, for the purpose of post-hypnotic action, impress silently upon Margery the character of the material cognized.

The first requisite for this procedure was then to furnish a device upon which Walter could, in the dark, indicate a specific number, in such fashion that even were Margery conscious she could not know what this number was. Such a device was found in the perpetual calendar illustrated as Figure 1. Turning the knob through a half-revolution brings a new figure into view. If some sitter first turns this handle arbitrarily in the dark séance-room and if the calendar is then passed over to Walter who turns it further, neither Walter nor the other person can normally know, save by prearrangement, what number is brought into view. The possibilities of an arbitrary and unpredictable choice are increased by the fact that the calendar may be turned either forward or backward.

To this calendar I added a further element, in the shape of six ordinary white cards, on each of which I drew in ink a simple geometrical figure. These figures were about two inches in height. It is of course not so evident with them as with the calendar that no means of normal tactual perception exists.

It was my proposal that Walter, himself, in the dark, turn the calendar to any number; and that he then, in the dark, select one of the six cards. Having made these selections, he was to place the calendar and the chosen card in a box and put the cover on the latter. At the end of the sitting, while Margery was still in trance, he was to indicate silently to her
the number and the figure which he had selected and cognized; doing this, it will be seen, instead of making audible announce-
ment of his cognitions to the sitters. Downstairs, after the séance, Margery would then try, by process more or less analo-
gous to automatic writing, to draw the figure and write the number; and the element of post-hypnotic timing was to be introduced by Walter’s suggesting to her that she do this after the lapse of the number of minutes indicated by the calendar number chosen by him. In this way and only in this way could the time element as well as the matter of the suggestion proper be known to Walter and yet with certainty not known normally to Margery or any sitter. It was pointed out to Walter that the timing would have to be from the moment of leaving the séance room; and that he would therefore have to select a number large enough to give the sitters opportunity to get downstairs and get settled there.

Experiment of January 4, 1928

In so far as the above explanation of procedure implies con-
sultation with Walter, it carries us ahead of the story. The experiment as just outlined took form in my mind but was revealed to nobody until the occasion on which it was carried out. On January 4th, 1928, I brought the calendar in its box to the séance-room and placed it beneath my chair. Very soon Walter noticed it and wanted to know its nature and purpose. He then, in the dark, under full hand-control throughout the circle, picked the box up off the floor, placed it on the table, opened it, handled the calendar with his teleplasmic terminal, and said that he could “see” the numbers perfectly in the dark. Of course the experiment depends for its validity upon the presence of total darkness so that they could not be seen normally; this point is adequately covered in the previous publication cited above.¹ The calendar and the conditions were suitable for the demonstration of supernormal cognition, whatever might come of the hypnotic experiment.

At this stage of the séance I discussed the experiment with

¹ Pp. 749-50.
Walter for the first time, Margery being presumably and apparently in trance. Walter was not particularly enthusiastic but promised to do his best. The sitters were, in clockwise order: Margery, myself, Mr. Carter (the only stranger), Mr. Dudley, Mrs. Richardson and Dr. Crandon.

Toward the end of the sitting, Walter in the dark chose a number on the calendar and put it in the box. He chose also a geometric card and put it in the box with the calendar. The box was then covered and given into the custody of Mr. Carter, who also took charge of the remaining five cards to guard against any substitution. At the end of the sitting Walter indicated that the hypnotic part of the experiment might have to be done in somewhat of a hurry; further, the exact moment from which time was to be counted was not made entirely clear. It was at approximately 10:27½ that, Margery being completely emerged from trance, we all went rapidly downstairs together. Dr. Crandon with no delay produced a pad of paper and a pencil. As had been suggested by Walter himself, Margery and Mr. Carter sat down together at a table as though to attempt automatic writing. At 10:33 Margery began to write, and produced the following script:

"I cannot hold the control any longer. I am using the ten on the calendar and then—I must go."

Completing this at 10:34, Margery made a circle under the writing and then stopped. Mr. Carter opened the box and took out the card upon which was a circle. He then took out the calendar which showed the 10, as in Figure 1. The experiment, therefore, had been almost completely successful in its outcome, the only question apparently being that of the lapse of time: only 6½ minutes instead of ten. The explanation of this I believe lies in the fact that Walter, as often happens when he leaves, was distinctly in a hurry and so could not await the lapse of the full ten minutes. The writing certainly indicates that he was retaining the control with difficulty and that there was necessity for haste. Of course this might be urged against the hypnotic interpretation of the results and in behalf of the hypothesis that Walter was still present in
the more usual spiritistic control sense; but subsequent results will quite rule out any such explanation. In point of fact, at the next sitting I asked Walter how he had exercised his control over Margery’s writing hand, and inquired whether he had been present at her metaphorical elbow to direct the production of the script. This he denied, saying that he had remained upstairs in the séance-room, two flights removed; but he stated that he had maintained from there a connection of some sort with the medium. He used the word “yarn” here, and seemed to have in mind much the same sort of thing as in the early occurrence of this word in his séance philosophy.¹

If we now cast up the account to see where we stand, we shall find that at least the situation fairly bristles with supernormal phenomena, as follows: (a) Walter’s independent voice;² (b) teleplasmic terminals lifting the box from the floor to the table, removing the cover, removing and manipulating the contents; (c) cognition in the dark of the number on the calendar and the geometric figure on the card; (d) transcription in brilliant white light, through automatic writing by the normal, waking medium, of facts known only to Walter. The time-cognition, of course, was not accurate. This aspect must therefore await further experimentation. Very important is it to bear in mind that the experiment was unexpected by any person in the circle save myself; so that the possibility of preparation, collusion or confederacy is eliminated at once.

The experiment having succeeded in its main aspects, we must now consider briefly and inadequately several important points. Margery seemed to be her normal self during the writing downstairs, though we shall later have some slight modification of this statement to record. During the sitting upstairs she was presumably in trance. If not, she would have to be clairvoyant in the dark and we have no other indication out of five years’ experience that this is the case.

As to Walter: is he an independent personality exerting his post-hypnotic effects exactly as did Dr. Mitchell? Or is he a

¹ See Bird: Margery the Medium, p. 98.
secondary personality inseparably connected with Margery? If this latter supposition be the true one, does Margery through self-hypnosis become Walter-Margery, acquire clairvoyance, make suggestions to the entranced Margery who then later carries out the suggestions as made? Is the hypnotic power of the Walter-Margery entity restricted in its scope to Margery, or can it be exerted upon two or more subjects simultaneously? This latter question was the one which struck me with great force as particularly and peculiarly pertinent; and at this juncture I was fortunate in securing the assistance of another medium, George Valiantine, who together with Margery became the subject of further experiment. He was in Boston on January 20th, attending a Margery séance, and in this way was brought into contact with the cognitive and post-hypnotic experiments.

**Experiment No. 2**

The sitting started at nine o'clock, with the sitters in this order, clockwise: Margery, Valiantine (the two mediums, side by side in the cabinet), Dr. Richardson, Miss Silsbee, Mrs. Richardson, Mr. Dudley, Mrs. Woolley, Mrs. Cornell, Mrs. Cannon, Dr. Crandon. Behind the circle were: John Crandon, Harriet Richardson and Dr. Robert Nichols. The sitting was very diversified because of the presence of the two mediums, each with his own controls. An outline of the action that is of interest in the present context would be about as follows:

In order to continue the experiment on post-hypnotic suggestion, I had brought to the séance-room a flat box containing

---

3 It is with utmost appreciation that I acknowledge at this point the wholehearted co-operation in these experiments of the following groups of individuals:

First: George Valantine, medium, associated with members of the New York Section of the American Society for Psychical Research; and among the members, particularly Mrs. William M. Cannon, Mrs. Charles G. Cornell, Mrs. Cornelia Woolley, Mrs. Estelle Warner, Mrs. John Moody and Mr. T. H. Pierson, Chairman of the Research Committee.

Second: Dr. Henry Hardwicke, medium at Niagara Falls, N. Y., associated with Katharine S. Hardwicke, Donald Kellogg, Dorothy E. Kellogg, Bj. Klassen, Emily H. Klassen and Derick Cross.

Third: Mrs. Sarah Litzelmann, medium, sitting temporarily at Ogunquit, Maine, with Karl Litzelmann, Kate Tucker, Edna Burlingham and John Helt, Jr.
(a) a daily calendar with individual sheets, numbers 1 to 31, suspended on metal rings approximately like a certain style of loose-leaf memorandum book, the metal calendar of Experiment No. 1 being discarded because Walter dislikes to touch metal with his terminals; (b) a series of ten white cards also suspended on rings, each card bearing a geometric figure about two inches in diameter; (c) a series of five sheets of white paper, commercial size, with pasteboard covers, also suspended on metal rings, and each white sheet bearing, in black letters approximately one inch high, a set of directions for actions to be carried out by the two mediums after the sitting, provided Walter could put these actions across as a matter of intra-trance suggestion. I discussed the experiment with Walter, and he expressed confidence that he would be able to choose, in the dark, a number from the calendar, a card with geometrical figure, and one of the paper instruction sheets; and to "put across," in the subsequent light, the appropriate cognitions and actions, with the two mediums in the waking state. Walter having made the necessary arbitrary selections in the darkness of the séance, the box in which he had placed the three sheets or cards selected by him was covered and turned over to Mrs. Cannon, who kept it in her custody.

At the end of the sitting, for the purpose of the time-cognition, three stopwatches were punched simultaneously by Mr. Dudley, Dr. Crandon and myself. The circle then passed rapidly downstairs, the necessary two flights to the book-room; where Margery and Valiantine were placed back to back on a long stool, with table, pencil and paper in front of each. After six minutes and eight seconds both mediums began simultaneously to write. Margery wrote: "I am going to write . . . it is for seven minutes," and drew a flat cross like an X. Valiantine wrote: "Seven minutes," and drew a similar cross. The production of the two crosses coincided at six minutes, twenty seconds. Shortly after this, Margery stroked her nose with her hand, turned completely around, and in a rather embarrassed manner said that she wanted to pull somebody's nose. Valiantine then turned and each put his right forefinger on
the nose of the other. This took place at eight minutes, 26 seconds. Then after another interval Margery and Valiantine got up together and walked to the fireplace, where Valiantine took the tongs. The two mediums then walked into the back hall, there they put out the electric light by pressing the button with the head of the tongs held by Valiantine. Both were distinctly embarrassed, being unpleasantly conscious of the fact that they were behaving in a superficially foolish manner.

The exhibition being apparently over, Mrs. Cannon opened the box. It was found that the calendar stood at 7; that the white card bore a "flat cross" like the letter X; and that the conduct of the two mediums had close but not perfect correspondence with the instructions of the first two white sheets. The one sheet read: M & V each touches nose with forefinger; the other: M walks to hall, puts out light; V walks to fireplace and handles tongs. The experiment was therefore practically perfect in its outcome. The time cognition was of course not strictly accurate; but before the experiment Walter had said that this would probably be the case. Then, too, as regards the post-hypnotic suggestions of conduct, these were not carried out exactly as I had had them in my mind, for my intention was: (a) that Margery and Valiantine should each touch his own nose with his own forefinger; (b) that Margery should walk alone to the hall and put out the light and that Valiantine should walk alone to the fireplace and handle the tongs. Walter did not apparently understand my thought fully; which fact is in itself important as showing that the mediums were not acting hypnotically upon my personal initiative, but rather upon that of some other mind.

With this experiment our position is advanced. It is clear that we now have to do either with (a) a single independent entity, Walter, who exercises hypnotic power, simultaneously, over two sensitive individuals; or with (b) the dual Walter-Margery personality, which hypnotizes not only itself but also, and spontaneously, another sensitive person, to produce identical and simultaneous post-hypnotic manifestations. In this connection the following incident is of interest and importance:
During the above described sitting it will be remembered that Margery and Valiantine were sitting side by side in the cabinet. I controlled Valiantine's left hand, his right being ostensibly held by Margery's left. Margery was apparently in trance; Valiantine was not. Walter with his witty quips and stories was keeping the circle highly amused. It happened, however, that Valiantine's laughter was very loud and boisterous; so much so, that Walter warned him that continuance would necessitate his putting Valiantine "out," which is to say, into trance. In spite of the warning Valiantine continued to show his amusement very noisily. Whereupon Walter said, in a tone humorously sad but very firm "George, this is where you get off. Go to sleep, little boy: sleep—sleep—sleep." Immediately Valiantine's hand, which had been gripping mine firmly, became limp; and he made no sound for ten or fifteen minutes. Could any expert have employed a more professional manner in inducing hypnosis in a sensitive subject?

Now in the experiment just detailed, the post-hypnotic phenomena were obtained while the two mediums, Margery and Valiantine, were in close personal proximity. Obviously the next important question was: Can Walter produce identical, simultaneous, post-hypnotically or otherwise controlled phenomena, if the two mediums involved are separated by some considerable distance?

Within a very few days this question was answered affirmatively, Margery and Valiantine being, during the experiment, about a mile apart. Then, after a good deal of further partially successful experimentation, Valiantine being in New York, the following brilliant result was secured on February 17, 1928. Moreover, a third medium, Dr. Hardwicke at Niagara Falls, was included.

Experiment of February 17, 1928

The Lime Street sitters were, in clockwise order as always: Margery, Dr. Richardson, Mrs. Baker, Miss Silsbee, Mr. Dudley, Mr. J. H. Brown, Mr. Adler, Mrs. Frothingham, Mr. Bond, Mr. Litzelmann, John Crandon, Mrs. Richardson and Dr. Cran-
of these thirteen participants, four were slightly back
of the main circle but so close thereto that it seems desirable
to indicate the order of sitting complete from end to end as a
single group.

A new sheaf of calendar pages had been brought in, together
with a new set of geometrical cards. These were shuffled before
the sitting by Miss Silsbee, and were then put in her custody
in a closed box. Later, when instructed to do so, she placed
this box on the séance table; and when Walter had indicated
that he was finished with the contents, she put the cover on
and the covered box again remained in her charge, until opened
in due course after the séance.

Walter’s conversation was quite general, but with respect
to the experiment of the evening he said that for tonight, Mar­
gery would “make up a problem,” to which Valiantine and
Hardwicke would each give half the answer. After he had
duly worked over the contents of the box and after the séance
had ended, Margery, downstairs, asked for pencil and paper,
and at 10:05 began to write. She was particularly impressed, on
the present occasion, with the fact that this kind of writing,
after ostensible hypnotic suggestion by Walter, produces none
of the numbness of forearm and hand such as she is accustomed
to experiencing when experimenting with ordinary automatic
writing. The script produced on the present occasion consisted
of two lines of figures and words; the first line reading
“11 x 2 = ” and the second one being likewise and with equal
obviousness incomplete: “to kick a dead.” These facts were
attested by the signatures of all sitters; in view of the fact that
none of the results of the evening were in any sense diagram­
matic or pictorial, it seems unnecessary to reproduce the writ­
ings herewith.

At 10:38 the box was opened. The calendar number 11
was on top of the collection of number-sheets and geometrical
cards; next in order in the group was the geometrical card
carrying the figure X; and under this was the calendar sheet 2.
The assumption that Walter intended all three elements to
figure in the test was supported by the fact that these two
calendar sheets, and only these, were torn from the pad. It
POST-TRANCE RECORDING OF SÉANCE COGNITIONS

will be seen that a considerable bit of ingenuity has been exercised to string these three elements together, and to select three elements susceptible of such stringing, into a specific problem or statement which remain unfinished, lacking the final element. If Walter's promise given during the séance is to be made good, we shall expect the right-hand member of this equation, 22, to come through Valiantine and Hardwicke; and since half of it was promised through each of them, about the only way in which success may be visualized is through the writing of the single digit "2" by each of them.

At about 10:50 (p.m., of course, as throughout) Dr. Crandon telephoned to Hyslop House in New York, where the Valiantine sitting had been held. Mr. T. H. Pierson, Chairman of the Research Committee of the A. S. P. R., answered the telephone and reported verbally in terms confirmed by letter the next morning. Two things stand out. First, the ostensible Walter control, speaking through Valiantine at 9:40, said: "The Kid is out already," meaning that she had emerged from her trance. This, it will be seen, was correct; though it is by no means the fact that the Lime Street séances are always so far advanced at that hour. Further, between 9:57 and 9:59 Valiantine wrote as follows: "2—No one ever stops to—Walter"; in three lines, as indicated by the present punctuation.

The Hardwicke sitting in Niagara Falls was held in the presence of only two persons besides the medium. Little happened until 9:50, at which hour Dr. Hardwicke went into trance. Raising his right hand, still in contact with the left hand of his neighbor, he picked up a pencil and wrote rapidly and accurately on two of the pieces of paper in the center of the table. The substance of what he wrote was the word "horse" and
the figure "2"; but the arrangement of this script was sufficiently unusual to merit the illustration which we give it in Fig. 2. This result was telegraphed at once to Boston, the wire being received over the Lime Street telephone at 11:49 o’clock and reading: "Nine forty five H O stop R stop S E 2."

It will therefore be seen that the numerical exercise which Walter had undertaken was completed with perfect execution; Hardwicke and Valiantine each having written half the answer to the equation set down by Margery. Further, as regards the words written by the three Psychics, these can evidently be put together to make sense only in the following order: "Nobody ever stops to kick a dead horse—Walter." This sentence represents a catch phrase which Walter was in the habit of using while alive, just as today in the séance room he produces and uses such phrases (e.g., *it's a long alley that has no ash-barrel*) where they are appropriate. It is of some importance that this spontaneous subject matter, which could have been a matter of prearrangement between the mediums, was coupled in the same experiment with the elements chosen in the séance room, which could not have been pre-arranged. In the present case this séance room choice was apparently a considered one by Walter, rather than an arbitrary one made at random by a sitter; but this merely makes the episodes a little less rock-ribbed rather than in any sense vitiating it.

It is also to be noted, for future reference, that during the Lime Street séance of this date, Walter volunteered the suggestion that at some future sitting he would choose, in Lime Street and in the dark, test cards in Margery’s absence. Far from being the “red herring” of which one distinguished critic of the mediumship has complained, designed to create confusion in the minds of the sitters between promise and performance, this undertaking was actually made good within a week.

Finally, after a considerable period of time, and to cap the climax, a success was recorded in this series between Margery at Lime Street and Valiantine in Venice. The details published by Mr. Bligh Bond (Psychic Research, May, 1930) will be given in the next chapter.
CHAPTER LVIII
The Boston-Venice Cross-Correspondence

SUMMARY

PERSONNEL: Count Piero Bon and a large group sitting at his house in Venice, Italy, at 11 p.m. and the Margery group sitting at 10 Lime Street, Boston, at 5 p.m., May 27, 1929. Thus both groups sat practically at the same period in absolute time. The notes are signed by all those present.

(b) THE MATERIAL TO BE TRANSFERRED: 9 one-day calendar sheets were selected fortuitously and, unseen by the selector, marked on the back for identification and sealed in an envelope.

(c) EXPERIMENT No. 1: SITTING AT BOSTON: The room absolutely black. Margery in trance. Three of the marked calendar sheets were taken by chance from the sealed envelope by Mr. Bond and laid on the table in front of the medium. After apparent reading by Walter, Mr. Bond put them away in a separate pocket. Sitting adjourned, but all persons remained in sight of each other till 9 p.m. the same night.

(d) ADJOURNED SITTING 9 P.M. SAME NIGHT: White light, no trance, Margery writes 3-5-10. Sheets read by Walter produced from Mr. Bond’s pocket were found to be 3-5-10. Full account of sitting, written, sealed and mailed to Venice same night.

(e) SITTING AT VENICE: Valiantine in trance wrote the numbers 3-5-10. Full details of the sitting were written, sealed and mailed to Boston at once.

(f) EXPERIMENT No. 2: May 30, 1929, same groups sitting in both places, except that Valiantine is absent, two sensitives present in the Venice group received and wrote, at least eighteen times, the figures 429 or 249. These numbers turned out to be the next three numbers in the original envelope held by Mr. Bond in Boston.
(g) RESULTS ATTAINED: Thus, it appears that at the first sitting Walter cognized not only the three numbers presented to him, but the next three in the pack; and was able to transmit the second three to Venice in the absence of Valiantine, and without knowledge by any sitter at either place concerning the nature or details of this second experiment.

* * * * *

FOREWORD. Various accounts have been printed from Italian sources of the remarkable facts in the transmission of a series of numbers unknown to any of the sitters or medium, through the agency of “Walter,” Margery’s control, the numerals being in all cases correctly transmitted and recorded at the Venice sitting within a few minutes of their being read in Boston. These accounts have been published in the English periodical “Light.” They give the story as it is known by the Venice group; but the full narrative of the incident with the relation of the circumstances which led up to it, the Boston sittings and the conditions under which the messages were sent across the world—over four thousand miles of land and sea,—has yet to be chronicled. Dr. Crandon has supplied all the necessary documents in the case and we are thus in a position to tell the whole story of a test which seems unique in the annals of psychic science.

THE TWO EXPERIMENTS: The story opens with a prediction by Walter, May 2, 1929, of the arrival of a cable from Europe shortly with a proposal of certain work. Nothing happened then until May 25, 1929, when the following cable was received by Dr. Crandon of Boston from Count Piero Bon of Venice.

“Valiantine sitting Monday 9 p.m. Italian. Bon.”

This telegram came without any previous planning and was wholly unexpected.

Mr. George Valiantine is well known as one of the cross-correspondence mediums working with Margery, Hardwicke and Sary Litzelmann from time to time during the preceding year. It was apparent then that this telegram from Count Bon meant that he wanted to try a transatlantic transmission of some sort.
A telegram by cable was immediately sent back to Count Bon to this effect:

"You sit 11 p.m. Italian time. Crandon."

This change from the time suggested by Count Bon was in order to make a reasonable sitting time, namely 5 p.m. in Boston. At the sitting 5 p.m. May 27, 1929, at 10 Lime Street, Boston, there were (clock-wise) Dr. Mark W. Richardson, Mr. Grandi, Mrs. Grandi, Mrs. Alfred W. Gray, Mr. Fred Adler, Mrs. Richardson, Mr. Bligh Bond, Dr. Crandon. Behind the circle were Mr. Nagouchi and Mrs. Gray, who later took her place in the circle. It was estimated that 5 p.m. in Boston was about 11 p.m. in Venice.

5:07 p.m. Sitters assembled. Dr. Crandon and Dr. Richardson controlled the hands of the medium. This control was maintained throughout the sitting. Dr. Crandon’s right hand was placed upon Mr. Bond’s knee and there remained without interruption. Mr. Bond acted as the recorder and held the material for the test. This consisted of a small bunch of one-day sheets nine in number, from a desk calendar. The sheets had been abstracted from the calendar (a loose-leaf one) by Mr. Bond who took them individually face downwards, so as not to see their dates, and marked each one in ink on the back for identification before placing them within an envelope. This envelope he sealed and placed in his breast-pocket. Mr. Bligh Bond testifies that he had only seen the backs of the leaves and was entirely without knowledge of any one of the numbers on their faces. This record was made by him on Tuesday May 28, 1929, the day following the sitting.

5:09 p.m. There ensued a two-minute discussion between the sitters on the subject of technicalities of procedure with the idea of obviating any charge by hostile critics as to "crowd-telepathy."

5:11 p.m. The medium went into trance and Walter’s voice was heard in comment upon this point. He recommended that Mr. Bond should hold the leaves, which might be cognized by Walter unseen by anyone present until 9 p.m., Boston time, when everyone in Venice would be in bed.

Walter greeted and joked with his sitters. After a short interval of silence, during which he appears to have paid a flying visit to Venice, he was heard to say "I can’t understand a word they are saying over there. It’s as hot as h—l."

5:15 p.m. (about). Walter instructed Mr. Bligh Bond to take one of the leaves from his envelope and place it on the table. Mr. Bond opened his sealed envelope in the dark and felt for one leaf, which he took at random from the nine enclosed. This he
placed upon the table just in front of the medium. (N.B. Absolute
darkness was maintained during the sitting.)

Walter chatted with Mrs. Gray (a cousin of his family) promising
her an "apport" sometime. Dr. Crandon asked him to visualize
Zattere 559, Count Bon's house in Venice. Walter gave his
impressions of the Venice group, speaking of one of the sitters as
having something to do (professionally) with "nerves" ("Dr. C." a
neurologist?). Walter described him as a fat man who chewed
his lip as if he himself were nervous. Walter remarked that he
would get something across in Italy.

5:19 P.M. At Walter's direction Mr. Bond took back the first
of the calendar leaves, Walter having apparently read it, and
handed up fortuitously a second leaf, which he laid on the table-top.

5:20 P.M. At Mr. Bond's request, Walter gave the time as
5:20. He then left the circle for about one minute.

5:22 P.M. (about.) At Walter's instruction, Mr. Bond took
the second leaf, as if read, from the table and replaced it in his
pocket with the first, keeping them in separate series from the
rest, in his waistcoat pocket. Walter remarked that one leaf had
fallen on the floor. Mr. Bond groped for this without success.
He then asked Walter if he were ready to take the third leaf,
and he laid this on the table.

Walter: "Isn't he a slavedriver! Take his tea away from
him or I'll make him throw it up." (This is a delicate allusion
to the cup of tea which Mr. Bond, English fashion, had had before
the sitting.) At this point strong breezes were felt by most of
the sitters. A heavy slamming as of a door outside was heard
by all, and was commented upon. Walter admitted that it was
his doing saying "Yes, there was too much light"; then, in response
to some remark "My goodness, are you deaf?" followed by a
loud bang, as if the table had been struck by some hard and heavy
object.

Walter now requested Mr. Bond to take back the third sheet
and to place it in his waistcoat pocket with the other two. He
desired that Mrs. Gray should enter the circle. Walter said "I
have an X-ray shot for you." He sent a strong current of energy
across the circle to Mrs. Gray and this was felt by several sitters
as a brisk current of air such as might be produced by a fan.

Walter declared that John Richardson (one of his regular
helpers) was over in Italy upon his work. Dr. Crandon questioned
Walter as to his prediction of the business to be arranged and
asked if it referred to this. Walter said "Yes, we'd known of
it for days." Mr. Bond said he had recorded the prediction as
made on May 2nd.

Walter: "Yes, and there's another coming. This is only a
trial tonight and their horse is winded—spavined."

Mr. Bligh Bond: "Walter, there has been an outburst of
bell-ringing at our Pride's Crossing house. Can you tell me any-
thing about it?"
Walter: "Yes, the house is haunted." Walter declined to say more and added: "Now I want you people to stay together for half an hour: and don't you make a date. Leave it to me. Now I'm going. Good night!"

Four raps were heard, this being the recognized signal for the conclusion of a sitting. The time taken as 5:45. This synchronizes exactly with the time at which the luminous clock was lifted and shown to each sitter in Venice, indicating the time there as 11:45 p.m.

The sitters at Boston remained together as instructed for the space of half an hour. As soon as the red light was turned on, Mrs. Richardson found two calendar leaves upon the floor lying where Mr. Bond had inadvertently dropped them. She took charge of them. Mrs. Richardson remained close by Mr. Bond from this moment until all were assembled in the library on the floor below, so that she is able to affirm definitely that there was no interval during which the papers held by him could have been referred or their content communicated to the medium or to any other person present. The three leaves read by Walter remained undisturbed in Mr. Bond's pocket until Margery had written out their numbers at the subsequent sitting the same night in the book-room in white light.

**Record of Later Sitting of May 27**

At 9 p.m. all sitters present in the library whither they had adjourned after the interval prescribed by Walter. Margery was seated at a small table, provided with pencil and paper, and in full light wrote, as follows, a message signed by Walter's initials, W. S. S.

"Sitting: Venice—Valiantine very subdued, without spats; much chattering; no silence; I think, Lord's Prayer, anyhow, everyone looks kindly except Count Bon, whose moustache bristles; much more gibberish; kindly thoughts. I do not understand; much more talk; finally Valiantine throws Italian fit; keeps well in fit, as I direct. Writes: 3-5-10.

All is over. Much food and drink. Valiantine resumes spats and rows home! More later. Next sitting Thursday night. W. S. S."

(Finished at 9:05 p.m.)
The three calendar sheets were taken by Mr. Bond from his waistcoat pocket and inspected by all present. They proved to be a 3, a 5 and a 10, viz., Sunday 5th May; Friday 3rd May and Friday 10th May. Each bore on its back the signature of Mr. Bond written prior to the experiment.

Four further calendar sheets remained undisturbed in the envelope in which Mr. Bond had originally placed them, in the interior pocket of his coat. They were not exhibited to any sitter and since they were not used, they attracted no attention.

**Letter: Boston to Venice**

Here follows the exact text of the letter sent by the Margery-Boston group to the Bon-Venice group.

10 Lime Street, Boston, Mass. May 27, 1929.

"At the sitting held at 10 Lime Street, Boston, Mass., at 5:11 P.M. (daylight saving) on the 27th May, 1929, in absolute darkness from start to finish, the above three sheets from a Desk Calendar, numbered 3, 5 & 10, were chosen by Mr. F. Bligh Bond fortuitously from a total of nine such sheets whose numbers were not known to him, and were handed in the dark by Mr. Bond to ‘Walter’ one by one, at his request, and then returned to Mr. Bond who held them unseen by himself or any other person until 9:05 P.M.

Margery sat in bright light for the writing, but was securely blind-folded, and she completed the script at 9:05 P.M. These three selected numbers were then produced by Mr. Bond from his envelope and were found to be correct.

Each numbered sheet has Mr. Bond’s private mark on back (attached by him before the experiments). The other six sheets not selected were then found to be 2-4-9-13-22 and 24. Each of the sheets were found to have Mr. Bond’s mark of identification."

(Signed) Josephine L. Richardson
Mark W. Richardson
J. Fred Adler
Frances N. Gray
L. R. G. Crandon
Fred Bligh Bond

**Summary of Letters: Venice to Boston**

The full account of this is printed in “Luce e Ombra” for August, 1929, p. 337, by Count Bon, under the title “un esperi-
mento di comunicazionale mediante attraverso l'Atlantico.'"
It records that the sitting of May 27th opened at his house at 9:30, there being present Mrs. B. Vais-Arrib of Venice; Commander S. Bellavits of Rome; Mrs. Kelley-Hack of New York; Mr. Oscar Cosma of Venice; Mrs. Dennis Bradley of London; Capt. G. Rodano; Admiral Z--; Signora Valle of Venice and Count Bon. Three others sat in an adjoining room curtained off. George Valiantine was seated in the center of the circle. Direct voice phenomena were continuous until about 11 P.M. at which time the commencement of the cross-correspondences was due to start by arrangement with Dr. Crandon. A shrill whistle announced the presence of Walter. His manifestation outside his own Boston circle is a novelty. A luminous clock which had been placed in the center of the circle at the request of the control "Cristo d'Angelo" was carried around the circle and shown to each sitter the time being noted as 11:45 P.M. The sitters heard the sound of the mechanism which controlled the hands, and it was shown again with the time altered to 11:15 P.M. Valiantine asked that the red light might be turned on and after a brief interval, walked from his chair to a small table on which paper and pencil had been placed. He then asked for the blue light instead of the red one and when this was done, he wrote upon the paper the three numbers 3, 5, 10 repeating each two or three times. These he handed to Dr. Bon. The sitting then closed, on the stroke of twelve. The sitters then partook of refreshments (see remarks of Walter already recorded).

Events at Boston May 28th (Tuesday) and Following Days

On May 28th Dr. Crandon cabled to Venice as follows:

"Kindly arrange second séance Thursday, May 30th, at same time. Record accurately time of each event. Mail report immediately. We do same. Yesterday's results apparently perfect."

A second sitting of the same group which sat on the 27th May had been planned to take place on the evening of May 30th to synchronize with that of Count Bon. But about noon on
that day Margery felt the impulse to write automatically and her hand wrote the following:

"Do not sit until six o'clock. Lines of communication poor. No cross-test needed. Sit only four persons—hour only.

"Walter in Europe trying lines of communication. Will only send word O. K. from Valiantine. Want force. Only Dudley, Father: No women to sit. (Signed) M. R.—(this means Mark Richardson, Walter's helper, Dr. Richardson's son.)

"This is Mark writing. Walter says: 'Four men sitters.' He will explain later on, I think. I will find out and write it later on—Walter says Mr. Adler will do. He just wants the energy from the room and the medium. He says 'Cheerio,—big things will happen soon'."

Promptly at 6 P.M. (Boston time) Dr. Richardson, Mr. Dudley, Mr. Adler, Dr. Crandon and the psychic sat. The room was entirely dark. Young Mark Richardson quickly made his presence known by raps. He said that Walter was in Venice and that we were sitting merely to transmit the energy stored in the room, to uses of the experiment. At a certain moment Dr. Richardson, despite the blackness of the room had the impression of the rapid transit of a still blacker mass in front of his eyes. This was immediately followed by the "Walter" voice saying: "You certainly look like a nest of foreigners." This probably referred to the fact that the men were all in their shirtsleeves. The sitting closed at 6:22 P.M., no apparent phenomena having taken place.

We now turn to events at Venice. Following the receipt of Dr. Crandon's cablegram, it had been arranged that the Venice circle should meet on the evening of the 30th. But, most unfortunately, their medium, George Valiantine, had to leave Venice and could not be present at the test. Walter, it appears, had become aware of this and of the difficulty it would create for him; hence the impressing of Margery to write that the "lines of communication were poor" and that extra power would be needed. Note also that he suggested that there would be no cross-test required. It seems that he had already acquired the material for his purpose; but this no one suspected or could have suspected. Yet out of an apparently irrelevant or immaterial circumstance he succeeded in producing a success even more impressive than the first, and under disadvantage of having to find a new channel of communication through the absence of George Valiantine.
Valiantine had left Venice at 7 P.M. Dr. Bon’s group sat at 9:30 P.M. at his house. Mrs. Kelley-Hack sat on his right and Signora Valle on his left. The sitters included Contessine Bona Bon, Signor Rodono, Contessine Nora Bon, Signor Curti, and Commander Bellavista. Miss Valle went into partial trance, becoming clairaudient and writing what she heard. It was to counsel patience, “as the forces were good.” Mrs. Kelley-Hack spoke of a feeling of tremendous force being exercised upon her. She was provided with a pad and pencil and began to write occasionally when impressed to do so between 10:30 and 11:30 P.M. She received a number of fragmentary sentences in automatic script; and then words and numbers; the numerals repeated again and again, and always the same three—namely, 4. 2. 9.

These numerals were reiterated a score of times, interspersed with the words “Carry on! carry on”—written excitedly. This conveyed nothing to the sitters, some of whom were impatient and remarked that nothing would come of it, etc., etc. Mrs. Hack then explained to her guides that Valiantine had been obliged to leave, and she asked them to try if possible to impress her with something if Walter should come. Then she again got:


“We are coming” (this was her guides’ usual sign when bringing in any entity).

“The current is better—carry on—listen 429 (written large) 429—429—Let this stand. It may be right. Tell the Count to turn on the red light” (this was the sign made to betoken the coming of someone).

“Walter is coming—429—They are making an effort—America—Margery has gone into trance—writing—we shall try to hear.” Mrs. Hack again explained Valiantine’s departure and asked that some impression might be given her even if Walter should be unable to speak by direct voice. She then got:

Walter—249—249. Here there was a change in “current” and the guide wrote in Italian “Cristo d’Angelo vole parlare ma non a fuerze—quiste prediction—nota—. (Cristo d’Angelo wants to speak but has not the power. This is prediction. Note (it).)” The red light was turned up, and Signora Valle recorded impression received by her from Count Bon’s guide “Nonna” whilst in light trance. Nonna had said repeatedly “Wait—wait—the forces are good.” This she wrote, finishing a few minutes after 11 P.M.

The sitting was suspended at 11:30, and then an attempt was made to obtain further information by the use of a glass moving over letters on a large sheet of paper. The result confirmed the claim that the numbers had been transmitted from Boston. Nonna said she was about all the time and that three numbers had been transmitted but in answer to Count Bon’s question as to whether
Walter had suggested these numbers, she said "No," and that they had been transmitted by her force. Count Bon asked who sent them, since Walter did not come from America? Was it Margery? Nonna gave the reply "You say truth." Mrs. Hack observes at the end of her report of this sitting that it is unlikely that the numbers are correct, but she was strongly impressed with the force exercised and the effort made. Count Bon says in his report "I confess that we were all, including Mrs. Hack, a little sceptical as to the results of the automatic writing." It was, he says, with a natural uneasiness that the cabled report from Boston which would indicate the outcome of the test was awaited by them. And of course when it came, it merely reported what Margery had got on the afternoon of that day with the directions for the sitting "for force" only.

It may be as well to interpose here a few remarks upon Walter's movements and activities during the progress of the work recorded. As we have seen, the Venice record of May 30th gives the expectation of Walter's coming in person; but when the question is put to Nonna, she implies that Walter did not transmit the numbers himself and leaves it an open question how far the mechanism of transmission was due to his personal effort at the moment in the direction perhaps of the forces employed. Mrs. Hack, writing to Dr. and Mrs. Cran-don on the first of June speaks of her amazement at hearing the direct voice of Walter in the Valaintine sittings (date not specified) with greetings and news of Margery. She also says it was Walter who regulated the hands of the clock and carried it around the circle. It is clear that she refers to the sitting of May 30th. And she says that all the group are in fullest accord as to the phenomenon of Walter's voice, which was full, strong and natural. But even so, it is not necessary to suppose that he was present because he has often hinted at a possibility, or even an actuality of some process of "relaying" his communications in a manner analogous to the radio. This point emerged in the automatic writing obtained by Margery at sittings some months before. Here Walter spontaneously said that he was relaying for Johannes, the monk of Glastonbury, and the writing of Johannes came through in the cramped style
of caligraphy which was characteristic of Johannes and utterly unlike Walter’s style.

Walter, we may suppose, is busy with his lines of communication, but without any great stretch of imagination it may be conceived that he has power to use those lines without the effort of traveling always to the scene of operations. Let us consider what Walter said to Mr. Dudley at a sitting held in Boston shortly after these events. (The present writer was not present.) In response to questions, says Mr. Dudley, Walter said “I put the second lot of numbers across before the séance was held here. I had used up all my energy and couldn’t get back until you had a sitting. I didn’t have the energy. Mark wrote the instructions for the sitting. I didn’t come back here at all between the first and second séances.” He also stated that he had not signed his name at the second Venice test. “Therefore,” remarks Mr. Dudley, “it seems clear that he merely succeeded in getting over the numbers—a sufficiently remarkable feat in itself.”

It may be reasonable to suppose Walter presiding over the general process of transmission and controlling his subordinates at either end of the lines of communication which he describes as having been laid down.

There is another point I would like to take up before proceeding to the end of the story. It refers to the interval of time which is found to elapse between the transmission of the numbers from the Boston end and their reception at Venice. It is a matter of a few minutes, as it seems to have been in the earlier experiments between Boston, New York and Buffalo. And Walter declares that the time absorbed in transmission is not taken in traversing the lines of communication, but in getting the numbers into the brain of the recipient.

The sequel to Mrs. Kelley-Hack’s persistent impression of the number series 4, 2, 9, and later 2, 4, 9, remains now to be told. First however come a few items occurring in the interval of time between the sittings of May 30 and the receipt of the attested records from Venice.
On June 1st a cable was despatched from Count Bon which reads as follows:

"Monday Walter magnificent work. Valaintine got numbers. Leaving Thursday. Same evening we got numbers. Letter follows."

There had been a further sitting held at Lime Street on the evening of May 31st at which the following sitters were present. (Clockwise) Medium: Judge Gray (controlling left); Dr. Richardson; Mrs. Richardson; Mr. Dudley; Mr. Bligh Bond; Mrs. Gray; Dr. Crandon (controlling light).

8:58 p.m. Lights out. Room effectively darkened and temperature more moderate than had been the case for the past few days.

9 p.m. Psychic breezes felt. Walter spoke. "What are you people doing here?" Dr. Crandon said "Have you any news? Is Venice all right?"

Walter: "I have had a terrible time but everything is all right. You leave it to me." (To Mrs. Gray): "Now about that 'apport' for you, cousin. I have been searching for three weeks for this old thing. I said it would be a bicycle tire; but it's flat, and as old as the centuries. Cousin, you're a perfectly well woman as well as a horse—and not a spavined one either!"

Judge G.: "Walter, we don't know how to thank you for what you have done."

Walter: "Don't thank me. It has been all in my line of duty, as it was with Dr. Richardson.* Look at him; he's quite frisky now. Now, you wait till you see what I have brought you. Your mother helped me to get it. She stole it for me. She's a fine stealer. But it ain't here yet."

Dr. C.: "Walter, can you tell us what the room in Venice was like?"

Walter: "Oh, just a large bare room with a table—a big table in the middle. I think they had some gas lights. Chief, will you please fetch the doughnut?" (luminous paper ring).

(Here Dr. Richardson left the room and returned with the illuminated doughnut, which he placed on the table with the duller side upward.)

Walter: "Now please relax. I'm going away for a little while."

Verification of the Numbers 2. 4. 9. Obtained by Mrs. Hack

Subsequently to the sitting at Boston of the 27th of May, at which, it will be remembered, the three numbers 3. 5. and 10.

* Dr. Richardson had gone through a critical illness and operation with notable celerity and success.
were successfully read by Walter, recorded by the hand of Margery, and transmitted to Venice correctly, the remainder of the calendar leaves, six in all, were held in part by Mrs. Richardson who had picked two which had fallen to the floor during the séance, and the rest by Mr. Bligh Bond. All six were subsequently collected by Mr. Bond and it is certain that none of them were seen by the medium. For purpose of record, Mr. Bond gave Dr. Crandon a memorandum of the numbers they exhibited. The whole series ran thus, in the order as noted at the time.

3. 5. 10. 2. 4. 9. 13. 22. 24.

It was just as a detail of record, and not with the least idea or expectation that any further test might come of this, that Mr. Bond brought these additional numbers to the attention of Dr. Crandon. With the departure of Valiantine the episode was thought to be closed. But on receipt of the intelligence from Venice as to the further sitting and Mrs. Kelley-Hack’s curious impressions, Dr. Crandon bethought him of the note made as to the additional numbers. (See the record attested by sitters after the meeting.) Mrs. Richardson presumably may have noted the numbers on the two which she picked up from the floor; but it is doubtful whether she would have regarded these as being of any importance after the event. They finally were returned to Mr. Bond who replaced them in his envelope with the rest and there they remained. But on the arrival of the further news from Venice, Dr. Crandon discovered that the numbers obtained by her were actually those of the three next unused leaves, recorded by Mr. Bond in the order 2. 4. 9., etc.

And to balance his satisfaction, Count Bon, who had experienced a severe sense of disillusionment on receipt of the first intelligence of the sitting of the 30th of May at Boston—which of course, contributed nothing as an endorsement of Mrs. Hack’s experience—was more than pleased to learn from the letter subsequently received from Dr. Crandon, that—to quote Count
Bon's own words—Walter had succeeded in transmitting six of these nine numbers, in two groups of three. He says "Walter, therefore, without those in Boston having the least idea of it . . . which gives the experiment a very much greater significance—had transmitted to us in Venice at our second sitting, three other of the numbers previously provided at Boston at the former sitting."
CHAPTER LIX

Cross Correspondences. Transmitted matter selected in absence of all mediums.

We now return to an important modification in experimental procedure—namely thought-transference of material cognized in the séance room at Lime Street—Margery being absent. As a beginning let us return to the experiment of January 29, 1928, where Walter by two raps in the séance room (Margery having gone down stairs) indicated the chosen number to be written by Margery in the book room on the second floor.

EXPERIMENT OF JANUARY 29, 1928

This sitting began at 9:00 o'clock, and there were present, in clockwise order as named: Margery, Dr. Brown, Mrs. Anna Moody, of New York, Mr. J. H. Brown, Mr. Adler, Mr. Ernest A. Moody (Mrs. Moody's son), Mrs. E. W. Brown, Dr. Crandon. To eliminate all possibility of knowledge as to the positions of the numbers, Mr. Moody shuffled the thirty-one loosened calendar sheets, not only before the sitting but again in the dark after the sitting had commenced. The record was also improved, indicating more satisfactorily than in any previous experiment exactly what happened to the ensemble of sheets at the critical moment of séance-room selection. Finally Dr. Crandon was eliminated from the upstairs post-séance portion of the experiment, the two sitters remaining in the séance-room being Dr. Brown and Mr. Brown. As before, of course, each held the other's hands. Under all these tightened conditions the following record was attained:

"At 9:28 the words: 'I will write 2' were written automatically by Margery in the bookroom. At 9:29 Dr. E. W. Brown and Mr. J. H. Brown, sitting together with no one else present, in the dark séance-room up two flights, heard two raps on the table.

"During the sitting, Walter picked out a calendar number in the dark, and handed to Mr. Ernest A. Moody the shuffled pack 777"
of thirty-one sheets, with his selected number on top. Mr. Moody put the pack in his pocket with this number on top. The numbers had been shuffled before the séance by Mr. Moody, and this fact was not known to Margery.

"After the two announcements of the number '2' were made as above, Mr. Moody produced the number-pack and the top number was '2'"

(Signed) L. R. G. CRANDON
E. W. BROWN
ERNEST A. MOODY
ANNA MOODY
J. H. BROWN
J. FRED ADLER

With this experiment as a basis Walter proposed that Margery's presence in the séance room be dispensed with; that she, like other mediums should sit at a distance, and should like them receive impressions, presumably hypnotically, as to events or material, under consideration at Lime Street. After considerable preliminary work a perfect experiment of this type was carried out as follows, on February 25, 1928. Walter's directions were that employees of Mr. Fife were to provide a pack of cards with a word on each in large letters. Each card was to be made up by a separate man, given to Mr. Fife in a sealed envelope, and these envelopes turned over to Mr. Dudley by Mr. Fife; the net result of this manipulation being that no living person would know the contents of more than one of the envelopes. The clerks who made up the cards were of course in total ignorance of their intended purpose; they simply carried out blindly their superior's instructions. In the dark séance room Dudley was to shuffle the cards from the envelopes; Mr. Fife was to select one at random; and this was to be handed at once to Mrs. Richardson, who was to place it away in her pocket book. All this was to be done in the séance-room in Margery's absence, the "sitters" including Mrs. Richardson, Dr. Brown, Mr. Dudley and Mr. Fife. They were instructed by Walter to form a circle, with Dudley facing the cabinet, Brown on its left and Mr. Fife on its right. "Don't get excited if you don't get it through this time; we may have to try again."
While all this was going on in Lime Street, Margery was instructed to sit at some other house with Drs. Richardson and Crandon and as many others as cared to come, all in bright light. The card in Mrs. Richardson's possession was not to be looked at until both New York and Niagara Falls had been heard from.

Experiment of February 25, 1928

The mediumless sitting held in Lime Street in accordance with the above instructions, on February 25th, may be described here first. The notes of this sitting are by Mr. Dudley. No one was in the cabinet. The table was turned at right angles to its usual position, and a complete circle formed about it; Dr. Brown at the west (at the left of the imaginary medium in the cabinet), then in clockwise order Mr. Dudley, Mrs. Richardson and Mr. Fife. Mr. Fife and the Doctor were easily able to clasp hands across the narrow end of the table where this abutted the empty cabinet; this was the reason for reversing its usual position. The box brought by Mr. Fife and, in the properly cautious words of Mr. Dudley's record, "said by him to contain" twelve cards with printed names thereon, and some with pictures as well, was placed on the table. Mrs. Richardson's leather pocket book was carefully searched before the sitting by Messrs. Fife and Brown; and in addition, Mr. Fife testified, after the sitting, that prior to distributing the blank cards among his employees, he had placed secret marks upon them of such sort as to render them absolutely identifiable. Explanation of a successful outcome through the alleged confederacy of Mrs. Richardson by means of substituting a previously prepared card, known to the medium, is thus ruled out.

All the motions of a regular séance were faithfully performed. The lights were extinguished and the victrola started. After about five minutes the victrola stopped and Fife tried in vain to get it running again. While he worked over it the circle was closed by contact between Dr. Brown and Mrs. Richardson; and Dr. Brown here noted that whereas his right hand
was warm when in contact with Fife's left hand, it was decidedly cold when in contact with Mrs. Richardson's. His left hand, in contact with Dudley's right, had felt cold from the beginning.

Fife returned to the circle after about two minutes; and in about three minutes more, Dudley broke the circle but not the control while he picked up the box, shook it thoroughly, opened the cover, and presented it to Fife who drew one card. All this of course was in total darkness. The box was then closed and placed by Dudley against the right side of his chair, in such manner as to remain continuously under his control, and closed.

Fife then said he was holding the card between his thumb and finger in vertical position. After about five seconds he turned it over and held it in the new position for about six seconds, both times in the vicinity of the center of the table. He had drawn the card from the box with his left hand, his right hand being continuously under Brown's control. Fife then passed the card to Mrs. Richardson, who, in taking it, felt something pasted on one side of it. Without exploring the surface more than was necessary to discover that this was the right side, she held it with this side up and approximately in the center of the table for some six or seven minutes. Just as she was about to put it away in her pocket book the three other sitters heard a slight sound like a whisper or an attempt to whistle; after which, almost at once, all four sitters heard seven distinct raps, uniformly spaced about one-half to three-quarters second apart and apparently originating within the cabinet. These raps were of peculiar quality, not like a finger or fingernail, but rather resembling minute explosions. They were perfectly clear and sufficiently loud for all to hear. To Mrs. Richardson and Dudley they appeared to come from a point near the northeast corner of the table; Brown placed them further in the cabinet but in the same general direction; to Fife they seemed in the cabinet but to the west. Subsequent experiments showed that if they had occurred on the right arm of the chair usually occupied by the medium, they would have led to approximately the above reports from these four sitters, seated as
they were here; and no other locus was found of which this was true.

Mrs. Richardson put the card away in her pocket book immediately after these raps were heard. All the sitters agreed that the raps were seven in number. Less than ten minutes later the clock struck 9:30.

The sitting was continued until ten o'clock without further incident; at which time the red light was turned on, the positions of chair and table were noted, and Brown took charge of the box while Mrs. Richardson retained control of her pocket book as she had throughout the sitting. All four then went downstairs to the bookroom. The séance-room door was locked by Brown at the start of the sitting and remained locked throughout.

So much for the events in Lime Street. Dr. Richardson, Dr. Crandon, Margery, Mr. Litzelmann, Mr. Adler and Miss Harriet Richardson left 10 Lime Street by motor at approximately 8:30. During this interval they went to the Richardson residence in Newton Centre, sat, and drove back to Boston. Their sitting started at 9:00 o'clock, and they sat in bright white light, not in the conventional circle, Miss Marian Richardson being added to the sitters just enumerated. Margery had a pencil in her hand and a pad before her. At 9:25 her writing hand became cold, both subjectively and objectively. At 9:46 she felt impelled to ask Dr. Richardson for his watch. It was one with closed case and she rejected it. Mr. Litzelmann offered his, with open case; Margery said she liked it better but it wasn't right.

At 9:48 she began to draw what looked like the face of a watch. There were no letters on it, but a lot of small circles in two layers inside the edge, and the hands were placed at 2:55 or 11:15, no choice between these two readings being possible because of the failure to discriminate between their lengths. She did not put the usual ring on the stem. The pencil then began to go around and around the periphery of the "watch," and finally stopped. Mr. Adler remarked that we should have
counted the number of times the pencil went around; whereupon it repeated the performance, making seven circuits. Margery then wrote "T H" in large (not capital) letters under the watch; the finished drawing (without the annexed script) being as indicated in Fig. 3.

At 9:54 this first sheet was torn off the block of paper by Margery, and she began to write on the second sheet. The finished script here was found to read:

"This is confidential. All is not time that titters. W. S. S. 4 You will put this away and produce it later when things are settled. You will understand."

At 9:57½ she went back to the first sheet and wrote "7 raps"; then at 9:58 she returned to the second sheet and wrote the same addendum on it. This closed the Newton Centre séance.

Although the box was not opened in Lime Street until after New York had reported, it seems best to describe its contents now. Before it was opened and after the return of the party from Newton Centre, of course, the two groups compared notes. The Lime Street group told their experiences first, announcing the seven raps which they had heard, etc. Margery's sheets

4 Walter S. Stinson.
or in part and in its more essential features to Margery, eight miles from the original; to Valiantine 240 miles away; and to Hardwicke 500 miles away. With reference to the accompanying word, the number of letters therein became known to some entity at Lime Street who was able to give audible expression of his knowledge; and also to Margery. The word itself, when an attempt was made to reproduce it piece-meal in the three séance-rooms, was given with complete success so far as Valiantine's and Margery's fractions were concerned; and Hardwicke spoke a word having the same fundamental consonant value as the syllable which he should have given.

The "Golfskor" is a newly developed mechanism for keeping track of the hole-by-hole golf score and the total for the round. It has a series of 18 small openings in the face, in each of which the hole score is shown, a pointer travelling around the edge of the dial to show which hole is in play, and three holes on a horizontal line across the center of the dial. The cut used is shaded and is a coarse half-tone. It is so difficult to decipher that even in a strong light one would, at first glance, tend to describe the picture as that of a watch with the hands pointing to 2:55 or to 8:55. The black pointer near the edge of the dial and the line of holes across the center, together with certain shadow effects, have a strong tendency to create this illusion. If the time is indicated at 2:55 the angle would be "oblique." (See Hardwicke's telegram.) The entire cut has
had to be retouched for reproduction here, and so looks better than on the cutting used in the séance room.

Margery’s drawing of this device shows quite clearly that it is not exactly like a watch and it is such a well executed drawing that one would naturally expect to see the details such as hour figures and second-hand, on the drawing. Instead we find the series of loops representing the 18 holes, no second-hand, a heavy stem but no ring. All this, taken in connection with the phrase, “All is not time that titters,” and the information that, “when things are settled you will understand,” seems to indicate that Walter knew that this was not a watch but was some sort of a counter. This “Golfskor” is a very recent development and no one in the group had seen one although several had seen cuts and descriptions. It was several minutes before anyone recognized it in the cut. Perhaps a part of this delay as well as part of the mediumistic tendency to draw it as a watch was due to the juxtaposition of the word “Waltham” which is so readily associated with the idea of watches.

Careful study of this experiment brings out sharply the fact that the component parts of the so-called Walter-Margery entity have become widely separated, so much so, in fact, that Walter practically stands on his own feet. Let us sketch briefly the details:

1. Walter plans the experiment.
2. At Lime Street in Margery’s absence Walter sees in the dark one of a dozen cards chosen at random and whose character is unknown to any person concerned in the experiment. By raps he indicates not only his physical presence in the séance-room but also the correct number of letters in the word—Waltham.
3. Like the skillful ringmaster at the circus Walter then impresses coincidently the idea of a Waltham watchlike instrument upon three different mediums (a) Margery (unentranced), 8 miles away; (b) Valiantine 240 miles away and (c) Hardwicke (entranced) 500 miles away. In other words Margery has been removed from any participation as an agent or sender,
of writing from Newton Centre were then displayed; and in due time Mrs. Richardson took from her bag the card that had been selected in the dark by Mr. Fife. This card had pasted on it a cutting of what first appeared to be a watch, but turned out to be a new watch-like device for keeping golf scores. It had no ring on its handle. Some of the little dials were blacker than others, giving the rough general appearance of hands in the 2:55 position when viewed from a distance.

![FIG. 4.](image)

Under the figure was pasted the complete word Waltham. The reader may refer to Fig. 4 for an exact representation. The other cards were examined, and none were in any sense duplicates of this one.

It will be seen that Margery has given a satisfactory reproduction of the material on the card, so far as the pictorial element is concerned; and that in the letters "TH" she has given her approximate fair third of the word beneath. If the entire experiment is to be carried to a successful end in this spirit we shall hope that Valantine and Hardwicke will each produce a recognizable sketch of the scorer, and that one will
write "WAL" while the other will complete the word with "AM." We shall also hope that each of them will write "seven raps" or give some other indication of the association between the number seven and the Lime Street part of the sitting; though this factor being susceptible of pre-arrangement if we waive the question of how the raps were produced during the séance, and ignore the coincidence between the number of the raps and of the letters in "Waltham," is not so important as the others.

At about 10:55 a telephone message was received from Hyslop House, Mrs. Cannon speaking. She said in effect that Valiantine had written the letters "WAL" and below them had drawn the face of a watch with hands about 9:55. (See Fig. 5.) She made the further and very significant report that Walter, speaking through Valiantine, had said: "I'm having the very devil of a time with Hardwicke."

At about 11:30 a telegram was telephoned in to Lime Street, from Dr. Hardwicke at Niagara Falls. It read as follows, correcting the operator's error in spelling the word oblique: "Circle enclosing oblique angle. Word MINE." It developed later that the word had been spoken rather than written, with Hardwicke in trance. His drawing is reproduced in Fig. 6.

It thus appears that a drawing selected at random and normally unknown to any living person became known in whole
CROSS CORRESPONDENCES

and has become, like the other two mediums, simply a recipient of impressions. Her impressions are, to be sure, more accurate than those of the other two mediums but they are similar in type.

In this connection it is interesting to note that Walter complained a little about the "Golfskor." It looked like a watch and had "Waltham" under it. Therefore, in his desire for speed he had transmitted the idea of a watch to New York and Niagara Falls before he noted his mistake. It was then too late, the result being "watch" impressions by Valiantine and Hardwicke. Very apropos is Walter's remark through Margery, "All is not time that titters."

If, now, on the other hand we insist upon Margery's active participation in this cross-correspondence we must postulate that (a) Margery-Walter, with no trance immediate or preceding, and with no consciousness of the condition, becomes "traveling-clairvoyant" to Lime Street, (b) sees in the dark the card chosen by Mr. Fife and (c) still without conscious effort by the normal waking Margery transmits portions of the inscription on the chosen card telepathically to Valiantine in New York and Hardwicke in Niagara Falls. This seems to me a more difficult explanation than the alternative, and one involving more assumptions and more dangerous ones. And certainly if we look at the present experiment from the viewpoint of any hypothesis of fraud, the difficulty of maintaining such a hypothesis becomes greater than in any previous performance by Walter. We have real hopes that skeptics who have found themselves unconvinced by any of the physical phenomena may regard this and the ensuing demonstrations as impossible of inclusion in the picture of fraud, and as therefore necessarily genuine.

A second experiment of this type and one, if possible, more brilliant in execution follows:

EXPERIMENT OF MARCH 3, 1928

This experiment was carried through under conditions practically identical with those of February 25, 1928, there being
four groups concerned: (1) at 10 Lime Street, Boston, with no medium; (2) at 70 Chestnut Street, Boston, with Margery present but without trance; (3) with Valiantine in New York (trance); (4) with Hardwicke in Niagara Falls (trance).

In Lime Street, about 9 P.M. the following committee went up to the usual séance-room: Mr. Fife, Mr. J. H. Brown, Mr. Dudley, Mrs. Richardson, Mr. A. R. Crawford (Chicago University), Dr. E. W. Brown. They made a complete circle, Fife and Dr. Brown being adjacent to the east and west wings of the cabinet. *There was no medium present.* The door was closed and locked by Dr. Brown. The lights were out and the phonograph going, as for a séance.

Mr. Fife had brought a new collection of cards which had been prepared at his establishment, individual clerks having each pasted a single advertisement on a separate card. The cards were then put into a box at the Head Clerk's office, not looked at by him, and then delivered, sealed, to Mr. Fife. Mr. Fife handed the box to Mr. J. H. Brown who kept it in his hands, in sight of all, till the committee entered the séance-room. No one person, therefore, in the world knew all the cards in the box, and the only person to know a particular card was the one who had made it. In each instance, that one person was an unknown clerk, who had no knowledge as to the purpose for which the card was made. The notes of the sitting were drawn by Mr. Dudley.

J. H. Brown had charge of the box of cards. He removed the paper covering just before the lights were turned off and then sat with the covered box on his knees. The circle was formed and almost at once the right hands of J. H. B., E. B. and D. felt cold. This was followed by reports of "cold breezes" from the cabinet by Fife and E. B.

At approximately 9:10 J. H. B. shook the box in order to mix the cards, removed the cover, and Fife drew one card. He held this in his fingers for a few seconds and then passed it to A. R. C. In the meantime J. H. B. closed the box and placed it behind D., but in his chair so that it was wedged tightly in place. A. R. C. held the card edge up, in the center of the table;
and while doing so he reported that his hand (the left) felt icy cold, that he had a pain in his chest, and that he felt slightly dizzy. At approximately 9:15, or a little earlier, all in the circle heard five raps in the cabinet. They were distinct, spaced about one second apart and there seemed to be a slight hesitation after the third rap. They were like the sounds made by a tightly padded object on non-vibrant wood; not at all like the sharp, explosive sounds of a week ago. All agreed as to the number of raps, five, and also as to their general location, the east side of the cabinet.

In accordance with Walter’s instructions of March 1st, A. R. C. then put the card in his case (a bill-fold with snap fastener) and placed this in an inside pocket. The circle was broken only at the time of drawing the card and when A. R. C. placed it in the bill-fold, and at those times only to the extent that the operations made necessary. While A. R. C. held the card on the table with his left hand he was controlled at the left shoulder by Mrs. Richardson.

The circle was broken at 10 o’clock; lights were given and the door unlocked by Mrs. Richardson. Dudley took the box of cards, none of which had been seen by any of the group save that Mr. Fife had necessarily seen the blank backs while marking them for identification with his thumbprint. The group then proceeded together to the bookroom and waited reports from the other places in which the experiment was being prosecuted.

In Chestnut Street, at nine o’clock, Margery sat in bright light with no circle and no trance, quite as though for an ordinary social evening except that she had before her pencil and paper. There were present, besides her and in no particular order: Dr. Richardson, Dr. Louis Arkin, Mr. and Mrs. E. D. Millea, Mr. Fred. Adler, Mr. and Mrs. Carl Litzelmann, Mr. and Mrs. Whitney, Mrs. Edith Baker, Mr. Norcross and Dr. Crandon.

At 9:37, with no sign of trance, Margery began to write and draw; and a complete description of what she produced would be as follows:
A crude drawing of some cigarettes, three lighted and smoking and four unlit; a rectilinear figure which she outlined twice and which turned out in the end to be within a sixteenth-inch, both ways, of the size of the fifteen cent Camel cigarette package; and the following script, in which the blank stands for a humorous reference to Mr. Fife, the exact word employed being deleted.

"Ha ha the joke is on ______; one of the letters has fallen off the word."

This script was on the first page, under the drawings; on a second page she wrote three times the letters EL, very large, together with the sentence:

"And I have found what I walked for."

She then went on to three further pages of writing, as follows:

"John reports the Judge's foot is all right. Ask your friends why they mix the animals. A rose by any other name would smell as sweet. Ha-ha. It is as he said; the glue is bad. Hello and good-bye. You will find the missing letter in the box. Atta boy. W. S. S."

The script seems to require no illustration; the drawing appears herewith as Fig. 7.

At ten o'clock the Chestnut Street group returned with Margery to Lime Street, where the Lime Street committee reported to Dr. Richardson, before any other word was spoken by anybody: "We got five raps."

At 10:15 Mr. Crawford produced the card which had been selected upstairs in the absence of any medium. It was found to carry on one side the identifying thumb-print of Mr. Fife; and on the other was pasted a colored advertisement representing a box of Camel Cigarettes. Out of the top of the opened package in this picture protruded three cigarettes. Superposed upon the upper portion of the Camel package was pasted a picture of a small cat cut from another advertisement. Pasted similarly across the bottom of the camel package was
a single piece of paper containing the letters C—A, wide apart; and between them glue marks such as would have been left had another piece been pasted here and fallen off. All this is shown in Fig. 8, which is a direct photograph of the card. In addition, in the bottom of the original large box containing all the cards was found a loose letter T. No detailed argument need be made nor parallel drawn to emphasize that this picture gives a meaning to every detail of Margery’s script.

At 10:36 p.m. there was received at 10 Lime Street the following telegram, dated Niagara Falls, 9:52 p.m.:

M STOP CAMEL IMPRESSION—HARDWICKE

A detailed statement from Hardwicke, carrying the signatures of all his sitters, later was received by mail; it was dated, March 3rd, and read as follows:

"Sitting at Niagara Falls, N. Y., 9 Ericson Place, at 8:45 p.m. Clockwise: Miss Kellogg, Don Kellogg, Mrs. Gray, Mrs. Hardwicke, Alfred Gray and Dr. H.

"9:03 Hardwicke in trance. Voice claiming to be that of John Richardson.

"John: Hello Judge.

"Gray: Hello.

"John: How is your foot?"
"Gray: Why I'd forgotten all about it. It is all right, doesn't bother me at all.

"Mr. Gray then explained that as he was leaving Dr. Crandon's house he slipped on the stairs and strained his foot.

"9:10 Dr. H. out of trance.

"9:20 Dr. H. and Miss Kellogg both in trance, and pencil heard to move. D. Kellogg stated that he could see the left arm and hand of someone coming from between Mr. Gray and Dr. H. and reaching over the table. He wondered if John was left-handed.

"9:30 Dr. H. out of trance and reported seeing a moving Camel similar to those on the cigarette packages. [The Editor's italics.]

"10:00 Miss Kellogg out of trance, sitting broke up.

"Examination of paper showed an 'M' in center of sheet."
At 10:45 P.M. New York called up and reported (actual original document received next day by mail), Mrs. Cannon speaking:

"9:40 P.M. have the Kid under. 9:45 P.M. Valiantine out. Started to draw package of cigarettes with two sticking out. C. A. underneath the drawing, also, I HAVE WALKED C. A."

[See Fig. 9]

\[\text{cigarettes} \]

\[\text{C.A.} \]

\[\text{I have Walked} \]

FIG. 9.

The execution of this experiment was practically perfect. It may be discussed in three stages. First, the preparation of the cards serving as mental material or thoughts to be transferred. Secondly, the fortuitous selection of a portion of this material and its accurate recognition (both in the dark) at Lime Street, by Walter, Margery's control, Margery, herself, being absent. Finally, the transfer, in sections, of this mental material to (1) Margery, (2) Valiantine and (3) Hardwicke; all within the space of a very few minutes.

As to the mental material, it is hard to see how knowledge as to its character could have been better guarded. Of course, if one desires to take refuge in the "cosmic reservoir" theory of universal knowledge, the details of the cards were possibly
accessible to some supernormally endowed intelligence, but, even with this point granted, who was that intelligence? Certainly not the Walter-Margery entity, for Margery was an eighth of a mile away, gaily chatting in a brightly lighted social gathering. This being so could Walter have found for his purposes sufficient mediumistic power in some one or all of the sitters at Lime Street? This is possible, for Walter has often asserted that Dudley though never entranced has been oftentimes a rich source of psychic energy. We might then have a Walter-Dudley entity with a modicum at least of the supernormal powers hitherto exhibited only by Walter-Margery. In any event the Walter-Margery entity has become separated so that when finally we come to the actual thought-transfer we find Margery, like Valiantine and Hardwicke, restricted to the rôle of percipient. Under these conditions we might represent the individual transfers as Walter-Margery, Walter-Valiantine and Walter-Hardwicke reactions. When, however, we look at all these reactions, actual or potential, we find that they all have one common factor and only one—Walter, who makes his combinations when and how he chooses. This being so have we not practically established Walter's independence?

Two very important points remain. First, it will be remembered, Margery wrote "a letter has fallen off the word" which was proved later to be true. Now here was a fact which was certainly not known to the clerk who made the card nor to anyone else, and which, until the box was opened, could have made no ripple in the "cosmic reservoir," which fact, nevertheless, was recorded immediately in Margery's script by Walter as soon as he had chosen and observed the card.

Another exhibition of supernormal knowledge concerned Judge Gray's ankle, which at Lime Street a few days before had been slightly sprained. The Judge had forgotten the sprain in fact and had certainly mentioned it to nobody on his return to Niagara Falls. Nevertheless, John, Walter's assistant in charge of Hardwicke, asks the Judge how his ankle is and reports its favorable condition immediately through Margery at Chestnut Street, Boston, 500 miles away.
CHAPTER LX

Another Cross Correspondence with Margery's Whereabouts Unknown

At this point it will be well to insert a hitherto unpublished, highly successful experiment, which was carried out on August 22nd, 1929, and which was characterized by certain important variations in technique. On the above date Margery was on a vacation trip in Canada, her exact whereabouts being unknown. Previous to her departure it had been arranged that, on the evening of August 22nd, wherever she might be, she should sit at 9 o'clock, and register whatever impressions she might receive.

As a matter of fact Margery's itinerary was as follows:

August 20 (Tuesday) left Boston and spent the night in Montreal.

August 21st on St. Lawrence boat upon which she spent the night.

August 22nd arrived at Toronto in the morning. Telephoned to her cousin, Judge Gray, at Niagara on-the-Lake, where she arrived at about 11 A.M.

At 9 p.m. according to the above-described arrangements, Margery sat at the house of Judge Gray. Early in the evening Dr. Hardwicke at Niagara Falls got late notice that a sitting was to take place. He drove the 30 or 40 miles to Niagara on-the-Lake, and arrived late. His cognitions therefore involved those which occurred after his arrival. He did not sit in Margery's circle, but sat half way up a flight of stairs where he was quickly entranced.

Again as per arrangement a group with Mrs. Litzelmann as medium, sat at the house of Dr. Edison Brown in Revere, Massachusetts, at 9 p.m.

This group, which might be called the active group, had no knowledge as to where Margery was, or what arrangements she had made. The Revere group sat as follows (clockwise): Sary
(Mrs. Litzelmann), acted as medium, and to her left Dr. Brown, Mrs. Brown, J. Fred Adler, J. H. Brown, E. E. Dudley, Carl Litzelmann, and Dr. Crandon. As material for the experiment Mrs. Brown had had prepared a number of clippings from

FIG. 10.
advertising sections of magazines. These clippings had been placed singly in envelopes and sealed. A sheaf of calendar numbers, properly marked for identification, was also provided. The person who made the clippings was not informed as to their purpose and Mrs. Brown, of course, had no knowledge of their character. They were continuously in her possession until used (in the dark) at the time of the sitting. Margery had no knowledge as to the place where Sary was to sit, in fact none of the Revere group knew the place until a few hours before the sitting.

Sary soon became entranced with writing pad and pencil on her lap. Absolute darkness: no music. Soon raps were heard and, in code, indicated the presence of Walter, Margery’s control. Rapid writing and marking on the paper pad was heard. It covered four pages; each page had been marked for identification before the sitting and each page was withdrawn by Dr. Crandon when filled. The writing lasted until 9:40 p.m. and the sitting until 10 p.m. At the beginning of the sitting, as material for the experiment, Mr. Litzelmann had chosen at random in the dark two of the envelopes in Mrs. Brown’s collection. In a similar manner Mrs. Brown chose three number slips. All this material was placed in the center of the table by Mr. Litzelmann. Mr. J. H. Brown was selected to take charge of the envelopes and number slips after their use by Walter.

At the close of the sitting the Revere group went downstairs and examined the writing produced by Sary. Page 1 showed a rectangle, and, in relation to it, were three-sided figures, suggesting seats, eight in number, around a table. (See Fig. 10.)

Page 2 showed the word “Kleenex” written in a normal style, and, below, written mirror-fashion. (See Fig. 11.)

Page 3 showed the word “Twentyeight” written mirror-fashion, and below it a circle with vertical markings going from its equator downward and outside it. Below that, the word “Aug” and something not interpreted in the lower right corner. (See Fig. 12.)

Page 4 showed the figure 8 written eight times and a line put under it. Below that 8–28 in figures. (See Fig. 13.)
Page 5 showed mirror writing as follows: Walter is gone but I am in charge. All is well. (See Fig. 14.)

At 11 p.m. the articles which had been on the table, selected
entirely by chance, the envelopes being still sealed, were brought forth by Mr. J. H. Brown, in whose possession they had been kept, with the exception that two of the numbers had been

FIG. 12.
dropped by mistake on the floor of the séance room. One of the advertisements was that of a skin cleaner called "Kleenex." In the upper corner of this advertisement was a picture which
Sary had made no effort to produce. It was a woman’s left hand with a large ring on the ring finger.

The second item in Mr. Brown’s custody proved to be a
Dr. L. R. G. Crandon, Phone Revere 17
10 Lime St., Boston, Mass.

Psyche drew picture of hand with ring on first finger and wrote quote Keenit Doctor and Psyche in separate rooms.
Drew pictures of tables set with chairs. Doctor drew one with chest; both wrote eight and twenty eight. Psyche said chest should be on one side of table.

-A. W. Gray

THE QUICKEST, SUREST AND SAFEST WAY TO SEND MONEY IS BY TELEGRAPH OR CABLE.
The numbers selected by chance and reproduced by Sary turned out to be 28, 8 and 4. The 28 and the 4, as above-stated, had been dropped by mistake on the séance room floor. Nevertheless, the 28 and 8 had been cognized by Sary; the 4 had not.

About 11 p.m. Dr. Brown received from Niagara Falls, New York, a telegram, and from this fact the Revere group assumed that Margery had sat at this place. As a matter of fact, the sitting had taken place at Niagara on-the-Lake, Ontario, 26 miles from Niagara Falls. In other words the locus of the Margery sitting was entirely unknown to the Revere group. The telegram (Fig. 15) is as follows:

“Psyche (meaning Margery) drew picture of hand with ring on third finger and wrote ‘Keenit.’ Dr. (Hardwicke) and Psyche in separate rooms drew pictures of tables set with chairs. Dr. H. drew one with chest, both wrote 8 and 28. Psyche said chest should be on one side of table.”

(Signed) ALFRED W. GRAY.

Dr. Hardwicke’s original drawings, (Fig. 16) certified as below, showed a table with chairs and chest. Also 11111111—8. Below that comes “Set the table” 28-8-28. “Table set.” This was endorsed as follows: Written August 22, 1929, at 10:10 p.m. by Dr. Hardwicke at the residence of A. W. Gray at Niagara on-the-Lake, Ontario, in the presence of the undersigned:

A. W. GRAY
MARY WRIGHT HUBBS
C. O. KENNEY
CHARLES F. MINK
HOPE NORMAN BIBLEY

As to Margery’s writing: Figures 8 and 28. Another sheet of Margery shows drawing of the table and the word “chair” written eight times around the table, and the words “8 chairs” written below. (Fig. 17).

Margery arranged table with three chairs on each side and one on each end, chest opposite table. The following are the
FIG. 16.
FIG. 17.
This sitting is the third in which Margery has been the recipient, rather than the agent, in the production of cross-correspondences. The experiment presents an important difference, furthermore, in that neither medium knew, at the time of the sitting, the location of the other. The situation can perhaps be best expressed by a quotation from Longfellow:

"I shot an arrow into the air,
It fell to earth, I knew not where."

The important question is, Who shot the arrow?
CHAPTER LXI

The Chinese Script and Cross Correspondences

At this point the experimentation begins to take on an oriental flavor owing to the suggestion that Valiantine’s Chinese controls might be able to produce phenomena of great evidential value. These Chinese entities have been placed in sketchy outline before American readers through Dr. Whymant’s London lecture, appearing in the A.S.P.R. Journal for April, 1928. A brief statement sufficient for present purposes and ignoring all aspects not here pertinent, would be this:

Through Valiantine, for more than a year now, communications have been freely given purporting to come from Confucius (Kung-fu-tze) and other Chinese contemporaneous with him. These are ordinarily spoken in what Dr. Whymant regards as a probable approximation to correct classical Chinese diction. The internal evidence that the entities behind the communications are actually Chinese is rather good. There has further been considerable indication that these entities know things which could hardly fall within the normal knowledge of any others than those whom they purport to be.

When Valiantine first went to Boston to attend Margery séances, and when these séances turned out to be more or less a function of the two mediumships of Valiantine and Margery, his Chinese controls appeared freely. Since that time, when Margery sits in accordance with her ordinary routine, Walter quite consistently presents the picture that numbers of these Chinese are at hand, as his assistants or as interested spectators; and that their services are currently available to him. The situation is not without its element of humor, as for instance when Walter complains that he doesn’t much relish the constant presence of all these “Chinks”; that they are always “high-hatting” him. It is also not without its element of potential importance in the present story to anticipate the possibility,
if such Chinese personalities are really at Walter’s hand, of some of the writings of the cross-correspondences being attempted in Chinese.

**Experiment of March 10, 1928**

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, March 10, 1928. Present in bright light downstairs: Margery, Dr. Richardson, Mr. and Mrs. Albert C. Neres, Mr. Crawford (Chicago), Mr. Dudley, Mr. and Mrs. Millea, and Dr. Crandon.

---

**FIG. 18.**

At 9:18 p.m. Margery began to write, beginning at the right edge of the paper with great rapidity, and wrote two words. It was then found that she had written the words completely
backwards, but when finished they read normally thus: "Go upstairs." At 9:25 P.M. the party went upstairs and sat in the usual order.

Walter came in about two minutes and said that the Chinese tests were in preparation; that Kung-fu-tze would not come immediately but would be preceded by his disciple "Tao," who would prepare the way for the "Master."

At 9:45 P.M. the group went downstairs into bright white light. At 9:47 Margery began writing in three vertical columns and produced the text of Fig. 18. It will be noted that while this text is English, its arrangement constitutes an approximation to that of a Chinese text.

At 10:47 P.M. the New York group with Valiantine called up and Mrs. Cannon said that at 9:26 P.M. Walter said, through Valiantine, he wasn’t sure he was going to be able to do it tonight. He said he was not going to control tonight. Then Kung-fu-tze came in and said he had just picked the medium up. Trying to control the other medium. Not sure he could do it. He was controlling the one in Boston. He began, starting at the right edge of the paper, and wrote eight Chinese characters. At the top he wrote: "Tao is my disciple," and he misspelled disciple—precisely as Margery had done in her script. Underneath is written: Kong Futze.

Verification of this was received from New York by mail next day, with signatures of all sitters.

The facts of this experiment are noteworthy chiefly for their distinctly oriental Chinese atmosphere. An interesting coincidence is the mis-spelling of the word "disciple," in the scripts both of Margery and Valiantine. As to the characters written by Valiantine, we have not succeeded in securing any translation. They are said, however, to have distinct resemblances to very early Chinese.

They are reproduced in Fig. 19, in two columns for economy of space although in the original they stood in a single column, those at the left of the cut standing above those at the right.

The séances following March 10, 1928, of the present sequence, continued to develop the Chinese theme, sometimes in
connection with the cross-correspondential angle and sometimes as an end in itself, without reference to any other aspect of the material presented beyond its Chinese character. Thus, at the seventeenth sitting of the series, held in Lime Street on March 15th, 1928, there were present, clockwise: Dr. Richardson, Mr. M. Hardwicke, the son of Dr. Hardwicke, Mrs. Philip Hale, Mr. J. H. Brown, Mr. Millea, Mr. and Mrs. Neres, Mr. Dudley, Mr. Adler, Mrs. Richardson, Dr. Crandon and the Psychic. Walter came through promptly, whistling off the key of the Victrola and remarking that “We must be oriental tonight.” He then addressed the sitters with mock Chinese formality, saying substantially: “Oh illustrious members of this disreputable household! Lao-Tze will come tonight. He likes your books. He was a curator of books. On March 17th I may not talk, but may only rap. I don’t mix with Chinese myself, but it isn’t my choice. Be ready to write in red light
if necessary. I asked one of these Chinese something today, and he answered by drawing a kind of urn, with horns.''

There was much repartee back and forth; in the course of which somebody said to Walter, in the latest mode of current slang, "And How!" Someone else in the same spirit said, "And Why?" Walter rejoined: "You will be interested to know that these two expressions mean something to these Chinese.''

The sitting closed at 9:33, after thirty-two minutes; and the group all went downstairs into the light. Without trance and in a fully normal state, Margery began automatic writing at 9:40, ending at 9:55. She wrote the text and drew the diagram of Fig. 20. This will add point to the remarks immediately above about the presentation of the Chinese atmosphere as an end in itself, without other context. We may note with some interest the purported appearance of another disciple of Confucius; we have had Tao and we now get Lao-Tze. The figure drawn has marked resemblance, we are told, to an ancient Chinese altar; and the Chinese characters at the end of the script actually constitute the signature "Lao-Tze."

Experiment of March 17, 1928

The next séance was held on March 17th, with the following group of sitters, in the circle and outside, in an order of which no exact record was kept: Dr. Richardson, Mrs. Baker, Mr. and Mrs. Litzelmann, Mr. and Mrs. Saunders, Mr. J. H. Brown, Mr. Adler, Mr. and Mrs. Neres, Mr. and Mrs. Millea, Mr. Dudley, Miss Marian Richardson, Mrs. Richardson, Dr. Crandon and Margery. Trance on this date was exceptionally deep, both hands being colder than usual. Walter came through promptly and maintained a merry conversation with the sitters. Among other things he gave the following epigram: "All is not Chinese that chinks." He told us that he was providing the energy for the night's entertainment but that he was in no way responsible for what his Chinese guests might do or say. He then called for pad and pencil, told us to release the medium's hands and turn on a low red light, and let her then do as she pleased.
Whereupon Margery took up the pencil and wrote on the uppermost page of the pad in nine vertical columns, but with such speed that those nearest her could only assume that her hand...
was merely trembling. The longest time consumed in the writing of any one column was seventeen seconds and the shortest was twelve seconds. When the séance closed at 9:53 after

having been under way since nine o’clock, we were told by Walter to leave the red light burning and to go downstairs without any more walking about in the séance room than was necessary.
FIG. 22.
On examination downstairs, it was seen that the page on which Margery had been writing carried not formless marks, but characters which to the eyes of the sitters carried every suggestion of being actual Chinese script. This page is reproduced as Fig. 21. Further, downstairs in ordinary white light Margery again felt the urge to write automatically, and from 9:55 to 10:21 she wrote, much more slowly than before, five additional columns of characters on a fresh sheet. These fell into two rather distinct groups: one group of 24 characters in two columns of moderate intensity, similar to those written in red light upstairs; and 43 characters in three columns very heavily overscored. This second sheet is reproduced as Fig. 22.

On this same date a Valiantine sitting was held at Hyslop House in New York; and during this séance, a voice announcing itself as Kung-fu-tze addressed Mrs. Cannon, greeting her in Chinese first and then adding, in English: "One—two—three—I try." Mrs. Cannon asked whether he meant that he would try to come through three mediums that evening and he replied in the affirmative. At the end of the séance, Valiantine, out of trance, wrote and drew the diagram, words and characters reproduced in Fig. 23. This was reported to Lime Street by telephone call, the connection being made at 10:42 p.m. Nothing further in connection with the cross-correspondential theme developed at the Valiantine séance and so far as is known no successful attempt to employ a third medium was made.

Reverting to the Lime Street script, it should be said that during the presence of the Chinese controls, and in view of Walter's direct statement that he anticipated that Confucius himself would attend, some of the sitters asked several rather broad general questions which they felt might appropriately be addressed to such a person. These questions were not written down but their nature is implied by the answers to which we shall now come.

By particular invitation, a day or two after the séance, Dr. Hsieh (pronounced Shay as nearly as occidental lips can readily come to it), a Chinese scholar and one-time Commercial Envoy from China, came to Lime Street and brought with him Dr.
Kong Putje

FIG. 23.
Tse-fang F. Huang, S.B., S.M., M.D., Chief of the Department of Epidemiology of the National Epidemic Prevention Bureau in Pekin. Dr. Huang is a Chinese of great learning, and at the present time a student in the Harvard Graduate School of Public Health. He and Dr. Hsieh agreed that the writing produced by Margery's hand in both red and white light was true "original" Chinese—they use this term in avoidance of the expression "ancient Chinese." The difficulties confronting a student of modern Chinese who attempts to read such an "original" text are very considerable, and without a special training in the classical language which Drs. Hsieh and Huang disclaim, a rapid and accurate reading is not possible. Dr. Huang however devoted himself to a translation with such accuracy as is possible, with the distinct reservation that greater time put on it by one who knows more than he does might probably bring out more precise shades of meaning. His translation of the red-light script from the séance room is as follows:

"The Master said: 'The primary object in life of a man of virtue is not to be always well-fed, nor to be always comfortably housed. He is diligent in his work and careful in his speech.'

"Yu-tze said: 'Truth is akin to faithfulness, as it enables one to abide by one's words; humbleness is akin to politeness, as it keeps one away from disgrace and shame.'

"Yu-tze said: 'Serenity is the most valuable fruit of politeness. This is the most valuable teaching of our ancient sages.'

"He is a filial son who is able to do a small as well as a big type of work.

"Kung-fu-tze said: 'He is a filial son who studies his father's ambitions during his lifetime and observes his life-history after his death, and who does not forego his father's ways within three years after his death.'

"Tse-king said: 'The Master's ways were characterized by kindness and gentleness, humbleness and politeness. Neither should our ways differ from his ways.'"

The second sheet, written downstairs, yields the following translation:

"The Master said: 'Isn't it a happy thing to have the opportunity to study and to review your studies? Isn't it a pleasant matter to receive a call from a friend from afar? Isn't it like a true gentleman to possess knowledge and yet not to be disheartened when his knowledge is not known to others?'}
"Yu-tze said: 'It is improbable to have a man who is good to his parents and brothers, and who could be disobedient to his superiors. It is impossible to have a man who is not disobedient to his superiors and who could be a disturber of the public peace.'"

In summarizing this experiment, we must point out that here, Walter, in terms of the face values, played a secondary but very important part: that is, he prepared the way and arranged the apparatus for the use of his Chinese associates. That conditions must have been well-nigh perfect is indicated by the extraordinary speed with which Margery transcribed the Chinese ideas. As to these ideas, we are assured by native Chinese scholars that in context, quite aside from the mere question of ideography, they bear the hall-mark of "original" Chinese literature which is accessible only in one or two libraries in this country. Absolutely certain it is that neither Margery, nor Walter, nor any person in this circle of sitters, can have any normal knowledge of Chinese language or literature. Under these circumstances what becomes of secondary personalities as factors in this phase of Margery's mediumship? Is it to be urged by the incurably anti-spiritistic critic that Margery-Walter performed a book-test of the conventional type, using for the purpose Chinese scripts from some distant library? Such a claim would seize upon and magnify into a dominant element the fact that the Chinese scripts here displayed are not apposite to any séance action originated spontaneously and at random, but are simply produced out of thin air apropos of nothing at all. If the anti-spiritistic claims are to rest on this foundation, however, we shall very shortly see all possibility of such a basis swept cleanly out from under them. What position will the anti-spiritistic critic then occupy? We may be sure, reasoning from his past record, that he will find one somewhere; but how tenable will it be?

**Experiment of March 22, 1928**

On the next sitting date, March 22nd, there were present in the usual clockwise order: Dr. Richardson, Mr. and Mrs. Neres, Miss Patty Richardson, Mr. Adler, Mr. Dudley, Mrs.
图24.
Richardson, Dr. Crandon and Margery. Outside the circle sat Miss Louise Seaman. The results were in all senses parallel with those of the preceding date except that Margery’s writing was done in the dark; and beyond this we need not describe the séance action. Some of Walter’s remarks are, however, of sufficient possible interest for quotation here.

He told us that when Kung-fu-tze manifests in our séance-room he is not necessarily personally present. In amplification of this, however, he said that at the time of Whymant’s inter-

![FIG. 25.](image)

view with Kung-fu-tze through Valiantine in trance (see Light, Jan. 14th, 1928), the Master was actually present in person.

The script produced at this sitting consisted of two columns of what we took to be Chinese characters, on one page (Fig. 24); and independently of this, on another page, a very large single character (Fig. 25) made in three parts with a brush and India ink provided by the sitters in the hope of getting some such use thereof. Both sheets were from a sheaf all leaves of which had been previously marked for identification by Dr. Richardson, and both he was able thus to identify.

On March 23rd the text of Fig. 24 was shown to Dr. Hsieh, who said that it was perfectly good original Chinese but that he lacked the time to make a translation. Four days later the
following rendition was got through Mr. Y. W. Lee, 490 Beacon Street, Boston, a young Chinese student at Massachusetts Institute of Technology: 'Our doctors—everything is given from above—Because of this we do not have to over-worry—The master said: 'Those who seek the fine principles shall all attain them'—My loving heart—To my brothers, broad-minded—Everything goes smoothly—Peace.'

**Experiment of March 24, 1928**

This evening, March 24th, is of extreme interest and importance because of the way in which it finally brings completely together, into one action, the Chinese and the cross-correspondential themes. In Lime Street, the following sitters were present, in clockwise order: Dr. Richardson, Mr. Charles S. Hill, Mr. Bird, Mrs. Richardson, Mr. Dudley, Mrs. Barbara McKenzie of London, Dr. Crandon and Margery. Outside the circle in no particular order that was recorded were: Mrs. William Cannon, Misses Patty and Marian Richardson, Mr. and Mrs. Millea, Mrs. Cornell, Mr. and Mrs. Neres, Miss Laura Crandon, Mr. and Mrs. Litzelmann, Dr. E. W. Brown, Mr. J. H. Brown and Mr. Adler.

Walter came through in fine spirits; he said there were several Chinese present; and this was further suggested by many repetitions of a series of light, fast raps which the regular sitters have learned to associate with the purported presence of the oriental controls. Walter suggested to these Chinese on the present evening that they do their rapping on the outer side of the west wing of the cabinet; and this suggestion was put into execution.

Mrs. McKenzie had prepared a number of cards, each having words or pictures or both pasted on it. Mr. Dudley had brought a collection of geometrical figures drawn on cards in India ink. Dr. Richardson brought a new calendar with thirty-one numbered pages. All this paraphernalia was put in one box, placed by Mrs. McKenzie on the table with the cover on; and presently Walter was heard, apparently removing the lid and handling the cards. He finally placed one of them on the end of the table
near Mrs. McKenzie and told her to take possession of it and keep it concealed on her person. Another card from her collection was similarly handed to Dr. Richardson. From Dudley's sheaf he picked out a card and handed it to Mr. Bird; but when he asked the latter sitter whether he could tell what the figure was by feeling of it, Mr. Bird replied that he judged it to be a circle. Walter responded that that was precisely what it was and substituted for it another card. On this, too, Mr. Bird could feel the raised design but it was of sufficiently complex character and along at least one of its edges it merged into the surface of the card sufficiently gradually, to prevent his identifying the pattern. This card was accordingly adjudged satisfactory and possession of it was retained by Mr. Bird. Finally Walter turned over one of the calendar numbers to Mr. Hill, with the remark: "Judge, here's your lucky number."

No definite statement had been made as to precisely what treatment would be given all these elements but it was understood that in one way or another they were to be made the objects of experiments similar to the earlier ones of the series, and that for this purpose Dr. Hardwicke was sitting on the present evening.

Walter now of his own motion suggested that if Mr. Bird would give any reasonably short sentence, he would try to have his Chinese assistants reproduce it through Hardwicke, in
Chinese translation. Bird gave the proverb: "A rolling stone gathers no moss," which was accepted by Walter with some humorous comment. Bird had been cautioned by Walter to make his sentence neither too light nor too heavy, and the proverb seemed to him an excellent mean, being furthermore quite the only idea he could find under the unexpected demand.

The séance closed after an hour and three minutes and the party adjourned downstairs. There they found that Mrs. Stinson's nurse had eight minutes earlier, at ten o'clock exactly, taken over the telephone a telegram from Niagara Falls, in which Hardwicke said: "Characters stop drawing stop am mailing."

At 10:17, nine minutes after the close of the séance, Margery began to write while fully conscious, in full white light, on several sheets of paper. She produced several elements, which we describe, illustrate and comment upon separately:

(1) A drawing of a Maltese cross. It was evident to several of the sitters who watched while she made this, and Margery
herself subsequently verified, that her pencil tended to make the notches between the several arms go about in a curve at their bottoms, rather than in the conventional points; and that through conscious knowledge of what the drawing was tending toward in terms of convention, Margery was resisting this. This effect is even slightly discernible in her drawing. Having finished the sketch, she wrote in its center the direct attribution to Mr. Bird which appears in the reproduction of Fig. 26. This figure also shows the geometrical figure found on the card in Mr. Bird’s possession, when this was examined after the writing was finished. The close correspondence and particularly the point about the between-arm spaces will be evident.

(2) The figure 13. Examination of the calendar sheet in Judge Hill’s possession showed it to be this one. In addition to the number, there was a valid attribution to Mr. Hill, in the words: “For the illustrious gentleman with open shirt” written under the number.

(3) The capital letters L-U-X, in the arrangement shown in Fig. 27; an arrangement precisely corresponding with that of these letters as they were found on the card in Mrs. McKenzie’s possession, as further shown in this figure.

(4) A series of small circles in two vertical rows, with two larger and less circular marks between them, and the word “Kung-fu-tze” in English diagonally across the rest of the space between them; all as shown in Fig. 28. Examination of the card in Dr. Richardson’s possession showed it to be the deuce of spades, decked out with two rows of Chinese characters as shown in the first half of Fig. 28, the extreme
correspondence with Margery’s drawing need not be pointed out. We assume that the name “Kung-fu-tze” in the automatic script represents Walter’s attempt to put across the idea that the Chinese atmosphere of the card had been recognized.

The Hardwicke sitting in Niagara Falls produced a written record signed by the sitters, but more important are the signatures of four of these sitters on the sheet of paper mailed to Lime Street, attesting that this is the original produced at the séance and not a forgery made up after the Lime Street returns had reached Niagara. This paper (see Fig. 29) carries fourteen Chinese characters in two columns, and also a Maltese cross within a circle. This is inferred to arise out of the circumstance that in the Lime Street sitting a circle was first chosen and then rejected, to be followed by a cross. At the bottom of the sheet there is found what we take to be an attempt upon the spade deuce with the added Chinese characters; and the large design at the left center of the sheet is the signature of Kung-fu-tze, but in Chinese rather than in English as Margery gave it.

The characters at the top of the page, above the circle-cross drawing, are to be considered separately. As regards the balance of this Chinese text, Mr. Lee finds that the second and third characters resist his attack. With this omission as indicated, he translates the balance of the text as follows: “My —— travelling teachers gather no gold.” This we regard as a transfer, into a more Chinese atmosphere than one would get by direct translation, of Mr. Bird’s proverb; and we feel that no fair-minded reader will resist this interpretation. It gives, indeed, a touch of the Chinese temperament rather more convincing, we think, than a straight translation in word-for-word style could possibly afford.

Parallel with this as constituting the crux of the present experiment must be considered the characters at the top of the page, referred to just above as possessing isolated significance. Mr. Lee states that the two characters across the very top of the sheet here read: “13 little mountain” and that the single one below is: “bird.” Thus we have not only a turning over into Chinese, at a distance of 500 miles, of the number
arbitrarily chosen for Mr. Hill during the Lime Street sitting; we have in addition what must be taken as knowledge of the Lime Street presence of Messrs. Bird and Hill.

Now Judge Hill, once an extremely regular sitter, had not been in Lime Street for many months, following a critical illness from which his recovery was slow, arduous, and for a time very doubtful. His presence at this sitting was not by appointment or in renewal of his former regular attendance. Rather, he found himself free to come on a Saturday evening, when he knew a séance to be highly probable; so he just came. Until he appeared at the Lime Street door somewhat after eight o'clock nobody in the house had the remotest inkling that he was coming, and no familiar name could have carried with it a greater degree of improbability that its possessor would turn up for this séance. After his arrival Margery was not for an instant out of sight of the sitters and so could not have communicated with Niagara.

Mr. Bird's presence, while not nearly so improbable intrinsically, was equally without prior arrangement or announcement. He found himself, late on Friday, with numerous matters of publication about which he wished to confer with Mr. Dudley and others in Boston. With no other statement to the office force in Hyslop House than that he would not be in on Saturday, he motored up as is his custom when the weather makes it possible; and inasmuch as he was not arriving for dinner he did not bother to telegraph. He has arrived thus without announcement in the past but nobody in Boston had the slightest reason to anticipate his presence on this date. Yet somebody in Niagara Falls knew that he and Judge Hill were among the sitters in Lime Street on this evening. Somebody in Niagara Falls knew that the number 13 was pertinent to Hill's presence and that the proverb about the extremely unprofitable character of instability was pertinent to the séance in general. And someone in Niagara Falls was able to express all this knowledge in perfectly good classical Chinese. If not Walter with the aid of his Chinese assistants—then who? We ask this question not through any predilection toward the spirit hypothesis but
in honest desire to know what alternative thereto can conceivably be offered to explain the recorded facts of this date, and of those of a week hence to which we shall duly come.
This very brief episode intervenes between the one just given and the final climax of our story. The date was March 29th, and the sitters, in the usual clockwise order, were: Dr. Richardson, Mrs. Hale, Mrs. Baker, Miss Patty Richardson, Miss Laura Crandon, Mrs. Richardson, Mr. Dudley, Mrs. McKenzie, Dr. Crandon and the Psychic. A box containing various numbers and figures was placed on the table by Mrs. McKenzie; and, from it, Walter picked out a calendar number or a geometrical figure or a card with material pasted on it, and having silently noted its content handed it to a sitter; doing this, in all, five times, with five sitters.

Three and one-half minutes after the close of the séance, Margery began to write in the book-room downstairs. Not to go into burdensome detail, we reproduce (Fig. 30) one of the cards and the drawing thereto pertaining, to illustrate the generalization that Margery made: five drawings, etc., each in a lined-off compartment of the paper on which she worked, and each with the name of a sitter below it or in it; and that each of the five sitters who had a paper produced it, to find that its content had been given with substantial accuracy and completeness and that it had been correctly attributed to him. One interesting observation, however, deserves to be set down; there was no parallelism between the order of the distribution of the cards in the séance room and the order of their description as written and drawn downstairs. We mention this not as a criterion between genuineness and fraud, but rather because on the hypnotic theory of validity, one would expect that the cards would be later described by Margery in the order in which the suggestions were made to her in the séance room. Apparently, however, the process employed by Walter in getting the post-séance reproduction of the séance material is sufficiently different from one of routine hypnosis to be free from this ordinary limitation of the hypnotic process.

Experiment of March 31, 1928

On March 31st was held the last séance of the group herein reported, though the mental phenomena of the general type of
those of this paper continue to this moment and are of great interest. We stop with this date because this date seems to give a climax, alike in the cross-correspondence sequence itself and in its integration into the Chinese theme.

The Lime Street circle ran, clockwise: Dr. Richardson, Miss Silsbee, Mrs. Bird, Mr. Millea, Miss Patty Richardson, Miss Laura Crandon, Miss Marian Richardson, Mr. Kunz (see Journal, A.S.P.R., 1929, April, p. 191), Mr. Dudley, Mr. Bird, Mrs. McKenzie, Dr. Crandon and the Psychic. The experimental routine was partly determined in advance and partly suggested by Walter as we went along. First and last, the following moves were made:

(1) Mr. Bird was given the sheaf of calendar pages, which had been thoroughly shuffled beforehand by Mrs. McKenzie. During the séance, at Walter’s demand, he placed this sheaf on the table; and Walter selected from it, in total darkness as always in these tests, and gave to Mr. Bird, one of the calendar sheets. On this sheet Mr. Bird wrote his name in the dark and handed the sheet, thus marked, to Dr. Richardson for safekeeping.

(2) Mrs. McKenzie was instructed by Walter to write her name on a second calendar page, selected by him and handed to her; and to deliver the page thus marked to Mr. Bird for safekeeping.

(3) In similar fashion, Mr. Millea, who had custody of the box of cards with geometrical figures, put these on the table, and one was selected by Walter. This card finally came into Mrs. McKenzie’s custody; whether directly from the table or by passage through some other hand is not recalled.

(4) Mrs. McKenzie had preliminary custody of a box of cards prepared by herself, with pictures and text pasted on them from magazine advertising pages. It is not recalled in whose custody the card which Walter selected from this group was placed, but such selection was made and the card duly safeguarded in some sitter’s possession.

(5) Mrs. McKenzie was asked by Walter to give, vocally, a number of no more than three digits; the attempt would then be made to give this number through the other mediums who
were sitting on the present evening in cooperation with the Lime Street group.

(6) Mrs. McKenzie was asked to give a sentence for Chinese

translation and transmission through the other mediums, as had been done the week before with Mr. Bird's sentence. This sentence, like her number under (5), she gave aloud, so all the Lime Street sitters knew it and its mere production in Margery's own post-séance script would mean nothing. The sen-
tence given was: "He sticketh like a brother"; and Walter so persistently paraphrased it, during the séance "He sticketh like a burr," that the sitters were in doubt just what result to expect from this test.

(7) Mr. Bird was now asked to write a number of at most two digits, on a slip of paper taken from his pocket; and to restore it to his pocket without putting it on the table or otherwise exposing it in any way. It was Walter's hope that Hard-

wicke would give this number in Chinese. This one, if delivered even by Margery and by her alone, will be evidential; for Mr. Bird states that he was very careful to write in such way that even had the room been light, no idea could have been got from across the circle what he was writing.

(8) A third calendar number, selected by one of the sitters whose identity was neither recorded nor remembered, was put in Mrs. McKenzie's custody.

The séance was rather long, lasting slightly over an hour; and it is to be noted that three times Walter disappeared for intervals of a half-minute or more.
After the séance, Margery started to write automatically and wrote merely the number “21”; the words “Haddon Hall” (in printed letters, capitals and lower case); the large capital letters “DN” in mirror writing; and drew a square with very heavy sides; all as in Fig. 33. Examination of the material held by the several sitters was not made until later, but its results may best be given now, so far as they are now pertinent. Mrs. McKenzie’s calendar page was found to be the “21” sheet; the geometrical pattern in her custody was found to be a square, corresponding as Fig. 31 shows to the one drawn by Margery (but this matter of style is not so important because Mr. Dudley always employed this style in making up the geometrical figures); and the card pasted by Mrs. McKenzie and selected during the séance was found to carry the words “Haddon Hall” as in Fig. 33. This later parallelism in style between the séance and the post-séance material is important, since there could here be no expectation.

After an interval of about half an hour, Margery was moved to write again; and in realization that the first group of writings was not numerous enough to exhaust the séance material, none of this had been brought out for examination until after this second access of writing. At this time Margery wrote the combination of Chinese characters with attributions in English to certain sitters which is reproduced as Fig. 34. For these, it was not necessary to consult highly erudite authority; the Japanese servant in the house read them as the numerals 1 and 19, respectively, and as regards the former Mr. Bird is able to verify the reading from his own accidental knowledge. But Mr. Bird’s signed calendar sheet in Dr. Richardson’s possession was found to be the “1” sheet, and Mrs. McKenzie’s signed sheet in Mr. Bird’s possession was found to be “19.”

Simultaneously with the Lime Street séance, more or less, Dr. Hardwicke sat in Niagara Falls. His séance record carries the date March 31st and the signatures of all sitters; it was received in Lime Street by mail on April 3rd; there was no telegraphed report. The record states that following the séance there was automatic writing by Dr. Hardwicke of Chinese char-
acters; and the sheet of these received by mail in Lime Street contains, amongst other characters, those for the numerals 1, 19, 21 and 120. This latter was the number given aloud by Mrs. McKenzie for attempted transmission through the other mediums. The sheet written on this date by Dr. Hardwicke is reproduced as Fig. 35.

As a third medium sitting in the attempt to collaborate with the Lime Street group, we have to deal with Mrs. Sarah Litzelmann, old friend of the Crandons and frequent sitter in Lime Street. For some time, more or less inspired by Margery’s experience, she has been sitting in an informal amateur
way in her home and getting phenomena of small range and content. On this date she was in Ogunquit, Me., about sixty miles from Boston, and arrangements had been made for her to sit and see what would happen. Walter had accepted her collaboration and had stated that he was prepared to use her.

During the interval between Margery's two periods of writing, a telephone message was received in Lime Street from Mr. Litzelmann. He stated that "Sairy" had been in trance three times between nine and ten o'clock; it was known to the Lime Street regulars and verified by Mr. Litzelmann that Mrs. L. had never before been entranced; and it was recalled that Walter had ostensibly withdrawn from the Lime Street séance room three times during the sitting. All this of course could have been prearranged. But the number "21" was given in four different ways by Mrs. Litzelmann while entranced: in ordinary writing, in dashes, in little circles, and finally by raps. An attempt to describe further over the telephone what she had written may best be suppressed, since it suffered badly from unskillful reading by her sitters. When the documents were received in Lime Street they were found to comprise a column of Chinese characters; and, separately from these, the name "Bird" and the numbers 1, 19, 21 and 120 in Chinese. Further, there was something which the Ogunquit sitters had been quite unable to read but which was easily interpreted in Lime Street as "Haddon Hall" in rather poor mirror writing. All this appears in Fig. 36.

It will be noted that we have got back through one or all our mediums all the séance material except Mrs. McKenzie's proverb and Mr. Bird's secret number. The former was permanently lost. With regard to the latter, the facts are sufficiently interesting. Mr. Bird selected with considerable care the number "35," as a compromise between what he calls a "psychological" and an "unpsychological" choice. That is to say, the digits 6, 7, 9, occurring so far above their normal frequency in mind-made choice of numbers, are avoided; but care is exercised not to go to the other extreme and select even numbers, at the expense of the odd numbers which predominate
in ordinary, undirected choice of this sort. The result should be very difficult to guess correctly on either theory—, that normal psychology was being followed or that it was being avoided.

Nothing about this number appears in Margery’s own script. But on Sunday morning she told Mr. Bird with every appearance of positive confidence that one digit of his number was 3, that she had dreamed it unmistakably during the night. Walter later stated that he had actually seen so much of Mr. Bird’s number, but that Mr. Bird had removed it so quickly that he had not adequately sensed the second digit. Further examination of the Hardwicke and Litzelmann Chinese scripts then shows that these include also the Chinese numeral 3, and that they include no other numerals besides this and those already indicated.

It is of some interest to note that, her attention having been focussed on the matter by the dream and Mr. Bird’s admission of its correctness, Margery was consciously trying to guess the other digit all day Sunday and that in the process she came down, first and last, on pretty much all the digits there are. The difference between normal impressions and supernormal ones is well illustrated here, together with the difficulty which the genuine psychic has in sorting out the supernormal workings of her mind from its normal ones. Incidentally, Mr. Bird states that his paper with the “35” on it was adequately safeguarded over-night and that the full number, 35, was not revealed to anybody until late on Sunday, April 1st.
CHAPTER LXII

General Summary of Cross Correspondences

The phenomena observed in the foregoing experiments with the Margery mediumship may be grouped somewhat as follows:

(1) Phenomena related to psychic sensitiveness, recipiency or mediumship as exhibited by the (a) possession, or, (b) acquisition of supernormal knowledge.

(2) Phenomena related to psychic agency initiating and controlling the diffusion of this knowledge.

As sensitives we have observed Margery, George Valiantine, Dr. Hardwicke, and Mrs. Litzelmann. As agent Walter stands out pre-eminently but, with his cooperation, the Chinese group has assumed an almost equal importance.

As regards the psychic conditions of the mediums, these are, I believe, in all instances, similar, in kind, to hypnotic trance. In automatic writing, for instance, Margery feels a slight but perfectly appreciable sense of mental vacuity similar to that seen in the lightest form of hypnotic influence, even though she may seem to the onlookers to be in a perfectly normal state. The deep mediumistic trances would then have their analogues in those seen also in hypnotic subjects.

As to the induction of trance conditions, we know that, in hypnotic practice, this is ordinarily produced by some human agent such as a physician, but the fact of self-hypnosis is well-known and might well be responsible for certain varieties, at least, of mediumistic trance. An active entrancing entity outside the medium's organism need not, therefore, be assumed. The trance condition, however, whatever its cause, brings with it supernormal powers such as clairvoyance in the dark, and the knowledge thus obtained is exhibited later in a manner exactly similar to that seen in the phenomena of post-hypnotic suggestion.

The simplest example of this reaction we have seen in the ex-
periment of Jan. 4, 1928, in which Margery reproduced in automatic script the No. 10 of the calendar and the circle which had been selected by Walter-Margery in the dark. We have seen, however, this preliminary simplicity of procedure disappear very rapidly with each succeeding experiment. First two and then three mediums instead of Margery alone come under the Walter-Margery influence even though they are widely separated in space. Next, Walter sits alone at Lime Street, and becomes apparently entirely separated from Margery who then becomes a simple recipient with no trace of agency. Walter then, from a distance, drives his team of three mediums with the same unimpaired skill as was exhibited with Margery alone.

Finally, Walter, having thoroughly prepared the way, stands aside and allows the Chinese entities, known as Confucius and his disciples, to come in and drive his well-trained steeds, in the circus of post-hypnotic suggestion.

But we began with the simple idea that Margery’s trance was self-induced, that clairvoyance supervened, and that the post-hypnotic effects were simply those exercised by Walter-Margery, a secondary Margery personality. How can this hypothesis suffice when Walter continues his control with Margery eight miles away, and extends this control to two other far distant mediums, and when numbers, figures and sentiments expressed in English and initiated in Boston are translated within a few minutes into good Chinese, hundreds of miles away?

If the Chinese writing represented only quotations from already existing Chinese printed literature one might perhaps seek the origin in travelling-clairvoyance of a Walter-Margery personality with as a result a sort of rudimentary book-test. In these experiments however, many of the words, numbers, and sentiments are known to no one till the time of the sitting, and must be translated on the spur of the moment by minds familiar with both English and Chinese. By no stretch of the imagination can any Margery personality be endowed with a knowledge of Chinese. Equally improbable is the idea that the
Chinese entities know much English. Just how the translating is done is far from clear. Perhaps the answer lies in Walter’s reiterated statement that, on his plane, language is unnecessary; that thoughts and ideas impelled in any desired direction, reach their destination and are assimilated without any mediating apparatus.

Naturally, for communication under our human conditions, the mediating script or voice becomes indispensable.

All of which discussion, of course, does not touch the question of almost simultaneous transfer of these translated ideas to two other mediums widely separated in space. The conditions must differ widely from those under which previous telepathic experiments have been carried out. Hitherto telepathy has in most instances required intense mental concentration by the agent. In our experiments the communicating medium has been so sensitive that irrelevant facts, even, have encountered practically no resistance to passage.

Under the circumstances all must agree, I think, that in harmonizing the facts the simplest explanation is the spiritistic one—that Walter is what he claims to be, the still-existent brother of Margery; that through years of patient experimentation, assisted by the persistent cooperation of the Lime Street circle, he has mastered many of the conditions incident to mediumship in general, and that of Margery in particular; that the control thus gained is not restricted to physical conditions, but is now becoming extended so as to include mental phenomena; that this mental control can under proper supervision be delegated to other entities, such as the Chinese who exist apparently under conditions similar to his own; that this control is independent of space conditions and has some relation to the physics of wireless, in which domain Walter promises enormous progress during the next few years. An interesting point in this connection is Walter’s statement that, in order to be able to get into communication with any individual, mediumistic or otherwise, on our plane, he must first have had personal touch with him—possibly in order to get his wave-length.

Because the spiritistic explanation is simple does not, of
course, assure its truth. Neither should its simplicity require its rejection.

The facts as submitted are most extraordinary and their elucidation will require long-continued consideration by the best equipped minds. Their validity is so obvious to those in closest touch with the case that hesitation is felt in touching at all upon this feature. In conclusion, however, the question of fraud versus genuineness may be considered long enough to point out the following facts:

Some, of course, of the phenomena which I have described will yield to the theory that the room is not really dark, that the Psychic is able normally to get visual sensations from the material used—a theory quite wide of the evident facts but nevertheless one that is persistently advanced by the absentee critic. But we come in this paper to a very extensive series of facts which require more than this; which require a pre-arrangement between Margery and the other mediums, the sitters, the recorders, and even outsiders like the Chinese translators. It is evident, however, that there comes a point at which this hypothesis of universal confederacy must stop; or if not this, that the entire present report must be dismissed off-hand as a deliberate fabrication in the interests of a false mediumship. It is respectfully submitted that no critic who hesitates at this logical climax may by any means escape the hypothesis of validity. The facts here chronicled constitute conclusive proof of the existence of Margery's supernormal faculties, and the strongest sort of evidence that these work through the agency of her deceased brother Walter.
ASPR PROCEEDINGS VOLUME 3
"Margery"
PROCEEDINGS
of the
AMERICAN SOCIETY for
PSYCHICAL RESEARCH

VOL. XXII

THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

THE "WALTER" HANDS
A Study of Their Dermatoglyphics
by
Brackett K. Thorogood

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR PSYCHICAL RESEARCH
15 Lexington Avenue
New York
1933
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I: Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II: Definition of Certain Terms and Certain Preliminary Matters</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III: The &quot;Walter&quot; Hands</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV: The &quot;Walter&quot; Fingers</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V: The &quot;Walter&quot; Finger Tips</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI: Types of Finger Patterns</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII: The &quot;Walter&quot; Palms</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII: Paraffin Gloves</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX: Early Wax Impressions</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X: Classification of Waxes</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI: Prints Obtained at Solus Sittings</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII: Impressions Other Than &quot;Walter's&quot;</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII: Impressions Made Under Unusual Conditions</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV: Special Cases</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV: Mixed Prints</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVI: Changed Impressions</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVII: Comparison of the Hands of &quot;Margery&quot;, &quot;Walter&quot; and &quot;Dr. X&quot;</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVIII: Certain Criticisms</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVI</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVII</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVIII</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIX</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XX</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXI</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXII</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXIII</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXIV</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXV</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXVI</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PREFACE.

The purpose of this third volume of Proceedings on the Margery Mediumship is to present a report of certain investigations of the finger-print phenomena, made by Mr. Brackett K. Thorogood, Research Consultant of the Society. The circumstances which occasioned the investigation require a somewhat detailed statement of explanation, not only to insure a complete understanding of the Report, but also to make them a matter of permanent record in the history of the case.

Beginning in 1924 efforts were made to repeat in this mediumship the production of paraffin gloves that Geley had obtained in his experiments with the medium Kluski. A number of such gloves were obtained. Out of this gradually developed the notion of obtaining finger prints of "Walter," the control. No one, of course, had any knowledge whatever of, indeed, any theory as to how the finger-print patterns of a dead man could persist and be reproduced through a mediumistic agency; but the development of this mediumship has been characterized throughout by a definite plan of proposing to the control a series of problems of constantly increasing complexity and apparent difficulty designed to test in an experimental manner the scope and essential nature of the powers exercised by the control. The registering of finger prints was one of the problems thus presented to "Walter." Various media were tried, including ink, paraffin smeared on glass, and several plastic substances; but with no very great success. By filling the paraffin gloves with plaster of Paris and thus obtaining molds of the hands, it was found that a model of the surface structure of the teleplasmic hand or fingers was obtained, but the details of the pattern were seldom clear and the process was very cumbersome and uncertain.

On July 30, 1926, "Margery" visited her dentist, Dr. "X" of Boston, who had been a frequent sitter at the séances held
during the first year or so of the mediumship, but who had not been present since 1924. She discussed with Dr. "X" the progress of the phenomena and particularly the efforts to obtain finger prints and the difficulty of finding a proper substance to receive the impressions. He suggested the use of a dental wax called "Kerr" and showed her how to use it by making on sample pieces several impressions of his own thumbs. "Margery" returned home in the late afternoon with these impressions and a number of pieces of unused wax, and found there Mr. Charles S. Hill, Mr. E. E. Dudley, Mr. Wendell P. Murray, a lawyer of Boston, and Dr. and Mrs. E. W. Brown. Dr. Brown had called to attend "Margery's" mother who was ill. "Margery" told this group about the "Kerr" and showed them the impressions that Dr. "X" had made. It was decided to try the new wax at a séance to be held in the evening. Mr. Dudley, who was particularly interested in the finger-print experiments, was given the used waxes and took them away with him.

It is necessary to state that Mr. Dudley not only denies that he received the waxes impressed by Dr. "X," but also claims further that he did not then even know that Dr. X had made any impressions at all. On the evidence, however, we are satisfied that the facts are as above stated.

At the séance that evening Mr. Dudley was present, the "Kerr" was used and several prints were obtained. The results were highly satisfactory, and thereafter "Kerr" was used exclusively in all finger-print experiments. Upwards of 200 prints have since been obtained on "Kerr," most of them being claimed by "Walter" to be prints of his own thumbs.

Experiments with the thumb-print phenomena continued intermittently for the ensuing five years with Mr. Dudley in general charge and supervision of the work. With no initial experience in the subject he applied himself diligently to the task of becoming familiar with finger-print science and practice, made the acquaintance of several police experts, discussed the subject with them and soon began to consider himself an expert. In collaboration with J. Malcolm Bird, who was then Research Officer of the Society, Mr. Dudley prepared the series
of articles describing the finger-print experiments which were published in the Journal during 1928, and others which were published in 1929.

Mr. Bird ceased to be Research Officer in January, 1931, leaving in galley or page proof an unfinished manuscript of a proposed volume of Proceedings dealing with the Margery case which included a somewhat lengthy account of the finger-print experiments prepared by or with the collaboration of Mr. Dudley. Mr. Dudley was suggested as a candidate to succeed Mr. Bird as Research Officer. He was not appointed, but was specially employed by the Society to rewrite the manuscript and complete it for publication. This job was nearly finished and most of the corrected proofs returned to the Society,¹ when, on March 11, 1932, Mr. Dudley wrote Mr. W. H. Button, President of the Society, saying that he had "additional evidence," on the finger-print experiments which would require "some changes" in the text of the Proceedings, "not extensive but involving a paragraph here and there."

A week later, after an interview with "Margery" hereinafter referred to, Mr. Dudley wrote another letter to Mr. Button elaborating the somewhat cryptic statement of the first letter and claiming that he had discovered that the so-called "Walter" prints were in fact identical with the prints of a living man, one of the early sitters. These two letters are printed as Appendices I and II on page 157, infra. It later developed that the early sitter referred to was "Margery’s" dentist, Dr. "X." Other correspondence with Mr. Dudley followed and on April 4th Mr. Button and Mr. Walton, Chairman of the Research Committee of the Board of Trustees, interviewed Mr. Dudley at length on the subject, in Boston. He was told that the matter of his new evidence would be carefully investigated and considered, and was requested to prepare for the Society a publishable statement of his discovery and what he claimed in respect thereto. This he promised to do, saying that it would take him only a few days. If the promise was sincere when made

¹ This is referred to by Mr. Thorogood as "Manuscript Proceedings."
other factors seem soon to have intervened to mold the situation for other purposes than the scientific study of the case. Frequent requests to Mr. Dudley thereafter for his promised statement were not complied with until June 13th when a statement was received by Mr. Button with a somewhat peremptory demand for prompt publication. On June 13th he was invited to come to New York at the Society's expense to confer with the Research Committee on the subject, but this he at once declined to do. Investigations conducted in the meantime revealed that negotiations were under way for the publication of the story as a sensational expose in a popular weekly magazine of wide circulation.

It was then decided that before anything was published by the Society on the matter a full and adequate examination of all the facts was imperative, and Mr. Dudley was informed that the Society had adopted that policy and that when such examination was concluded the full facts would be published with all the relevant evidence. Mr. Dudley's statement and exhibits were returned to him at his request. In view of the impending publicity a statement briefly explaining the situation was inserted in the July number of the Journal. For ready reference this statement is reprinted as Appendix III on page 158ff, infra.

The story was ultimately rejected by the popular magazine, but Mr. Dudley found a publisher in Dr. W. F. Prince of the Boston S.P.R. which printed a somewhat revised and expanded article in Bulletin XVIII, in October, 1932, with supporting articles by Hereward Carrington and Arthur Goadby. Mr. Goadby shortly thereafter resigned as a Trustee of the A.S.P.R. As the alleged excuse for noticing the matter at all Dr. Prince, as editor of the Bulletin, prefaced it with a claim that the facts were being threatened with suppression by this Society. A further comment a propos Bulletin XVIII was thereupon published in the Journal for November, 1932, and is likewise reprinted, as Appendix IV, page 162ff, infra. Dr. Prince, relying heavily on Mr. Dudley's alleged discovery, subsequently announced publicly that the mediumship had suffered a stroke of paralysis, is a patent fraud, and its supporters dupes. He
also makes denunciatory capital out of the claim that Mr. Dudley, from being an ardent advocate and supporter of the mediumship, has been compelled at last to become an exposcer of the case and has in fact dealt it a death blow by his discovery.

In Bulletin XVIII it is suggested both by Mr. Dudley and by Mr. Goadby that the motives and sincerity of Mr. Dudley had been brought into question by the officers of this Society, and that doubts were entertained as to the authenticity of his data. Mr. Dudley's motives are obviously of no importance if his evidence is valid and the identity he claims a real one. The Society, therefore, is not interested in probing them per se, because the issue is solely one of objective fact. But on that issue the surrounding circumstances are relevant and material, including any motive or bias that might operate to affect the credibility or impartiality of a person on whose testimony some of the evidence rests. Furthermore, since he himself has publicly raised the question of his motives, and his editorial sponsor has publicly in subsequent writings and with no known dissent by Mr. Dudley presented him as an investigator who has been compelled solely by evidence, more or less accidentally discovered, to reverse his scientific judgment on the case, something must be said about Mr. Dudley's relations with Lime Street and various aspects of his conduct directly connected with the matter at issue.

It is always unpleasant to discuss personalities, but the duty to set forth the facts relevant to the matter covered by this Report is inescapable. Too often has charitable reticence suppressed facts that should be known if the truth is to be uncovered and false claims refuted.

In February, 1925, Mr. Dudley introduced himself to "Margery" by a fulsome letter commending her course in the face of the criticism and controversy then raging in the newspapers over the case. He was later personally presented at Lime Street and attended many sittings. He displayed great interest in and familiarity with the history and literature of psychical research. His personal experience with the physical phenomena of mediumship was limited, but he developed facility in assisting
at the séances and an eager desire to be useful. He wrote for the newspapers letters and articles discussing the case and its investigators, and at all times talked voluminously and with seeming understanding of the problems presented by the various experiments carried on. He became very friendly with the entire Crandon family, enjoyed the run of the house and was fully trusted. He had some mechanical skill and was helpful in arranging and handling apparatus. He finally became a regular member of the Lime Street group, came and went as he pleased and for him the house was always open, day or night. After a while it developed that he was somewhat needy financially and for a long period Dr. Crandon paid him for his services. He became a sort of séance-room major-domo and general assistant. As the finger-print program developed his eagerness and facility in picking up the details and technique of finger-print practice soon gave him a somewhat dominating position as one who knew the subject far better than anyone in the group, and he was given general charge of the experiments. He ordinarily marked and dated the waxes, made the analyses and classifications of the prints and attended to photographing the exhibits. He took the waxes home with him at any and all times and retained them without question for as long as he wished. He kept lengthy detailed records of the séances. The work of preparing accounts of the experiments for publication was largely and in many respects exclusively his. No one, in fact, was more intimately familiar than Mr. Dudley with the entire mediumship and particularly with every step and detail of the finger-print program, its origin and its development and the daily reactions toward it of the entire Lime Street group.

In the fall of 1929 Mr. B. K. Thorogood was brought to Lime Street by Mr. Dudley who says he "took him in as a collaborator." Because of Mr. Thorogood's interest in the subject he became a frequent if not a regular attendant at the séances. He had skill and ability and wide experience in several lines of scientific work and was so keenly intelligent in applying his trained mind to the problems presented in the case, that
the circle became convinced that he might easily become a real leader in the scientific study of the subject. In the summer or fall of 1930 Dr. Crandon decided to put Mr. Thorogood in full control of the séances. He announced this arrangement rather abruptly without previous warning and informed the group, including Mr. Dudley, that thereafter Mr. Thorogood would have entire charge. No one could come to a séance without the consent of Mr. Thorogood who was to have sole direction of initiating and conducting future experiments. The announcement was somewhat of a blow to Mr. Dudley who says “I found myself forced out”; but he, nevertheless, continued for a while to attend some of the séances and to work on the re-writing of the Proceedings Manuscript. He soon complained that Mr. Thorogood was appropriating his ideas of research and became somewhat sullen and morose. Later some one interfered with and sabotaged certain of the experimental apparatus that Mr. Thorogood had set up in the séance room, and Dr. Crandon quietly put a lock on the séance-room door. Mr. Dudley, to his great discomfort, for the first time did not have the freedom of that room and upon discovering the lock flew into a temper. Although invited to the séances he thereafter gradually dropped out.

Mr. Dudley’s growing sense of ill treatment and resentment was further accentuated when he learned that the Society had formally engaged Mr. Thorogood as a Research Consultant to undertake a series of new experiments with the mediumship. The man Mr. Dudley introduced to Lime Street had, in Mr. Dudley’s opinion, completely supplanted him and was, moreover, about to appropriate as his own, ideas and suggestions of which Mr. Dudley claimed to be the author. Nursing his feelings of disappointment and resentment Mr. Dudley absented himself completely from Lime Street and embarked upon the efforts that brought about the announcement of his alleged discovery.

In March, 1932, “Margery” learned that Mr. Dudley had been to her doctor’s office and had asked for his finger prints under circumstances that caused the doctor some embarrass-
ment. The doctor protested to "Margery." She sent for Mr. Dudley, who on March 18th, spent some time at Lime Street telling her that he had just discovered that the "Walter" prints were identical with those of her dentist and displaying photographs arranged to demonstrate the identity. He talked about the mills of the gods grinding slowly; admitted that he was incensed at the way he had been treated and announced a conviction that he must publish the story. On the same evening he wrote the letter to Mr. Button which is printed as Appendix II.

After the announcement of his alleged discovery Mr. Dudley undertook to minimize the importance of the part he played in the development and conduct of the finger-print experiments. In a letter to Mr. Button dated March 27, 1932, he said:

"I have never controlled the course of these finger-print experiments, never occupied the position of control while they were being made, nor had a solus sitting. The prints are made in darkness, therefore, I am dependent on the statements of others as to most of their actions, and these statements I must take on faith, as must the reader of the reports. If these statements are unreservedly accepted it would appear that a considerable number of the prints were made supernormally. I have testified to my part in these sittings, and to my knowledge as to what others have or have not done. Beyond that I cannot properly go."

Theoretically this statement is fair enough and, aside from the questions of fact it involves, is unexceptional and sound if applied to strangers or fortuitous collaborators dealing with a matter as among themselves at arm's length and with allowable mutual suspicion of each other's good faith and competency. Practically the statement assumes, contrary to the fact, that such was the situation Mr. Dudley occupied at Lime Street. It implies the harboring of a contemporaneous suspicion on his part as to the good faith of the medium and sitters that did not in fact exist. If Mr. Dudley sought to imply by his statement that he distrusted the Lime Street group or any of them or any person taking part in the séances as observer or
active participant, and that he thought there was any reason to question their good faith or to believe there was collusion and confederacy to deceive, or even any suspicion thereof, it is strange that the first indication of such an attitude came only after he, as he has said, was "forced out" and had a grievance. If he, in fact, had suspicions, justified or not, that any one of his collaborators was lying or unintentionally making inaccurate or untrue statements as to any part of the séance action, his suppression of the fact was unethical in respect to the Society which accepted his written work as sincere. We feel it is more consistent with the facts to interpret the resort to theoretical distrust of other witnesses as an attempt to escape from his frequently announced convictions of supernormality, and leave the way open for others to imply that Mr. Dudley entertained suspicions of fraudulent manipulations. Such technique is revealing as to some things but does not add anything of value to the subject and cannot be honored as a legitimate part of scientific methodology.

After the receipt of Mr. Dudley's letter of March 18th Mr. Thorogood was instructed to suspend all other work with the case and undertake, along any lines he might determine, a careful, exhaustive and unsparing examination of the whole series of finger-print phenomena with particular reference to the alleged identity of the "Walter" prints with those of Dr. "X," and report the result of his study for publication with as much speed as possible.

Mr. Thorogood was well qualified for the task. After attending the old Chauncey Hall School in Boston he received professional training in mechanical and electrical engineering at the Lowell Institute School of the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. He practiced his profession for twenty years and for ten years was instructor in the Mechanical Engineering Department of the Graduate School of Engineering of Harvard University from which he resigned to take charge of the rehabilitation and training of ex-service men as Educational Counselor at Franklin Union, a technical institute in Boston. He has remained in charge of its day courses ever since. Dur-
ing his years at Harvard University he took various courses in science, engineering, mathematics and psychology, and served as consultant in engineering and research, and as personnel expert for large industrial plants. During the World War, in addition to his other activities, he was employed on aeronautical work and as instructor for officers in the mathematics of heavy artillery fire. For more than thirty years Mr. Thorogood has pursued the study of abnormal psychology and psychic phenomena as an avocation. In June, 1931, he was engaged as Research Consultant by the American Society for Psychical Research.

In presenting his report on the finger-print phenomena we wish to commend the skill, perseverance and courage Mr. Thorogood has displayed in doing the necessary work. A constant barrage of criticism from many quarters for alleged delay in concluding his investigation served only to quicken his sense of responsibility for accurate, dependable study of the facts and sound conclusions. We hope the report will be found by competent critics to embody all of these.

On the merits of the issue as to the identity of the “Walter” prints we leave the matter to be judged upon the evidence and inferences contained in the Report; but we believe that the alleged identity has been disproved. Mr. Thorogood’s report shows that so many elements of uncertainty and so many suspicious and ambiguous circumstances surround the waxes used by Mr. Dudley as alleged examples of “Walter” prints, that any careful and impartial reader must feel, as we do, that their authenticity as genuine séance room productions has been wholly impeached or at least so seriously brought into question that they must in the end be disregarded as data in reaching any disinterested judgment on the real merits of the question. In planning his investigation Mr. Thorogood undertook first to secure under his own control new data that could not be questioned as to authenticity and would be free from any possible doubt as to origin and subsequent history. The fundamental soundness of such procedure will, we believe, be conceded by the most meticulous stickler for scientific methodology. The
PREFACE

"standard Walter hands" thus obtained are in themselves a remarkable result of applying experimental laboratory technique to the study of mediumistic phenomena, and constitute a notable achievement in research.

Whatever conclusion one may come to on the issue of identity, however, there will remain the problem of how the prints are obtained. The evidence bearing on that problem, we believe, rules out normal action, fraud and trickery as the explanation. The records of the séances at which prints were obtained are voluminous and circumstantial, but unfortunately the great majority of them have never been published. Accounts of typical séances may be found in the Journal of the Society for 1928-1932.

For convenient reference and as illustrations of the circumstances under which finger impressions are obtained, we print as Appendix V, page 166ff, infra, the record of a séance held on April 10, 1928, in which Dr. R. J. Tillyard, F.R.S., as the sole sitter, obtained three prints under conditions of control that were beyond criticism; and as Appendix VI, page 182ff, infra, the record of a séance held March 11, 1931, at which Mr. W. H. Button as the sole sitter procured a print while the medium was bound to her chair with surgeon's tape in such a manner that she could move neither hand nor foot. The hypothesis of fraud or trickery in these two séances, as in many others, can be maintained only by the most obdurate of skeptics.

The evidence not only rules out fraud but, we believe, overwhelmingly demonstrates that the prints obtained in the "Margery" séances are supernormally produced. For a brief discussion of the meaning of this expression as used in this connection see page 3ff, infra. No one, not excepting Dr. Crandon or the medium herself, had fuller or better opportunity than Mr. Dudley to know the facts and to detect any fraudulent or normal factor, or any suspicion thereof, in the process of production. That he at any time detected and for any reason whatever suppressed mention of any such circumstances, is quite unbelievable; and no one has as yet suggested such conduct by Mr. Dudley as even remotely possible. He, on the
contrary, in season and out of season, orally and in published writings, has maintained that the evidence justifies acceptance of the supernormality of the phenomena as a fact, and that he today believes there was any element of fraud, trickery or deception involved is not at all credible. The belief or opinion of any one person as to such a matter is, of course, rather unimportant, unless he be a person of such qualifications, accomplishments and general reputation that his opinion would be accepted as *per se* weighty evidence. In the instant situation Mr. Dudley's belief or opinion is of some relevancy because it is being represented to be hostile to the honesty of the mediumship under circumstances that are expected to give it great weight in the minds of the public. It thus becomes a proper inquiry to ask what is Mr. Dudley's opinion on the value of the evidence as proof of fraud in the case. Direct questions to him on the point have been evaded.

Assuming that the identity of the "Walter" prints with those of Dr. "X" is established, Mr. Dudley might, indeed, say with consistency that claiming as his own the finger-prints of another is a serious reflection upon the reputation of "Walter" for truth and veracity; but he would not, we believe, voluntarily say that in his judgment it proved or even indicated fraud in any degree on the part of the medium or anyone connected with the séances. The theory of the matter that it presents a sort of practical joke by the control would add one more problem no less intriguing than many others in the subject. In a letter to Mr. Button on March 24, 1932, Mr. Dudley said: "From a strictly scientific standpoint identification (of the prints) has very little bearing on the question of a supernormal versus a normal origin."

It was obvious, nevertheless, that if the prints claimed to be "Walter's" were in fact identical with those of Dr. "X", a conclusion of fraud would immediately be drawn and heralded by everyone interested in discrediting the subject in general and the Margery Mediumship in particular. The event justified the prediction. Mr. Dudley was of course well aware of this inevitable result. He did not have to cry fraud himself; if so minded, he had only to invite others to do so, and then enjoy
the prominence and publicity that would be accorded to him at the expense of the Crandons.

No fault can be found with Mr. Dudley for making the discovery, if he did make it, or for using it if possible in any proper way for his own advantage. And, of course, no honest person would advocate suppressing any real evidence, regardless of what it might prove or how disturbing it might be to the people involved or how disastrous to their reputations. The Society, on the other hand, recognized that the circumstances surrounding the alleged discovery raised so many suspicions as to the reality of the alleged identity and the validity of the evidence offered in its support, that careful investigation before accepting Mr. Dudley's story and giving it official publicity was not only a reasonable course to follow but a compulsory one in fairness to all concerned. The certainty of misinterpretation, malicious and otherwise, of that course, if adopted by the Society, was fully realized, but the risk was gladly assumed. Fear of unjust criticism is never a deterrent to responsible action soundly conceived. The very violence, moreover, of Mr. Dudley's asserted belief in the simplicity of the question and in the utter finality and conclusiveness of his case for the alleged identity, and his desire for immediate publication of his account without waiting for the matter to be looked into or checked by anyone else, added considerably to the feeling that the question was not so simple and that the merits of the issue were not to be so easily foreclosed and did not interest him so deeply as a desire to capture a certain fame and to disturb the peace of mind of his former friends and associates and expose them to the discomfort of an attack upon their honor and integrity which was sure to follow. In pursuing the course he took, whether on his own initiative or under the prodding of others with their own particular ends to serve, we feel that Mr. Dudley departed very far from the path of a disinterested investigator, and justified an inference that there was something material hidden in the situation that only the most careful investigation would disclose. The Society was thus abundantly justified in adopting the course it took of investigating the claim first and publishing the results
only when the work was completed. Itch for publicity is the last passion that should afflict a scientist or a researcher in this field.

In January, 1930, before the discordant circumstances above referred to had developed, Mr. Dudley contributed to the Journal a theoretical discussion of the reversal of psychic casts and an "Analysis of the Finger-print Problem on the Basis That a Mold or Molds Are Used in Their Production." The latter part of the article we reprint as Appendix VII, pages 190ff (Psychic Research, Vol. XXIV, pp. 32-34, Jan., 1930). Mr. Dudley there convincingly argued that the use of rigid molds to produce the prints was an "assumption palpably absurd," and that the use of flexible molds for such purpose presented difficulties which made the second assumption almost equally improbable. The hypothesis of "ideoplastic production," (a theoretical supernormal process) was then suggested by Mr. Dudley as well supported by the evidence.

There is no subsequent statement by Mr. Dudley that we know of, which in any way answers, modifies or is inconsistent with the arguments advanced by him in that article, and it is, we believe, a fair statement to say that Mr. Dudley today still clings in his own mind to the supernormal ideoplastic hypothesis of production as true, whether the prints are, as he claims, identical with those of a living man, or are not.

Mr. Dudley himself has in fact not charged fraud in the case, and we do not believe that, in his right mind and acting voluntarily, he will. He is content to let others bear the odium or enjoy the credit for such a charge. His close association, however, since 1931 with those who do charge fraud and his willingness to remain silent on that specific issue while they defame the mediumship largely on the basis of his statements, is a situation from which inferences relevant to the merits of the issue may be legitimately drawn. Our own inference is that it destroys any possible belief in the good faith of Mr. Dudley and fatally impairs his credibility as a reliable investigator. Beyond that, we think, no inference relevant to the issue can properly be drawn. Mr. Dudley may assert, and in fact has asserted, that he has simply stated the facts and is not responsible in any way
for what others may charge, or for the inferences that others may draw from the facts he claims to be established. This position, we believe, under the circumstances is an insincere pose, without even technical propriety, much less ethical justification. Having assumed to hold himself out publicly as a scientific investigator and an authority on the subject for over six years, and having accepted employment by the Society on that basis, Mr. Dudley cannot so easily evade the duty to be frank with the public and the Society which gave him a forum and opportunity to speak to those interested. His complete silence as to charges of fraud made largely, as he well knows, as inferences from his supposed discovery, indicates, not devotion to truth and adherence to scientific methodology, but simply a willingness to let others, his associates and friends of the moment, inflict the wounds which he cannot honestly or decently inflict himself. If one does draw the inference that Mr. Dudley by his silence concurs in the charges of fraud, we believe that a willingness to allow his position on so important a matter to be left in any doubt is equally discreditable. Psychical research is not advanced by such methods, but encountering them in the subject is, unhappily, a frequent experience and to the serious student they finally become like barnacles on a ship that moves forward despite them but makes better progress when they are removed.

We are not at all sure that all of the circumstances pertinent to the problem have as yet been uncovered, because much is involved that cannot be subjected to laboratory analysis. But within the limits of their ability and with the means at hand, the Society and its Research Consultant have sought to present fairly and in precise and accurate form all the facts and evidence that have been discovered or found available that seem relevant to an understanding of the finger-print phenomena and the claim as to identity of the prints. It is hoped that this volume of Proceedings may be found a worthy contribution to the history of the case and of value in the solution of problems presented by one of its most intricate and interesting phases.
THE "MARGERY" MEDIUMSHIP

THE "WALTER" HANDS

A STUDY OF THEIR DERMATOGlyphICS

"Read not to contradict and confute, nor to believe and take for granted, nor to find talk and discourse, but to weigh and consider."

Bacon

I

Introduction

In the Spring of 1932, the writer was asked by the Research Committee of the American Society for Psychical Research to review from the beginning all available material and subject matter pertaining to the finger impressions, claimed to be supernormal, which for the past eight years had been a feature of the "Margery" mediumship, for the purpose of determining whether there was sufficient evidence of the uniqueness of these prints to answer satisfactorily any possible question as to their identity, authenticity and supernormality.

The immediate occasion for this investigation arose out of the announcement by Mr. E. E. Dudley that he had discovered that the finger impressions claimed to be "Walter's" were in fact identical with those of a living man, and our study was to include an examination of all the available evidence bearing on that claim.

The details of this investigation and the conclusions to which it has led us are set forth in this report.

At the very beginning of our task we found that the early records were not sufficiently complete or accurate to serve as the sole basis of our study, so it became necessary for us to conduct further experiments for the purpose of securing additional data from our own observations of the phenomena and under our own conditions of control.
The documentary record of this mediumship disclosed from the beginning a persistent attempt to apply to the study of the phenomena produced a laboratory technique of experimentation, and the experiments which we initiated and carried through were in themselves a test of the *repeatability* of the phenomena under new and rigorous conditions. The results of our efforts constitute what we consider well-nigh conclusive evidence of the validity and supernormality of the phenomena studied.

We also found it necessary to make a careful study of the dermatoglyphics of many of the earlier prints, and of the possibility of artificial duplication as well as of the production of replicas by normal means, all of which entailed correspondence with experts both in this country and abroad.

In addition, a great deal of experimental and photographic work was carried on in the laboratory in order to check various phases of this study.

Our conclusions, therefore, have been reached after an exhaustive study of all the early material that was available, such as contemporaneous records, literature, photographs, ink-prints, paraffin gloves, plaster casts and waxes, as well as of new and authentic wax impressions, made both in relief and intaglio and obtained in connection with this study through the medium "Margery" under controlled conditions in the presence of only the writer, his associates and the official stenographer.
II
DEFINITION OF CERTAIN TERMS
AND
CERTAIN PRELIMINARY MATTERS

In order that our meaning may be quite clear as we progress with this report, it may be well to present here our interpretation of several terms which we shall have frequent occasion to employ, such as "Walter" thumb impressions, "Walter" voice, and such words as supernormal, identity and authenticity.

We are using the word supernormal in the sense in which it is employed by Osty, Geley, and other writers on psychic phenomena.

Osty, in his work entitled "Supernormal Faculties in Man" (p. 11) writes: "We can therefore take as 'supernormal' all knowledge which reaches us by other means than by the activity of the mind working on the direct or indirect reports of the known senses".

Geley, in his volume "From the Unconscious to the Conscious" (pp. 261–2) says: "There is no hard and fast line between the normal and the supernormal; both have their origins in the vital processus and the only difference is that the one is familiar to us and therefore gives us the illusion of understanding it while the other derives its occult character from the fact that it is unusual." Further on, he says: "In fine, there is no supernormal, as there are no miracles! The supernormal is but the unusual manifestation of Self, released by decentralisation, revealing itself by all its powers, even those that are highest and most latent; in contrast with the normal psychic life which only allows of narrow manifestations, strictly confined within bounds of material 'representation.'"

By "Walter thumb impressions," we mean those impressions, generally made in a plastic, which have been obtained in the séance room during experiments carried on by the Lime
Street group and others, and which the "Walter" voice (which purports to be the voice of Walter Stinson, deceased brother of the medium "Margery") has specifically claimed as being his own, and which are quite different and distinct from impressions similarly and at times coincidentally produced, but which "Walter" has claimed were those of other persons.

Up to the present time there has been no evidence that there are in existence any prints of this man's fingers made while he was living. He died in 1911 before these phenomena appeared. There is, to be sure, a razor which had been used by him, upon the handle of which a fragment of a fingerprint was found by Mr. Fife and later described in the Journal of the Society; and quite recently the writer discovered with the aid of ultra-violet light another partial print on the blade of the same razor. Both of these prints, however, are too fragmentary to be of substantial value for the purpose of comparison with the wax impressions. Considerable effort has been made, at one time or another, to find fingerprint prints on other articles known to have belonged to Walter Stinson, but without success.

Therefore, for the identification of the "Walter" prints as those of the medium's deceased brother we must, at any rate for the present, rely in the first instance solely upon the statements of the "Walter" voice, and this we do.

Now as to the "Walter" voice, upon the statements of which we have based our acceptance of the identity of these prints. Since we have no authentic prints, or in fact any prints at all which are definitely known to have been made by the living Walter Stinson, our only evidence is the declaration of the "Walter" voice. This, therefore, raises the question of the origin of this voice, which may be reduced to two possibilities.

1st. That the voice is a purely normal one emanating from the medium, from a confederate, or from some physical mechanism;

2nd. That it is supernormal—that is, that Walter Stinson, per se, is talking, by means of or through the use of a hypo-

---

MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

thetical psychic mechanism obtained or developed from the entranced medium; or that the medium unconsciously and subjectively is producing the voice by exercise of some power the existence of which or its possession by man is unrecognized by science.

Considering the first possibility: This voice as heard in the séance room is full, resonant and masculine though at times somewhat husky, and approximates, if it does not quite equal, in range, quality and volume, an ordinary human voice. It emanates from the general neighborhood of the entranced medium but its point of origin seems to move freely in an area of several feet in all directions from the medium. It talks intelligently, initiates discussions, answers questions that are asked, and carries on argument and conversation in a way which no mechanism yet devised could possibly do without our knowledge, in this séance room and under the control we use.¹

The use of a confederate is for the same reason impossible. And it has been satisfactorily demonstrated² that the voice functions quite independently of the medium’s vocal organs, or at least of their use in any ordinary manner.

As to the second possibility: There is no known scientific way of proving that the voice which we hear and with which we carry on conversation is that of the deceased Walter Stinson, either produced directly or by the aid of the medium “Margery”; nor can we prove that it is or is not a subjective power of the medium, unconsciously employed, although it has happened several times in our presence that the “Walter” voice has spoken before the medium entered the trance condition; and she herself has even carried on conversation with the voice when she was to all appearances still awake.

There are many able defenders of both of these theories. But that the voice is supernormal there is abundant evidence. We shall briefly mention only one proof of several which our

¹ It has been our practice, wherever and whenever possible to isolate the phenomena by elimination of the human factor, first, by localizing the controlled apparatus at the locus of the phenomena, and second, by localizing the phenomena in controlled space.

experiments have demonstrated (the record of which has not yet been published), as follows: We took a sensitive microphone similar to those used in radio broadcasting and placed it in a closed and sealed box (Fig. 1) which was mechanically, acoustically, electrically and magnetically shielded from external physical influences, and connected the microphone electrically with a loud speaker located in a distant part of the building, all connections and equipment being likewise shielded. The characteristic "Walter" voice was reproduced by the loud speaker and recognized by all who heard it, while no sound was audible to those who sat in the room in which box, microphone and medium were located. Under the controlled conditions there was no possibility that the microphone and loud speaker could have been made to function by any normal means whatsoever. The result of this experiment in applying to the problem of the "Walter" voice a strict laboratory technique of isolation, which precluded the possibility of any physical connection between the medium and the interior of the box in any commonly accepted understanding of the words, we believe affords sufficient proof that this phenomenon is supernormal. To persons who have not been present at a "Margery" séance and are not familiar through personal experience with the work of the Lime Street group these statements may not of themselves seem conclusive, but anyone who says that this phenomenon of the "Walter" voice is not supernormal betrays thereby that he is not familiar with the facts.

It will probably for a long time to come be the lot of researchers in the field of psychic phenomena, to have the evidence and conclusions they present meet a priori denial and rejection by the vast majority of people. But adventurers in new fields can well abide the scorn of the doubters, for it is the essence of adventure to explore new things and stand, even though alone, for the facts discovered.

In the presence, however, of this sort of repeatable laboratory experiment conducted with scientific care and precision, a priori skepticism must at least pause, and hesitate to condemn or deny. To ignore and wave it aside with the loud noise
FIGURE 1.

Interior of voice box, showing condenser microphone. This box is about twenty inches on a side and weighs over one hundred pounds. Outside the soundproofing material, which is built into it, there is a continuous sheathing of copper and another of soft iron.
of ignorant and uninformed negation is again, as has so often been done in the past, to substitute prejudice for the true spirit of science.

Whatever may be the explanation of this phenomenon, it is obvious that this voice is directed by Intelligence. It is quite a common occurrence for it to joke, tell stories, compose poetry, reminisce, give instructions, react almost instantly to a question or statement, sometimes answering directly, but often denying any knowledge of the subject broached. When serious matters are under consideration, if the voice says a certain thing will be accomplished it is rarely that this promise is not eventually kept, although its consummation may take days or weeks or months, for "Walter" claims, when presented with a new problem, that he must study or develop the necessary technique and learn how to attain desired results just as anyone would have to do.

To illustrate by concrete facts, the writer has on numerous occasions asked for specific finger prints. One case in particular, the record of which has been published, is that of the Sir Oliver Lodge prints.\(^3\) We asked "Walter," without warning, if he could produce them for us (Sir Oliver being in England at the time), and he not only said that he could, but did so at the times he said he would. There were some nineteen of these, in all, and Mr. Bell of Scotland Yard\(^4\) has shown that they agree with Sir Oliver's actual prints. In this case the man whose prints were obtained is living.

On another occasion we obtained the prints of a man who was not living—namely C. S. Hill\(^5\)—and they check with his actual lifetime prints which were on file. In this instance "Walter" told us beforehand whose prints he would make.

Several similar experiments have been commenced upon which the work has not yet been completed.

When we began to investigate the "Walter" thumb prints for this report the writer definitely asked "Walter" for im-

\(^3\) Journal A.S.P.R., Mar. 1932, Lodge article by Thorogood.
\(^5\) Journal A.S.P.R., Feb. 1932, Hill's Prints by Dr. Richardson.
pressions of at least part of his right hand with the thumb attached, in order to obtain its orientation, specifying further that this print of the hand should include lines, ridges and pores. "Walter" at once said that he would make the whole hand, with all the fingers. This took time. We did not get it immediately. First we obtained part of the palm with the thumb, then parts with the fingers, and so on. But eventually we had the entire hand. Then the writer asked for the left hand in a similar manner. As each piece of wax was impressed, "Walter" told us what it represented. And finally he told us he would give us hands in relief—that he would, in other words, produce normal positives. He even asked the writer, when we were working on the left hand, to name the individual fingers, one by one, as we wanted him to produce them. This was done and the fingers thus made check with those of the other reliefs of the left hand.

All this tends to show that when a serious investigation is under way "Walter" does his best to perform his part of the work, and that his statements with regard to what he will do may be relied upon. We feel justified, therefore, in calling these the "Walter" prints.

We shall later show that the patterns of the fingers thus obtained in relief check with those of the plaster casts made from the early paraffin gloves, and also with most of the authentic wax impressions which, according to such records as are available, have been claimed by "Walter" to be his.

Now as to the authenticity of the material which bears the impressions we have obtained during our investigation. We used for the most part a proprietary dental wax called "Kerr" which readily softens under heat (usually being immersed in hot water), takes the impression of the fingers in good detail, and quickly hardens without distortion.

The identification of these pieces of wax has always been possible, for we have not depended upon shape and appearance alone but upon other characteristics, such, for instance, as the presence of various foreign substances which we had previ-

---

ously secretly added to or imbedded in them. In the case of every one of these recent prints the wax was prepared beforehand by the writer in his laboratory, and remained in his exclusive possession up to the time of his placing it in position to receive the imprint, and from the time it was retrieved until its examination.

Finally, we would again emphasize our belief in the supernormal production of the "Walter" hands which we are about to consider. The main reason for this investigation is the claim that the thumb-print impressions issuing from the "Margery" séance room are supernormally produced, otherwise they would have no interest for persons pursuing psychic research. With regard to this, we state definitely and categorically that we obtained the above mentioned hands in relief, and many other impressions, in a manner which the facts prove to have been supernormal.

The conditions of control under which these hands—which we are using as our standard "Walter" hands—were produced will be given in connection with the detailed description of each hand. For the present, it is sufficient to say that the medium and her apparel were always searched by our own agent immediately before and after each séance, as was the séance room, which was locked on the inside as soon as the group had entered and kept locked until the séance was over; and that an official stenographer took down all conversation. The stenographer sat at a table, somewhat apart, in a substantial red light, so that she could always see and be seen.

There was no possibility that a die was used in making any of these impressions. The hands and feet of the medium were always under the uninterrupted control of some member of the writer's small group of investigators, which usually consisted of Mr. Adams, Mr. Fife and himself. When "Sary," another medium, was present—as occasionally happened—she also was under complete control.

If the reader will consider the size of some of these reliefs, which required pieces of wax eight or ten inches square and half an inch thick, he will realize how improbable it would be,
under the conditions imposed and in the space of forty seconds (for some have been made in this brief space of time) for the medium or any hypothetical confederate to manipulate a mold or die so as to make an impression in the wax and remove the die from it undetected, to say nothing of the difficulty of smuggling such a necessarily cumbersome article into or out of the séance room without immediate detection. Moreover, since no two impressions are exactly alike, their artificial production would have necessitated the use of many dies, not one, even when taking into consideration the known fact that no single die would be likely to produce two impressions exactly alike.

Mr. E. E. Dudley, writing in the January, 1930, number of the Journal (Vol. XXIV, pp. 31–34) presented an analysis of the problem on the basis of normal production by the use of molds. Said he: "The varying forms of these imprints imply a flexible original. For, if the original (whether mold or otherwise) were not flexible there must of necessity be such a multiplicity of rigid molds as to make the assumption palpably absurd."

Furthermore, on several occasions the writer obtained impressions in wax when only the medium and he were present in the locked and searched séance room. Some of the Sir Oliver Lodge\(^7\) thumb prints, among others, were obtained under such conditions.

And as final and conclusive proof of the supernormality of these phenomena, the writer has obtained thumb prints

---

6a See Appendix VII, p. 190, infra.
7 Journal A.S.P.R., Mar. 1932, p. 97, Lodge Prints.
7a For a presentation of the view that it is impossible to prove scientifically that phenomena are genuine and supernormal, see "The Paradox of Psychic Research", by Edwin G. Boring, Professor of Psychology at Harvard, in the Atlantic Monthly, Vol. 137, pp. 81-87 (January 1926). The argument as to supernormality is that when the investigator has excluded every possible agency of production that his ingenuity can conceive, and the phenomena still persist, he has not proved supernormality but simply that he does not know how the phenomena do occur. Furthermore, to establish the reality of the supernormal would be to bring it within the normal. In respect to the "Walter" phenomena discussed by Mr. Thorogood, however, much is in fact known as to the mechanism of production, e.g., the reality of the teleplasmic structures as the means of impressing the waxes is established by overwhelming proof, although little is known as to the source and conditions of the occurrence of the teleplasm. There is, nevertheless, no room to-day in the inn of orthodox science for teleplasm, and to call its occurrence, therefore, a "supernormal phenomenon" seems justified. Finger impressions made by a
Figure 2.
Impression obtained February 23, 1932, under the most rigid conditions of control, in a sealed, locked box.
(Fig. 2) on a plastic in a closed locked box. With regard to the minutes of the special sittings had in connection with this report, notes were taken in shorthand by the official stenographer, and at practically no time in the last two years of investigation have we depended upon the memory of anyone present for an account of what was said or done where such points would be of importance. This claim cannot be made for many of the earlier séances at which these phenomena appeared. In general the early records were compiled by Mr. E. E. Dudley at his leisure and from his memory. Dr. Crandon also kept notes of many of the earlier experiments, which he usually made directly after each séance, but in numerous cases neither his records nor those made by Mr. Dudley can now be found. Therefore, with all respect for the reports of the earlier séances, those which are available cannot always be relied upon since they were not stenographic records made coincidently with the phenomena.

Now let us explain the terms positive and negative as we use them in connection with these impressions.

The pattern on the inner surface of an actual hand we term a normal positive relief. If this surface of the hand is pressed into softened wax it produces an impression which we term a normal negative. In the wax the ridges on the skin of the hand produce furrows. But if an ink print is made from a hand or finger by any of the numerous methods in use, the ink marks are made by the ridges of the skin and such a print is designated a normal positive.

Now if we compare the pattern on the inner surface of the actual hand face up with that of its ink impression it may be seen that the lines of one run in a reversed or opposite direc-

---

8 Journal A.S.P.R., July 1932, p. 268, Locked Box.
tion from the lines of the other, or one may be said to present a mirrored view of the other. It is also true that the lines of a normal negative, such as an impression in wax, run in an opposite direction from those of the normal positive relief, but they do not present a mirrored view of it for the reason that the negative is an intaglio impression.

Whether an impression in wax is a positive or a negative may in some cases be easily determined, but in others it may be very difficult or practically impossible to decide this point. If in this investigation we were dealing with prints made in a normal manner only, or even artificially produced, the presence of certain characteristics would help us to determine these points; but in the case of prints made supernormally we can not, even where these characteristics exist, expect always to find that they agree in all their indications.

These characteristics are:

1st. Location of the pores. If we succeed in finding in a print indication of pore structure we know that the particular locality carrying the pores is a friction ridge, since as a matter of anatomy pores are to be found only on these ridges.9

2nd. Form of the pores. If, on the wax we are examining, the pores should appear as small depressions in the ridges the impression is a positive; but if, on the other hand, the pores should show as small nodules in a depression the wax must be a negative. Unfortunately, on many of the séance waxes which we have there is no indication of pores, so that absolute classification as positive or negative by this means is impossible.

3rd. Width of ridges. Another point to be considered is the width of the friction ridges in comparison with the width of the furrows. This, in our opinion, can not always be taken as conclusive evidence in the analysis of these waxes, for we have found that on some of them no difference in width is apparent.

4th. Joint lines. If a joint line, or skin crease, is depressed it is evidence that the impression at this point is positive; while if it is raised it will indicate that the impression is nega-

---

Luigi Laciana, Human Physiology, Macmillan, 1913.
Box locked, and open. The impression of February 23, 1932, was obtained in this box while it was locked and sealed. This box could not have been opened without detection.
tive. But here again, while in the majority of cases these supernormal prints seem to run true to form, there are instances in which part of an impression is negative and part of it is positive.

5th. *Scars and other marks.* Old scars and other marks of this nature are, in general, depressions in a positive, and ridges or raised areas in a negative. But very often there appear in the waxes imperfections which are not at all of a supernormal nature but may in reality be due to the fact that the plastic when heated is very soft and necessarily alters its form at the merest contact with anything whatsoever.

Of course, none of the above points would be of any use in helping us determine whether an impression is or is not a so-called mirror print. That could be determined only when we have a standard impression or print to compare it with, such as we shall show in our standard "Walter" hands.

Now, whether we attempt to analyze impressions in wax by studying them directly or by studying photographs of them, we shall be very likely to encounter difficulty for the reason that it is very hard, even with the most careful lighting, to eliminate illusion; and in the case of a photograph there is always possibility that the print may have been made from the wrong side of the photographic negative, thus reversing the orientation of the design.

Because of these many questionable factors, therefore, we are basing our conclusions on those waxes only which are clear and distinct and in which the greatest number of the above characteristics can be determined. We shall mention other waxes, and in fact make use of them, but they are not such as may be used to decide an issue. To eliminate illusion when using the microscope, we have made practically all our observations with binocular stereoscopic-vision instruments.

In order that the reader may more clearly understand what we mean when we use *positive, negative,* and other terms in connection with these prints, let us illustrate by means of an actual finger and wax impressions made from it.

---

9b See Appendix VIII: Letter from Bausch-Lomb Optical Co.
In Figure 4, A is a photograph of a living finger. In it the friction ridges and the pore structure show quite clearly. The actual finger we designate a *normal positive relief*.

If we take this finger (A) and press it into soft wax, we shall produce an impression which is a *normal negative* (intaglio) as shown in B. The furrows or depressions appearing in this illustration were made by the ridges of the actual finger while the ridges were made by the furrows of the real finger.

If now we use B as a die, and press it into soft wax we shall obtain an impression which is shown at C. This is a model in relief of the original finger, and may also be designated a *normal positive relief*. Here, what appear as ridges correspond with the ridges, and the furrow with the furrows, of the original finger.

Two other terms which we wish to illustrate and which in the early papers on this subject by Bird, Dudley and others have been emphasized, but which we shall use very little, are *mirror-positive* and *mirror-negative*. Still using the illustrations in Figure 4:

If we look at A in a mirror the reflection will appear as at A'.

B' shows a mirror-negative, and while it is of exactly the same structure as B, it will be noticed that the pattern is reversed.

C' shows a mirror image of C. In this, the detail is the same as in C but is a reversal of it. In orientation and design it is similar to an ink print.

D shows a photograph of an actual ink print of finger A, made by lightly coating the finger with printer’s ink and pressing it upon a piece of paper. The only difference between D, and A or C, is that the ridges in D run in the reverse direction from those of the others. An ink print, if carefully made, shows not only the ridge design but the pores which are in the ridges. The supernormally produced impressions, whether positive or negative, rarely show the pores.

E is an enlargement of the tip of the core of D, showing the pores.
Figure 4.
A. Photograph of an actual finger. A'. Mirror image of A. B. Negative impression of A. B'. Mirror image of B. C. Artificial replica in relief made from B. C'. Mirror image of C. D. Actual ink-print made by A. E. Enlarged view of the core of D showing pores.
III

The "Walter" Hands

Having presented with considerable detail the methods which we have used in obtaining the impressions we are about to illustrate, and having defined our interpretation of many of the terms commonly used in connection with this subject, we now present photographs of the palmar surfaces of complete "Walter" hands in relief, a left hand which was obtained on May 10, 1932, in Figure 5; and a right hand, obtained on May 23, 1932, in Figure 6. The originals of these hands were obtained under conditions of absolute control, and at the time they were made they were said by "Walter" to be reliefs of his hands as they appeared in life, so that in all respects we are satisfied as to their identity, authenticity, and supernormality. For the purpose of this report we designate them the standard "Walter" hands. The conditions under which they were obtained will be given in detail later.

The statement that the hands are in relief has a very important bearing upon this whole subject. Macroscopic observation clearly shows that they have every appearance of being models of the inner surfaces of actual hands. The main lines, the joint lines, the creases, and the papillary ridges all appear as they would on a living hand.

If we examine the ridges microscopically, the sweat pores may be seen as minute depressions on the tops and sides of many of them. This shows conclusively that the model is that of a hand in relief, or that it is what we term a normal positive relief, just as a living hand is a normal positive relief. The size of the sweat pores and the number per centimeter length of ridge or per square centimeter of area seem to agree with those of a normal palm.10

---

In many of the reliefs which we have obtained there are numerous defects, such for instance, as the absence of skin markings in certain areas, or of whole fingers. Some of these defects may have been due to poor preparation of the wax before use, or to the manipulation of it when hot and in the process of being impressed, and since these are established by the evidence to be supernormal phenomena, there is also the possibility that the forming agent may not have been complete. But among so many exhibits there should be no difficulty in clearly distinguishing the points to which we shall call attention, although for close study nothing can replace the actual waxes themselves, since no matter what care may have been taken in making the photographs, the lights and shadows in the picture may cause illusion which it is no simple matter to analyze. We have already referred to this difficulty.

Looking at the photographs of these two standard hands (Figs. 5 and 6), we notice that all the fingers are shown, therefore clearly orienting their dermatoglyphics, and for the first time in the history of this case definitely indicating which finger patterns belong to the right hand and which to the left, a thing it would be impossible to determine were only the detached finger tips available for examination. In other words, we no longer need to rely upon the statements of "Walter" or of anyone to know to which hand, if either, right or left, a detached finger belongs. All that is necessary is to compare the pattern of the finger in question with the patterns of the fingers on these hands to determine whether it is identical with any of them.

Observing the fingers still more critically, we find that on the original waxes the ridges are clearly raised and the joint lines depressed, while the pore structure appears substantially as it would on a normal hand.

Examining now the finger tips, let us take the index, middle, ring and little fingers of both hands. Here the microscope shows structure in relief similar to that already detailed, although the design on each finger tip is different from that of the others. These tips in some cases have the appearance of
FIGURE 5.

The standard "Walter" left hand in relief, obtained under strict conditions of control on May 10, 1932. This shows clearly for the first time the orientation of finger and thumb patterns.
FIGURE 6.

View of standard "Walter" right hand in relief, obtained under strict conditions of control on May 23, 1932. This shows for the first time the orientation of the finger and thumb patterns; also a characteristic scar(s) of "Margery's" right hand.
being pinched, and are slightly smaller in proportion than the fingers to which they belong, while in others they are well formed; and where there are joint lines they are depressed as they should be in a normal positive.

These statements are not based on the study of one set of waxes alone, for we have eight either complete or partial right hands, and seven complete or partial left hands, all in relief, as well as several detached finger tips and thumbs which show joint lines and ridge patterns that check with those of the homologous fingers of the complete hands. Almost all of these were made at the request of the writer, and at the times when, without previous intimation, he asked for them; and they were all produced under severe conditions of control.

When we first attempted to get complete hands, it seemed on “Walter’s” part to be a process of learning how to make them, as we have already mentioned. The results of the first efforts were very poor, but as the experiments proceeded the results rapidly improved until the startling models illustrated in Figures 5 and 6 were obtained. In the beginning we used large slabs of a low temperature wax which would soften under body temperature, but which required considerable pressure in order to record skin markings. About all that was obtained on these were partial right thumb impressions (Fig. 7), which in two or three instances, however, clearly show the core.

On April 8, 1932, using large pieces of Kerr, we obtained two impressions. The first one (Fig. 8) shows a very rough and crude outline of the palm with only a slight indication of the thumb, the skin markings of the upper part of the palm, and beginnings of the fingers. The second wax (Fig. 9) shows less of the palm outline and less of the thumb, but beginnings of the four fingers and some skin markings.

While there are few papillary ridges on these two waxes, enough of the “Walter” characteristics are present to warrant the statement that they check with the “Walter” right hand already illustrated in Figure 6.

On April 12, 1932, we obtained three impressions in Kerr. In the first one (Fig. 10) the wax was very much lumped and
distorted, but there are, nevertheless, indications of three fingers, and palm markings. The second wax (Fig. 11) shows much more of the palm design and also more of the fingers, the last three fingers each showing two joints. There are also apparent a few of the ridges of the thumb, and a small part of the core. The third wax (Fig. 12) was much like the second, with enough of the palm characteristics present to indicate that it was an attempt at making a relief of the right hand. In the case of the last two waxes, the markings on the bulb of the thumb are too indistinct to be of much help.

On April 13, 1932, we obtained our first more or less complete right hand (Fig. 13), showing most of the palmar surface and the three joints of each finger, although it does not show the thumb particularly well. This hand is peculiar, however, in the fact that the tips of the index, middle and ring fingers are negative, as are also the tip and part of the second joint of the little finger, but the rest of the lines, joints, palm, and the bulb of the thumb are in relief, and clearly agree with our standard hands. These finger tips, which are negative impressions, appear as if they had been an afterthought and were added after the hand was made. Nevertheless, they agree with the standard "Walter" hands.

On this evening also we obtained a right thumb impression (Fig. 14) which "Walter" stated was a mirror print. Now, to us a "mirror print" is one which looks like the mirror image of a normal print, and the general direction of the lines on this one would indicate that it may be such a print; but upon close examination it looks more like a normal negative, which is what we think "Walter" really means when he says "mirror print," as we shall later show. Due to the fact that this wax had been over-heated it is full of tiny holes caused by bubbles, which destroy some of the details.

The third piece of wax (Fig. 15) (which was the first one to have been impressed on this evening) bears two impressions. These are poorly made, although the lines that show are fairly sharp. "Walter" said they were negative impressions of his right thumb and right index finger, and the markings that can be seen check with those members on the complete hand.
One of the first attempts by "Walter" at making the impression of his hand, in soft pink dental wax. This shows several partial impressions of the "Walter" right thumb.
FIGURE 8.
One of "Walter's" first attempts at making his right hand impression in Kerr. This shows slight beginnings of the fingers with their ridge designs.
Another attempt at a "Walter" right hand, showing roots of fingers and, in the lower left hand corner, what appear to be skin markings of the wrist.
A much distorted piece of wax showing somewhat more of the fingers and some of the papillary ridge design of the palm.
FIGURE 11.
This shows slightly more of the palm, some of the fingers and the tip of the core of the right thumb.
Figure 12.

Some of the papillary ridge design at the roots of the fingers, especially the deltas at the base of the index and middle fingers.
The first more or less complete right hand, although with many imperfections. The peculiarity in this is that while the hand as a whole is in relief the tips of the four fingers are normal negatives.
Supposedly a mirror-print of the "Walter" right thumb, obtained on May 13, 1932, but in reality it is more like a normal negative. Small craters scattered over the surface are due to overheating of the wax by a gas flame which was used instead of hot water to soften it.
A rather poor negative impression of the "Walter" right thumb and index finger. The wax is quite deformed and is very thin in places.
On April 20, 1932, we retrieved a very irregular chunk of wax (Fig. 16) which, however, shows part of the palmar surface very distinctly, and the beginning of one finger. Here again, such of the design as there is agrees with that of the standard "Walter" left hand. This was the first attempt at making a left hand.

On April 22, 1932, we obtained three wax impressions in relief (Fig. 17), the left index, left middle and left little finger, one at a time, in this order, as specified without previous notice by the writer. They are clear, with well marked ridges and joint lines, and agree with the homologous fingers of the "Walter" standard left hand.

On April 28, 1932, we obtained a very fair left hand in relief (Fig. 18), showing the first joints of some of the fingers, part of the index finger, and the complete middle finger and thumb. The palm markings are quite clear, as are most of the lines that show on the fingers, and all agree with those of the standard "Walter" hand. The bulb of the thumb is attached to the joint in a peculiar manner, and is not quite normal in appearance. This thumb, however, shows all the characteristics of the "Walter" left thumb, including a scar which we shall discuss later. It took eight minutes to make this particular hand.

On May 2, 1932, we obtained another left hand (Fig. 19), with the last two joints of all four fingers missing. The ridge designs of the palm and of the stumps of the fingers and thumb are quite clear and check in all respects with our "Walter" left hand.

On the back of this wax are several partial impressions of the "Walter" right thumb (Fig. 20), which likewise agree with the standard; and there are also traces of what appears to be the "Walter" right palm, but they are indistinct.

On May 3, 1932, a quite complete left hand (Figs. 21 and 21a) was obtained by Mr. Button—the writer not being present—which has the characteristics of the "Walter" left hand. The tips of the ring and little fingers, while formed, show no ridge design.

On the following evening, May 4th, Mr. Button obtained an-
other left hand (Fig. 22), the fingers of which are bent back on themselves in a way in which no normal hand could be bent unless the bones were broken. If this wax had been bent back after the print was made the fingers would show some signs of distortion which they fail to do. Both of these waxes bear the typical "Walter" left thumb, the scar showing clearly, and have been described and illustrated in the Journal.¹¹

On May 9th "Walter" said he was going to try to make both his hands back to back, and we obtained as a result a somewhat distorted piece of wax (Fig. 23) showing clearly on one side the left palm and the complete thumb and first joints of the fingers, with much detail of ridge markings, all fully agreeing with our standard "Walter" left hand.

The other side of the wax (Fig. 24), upon which the right hand in relief was supposed to show, was greatly warped and bent out of shape. Nevertheless, there are enough of the palm and finger markings to show that it is of the right hand. The thumb, which is in relief, agrees with our standard "Walter" thumb, and there appears to be no indication of a scar, although there is an imperfection in the wax which might be mistaken for a scar; but this thumb is peculiarly located beside the little finger as if accidentally shifted over into this position when the left hand was made.

On the 13th of May another right hand was made (Fig. 25) on which the ridge design of the thumb is not very good, the little finger is practically missing, and the ring finger only partially made and showing no markings worth while. Only the first two joints of the middle finger show, the tip being bent over the back as though the wax had been too soft to keep its shape. The index finger is quite complete, and checks, as does the palm, with our standard right hand.

Now let us turn our attention more specifically to the two hands in relief, which we are using as our standard "Walter" right and left hands.

On the 10th of May we obtained the left hand which is illustrated in Fig. 5.

One of the first attempts at making a left hand (May 20, 1932). While this wax carried many imperfections not supernormal, such part of the palm as does show clearly bears excellent papillary ridge design.
This shows tips of the index, middle and little fingers of the "Walter" left hand, all in relief, and made in this order as requested by the writer without warning.
Figure 18.
A partial left hand, quite well shaped, but lacking much of the ridge design and the tips of the fingers.
A quite well formed palm of the "Walter" left hand, showing the general ridge design and the scar on the left thumb.
Figure 20.
The back of the wax illustrated in Figure 19, which was made on May 2, 1932; it bears several partial impressions of the "Walter" right thumb.
"Walter" left hand in relief, produced on May 3, 1932, in two minutes. The fingers are bent back at about 90°.
Figure 21a.

Another view of hand shown in Figure 21.
FIGURE 22.

Two views of a "Walter" left hand in relief bent back on itself. This was obtained on May 4, 1932, in forty seconds. This wax has the appearance of having been impressed while the wax was bent in this position, not of having been deformed after the impression was made.
This shows a "Walter" left hand, somewhat bent, with the ends of the fingers missing. It was an attempt at making a right and left, back to back. The reverse side shown in Figure 24.
Part of a "Walter" right palm in relief, which was impressed into the same piece of wax shown in Figure 23. This is much less complete, and the thumb, while in relief, is located near the beginning of the little finger.
A rather poor "Walter" right hand, but with the index finger well formed and the ridge design clearly showing an ulnar loop.
The wax upon which this hand was made was prepared by the writer at his laboratory by taking eighteen or twenty pieces of Kerr as they came from the manufacturer and fusing them into a single slab. The resulting block of wax was approximately eight inches square and nearly half an inch thick. It was quite regular in shape, relatively smooth on both sides, and contained few hollows, depressions, air bubbles, or other imperfections.

While this wax was in a very plastic condition, at the time of preparing it, a fine copper wire covered with two layers of silk wound in opposite directions was carefully imbedded along one side of it as a means of identification. This wire was a No. 36 Brown & Sharpe gauge, making it 0.005 of an inch in diameter. Only Mr. Adams and the writer knew of this wire being so placed. After this was thoroughly imbedded so that no ends showed, a few crystals of copper sulphate, which are of a bluish green color, were also concealed in the wax. These were added for the purpose of better identification, and not even the writer's colleagues knew that the copper sulphate crystals had been added until after the wax had been used in the séance room.

This wax, sealed in a large and heavy envelope, was taken to the séance at Lime Street by the writer, and was continuously in his possession until, during the séance and while the medium was in trance he removed it from the envelope and placed it on top of a cloth which was in a square cake tin which had also been purchased by him and brought to the séance room this same evening. This tin, which had a perfectly smooth bottom, bearing only the manufacturer's trade mark, was placed on the table in front of the medium.

At 9:15 scalding hot water was poured over the wax, completely covering it. We say the water was "scalding hot." It was in a tea kettle on an electric plate beside the writer's chair and was boiling when poured into the pan. At 9:22 the writer took the same piece of wax out of the cold water, which was in a duplicate cake tin which had also been brought by him. He immediately took the wax to the full red light at the stenogra-
pher's table and scratched on its back the date and length of
time it had been out of his possession (seven minutes), examined
it to see if the wire or any of the crystals were to be seen, and
placed it in the envelope to take back to the laboratory, keeping
it in his possession all the while. At the laboratory it was ex-
amined more carefully for the identifying wire and chemicals,
which were found. There was absolutely no doubt as to its
being the identical piece of Kerr which the writer had taken to
Lime Street, only now its surface bore a relief of a left hand.

Mr. Adams also checked its identity by means of the
imbedded wire.

We may say here, as will be seen in the transcript of the
minutes of that evening, that no sooner had the wax been put
in the hot water than "Walter" asked what those little pieces
of wire were, saying that they stuck in his fingers.

On this evening only Mr. Adams, Mr. Fife, the two mediums
—"Sary" and "Margery"—Miss Barry (the stenographer)
and the writer were in the room.

Before the mediums or the stenographer came into the room,
Adams, Fife, and the writer went in and locked the door, and
with plenty of white light searched it thoroughly,—cabinet,
equipment, walls, floor and ceiling; arranged the electric stove
and placed the tea kettle on it to heat the water; put the two cake
pans on the table—which was to be in front of the medium—
putting cold water in one of them and a cloth in the other. This
cloth is used to prevent the hot wax from sticking to the tin
and to facilitate its removal from the water. We may note here
that these very large pieces of wax take considerable time to
heat through, and are likely to be softer at the edges than in
the centre.

The stenographer in the meantime carefully searched both
mediums and their shoes, stockings, and séance garments, with
negative results and neither of them left her side until we
allowed them to enter the séance room. We also observed them
carefully as they entered, and as soon as they were in the room

12 Appendix IX: Minutes of meeting of 5-10-32.
the writer closed and locked the door, placing the key in his pocket. We might add that the lock may be operated only from the inside, as the keyhole is not cut way through the door, and there is no other means of entrance to or exit from the room except the fireplace, which is small in section, and two windows on the Lime Street side, which are about thirty feet above the street and do not open onto any balcony or fire escape.

Adams immediately took control of "Sary," and the writer of "Margery," the stenographer going at once to her table where a good red light was burning so that she could be seen the entire time. Mr. Fife was also in the room to observe all that took place.

"Margery" was placed in her chair back of the table upon which the two tins were arranged. The legs of this chair are let down into a good sized board to the under surface of which are attached rubber cushions, so that it is very difficult, either with the hands or feet, to change the position of the chair once one is seated in it.

The centre of the chair is approximately thirty inches from the centre of the table in front of it.

The table is a plain light pine affair, with no drawers or opening where anything might be concealed.

We were at first seated in this order,—"Margery," on her right Fife, on his right "Sary," on her right Adams, on his right Thorogood, on his right "Margery."

This was at 9:10 P.M.

Within a very few minutes "Margery" being in trance, "Walter" asked us to change our seating, which we did, making a final arrangement of "Margery," Adams, "Sary," Fife and "Margery" with Thorogood seated within the circle directly in front of the table.

Adams controlled "Margery's" right hand and her right knee with his left hand; Fife in a similar way controlled her left hand and knee; Adams controlled "Sary's" left hand and Fife controlled her right, she being seated somewhat behind the writer, who was free to use both hands to manipulate the hot water and wax.
The séance was over at 9:30, requiring only twenty minutes for the entire proceeding, during which a red light near the séance table was on nearly all the time, in addition to the stenographer’s red light. A red-flash pocket lamp also was used frequently by the writer.

As soon as the séance was over the writer unlocked the door, and the stenographer accompanied both mediums into another room where she thoroughly searched them and their garments with negative results. During this time Adams, Fife, and the writer again searched the séance room and all its equipment, with like negative results.

The examination of the wax bearing the impression showed very conclusively that it was the same piece which had been taken into the séance room.

The time taken to heat and soften the wax, to fashion upon it this hand in relief and place it in the cold water was but seven minutes, and the time consumed in actually making the impression must have been less than a third of that period.

There was no possible chance for either medium to take anything into the room or out of it, and at no time was “Sary” close enough to the table to reach it. The stenographer was in her chair fully six feet away during the entire time. The wax was out of the writer’s possession only while it was in the water, and during this interval he had one hand under the table on “Margery’s” knees and kept the other on top of the table.

We cannot too strongly stress the fact that this hand in relief has every appearance of having been made all at once by a single co-ordinated process. The impression is complete, with the palm, fingers, finger tips, and thumb, and there is no indication of any part of it having been added separately. This, in itself, might indicate supernormality, for few of us could orient our thumb in the same plane with our hand. Thus, the impressing mechanism must be flexible.13 It is, of course, possible to so mold the wax about the hand as to get the thumb impression at the same time with the rest of the hand, but in such a case

the plane of the thumb would appear at an angle of forty-five degrees or more with the palm, as in Figure 26. Moreover, the resulting impression would be a negative, whereas our standard "Walter" hand is a positive. *A positive could not be made normally by any direct method.*

The finger and palm prints of all those present at this sitting have been taken, and show no similarity to the "Walter" hand.

On May 23, 1932, we obtained a complete right hand, which we have already illustrated and presented in Figure 6 as our standard right hand.

The preparation of the wax for this séance was the same as for that of May 10th, except that for identification purposes crystals of sodium bichromate were used in addition to crystals of copper sulphate, the former being of a reddish color. The same procedure was used throughout, the only difference being that the wax was actually out of the writer's possession for a shorter length of time, although the séance itself lasted longer.

We started at 9:10 p.m. The "Walter" voice was heard at 9:20. The writer put the wax into the hot water, which was already in the dish, at 9:28 and at 9:29 withdrew the wax from the cold water dish and examined it in red light, marking as before the date and length of time it took to impress it, one minute. It was found to be a right hand in relief, as "Walter" had said, and he called our attention to a scar in the palm, saying that it was really "Margery's" scar, although the hand was his. This particular phenomenon will be dealt with later.

The personnel of the group at this séance was the same as that of May 10th,—Fife, "Sary," Adams, "Margery," the stenographer who sat apart at a table, and the writer.

The mediums and their apparel were searched both before and after the séance, as were room and equipment, all with negative results, and during the séance the door was locked and the key kept by the writer.

14 Appendix X: Minutes of meeting of 5-23-32.
After the séance the wax was identified as the same piece the writer had brought with him, but now it bore an impression in relief of a right hand.

Thus, we have shown that for a period of over two months "Walter" was engaged, at the specific request of the writer, in the task of producing impressions of his hands, and the results indicate the efforts of a technician mastering his material to attain a definite result by the familiar process of trial and error. We shall not at this time discuss the technique involved or offer any explanation thereof, but the atmosphere of working on a difficult technical problem with an unseen collaborator was an outstanding feature of an otherwise quite normal piece of laboratory research. The elation and satisfaction displayed by "Walter" upon the completion of his task had all the genuineness and spontaneity one might expect from a colleague who had found the answer to a mundane engineering or laboratory problem.
Figure 26.

Dr. "X's" right palm intaglio, showing the impression of the thumb completely attached to the palm. This was made in one operation.
IV

THE "WALTER" FINGERS

Now let us consider more specifically the thumbs of these standard hands. Both of them show very definite, although different, characteristics as to core and other markings. The design of the right thumb pattern shows that it is of the ulnar loop type and that the core consists of a staple or hairpin, although the thumb on our standard hand is not as well developed as others we have obtained and does not show the complete design of the joint. The part of the joint line which shows is depressed. On this thumb there appears to be no scar near the core.

The core of the left thumb is likewise of the ulnar loop type, but consists of a spike which is somewhat curved at its upper end and bifurcated at its lower end. One very noticeable characteristic of every authentic left thumb which we have in relief, and there are ten of them, is the definite scar which cuts clean across the thumb at an angle of about thirty degrees with the joint line, pointing upward toward the index finger, as shown in the photograph, and which cuts the above-mentioned bifurcation of the spike about five mm. from the tip. This scar is depressed in all those thumbs that are in relief. The edges of the ridges, where they were cut, are somewhat puckered and also somewhat sheared in relation to each other, which is not an unusual condition in scars. This scar was said by "Walter" to have resulted from a cut received while whittling, when he was a boy. There is, of course, no way to check this statement.

A better view of the standard "Walter" right and left thumbs in relief is given in Figure 27. All the characteristics

we have just enumerated may be clearly seen in this illustration.

A number of other right and left thumbs, obtained recently, are shown in Figures 28 and 29, and while some of them are incomplete, the details of structure are generally clear.
FIGURE 27.

The standard "Walter" left and right thumb impressions in relief, both to the same scale. Note that the left is somewhat smaller and finer in detail and as to pore structure and clearly shows the scar across the bulb. The right shows the ridges worn and somewhat flattened, the core as a staple, and the joint line with its bifurcation.
A group of normal positive reliefs of the "Walter" right thumb. These are only partial, and the reproduction is not very clear, but all show a staple at the core. Several of these have a concretion somewhat above the tip of the core, the middle wax showing this especially well.
FIGURE 29.

Four "Walter" left thumb normal reliefs, all well executed and showing the typical scar. Below the joint line on these there is a sharp, vertical imperfection. This is found in other wax impressions, both of "Walter" and others, and we have not yet been able to account for it. A sceptic would undoubtedly claim it is due to a joint in the die.
V

"WALTER" FINGER TIPS

In Figure 30 we show a classification sheet giving the ridge design of each finger tip. These views are similar to those which would be obtained if it were possible to make ink prints directly from these hands. What was actually done, however, in this case, was to use the photographs of the finger tips in relief and reverse them so that the orientation would agree with that of actual ink prints.

It will be noticed that under most of these prints there is a short diagonal line placed there by the expert who made the classification. This indicates the direction of the slant of the loop, where a loop exists. The figures beside each print indicate the ridge count.

The fingers of the right hand are all of the ulnar loop type, the little finger having what is sometimes called an eyelet ulnar loop.

The index finger of the left hand is of the radial loop type, the ring or fourth finger has an ulnar central pocket loop, and the remaining fingers have plain ulnar loops.
VI

TYPES OF FINGER PATTERNS

For those who are not familiar with this subject, let us say that for our purpose we are dividing finger print types into three classes,\textsuperscript{16} as shown in the ink-prints in Figure 31, \textit{A} being known as a whorl, \textit{B} a loop, and \textit{C} an arch. It so happens that all the "Walter" fingers fall under classification \textit{B}. When the lines of this type of design open in the direction of the little finger, the pattern is known as an ulnar loop; and when they open toward the thumb side of the hand, it is known as a radial loop. The word \textit{loop}, however, does not necessarily mean that the core of the pattern is an actual loop (or staple, as it should be termed) for the core may consist of a rod or of several rods; it simply indicates the general appearance of the pattern.

In addition to the core, there is another important feature in connection with the different classes of impressions, which is known as the \textit{delta}. This is the point where three ridges come together to form a Y, as shown in this same figure. There are two of these deltas in a whorl, one in a loop, and none at all in an arch.

The ulnar loop, which is so frequently found in the "Walter" fingers, happens to be the most common type of loop, occurring in over 66 per cent of all hands. Professor Kristine Bonnevie has shown the frequency of the ulnar and radial loops,\textsuperscript{17} not only for the fingers combined but also individually.

It is important to note that since the ulnar loop is of such frequent occurrence we are bound to have many fingers carrying this type and, therefore, that there must be many fingers having similar ridge patterns with only slight differences of minutiae.

Using Professor Bonnevie's values, in the City of Boston,

\textsuperscript{17}Appendix XI: Prof. Bonnevie’s frequency table of loops.
FIGURE 30.
Classification by Mr. Bert Wentworth of the "Walter" digits, arranged in a similar manner to ink-prints.
Classification of finger-print design used by us. The usual classification includes four or more types, but for our purpose three types only are necessary.
where there are over 780,000 people, 55 per cent of these, or 429,000, would have the ulnar loop type of pattern on the right thumb. How many of these would have a staple at the core, and how many a rod or rods is unknown, as there are no statistics covering these finer divisions; but it is probably reasonable to assume that there are about as many of one as the other, although we have some data which tend to show that staples predominate. In any case, it is easy to see that among all these thousands of staples the variations or differences between many of them must of necessity be very slight. Nevertheless it seems to be a well-established practice among bureaus of identification if two or more prints contain eight to twelve clearly defined characteristics in common and show no single difference to consider that the prints are of the same digit and therefore of the same individual; and it is a well-recognized fact that no two individuals, even if they be identical twins, have any two fingers which are exactly alike.

But Professor H. H. Newman says:

"There are, however, numerous instances in which the prints of two or more homologous fingers are so nearly alike as to be indistinguishable to the naked eye. When, for example, the patterns in both individuals are simple loops, having the same shape and involving the same number of ridges, it is possible only by using considerable magnification to discover differences in the branching ridges and breaks in ridge continuity."

This is also true of the other types (Fig. 31a) as well, and it is especially true of the pore structure. And let us bear in mind that in the "Walter" reliefs or intaglios the finer details may not show.

---

18 Murdock's Directory of City of Boston for 1932.
Now let us examine the main lines of the palms of our standard hands.

By main lines we do not mean the creases which are so prominent in the palms of the hands, but certain friction ridges which are used in the classification of palms. Figure 32 shows the right and left hands greatly reduced in size, but presented here in order to indicate these lines more clearly. Each palm, as may be seen, is somewhat different from the other.

It will be noted that the line A crosses the palm of the right hand at a much lesser angle than does the corresponding line of the left palm, and that the positions of the deltas, a, b, c, and d are quite different.

There are several ways of classifying palms. To the lay reader this classification would mean even less than that of the finger prints, and we shall not go into the details at this time but shall rely for the present solely upon the differences which are apparent in the illustration, leaving the actual classification until later.

From the foregoing, it may be seen that for the first time the "Walter" hands have been completely obtained and the fingers definitely oriented with regard to their position and pattern.
Patterns on homologous fingers of three pairs of identical twins. They show very close resemblances even in those cases where the patterns are unique or very unusual in character.

Reprinted by courtesy of Professor H. H. Newman.
Figure 32.

Standard "Walter" hands, showing some of the main palm lines and their classification, as well as a classification of the finger tips by Wentworth.
VIII

Paraffin Gloves

Let us now turn our attention to the paraffin gloves obtained at Lime Street during earlier experiments, and the casts made from them, and see to what extent they agree with the more recent impressions which we have just discussed.

Before impression wax (Kerr) was used, a number of attempts were made to obtain so-called "paraffin gloves" similar to those so successfully obtained by Geley in his experiments in Europe.

One of the first paraffin gloves (if not the first) thus obtained was of a right hand, and was produced at Lime Street on May 17, 1924. Someone made a plaster cast from this glove, necessarily destroying the latter in the process.

We were very anxious to obtain this cast in order to study the ridge markings on the thumb, but for a time it could not be located. Later, however, a memorandum was found at Lime Street which had been left by Mr. E. E. Dudley on December 29, 1931, to the effect that he had taken the cast away for study. Previous to the finding of this memorandum Mr. Dudley had disclaimed any knowledge of the whereabouts of this cast, but after he had been requested several times to return it, it was finally left at Dr. Crandon's office and was then turned over to the writer.

This cast (Fig. 33), while fairly complete, is somewhat misshapen and withered in appearance, the fingers in places having a pinched look not unlike the tips of our relief waxes already discussed. Because of the difficulty of removing the air from the glove when pouring in the plaster, not many ridge markings are apparent, but such as there are must, of course, be in relief.

20 Geley's Clairvoyance and Materialization translated from French by Stanley De Brath.
21 Appendix XII: E. E. Dudley's note with reference to cast.
We were very much disappointed, upon examining it, to find that many of the ridge markings on the ball of the thumb (Fig. 34, A), especially at the core, had been obliterated, leaving only a new clean surface (B) at this point, although the cast as a whole was somewhat dark with age. This left us only the original photographs for study, although we did obtain one of the original negatives\(^{21a}\) for this purpose, which, when carefully examined under proper illumination, showed that the papillary ridge design of the thumb was of the ulnar loop type. From this negative we made an enlargement of the core, and although the ridge markings have numerous defects (due to air bubbles) which might easily be misinterpreted, there is indication that the core may be a staple. Since this conclusion is based solely on the old photographic negative, it is, of course, not so well founded as it would have been had it been based on a study of the markings on the cast itself, but the general indications are that these agree, at least to some extent, with those of our recently obtained reliefs of the "Walter" right thumb.

We have also a second paraffin glove, which had been filled with plaster of Paris with the probable intention of removing the glove to obtain the cast, but this had never been done. The writer removed the paraffin from the tips of the thumb and fingers of this glove, hoping to obtain finger or thumb ridge markings, but only a few minor ones were found. This was likewise a right hand of about the size of the one first mentioned. It shows only a little of the palm, but the fingers are somewhat better shaped than those of the first cast. It bears no date and there is nothing to indicate to whom it belonged.

A third glove, also of a right hand, (Fig. 35), which bore no date\(^{22}\) and into which no plaster of Paris had been poured, was carefully examined by means of transmitted light with the hope of being able to observe any ridge markings that might be present. Nothing could be seen on the fingers, however, so

\(^{21a}\) Photograph by Wm. H. Kunz.
Figure 33.
Plaster cast from paraffin glove of May 17, 1924. This thumb is clearly of the ulnar loop type and, despite imperfections, shows many of the "Walter" characteristics.
Figure 34.

A shows the tip of the plaster cast, shown in Figure 33, as it formerly appeared; and B, in nearly the same position, as it appeared when received by the writer, the core markings having been practically obliterated.
FIGURE 35.
Back and front views of a paraffin glove, probably the second one made at the séance of April 30, 1926.
these (exclusive of the thumb) were filled with plaster of Paris and the paraffin then removed. No ridge markings showed, but the fingers and nails are of the same general appearance as the others.

The writer took the thumb of this hand and on the nail side of it carefully cut an opening through the paraffin thus exposing the interior. Here was found evidence of ridges. Those markings, however, which appear as ridges on the inside of the paraffin, were, of course, caused by the furrows of the thumb about which this glove was formed. In other words, this mold or glove theoretically should have been a normal negative, and it had every indication of being such.

Due to the fact that the paraffin was of a yellowish color and that it was not easy to work through the opening we had made, it was rather difficult to photograph; and when the ridge markings were examined under medium power and with the proper illumination, there was not enough detail to show whether the centre of the core was a rod or a staple. The slant of the ridge markings, however, indicates that it was of the ulnar loop type. The writer then dissected this paraffin thumb mold and was able to examine the pattern more thoroughly, but the actual core (Fig. 36) could not be determined, due to its imperfect structure. The remaining space in this glove was then filled with plaster, but when the paraffin was removed nothing was obtained but the stumps of the fingers and a very thin sheet of plaster, with no markings, where the palm should be.

We have another plaster cast of four connected fingers of the right hand (Fig. 37). According to the date marked on this, it was made from a glove which was produced on April 30, 1926. These fingers are much flattened and distorted, especially the little one, but on all of them the nails are very well formed and the skin markings on the back of the hand are quite distinct. Part of the papillary ridge design is fairly clear on all the tips except that of the little finger which was obliterated in the casting, by an air pocket, as were also the lower part of the index and ring fingers. However, as much of the pattern on these finger tips as can be made out seems to correspond with the
pattern on the finger tips of our recently obtained standard right hand, that is, all seem to be ulnar loops with the possible exception of the thumb tip. These will be discussed shortly.

In addition to the above we have a similar cast (Fig. 38), very much deformed, consisting of the last two joints of the little finger, part of each of the other three fingers, and what appears to be the nail of the thumb.

It is interesting to note that the tip of the little finger shows some ridge design (Fig. 39) which seems to agree with the ridge design of the little finger on the wax relief recently obtained in our own experiments. The only date this bears is the year—1926.23

Mr. Bird, in Volume I of the Proceedings dealing with the Margery Mediumship, edited by him, in Chapter XLII mentions the different gloves made on this date and shows a photograph of the cast of the better of the two right hands which had been together but had fallen apart when the paraffin was removed.

It seems as if there must be some error here, for certainly the structure shown in Figure 37 is better than that shown in Figure 38.

So far as we know, there is nothing in the records or the Proceedings which indicates whose hands these represent, although Mr. Dudley quotes "Walter" as stating that he knew who made the glove but as declining to say at that time who it was. We do not know to which glove of the set this refers.

According to Mr. Dudley's statement in the manuscript Proceedings, there appear to have been made on this date (April 30, 1926) one mold, consisting of a right and left hand clasped, carrying ridge markings; a short, thick, right hand without markings; and a mold containing two right hands together with both thumbs detached, but buried in the paraffin of the corresponding gloves. Apparently the two illustrations we are using are of the two latter, although one thumb is attached. These, as we have said, are poorly formed.

The tip of the thumb which shows in Figure 37 is classified

FIGURE 36.

View of a section of the back of the thumb of paraffin glove, cut away and exposing part of the negative impression on the ball of the right thumb. Beside it, a plaster cast made from this.
Plaster cast of right hand made April 30, 1926. The tip of the thumb, which was apparently separate, does not show sufficient detail to allow of determining whether it bears an ulnar or a radial loop. It is not certain that the thumb belongs with this hand.
FIGURE 38.

Plaster cast of a right hand, very much deformed, obtained April 30, 1926. Apparently, this and the one shown in Figure 37 were made at the same time and were lightly clasped together.
Comparison of the little finger of one of the plaster casts of April 30, 1926, and that of the standard "Walter" right hand. Plaster cast so worn that it is difficult to make out many of its characteristics.
by Mr. Dudley as a radial loop, on the assumption that it belongs to the same hand as do the fingers, and as having a small ridge count. The photograph indicates that the loop may be a radial, although the ridges are so obliterated that we could not say that it might not possibly be an ulnar loop, on the same assumption that he makes, i.e. that it belongs with these fingers.

If it is radial, it is certainly not a "Walter" right thumb. It seems hardly reasonable to think of it as the tip of the left thumb.

Mr. Dudley classified the five fingers of this hand—at least we believe the hand shown in Figure 37 is the one he is using—and his classification as compared with that made by Mr. Wentworth for both our standard "Walter" right and left hands, is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Thumb</th>
<th>Index</th>
<th>Middle</th>
<th>Ring</th>
<th>Little</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Right (E.E.D.)</td>
<td>R ?</td>
<td>U or A</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>U 6 ?</td>
<td>U 10 ?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right (B.W.)</td>
<td>U 22</td>
<td>U 4</td>
<td>U 8</td>
<td>U 18</td>
<td>U 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left (B.W.)</td>
<td>U 12</td>
<td>R 4</td>
<td>U 9</td>
<td>U 16</td>
<td>U 7 ?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is rather difficult to draw any conclusions from these figures.

Mr. Dudley feels that the ridge counts of the index finger if ulnar, and of the middle finger, are small. He says the patterns on the little fingers of these casts, over corresponding areas, show some fifteen identical characteristics, but as in one of the casts that we show the ball of the little finger is missing, we assume that the one to which he refers belongs to the right hand of the other set which was produced on the same evening.

Nevertheless, there are numerous characteristics which indicate that there are some points of similarity between this cast and our standard hand.

We also have a single broken finger which apparently belonged to another cast, which is undated, and on which the ridge design of the tip is fairly clear, although partially obliterated by a large air pocket. The general shape of this finger, which has

23a Manuscript proceedings by E. E. Dudley.
very good skin markings all over it and shows the nail, would indicate that it is the index finger of a right hand, but because of the defect on the under side, due to the air pocket, we cannot determine its identity.

When the fingers of these various casts are compared, they show many points of similarity, such as length of joints, general appearance, and texture of skin, all of which seem to indicate that they represent one and the same hand.

On November 19, 1932, we received two finger casts, shown in Figure 40, which Dr. Erik Twachtman of Cincinnati, Ohio, had had in his possession ever since 1926. These were still partly covered with a thin coating of paraffin which, when removed, revealed plaster casts, one of which (A) appears to be the index finger of a right hand. The tip of this bears a well marked design which agrees with the design on the index finger (Fig. 41) of the right hand of our recent waxes.

The other cast (B) is apparently that of a left thumb, although of this we do not feel certain, for while the bulb contains some ridge markings there are not enough of them to warrant classification, and the part where the scar would be located, were it a "Walter" thumb, is practically obliterated. The general slant of the lines, however, would indicate it to be of the ulnar loop type, if it is a left thumb.

According to the records, still other casts have been obtained at Lime Street, but they cannot now be located. Also, we understand that some of the early investigators attempted to make gloves of their own hands in experimenting with paraffin. How successful they were we do not know, but we do know that there are now materials in which even difficult molds of human hands may be made. Figure 42 shows a cast from such a mold.

The writer has examined photographs of some of the missing casts, but there are no markings which show, so they are of little importance in this connection except for the fact

24 Appendix XIII: Dr. Twachtman’s report on casts.
24a Dr. Poller’s method of molding by the Moulage Process.
Plaster casts of two fingers received from Dr. Twachtman, one apparently a right index finger and the other a left thumb.
FIGURE 41.
Comparison of the plaster cast of index finger received from Dr. Twachtman and that of standard "Walter" right hand, showing numerous points of similarity.
Figure 42.

Cast from living body—a seamless one piece mold. It was formerly supposed that such difficult molds could not be made in one piece. Now, by the use of the method of Professor Poller of Paris, this has become comparatively simple.
that they conform in general appearance to the others already mentioned.

We are not placing particular weight upon the evidence afforded by these gloves, insofar as the thumbs are concerned, since they all lack sufficient detail of the core, but they do agree with the standard "Walter" right thumb in being of the ulnar loop type. It is important to note, however, that these early casts, which the records state are of the "Walter" hands, correspond in many details of finger tip pattern, and of the palms in those cases where the palm design is apparent, with those most recently obtained in wax, indicating that they all represent one and the same hand.
We shall now turn our attention to the earlier waxes in order to show to what extent, if any, they agree with our standard "Walter" hands, but before doing so let us record how wax (Kerr) first came to be used in these experiments.

On July 30, 1926, "Margery" visited her dentist, Dr. "X," for treatment. While she was there they discussed some of the psychic phenomena which had been taking place in her séances, and especially the subject of the paraffin gloves. He was naturally interested, as he had formerly been a member of the group at Lime Street, although that was before any of the gloves had been produced. He suggested to "Margery" the possibility of using in these experiments a dental impression compound, a molding wax called Kerr, which softens under a temperature of from 120° to 130° F. In cooling it has little distortion, and, if care is taken, usually gives a clear cut impression.

The dentist showed "Margery" how this wax might be used by actually making impressions of his own thumbs. When she left for home she took these with her, together with pieces of unused Kerr, and on that evening, July 30, 1926, the first wax impression, a positive, was obtained. The history of the sample impressions made by Dr. "X" will be discussed later in this report.

Just how many supernormal wax impressions of all kinds have actually been made during the history of this case we do not know, but there must have been very nearly two hundred of them. We have studied more than one hundred which were made between July 30, 1926 and July, 1932. On many of them the impressions are much too faint to be of any use whatsoever. Some of those that were fairly well impressed are only partial prints, and others that have fair markings are undated or unnumbered,
Several years ago the writer made in his laboratory, for Mr. Dudley, photographs of a group of seventy-five of the so-called "Walter" prints, which Mr. Dudley desired more for the purpose of showing the multiplicity of the waxes than anything else. We are showing two views of this group—the obverse in Figure 43 and reverse in Figure 44. Checking the waxes we have for examination against those shown in this group, we find that we have only about half of them. Very few waxes have been given away, and as Mr. Dudley had general charge of all the waxes for several years, we presume he can account for many of those which we cannot find.

Before entering upon the discussion of these early waxes, we may say that apparently there is little difference of opinion as to the proper classification of many of them as normal positives or normal negatives. The differences of opinion which do exist as to proper identification we believe to be due chiefly to assumptions made in the interpretation of the design which, in our opinion, the facts do not warrant. These points will be brought out as we discuss typical waxes. We might say here that, in addition to some waxes which in the past have been classified as containing characteristics of both positive and negative impressions of the "Walter" thumbs, there are others, which have also been supernormally produced, which have characteristics of more than one individual in their pattern, depending to some extent, perhaps, upon conditions existing at the time the phenomena took place. Such results could not occur under the control we imposed in our own experiments unless by some supernormal means of production, and, we might add, there have been a number of instances, well known to those frequenting Lime Street, where, when a print was being made, "Walter" has said that there was difficulty in preventing some of the characteristics of the medium from getting into the design. Waxes having just these indications have been obtained in the past, and "Walter" has stated that he cannot always control the situation. Our standard "Walter" right hand, illustrated in
Figure 6, shows a scar, s, to which we have already referred, on the palm near the base of the thumb, which "Walter" told us was "Margery's" scar. He called our attention to this scar at the time of making the print and before we had had an opportunity to examine it. It does not appear on any of the other right hands we have obtained. "Margery" in fact, has a scar on her right hand somewhat corresponding to the scar on the wax.
FIGURE 43.
Group of seventy-five waxes, each bearing one or more impressions, which were photographed by the writer early in 1930 for the purpose of showing the variety of such waxes rather than their detail.
Figure 44.
Backs of waxes illustrated in Figure 43, showing in some cases marks of identification.
Classification of Waxes

We have studied critically in the preparation of this report more than one hundred waxes, about sixty of which were old ones, that is to say, waxes which had been obtained during the earlier period of the finger-print phenomena.

For convenience in presenting the data pertaining to these, we are arbitrarily dividing them into nine groups, either according to their principal characteristics or to the conditions under which they were produced. Some of these waxes have such faint or worn patterns that they are practically useless for comparison but most of them have a design that can be determined, and we shall show that these agree with our standards.

A. Positive Impressions

This type of impression was apparently the first to be produced, and we have some twenty of the older ones. Until recently "Walter" claimed that positive impressions were the easiest for him to make, but he now says that he can as easily make a negative as a positive if the energy is sufficient and has the right qualities—whatever that may mean.

The wax supposed to have been the one first made, that marked 1 of July 30, 1926, actually bears two impressions, one on either side (Fig. 45). One of these, possibly the first, is only partial, perhaps having been somewhat obliterated when the second one was impressed, and is a little more distinct than the one on the other side which shows an elongated print and a partial joint line which is depressed. The general direction of the core and the position of the delta on this latter print indicate that it is probably a normal positive relief of the "Walter" right thumb, and it is so classified in the Journal, although this

25 Psychic Research, August, 1928, p. 463.
26 Ibid., p. 464.
classification appears to have been based wholly on the appearance of a scar which was depressed and which was said to show in the upper right hand section of the print. We shall have more to say about this scar later.

In our opinion there is not enough detail in either of these prints at the present time to indicate their ridge patterns. Apparently the wax was not deeply marked, the lines being very light, and it is now much worn from handling.

Figure 45 also shows a print made August 5, 1926, which is elongated like the first. This design is somewhat clearer, although this wax, also, is quite worn. In this print the centre of the core might easily be taken for a rod rather than a staple. This is partly due to the fact that the core is quite worn and that the right-hand side of this central staple is somewhat accentuated by a minute globule of wax which lies at a higher level than the surrounding elements, giving it the appearance of being separate from them. There may also be another reason for this appearance, which occurs on a few other waxes, and which we shall treat in detail later. This wax also seems to show the depressed scar at the upper right which was mentioned in the Journal in connection with No. 1. Undoubtedly the print was intended for a normal positive relief of the "Walter" right thumb.

There are two prints dated September 5, 1926, both elongated and both rather poorly made, but showing a depressed joint line and scar at the upper right. The cores of these prints are now so faint that they can scarcely be made out, although one is similar to that of the print of August 5th. These likewise appear to be attempts at a normal positive relief of the right thumb.

An imprint dated March 21, 1927 shows a depressed joint line, and the position of the delta and slant of the lines of the core indicate that it is a normal positive relief, but the core is now so worn that the details are difficult to determine although it bears indications of being a staple. The scar at the upper left, noted in connection with previous waxes, is depressed.
FIGURE 45.

Two views of the first impression obtained in dental wax (Kerr), the upper showing a more or less complete thumb impression, although poorly made; center view showing what remains of the impression which was on the back of the upper one.  Lower cut shows what appears to have been the second impression obtained at a later date.
A wax dated June 9, 1927, is much distorted and shows only a partial print which is exceedingly poor. The texture of this print is much like the previous one but it, too, is so worn that it cannot now be positively identified although indications are that it is a normal positive relief.

A wax of June 30, 1927 also bears a partial print, in which the core is a staple. This, too, appears to be a normal positive relief.

One wax of July 14, 1927, (Fig. 46), is described in much detail in the manuscript Proceedings and in the Journal. According to the records this was the fifth wax of the group made on this date. It is somewhat hemispherical in shape, the ridge markings are quite clear, and a feature of especial importance is the extra wide furrow at the centre of the core, the remaining furrows being of normal width. This impression might easily be classed as a sport, certainly as a special case, and might be lightly passed over if it were not for the fact that so much has been made of it in the Journal. Because of this it is of interest to consider how it varies from our standard right thumb in relief, if at all.

In a statement from the manuscript Proceedings, about this wax, which is marked No. 35 on the back, and, as old No. 23, is shown in Psychic Research, August 1928, p. 461, emphasis is laid upon the important fact to which we now come, as follows: "During the séance talk, "Walter" of his own notion had stated that he would make a print with the central trough of extra width but with all other ridges and depressions of usual dimensions. This was in fact a bit of a joke. There was a small controversy raging about the identity of the true central element in positive and negative prints; Walter said that on the print coming next he would stretch out this central element so that there could be no mistake about it and no trouble finding it. The photograph indicates strikingly that he did something which casual examination would interpret in just those terms. In point of fact, the print is a positive. The central ridge is

---

27 Psychic Research, August, 1928, p. 460.
* (Our italics.)
completely excised, so that the central element of this print consists of a depression of triple width occupying the space ordinarily taken up by the true central ridge and the depressions at either side. Two points should be emphasized here—that Fife and Dudley examined the print immediately after the séance closed and found it in precisely the condition in which the photograph shows it; and that, while there remain what might be taken for traces of the missing ridge, there are no marks in any sense suggesting the ravages of a tool.”

We now quote again, this time from Psychic Research, August, 1928, p. 460, where Dudley, after referring to a promise by “Walter” “to make the central trough in the loop broad,” says: “Realizing that he was speaking in terms of the negative prints * and that what we have here is a positive in which the central trough becomes the central ridge, we see that he has wholly made good on this promise.”

And further on, “We were somewhat disturbed by the fact that following the delivery of this print, no other normal positive was made by Walter for a matter of some months, in fact until his attention was called to this fact all subsequent prints were either negatives or mirror positives.”

When “Walter’s” attention was called to this lack of normal positives, “he at once made not one but several”, all of which were fully executed, but Mr. Dudley did not illustrate or describe them because they lay beyond the time period covered by the report he was making.

Let us analyze the foregoing in the light of what we now know.

A careful study of this wax, especially at the core, shows slight traces at the top, and considerably more at the lower end, of the missing ridge of which Mr. Dudley speaks and under about thirty magnifications there are visible a number of fine grooves running practically the whole length of the core.

Let us look at a diagrammatic view (Fig. 47) of the core of the “Walter” normal positive right thumb in relief (A).

* (Our italics.)
FIGURE 46.
One of the impressions obtained July 14, 1927, which is a "Walter" right thumb in relief and shows that one side of the staple has been almost eliminated.
FIGURE 47.

A shows diagrammatically the "Walter" right thumb in relief; B shows one side of the staple partially removed as in Figure 46. C shows tip of core and how it would appear if reconstructed.
We note that this core $s$ is a furrow surrounded by a staple whose side ridges are marked $r$ and $t$, and that to the right of this is a ridge $p$ which in many prints terminates at point $x$. The diagrammatic sketch of the wax to which we are referring is shown at B. In this the right-hand side of the staple $r$ is shown as a dotted line. This is the side which a casual examination of the wax shows to have been left out or excised. Notice also that at point $x$ in the enlarged diagram $C$ the top of what is left of ridge $r$ of the staple joins with ridge $t$ of the staple. Now, under high magnification, as has already been stated, there is indication of remnants of this ridge $r$ not only all along this core, but also at point $x$ where it would normally join were it fully present as shown in A.

In other words we find again what we have so frequently noted, that the "Walter" right thumb has a staple at the core and therefore that in general this wax agrees with our standard right thumb. Mr. Dudley mentions other peculiarities such as certain dimensions and the position of the delta, but these do not affect the core.

Let us examine "Walter's" statement concerning this matter as recorded by Mr. Dudley.

"Walter" had promised to make the central trough in the loop broad so that there would be no question as to what it looked like. It is apparent that one way in which this might be accomplished would be by removing the side of the staple marked $r$ in our drawing. This would leave the ridge $p$ still connected with the left side of the staple $t$ thereby keeping the type of the formation of the core the same without interfering with the spacing of the other ridges, and giving us the results shown in B to which we have already referred.

It would appear that it was "Walter's" intention to so accentuate the core of his thumb that there could be no question with regard to its design; and certainly there could be no object in removing part of the design if by so doing its pattern would be changed.

We have further evidence in the fact that on another oc-
casion, when "Walter" was asked without warning if he could make an enlarged impression of his own thumb he said he could, and did it immediately, as may be seen in Figure 48 of a wax made on November 14, 1930. But this was not enlarged in the way which we expected, for the wax has the appearance of having been pulled out considerably longer and somewhat wider after the impression had been made and before it had had time to cool, thus spreading out the pattern, although not uniformly. Such a procedure in the wax under discussion would have affected other ridges as well as the staple. Therefore, it appears as if in order to accentuate this point, one side of the staple had in some way been modified, still leaving a complete staple at the core because of the contiguous ridge already mentioned.

If, as Mr. Dudley claims, the core is a rod, the only way of widening it would be by stretching it. Removing it would not give the same result. The ridges, not the furrows, are the elements, and the furrows are the spaces between these elements.

There is no mention in the old records, so far as we are aware, of any statement by "Walter" which specifies what the core of his right thumb in relief is like, but at the time of making this wax "Walter" said he would make the loop broader and in our recent experiments he has stated that the core of the right thumb in relief is a loop, which is what is technically known as a staple.

We do not understand what basis Mr. Dudley had for his statement to the effect that he realized that "Walter" was speaking in terms of negative prints when he spoke of the furrow in the centre of the core of his thumb.

Moreover, Mr. Dudley said that there had been a controversy over just what constituted the core of the thumb in relief,—as quoted above; and still further on, he says that he (Dudley) was disturbed because no more normal positives—with the rod at the core according to his classification—were received for some time, and that when this was called to "Walter's" atten-

28 Appendix XIV: Minutes of meeting 11-14-30.
A rather unusual impression in wax of the "Walter" right thumb, obtained November 14, 1930, and made on demand that "Walter" produce an enlarged print of his right thumb. This has every appearance of having been enlarged by stretching when the wax was soft, and if so was done supernormally.
tion the latter made several positives which were fully executed. We presume by this that Mr. Dudley means that he obtained some with a rod in the centre. According to his statement he did not use or publish these because they were produced at a later date than the period his report was covering.

We, too, recognize this wax—No. 35 of July 14, 1927—as a normal positive relief of the "Walter" right thumb, but having a staple at the core, not a rod as Mr. Dudley believes.

The simplest way to emphasize the character of this central element would seem to be by the widening of this staple, which would be accomplished by the removal of one of the sides. If the centre of the core were a rod, its removal would entirely change the character of the core, not emphasize it. (When one speaks of the core one refers to the ridges, not to the furrows caused by them.)

We have a wax dated July, 1927, the exact date looking like a 12 although it is very indistinct. While this is a small piece of wax with only the upper part of the print showing, it is quite distinct and is without question a "Walter" normal positive relief and shows clearly the staple at the core. If this is a wax of the 12th we wonder if it may not be the wax of that date which is mentioned in the manuscript Proceedings as having disappeared.

We also have a wax bearing a small partial impression, dated April 14, 1928, which is very clearly a "Walter" normal positive relief with a staple at the core.

Another very good wax showing quite clearly the ball of the "Walter" right thumb is marked P2 (Fig. 49) but the date cannot be deciphered. Whether this P stands for positive we do not know but that the impression is the "Walter" normal positive there is not the least doubt, and there is a well defined staple at the core.

We have also the five impressions which were shown in Figure 28, none of which is complete. Each of these is clearly of the "Walter" right thumb in relief and shows a staple at the core.

To recapitulate, therefore, these normal positive reliefs of
the "Walter" right thumb show almost without exception that the core is a staple. There are a few in which the tip of the core is not very clear; and a few in which it appears as a rod. These latter will be discussed under another heading.

To the best of our knowledge there have been no positive impressions of the "Walter" left thumb except those of recent date which we obtained in our experiments resulting in a standard "Walter" left hand, and a few which were shown in Figure 29, which clearly show the characteristics of this digit including the well marked scar.

B. Normal Negatives

Turning now to the normal negative impressions, one of the earliest that we have is that of February 3, 1927, wax No. 11. This wax (Fig. 50) is of particular interest and is described at some length in the manuscript Proceedings. The core of this print distinctly consists of a ridge which, if it were used as a die, would give us a positive agreeing with our standard "Walter" normal positive relief.

Let us see what Mr. Dudley has to say about this in the manuscript Proceedings:

"Process No. 11 is the third print made on February 3d, and was first listed as a normal negative. There is no doubt as to the propriety of its inclusion in the negative category but it is somewhat of a misnomer to call it "normal," inasmuch as it is the print upon which "Walter" has presented one of the most ingenious of his arbitrary variations from the norm.

"This print is of such importance in the discussion of the ideoplastic hypothesis of the origin of these phenomena, that an indexed photograph* is presented at this point.

"The upper part of the print, down to a point about a quarter-inch below the core, is quite regular, but below the curved line A-A' there is a distinct departure from the norm; the ridges appear to continue as in a normal print except that they are straight instead of curving to the right as they should. A careful examination of the print proves that the character-

*No copy of this photograph is available to the writer.
A wax bearing a "Walter" right thumb in relief, showing quite clearly a staple at the core with a well defined tip and no indication of a plateau or sink in this region.
FIGURE 50.
A wax intaglio of the "Walter" right thumb, obtained on February 3, 1927. This can not be called a wholly normal negative, but the center and upper part of the core show clearly, in the actual wax, that the "Walter" thumb must have a staple in the positive.
istics above line A-A' are repeated below that line, as shown by the index numbers 1-1', 2-2', etc., but are offset one ridge to the right. An exception occurs with No. 4; the normal bifurcation coming so close to the transition line A-A' that only the lower characteristic is shown.

"Near the central loop the ridges are continuous across A-A', but beginning about seven ridges to the left there is a slight offset at the point of junction. This offset is very slight, and there is no indication, even at the extreme left of the print, that any mechanical operations have been performed on any of these minutiae.

"Obviously, such a print cannot be produced by a double imprinting from the same digit, since the ridges carrying the repeated minutiae are almost straight instead of curving as they do above the transition line. Therefore, the conclusion seems inescapable that the alteration was deliberately conceived and carried out."

From the above it will be seen that Mr. Dudley classifies this wax as a normal negative with some variations, and according to his statement these variations do not affect the upper part of the core and yet the core agrees fully with our standard.

We have two waxes of March 5, 1927, one of which is much distorted and marked very faintly but sufficiently to show that it, like the other, is a normal negative. One shows a raised joint line, and the core of this wax is fairly clear although the upper end of it is worn, so that the ridges appear to form a loop. This condition will be discussed later on in connection with the positive waxes having a similar characteristic.

A wax dated June 30, 1927, is badly distorted and appears as if a part of it had been broken off after the wax had been impressed. This impression is only partial but it is evidently a normal negative and the core clearly agrees with our standard. Mr. Dudley, in the manuscript Proceedings, so classifies it.

We have one print of July 9, 1927, with indications of being a normal negative, and according to Mr. Dudley's statements this wax bears identification marks (which we presume are the notches on its edge and an X on the back) and was identified by Mr. Bird.
Wax No. 32, of July 14, 1927, has been broken in halves and mended, which probably accounts for the absence of most of the cloth markings which Mr. Dudley mentions as appearing on the back. It is a normal negative, although not particularly well impressed, and shows a ridge at the core, thereby agreeing with our standard.

On August 23, 1927, according to the records, three prints were made, all of which were supposedly normal negative impressions of the “Walter” left thumb. Mr. Fife and Mr. Dudley were both present at the time, and according to their statements these waxes were identical in design.

Since we are going to discuss these left thumb impressions in connection with some of the criticisms of the “Walter” left thumb impressions we shall here only mention that we have in our possession, and have had for some time, two of these waxes. That marked No. 1 is shown in Fig. 51. It has been somewhat damaged but not to an extent which interferes with its identification. That marked No. 3 is shown in Fig. 52 and if the reader will examine these he will notice the deep scar across the center of the ball of the thumb, to which we have already referred in considering the “Walter” hands.

The joint lines on these waxes are raised, although in the photograph they may not look so.

These waxes agree in detail with those of our standard “Walter” left thumb.

On August 18, 1927, five excellent normal negative impressions of the “Walter” right thumb were obtained. We have four of these, No. 1, No. 3, No. 4 and No. 5,—all of which show a negative joint line, most of the ball of the thumb and the delta, and the core particularly well. Three of them have been broken and repaired, one by the writer, the others before they were received by him. They are in general well executed, and we class them as normal negatives, and believe that the evidence indicates that they are all “Walter” normal negative right thumb impressions.

If we take any one of these four waxes and examine it carefully we shall find that not only is the joint line raised as
FIGURE 51.

One of the three negative impressions of the "Walter" left thumb obtained on August 23, 1927. It agrees with our standard "Walter" left thumb. This wax is in our possession. Note characteristic scar.
Another of the three negative impressions of the "Walter" left thumb obtained on August 23, 1927. This likewise agrees with our standard "Walter" left thumb. Also in our possession.
it should be, and that its bifurcation opens in the proper direction, namely to the left as we look at the wax, but that the friction ridge pattern is of the ulnar loop type, and that the furrows, which of course represent the ridges on the real finger, form a staple at the core. Further if we should make a positive from any one of these negatives we would find that it agrees with our standard "Walter" right thumb.

Mr. Dudley, at some length, goes into considerable detail with regard to these waxes, illustrating two of them by cuts. He classifies them as normal negatives, and calls particular attention to the fact that there is something peculiar about the upper end of the core. He says that the ridges do not join as they should, and that instead of forming a U-shaped ridge around the central core they simply bound this core on either side and run up to dead ends. He even makes the statement that the tip of the core looks as if it had been "routed out" at the top; but experts who have made a careful microscopic examination of this state that there is no evidence of any "routing" having been done.

We are showing, in Figure 53, wax No. 3 of this series, which we hope will reproduce with sufficient clearness to show its structure.

To show more clearly the structure of the tip of the core, we have made micro-photographs of it, one of which appears here, (Fig. 54), which clearly indicate that the thumb that made this impression had a staple at the core, for the furrows of the impressing member clearly show as disconnected ridges. Due to illusion the ridges may appear in this photograph as furrows.

Moreover, in the manuscript Proceedings which Mr. Dudley recently wrote, he again goes into detail with regard to the waxes of this date, calling them, as we do, normal negatives, without any particularly salient points except in so far as the intensity of the joint line is concerned, which does not alter the situation in the least; and so far as we can see he makes no

---

29 Psychic Research, August, 1928, p. 453 et seq.
reference in this article to the "routing out" of the core which he so strongly stressed in the previous article.

All these negative waxes are very clear, and in the diagram (Fig. 55) it can be seen that the ridges in the center at \( r \) and \( s \) terminate smoothly and do not join as they must if they form a rod in the center of the positive as Mr. Dudley claims they do.

This is also true of a very much deformed wax, No. 78 of August 9, 1928 (Fig. 56). It is bent almost at right angles and that part of the impression that shows clearly, discloses a normal negative with a ridge at the core, again agreeing with our "Walter" standard thumb. An impression of July 9, 1929, which may be a "Walter" negative, is very much distorted on its surface. We believe this was produced at the suggestion of Mr. Fife who asked "Walter" to make a rough and irregular print of his finger. The impression looks as if the impressing member had been pulled away while the wax was too hot, which roughened the surface.

The last wax in this category which we shall mention is one of November 28, 1930. (Fig. 57) (A). This was prepared by Mr. Dudley, who embedded in the back (B) a circular piece of material that looks like shellacked cloth similar to that used for insulation purposes in electrical work. Several perforations had been made in this cloth before imbedding it in the wax. This particular wax is a normal negative and was marked \( N \) on the front by Mr. Dudley. Only part of the impression shows. The core distinctly and clearly carries a ridge in the center and the furrows in this negative would form a staple in a positive.

We have two waxes of May 27, 1932, which are quite well impressed although one is somewhat distorted and is pierced by a hole which was made when it was produced. Both of these are "Walter" normal negatives and agree with the standard.

There are also two normal negative waxes of June 13, 1932, which, while fairly legible, would not reproduce satisfactorily.
Figure 53.

One of a series of normal negative "Walter" right thumb impressions which agree with the thumb of our standard hand. A careful examination of the core shows that its center consists of a single ridge which would give a staple in a normal positive made from it.
FIGURE 54.

A micro-photograph of the tip of a 'Walter' normal negative core, clearly showing a single ridge at the center and surrounded by a depression which, in the positive, becomes a staple. To some observers, the center may look depressed rather than raised, due to illusion.
A diagram made direct from a micro-photograph to show the staple at the core in the "Walter" positive and the smoothly ending ridges r and s in the negative. The white lines in the positive represent actual papillary ridges forming the staple, while in the negative they represent ridges caused by the furrows of the positive.
A somewhat deformed wax, showing a "Walter" negative impression which, if examined with a reading glass, will be seen to have a single ridge at the core.
A wax dated November 28, 1930, carrying another "Walter" negative impression which, with slight magnification, is seen to have a single ridge at the center. This piece of wax was marked for identification by Mr. E. E. Dudley, as may be seen at B.

The back of wax shown at A and shows a piece of fabric inserted for purpose of identification.
They are much out of shape, but clearly show a ridge at the core and thereby agree with our standard. It will be seen from a comparison of these negative impressions that in nearly all cases the waxes would, if used as dies, produce a staple at the core of the positive which would agree with our standard "Walter" right thumb. There are no recent normal negatives of the "Walter" left thumb and there have been only a few in the past. In examining these waxes one is likely to be lead astray if the lighting is not correct and if monocular vision is solely depended upon. In some cases we found it necessary to measure the depressions and ridges at the tip to determine at just what level a particular point was located.

C. Multiple Prints

There have been numerous instances in which two impressions have been produced on a single wax, and a few cases in which three imprints have been made. We happen to have ten such waxes, most of which are so poor that it is difficult to determine their details.

One very poor double impression, dated August 5, 1926, is on a wax numbered 2. The impressions are roughly at right angles with each other and Mr. Dudley agrees that they are too poor to classify. He says, however, that the primary impression may be distinguished as a positive. To judge by what can be seen of the lines, their direction is correct for this inference, but the core cannot be determined.

One, dated January 18, 1927, bears two prints which Mr. Dudley classified in the manuscript Proceedings as a positive and a negative, as follows:

"It carries two concave prints, one a normal negative and the other a concave positive; but unlike the early positives, this one conforms to the size and shape of the average negative, quite lacking the elongation and the narrowed effect of Nos. 1, 2, 3, 6, 7. The concavity of the positive is, however, fully equal to that of the negative, and to this fact we must attribute much of the early confusion between normal and mirror types. By
the middle of July, 1927, a sufficient number of prints had been obtained so that the true nature of the concave positive became apparent. Nevertheless, this pair of prints of January 18th was so perfectly matched in contour and apparent reversal that it is not surprising that their relationship was not immediately understood. With the knowledge acquired from the analysis of numerous later prints came the realization that almost any conceivable or inconceivable modification might occur in finger prints that behaved as abnormally as do these."

Our examination of this wax, which is much worn, shows that the positive appears to have a rod at the core such as we have found in a few other instances, although there seems to be a decided tendency toward the formation of a staple, and it bears no sign of a scar. We shall discuss this later. The negative, on the other hand, has much better detail, and shows a ridge at the core. There is no indication of a scar in this, either, but it does show a poorly made negative joint line. This print seems to agree with our standard.

The question of the concavity or convexity of the surface in any positive imprint is probably of minor importance, if any. We have handled that point by considering these as reliefs which may vary in depth, as in sculpturing, from low to high.

Another wax bearing a double print is that of March 21, 1927. This is now too worn to be deciphered. The joint lines are raised as in a negative, and the general slant of the lines of the cores indicate that both may be negatives. Mr. Dudley classified them as such.

On July 9, 1927, another set of prints was obtained, but these also are quite worn and the details are practically obliterated, although both show indications of being negative impressions. One of them seems to show, however, that the core carries a ridge, which would produce a staple in a positive made from it, thus agreeing with our standard. These prints were likewise classified by Mr. Dudley as normal negatives.

Piece No. 27, dated July 15, 1927, carries two impressions of the central region of the ball of the thumb, superimposed one
upon the other and at right angles with each other. Mr. Dudley classified these as follows: 30

"On the one piece of wax there occur two prints, both normal negatives, and neither complete. The condition of the wax strongly suggests that after one print had been made the wax was folded approximately along the center of the print. As a result part of the print is lost and part is on the extremely convex edge of the fold. The other print then appears to have been laid down on a concave surface presented by the folded wax, but the original seems to have been too large for complete accommodation on that surface. Both prints show enough details for complete identification, beyond which, in view of their accidentally incomplete character, they are of no further interest."

To judge by the few lines of one of these which are not masked by the other and can be clearly seen, it looks as if it may be a normal negative, and as much as can be seen of the joint line substantiates this. The other impression, however, whether it was made first or last, is by no means a normal negative as Mr. Dudley has claimed. The core clearly shows a staple, and the outer lines, as well as the core, agree with our standard "Walter" right thumb, though its general inclination is different. We wish it were possible to show this satisfactorily in the photograph (Fig. 58).

We have a double impression, marked No. 44, made on July 22, 1927. Mr. Dudley calls both prints normal negatives and we are inclined to agree with this, for though on one the core cannot now be determined, the position of the delta and the general direction of the lines indicate it. The other impression, likewise poor, shows clearly, however, a ridge at the core which would produce a staple at the core of a positive made from it.

Another wax, made on September 9, 1929, bears two overlapping prints and a third one at one side. These are too worn and faint in design to permit anyone to say what they represent.

We have also two of the waxes imprinted on October 20,
1929. No. 1 was made in five minutes—according to the data it bears—and consists of two overlapping impressions. The general slant of the lines of these and the negative joint line of one indicate that they are both negatives.

Wax No. 2 of this date has two impressions, but only one is of any use, and that is a negative which shows a ridge at the core which, as a die, would produce the “Walter” normal positive right thumb with a staple at the core. There is a small area, however, directly below this impression, but not connected with it, which shows a joint line depressed as in the positive. This condition of a negative wax with a positive joint line is unique and will be discussed later in connection with a few other waxes having the same characteristic.

Another wax marked No. 2, which was made on November 5, 1929, carried three impressions, although they are now practically undecipherable.

According to Mr. Dudley’s minutes of that séance—given by him to the writer who had been present—one was supposed to be a “Walter” print, but there was doubt as to the others, although there were intimations that one might be that of Lady Lodge. The other, which bore a twin loop and was unknown at that time, has since been identified by “Walter,” but has not been checked, as we have not been able to obtain ink prints of the thumb it is supposed to represent.

On November 15, 1929, two impressions were obtained on a single piece of wax (Fig. 59), one a typical “Walter” right thumb negative impression agreeing with our standard, and with it a small impression which may be that of a child.

In reviewing the details of these duplicate prints, one point stands out very clearly, and that is that most of those which are “Walter” prints and have sufficient detail to allow of their classification, and which Mr. Dudley has classified as negatives, would, if used as dies, produce our standard positive right thumb with a staple at its core.
Figure 58.

This cut shows a small section, somewhat enlarged, of a wax containing two impressions, one superimposed upon the other, which was dated 7-15-27. While much distorted, one impression is clearly a positive with a staple at the core.
A normal negative "Walter" impression, which in the actual wax has a single ridge at the center; and a small, unidentified impression beside it. This was produced for Mr. Walton at a séance at which he was present.
XI

Prints Obtained at Solus Sittings

Usually, at the séances at which thumb impressions have been obtained, several persons have been present, but the following impressions were obtained at solus sittings. That is, only one person beside the medium was in the room, and that person had complete control of medium and equipment. This group of waxes is small, and we are going to mention only four of the typical cases, since they are the only ones of which we hold the waxes.

On August 26, 1927, Mr. J. W. Fife had a solus sitting at which two impressions were obtained. The details of this séance are given quite fully in the manuscript Proceedings prepared by Mr. Dudley, he having remained outside the séance room door and recorded the details at Mr. Fife's dictation. This record states that these two impressions are normal prints of the "Walter" thumb, but does not specify whether positive or negative.

One of these waxes, marked No. 58, which we hold, has a raised joint line. The delta and general position of the core indicate that it is a normal negative. While the top of the core is not clear, there are indications that the center is a ridge. If such be the case, it agrees with our standard.

Wax No. 59, the second of this date, is presumably a normal positive, but as this wax appears to have been subsequently changed in some way, we shall discuss it later.

Two others were made on August 7, 1928, when only Dr. Mark W. Richardson was present. Although these waxes are much bent, the impressed area is quite flat, and both imprints, although they are only partial, show the core and surrounding area very distinctly. They are both unquestionably "Walter" negative right thumb impressions agreeing with our standard. We are illustrating one of these in Figure 60.
On March 11, 1931, Mr. William H. Button, President of the American Society for Psychical Research, obtained a "Walter" thumb print when only he and the medium were present in the closed, locked séance room, the hands and feet of the medium being controlled by surgeon’s tape.\textsuperscript{31}

On July 13, 1931, the writer, at a solus sitting,\textsuperscript{32} obtained an impression of Sir Oliver Lodge’s right thumb (Fig. 61) (3a). This was produced under controlled conditions and has been shown by Mr. Bell of Scotland Yard \textsuperscript{33} to check with the ink-print of Sir Oliver’s right thumb.

We would suggest here that anyone interested in solus sittings read the report of one held on August 10, 1928, by Dr. R. J. Tillyard of New Zealand.\textsuperscript{34}

The results obtained at these solus sittings show clearly that the accomplishment of these phenomena is not dependent upon the presence of any particular person other than the medium.

\textsuperscript{31} Appendix VI: Solus sitting of W. H. Button.
\textsuperscript{32} Journal A.S.P.R., Mar. 1932, Solus sitting of B. K. Thorogood.
\textsuperscript{33} Journal A.S.P.R., Mar. 1932, p. 118, Bell’s report on Lodge Prints.
\textsuperscript{34} Appendix V: Dr. Tillyard’s solus of August 10, 1928.
A wax containing a "Walter" normal negative impression which has a single ridge which would produce a positive having a staple at the core. This was obtained by Dr. Richardson at a solus sitting. In the reproduction the ridge might easily be mistaken for a staple.
Some of the Sir Oliver Lodge right thumb impressions. The wax marked 3a was obtained at a solus sitting by the writer.
From time to time, finger impressions in wax have been obtained, under the mediumship of "Margery," of persons other than "Walter."

On November 5, 1929, we obtained three impressions on a single piece of wax, as already mentioned,—one which was "Walter's", a second supposedly of Lady Lodge (although this has never been verified), and a third, the pattern of which is a twin loop. For a time, "Walter" refused to tell to whom it belonged, and he made several similar prints (Fig. 62) which he said belonged to the same person. We have not checked this, however, since we have not been able to get the person's ink print.

We obtained several prints of the thumb of C. S. Hill (deceased), and we show in Figure 63 the ante-mortem ink-print of 1926 and post-mortem séance print of July 24, 1931.

In July, 1931, as we have already mentioned, we obtained numerous Lodge prints of both the right and left thumbs, a pair of which we show in Figure 64.

We also have two prints, one of which was produced on July 6, 1927 and the other on July 12, 1927, which "Walter" said were of fingers of Mark Richardson, deceased son of Dr. Richardson. One of these is shown in Figure 65. It has not been possible to check these, as no one has been able to locate any fingerprints known to have been made by this young man when alive.

Of the impressions mentioned under this heading, we have thus far been able to verify only those of Sir Oliver Lodge

---

and the late C. S. Hill; but we have mentioned and illustrated the others to indicate the diversity of design it is possible to obtain in this supernormal manner. This, of itself, is very important, even though the patterns should never be shown to agree with the actual prints of the fingers they are supposed to represent.
Figure 62.
A small part of an impression which was unidentified for several years and upon which no report has yet been made. This shows a twin loop.
Figure 63.
Comparison of the normal (ante-mortem 1926) thumb-print of C. S. Hill with a post-mortem print obtained July 24, 1931.
FIGURE 64.
Enlargement of one of the pairs of Sir Oliver Lodge's right and left thumb prints, showing a whorl and an ulnar loop, respectively.
FIGURE 65.
An impression obtained July 12, 1927, claimed by "Walter" to be that of Mark Richardson (deceased). This has never been checked, as no authentic finger-prints have ever been found with which to compare it.
IMPRESSIONS MADE UNDER UNUSUAL CONDITIONS

In addition to the impressions obtained at 10 Lime Street, several have been produced under "Margery’s" mediumship at other places, such as Newton, Massachusetts; 353 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston; Niagara Falls, New York (through another medium, but within an hour or so of the time one was produced in Boston with "Margery"); and at the Laboratory of the British Society for Psychical Research in London.

Again, we are describing only those waxes which are now in our possession.

One, dated July 16, 1927, No. 39, is very much worn. This print was obtained at a séance held at Dr. Richardson’s house in Newton. It is undoubtedly a normal negative. The joint line and delta quite clearly indicate this, but the core appears not to agree with our standard. This peculiarity of the core will be considered later. This particular wax has Mr. Bird’s initials, "J. M. B.," and the date scratched on the back.

Another (Fig. 66) is marked "89 E 5" on the back, where there appears also a roman I. In the back of this wax are imbedded three gold seals bearing the monogram "TFP," which were imbedded personally by Theron F. Pierce (now deceased) and sealed with the end of his gold pencil. The back of this wax may be seen in the group photograph (Fig. 44), numbered 62. The face has scratched on it "N.F. 4-29-29." This wax, and the impression it bears, will be discussed in connection with another group.

Finally, we would mention an impression obtained on a perfectly clean, smooth piece of plasticene in the closed, locked box which was shown in Figure 3, under perfect conditions of control, with only Adams, Fife, the official stenographer, and

the writer present. The hasp on this box could not be removed and replaced in an hour's time and the box could not have been opened by this or any other means without detection, although one critic, who has never seen the box, claims that it could have been opened in a few minutes by removing the screws from the hasp. This impression was shown in Figure 2, and while it is not particularly good, there are strong indications that it is a Sir Oliver Lodge right thumb.

From the foregoing, it is apparent that the production of these impressions is independent of location and the presence of any one person other than the medium; and even she was not at Niagara Falls—nor was she within the closed, locked box!
Prints of April 29, 1929, made within about one hour of each other, one through "Margery" at Lime Street, and the other through a medium at Niagara Falls.

The one marked N.F. is claimed to have been made at Niagara Falls and is presumably a negative impression. The core appears to be a continuous looped ridge.

The other was made at Lime Street, and appears to be a negative with a ridge at the core.

While we have no good ink prints of the medium at Niagara Falls, those we have secured do not seem to resemble the impression shown above.
Among the impressions which in the past have been classified as of the "Walter" right thumb, there are five well made prints which do not agree with our "Walter" standard hands in so far as the core is concerned. How many more such waxes may exist we do not know, but among those which we have not had for examination there may be others.

We have no way of testing or judging the authenticity of these waxes, but the records of the séances in which they were produced have been published in the Journal 36 and are sufficiently complete and convincing to lead us to accept these impressions as having been produced supernormally. The latest of the waxes was obtained by Mr. Fife on November 26, 1931 and was identified by him at the time as a "Walter" print. Because it reproduced well in a photograph, the writer used it in his Lodge article 37 to illustrate a "Walter" print.

These five waxes may be divided into two groups, one of which is comprised of two partial normal negatives of the "Walter" right thumb—the print obtained by Mr. Fife and a print obtained on September 4, 1926.

The other group consists of three partial normal positive reliefs—one having been made on September 4, 1926, one on February 3, 1927, and one on July 13, 1927.

All of these waxes were well executed, and in most of them the joint line shows correctly and the details are quite sharp. Because of much handling they are now quite worn in parts, and three of them have been cracked and mended. The main difference between these prints and our standard is the indication of a rod at the core instead of a staple.

We have already shown that by far the greater number of

36 Psychic Research, April, 1928, pp. 197, 209, and August, 1928, p. 461.
37 Journal A.S.P.R., Mar. 1932, p. 123.
the waxes which we have examined clearly show a staple at the core of the "Walter" right thumb.

The question which arises, therefore, is: How can there be at least five well executed waxes which apparently agree with the "Walter" right thumb in all respects except as to the core? From the contemporaneous records, it appears that "Walter" stated when these were made that they were his impressions.

Let us see, therefore, if there is any way by which we can reconcile these differences and bring these prints into line with all the others.

To begin with, a classification of all the other "Walter" prints of the right thumb shows that there is really but one general design, which, however, has four different phases. These may be indicated diagrammatically as in Figure 67, where A is a normal positive relief, and B a normal negative intaglio. A carries pore structure on its ridges, as shown in the diagram, while in B the pore structure appears as nodules in the furrows. In general, these two phases predominate among the "Walter" waxes and occur in about 95 per cent of the prints, and although the slant of the lines of one is mirrored with respect to the slant of the lines of the other, they are not true mirror prints.

If we deliberately remove a small section of the top of the staple shown in A we shall obtain the result indicated at C. This gives us what we call a partial positive relief. It is identical with A, except for this slight but important change, which results in a rod at the core bearing pores as indicated. If this in turn is pressed into wax, we shall obtain the partial negative intaglio shown at D, in which the pores will be found as nodules in the furrows.

These last two phases have occurred in perhaps 5 per cent of all the prints that have been made and occur in this group of special cases. They are mirrored with relation to each other just as are A and B, but of course are not true mirror prints.

Another important point is, that upon examination, A and D, one a positive and one a negative, will be seen to be mirrored
Figure 67.

Four typical phases of the "Walter" prints, A and B being a normal relief and intaglio respectively (the two most common); while C and D are partial relief and intaglio and occur in a very small number of cases, possibly made intentionally to show mirroring of pattern shape or unintentionally because of lack of energy.
in a similar way with relation to each other; and in a hasty inspection the cores might be thought to be actually mirrored because they both appear to be staples; but this of course is not possible, because the staple shown at A is genuine and has pores on it, while that of D is not. What would seem to be a staple at D is nothing but a ridge formed by the furrows of the impressing agent. The same thing may be said of C and B, for they also seem to be mirrored and both appear to have rods at the core. A casual examination might easily mistake a ridge caused by a furrow for a real staple, especially if the pore structure were not well marked.

If the above is true, it may well be asked why "Walter" should sometimes make a break in the staple and so form a rod, and at other times not do so.

We have already seen this in the case of a wax discussed on page 45, that of July 14, 1927, where one side of the staple had been deliberately left out or excised by the forming agent, so it would evidently be perfectly possible to excise a piece of this staple to a lesser extent than was done on the wax just mentioned. But what object could there be for doing this? It might be an attempt on "Walter’s" part to produce a more completely mirrored impression, as we have already explained, for he has on numerous occasions stated that he should never have attempted to make mirror prints, since it is this that has caused most of the confusion in the waxes and some on his part as well.

If the above facts are true, the question quite naturally arises as to why we adopt a print having a staple at the core as our standard, rather than one having a rod.

There are three reasons for so doing.

First, the great majority of the waxes that are normal positive reliefs have a staple at the core.

Second, the great majority of normal negatives have a ridge at the core.

And third, all the complete right hands in relief, which we ourselves have obtained and which "Walter" has asserted are of his hand, show a staple at the core of the thumb.
Moreover, while the evidence may point to a deliberate intention on the part of the "Walter" intelligence to depress or excise the top of this staple in an attempt to make what he calls a mirror print, we feel that there may be still another cause, one which is at times beyond his control. But before going into this subject, we want to take up the case of a few odd prints which we have.
XV

MIXED PRINTS

This group of prints is comprised of those that have a positive impression at the ball of the thumb combined with a negative joint line, or vice versa. There are probably not many prints in this category. We ourselves have only two well impressed waxes that come under this heading. Both were made on July 22, 1927, at a séance at which five thumb prints were obtained.

According to the records, the handling and marking of all these waxes was done by Mr. Fife. By marking, we presume is meant marking for identification purposes, as the lettering of the dates was done by Mr. Dudley.

The first one of these prints that was obtained is numbered 45 C 6 on the back and is shown in Figure 68. The wax is somewhat distorted and there is some indication of a cloth mark on the upper right-hand edge, as mentioned in the Journal.38

However, the surface which carries the thumb impression is quite level and the print, which covers so much area that it looks almost like a rolled print, is fairly sharp at the core and around the delta. It is very clearly a normal negative with a ridge at the core, which if used as a die would produce a "Walter" normal positive right thumb relief having a staple at the core.

Below the lower part of the ball of the thumb is a somewhat folded area, which contains a few skin markings, and in this fold may be clearly seen a depressed joint line with its bifurcation opening to the right, showing very definitely that the joint line is a normal positive. This in itself, of course, is another point in favor of the theory of supernormal production, for while a normal thumb would give us the negative ball impres-

---

38 Psychic Research, August, 1928, p. 456.
sions the joint line also would be negative, whereas the joint line in this impression is positive.

The second wax, numbered 48 C 9, is of about the same length as the other, but considerably narrower. The impression of the ball of the thumb is not quite so well executed nor so complete as in the other wax. This lack of sharpness of the ridges may be due to wear, as the print appears to have been handled considerably.

The core of this print is very definite and shows clearly a staple, and that, with other characteristics, shows that it is a normal positive and as such agrees with our standard. The delta does not show in this wax.

The lower part of the wax, as may be seen in Figure 69, is not folded the way the first one is, and the skin markings are more or less continuous throughout the area of the joint line, which in this case is raised, with the bifurcation opening to the left, showing definitely that this part of the print is a normal negative.

Here are two prints—the first, a negative impression of the right thumb but with a positive joint line; and the second, a positive impression of the same thumb with a negative joint line.

It is interesting to note on these two waxes that there is no indication in the negative print of any scar at the right of the core, nor its reverse on the positive print.

In addition to these, we have four small waxes, three of them with no further mark of identification than the numbers 1, 2, 3, respectively, although one bears a small F on the back; and a fourth marked N+ and, on the back, March 21, but with no year. The cores of these four waxes seem in general to agree with our standard positive, although there are a few places in the furrows which appear to carry minute nodules like the pore structure of a negative. In addition to this peculiarity, we find that the joint lines of all four open as in a positive, that is, to the right, although they are raised as in a negative. In other words, the joint lines in these waxes seem to be mirror prints of normal negative joint lines.
A very unusual normal negative impression, having a normal positive joint line as indicated at \( J \). The \( X \) indicates an area about which this change may have been produced by rotation. This is an old cut, and the \( X \) and \( J \) were, we believe, placed by Mr. Dudley in calling attention to this peculiarity.
A normal positive impression, showing clearly a staple at the core, combined with a normal negative joint line.
This same peculiarity seems to exist in a print of April 13, 1932 (Fig. 14), previously spoken of, which “Walter” stated was a mirror print of his right thumb, but which we feel is a normal negative, although it has a very faint indication of a joint line depressed like a positive, which opens to the left as it would in a negative. This particular print is so damaged by bubbles which formed in the wax because it was too hot that the exact tip of the core and other important features can not be determined. We believe, however, as we said above, that it is more like a negative than a mirror of the positive.

This brings up the subject of the method of production of these mirror prints, which, at one time or another, have been so strongly stressed.

We are of the opinion that the prints which have been labelled mirror prints are actually not such at all, although Mr. Dudley in the Journal\(^{39}\) says that “Walter” deliberately made a mirror print which he (Mr. Dudley) could conscientiously list as a mirror-positive. This print, No. 41, made on August 30, 1927, we have never seen, and the photograph of it which we have and the illustration in Psychic Research, August 1928, p. 467, are not sufficiently clear to allow of its determination. We have already discussed the wax made on July 13, 1927, with which Mr. Dudley compared it in the Journal.

We do not say that “Walter” can not produce complete mirror-prints, but there do not seem to be any among the waxes we have examined.

Mr. Dudley, in the Journal, writes as follows: ‘He (‘Walter’) insisted, at a later date, that he never intended to make perfect mirror-prints at first, for, as he said: ‘There are people who would say that it can be done by trickery. You don’t want a perfect mirror-print. A partial mirror-print is harder to explain.’’\(^{39}\)

Now, to return to the statement we made to the effect that there might be another reason for the occasional appearance of partial reversal in some of these prints.

We would not suggest this possibility were it not for

\(^{39}\) Psychic Research, August, 1928, p. 468.
the fact that there are many variants among these impressions which it seems to explain, and although it is obviously metaphysical in its import and cannot be proved, we think it is worthy of consideration as an analogy at any rate, despite the danger of using physical analogies in this type of investigation.

We have often questioned "Walter" with regard to these variations in the waxes and his statements, interpreted in the light of facts we have observed, seem to indicate that this Intelligence, whether it be the medium's or "Walter's," is acting, at least some of the time, in a space which is different from our own so-called three dimensional space or manifold. This may be on the order of the four-dimensional Space-time of Minkowski. 40 "Walter" persists in calling it a fourth direction rather than dimension.

The writer feels that there is much in connection with certain of these phenomena that comes very close to being evidence in support of our modern ideas concerning the Equivalence of Mass (Inertia) and Energy, and the variation of Mass with Velocity.

In the Journal for October, 1928, on page 562, an attempt is made by Bird and Dudley to explain the production of mirror prints by the use of a fourth dimension, but we doubt very much if mirror-images could be produced in the way suggested, even if a fourth dimension were available for the purpose.

This idea of higher space as a concomitant of psychic phenomena is not new, and has been discussed by numerous writers for many years. 41

Our tactual, visual and photographic experiments have shown that there is a definite "exteriorization" from the medium's body of a unique substance, a quasi-material, which is sufficiently delicate of structure to carry a design, yet rigid enough to impress a plastic. In our experiments this substance has sometimes taken the shape of single or multiple terminals, and at other times of simulacrae of partially formed or well formed hands (Fig. 70). Investigators along this line have

40 Minkowski's Das Relativitätsprinzip.
A terminal supporting a small stool. Notice that this apparently is bifurcated at the end to hold the rung. The whitish material seems to end near the medium's head, but surrounding it and continuing over to the head may be seen what appears as a shadow, although there is every indication that this is part of the terminal but in a state where it absorbs the light of the flash rather than reflects it. The writer was practically back of the curtain at the time this was taken and "Margery" was in a deep trance.
established beyond possibility of doubt the existence of such a substance, and we refer the reader who may be interested in the subject to the works of Crookes, Geley, Osty, Schrenck-Notzing, Richet, and others.

Denial that any such substance exists is usually made on a priori grounds and by persons who have had little or no experimental or observational experience with the phenomenon. Denials of that kind of course have no scientific value whatever.

Professor D. P. Fraser-Harris, M.D., D.Sc., F.R.S.E., in The Hibbert Journal, Vol. XXXI, page 24 (Oct., 1932), writes:

"No one, however exalted his position in the world of science, is entitled to pronounce either for or against the genuineness of these phenomena who has not himself witnessed them. He must testify only of that which he has seen and heard."

This substance, termed ectoplasm or teleplasm, seems to extrude from almost any part of the body of the medium, but principally from the natural orifices. It may possibly be a form of radiation which in some manner has its rate of vibration reduced, becoming analogous to a gas or vapor, in which form it is sometimes luminous, gradually condensing or solidifying into an elastic and tenacious material, sometimes visible, sometimes invisible. At times it may exert considerable force and move at high speed, and it is, without question, controlled, directed or manipulated by Intelligence.

Because it is controlled by Intelligence, it seems to take the form, sometimes crudely, sometimes with considerable perfection, which the controlling Intelligence directs, that is to say, it is ideoplastic. 42 We are using this word in the sense in which Geley uses it, to mean the modelling of living matter by an idea. He says: "The creative and directing idea normally works in a given sense, that of the evolution of the species, and conforms to the manner of that evolution. Supernormal physiology, on the other hand, is the product of ideoplastic activity directed in a divergent manner by an abnormal effort of the directing idea."

Again Geley says: "Supernormal physiology presents

42 Gustave Geley, From Unconscious to the Conscious, p. 63.
exactly the same mystery as normal physiology; the normal formation of a living being is neither more nor less marvelous, neither more nor less comprehensible than the abnormal formations which mediumship presents to our view. It is, we repeat, the same ideoplastic miracle which forms the hands, the face, the tissues and the whole organism of the child at the expense of the maternal body; or the hands, face and organism of a materialization at the expense of the body of the medium.

If we assume that this Intelligence can transmit through this teleplasmic material, which it appears to control, the design or pattern of a thumb or finger, it seems as if it might make any finger print it desired, and in so doing the resulting impression would be more likely to take the form of a normal positive relief than any other for the simple reason that that is the normal form of the finger. If this Intelligence is that of an independent entity claiming to make its own print, it seems likely that it knows its own design. On the other hand, if this Intelligence lies in some subjective faculty of the medium which takes on the characteristics of a deceased brother whom she knew, it would naturally choose for reproduction the design of his fingers with which it would seem subjectively to be familiar.

That this Intelligence can supernormally reproduce any desired finger pattern seems evidenced by the results of our own experiments in which we have obtained finger prints of both living and deceased persons which have been found to agree with their actual finger prints. It seems reasonable, therefore, to suppose that the prints known as the "Walter" prints reproduce his papillary ridge design as accurately as the prints of Sir Oliver Lodge and the late C. S. Hill reproduce theirs. The medium has had personal acquaintance with both of the latter, yet none of their supernormally produced prints shows any unusual marks or unnatural characteristics. It is chiefly in connection with the "Walter" prints that we have found variations of pattern or mixed characteristics. This also appears logical, as it would be more likely for this Intelligence to experiment with its own prints than with those of someone else.
We have no evidence that "Walter" is able to create a design or pattern. Indications are that he can reproduce only those patterns which already exist or have existed.

In this connection there is another point to which we would call attention, namely that this teleplasm, which comes from and is apparently part of the medium, being re-absorbed into her body after supernormal use, must be vitally affected by her ego, and that unless a stronger idea than her own prevails, certain of her characteristics may be evident in the resulting phenomena. "Walter" has called our attention to this fact, and has frequently claimed that he could not accomplish what he wished until he had put the medium into a deeper trance. He apparently cannot demonstrate as freely as he wishes until her normal faculties are entirely in abeyance. The function of the medium appears literally to be to provide the medium through which the "Walter" intelligence may physically manifest itself. On the other hand, some phenomena apparently supernormal, but irrelevant to this discussion, take place without the presence of the medium.

The hypothesis which we are about to present is applicable to every phase of the "Walter" print which we have obtained, and gives credence to many statements made by the "Walter" voice to which little attention has hitherto been given. It seems to us to be much more reasonable than does the suggestion that the terminal carrying the design is taken into the fourth dimension, reversed, and brought back, as suggested in the Journal by Bird and Dudley.

"Walter" has attempted, at one time or another, to tell us how this phenomenon takes place. He has stated that his space is different from our three-dimensional space, and that in order to reproduce the design of his thumb in the teleplasmic terminal so that its orientation will be the same as it was when he was alive, he is obliged to turn his consciousness so that a complete reversal takes place and the materialized member becomes in our space a mirror image of what it is in his space. His success in accomplishing complete reversal apparently depends upon the energy available. Bearing this in mind, let us see how lack of sufficient energy may affect these impressions.
It does not seem reasonable to imagine that this teleplasm, when formed for making prints, for instance, is other than a physical material, although it may be possible that in some form not apparent to our senses it also pervades higher space and acts as the connecting vehicle which enables this Intelligence to manifest itself physically; but in its physical form it seems to be tenacious in its structure and its shape could not be changed without the application of considerable effort on the part of the controlling force (idea).

To illustrate this, let us imagine the finger of a glove of very thin material, the tip of which bears a staple at the core, as in A of Figure 71, and turn it inside out by turning it back on itself, as in B. In order to visualize more clearly a complete and detailed mirrored reversal of this we must realize that the reversal of every minute detail must be effected—that is, all furrows must be pushed completely out so that in reverse they will continue to appear as furrows and all ridges must be pushed completely in so that in reverse they will retain the appearance of ridges.

Now, if the material in this glove finger should be tenacious, it is conceivable that some bit of this detail might fail of complete reversal, with the result that what, for instance, was a staple in the original might in the reversed form appear to be a rod, since due to its stiffness the furrow in the staple might not have reversed when the glove was turned. This resulting rod, however, would not be a true ridge, since it is really only the back of the furrow which appears as a rod.

At C we show the glove turned inside out, and at D it has been rotated in order to enable us to compare it with A, with which we started. If there had been a complete reversal of ridges, furrows, and minutiae this tip would then look like E, which is a mirror-positive of A.

We must not lose sight of the fact that our analogy applies only to a surface reversal, whereas in the actual case, whatever the process may be, it probably involves a three-dimensional or volume change. Bearing this in mind let us now analyze some of the different "Walter" thumb prints.
A diagram which shows mechanically how when a glove tip A (positive) is turned partially inside-out it becomes a negative, as at D; and if completely turned in all details, a mirror positive E.
In the first place the higher space, or fourth direction, as "Walter" terms it, upon the existence of which this theory depends, probably includes both spatial and temporal dimensions. Since this higher space undoubtedly embraces our space, there seems to be no reason why "Walter" should be obliged to reverse his consciousness in order to make finger prints, except for the very important reason that if he were to materialize his thumb, for instance, without such reversing its design would naturally appear as it does in his space, so that to us it would be a mirror-image of what it was when he was alive. Therefore, impressions made from it would also, to us, be mirrored and unless we knew of this mirroring would be useless for purposes of identification, although they might be of value in showing supernormality. Since in most cases it seems to have been the intention of this Intelligence to make impressions which might be identifiable, it is reasonable to assume that for this purpose the reversing process has been consistently adhered to whenever energy allowed.

The following schematic diagram (Fig. 72) illustrates its possible mechanism. In it, B represents the materialized "Walter" thumb which, according to "Walter," is a reversal or mirrored form of his thumb as it is in his space, which we represent by A. The outer surface of each of these thumbs, A and B, bears the pattern in relief of the "Walter" thumb, but that of A is the mirror positive, while that of B is the normal positive. The inner surface of each bears an intaglio pattern, that of A being the mirror negative and that of B the normal negative.

If we press a piece of wax into the intaglio surface of A we shall obtain on the wax a mirror-positive relief of the "Walter" pattern, or a pattern which is exactly like that on the outer surface of A.

If, on the other hand, we press the outer surface of A into the wax we shall obtain on the wax an intaglio, or what we term a mirror-negative.

The two patterns produced by this method are indicated by a and a', but, as we have already said, we have not seen any complete mirror prints, either positive or negative.
If there is sufficient energy to keep this ideoplastic thumb rigidly in shape, the resulting impression in the wax, whether positive or negative, should be clear; while if energy should be insufficient or lacking, the surface design would become more or less flexed and the impression in the wax correspondingly weak, or in places irregular or even obliterated. "Walter" has said that at times it is difficult for him to hold the pattern and, as a result, we sometimes get prints in which positive and negative characteristics are mixed; and very often we obtain only partial or incomplete prints.

We have mentioned elsewhere that "Walter" claims that in order to make a normal positive or normal negative impression he finds it necessary to turn his consciousness, in which case his thumb would appear as at B. Using this materialized thumb B, and pressing a piece of wax into its intaglio surface, we should obtain on the surface of the wax a normal positive impression, or a replica of the surface pattern of B. If, on the other hand, we press the thumb into the wax, we should obtain a normal negative.

The patterns produced on these two waxes are shown at b and b'.

Most of the "Walter" prints are included in these two types b and b', and the completeness of their pattern would depend upon the completeness of the reversal of A into B, which is in turn dependent upon the energy available. Whatever demonstration occurs must require energy of some kind. No matter what physical phenomenon we consider, the use of energy is certainly involved, and this particular phenomenon which produces, even though supernormally, a physical change in the wax, requires energy for its consummation.

Of this reversing process there is evidence in some of the waxes we have, which bear impressions which are partly normal and partly mirrored or partially positive and partially negative. These have been classed as mixed prints. They may be explained, on the basis on which this reversal takes place, as having been thus produced either intentionally, because of lack of energy, or because of confusion in the forming Idea.
This diagram illustrates on a purely hypothetical basis how all the phases and types of the "Walter" right thumb may occur, both in his space, as at A, and in our space, as at B and C.
Let us now consider the few waxes which bear normal positive relief impressions having a negative joint line, or normal negative impressions having a positive joint line. Here the process may seem more complicated, but it is nevertheless perfectly reasonable.

Most of these waxes have an area between the joint line and the ball of the thumb which appears to be folded and shows very few skin marks. This condition was probably caused by the rotation of the joint line about this area.

This is more difficult to visualize, since in addition to a partial reversal of thumb A into thumb B, it involves a twisting or rotation of the joint line through an angle of 180° relative to the ball of the thumb, so that the joint line is reversed end for end but comes to rest in the same plane as before. The resulting ideoplastic form is shown at C, with a raised rather than a depressed joint line.

A piece of wax pressed into this thumb C would give us a print with a normal positive core and a normal negative joint line. If, on the other hand, the thumb were pressed into the wax, we should obtain a normal negative impression with a normal positive joint line. The two patterns obtained in this case are shown in c and c'.

A model of this rotation of the joint line relative to the ball of the thumb might be made by taking a thin piece of rubber and embossing it with the pattern of the ball of the thumb and joint line, as shown at P. By holding it firmly at the ends and rotating the lower half completely over, as shown at Q, we get the reversal of the joint line from a depressed normal positive to a raised normal negative. This analogy is probably inexact because in using it we are illustrating the twisting of a plane surface, whereas in the ideoplastic thumb the process is very likely the twisting of a closed envelope.

The waxes we have which show this type of change are some that "Walter" produced with the expressed intention of proving the supernormality of the phenomenon.

Another type of print, mentioned under "Mixed Prints", is that in which the thumb pattern appears as a normal positive
but has a mirrored negative joint line (Fig. 73). This can be explained on the same basis as that of C in Figure 72, as involving a partial reversal and a rotation of the joint line, as shown at \( \delta \). There are no waxes which show the reverse of this form. The few we have of this type are fairly well made, and in some the joint line is not quite complete and there is a small blank area between the joint line and the ball of the thumb, but no folded or twisted area as in the previous case.

Incomplete reversal may have been the means by which the side of the staple in the wax of July 14, 1927, was excised, the teleplasmic ridge not having been actually removed, but allowed to flex relative to the other ridges, thereby leaving only traces of it in the wax. It may also explain how because of lack of energy, the tip of the staple in some of the “Walter” thumb prints may have been excised, for had it been formed in the teleplasmic material before \( A \) was changed to \( B \), and the consciousness then reversed, the reversal of the ridges and furrows might have been only partial, due to the fact that the sides of the staple at the core of the “Walter” thumb could be reversed more easily than its upper end, thus in some cases leaving a depression which would cause the core to appear as a rod. This we have already shown in Figure 67. And it may account for the blob of wax, or plateau, such as may be observed at this point in some of the normal positive waxes, and which shows as a depressed area or sink in some of the normal negatives, as well as for areas in the ridges, especially of normal positives, where there appears to be a tendency toward discontinuity in the ridge alignment.

The ability of this ideoplastic thumb to envelop the wax in making positives need not seriously strain the imagination, even though the thumb appears continuous in its structure, for there is no reason why this teleplasmic material could not penetrate the plastic since the interpenetration of matter by matter under special conditions can be accomplished physically.

We do not wish to go into details of speculation concerning the possibility of the functioning of energy between three-dimensional space and higher space from a psychic view-point, but
A positive "Walter" print, clearly showing a staple at the core, but with a mirror negative joint line, i.e., the joint line is raised as in a negative, although it opens to the right as in a positive.
that we have some physical evidence pointing in this direction is shown by experiments which have been carried on at Lime Street in connection with the transmission of solid material through solid material, which tend to substantiate this statement. The writer has seen a sufficient number of such experiments to satisfy him as to their authenticity. They are similar to some of Zöllner's, whose ideas on this subject have been ridiculed and criticised most severly. Future experiments and the rapidly developing technique of psychic research, may finally elevate Zöllner to a great place as a pioneer in the realms of scientific truth and leave his critics in the category of obstructionists who lacked the capacity or the courage to recognize the work of a truly great man.

We are showing as an example of teleplasmic development a well-formed arm and hand enlarged from a section of a flash-light photograph taken at Lime Street on November 13, 1931 (Fig. 74). In fact, it is so well formed that some critics claim that it belongs to a living person. Notice that the photograph shows a left arm and hand, yet "Walter" insists, and has said from the first, that it is his right arm and hand. We would say that when this photograph was taken only "Margery," the writer, and Mr. Adams were in the room. The complete photograph (Fig. 75) shows the medium's feet and hands also, and it can plainly be seen that they are in no way connected with the materialized arm and hand.

Let us here briefly explain the apparent paradox of a right hand appearing as a left hand. Until recently this has been confusing to us as well as to critics of these phenomena, but if we consider the analysis we have just made of the procedure which is responsible for the various wax impressions, we may use the same hypothesis here.

This hand, of which we have just spoken, was materialized under the most rigid conditions of control. The cameras which were used belong to the writer, their optical glass lenses are

---

44 The Physical Phenomena of Spiritualism, by Carrington, p. 19.
Easy Lessons in Einstein, Slosson, p. 58.
of the best quality, the photographic plates were new and in perfect condition, and we certify as to the authenticity of the negative.

The picture was taken by the illumination of photo-flash lamps in about one fiftieth of a second, and shows unmistakably a left arm and hand of large proportion holding aloft a small stool. This materialized arm and hand was observed by Adams and the writer in good red light for a space of several seconds before the plates were exposed, the writer being within two feet of it. We naturally designated it a left arm and hand; "Walter" however insisted that it was his right arm and hand, but said that since what we saw was really a mirror image of it, it appeared to us like a left.

This same anomaly would of course be apparent in the "Walter" prints if for any reason the reversing process were not carried out, as we have already shown, and may account for some of the different phases of the "Walter" thumb pattern which have occurred. It seems hardly reasonable to suppose that "Walter" should not know which hand was his right, and presumably it would be the same one that had always been his right.

If "Walter" were to materialize his right hand, without reversing his consciousness, we, observing it without any further means of orientation, would see it as a left hand since the mirrored image of a right hand appears to us like a left hand, and if we photographed it it would appear in the photograph as a left hand.

A diagram may make this a little clearer, although the mirror analogy should not be considered as in any way explaining the actual process. We have already said that, according to "Walter", his right hand, as it is in his space, is a mirror image of what it was when he was in our space. Therefore in the diagram (Fig. 76) we are representing his right hand as it was when he was alive by B—while A represents it as it is now in his space. To us who have no other means of orientation, A would look like a left hand, so if "Walter" materializes this hand A without reversing it we see it as a left hand, and if he
A materialized arm supporting a small table. This, to all appearances, is a left arm, but "Walter" claims it is his right, as explained in the text. The complete picture is shown in Figure 75.
This shows the writer holding the medium’s hands. Her feet are on the floor and are obviously not being used to produce this left arm. It may naturally be claimed that someone was behind the curtain, but only Adams, who was at the camera, "Margery" and the writer were present in the locked and searched séance room. This was taken Nov. 13, 1931.
Diagram illustrating possible manner of production of normal positive and mirror positive image and type of impression the inside surface of each would produce.
presses wax into the inner surface, the pattern produced would be a mirror-positive relief. If we accept his statement that the impressions which we are using as our standards represent his hands as they were when he was alive they must have been made after the reversing process was carried out, by the hand as shown at B. If wax is pressed into the inner surface of B the resulting impression would be a normal positive relief like our standard hand. These impressions would, of course, be subject to such variations as would result, not only from the physical imperfections of the wax, but in proportion to the extent of the reversal, which is sometimes incomplete as in one wax we have already discussed (Fig. 13), where the tips of the four fingers (but not of the thumb) are normal negative impressions.

"Walter" said in making this hand, which is a normal positive relief except as to the four fingertips, that the teleplasm "got away from him." In other words, the wax was pressed into the intaglio surface of this ideoplastic hand, but through lack of energy the fingertips were not completed. In order to correct this quickly, the outside surfaces of the ideoplastic fingers were pressed into the wax somewhat at an angle, thus producing the negative patterns at the tips, which bear every indication of having been added hastily.

With regard to the materialized arms which we have seen and photographed, they must have been, either arms of a living person or persons or artificial substitutes for them—that is, fraudulent; or they were teleplasmic arms—to which all the evidence points—and as such were ideoplastic.

In the first instance, it is perfectly obvious that if the left hand we saw was the left hand of a living person it could not have borne the papillary ridge design of a right hand.

If it was artificial, of course almost any kind of design might, theoretically, have been given it.

But under the conditions of our experimentation, it could not have been either the arm of a living person or an artificial arm.

If, on the other hand, it is, as we have claimed, a teleplasmic arm, it should be able almost instantly to take the design of the controlling idea.
There appears to be no reason why this idea might not form any combination of patterns on the fingers if the designs are available. In fact, "Walter" has said that sometime he would make for the writer a sort of composite hand with each finger bearing a papillary ridge design of a different person. He said he could produce on it the design of the writer's thumb while the writer was present at a séance and without his being conscious of it. We asked if he could also produce the medium's finger pattern, and he replied that he could. In view of this, the use of a left hand in the production of a right thumb impression need not provoke any special comment. Moreover, in this very fact lies further proof that the patterns which "Walter" says are those of his own fingers are what he claims them to be.

It seems unlikely, however, that our standard hands bear a composite design, for if such were the case variations might be expected, whereas they are always uniform in pattern, and correspond not only with all recent waxes but with the older ones and the plaster casts.

In the Journal there are shown, on pages 568 and 570, a series of views (Figs. 77, 78, 79 and 79a) of a somewhat poorly formed hand going through the process of taking a piece of Kerr out of a hot water dish, making a thumb impression in it, and handing the impression to someone. According to the records of this séance, which were written by Mr. Dudley and Mr. Bird, this took place on July 28, 1927, and they state that the print obtained at the time the photograph was made, while not very well-defined and showing no joint line, is nevertheless that of a "Walter" thumb.

In the manuscript Proceedings, prepared by Mr. Dudley, he has stated that this print is a normal negative, very little distorted, and that there are indications of a fingernail scratch on its surface. This latter mark does not seem to show in the photograph illustrated on page 459 in the Journal.

We happen to have this wax (Fig. 80), marked No. 49 C 10 on the back, and bearing the above date on the front, and while

---

43 Psychic Research, October, 1928, p. 568.
FIGURE 77.
The "Walter" hand removing a piece of Kerr from the hot water dish. The medium in deep trance.

FIGURE 78.
The "Walter" hand posed as in the act of making an impression in the Kerr.
FIGURE 79.
The "Walter" hand passing this impressed piece of Kerr to Dr. Richardson.

FIGURE 79A.
Dr. Richardson holding the "Walter" hand.
The wax which was impressed with a "Walter" negative print on July 28, 1927, when the photographs shown in Figures 77, 78 and 79 were made. This negative wax has a single ridge at its core, clearly indicating a staple in the normal relief. The imperfection is claimed to have been made by "Walter's" nail, and seems to be more pronounced in this photograph than in the original photograph. Whether this has been changed, we can not say.
it is difficult to show the detail in a half-tone, we can state that it is a "Walter" normal negative right thumb, and that under magnification it shows clearly a raised ridge at the core. This, if used to produce a positive, would give us a staple at this point, and so agree with our normal positive right thumb.

With regard to this particular materialized hand, Mr. Dudley says, in describing the second photograph, which shows it impressing the wax, that: "One can distinguish five digits—none of which looks like a thumb, and none of which seems to be engaged in imprinting. It is possible that Walter posed the hand as though in the act of making the print, and that the actual imprinting was carried out a few moments later."

We quote the foregoing to show that there is no evidence that "Walter" materializes a perfectly formed right or left hand in order to make these prints. So long as the terminals are formed sufficiently to bear the pattern which is to be imprinted, there is no need of more perfect formation. There seems to be no reason for that matter why the pattern of the entire hand may not be borne by a single teleplasmic surface or terminal, having no resemblance otherwise to a hand.

However, since the pattern on the wax in this particular instance is a normal negative, it must have been made by a digit which bore on its outside surface the normal positive design, and the digit must have been pressed into the wax in order to produce it. And since only one print was produced, it may have been made by any one of the digits shown in the photograph, although it seems reasonable to suppose that the pattern was borne by that digit which held the normal position of the thumb. Further, if our hypothesis with regard to the reversing of the "Walter" consciousness is to hold, this particular pattern must have been the reverse of the pattern as it appears to him in his space.

When an arm and hand are materialized in order that they may be seen and photographed, the papillary design is not the important thing and it is, therefore, not necessary to reverse the idea; consequently, the arm and hand appear to us mirrored, as we have already shown.
It would be of great value when a materialized hand is formed—for instance the hand which appears to us as a left—if it were possible to obtain in the photograph its papillary ridge design so that we might check it against our standard "Walter" hands and establish conclusively whether it bears the design it should for the hand in question. We hope sometime to accomplish this.

In this particular instance, according to the hypothesis we have presented, this hand, which to us appears as a left hand, should bear a mirror image of the pattern carried by our standard "Walter" right hand.
CHANGED IMPRESSIONS

There are instances in which the earlier published accounts of the "Walter" thumb prints are not in accord with the records made after the séances involved, or in which there are statements which are contrary to fact, which have caused us to question the value of much of the older material which we have studied in connection with this report.

We found, for instance, that the dates and numbers in white ink which the prints carry do not in all instances correspond, and that the published descriptions do not always agree with the records made after the séance. As an example, and we shall give but one, we show in Figure 81, in A and B, the obverse and reverse surfaces of a wax which is dated October 20, 1929. 46 This happens to be a double or superposed print. On the back of this wax appears No. 104 F 3. We have the wax, as well as a photograph of it which was made for Mr. Dudley by Mr. Kuntz. But Mr. Dudley, in the manuscript Proceedings, states that wax No. 104 was made on October 4, 1929; that with wax No. 105 (which we also have) it was presented to Lord Charles Hope, and was never photographed.

Of itself, this is a matter of small importance, but it is proof of the possibility of inaccuracy in the records which might seriously impair their value.

Also, we have mentioned elsewhere that pores occur frequently on the papillary ridges of the living hand as small depressions. They are actually the openings or mouths of glands located deeper in the flesh. If we make ink prints of such an area the pores will appear as tiny white dots. If we press our finger into a plastic, making a negative impression, the ridges will appear as furrows in the wax, and scattered through the furrows will appear little nodules wherever pores occur in the

46 Journal A.S.P.R., Dec. 1929 and manuscript proceedings.
original. If from this negative we should make a positive or relief these pores would appear as depressions in the ridges—as they do in the normal finger.

Now turning to page 204 of the Journal for April 1928, to an article by Mr. Dudley and Mr. Bird, we find the following statement:

"Pores of course occur freely in the prints. In the anatomical original these are little mounds in the depressed lines of the hand; on the negative impressions they are therefore depressions in the ridges. In print No. 7 (page 201 of the Journal for April, 1928, our Fig. 81C) the photograph shows particularly well two series of three pores each at the upper parts of the right hand ridges No. 4 and No. 5."

If this were true, then the wax in question would have to be either a normal positive or a mirror positive for the statement indicates that these pores appear as holes in the ridge. Still further on it is said,\(^{46a}\) "though not always so well visible these are permanent features and their position is indicated on the diagram (our Fig. 81D) by a series of three X's. In the positive print No. 4 \(^{46b}\) (our Fig. 81E) of course, we see them as tiny mounds." This is impossible, and shows that care was not taken in the preparation of this article, and is another indication of the inaccuracies of the early records.

Such inaccuracies as the foregoing, however, were undoubtedly accidental.

But no theory of accident can account for the fact that prints of historical and scientific importance have been so changed by some means or other as to render them valueless and lead us to the almost irresistible conclusion that someone must have deliberately tampered with them.

In looking over the photographs of the earlier waxes, and checking them against the waxes in our possession, we were surprised to discover a very anomalous situation. Some of the waxes which we have had for study, while still agreeing as to contour and general marks of identification, show now a

---

\(^{46a}\) Ms. Proceedings, E.E.D.; also Journal, April, 1928, p. 198.

\(^{46b}\) Journal, April, 1928, p. 209.
A shows two superimposed impressions on a wax dated October 20, 1929; while B shows the back of this same wax, numbered 104 F 3. According to the records, the wax of this number was not of this date, was never photographed, and was given to Lord Charles Hope; nevertheless we have it.
different orientation of the actual thumb impression from that shown on the original photographs, the photographic negatives of which, in the five cases we are about to mention, are and always have been in the custody of Mr. William H. Kuntz, specialist in photography. How these impressions became changed, we do not know.

We are aware that if the lamp used for illuminating these waxes when photographing them were placed too close the heat from it might cause them to soften, and if great care were not taken the contour might be changed.

But some of the five waxes which we are illustrating, now bear characteristics that can not be accounted for by a change due to such a cause. Moreover, if these changes in shape occurred accidentally while the prints were in Mr. Dudley's possession, he should certainly have called attention to the fact, either on the waxes themselves or in a memorandum to Dr. Crandon, since he placed these very waxes in the collection for the preservation and display of which he made a special cabinet which is now at Lime Street.

We present these altered waxes in their chronological order. The first is dated July 16, 1927, and is shown in Figure 82, A being the original photograph and B showing the wax as it now is. On this date, according to the records, six prints were produced at a séance held at Dr. Richardson's house in Newton. Mr. Dudley, Mr. Bird, and Mr. Fife were in charge of this sitting. We have two of these waxes, and have already mentioned one of them, No. 39, which bears Mr. Bird's initials. Scratched on the upper surface of the other one are the initials A. H. and the figure 4, and there is also an H which appears to have been branded into the edge since the change was made. On the back of it is scratched the date, presumably in Mr. Bird's printing.

Mr. Dudley, in the manuscript Proceedings, makes the following statement: "They are all normal negatives, all on wax that shows little distortion or other evidence of handling, all fairly good but none brilliant impressions."

Now this particular wax in its present condition does show
considerable distortion. The broken edge at the top, and the
date agree fully with the original photograph; but there
the resemblance stops. The pattern is not a normal negative
and its orientation is quite different in all respects from that
of the impression shown in the original photograph. On the
back of the wax there is an indentation in which something
resembling a letter B has been scratched.

The second of these altered prints is dated July 22, 1927,
and is one of a group of five waxes which were made on that
date. The writer has four of them in his possession, as well
as photographs of all five made from the original negatives
which Mr. Kuntz holds.

In Figure 83, A shows the print as it originally appeared
and B (on the same scale) shows it as it now is. It may be
noted that the general shape of the right side of the wax is
the same in both photographs, and that there is a criss-cross
pattern at the extreme right and at the top made from its con­
tact with cloth. A scratch may be seen running from the right­
hand edge into the figures 22 of the printed date. These marks,
as well as others that may be seen in both illustrations, show
clearly that the wax in each case is the same, but in A, the origi­
nal photograph, the lines may be seen to slant in a direction dif­
ferent from those in B. This is shown diagramatically in Figure
84. It may also be noted that there is considerable difference
in the inclination of their axes, as shown by the angles a and b.

If these were the only changes, they might be accounted
for by a softening of the wax from excessive heat, as above
mentioned, but if the patterns are carefully scrutinized, espe­
cially as shown in the diagram, it may be seen that one looks
like a mirror print of the other. Now this can not be accounted
for by a mere change in the angle of the axis of the core. Neither
can it be accounted for by a reversal of the photographic nega­
tive when the original print was made, for in that case the date
also would be reversed, but such is not the case. And as the
photographic negative has never been retouched, the possi­
bility of these changes being due to that process is eliminated.
Figure 82A.  
A shows the wax of July 16, 1927, enlarged from the group.
Shown as No. 33 in Figure 43.

Figure 82B.  
B shows this same wax much distorted and the impression
as it now appears.
FIGURE 83A.
A is a view of a wax of July 22, 1927, made from the original negative of that time.

FIGURE 83B.
B is a view of wax shown in A, with the impression quite changed. Notice the scratch running into the 22 on both.
Figure 84.

Diagram of the impression of July 22, 1927, indicating the difference of angle between the original and the present form, and their tendency to mirror in design.
We are not attempting to explain how these changes were made, for we do not know. The argument that the wax shown in B is not the same as that shown in A will not hold, in view of the fact that all the points of identification on other parts of the wax still agree with the original photograph. Moreover, the printing in white ink is in Mr. Dudley's hand; and on the back is quite clearly marked in the same writing "C7, # 46," which are the numbers Mr. Dudley uses in presenting the details of this wax in the Journal.\textsuperscript{47} There is some indication on the back of the use of a smoothing iron. The impression which the wax now bears is much less complete than the original.

The third of these altered prints is one dated August 26, 1927, and marked J. W. F. in white ink. This is the second wax which was impressed at Mr. Fife's solus sitting, the first having already been discussed under that heading.

The face of this wax shows what appears to be a normal positive relief, the delta being at the right. It is difficult to say just what the joint line is. In the manuscript Proceedings, this was called merely a normal print by Mr. Dudley, so we have no way of knowing which type it originally represented.

Figure 85, A, shows its original form, while B shows its present appearance. On the back of this wax is printed # 59 and a D with a number which can not now be made out. These are in Mr. Dudley's writing.

The fourth wax under this heading is dated April 29, 1929. Figure 86, A, shows its original pattern, while its present form appears in B. It may be noticed that in both illustrations the upper left-hand edge of this wax shows the cloth markings; that this edge, the top, and the right-hand side agree in contour, and that the four little nicks, probably cut for identification purposes, show distinctly. The lettering also is the same in both, the middle line of the N and the lower horizontal line of the F, the periods, and even the minute hole above the period after the N show in both photographs, and there are many other points of similarity which are obvious.

\textsuperscript{47} Psychic Research, August, 1928, p. 457.
This wax is supposed to be one of two impressed at Niagara Falls through another mediumship, at about the time that a similar print was being produced at Lime Street under "Margery." It bears Mr. Dudley’s number 89 E 5 on the back and the three gold seals placed there by the late Theron F. Pierce. The shape of the impression which the wax now carries would indicate a normal positive relief, quite distinctly marked except at the core where the lines are somewhat confused. The joint line shows quite clearly as a positive at the lower edge, although in our photograph (B)—through illusion—it appears raised. Here again we have a reversal which can not be accounted for by any simple explanation.

The fifth wax under this classification is one which was made on September 9, 1929, and is numbered 2 on the face, no number appearing on the back. In Figure 87, A shows its original and B its present appearance. The wax is now so much deformed that it is hardly recognizable as the original. Its contour is quite different, although there is a fold above the date which looks much the same in both, but the date itself and the number 2 on the face seem to tell the story. There is some indication that the change in this wax occurred after the above date was placed on it, for the figure 2, especially, seems to have been slightly warped. Here again we have the reversal of the impression, the print now apparently being a positive.

Regardless of when these metamorphoses may have taken place, it is certainly evident that these waxes were in Mr. Dudley’s possession after the changes had been made, for with practically no exception the numbers in white ink, which it has always been Mr. Dudley’s custom to mark on the back and front, are so placed that they would have been greatly distorted had they been on the waxes before the prints were altered.

That the present dimensions of the waxes differ from their earlier dimensions is shown by a comparison with the earlier photographs, as well as with the photographs (Figs. 43 and 45) which the writer took of the large group long ago.
FIGURE 85.

Two views of a wax of August 26, 1927, initialed, presumably, by Mr. Fife. A shows the impression as it appeared at that time, and B as it now appears.
Figure 86A.

A shows the impression on a wax obtained at Niagara Falls on April 29, 1929, through another medium, "Margery" being in Boston at the time.
FIGURE 86B.

B shows this same wax, but as it now is, bearing an entirely different impression. There are many points of identity on the waxes shown in these two photographs.
FIGURE 87A.
A shows a wax of September 9, 1929, marked No. 2, and was made from the original negative.

FIGURE 87B.
B shows this wax as it now appears, much deformed, and with the orientation of its design changed.
In some way these five prints have been substituted for the prints which these waxes originally bore. This, of course, could have been accomplished only by first softening the wax, which would account for such changes as are noticeable in the contour and shape of each piece, unless indeed, the entire waxes and impressions have been artificially made and substituted for those whose number and date they bear. This, however, could hardly have happened in the case of the wax imprinted at Niagara Falls.

We do not know how, or when, or why these changes were made. We merely know that these waxes do not now carry the impressions they bore at the time they were originally photographed; and that they are sufficiently well executed so that had we not been comparing our material carefully with the earlier records and photographs, we might have accepted them as supernormally produced prints.

In view of this circumstance, it is an inescapable hypothesis that the other waxes which we have considered in our study and which, for one reason or another, we have not been able to check with previous records, may have been similarly changed.

Experimentation on original waxes may at times, be necessary and legitimate, but to obliterate or change markings on waxes of importance for any reason whatsoever without definite disclosure and record of changes is certainly indefensible and compels suspicion if not conviction that whoever was responsible for these changes had a fraudulent purpose to serve.

Of the five waxes under consideration, three were produced under unusual conditions, one having been imprinted in Newton, away from Lime Street, with only Bird, Fife, and Dudley present; another at a solus sitting for Fife a few days later; and the third being one of those produced at Niagara Falls at a time when "Margery" was at her home in Lime Street. Since these were all secured under exceptional conditions, for that reason if for no other they should not have been used for experimentation.

In his account of the séance of October 20, 1929, in the manu-
script Proceedings, Mr. Dudley has the following to say concerning two overlapping normal negatives of the "Walter" right thumb obtained on one of the waxes: "If the reader will experiment with this wax (Kerr) he will find it a simple matter to make one print, and (after reheating the wax) to superpose a second print on the first, but he will doubtless discover, as did the writer, that it is exceedingly difficult to retain more than the faintest trace of the first print." (Our italics.)

We quote this to show that Mr. Dudley had carried on experiments of this sort, and we have elsewhere referred to some artificial prints which he made and which were submitted to a fingerprint expert to see if they could be detected.

As evidence that these waxes were changed before being marked on the back for indexing, let us look at the back of the wax supposed to have been made at Niagara Falls on April 29, 1929, as it appeared before Mr. Dudley put his index number 89 E 5 on the back. This is shown in Figure 88. It will be noted that almost the entire surface of the back is well indented by cloth markings. The letters KER, and especially the K, are very sharply cut. The three gold seals show no sign of distortion, and there is what appears to be a roman numeral I close to the two end seals, although this does not show very clearly in the photograph.

Then let us look at Figure 89, which shows the back of this wax as it now appears. It may be seen that the seal on the end that has been changed is blurred and spread and that the roman I is farther away from the seal than it was originally. Furthermore, nearly half the surface of the wax on this end is fairly smooth, the cloth marks, as well as part of the K, having been obliterated. This, of course, is what would be expected if the wax were heated and stretched out more than a quarter of an inch as it has been.

But the important point is that the lettering # 89 E 5 is not distorted in the least, as it must have been had it been on the wax before this change occurred. Moreover, it is on the now smooth surface and it was not on that surface when
Figure 88.

The backs of two impressions made on April 9, 1929; the one with the letters KER showing being the one produced at Niagara Falls, while the other was made at Lime Street within an hour or so. This photograph shows them as they appeared at the time of their production.
Figure 89.

Shows the back of the wax imprinted at Niagara Falls as it now appears.
the latter bore the imprint of the cloth, as is shown by the photograph.

Also the wax of July 16, 1927, which we are not illustrating, showed originally a relatively flat surface, as may be seen by looking at No. 35 in Figure 44; but now it carries a considerable depression which shows coarser cloth markings than did the original, indicating that a cloth was used which prevented the hand which altered the impression from leaving an imprint; and into this area has been scratched, since the change was made, what appears to be a letter B that seems to agree in appearance with that letter on other waxes which have been marked by Mr. Dudley.

The other waxes bear equally convincing evidence of having been marked after their impressions were changed.

These waxes were certainly not altered supernormally, and we do not know of any simple method by which mirror prints of existing patterns can be made, yet a casual comparison of the photographs might lead one to think that these five impressions are mirror prints of the designs which these waxes originally carried.

We have never heard "Walter" suggest the re-use of an old wax or the possibility of making an impression over for the purpose of improving it, and nothing in the records indicates that this was ever attempted or even thought of by anyone interested in these experiments. When poor results have been obtained "Walter" has often insisted upon having another piece of wax, in order to try again, and naturally a fresh piece of Kerr was always provided.

A most regrettable circumstance in connection with these changed prints is that several of them were included in the group which the writer sent to Dr. Harold Cummins of Tulane University for comparison with photographs of Dr. "X's" impressions. It was not until some time after Dr. Cummins' report was received that the fact that some of these waxes were of questionable origin was discovered.

Dr. Cummins very kindly gave a great deal of time to the
careful study of the data which we sent him, and submitted two reports, both of which appear in full in the appendix, and we wish to make this acknowledgment of our appreciation of his meticulous study and our regret that the character of much of the material sent to him necessarily disqualifies it for use as evidence in this matter.
Comparing the Hands of "Margery," "Walter," and Dr. "X"

Having classified the "Walter" standard hands, and shown that in general the old casts and waxes agree with them in pattern, let us now make a comparison of the various characteristics of the hands, fingers and thumbs of "Margery," "Walter," and Dr. "X," since the refusal to accept the "Walter" prints as unique is for the most part based on the claim that they are in fact replicas of the normal prints of either "Margery" or Dr. "X," produced normally or by means of dies.

We think we have satisfactorily demonstrated that dies could not have been used and were not used in the séances which were held under our control and at which the complete "Walter" hands were produced, and since most of the "Walter" thumb impressions made during the earlier years of this mediumship agree with those of our more recent experiments, we may assume that dies were not used in the production of the earlier impressions.

We have also, we believe, satisfactorily established the fact that these standard hands were supernormally produced, so that if their markings should correspond in any degree with those on the hands of either "Margery" or Dr. "X," explanation of the parallelism must be found in some other direction than conscious fraud.

In order to determine whether our "Walter" hands do carry the same characteristics as those of "Margery" or of Dr. "X," let us make a complete analysis and comparison of all three pairs of hands. (Figs. 90, 32 and 91.)

Palm

We have already shown photographs of what we term the "Walter" standard hands (Figs. 5 and 6), and also these same hands on a smaller scale with some of the main lines of the
palm emphasized (Fig. 32). Now let us compare the palms of "Margery," "Walter" and Dr. "X," as shown in Figs. 92 and 93, based on prints made by Mr. Bert Wentworth.

The main palm lines and the deltas at the roots of the fingers show quite clearly the differences in orientation.

The palms of "Margery's" hands are small in comparison with those of "Walter" and Dr. "X." "Walter's" palms and hands are large. He was a large man as indicated by photographs of him and confirmed by family statements, and we should naturally expect large hands. He was a locomotive fireman and it is reasonable to assume that his work had made his hands more than ordinarily muscular.

On the other hand, while Dr. "X" is a good sized man, weighing approximately 175 pounds and being 5 feet 8¾ inches in height, his left hand is not nearly as large as his right, a difference which can probably be accounted for by his constant manipulation of tools as a dentist, which would naturally develop his right hand to a greater extent than his left.

If we consider the outlines of these palms without reference to their size, we see that in general shape these six hands present considerable variation, although this would also depend slightly upon the amount of pressure used in making the prints.

If we note the position of the deltas a, b, c and d in each palm at the roots of the fingers and trace the main lines A, B, C, and D that go from these deltas across the palm, we shall see that no two of them are exactly alike, and that the inclination and termination of the lines at the edge of the palm are different in all cases.

One very special characteristic is to be seen in the left palm of Dr. "X," where there is a well marked loop near the outer edge. This occurs in none of the other five palms.

The classification of these palms, which will mean little to the lay reader, as given by Mr. Wentworth, using his own method, is indicated by the figures in each palm diagram (Figs. 92 and 93). In the case of some of these there are two classifications given, since Mr. Wentworth could not determine where some of the lines ended in the particular print he had.
Figure 90.

Palm and finger impressions of the right and left hands of "Margery," showing at s on the right hand, the scar in the palm.
Figure 91.
Palm and finger prints of Dr. "X". Note the loop in the left palm formed by ridges.
The right palm impressions of "Margery", "Walter" and Dr. "X", reduced to the same scale and showing some of the characteristic palm lines.
FIGURE 93.
The left palm impressions of "Margery", "Walter" and Dr. "X", reduced to the same scale and showing characteristic lines.
Dr. Harold Cummins in his report, using his formulation of the palmer features, says that this formulation of the major dermatoglyphic characters is expressive of the existence of outstanding likenesses (our italics) and that it may be stated with assurance that the impressions were not made by the same person. His analysis is as follows:

**Right Palm**

"Dr. X" 7 (8).5"(6).5".3–t–A".O.O.O.L.

"Walter" 11.9.7.5–t–A".O.O.L.M.

**Left Palm**

"Dr. X" 7 (8).5"(6).5'.3(2)–t–L".O.O.O.L.

"Walter" 11.9.7.4–t–A".O.O.L.O.

Thus, it is quite apparent that these are the palms of six different hands.

In the case of the "Walter" palms, since there was no way by which we could make direct ink prints from the waxes without damaging them, we relied on photography, the area being too large to permit of the use of any of the methods of reproduction which we used in connection with the study of the fingers.

**Finger Tips**

Next let us examine the finger tip pattern of each of the thirty fingers.

These were obtained by several methods. Figure 94 shows a copy of the official record made by Mr. Bert Wentworth of "Margery's" fingerprints, with the designation of the type of design, the ridge count, and the classification.

The fingerprints of Dr. "X," likewise classified by Mr. Wentworth, are shown in Figure 95.

"Walter's" prints taken from our standard hands and arranged in a manner similar to the ink prints, we give in Figure 30.

As we have never obtained supernormal ink prints of the

\[\text{Appendix XV.} \]

\[\text{Psychic Research, February, 1928, pp. 99–100. Ink prints produced supernormaly.} \]
"Walter" fingers, it was necessary to devise various methods for obtaining prints for the purpose of this comparison, and for this classification made by Mr. Wentworth we took photographs of the tips of the fingers of the standard "Walter" hands in relief, reversed the negatives, and then made a set of prints as shown on the chart, although Mr. Wentworth had already made a similar classification with regard to the fingers and palms from the standard hands shown in Figure 32.

It may be seen that in most of the cases the ridge counts of the different fingers vary widely, and the classifications show clearly that no two homologous fingers are identical.

There are, however, some points of similarity, especially on the right thumbs, which will be considered later.

Examining the right forefinger of each, we note that "Margery's" has a radial loop with a count of five; "Walter's" an ulnar loop with a count of four; and Dr. "X's" a radial loop with a count of five, the same as "Margery's"; but that the designs themselves are different may be seen by a study of the photographs.

We would mention here that the radial loop is found more frequently on this finger than on any other, occurring in approximately 25 per cent of all right index fingers, while the ulnar loop occurs in 27 per cent of them.

The middle finger of "Margery's" right hand has an arch; that of "Walter" an ulnar loop with a count of eight; and that of Dr. "X" an ulnar loop with a count of fourteen. The ridge count here would definitely differentiate the latter from "Walter's" without respect to the ridge design; while "Margery's" arch is in an entirely different class from either. Arches occur on this finger in only 10 per cent of all cases, while ulnar loops occur in about 71 per cent.

The ring finger of "Margery's" right hand has an ulnar loop with a count of six; that of "Walter" an ulnar loop with a count of eighteen (again no similarity on this basis alone); and Dr. "X's" has an ulnar loop with a count of thirteen. There is too great a difference in the count between these last

---

49 Appendix XVII: Bonnevie Distribution of Patterns on Different Fingers.
Figure 94.
Mr. Bert Wentworth’s classification of “Margory’s” fingers.
Mr. Bert Wentworth’s classification of Dr. “X’s” fingers.
two to be due to any difficulty in making out the ridges. Ulnar loops occur on the ring finger of the right hand in about 51 per cent of all cases.

The little finger of "Margery's" right hand has an ulnar loop with a count of six; "Walter's" an eyelet ulnar loop with a count of nine; and that of Dr. "X" an ulnar loop with a count of fourteen. Here again the ridge count, without further consideration, would prove that these fingers were not identical. Ulnar loops on this finger form about 84 per cent of the total.

Taking now the left hand, "Margery's" index finger has an ulnar loop with a count of three, while "Walter's" has a radial loop with a count of four, and Dr. "X's" has a tented arch. Radial loops on this finger of the left hand are found in 22 per cent of all cases, while ulnar loops comprise about 34 per cent and arches 16 per cent. Arches are found more frequently on the forefinger than any other, but to a greater extent on the right hand than on the left.

The middle finger of "Margery's" left hand has an ulnar loop with a count of three; "Walter's" an ulnar loop with a count of nine; and Dr. "X's" an ulnar loop with a count of eight. On this finger ulnar loops occur to the extent of about 70 per cent. The ridge count difference between the "Walter" finger and Dr. "X's" is only slight but the designs are quite different.

"Margery's" ring finger has an ulnar loop with a count of five; "Walter's" a central pocket ulnar loop with a count of sixteen; and Dr. "X's" an ulnar loop with a count of nineteen. On this finger of the left hand about 67 per cent of the patterns are ulnar loops.

Coming now to the little finger, "Margery's" has an ulnar loop with a count of four; "Walter's" an ulnar loop with a count of seven; and Dr. "X's" an ulnar loop with a count of fifteen. Their designs, however, are not alike and the angles of the core are different.

Ulnar loops are found more frequently on this finger than on any other, and on the left hand especially they may occur in as high as 86 per cent of all cases.
From this study of the finger-tips of these thirty digits, and their papillary design and ridge counts, and a comparison of each not only with the homologous fingers but individually with each of the other digits, it is apparent that each contains characteristics which show not only that it is not identical with any of the others, but, in most cases, that each is quite different from any of the others.

**Thumbs**

Taking now the right thumbs, "Margery's" has an ulnar loop with a count of twenty-one; "Walter's" an ulnar loop with a count of twenty-two; and Dr. "X's" an ulnar loop with a count of twenty-three. Fifty-five per cent of right thumbs carry ulnar loops. On the basis of ridge count alone these right thumbs do not differ widely. There is a greater difference between the design on "Margery's" thumb and that on "Walter's" than there is between the latter's and Dr. "X's." The angle of inclination of the core on "Margery's" is much less than on the others, being about forty-five degrees, while "Walter's" is about sixty degrees and Dr. "X's" about seventy-five degrees. The core of "Margery's" thumb and that of "Walter" are staples, a similarity which might be expected because of their relationship. The core of Dr. "X's" right thumb, however, is a rod.

As to the left thumbs, "Margery's" has an ulnar loop with a count of fifteen; "Walter's" an ulnar loop with a count of twelve; and Dr. "X's" an ulnar loop with a count of sixteen. In the case of left thumbs about 66 per cent have an ulnar loop.

We might add here that the ulnar loops are found to a greater extent on the fingers of members of the English race than on those of any other.

Now let us compare the pattern areas of these six thumbs. By the pattern area we mean that section bounded by the ridges originating at the delta and more or less enveloping the part immediately surrounding the core, as shown in Figure 96.

---

50 Appendix XVIII: Bonnevie: *Distribution of Patterns in Different Human Races.*
Pattern Area
(Ink Print)

Figure 96.
Diagram interpreting the pattern area of an ulnar loop.
These pattern areas of the six thumbs, shown in Figure 97, have been enlarged to the same scale and oriented so that their joint lines are approximately horizontal.

The ball of the right thumb is naturally larger than that of the left because of the greater use of the right hand. "Margery" and Dr. "X" are both right handed; and we understand that Walter Stinson was likewise right handed.

"Margery's" thumbs since she is a woman, are naturally smaller than the others, while the pattern areas of the right thumbs of "Walter" and Dr. "X" are not of the same shape, "Walter's" being somewhat larger and higher than Dr. "X's," although not greatly different from it. The pattern area of Dr. "X's" right thumb is larger in comparison with his left thumb than is either of the others. This again is doubtless due to the constant pressure on his thumb in handling his instruments.

The fine lines in the center of these diagrams show the general position of the cores relative to the whole area and their angle of inclination with the joint lines. No two are alike in either of these respects, as may be seen.

No creases or severe scars show on "Margery's" right thumb or on "Walter's" in these impressions; but there is decided evidence of one on Dr. "X's," as shown at the right of the core by the dotted line, and also one near the delta not shown here.

Taking now the pattern areas of the left thumbs, the difference in the inclination of the cores is perhaps not quite so marked as in the right thumbs, and each one shows definite indication of creases or scars, there being two on "Margery's" and a very deep one diagonally across the core of "Walter's." This has appeared in every left-thumb imprint we have had, both positive and negative, and appears in those of 1927 that we hold.

Dr. "X's" left thumb also has a very noticeable crease near the top of the core running to the left and sloping slightly downward. There is also a short crease partially within the core and to its right; and still more important, there is an area
near the boundary line of the pattern which is scarred by an old suppuration. None of these occurs in any "Walter" thumb print. "Walter" claims to remember having cut his left thumb, but neither "Margery" nor Dr. "X" can state when their scars or creases developed, although appearances indicate that they are not recent.

We shall now consider a study of these six thumb impressions made by a method similar to the ordinary ink process, but covering only the area about the core.

Having no ink print of the "Walter" thumb, we felt that a fairer comparison as to general form might be made by using for this purpose normal negative thumb impressions in wax of "Margery," and Dr. "X," also, thus producing them all by the same method.

Care was used in taking these impressions to select waxes that were smooth and even, in order to avoid distortion, and transfers were made from these negatives to a paper surface by means of special wax. These transfers were somewhat latent, and in order to bring out the ridges for photographic purposes they were dusted carefully with a very fine carbon black.

The six impressions are shown in Figure 98, all enlarged to the same scale. They are not particularly good in places, as it is difficult to make as completely detailed a print by this method as could be obtained by the ink methods.

The three sets of finger prints signed by Mr. Wentworth, which we have already shown (Figs. 94, 30 and 95), give a much clearer idea of the details than does this figure, but for this purpose Mr. Wentworth’s prints could not very well be used, since those of "Walter" were made from decidedly convex waxes and would therefore be considerably foreshortened.

A comparison of "Margery’s" right thumb with those of "Walter" and Dr. "X" reveals that it is entirely different from either, although it has some of the general characteristics of "Walter’s," and we need not spend any time on these points of difference since they are so apparent.

Between "Walter’s" right thumb and that of Dr. "X" we
Diagram showing pattern area of right and left thumbs of "Margery", "Walter" and Dr. "X". Fine full lines indicate position of the core; dotted lines indicate scars, cuts or creases.
Central areas of the six thumbs, made in a manner similar to ink-prints, and showing structure at the cores. There are many imperfections in these, due to the process used.
shall find many points of similarity. In fact, these thumbs are extraordinarily alike. Mr. Dudley, in his exhibit, indicates some twenty-seven points of similarity, and one expert indicated more than forty points. But in our opinion there is one major difference, at least, and that is in the core, for in "Walter's" thumb the core is a staple, while in Dr. "X's" it is a rod. We are well aware that almost any police bureau of identification, finding eight to twelve points of similarity on two prints, and no marked differences would feel convinced that they were of one and the same digit. But here, we believe, is one great difference. And there are other slighter differences, such as the character and weight of the lines, and the shape and location of the deltas.

So far as the study of the pore structure is concerned, while it is possible to make enlargements of the ink prints of both "Margery" and Dr. "X" showing clearly the location and shape of many pores, we have not been able to find any method by which we could satisfactorily do this with either the positive or negative impressions in wax of the "Walter" thumb, nor have we been able to find anyone else who could do so.

We have already stated that many waxes show indications of pore structure, but satisfactorily to transfer these to an ink print or photograph them seems quite impossible.

There is little need to do more than glance at the left thumbs of the group because their designs are so radically different. There is one point of similarity on "Margery's" and Dr. "X's" which is of interest, and that is the crease to the left and near the top of the core. Here is a case in which two living people have a crease on the left thumb, similarly located although by no means identical. While there is no similarity between "Margery's" left thumb and that of Dr. "X," there is even greater difference between that of "Walter" and that of Dr. "X," in pattern as well as in the quality and character of the lines.

**Classification of Ridge Count**

If we classify the thirty fingers of "Margery," "Walter," and Dr. "X" on the basis of ridge counts,\(^{51}\) using the method

of H. H. Newman of Hull Zoological Laboratory, University of Chicago, we shall obtain the values shown in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>‘‘M’’</th>
<th>‘‘W’’</th>
<th>Dr. ‘‘X’’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Right thumb</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left thumb</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right index</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left index</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right middle</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left middle</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right ring</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left ring</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right little</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left little</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This method of comparison apparently gives a fairer distribution of the quantitative values and is less arbitrary, especially where a ridge count runs high, than that of Professor Bonnevie, and while, undoubtedly, when the ridge counts of two fingers are relatively close its value may be questionable, it does give an idea of the variation from this point of view, and is quite enlightening in the case of the fingers of these six hands as showing differences of value which might not otherwise be apparent. There is no case in which the homologous fingers of all these three have the same value. There are two cases in which homologous fingers of ‘‘Margery’’ and ‘‘Walter’’ have the same value, namely, in right thumbs and left index fingers; and there are two cases in which homologous fingers of ‘‘Margery’’ and Dr. ‘‘X’’ have the same value—the left thumbs and right index fingers. Four of ‘‘Margery’s’’ fingers have the same value; three of them have another; and the remaining three are all different.

In the case of "Walter" there are three pairs, each pair having a different value; each of the remaining four fingers is different.

In Dr. "X’s" case three fingers have one value; two have another; and each of the remaining five is different.

What is perhaps even more interesting is that the homologous fingers of "Walter" and Dr. "X" are in different classes in every case, although in some cases this difference is slight. Their only similarity occurs between "Walter’s" right middle finger and Dr. "X’s" left middle finger, which have the same value, but a glance at the actual designs on the classification sheets shows them to be quite different.

It is also interesting to note that the values tend to be smallest in "Margery’s" case and highest in that of Dr. "X," although this fact may have little, if any, significance.

A point which the finger-print expert would not have to take into consideration is the possibility of two fingers which are not homologous being of identical pattern, but in this investigation, because of the supernormal character of the "Walter" prints, it was necessary to check each finger of the "Walter" hands with each and every finger of Dr. "X’s" hands to make certain that there were no possible duplications of any of the prints. In fact, this comparison has been made with all the finger prints which we have on file.

**Ridges and Furrows**

Microscopic examination of the negative impressions of the right and left thumbs of "Margery," "Walter," and Dr. "X," using for this purpose waxes having a relatively flat surface, shows by actual measurement that the ridges on the "Walter" thumbs are very much wider than those of either "Margery" or Dr. "X," and that the ridge intervals of both thumbs are considerably greater than those of Dr. "X." The following table gives the average measurements of these six thumbs, both as to ridge width (R) and furrow width (F). We have also tabulated the average ridge interval (R + F) and the ridge and
furrow difference \((R - F)\), as well as the ratio of ridge to furrow \(\frac{R}{F}\).

**Right Thumbs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(R)</th>
<th>(F)</th>
<th>(R + F)</th>
<th>(R - F)</th>
<th>(\frac{R}{F})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Margery&quot;</td>
<td>0.324</td>
<td>0.084</td>
<td>0.408</td>
<td>0.241</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Walter&quot;</td>
<td>0.384</td>
<td>0.171</td>
<td>0.555</td>
<td>0.213</td>
<td>2.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. &quot;X&quot;</td>
<td>0.360</td>
<td>0.087</td>
<td>0.447</td>
<td>0.273</td>
<td>4.86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Left Thumbs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(R)</th>
<th>(F)</th>
<th>(R + F)</th>
<th>(R - F)</th>
<th>(\frac{R}{F})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Margery&quot;</td>
<td>0.347</td>
<td>0.165</td>
<td>0.512</td>
<td>0.182</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Walter&quot;</td>
<td>0.359</td>
<td>0.217</td>
<td>0.576</td>
<td>0.143</td>
<td>1.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. &quot;X&quot;</td>
<td>0.370</td>
<td>0.171</td>
<td>0.542</td>
<td>0.199</td>
<td>2.16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There are very few data available on the actual dimensions of ridges and furrows, and we have not considered a sufficient number of cases to warrant drawing any conclusions, but we wonder whether the ratio of ridge to furrow may not perhaps indicate a constitutional difference. These measurements were made near the center of the ball of the thumb between the core and the delta, and are expressed in millimeters. We used the negative waxes, as we felt they would give a fairer comparison than either ink prints, which we did not have of "Walter," or relief waxes, which of course we did not have of "Margery" or Dr. "X," and while there are great irregularities in the ridges of all the waxes, we believe that a sufficient number of measurements was made to warrant use of the above averages. (Professor Walsted made independent measurements on six or eight waxes and arrived at similar conclusions.) But as we have already mentioned, on some of the "Walter" prints there is no appreciable difference between the width of ridge and that of furrow. We have made measurements of other thumbs and find that they are comparable to those under consideration.

While we can not draw conclusions with regard to these various relationships, it does seem quite significant that the
dimensions of the ridges and furrows of the "Walter" thumb are decidedly different from those of Dr. "X's".

We were also interested to find that in all cases the ridge intervals of the left thumb are greater than those of the right.

**Cores**

Microphotographs of the tips of the cores of the right thumbs of "Walter" and Dr. "X" (Fig. 99) show quite clearly the differences in their structure, the width of their ridges and their furrows. The texture of the surfaces is quite different, and this can not be accounted for by difference of illumination, for both were illuminated in exactly the same way, both enlarged to the same diameter, and both made from negative impressions in wax. "Walter's" is shown in A—from an impression made some time ago; and B shows Dr. "X's"—from an impression which he made for us of his right thumb.

Many readers may have difficulty in seeing the structure, due to illusion, but sometimes this may be overcome by turning the cut so that the light will strike it at a different angle. Furthermore, it should be kept in mind that these are negatives and that what appear to be ridges are really the furrows of the actual thumbs. We have numbered these ridges to help identify them.

It will be noticed that in "Walter's" case ridge five has a definite end, while in Dr. "X's" case ridge five continues around into ridge four, although it is thin at the top; also that ridges two and three on Dr. "X's" join, and that their junction is about on a line with ridge five; and that between ridges one and two of "Walter's" thumb the furrow curves toward the top very perceptibly, while in Dr. "X's" the furrow does not curve although it is bent very slightly. Ridge four in "Walter's" is also a dead end; the upper end has a very small bifurcation and then stops; it does not actually merge with any of the others. There are many other points of dissimilarity apparent to the eye with a little study.

There is nothing unusual about the design of the tip of the core of the "Walter" right thumb, for Galton in his Finger
Prints,\textsuperscript{54} under the subject of Cores, illustrates the various types of staples as shown in Figure 100. No. 39 is the one of which "Walter’s" is typical.

In making a careful study of the design of the core of the "Walter" right thumb in various impressions, we find slight differences, as would be expected, but it would be quite difficult to photograph and reproduce these in illustrations. We have, therefore, made a conventionalized diagrammatic study of this part of the thumb (Fig. 101). These five diagrams—A, B, C, D, E—are normal positives in relief which show the design as it would appear to one looking at the actual thumb. The joint line, also, is diagrammatically shown, with the bifurcation opening to the right, not with the idea of showing variations in the joint but in order to show schematically how it looks in relation to the thumb in relief.

The joint lines, since these represent positives, would be depressed, while the ridges, also indicated by black lines, would be raised.

It will be noted that about the only variation in these five diagrams is the relative position of the tips of the two ridges \( p \) and \( y \). In some cases these are virtually in contact with the top of the staple while in others they are in intermediate positions, as may be seen. This may be due to difference in pressure, or to the condition of the wax at the time of making the impression, or to some factor in the impressing mechanism. Similar differences are often found in ordinary ink prints. While we have a number of prints of each of these types, most of them seem to fall into the group shown as B. The important point is that in all these cases the core is a staple.

There are also variations, as might be expected, in the prints which are normal negatives, and some of these are shown at F, G, H, I, and J. Most of them, however, seem to fall in group F, a positive of which would be approximately like A.

Most of the differences in the negative designs are not actual but are due to imperfections or entire lack of detail.

Figure 99.

A micro-photograph of the tip of the core of the right thumbs of "Walter" and Dr. "X": These represent negative impressions and the ridges of the negative—which in the real finger are the furrows—are numbered. Notice that in A, the "Walter" print, ridge 5 is surrounded by a depression which would form a staple in the positive; while in B, Dr. "X's", ridge 4 is continuous with ridge 5, leaving a depression between them which would form a rod in the positive. These were both made on the same kind of wax and with identical illumination, yet notice the difference in texture and structure.
Staples:—their envelopes are indicated by dots.

Plain. \( \frac{1}{2} \) parted. \( \frac{1}{3} \) parted. Tuning fork. Single eyed. Double eyed.

FIGURE 100.

Diagram taken from Galton's "Fingerprints" which shows various forms of staples, Nos. 38 and 39 being somewhat like that on the "Walter" right thumb.
Diagram showing some of the variations in the positive and negative impressions of the "Walter" right thumb.
Deltas

A careful examination of the deltas on the right thumbs of "Walter" and Dr. "X," under quite high magnification, (Fig. 102), shows that the angles of the ridges forming the delta are somewhat different from each other and that the deltas themselves are structurally different.

It may also be noticed that the core of the delta of the Dr "X" thumb forms a Y, while that of "Walter" does not; and that there are other un likenesses which are apparent in the illustration. These may seem to be points of minor importance, but it is in the smaller details that the differences in these two thumbs are found. Mr. Wentworth, in his book on Personal Identification,\(^5\) in order to illustrate slight differences that are not apparent to the eye, calls attention by diagram to two deltas which under low magnification appear to be alike, but which under high magnification are seen to show slighter differences than do similar areas on the thumbs of "Walter" and Dr. "X," but which Mr. Wentworth considers sufficient proof that they are different. To be sure, in his case he knew that the thumbs were of different persons, but he was trying to show to the layman how difficult it might have been to convince anyone unfamiliar with the subject that they were different.

It might be argued by some that by slight changes the ridges of the delta in "Walter's" thumb could be made to agree with those of Dr. "X," but that is no more true of these than it is of any two similar patterns of different thumbs, such as those shown by Mr. Wentworth, for instance. Furthermore, numerous prints of the delta of Dr. "X's" right thumb, when enlarged, show that these characteristics are always present, and the "Walter" characteristics consistently appear in such impressions as include distinct deltas. Therefore, it is perfectly reasonable to say that the deltas of these two thumbs are not identical.

Scars and Creases

In discussions of this matter much has been made of scars, especially of one which it is claimed shows on the upper right

of the "Walter" positive reliefs, and one at the lower left of these same reliefs. The variability of these has been mentioned in the Journal. Sometimes they are present and at other times they are not visible.

On the other hand, such scars and creases as are on "Margery's" thumb or Dr. "X's" would show on any ink print that is well made. In other words, they are persistent, and, therefore, it could be taken for granted that they really exist even if it were not possible to see the actual thumbs.

In the "Walter" prints, however, they are so variable that it is not logical to use them in comparisons.

The only exception to this is in the case of the "Walter" left thumb, where a scar seems to show in all waxes. And while both Dr. "X" and "Margery" also have scars or creases on their left thumbs, they are radically different in location and orientation from that of "Walter's."

Further, as has already been pointed out, Dr. "X" has an old scar due to suppuration on his left thumb, which does not appear in any "Walter" thumbs which we hold.

Therefore, not much is to be gained from a study of these scars except in the case of the one on the "Walter" left thumb.

"Walter" claims that there are no scars on his right thumb, but that there is one on his left.

**Joint Lines**

It may seem of little value to show a comparison of the joint lines of these thumbs, and apparently few data are available to show whether joint lines are permanent or not, but it seems probable that they do not change greatly during life. In this study one thing seems to be quite definite, and that is that the joint line of the "Walter" right thumb appears to have retained the same character and shape during all the years of these phenomena, having one large bifurcation and a smaller one on the upper branch. Dr. "X's" is quite different in shape as well as in size and character and has a small bifurcation on the upper line but no large bifurcation, although it might seem to have a large one since it is made up of two lines which almost blend, each one being somewhat tangent to the
Figure 102.
Micro-photograph, showing differences of structure between the delta of the "Walter" right thumb and the delta of the Dr. "X" right thumb.
other but separating from it again. These are shown in Figure 103 at A and B. The diagram shows very clearly the differences in the two patterns. In the lowest figure one is superimposed upon the other in order to show the degree of their difference, the dotted line representing "Walter's" and the solid line Dr. "X's".

**WRIST MARKINGS**

One of the wax impressions (Fig. 9) that was made when "Walter" was attempting to reproduce his complete right hand shows, in the lower left-hand corner, skin marks which appear to have been produced by contact with the under side of the wrist near the tip of the ulnar bone. These seem to be quite characteristic, and as we have another instance of the same phenomenon in one of the Lodge prints,\(^5^6\) we compared the two waxes and found that the texture was quite different, showing that while these two prints were both made supernormally and through the same mediumship, yet these skin markings show differences. Whether those on the Lodge waxes actually agree with Sir Oliver's skin markings, we do not know.

In order to make further comparison, we took wax impressions of the right and left wrists of both "Margery" and Dr. "X" and have examined all of these carefully under the microscope, and they all show decidedly different characteristics.

We are showing photographs (Fig. 104) of an area from the right wrists of "Margery" and Dr. "X" and the wrist marks (presumably of the right hands) on the prints of Sir Oliver Lodge and "Walter." The free surface of the epidermis is marked by a network of linear furrows of variable size dividing it into a number of polygonal areas.\(^5^7\)

These may be seen to show distinct differences of structure and none of them is the same as any other. This is another indication that the pattern of the "Walter" skin is not like that of any of the others.

The impressions due to the hairs are clearly shown and microscopic examination and measurement indicate consider-

\(^5^6\) Journal A.S.P.R., March 1932.
\(^5^7\) Gray's Anatomy, 21st Edition.
able difference in the width of these in the three cases studied, namely, those of Sir Oliver Lodge, "Walter" and Dr. "X."

This detailed comparison of the hands of "Margery," Dr. "X" and "Walter," which has quite completely covered both major and minor differences in palms and fingers and which, in the case of cores, deltas, scars, creases and joint lines, related only to "Walter" and Dr. "X," ("Margery’s" characteristics being so markedly different that such comparisons are superfluous), quite clearly indicates dissimilarities which can not be explained on any reasonable basis other than that the impressions are those of entirely different hands.

There is one point which should not be lost sight of in connection with these waxes, and that is that under high magnification the surface texture of all the supernormally produced prints is of a distinctly different appearance from that of the normally made impressions. This is apparent to some extent in the microphotograph (Fig. 99) which appears on page 109.

In order to be able to note these surface differences the waxes should be freshly impressed, so that they may be examined before oxidation has had a chance to take place or the surfaces to dry out to any great degree, and they should be very carefully handled to avoid the soiling and wearing down of these surfaces. Almost all the older waxes have suffered from these conditions.

In investigation of psychic phenomena the utmost effort should be directed toward a sufficient repetition of the phenomena to afford a basis for a qualitative analysis, if not for a quantitative one.

In the case of these waxes we have done something approaching this, and a careful examination of all the waxes involved establishes the fact that the surface texture of the "Walter" prints is decidedly different from that of the waxes normally impressed by "Margery" and by Dr. "X."

Often, to the unaided eye, differences in sharpness of detail are noticeable between the impressions supernormally made and the others. While this is only a minor point, it lends additional weight to other evidence that tends to substantiate the claim that the "Walter" waxes were supernormally produced.
Diagrams showing main differences in the joint lines of the right thumbs of "Walter" and Dr. "X". Notice that the "Walter" joint line is bifurcated, while that of Dr. "X" consists of two lines which are tangent. There is also considerable difference in size, which may be noted in the lower diagram.
A somewhat enlarged photograph of the skin markings on the wrists of "Margery" and Dr. "X". The two central views show what are supposed to be the same areas of Sir Oliver Lodge's wrist and "Walter's" both obtained supernormally. Notice that the structure is quite different in all four, as well as the size of the hair and the quantity of it.
Briefly reviewing our discussion, we have presented in detail the "Walter" standard hands and shown the extent of their agreement with the old paraffin gloves and the wax impressions, and have considered points of similarity and difference in the hands of "Margery," "Walter" and Dr. "X." Before we present our summary and conclusions we wish to consider the major points raised by the critics of these phenomena. As we have already said, these have related chiefly to the similarity of the papillary ridge design of the "Walter" thumb impressions to those of "Margery" and Dr. "X," and especially their close resemblance to those of the latter.

It seems hardly necessary to go into much further detail to show that in most cases the critics have been ignorant of the facts, or if they were acquainted with them, appear to have been quite arbitrary in their interpretations, to say nothing of the contradictory statements which have in some instances been made.

First in this connection we shall take up the report submitted by Mr. Bell on the thumb of the plaster cast.

During the fall of 1931 Mr. Bell, former fingerprint expert of Scotland Yard, sent a report 58a to Lime Street "on the identity of the alleged supernormal 'Walter' print on the plaster cast of May 17, 1924" (Fig. 105) to the effect that this print is, in fact, identical with the imprint of "Margery's" right thumb and does not agree with the "well-known 'Walter' print."

In this connection, special reference was made to a photographic copy of the latter bearing the date of February 3, 1927, appearing on page 700 of the Journal for December, 1928.

This criticism of Mr. Bell's was presented in connection

58 Appendix XIX: Wentworth's statement on hands.
58a Appendix XX: Bell's report on cast of thumb.
with the Sir Oliver Lodge prints, upon the identity of which he had already affirmatively reported, although just why he at this time brought up the subject of the plaster cast, which had no bearing on the Lodge prints, is not apparent, unless he wished to intimate that since (according to his opinion) the plaster cast was not what it was represented to be, there was no reason to suppose that the Lodge prints were any more genuine. However, at the time little attention was paid to this criticism, although Mr. Dudley intended to reply to it, and consequently took this cast and the photographs prepared by Mr. Bell, none of which the writer had ever seen, to use in connection with his proposed reply, leaving a signed memorandum to that effect, dated December 29, 1931, as has already been mentioned, page 33.

Some years ago Mr. Dudley wrote an article on this plaster cast of May 17, 1924, which appeared in the Journal of the Society50 with a photograph of the thumb only, which showed the pattern more or less well. In this article he says, speaking of the persistence of finger-print patterns: "While on the subject of the persistence of these patterns let us not overlook the fact that this 'Walter' finger-print pattern is also persistent in its supernormal aspects. It has persisted as a unique pattern through more than two years, meanwhile undergoing all the vicissitudes of changes from negative to positive and through partial reversals into the mirror negative and mirror positive categories until, if it were not an ideoplastic structure it would seem that it must certainly have been changed beyond the possibility of recognition. But the pattern has persisted much longer than this, for, as noted in our February installment and in Mr. Fife's general report, above, it is this same pattern which is found on the thumb of the plaster cast of the paraffin glove of May 17, 1924. We present herewith a photograph of the bulb of this thumb sufficiently enlarged so as to make it an easy matter to recognize the essential similarity of the characteristic core and its surrounding ridges to the

50 Psychic Research, December, 1928, p. 704, Dudley and Bird's article on plaster cast.
Figure 105.

The palmar surface of the plaster cast made from the paraffin glove of May 17, 1924. This was made by Mr. Kuntz from the original negative which he took and shows some fine detail. The ridge design of the thumb has since been obliterated.
corresponding pattern of the Walter positive prints in wax. An examination of the photograph in question and of the original plaster reveals much of interest.

"The print on the plaster is very complete down to a certain point, where paraffin appears to have flowed into the thumb; but below this main print another print has taken form. This lower print is apparently of an earlier period than the complete print, but it, too, is a normal positive. The lines of this second print are deformed at the right, as one looks at the photograph, and in this area a more careful study of the photograph and of the original plaster reveals a third partial thumb print. This last is of the same general pattern; and in so far as its lines can be be followed it appears to be a mirror-reversed print. These subsidiary prints do not show as clearly on the photograph as on the plaster original, and we fear that they may be even less evident on the engraving. In such event, the plaster cast remains as evidence of the validity of what we have just said.

"In any case, the presence of these prints lends extreme renewed interest to an aspect of the Margery mediumship which, as Mr. Bird has said in print, has heretofore been made much of by the hostile critics and in behalf of which the medium's defenders have been unable to present much more than an apology. The plaster cast of this hand has been in Dr. Cran- don's custody since it was obtained, but its anatomical imperfections and those introduced into it by the ineffective casting certainly so mark it as to make substitution theories ridiculous; and no one who examines the print now found on the thumb will suggest that it has been added since 1924. Accordingly it now becomes necessary to add, to the hypothesis of fraud covering the Margery mediumship, the very quaint notion that the present thumb-print sequence has in all its details been present in the medium's mind since May, 1924, and that she has waited until the middle of 1926 to start it on its way. This, of course, in addition to all the physical evidence of genuineness which this sequence presents when viewed on physical grounds alone.
The discovery of these prints on the 1924 hand confirms the ideoplastic process in a remarkable manner. It also indicated, in view of the details just now catalogued, that the hand was the product of a trial-and-error method, and that some of the errors left their traces in the wax. That we have here a very respectable degree of evidence that we are now able to get, on demand, through the Margery mediumship, finger prints of a man who died in 1911, seems a conservative enough summary of the present paper. Galton, with true scientific caution, . . . limited the life of finger prints to the period of existence of the flesh in which they were formed. The evidence now being collected, a portion of which has been presented in this article, indicates that the true measure of persistence may lie in the period through which the mind or personality persists and maintains its ability to function ideoplastically in the three-dimensional world of our present physical existence."

As may be seen from the foregoing, this cast was recognized by Mr. Dudley and others as belonging to the "Walter" series, but to the best of the writer's knowledge Mr. Dudley has never made reply to Mr. Bell's criticism, although the conclusions of the latter were quite different from his own.

Since, as we have previously stated in this report, it is unmistakably evident that some of the ridges on this cast, including the core, have been obliterated at some time since the original photograph was made and before it came into our possession, we were unable to make a careful microscopic examination of its structure and markings, and we can not, therefore, state definitely whether it bore a "Walter" or a "Margery" print, but that it was of the ulnar loop type there is little doubt and on this point all seem to agree.

Furthermore, since Mr. Bell's report was to the effect that the plaster cast imprint and the right thumb of "Margery" show great similarity, and since we know that the "Margery" right thumb is not only of the ulnar loop type but also has a staple at the core, it would indicate quite clearly, as our examination of the photograph does, that the cast also originally had a staple at its core.
And we know, moreover, that if this were actually a "Walter" print it might quite naturally be similar to "Margery's" because of their relationship as brother and sister. That such relationship is shown by finger markings is evident from the statements of such authorities as H. H. Newman of Hull Zoological Laboratory, University of Chicago; Kristine Bonnevie, University of Oslo; H. H. Wilder of Smith College; Francis Galton and others.

But while we have imprints of the right thumb of the medium "Margery" and know its various characteristics, we have had nothing but a photograph of the cast, which was poor at best, for comparison, so we can not decide this point.

Moreover, since we are considering a supernormal phenomenon, we must take into consideration a curious situation which has arisen and is likely to arise again in the production of waxes and casts, one which could not possibly occur if they were made by normal human contact. That is the fact that there are times when some characteristic or characteristics of the medium's fingers are found in these wax impressions. We have already made mention of this. We are not offering any explanation as to the process by which it happens, but that it does happen is evident, and we feel that this fact should be called to the reader's attention because of the supernormality involved, since this tendency might easily account for the similarity of which Mr. Bell makes so great a point.

We have already indicated in this report, in our study of the photograph of this plaster cast, that the thumb still shows some indications of being a "Walter" right. It is of the ulnar loop type and the core is much nearer to the angle of the "Walter" core, relative to the joint line, than it is to "Margery's."

In order to try to obtain unprejudiced consideration of this point we took the matter up with Mr. Bert Wentworth, the

---

61 Kristine Bonnevie, "Studies on the Papillary Pattern of Human Fingers", Journal of Genetics, XV.
64 Francis Galton, Finger Prints, London, 1892.
Dean of fingerprint experts in this country, to obtain his opinion. In his report Mr. Wentworth states very definitely that this cast does not belong to either "Margery," "Walter," or Dr. "X," basing his conclusions on prints which he himself took of the thumbs of "Margery" and Dr. "X" and an examination of the impressions in wax of the "Walter" hands.

Mr. Wentworth states that this photograph of the cast is a miserable thing to work with, and we agree with him. However, here are the opinions of three qualified experts, no two of whom agree, for Mr. Fife says in his report, as published in the Journal in Mr. Dudley’s article, that this particular thumb agrees with a typical "Walter" wax impression.

Mr. Bell, in his report, stated very definitely that the thumb of this plaster cast agrees with "Margery’s" right thumb and, in proof of this, furnished photographs of both showing eighteen skin ridge characteristics which are in agreement (Fig. 106).

Mr. Wentworth, on the other hand, states that this pattern is unlike that of either "Margery," "Walter" or Dr. "X." Therefore, with the evidence which the cast bore destroyed and three-fingerprint experts differing in their opinions, we cannot arrive at any definite conclusion. All we may do is to point out some of the features which seem to indicate that it was at least an attempt at a "Walter" thumb, viz: It is of the ulnar loop type with considerable indication that it had a staple at the core; the ridge count is high (as it is in the cases of all three, "Margery," "Walter" and Dr. "X"); the shape of the tip of the core is very close to that of the "Walter" right thumb and much like that of "Margery’s," while the slant of the core is steeper than hers and more like "Walter’s." The general shape of the pattern area of the thumb is more like that of "Walter" than that of "Margery," although smaller than either. In fact, the thumb, as well as the entire cast of which it is a part, appears somewhat smaller than our standard "Walter" hand although the finger lengths are about the same.

---

64 Appendix XXI: Wentworth’s report on cast of thumb.
65 Appendix XXII: Fife’s report on cast of thumb.
Three photographs used by Mr. Bell in his report on the plaster cast. Note that he has reversed the photograph of the cast (No. 2) in order to make the comparison easier.
This may be due to shrinkage of the paraffin, as well as to the partial collapse of the glove before the casting was made. Mr. Bell found eighteen characteristics in agreement with the "Margery" right thumb, which is not surprising when we keep in mind that this is a supernormal phenomenon and is, therefore, much more flexible than might be evident without close study. Dr. Bonnevie shows that in the cases of thirty pairs of hands of brothers and sisters the correlation was quite indicative, although not nearly so high as in cases of identical twins.

Mr. Bell appeared to appreciate the fact that this photograph was of a cast in relief, whereas Mr. Wentworth seemed to question its orientation.

Furthermore, Mr. Bell presumably used for comparison the photograph of the "Walter" print made on February 3, 1927. This appears to be the same impression which Mr. Dudley is using and claiming to be that of Dr. "X," as we shall later see. We claim that this is not a true "Walter" negative print, and that it may be either a "Walter" partial negative, such as we have already discussed, or one of the impressions which were made by Dr. "X." In either case Mr. Bell would be quite right in saying the cast did not agree with it.

In March, 1932, in a letter to the American Society for Psychical Research, Mr. E. E. Dudley claimed to have discovered that the so-called "Walter" thumb prints were none other than those of Dr. "X," "Margery's" dentist, to whom we have already referred, and attempted to substantiate this claim by an exhibit in which are shown two photographs of what are purported to be wax prints of the "Walter" right and left thumbs, arranged for comparison beside those of ink prints of Dr. "X's" right and left thumbs (Fig. 107). In other words, Mr. Dudley, who until recently has had opportunity to examine all the "Walter" finger prints that have been produced, who was present when a large number of them were produced and

---

67 Psychic Research, April, 1928, p. 201 and December, 1928, p. 700. Wax of 2-3-27.
in a sense acted as curator of the collection, and who had supposedly made a careful study of all of them, and wrote extensively about them, has come to the conclusion that these prints are those of this dentist.*

It seems rather strange, in view of all his years of close connection with the case, that this supposed identity should not have been discovered sooner, especially since on very good evidence Mr. Dudley had in his possession the very impressions which Dr. "X" made of his own thumbs previous to the appearance of any "Walter" waxes.

The question raised by this claim at the time it was made, if we understood it, was merely one of identity and in no way related to the genuineness of the phenomena, but some recent articles interpret the Dudley claim as proving fraudulent production. A most important preliminary inquiry in this investigation is, of course, as to the authenticity of the impressions used in the comparison.

The photographs of the "Walter" thumbs which have been used by Mr. Dudley in his exhibit to support his contention have been given very careful study, but the waxes from which these photographs were made have not been available for our examination. They have completely disappeared so far as we know. In the photographs the wax bearing the print of the right thumb, Fig. 81c, is dated February 3, 1927, and the wax carrying the left thumb impression (Fig. 107a) bears the date of August 23, 1927, and has a "2" marked on it. These two photographs are apparently those from which illustrations were made for use in the Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research. 68 They will be discussed later.

---

* The extent to which Mr. Dudley was involved in the experiments which produced the finger impressions is indicated in the following extract from an article written by Mr. Dudley himself in collaboration with J. Malcolm Bird in the Journal of the A.S.P.R. for December, 1928, p. 693:

"...and particularly he (Mr. Fife) has been very patient and helpful with Mr. Dudley in connection with the latter's efforts to attain some degree of mastery of the dactylographic problems of the case. Since approximately the date mentioned just above (i.e. March 1927) these two have been regarded as having complete charge from the normal side of the thumb-print sequence and the work done thereon."—Editor.

Mr. Dudley's exhibit of the right and left thumbs, supposedly of Dr. "X" and "Walter", with numerous points of identity indicated. We have deleted Dr. "X's" real name, with which one print was labelled.
Figure 107A.
Left thumb of Mr. Dudley's exhibit.
It is interesting to note that most of the literature describing, classifying and discussing these wax finger impressions of "Walter," appears to have been prepared and written by Mr. E. E. Dudley himself, who, judging from his articles and signature on numerous sets of finger prints which he has made in the usual manner, considers himself a finger print expert.

At this point let us emphasize the fact that neither Dr. Crandon nor Dr. Richardson claims to know anything at all about the art of the finger-print expert. We are certain, after long contact with them, that neither one would attempt to identify a "Walter" print from any other, having in the past left this matter entirely to Mr. Dudley. While Mr. Fife has examined many of the waxes, it was always Mr. Dudley who was in charge of preparations for the séances and of the prints which were obtained, and it was he who made the ultimate identifications and prepared the reports for publication.

An investigation of a matter such as this requires more than the mere identification of two or more thumb print patterns by the methods of classification ordinarily employed.

We know that there are many qualified persons who are thoroughly familiar with the taking of finger prints and with the interpretation and classification of ink (or similar) prints such as are used in criminal and other identification systems. These experts, if shown two ordinary normal finger prints and asked whether or not they are identical, would give a definite answer, one way or the other, almost immediately; and if they were shown photographs of prints that were three-dimensional they would undoubtedly still be willing to express an opinion, naturally assuming that such prints had been made by pressing a thumb or finger into some plastic, thereby producing a negative. But if they were told that some of the three-dimensional prints were positive impressions (in other words, were in relief) they would naturally become suspicious and probably skeptical and begin to question the procedure; and if in addition they were told that some were mirror prints, either positive or negative, they would certainly be puzzled, if not incredulous, and want to know how they were made before expressing an opinion.
on identity. Mr. Dudley, writing in the manuscript Proceedings, indicates the finger-print expert’s attitude as follows:

"Normal finger prints are substantially constant as to pattern and the relationships of their minutiae; hence an identification can be established if comparatively few of the minutiae in the print under examination are related in exactly the same manner as in the record print. . . . It has also been stated that some of the Walter prints already described, and others of later date, show marked variations from the norm in one or another part of the imprinted area, variations which are not, apparently, a function of differences in pressure or the angle at which the digit contacts the wax, nor of changes in the plasticity of the imprinted substance.

"The invariability of normal finger prints is so firmly established that it is only natural that the practical finger-print expert, trained to deal with such prints, should tend to look askance at any exhibits which behave in such an unorthodox fashion as do some of these Walter prints, assuming, no doubt, that the variations had been introduced mechanically.* However, in these variant forms of a basic pattern there is recorded one of the chief characteristics of the structures which produce them: the extreme mobility of a substance that is apparently of organic origin, and, even in its larger aspects, seems to possess the power to change its form as rapidly as do some of the lowest forms of life—the single-cell animalculae."

Elsewhere in the same manuscript Mr. Dudley writes:

"So invariable are these patterns as to their minutiae that the finger-print expert would be loth to believe that a print could have ten or twelve perfectly definite characteristics which correspond exactly with another print and yet have as many as two equally well-defined elements which did not so correspond. If faced with such a problem he might either refuse to make an identification or else insist that the latter minutiae must be accidents of impression. This attitude on the part of the experts is a perfectly logical one, and is based on the careful study of normal finger-print records for more than fifty years. Just

* Italics are the writer's.
how it may affect the evidence derived from a study of supernormal prints is yet to be determined."

We appreciate the skill and competence of the finger-print experts in the ordinary field of their work, but to practically all of them problems arising out of the supernormal production of prints would come as something entirely new and beyond the limits of their training and experience. As to such problems they can have no claim to be experts.

Indeed, it is not too much to say that to all but a very limited number of persons who happen to have had the occasion or opportunity to study the phenomena of supernormal prints, the subject is a veritable terra incognita. There are no experts in it. Quite obviously, therefore, the opinion of conventional finger-print experts in this subject cannot be given weight or authority beyond that of others, and certainly cannot be accepted as final or conclusive. Mr. Dudley, however, seems now to think otherwise.

There are, however, quite a number of persons of the highest standing on the faculties of our universities working along biological and anthropological lines who have given much time to the study of finger and palm prints in connection with the study of the characteristics of identical twins and similar human and animal relationships, who thoroughly understand dermatoglyphics, or the subject of skin markings, not merely for the purpose of classification but for use in biological research, and who are very familiar with skin structure. Moreover, they have developed scientific methods of measurement and of making impressions superior, for their purpose, to those generally in use in police practice.

But even this group of scientists who have made dermatoglyphics a specialty, have confined their researches to normal skin, both human and animal, and we know of no one among them whose experience has included the study of teleplasmic structures. Any student undertaking work in this field of supernormal manifestations must face and if possible overcome the handicap that he is under as a pioneer breaking new ground, with little of value in the work of others to guide him. Skill
in the field of normal dermatoglyphics is certainly of great value
to the student of the dermatoglyphics of supernormal struc-
tures, but knowledge and skill in the former cannot be blindly
transferred and applied to problems in the latter field. To do
this would be to assure, not avoid, error. Variable factors of
almost wholly unknown nature, range and effect enter into the
production of these teleplasms and affect or condition their
use and operation by the directing intelligence in ways that
we as yet but dimly sense, much less understand. These factors
must be taken into account by any serious investigator of the
subject and until a scientist, whether in the field of biology,
dermatoglyphics or police identification work, has, by actual
study of the teleplasms and their manifestations, become some-
what familiar with, if not master of the pertinent facts, his
opinion on particular problems is rather irrelevant.

Obviously, furthermore, the opinion of one who denies the
existence of teleplasmic structures can hardly be valuable upon
a problem that arises in respect to the physical effects produced
by the supernormal structure, e.g., impressions in plastic wax.
Such a person will, of course, attribute the phenomena to normal
production and will quite readily classify the claim of tele-
plasmic production as fraud. Science cannot pause for the
laggards. It must go forward and leave them to debate among
themselves.

We are satisfied that any reliable finger-print expert, if
given the exhibit prepared by Mr. Dudley of the Dr. "X" and the two so-called "Walter" prints, would reach the
opinion expressed by Sergeant J. Warren Toelken of the State
Police of Massachusetts and Frederick E. Zwirz, Acting Cap-
tain in charge of Criminal Identification in the New York City
Police Department, namely: that they are identical. We agree
that the two left thumbs shown in Mr. Dudley’s exhibit are iden-
tical and see no reason why they should not be, for since the pho-
tograph of the alleged "Walter" print is not in agreement with
what we have shown to be the standard "Walter" left thumb, it
naturally does not belong to the authentic "Walter" group,
and may well be that of Dr. "X." As to the right thumb prints
shown in Mr. Dudley's exhibit, we agree that they are extraordinarily alike, but the reader who has followed our analysis of these impressions, especially our comparison of the "Walter" and Dr. "X" right thumbs, will probably see that this similarity may be only apparent—not real. To be sure, we have not had a chance to study the actual impressions shown in Mr. Dudley's exhibit and photographs are a poor substitute for the waxes and actual impression for such purpose, but we have presented the details of similar impressions in our own possession and have indicated a degree of major and minor difference which is sufficient to show that they are not identical.

Insofar as Mr. Dudley's photographic exhibit is concerned, we would call attention in the first place to the fact that he is comparing ink prints with impressions in wax, a proceeding which ordinarily would not be difficult, but which in the case of supernormal impressions is far from satisfactory, since these contain not only normal irregularities but supernormal differences which can not easily be accounted for and involve consideration of the variable factors above referred to. Such variations in these prints have frequently been commented upon by Mr. Dudley and others in the Journal.

Further, the ink prints which Mr. Dudley uses to illustrate the patterns of Dr. "X's" thumbs are not particularly well made and do not include a sufficient area around the delta; and as for the developed latent prints, they are quite unnecessary in this instance and add no value to the argument, although later we shall call attention to one feature of interest which they contain.

It will be apparent to anyone familiar with the genesis and development of the finger-print phenomena in this case, that producing in the séances prints of a living person has in fact been part of the program of experimentation. The production of the Sir Oliver Lodge prints followed an inquiry by the writer to "Walter" as to whether he could produce prints of living persons who were unknown to the medium or any of her circle, and experiments to test that possibility were under way when Mr. Dudley announced his alleged discovery. It must be con-
eced, therefore, on the basis of past experience that the super-normal production of Dr. "X's" prints as part of a definite experiment having that result in mind, is not a novel idea.

Of course, "Walter" might have produced these Dr. "X" impressions, for he has made many thumb prints of living persons as has been stated, and has not always said at the time to whom they belonged. In one instance it was several months before we were informed by "Walter" whose print it was that appeared on a certain wax. And there are still prints, obviously not of the "Walter" fingers, as to the identity of which we are ignorant. However, there does not seem to be any evidence in the records which are available that "Walter" made any unidentified prints on the dates which these waxes that Mr. Dudley uses bear, and, moreover, he is emphatic in his statement that he has never made Dr. "X's" prints, and that the prints he calls his are his.

Another possibility is that these disputed waxes may have been artificially made. The hypothesis that the medium or her friends made or procured a few artificial duplicates of a normal impression, is wholly unsupported by any evidence and contrary to all the probabilities. No understandable motive for such an erratic procedure can be reasonably imagined, and if these disputed waxes are artificially made duplicates of Dr. "X's" print, their source must be sought elsewhere than at Lime Street.

While it is not the purpose of this report to deal with the artificial duplication of waxes, we would say that enough investigation has been carried on by us in this line to convince us that it is quite possible to make artificially both two-dimensional and three-dimensional impressions exact enough so that, in some cases at least, they might be taken for genuine finger prints.

Mr. Dudley has a technique by which he can make duplicate wax prints in three dimensions. In fact at one time he prepared a number of such prints and submitted them together with a number of genuine ones to Mr. Button with the request that he

---

69 Appendix XXIII: Minutes of meetings of 2-3-27 and 8-23-27.
should submit them to a fingerprint expert to determine whether such expert could distinguish the duplicates from the originals. Mr. Button submitted them to Mr. Fife who, in this instance, was able to detect the genuine waxes from the counterfeits within a few moments. In Bulletin XIX of the B. S. P. R., mention is made of impressions so made.

Many fingerprint experts claim that it is not possible to make artificial prints which could not be detected; but, on the other hand, we have letters from a number of well-known persons who claim that it is, or may be, possible to so make them. We refer below to several printed articles on the subject. Some of the waxes shown in Figure 4 were artificially made.

Finally, if these disputed waxes are normal negatives as is claimed, may they in fact not be those which were made by Dr. "X" long ago when he was showing "Margery" how Kerr could be used in her séances?

We wish to reiterate that Dr. "X," "Margery's" dentist, who had been a frequent observer of the phenomena at Lime Street although he had not attended the séances for some years, was the first person to suggest the use of Kerr and that he demonstrated to "Margery," on July 30, 1926, the manner in which thumb impressions might be made in it by making some of his own, which "Margery" took with her when she left his office. Upon returning home enthusiastic over the possibilities of this new material, she talked the matter over with Dr. E. W. Brown, whom she found at the house attending her dental appointment book shows "Margery" at his office on July 30, 1926.

---

62a Bulletin XIX, Boston S.P.R., p. 44.
70 Albert Wehde and John N. Beffel, Finger Prints Can Be Forged.
Ames on Forgery.
Osborn on Questioned Documents.
Hagan on Disputed Handwriting.
We have a signed statement from Dr. "X" to the effect that the only wax impressions ever made of his thumbs or fingers were those he made on the above-mentioned date and those made for the writer within the last few months.

Further, in an attempt to determine whether waxes made on or near the dates on which "Margery" had appointments at her dentist's differed in any degree from those made at other times, the writer checked the dates of the dental appointments with the séance dates and found that there were no differences in the impressions which could be interpreted as being due to any special mental influence on the part of the medium at such times.

71 Dr. "X's" dental appointment book shows "Margery" at his office on July 30, 1926.
mother who was ill, and his wife. Since he was familiar with the phenomena, "Margery" showed him the waxes and discussed the matter with him, and with Mr. Dudley who was also at the house. These normal negative wax impressions of Dr. "X" were given to Mr. Dudley. When it was time to leave, Mr. Wendell P. Murray, a lawyer, who was also present, and Dr. Brown drove Mr. Dudley to his home, and both men distinctly recall that Mr. Dudley took the waxes with him. Of what became of them after this, there is no record, but apparently they were never returned to Lime Street. Since Mr. Dudley had these Dr. "X" waxes in his possession before any "Walter" prints appeared, we fail to see why he should not long ago have noticed the similarity to which he is calling attention as a discovery made in March 1932, and consider that there is abundant reason to believe that the original Dr. "X" impressions may have been confused with authentic séance room waxes.

Let us consider a moment the wax Mr. Dudley is using to show the print of the right thumb, that bearing the date of February 3, 1927. This wax was evidently one of those he brought to the writer to be photographed in the group previously mentioned. In the group (Fig. 43) it is marked No. 11 and may be seen in the upper row, the only difference being that the date appears twice on our illustration, once at the top as shown in Mr. Dudley's photograph, and also again below the joint line, the writer having added the latter at the time he made the group photograph for the purpose of better identification. The outline of this wax, as shown in this group picture, appears to check with that shown in Mr. Dudley's exhibit.

In this group there are two other waxes which bear the same date (February 3, 1927) namely No. 9 and No. 10, so that there were at least three waxes marked with that date. In the manuscript Proceedings Mr. Dudley specifies that three waxes were obtained on this evening. The first (No. 9 in the group) is, according to him, a positive; this wax we have already discussed. The third and last made on this date (No. 10 in this
group) is listed as a normal negative, and in the manuscript Proceedings Mr. Dudley spends considerable time on a discussion of its peculiarities, as the writer also has done in this report (see page 50) showing that as a normal negative it would give a normal positive with a staple at the core. Just why Mr. Dudley should have picked out No. 11 for use as a standard negative when this other wax, No. 10, produced on the same evening, showed a different core pattern, we fail to see. We realize that his photograph of No. 11 shows very fine detail, but the upper part of the core of No. 10 likewise shows excellent detail. There is, of course, a possibility that this wax (No. 11) might come under the classification of a partial negative intaglio, a type of which we have already spoken in discussing "Walter's" difficulty in making mirror prints (see p. 67). This, however, can not be determined merely by examination of the photograph. It is possible that one of the original impressions of Dr. "X's" right thumb may have become confused with other prints and erroneously classed as a séance room production.

Taking now Mr. Dudley's exhibit of left thumb impressions, we do not know where the waxes he is using originated, but we are led to believe that they are either some of the originals that Dr. "X" made for "Margery" or else replicas made from them. There is in our mind very little doubt that in some way Dr. "X's" impressions have become mixed with those produced at the séance of August 23, 1927. In the Journal Mr. Dudley specifically states that only three waxes were made on this date and that all of these carried the same design, a fact attested at the time by Mr. Fife, who was present, and that since they were different from the usual "Walter" right thumb impression they were assumed to be impressions of "Walter's" left thumb for which Mr. Fife had asked.

In the manuscript Proceedings which Mr. Dudley likewise prepared, it is again stated that three waxes, bearing identical impressions, were made on this date, and the one illustrated in the Journal, which is the one he is now using in his comparison,

---

73 Psychic Research, February, 1928, p. 112.
could not have been one of these, if his statement made at the time, that all three were identical, is true.

A scrutiny of the picture of the print which he is using and which we assume he is calling a normal negative shows that it does not agree with our standard "Walter" left thumb. It happens, moreover, that we have in our possession two "Walter" negative left-thumb impressions, one marked 1 (Fig. 51) and the other 3 (Fig. 52), both of which bear this same date, August 23, 1927. The patterns on these are similar to each other and agree also with our standard "Walter" left thumb, but they do not agree with the impression Mr. Dudley is exhibiting which also bears this date and which is clearly marked 2. If these were the only waxes so dated, and numbered consecutively from 1 to 3, even though 2 is dissimilar from the others, the difference might be explained by the possibility of one of Dr. "X's" original impressions having become mixed in, but such is not the case. Mr. Dudley exhibits a broken wax showing an impression apparently similar to his No. 2, which he and his collaborators claim to have received from Mr. W. T. Hutchinson of Louisville, Ky., and which is said by them to have been given to Mr. Hutchinson at his request at the close of the séance at which it was produced. In the photograph this shows no date and we do not know whether or not it actually bears one. However, it does show the characteristic crease of Dr. "X's" left thumb and also the round scar due to suppuration. This, therefore, makes a fourth wax ascribed to this date, in contradiction of the contemporaneous record.

But now let us glance again at Figure 43, which shows the group of seventy-five waxes. In this group we find two waxes, numbers 47 and 48, both of which bear this same date, August 23, 1927. One of these carries a No. 2 and has all the other characteristics which go to prove that it is the one which Mr. Dudley is using for his comparison. So here are five waxes ascribed to this date, although, as we have said, on the one furnished by Mr. Hutchinson no date is indicated.

75a B.S.P.R. Bull. XVIII.
How is it that there are four waxes bearing this date, three of them marked consecutively 1, 2 and 3, the fourth one apparently unnumbered? Our photograph of the latter is not sufficiently clear in detail to show the pattern, although there are indications that it is of Dr. "X's" thumb. Whether Mr. Dudley has this particular wax, we do not know, but we assume that he has it in order to be able to account for three.

It certainly seems strange that the wax furnished by Mr. Hutchinson should bear no date, while the one Mr. Dudley is using and the other, which we assume he has, are dated. We suppose this might be accounted for by the fact that he took only two home with him (we presume he always did his marking in white ink or chalk at home, as he did not do it at Lime Street), and that the third was not marked because Dr. Crandon, as is claimed, had given it to Mr. Hutchinson. Or perhaps the date was accidentally broken off, when the wax shown in the illustration in the Bulletin was broken.

However, it seems very curious that Dr. Crandon should have given away to a practical stranger a new and unusual print, supposedly the first one made of "Walter's" left thumb. It seems much more likely that he would have given away an old one of the right thumb. Dr. Crandon wrote to Mr. Hutchinson asking him to relate what he could remember of this circumstance, and in his reply Mr. Hutchinson stated that he thought it likely that Mr. Dudley gave him the wax.

This is all very difficult to understand but, as we have said, we have in our possession two waxes, shown in Figures 51 and 52, both of the "Walter" left thumb, which are identical with our recently obtained left thumbs and both of which bear the date in question, August 23, 1927. We do not know where the third one is. It cannot be claimed that the two waxes we hold are not the originals, for the dates they bear were placed on them by Mr. Dudley. In the course of time they were given to Mr. Fife for further study and were kept by him in his safe until he turned them over to the writer.

---

72a Bulletin XVIII, Boston S.P.R.
73 Appendix XXIV: Hutchinson letter to Dr. Crandon.
How is Mr. Dudley going to account for these four waxes, possibly five, two of which we hold, four of which bear the same date and three of which are numbered consecutively in addition, date and numbers having been scratched into the surfaces of all four by Mr. Dudley himself, when in his own signed articles he claims, in agreement with the contemporaneous record, that only three were produced on this date?

That these dates and numbers were all printed by Mr. Dudley there is no doubt, since we have many samples of his work; but in proof of this we are appending a signed statement by Mr. W. F. Turner, an expert examiner and photographer of questioned documents, who attests that the printing is in Mr. Dudley's hand.

Mr. Turner checked the figures in the dates on the two left-thumb impressions which we hold, shown in Figures 51 and 52, against the same figures similarly used on the two waxes which appear in the group photograph (Fig. 43), and which have been enlarged and shown in Figure 108; as well as figures on numerous other waxes which his report indicates.

After Mr. Dudley's presentation to the American Society for Psychical Research of his alleged discovery that the so-called "Walter" thumb prints were actually those of "Margery's" dentist, whom we have called Dr. "X," and before there had been time to investigate the matter thoroughly, he, in collaboration with several others, published his finding in Bulletin XVIII of the Boston Society for Psychical Research. The editorial preface to this Bulletin contained an excellent comment, as follows: "Psychical research is scientific in so far only as it is governed by the recognized principles of all other species of scientific inquiry. One of these recognized principles is that every fact pertinent to an investigation must be taken into account and given its due weight. To ignore demonstrated facts or to gloss them over because of advocacy of a particular theory is to commit treason against psychical research and subject it to contempt."

---

74 Appendix XXV: Turner's report on lettering of dates.
74a Appendix XXVI: Preliminary report. Thorogood-Fife-Adams.
Enlarged view of waxes No. 47 and No. 48 shown in group photograph, Figure 43, which were dated 8-23-'27 by Mr. Dudley. The two check marks were placed by Mr. Turner, handwriting expert, to indicate that the figures were made by the same person who dated the waxes shown in Figures 51 and 52.
Had Mr. Dudley's collaborators been governed by this spirit, they might not have made the mistake of accepting unfounded allegations for results of scientific investigation. And if they had been familiar with Mr. Dudley's writings on this subject, they would have been aware that some statements in the Bulletin were contrary to facts claimed by him to have been established during his connection with the Lime Street group.

When Mr. Dudley makes the assertion that there is no clear indication that the minutiae of the ridge patterns in the plaster casts and waxes were studied he is criticising only himself. No one should know better than he what procedure was used in the examination of these casts and waxes, since it was to him that these details of the investigation were committed and he it was who prepared the greater part of the subject matter for publication.

However, these minutiae do not assume any great importance until some need of careful analysis arises such as has arisen because of the claim as to identity.

Undoubtedly, in the early days of these phenomena, the prints were not carefully studied. In the beginning no one of the Lime Street group, including Mr. Dudley, had anything but the most elementary knowledge of finger-print science, and they scarcely knew where to begin in a study of the prints. This obvious lack of skill and knowledge is in itself a fact that must weigh heavily against any theory that the group was engaged in a confederacy of fraud to produce artificial prints. But by the time enough of the prints had been obtained to form a basis for comparison, Mr. Dudley had acquired a fairly ample knowledge and skill in the subject and certainly devoted many hours to a careful consideration of their details, a fact of which he has often spoken to the writer, claiming that he alone knew anything about this subject and that no ordinary finger-print expert was competent to express an opinion. In view of this, we fail to see why he should now be so willing to urge the opinion of these experts as conclusive.

That he had not met Dr. "X" before the spring of 1932 is of no consequence since, as we have already shown, he had in
his possession on the very day they were made the wax impressions which Dr. "X" had made in demonstrating the adaptability of Kerr for séance experiments.

Referring to Dr. "X's" surprise and perturbation when he learned that "approximate replicas of his right thumb print had been well-distributed over the world as the prints of a ghost's thumb," and that his reply to the question of what he had done with the prints he had made in wax had been: "You had better ask 'Margery','" Mr. Dudley parenthetically remarks: 15 "(An entry in the writer's record of the séance of July 30, 1926—in the light of the above conversation—leads him to believe that the wax prints may have been made about that time, but the reason for this assumption cannot be given without disclosing the maker's name. Had there been any previous intimation to the above effect these ink prints would have been sought years ago.)"

It seems to us that actual possession of these very wax impressions of Dr. "X" was sufficient intimation, and that there was little excuse for not immediately checking the newly obtained "Walter" prints against them. And it is difficult to believe that Mr. Dudley failed to compare them. Moreover, Mr. Dudley, in the manuscript Proceedings, has recorded the fact that Dr. "X" was the person who first suggested the use of Kerr and provided "Margery" with several pieces of it. And when on that same evening the first "Walter" right thumb impressions were obtained they were found to be not negatives but positives, which no living person could produce directly. Because of the fact that Mr. Dudley had these negative impressions of Dr. "X's" thumb, must we claim that by his technique he made these positives from them? Certainly not! For while the core of the very first supernormal impressions can not be accurately determined, those of later date can in general be made out and the greater number of them have a staple at the core, while a true Dr. "X" negative impression would produce a positive with a rod at the core.

15 Bulletin XVIII, Boston S.P.R., p. 3.
* Italics by the writer.
Mr. Dudley says, further, that the examination of Dr. "X's" ink prints in March, 1932, produced unexpected evidence of the fact that they are identical with the séance room right and left thumb prints of "Walter."

We have shown conclusively that, while there are many points of similarity in the right thumbs which tend to make them appear identical, especially if viewed in the photographs, the dissimilarity of the left thumbs is apparent to the most superficial observation.

That the right thumbs and the left thumbs which Mr. Dudley shows in his exhibits seem to check is of no particular moment, for they may all be normal or artificially produced prints of Dr. "X's" thumbs.

A statement is made that this comparative exhibit was shown to Mr. Fife on March 30, 1932, and that he agreed that the identification was complete. There is no argument in this. As we have already pointed out, any finger print expert would agree. We, ourselves, agree in the case of the left thumbs shown, and if we had only this exhibit for examination and knew nothing of the details, we should probably agree as to the right thumbs too.

In this exhibit Mr. Dudley shows for the right thumbs a poor and incomplete ink impression of Dr. "X's" thumb against a wax impression dated February 3, 1927, and has marked some twenty-seven points of similarity. We have indicated that this wax may be the product of any one of several processes, but not having the wax, and giving Mr. Dudley the benefit of the doubt, we would tend to class it, on the assumption that it was supernormally produced by "Walter," as one of the special phases of the "Walter" negative impression shown in Figure 67 at page 66, and marked D. This, we believe, is what "Walter" often refers to as a "mirror-print." We are not claiming that it is a true mirror-print, but simply that it is mirrored with regard to the slant of the lines.

We are showing an enlargement of the central part of a negative print (Fig. 109) similar to this wax of February 3, 1927, and it may be seen that in this the ridge forms a loop
in the center but that the upper part of it is very narrow, being actually somewhat lower in elevation, and showing a tendency toward separation. This is a very good illustration of possible incomplete reversal.

There are other points near the top of this core which differ from those in Mr. Dudley's illustration.

In no case, so far as we know, has he made a comparison of the deltas of the "Walter" and the Dr. "X" thumbs; in fact, the area of the delta of Dr. "X's" thumb is not shown in the print.

In the case of the left thumb exhibit, here again the ink-print of Dr. "X's" thumb is no more complete than is that of the right thumb, and it is compared with an undated negative impression in wax, although in the original exhibit, which we have already discussed, this wax carried the date of August 23, 1927.

Between these two left thumbs are shown some twenty-four points of agreement, and some of the creases and scars are identical.

There is, however, one crease or scar across Dr. "X's" thumb at the core, a little below the tip, which does not show in this ink print or in any of these wax impressions, so far as we can determine, but which does show in all the impressions we have made directly from Dr. "X's" thumb both in wax and in ink. This shows fairly well in Figure 110; and more clearly at C in the enlargement Figure 111; and for better comparison, we are showing in Figure 112 an enlargement of the photograph of the wax Mr. Dudley is using in representing this left thumb.

The absence of this mark in the prints presented by Mr. Dudley seems rather strange and is still further indication that the wax impression which is shown in the Dudley exhibit of left thumbs may indeed be one of the old impressions Dr. "X" made for "Margery," and that at that time it did not exist.

There is an additional exhibit of two left thumb impressions, one of which was furnished by Mr. Hutchinson, both of which likewise fail to show this characteristic mark across the upper
FIGURE 109.
Enlarged view of the core of a "Walter" partial-negative impression. Note the difference between this and Figures 54 and 99.
Figure 110.

Negative impressions in wax of the right and left thumbs of Dr. "X". Note the small cut or crease near the tip of the core of the left thumb.
Figure 111.
Enlarged view of the core of Dr. "X's" left thumb, showing the cut or crease (c) near the tip.
FIGURE 112.
Enlarged view of core of left thumb of Dr. "X" which Mr. Dudley is using and which does not seem to show cut or crease shown in Figure 111.
part of the core. And since Mr. Hutchinson says in the letter which we have mentioned that he did not ask for a wax and thinks this one was given to him by Mr. Dudley, it looks as if this, too, might be one of the original Dr. "X" impressions.

The other left print illustrated in the Bulletin shows part of a wax of December 3, 1927, and has Mr. Fife's initials scratched into it. As much of this left print as shows is similar to the others and there is no indication of this mark at the core.

The ridge counts in these do not seem to agree with Dr. "X's," although that may be due to poor reproduction in the photograph.

Whether or not this impression was made supernormally, of course we do not know, but, if so, it might easily have been changed, as have other waxes we have enumerated, by making replicas from one of the original Dr. "X" wax impressions which Mr. Dudley had in the first place. As he has had no recent waxes, these would naturally show the condition of the thumb as it was in 1926, rather than as it is now.

The joint line in this wax does not seem to be just like that shown in the other wax Mr. Dudley is using, dated August 23, 1927. No failure in reversal, such as we have shown as a possibility in the case of the right thumbs, would account for these differences in the left thumbs.

Thus, we may say of the left thumb shown in Mr. Dudley's exhibit that it does not agree with the standard "Walter" left thumb in any way; that there is no conclusive evidence that it was made supernormally; and that there is very good reason to conclude that these left-thumb impressions in wax are either original Dr. "X" impressions or replicas made from them.

We do not know upon what evidence Mr. Dudley bases his statement that there are one hundred and thirty-one prints of

---

*We have not had an opportunity to examine this wax, but we have a photograph which we think is of the complete wax (Fig. 113), and although, as we have said, it is not safe to analyze these impressions from a photograph only, the impression shown at the right in the illustration appears to be that of a negative of a right thumb, and the core appears to carry a ridge, so that if this impression were used as a die it would produce a positive with a staple at the core.
the "Walter" right thumb which are identical with that of Dr. "X." To us this means little, since we know that the greater number of the waxes which we hold—both old and new—are not like Dr. "X's" in all details. As to those that have been distributed in England, on the continent, and in Japan, we can say nothing, but we have already pointed out that in general photographs of these waxes are of little value.

Neither do we know why Mr. Dudley should have picked out the particular wax he did for his comparison, when there are others just as sharp and clear and distinct, but showing a different core.

As for the negative of August 18, 1927, we have shown conclusively that this and many others would produce a positive with a staple at the core of the thumb.

It may be true that a wax dated August 23, 1927 was marked by Dr. Twachtman, but Mr. Dudley wrote the record, and Dr. Twachtman does not seem to remember anything about it. The back of one of our waxes bearing a "Walter" left thumb impression shows some very poor and much deformed marks, one of which resembles an R. While the letter E which Mr. Dudley mentions and which shows in the illustration of his wax may be the one that Dr. Twachtman scratched on it, it has many of the characteristics of the E in KERR which was impressed by the manufacturer.

Mr. Dudley claims that he is accepting as a basis for his conclusions as to this identity ten or more clearly defined characteristics with no clearly defined differences.

We claim, and have shown, that there are differences, one of the most pronounced being at the core, where Dr. "X's" print shows a rod and the "Walter" print a staple.

So far as the photograph of the two waxes is concerned—one supposedly received from Mr. Hutchinson and one of December 3, 1927 said to carry an impression of the "Walter" left thumb, we conclude that while both may be photographs of Dr. "X's" thumb prints, they are certainly not photographs of "Walter" left thumbs in any respect. Whether the impressions they represent were artificially made we, of course, do
FIGURE 113.
Impressions of 12-3-1927.
(See footnote on p. 139.)
not know. In fact, the authenticity of so much of the evidence is questionable that, did we not have impressions which were obtained under our own supervision, we should not feel competent to express an opinion in the matter.

One thing which impresses us in this article in the Bulletin, and a fact which is most significant, is that Mr. Dudley, after the severing of his connection with the work at Lime Street, should have been moved to continue on his own responsibility further investigation of the identity of the "Walter" prints with the thought in mind that they might be those of one of the early sitters; and it seems more than a coincidence that he should so quickly have turned to Dr. "X," who was one of the earliest sitters, and who had discontinued his attendance at the séances even before the production of the paraffin gloves.

When we were considering individually the various positive and negative impressions of the "Walter" right thumb we mentioned now and then the appearance of some peculiarity, such as the excrescence which occurs on a few of the old and new positive waxes, which is always found in the same position, somewhat above the core, and which appears in at least one old negative print as a depression; or the variation of the position of the ridges, as of p and y in Figure 101 or the ridge disjunction which occurs occasionally, as in Figure 114 at B.

These variations are quite apparent to any one who studies these prints at all critically, and might by persons unfamiliar with psychic phenomena of this nature and who are convinced that the "Walter" finger-print is artificially made, be considered as evidence of imperfect manipulation of the impressing agent or die or of mechanical imperfections in it, since there seems to be no known physical condition of the skin which could account for the excrescence to which we have alluded. This may be true, but if so, the replica was of living organic matter, neither normal nor artificial, but supernormal.

The variation of the position of the ridges p and y shown in Figure 101 might be claimed to be due to a technical defect in the impression. Perhaps it is, but if so it is a supernormal defect, whatever its cause.
The ridge disjunction and difference in ridge count noticeable in some waxes may have been caused by a re-impression due to rolling which produced a repeat; but if such be the case it was the teleplastic terminal which did the rolling.

That these "Walter" waxes are variable among themselves has been frequently commented upon. The very fact that these variations do occur in these supernormally produced impressions, seems to us, however, added proof of their supernormal origin. With Geley,\textsuperscript{76} we think that "the defects in some materializations do not imply fraud, but quite otherwise."

Since these supernormal impressions are made by ectoplasmic material they naturally record any imperfections contained in that material at the time the impressions were made.

If one raises a question as to how finger-print theory is going to account for thumbs on two different hands bearing the same design, the retort will very likely be made that the thumb must have been added separately anyway since it is impossible to make a negative impression of a whole hand with its five digits all at one time. This is partially true in a normal case although there are a few people who seem to be able to turn the thumb over into almost the same plane with the fingers. Artificially, of course, it can be done. But that is beside the point. Our standard "Walter" hands are in relief, not intaglio, and were not made by normal means, but directly by a teleplasmic structure which appears to be flexible.

Of course, there is no reason to suppose that separate fingers or thumbs could not be added supernormally, and not only has "Walter" stated that they can be so added, but in fact, from appearances and from his statements this actually occurred in the case of the finger tips added to the hand shown in Figure 13; but on our standard hands there is no indication of discontinuity of skin markings; and if this right thumb was a substitution then the substitution was accomplished supernormally and in consequence the whole subject becomes more complex.

Another noticeable feature, and one which some observers may question, is the finer and more natural appearance of the

\textsuperscript{76}Geley, \textit{Clairvoyance and Materialisation}, p. 239.
"Walter" left thumb in comparison with the right. It is quite apparent. We might perhaps account for this difference in structural quality on the basis that Walter Stinson, as a locomotive fireman, handled a shovel a great deal of the time and his right thumb naturally had harder use and greater wear than his left, in consequence of which the ridges would tend to be worn down and spread out. It may be too much to ask anyone to accept this as an explanation of this difference but if the prints were normal it would undoubtedly be satisfactory.

Still another point and one which we have already stressed, is the fact that in the art of finger-print technique ten or more points of identity in two prints, if there are no marked differences, are considered to be sufficient evidence that the two were made by the same digit. In the case of normal or supernormal prints, if there were no differences worth considering, this might be true, but in this particular case we feel that the differences which are apparent in the "Walter" prints are too likely to be masked by the finger-print expert when he finds so many points of similarity because he will not—or cannot on account of inexperience evaluate the supernormal factor.

It seems as though the statistics relating to the probability of two different prints being of the same digit if they have eight or ten points of identity, and no marked differences make it impossible in finger-print practice to consider that these two impressions could have been made by different digits.

While the theory of probability may tell us much regarding the behavior of large groups which are subject to its laws it tells very little about any single member of such a group.

According to Galton there is less than one chance in sixty-four billion that two finger prints alike in all their minutiae were not made by the same digit.

M. Balthazard of France expresses the ratio as many times that of Galton; while Seymour states: "If any two prints are alike in ten particulars the chances are one million five hundred

---

sixty-two thousand to one that they were made by the same finger."

This is not the place to theorize on the doubtful value of some of these figures; but we believe that if the actual data pertaining to the minutiae of a large number of extraordinarily alike impressions were carefully examined, and the probability of alikeness accurately determined, these figures would be radically changed.

Moreover, when we figure the probability of the time of occurrence of some particular happening it does not necessarily imply that the event cannot take place the very next instant, for it may—or the next—or the next.

Let us take, for example, the radioactive element, uranium—the heaviest element we have. It is estimated that of any large collection of uranium atoms one-half will have ceased to be uranium at the end of five billion years, due to the expulsion of the alpha-particles. If, however, we consider any one particular atom of uranium we cannot speak so accurately. We merely know that according to the laws of probability the chances are even that one-half of the entire amount of uranium will have disintegrated by the end of that period of time; but any given atom may expel its alpha-particle the very next second and so cease to exist; or it may not expel it for twenty billion times the above-mentioned length of time.

In the few calculations that have been made on the probability of duplication of finger prints the conclusions are based on quite meagre data when we consider all the people in the world, and if we understand correctly the finger-print experts' point of view—all those that have been*—or ever will be on this earth.

Of the few thousands of cases that have been investigated, study has been largely on the percentage of types rather than on the probability of identity of detail, yet the literature on finger-print theory in general strongly emphasizes the impor-

*It has been estimated that in the United States alone, during the last three hundred years, seventy or more million people have been buried. According to the statistics available some thirty-eight millions of these must have had ulnar loops on their right thumb.
tance of minutiae as the place in which to look for difference when any question of identity arises. However, it is probably true that the average fingerprint expert puts more weight on points of similarity than on points of dissimilarity.

That the impressions of two different fingers may have many points of identity there is no question. Balthazard in a report to the Academy of Sciences in Paris stated that one of the Bertillons found a case in which there were more than thirty identical markings in the imprints of twin brothers. Of course this is probably the best condition under which to obtain such similarity.

There is little doubt that more actual and accurate work with regard to the similarity of fingerprints has been done in connection with the biological study of identical and fraternal twins than of non-related groups, and we have already shown through the courtesy of Professor H. H. Newman, a reproduction of a cut (Fig. 31a) showing the close approach to identity between patterns of homologous fingers of three pairs of twins. These are not the more frequent ulnar loops but they represent the way in which the centre or cores of patterns may show close resemblances even when the pattern is unusual or unique in character.

It is not surprising that anyone who is impressed by the similarity of the "Walter" right thumb impression to that of "Dr. X", should attempt to explain their differences of detail in terms of the artificial or fraudulent production of the former, especially if he is unfamiliar with the supernormal origin of the "Walter" impression or refuses to accept it as a possibility.

Dr. Harold Cummins does so. Although stating that the left thumb impressions of "Walter" and "Dr. X" were distinctly those of different digits, as also were those of all other fingers except the right thumbs, and despite noting minor differences of detail in the right thumb patterns, he nevertheless concluded because of their many points of similarity that the "Walter" prints must be poorly made mechanical replicas of "Dr. X's" right thumb, added separately to the hands since the thumb print could not be made simultaneously with the print of
the rest of the hand, and that the differences were due to faulty execution. We have shown that in these supernormally produced impressions of the "Walter" hands the thumbs were not made separately, but were made supernormally and at the same time.

Unfortunately, as we have noted elsewhere, several of the "Walter" waxes which were sent Dr. Cummins for comparison were later found to bear changed impressions and the discrepancies which these altered prints show undoubtedly strengthened his opinion.

This attitude on the part of anyone who has no first-hand knowledge of the supernormal production of these impressions is a perfectly natural one.

It is easy to understand how, in making an impression artificially, differences might occur in the plastic imprint—but in these supernormal prints this possibility would be ruled out, and the variations might be accounted for, as we have suggested, by lack of energy resulting in incomplete formation of the teleplasmic pattern or possibly its incomplete reversal when formed.

We, on the other hand, have shown that large numbers of "Walter" right thumb impressions have marked differences from those of any one else we have studied, not only at the core, but at the delta, and, therefore, irrespective of many other points of similarity these are basic differences of supernormal origin, which cannot be explained away by mechanistic theories.

**CONCLUSIONS**

In conducting our investigation of these phenomena, and particularly of the alleged identity of the "Walter" prints with those of Dr. "X," we have been concerned primarily with the waxes and casts as to which there is no question of authenticity as séance room productions. By this latter phrase we mean waxes claimed by the control "Walter" to be the productions of his own activity. We mean further to exclude by the phrase any waxes which there is reason to believe on the evidence may have been improperly classed as authentic through error, confusion, substitution or the like. Data which are suspect as to
origin or subsequent history or both, must be disregarded as valid evidence on the issue of identity, except as such data and the surrounding circumstances relating thereto have a bearing on the weight of the case in support of the claimed identity.

We have considered the arguments advanced by adverse critics of the case, but there seems little need for particular comment on them because they have been based upon Mr. Dudley's presentation of the subject and in general assume the validity of his evidence and the soundness of his conclusions. It is, furthermore, no part of the proper function of an inquiry into the facts to discuss, analyze or evaluate the arguments of controversialists who assume the truth and validity of the facts under inquiry.

We have approached the matter impersonally. Where our own investigation has involved personalities and facts not directly connected with séance-room activities but relevant to the investigation, the obligation to report fully and fairly on the facts as we found them made such a course inevitable.

In stating our conclusions we do not presume to offer any philosophical interpretation of the facts or advocate any hypothesis that would explain them or correlate them with the general body of scientific knowledge. In intention our report is exclusively factual. Where for convenience we have spoken of "Walter" as of a real person, we were adopting an almost necessary convention. That the phenomena are strange and unrecognized in any of the conventional categories of science should stimulate interest in them rather than excite derision for the attempt to examine them scientifically. The evidence for their reality is compelling and cannot be disposed of by the formula of denial, or be met by the assertion of hypothetical fraud. Skepticism is an indispensable attitude of mind for any researcher in this field; but reason and logic and intellectual integrity cannot be abandoned because the facts involved transcend ordinary experience. Scientific knowledge is not advanced by making gratuitously a blanket charge of fraud because no other conventional explanation is available. The most rigorous proof is and should be required to establish the reality of
mediumistic phenomena, but asserting the existence of fraudulent manipulations where there is no evidence to sustain the charge, is not only a violation of logical theory and rational method, but a species of dishonesty that betrays prejudice, incapacity and a moral unwillingness to face realities that may threaten the cherished beliefs of a lifetime. The reality of the finger-print phenomena as a genuine supernormal manifestation in the "Margery" mediumship is to our mind established by overwhelming and rigorous proof. Their interpretation and philosophic implications are beyond the scope of this Report.

The evidence which we have set forth, referred to and discussed in this Report establishes the following facts, and justifies the conclusions which we draw:

1. That the "Walter" voice is supernormal and is governed by Intelligence of no mean quality.
2. That this Intelligence usually attains its declared objective, and without serious error or variation from the announced program.
3. That having no lifetime record of the finger patterns of Walter Stinson, deceased, we accept *ex necessitate* as *prima facie* proof the statements of the "Walter" voice as to the identity of the "Walter" prints, since we have found over a period of years that the statements of the "Walter" voice are to be relied on.
4. That identifiable finger impressions, in a plastic, of known persons, both living and deceased, have been supernormally produced by the aid of this Intelligence.
5. That there seems to be no logical reason why this Intelligence, if it be the independent entity it claims to be, should not be able in like manner to reproduce the designs of its own lifetime fingers.
6. That even though this Intelligence reside in the medium, masquerading as her deceased brother, there still seems to be no logical reason why it should not be able to reproduce his lifetime finger prints.
7. That we have obtained under severe condition of control many "Walter" impressions.
8. That the standard "Walter" hands (Figs. 5 and 6) were supernormally produced.

9. That the friction ridge designs of these "Walter" hands are unlike those of the hands of any person present when they were made, or of any persons who have attended séances at Lime Street and whose prints are on file.

10. That finger impressions of persons specified by the investigators have been supernormally produced through the agency of this Intelligence and later found to agree with the normal ink prints of the persons specified.

11. That the wax and other plastic material used by us in our experiments was furnished by us and was identifiable, and that many impressions of fingers and hands were supernormally obtained on these original plastics through the agency of this Intelligence.

12. That there was no possibility of the use of molds, dies, or other artificial devices or normal physical mechanisms in their production, nor of their production by a confederate or by natural human fingers.

13. That the "standard hands" were supernormally produced through the agency of said Intelligence at the request of the writer as a step in an experimental procedure to establish the orientation of the thumbs.

14. That plaster casts from early paraffin gloves show many points of agreement in ridge design with the standard hands, and no significant differences.

15. That in particular the plaster cast of the earliest recorded paraffin glove—that of May 17, 1924—shows many indications of having been an attempt to produce a "Walter" right hand, and probably included some characteristics of the medium's own hand.

16. That an index finger of the right hand, obtained in a séance held more than seven years ago, agrees with the homologous finger of the standard right hand; and that there are numerous points of agreement between a little finger produced at that time and our recently obtained homologous finger.
17. That old wax impressions, as well as more recent ones, which were classed as "Walter" prints, whether negative or positive, have in general been shown to agree with our recently obtained hands. Some of the impressions were obtained at solus sittings; others away from Lime Street and without the presence of Dr. Crandon; and still others in another location under another mediumship without the presence of "Margery."

18. That among these waxes are some containing both positive and negative characteristics; others that appear to be partially mirrored; and still others which seem to have "Walter" characteristics in general but show apparent differences at the core or in other parts.

19. That these different forms and variations of impressions are all phases of the "Walter" impression, some having been produced in immediate response to requests for such variations preferred as part of an experimental procedure.

20. That we have correlated statements made by "Walter" with regard to the difficulty of making various types of impressions, both positive and negative; his attempts at the production of partial mirror prints; and the reason why a right-hand impression may appear to be made by a left hand, and have based a working hypothesis upon them.

21. That the actual mechanism by means of which impressions are made on waxes during a séance is some kind of a teleplasmic pseudopod or exteriorization from the medium, physically manifested during trance and under the control of the Intelligence governing the voice; that such mechanism assumes various shapes and may appear as a rod, terminal or simulacrum, more or less complete, of a human hand; and that it is apparently re-absorbed by or into the body of the medium. That such teleplasmic structures are not embraced within any category of biological or anatomical knowledge, and are definitely supernormal.

22. That the hypothesis which we have presented, on a purely metaphysical basis, at least serves the purpose of giving a picture of a mechanism which might produce the varia-
tions and different phases of the phenomenon, and may be used as a tenative working hypothesis.

23. That a complete teleplasmic hand or finger is not necessary for the reproduction of the design of any of the "Walter" hands or fingers, but that these designs may be impressed by a teleplasmic rod or terminal.

24. That at least some of the early waxes now bear impressions unlike those shown in the original photographs of these same waxes, and that these changes were not supernormally produced.

25. That the palms of the hands of "Margery," "Walter," and Dr. "X" are all different.

26. That the ridge patterns of these six hands are distinctly different one from another.

27. That the core of the "Walter" right thumb is a staple, whereas that of Dr. "X" is a rod.

28. That there are impressions in which the core pattern is clear and distinct, and others in which there seems to be a plateau in the positive or a sink in the negative at the tip.

29. That the delta of the "Walter" right thumb is different from the delta of the Dr. "X" right thumb.

30. That there is a definite difference between the ridge interval of the "Walter" right thumb and the ridge interval of the Dr. "X" right thumb.

31. That whatever scars and creases may at times appear on the "Walter" right-thumb impression cannot be used as points of identity or difference as they seem to be variable and are not always present, while those on the right thumb of Dr. "X" are constant.

32. That the joint line of the "Walter" right thumb is distinctly different in form and size from that of Dr. "X."

33. That what appear to be skin markings of the wrist in the "Walter" impressions are quite different from the skin markings of Dr. "X's" wrist, and those of the supernormal impressions of Sir Oliver Lodge, as well as "Margery's" normal wrist impressions.
34. That the size of the imprints on "Walter" waxes that would correspond to the hair on the "Walter" arm is quite different from the size of the imprints made by hair on Dr. "X's" arm.

35. That in the relief impressions of the "Walter" right thumb the ridges appear somewhat worn, flattened and spread out in comparison with those of the "Walter" left thumb; while the ridges on both of Dr. "X's" thumbs are quite well defined and leave clear cut impressions in the wax.

36. That the "Walter" wax impressions viewed under a microscope present a different surface appearance from normal impressions in wax similarly observed.

37. That Dr. "X" demonstrated to "Margery" the possibility of using Kerr in these experiments by making impressions of his own thumbs and that these were given to Mr. Dudley.

38. That the right thumb which Mr. Dudley has used in his exhibit as a "Walter" thumb, if it was supernormally produced through the agency of the "Walter" Intelligence, may possibly be classed as a "Walter" partial negative.

39. That if it is not of supernormal production it is probably either one of Dr. "X's" original impressions or a replica from one of them.

40. That the wax which Mr. Dudley is exhibiting as that of the "Walter" left thumb is entirely different from the thumb of the standard left hand and the earlier waxes, but that it is very much like, if not identical with, that of Dr. "X."

41. That our recent wax and ink impressions of Dr. "X's" left thumb in all cases show a crease or light cut through the core and a little below its tip, whereas those of Mr. Dudley's exhibit with perhaps one exception do not show this.

42. That two of the three "Walter" negative left-thumb impressions obtained on August 23, 1927, agree with that of our standard "Walter" left hand, and are free from all question as to origin and subsequent history.

43. That the impression which Mr. Dudley is showing as having been made on August 23, 1927, could not be one of the three impressions produced at that time if all three were alike,
as the contemporaneous records assert, since it does not agree with the two mentioned in the preceding paragraph.

44. That although all the contemporaneous and relevant records distinctly state that only three impressions were produced on August 23, 1927, there are in fact five impressions attributed to that date. Obviously if the records are correct some of the impressions are spurious and must be eliminated as incompetent data on the issue of identity.

From our presentation of this subject it seems evident that our standard hands must fall into one or another of the following categories:

First. That the impressions they bear are composite (i.e., made up of parts of the hands of different individuals).
Second. That they are impressions or models of the hands of some one unknown person.
Third. That they are impressions of the hands of one Walter Stinson, deceased, and as such are unique.

Let us consider these three possibilities in the order in which they are presented:

First. The demonstrated supernormal powers of the "Walter" intelligence (1) to produce finger impressions coinciding with the recorded normal impressions of persons both living and dead, and (2) to produce impressions compounded of both positive and negative characteristics, make it quite impossible to say that such powers are unequal to the production of a positive model of hands displaying skin patterns that correspond in their different parts with patterns found on the homologous parts of the hands of different persons—a composite hand, in other words. To postulate limits to the field of the possible exercise of a power or faculty so strange and so little understood would be perhaps presumptuous and certainly unwarranted by the evidence. The persistence, however, of many detailed characteristics and minutiae for so many years in scores of impressions purporting to be of the same digits, would rather indicate a fixed, definite original hand and not a
mere assembly of patterns from different hands. The evidence, including the statements of the "Walter" voice as a legitimate part of the data, seems to us to justify the conclusion that the impressions of the "Walter" hands are not composites but correspond to unique originals. The occurrence in the standard "Walter" hand (Fig. 6) of an impression of a scar corresponding to a scar actually existing on the hand of the medium is a fact for which no explanation can, in the present state of our knowledge, be offered; but we do not consider that it requires the hand to be classed as a composite.

Second. If the patterns on these hands are those of some living person or of a deceased person other than Walter Stinson we do not know who that person is, for these impressions are not identical with the recorded ink prints of anyone who has attended the séances, or of any other person, in so far as we have been able to determine. The right thumb impressions are not identical with those of Dr. "X" although they are very much like them. Moreover, the impressions of the other fingers of this hand are wholly different from Dr. "X's." As to the left hand there is no doubt that in detail and as a whole it is different from Dr. "X's." If, however, we assume that the right "Walter" thumb is identical with Dr. "X's right thumb, we should then have an anatomical paradox—the hands of two different individuals, showing distinctly different characteristics as to the remaining fingers and palms, but with identical thumbs. This according to finger-print theory is impossible.

Third. Since, during our entire investigation of the "Walter" phenomena, the statements of the "Walter" voice have been found to be accurate, there seems to be no reason why we should not accept its statements with regard to these particular phenomena. It seems reasonable to accept these prints as unique, especially in view of the fact that they have consistently shown the same characteristics from the beginning. We feel justified, therefore, in accepting them tentatively as the prints of the hands of Walter Stinson.
as they were in life. Whether "Walter" the controlling intelligence be a distinct entity or a subjective manifestation of the medium "Margery" is a question beyond the scope of this report and seems to us to be of less importance at the present time than the demonstrated fact that these phenomena are supernormal and the prints apparently unique.

Our conclusions, therefore, are as follows:

1. There is no evidence of fraud, trickery or the use of any normal mechanism in connection with the séance production of the "Walter" finger-print phenomena.
2. These "Walter" phenomena are definitely proved by the evidence to be supernormal.
3. Neither of the "Walter" hands as a whole nor as to any of the component parts, is identical with that of any known person or persons.

We herewith make appreciative acknowledgment of the assistance rendered by many experts in different lines of research, among them being Mr. Bert Wentworth, and Mr. John W. Fife, finger print experts; Dr. Harold Cummins, Professor of Anatomy at Tulane University; Dr. Walsted, Professor of Metallography and Dr. Bunker, Professor of Bio-Chemistry, both of the Massachusetts Institute of Technology; Dr. Harold Cummins, Professor of Anatomy at Tulane University; Dr. Walsted, Professor of Metallography and Dr. Bunker, Professor of Bio-Chemistry, both of the Massachusetts Institute of Technology; Mr. Charles Wells, expert microscopist; Mr. Wm. H. Kuntz and Mr. Lee Bowman, experts in photography; Mr. Hayes of the Bausch and Lomb Optical Company; and the Folsom Engraving Company.

The writer is especially indebted to Dr. and Mrs. L. R. G. Crandon, for their willingness to allow a study of the phenomena under rigidly imposed restrictions; to Mr. Wm. H. Button, President of the American Society for Psychical Research, and to Mr. Daniel D. Walton, Chairman of its Research Committee, for their patient consideration, in the face of no little criticism, in allowing time for an unhurried examination of the data; and to Professor Ralph G. Adams, of the Department of Mechanical Engineering of the Massachusetts Institute of Technology for his valued assistance in the séance room.
APPENDIX

I.


Mr. W. H. Button,
27 Cedar Street,
New York City.

Dear Mr. Button:

I enclose Chapter LVI together with the photographs belonging thereto. I sent Bird some of these pictures a long time ago, and when I was in New York I tried to find them. Without any success! The prints had to be remade; hence the delay.

I have held out Chapter LXXVI, Outline of Finger-Print Evidence, because I have additional evidence which will necessitate some changes in the preceding chapters; not extensive but involving a paragraph here and there in several of those chapters which have suffered one revision. This applies only to the finger prints.

I believe that the first page of Chapter LV "Problems of Control," can be improved, as well as a few sentences in some of the subsequent pages. I am anxious to make it as strong as possible.

Sincerely yours,

E. E. Dudley.

II.

Boston, March 18, 1932.

Mr. W. H. Button,
27 Cedar Street,
New York City.

Dear Mr. Button:

I enclose additional data on the reproduction of normal three-dimensional finger prints by means of dies.

In my letter of March 11th, I stated that I had obtained additional evidence in connection with the finger-print matter.
which would necessitate certain textual changes. This consists of the identification of the right and left thumb prints known as "the Walter Prints," with the thumb prints of a living person, one of the early sitters in Lime Street séances. After these had been enlarged and analyzed I took them to competent experts who agreed that the identification was unusually complete.

Naturally this evidence will alter certain parts of some chapters, and will call for a careful checking of all the material for possible inconsistencies. I trust that you will return the galley proof as soon as possible so that I can clean this up with the least possible delay.

Fortunately most of the material deals only with facts and has been conservatively stated. Nevertheless, I wish I had known of this before I put in so much time on some of the chapters. It could have been finished by now.

Two things are proved: three-dimensional prints of normal form can be successfully duplicated; and the "Walter" prints are not those of Walter Stinson, deceased. Therefore, the prints of a living person have been made since the beginning of the experiments.

I learned from Margery, this afternoon, that you have been successful in obtaining a "Walter" print in a closed box. Congratulations.

Sincerely yours,
E. E. Dudley.

III.

THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP ¹

AN INTERESTING DEVELOPMENT IN THE FINGER-PRINT SERIES
STATEMENT ON BEHALF OF THE RESEARCH COMMITTEE

In the summer of 1931 the Society engaged Mr. E. E. Dudley to assist in the preparation of material for the forthcoming volume of the Proceedings on the Margery mediumship. The subjects involved were largely confined to telekinesis and the

series of finger-print experiments. By the middle of March, 1932, the work had been practically completed when Mr. Dudley wrote Mr. Button that he had just discovered that a certain right and a certain left thumb print attributed to "Walter" were identical with the right and left thumb prints of a living man, Mr. X, who had been a frequent sitter at Lime Street prior to sometime in 1925, long before the beginning of the finger-print series. Mr. Dudley exhibited at Lime Street photographs of the prints involved with indices showing the similarities alleged by him to exist. These photographs were later delivered to members of the Research Committee and showed superficially striking resemblances. Mr. Dudley claimed that the similarities were so clear that there was no need of any further inquiry; that he had settled the matter and that any layman would concede the identity. This attitude, however, in view of the circumstances surrounding this sudden and belated discovery of the alleged similarities, did not commend itself to the Research Committee. Mr. Dudley was advised that when a proper investigation of all the facts and circumstances had been made by the Society, the results would be published either in the Proceedings or the Journal, and he was asked to prepare in publishable form a statement of the facts as he thought them to be and of his claims in respect thereto. On April 4th he promised to do this, saying it would take but a day or two to prepare his paper. His statement, however, was not received from him by the Society until June 13th, over two months later.

In the meantime the Society immediately began an active investigation of the matter. During the past six years there have been obtained in the Margery séances, under conditions of strict control and laboratory technique, about two hundred three-dimensional impressions, cameos or models in plastic wax of thumbs, fingers and entire hands. Most of these waxes are claimed by "Walter" to be impressions or models of his own thumbs, fingers and hands. These "Walter" impressions are of different kinds: according to articles heretofore published by Mr. Dudley (see this Journal Vol. XXII, pp. 99, 191, 453) they comprise at least positives, negatives, mirror positives and mirror negatives, and a number of variations.
It will possibly not be easily realized that variations of this sort in impressions of an apparently identical pattern or thumb are entirely unfamiliar to the ordinary finger-print expert, are not covered by the technical literature expounding finger-print science and are not within the ordinary experience of the finger-print criminologist. These phenomena present to finger-print science an entirely new and unique problem and are thought by some to challenge the very foundations upon which such science is claimed to be an infallible system of personal identification.

Our Research Department first looked into the question of the technical classification theretofore made by Dudley, of the particular right thumb print of "Walter" used by him as part of the basis of the claim, and it became quite apparent from the evidence that instead of being a negative print, as Dudley maintains, the print is a positive print. If this be true the supposed identity of the print with the right thumb of the living man, Mr. X, falls entirely. In regard to the left thumbs there is a great similarity between the photograph of the "Walter" print used by Mr. Dudley and the print of Mr. X, but the left print of "Walter" used by Mr. Dudley seems to be unique in the series of left thumb prints produced by "Walter," the other contemporaneous left thumb prints of "Walter" bearing no resemblance to Mr. X's left thumb print. The authenticity of the wax print of the left thumb shown in the photograph used by Mr. Dudley is, therefore, open to question.

The above situation will indicate to our readers that it has become necessary for the Society to review all of Mr. Dudley's work in the classification of the many thumb prints obtained in this mediumship, as there are evident errors in it, errors which may be natural enough in a very complicated and difficult subject. With only a print of a single thumb or a single finger to go by, without reference to the rest of the hand, it is sometimes very difficult, if not impossible, to determine whether the print is from the right hand or from the left hand, and on account of optical illusions it is sometimes difficult to tell from a photograph whether a print is a positive or a negative.

Realizing these difficulties of classification our Research De-
partment undertook and is still conducting an exhaustive series of new experiments which throw much light on this interesting situation. The problem was presented to "Walter" and he immediately ridiculed the idea that his prints were identical with Mr. X's.

Our Research Department procured the full prints, both in ink and in wax, of the hands of Mr. X. They then requested "Walter" to produce prints in wax of his full hands, both right and left. In a series of sittings as remarkable as any that have ever occurred in psychical research, "Walter" produced in wax furnished by the investigators, a large number of partial and complete hands, both right and left. Most of these waxes were produced in the presence only of the two mediums, Margery and Mrs. Litzelmann and some of the following: our Research Engineer, Mr. Thorogood, Professor Adams and Captain Fife. Although both hands so produced carried thumb prints of the same sort as those that have always been attributed to "Walter," the hands in every regard including the thumbs are entirely different from the hands and thumbs of Mr. X. The Society has thus initiated a thorough and exhaustive investigation of the matter which will be pressed with all possible speed to a conclusion and the entire subject presented to our readers when the work is completed.

It is an unfortunate fact, however, that the claim of Mr. Dudley, and the alleged facts upon which it is based, have been widely disseminated through his activities, and have come to the attention of people not connected with the Society who have the story for publication. We deprecate such publication before an investigation of the facts is complete, but the matter having got beyond our control, due to the above facts, we have thought it wise to make this statement, and despite any discussion that may be indulged in by others in the meantime, we shall make no further statement in regard thereto until the investigation is completed and all the facts covered in an adequate scientific report.

In regard to Mr. Dudley's statement received by us on June 13th, we have refused to publish it for the reason, among others,
that the identity of the prints discussed by him is open to
question and his statements seem to us unwarranted.

The problem of the source or origin of these séance-room
prints is of course quite different from the question as to
whether the prints themselves are identical with those of any
known person, living or dead. Data on the latter question may
have a bearing as evidence relevant to the solution of the first
problem, but it is not claimed by Mr. Dudley that his supposed
discovery is indicative of fraud in the making of the prints.
It remains to be seen whether any such inference will be drawn
by others.

We are gratified to state that our Research Department re-
ports to us unqualifiedly that the recent experiments have been
such that there can be no question whatsoever in regard to the
supernormality of the phenomena involved, all of which will
be disclosed in due course.

IV.
THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

BULLETIN XVIII OF THE BOSTON S.P.R.

Readers of The Journal will recall a statement published
in the July, 1932, number (vol. XXVI, pp. 266–268) regarding
an alleged discovery by Mr. E. E. Dudley that some of the
thumb prints in wax, alleged to have been produced as his own
by "Walter" through the Margery mediumship, were in fact
identical with those of a living man. In that statement it was
announced that upon the disclosure by Mr. Dudley of his alleged
discovery (which was in March, 1932) the Society immediately
began an active investigation of the matter and that the results
of such investigation would be fully reported when the work
was complete. The investigation of the whole matter has been
pressed with as much expedition as possible and in due time
the subject will be fully presented to our readers.

As stated in the July number, the Society had declined to

publish an article by Mr. Dudley offered on June 13th, setting forth his claims. Although the traditional and announced position of the Society has always been that responsibility for material accepted for publication rests entirely with the writers of the articles published, the Society does not thereby escape from the duty of using responsible discretion and judgment in respect to what it shall or shall not publish and the time for publication. Its decision in such matters may, of course, be sound or unsound in any given particular instance, but it is certain that in every case its action will be criticised and condemned by some persons or some group of persons who happen, disinterestedly or otherwise, to disagree with the decision. Mr. Dudley's alleged discovery may be of great importance in the history and interpretation of the Margery mediumship, or it may be mistaken or insignificant and of no permanent value. Mr. Dudley himself naturally attaches extreme importance to the matter and his eagerness to publish his views and the evidence he feels supports them, has found accommodation in Bulletin XVIII of the Boston S.P.R. recently issued. Mr. Arthur Goadby and Mr. Hereward Carrington also contribute to the Bulletin articles discussing the matter.

It is not our intention at this time to discuss the merits of the question raised by Mr. Dudley or to review the contents of this brochure, but rather to reiterate the purpose announced in July to publish the results of our investigation with all relevant and material evidence, when the work has been completed. Our readers may meanwhile expect a barrage of hostile criticism of the Margery mediumship to break out shortly in various public prints, as though set off by the appearance of this Bulletin. This was forecast in our July statement. Rumors of a veritable deluge of hostile criticism are afloat and evidence is at hand that the channels of private correspondence have been used to spread libelous versions of the alleged facts. Psychological research has many friends, but more enemies, and no mediumship that ever attracted public attention has escaped determined attack. The launching of a new attack upon the Margery mediumship, therefore, is not surprising; but all con-
cerned can well await the outcome with confidence that the truth will ultimately be made plain.

Mr. Goadby's contribution to the Bulletin discloses apparently complete satisfaction on his part with Mr. Dudley's evidence and agreement with his conclusions as to what this evidence proves. We do not question Mr. Goadby's right to be so satisfied and convinced, and to announce his views through any available channel. Whether the contribution is in fact calm and impersonal, as the editor of the Bulletin suggests, is not over-important; but Mr. Goadby's enthusiasm leads him to some extravagance and inaccuracy of statement that may suggest a doubt as to his soundness in argument and deduction. Mr. Goadby says, for instance, in speaking of Mr. Dudley's claim, that the Research Committee has taken

"over three months to decide a matter which could easily have been disposed of in a few hours."

The Research Committee has not decided anything except the wisdom and necessity of a careful and thoroughgoing investigation of all the facts before publishing anything on the merits of the claim, and so announced in the July issue of The Journal. Furthermore, neither the Society nor the Committee will "decide" the issue raised or any part of it; but no possible effort will be spared to assemble, analyze and present to the Society and the readers of its publications all the material evidence bearing on the question raised. That the question can be easily disposed of to Mr. Goadby's satisfaction in a few hours may do credit to his intellectual power and scientific accomplishments; but those carrying official responsibility in the matter may be pardoned for differing from an amateur student of the subject as to the difficulties presented and the proper method of ascertaining the truth. Critics, and especially amateur researchers in psychical matters, who appeal early and late to "devotion to scientific truth" to support or justify their views, may occasionally overlook facts that lie nearer to reality than their own emotional allegiance to a vague ideal
or abstraction. True science never jumps to hasty conclusions or attempts to dispose of any question on incomplete data.

The Editorial Preface to the Bulletin, written, we assume, by Dr. W. F. Prince, though bearing no name, compels a comment of general character that ought to be made in the interest of fairness and good faith.

The Preface says that the material is published by the Boston Society,

"both because of the extreme importance of the evidence displayed and because this evidence would otherwise apparently be, to all intents and purposes, suppressed."

Mr. Goadby's article discloses the fact that a statement regarding the matter was published in the July number of The Journal, but Mr. Goadby carefully refrains from informing his readers that the Society had announced in that statement that the entire matter was being thoroughly investigated and that a full report would be published when the work was concluded. Nowhere in this Bulletin, however, is there any hint that such was the announced policy and purpose of the Society. One reading the Bulletin and its Preface is left with the inevitable impression that this Society has embarked upon a suppression of evidence relevant to the Margery Mediumship. The charge is false. Dr. Prince is too careful and experienced as a controversialist to be unaware that such an impression would be created and it is a fair inference that the creation of such an impression was within the definite purpose of the editorial mind.

As a clergyman turned scientist, or pseudo-scientist, Dr. Prince, when seeking to expound to others the canons of science and protect psychical research from unscientific Philistines might be expected to recall some canons of the moral law that are immutable even in the scientific field. "Thou shalt not bear false witness against thy neighbor" is valid for scientists and psychical researchers as well as ordinary people.
V.
THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

A SOLUS SITTING AUGUST 10, 1928

BY R. J. TILLYARD, M.A., Sc.D., F.R.S.

PRELIMINARY RECORD OF EVENTS

In 1926, Dr. Tillyard,* passing across America on his way to London, had certain psychic experiences in the presence of the medium Margery. On reaching London he made in the columns of “Nature,” a leading scientific periodical in England, a plea for a wider and more generous outlook on the part of science towards psychical research.


Sir Richard said: “One of the reasons why scientific investigators hesitated to undertake research into these problems was the uncertainty that, however faithfully they might follow up clues, they were unlikely to be able to reach precise conclusions.” He then went on, in his amiable way, to dissect Dr. Tillyard’s report of sittings and concluded: “We believe that Dr. Tillyard will have to bring much more convincing evidence of the actual existence of Walter’s spiritual personality than that presented by him in his article before it can pass the critical bar of science.”

In May and June, 1928, Dr. Tillyard found himself again in Boston en route from New Zealand to London. There and then he had the sittings with Margery which were published in “Nature” August 18, 1928. In England he was made Honorary Fellow of Queen’s College, Cambridge. He had several conferences with Sir Oliver Lodge on physicopsychic phenomena in general and the Margery experiments in particular.

---

1 Journal A.S.P.R., Vol. XXV, No. 4, April, pp. 136–145.

* See page 170ff for biographical note on Dr. Tillyard.
Just prior to Dr. Tillyard's return to New Zealand by way of Boston, Sir Oliver Lodge wrote the following letter to Dr. Crandon, dated July 13, 1928:

SIR OLIVER LODGE'S LETTER

Dear Dr. Crandon:

I hear from Tillyard that he is returning to Australia via America. He is, I believe, writing about his experiences with "Margery" in "Nature." If his article is admitted, it will be an important step towards challenging the attention of the scientific world.

He has an idea that it would diminish the opportunities for accusation of collusion if he were allowed a solitary sitting with "Margery" in a room arranged by himself, of course with your approval; and thinks that if he got results under those conditions, the sceptics would be reduced to accuse him of collusion—which, considering his position as a scientific man, would be too absurd. I know that he is much impressed with "Margery," appreciating her highly from every point of view, and you might have confidence that he would treat her fairly.

More than that I cannot say, since you know what is reasonable and permissible far better than I do. It is not a privilege that I would recommend you to grant to many people; though if it were feasible I should value it myself.

I trust that she keeps in good health, and that you neither of you have been bothered with any recent controversies.

Yours sincerely,

(Signed) OLIVER LODGE.

Dr. Tillyard arrived in Boston about August 1st, and was present at several sittings, and on August 10, 1928, he had his long-desired sitting alone with the medium in a place strange to them both.

Mr. E. E. Dudley, who assisted in the preparations for the séance and was outside the door during its course, made the following notes:
Psyche searched before and after sitting by Miss Landstrom (Miss Y). Dr. R. J. Tillyard and Mr. E. E. Dudley searched by Dr. Skirball (Dr. X). No one else in the room at any time.

Preparations for finger prints and Voice-Cut-Out machine brought from Lime Street. Psyche wore only bathrobe, stockings and shoes. Was under control of Miss Y from time that she was searched until tied in chair and from close of sitting until again searched. Psyche’s wrists taped to arms of windsor chair with one inch surgeon’s tape. Ankles taped to chair, legs in same way. Approximately 24 inches of tape in each piece. Ties cross-marked to wrists and to stockings by Dr. Tillyard. E. E. D. left the room as soon as taping was finished and did not re-enter until Psyche had left at close of sitting. R. J. T. alone with Psyche throughout sitting. Margery so secured to chair as to be unable to move feet or wrists and hands could not touch table.

Séance opened at 9:12 p.m. Dr. Crandon, Miss Y, E. E. Dudley, in hall with door closed and locked by R. J. T., did not enter room at any time. Walter came in at 9:15 p.m. Called out to Dr. Skirball (oculist) “Hello, Eyeball, who’s the blonde?” (Nurse is blonde.)

Walter whistled a great deal, talked more or less with R. J. T. who put hot water in dish and a piece of marked wax as requested by Walter. The approximate times of completing the three finger prints were 9:22, 9:25, and 9:29 p.m.

At 9:30 R. J. T. said that he was putting on the Voice-Cut-Out.* Just before this, I think it was, Walter said that he

*Dr. M. W. Richardson’s Voice-Cut-Out (V-C-O) apparatus was devised by him to prevent entirely any normal use of the medium’s voice-producing anatomy and physiology. It was described at length in Jour. A.S.P.R., December, 1925, pp. 673-689.

It consists of a U-tube 36 inches high, diameter ¾ inch, space between arms
might not have enough energy and R. J. T. said, "If you haven’t enough why not take some from me?" Walter, "Because you haven’t any."

With the V-C-O unbalanced by Margery, Walter said, "Hello, Skirball, skittish Skirball."

9:37 R. J. T. announces that V-C-O test is finished, that he has removed tapes and that marks were intact. Said, "Walter says that he is going to work on my back." Sitting finished at 9:42 P.M. Psyche searched by nurse. Nothing suspicious was found at any of the examinations.

At close of sitting Psyche’s back, over the 12th dorsal and first lumbar vertebrae, showed red and swollen and she said it was painful. This condition was not there before the séance and her back had been protected by a small and very soft pillow. All discomfort from this cause had practically disappeared one hour later.

Note: On return to 10 Lime Street the phonograph was supernormally started as we entered lower hall. Three normal negative prints of the Walter thumb were obtained at this sitting. One shows a well-marked joint line.

(Signed) E. E. Dudley.

3 inches. This tube, supported on an iron stand, is filled half full of water. On the water surface in each arm, (always at the same level, of course,) is floated a cork of convenient size. In the top of this is inserted a wooden match, two inches high, painted with luminous paint. These luminous matches serve to indicate, in the darkness of the séance room, the relative water-levels in each branch of the U-tube.

One free end of the U-tube is connected by a flexible metal gas tube to a glass tip in the medium’s mouth. This glass tip is kept, by a flange, from slipping into the mouth. It has a hole, top and bottom, which must be covered by the lips tightly. The medium then blows until one luminous indicator is at least a foot higher than the other, and she then covers the hole in end of tip with her tongue. Thus, to maintain the luminous indicators at unequal levels, she must hold the glass-tip with her teeth and cover closely the three holes with her lips and tongue. In short, all her speaking organism is mechanically controlled. This experiment with only one observer, and he holding the medium’s hands, has been repeated unnumbered times. Under these conditions of non-equilibrium of the floats, Walter’s voice continues to talk and pronounce the most difficult labials and sibilants, showing, apparently, the independence of the Walter voice from that of the medium, in any normal way.
Readers will recall the fact that it was Sir William Crookes who, as a chemist and physicist of distinction, first made a breach in the walls of the stronghold of official science. The controversy stirred by his proclamation of faith in the mediumistic phenomena he had witnessed was deepened and rendered more acute by the fact that he was a member of the Royal Society of England. The Fellowship of this historic Society is a privilege accorded to few, and only to those who have well earned the right to be listened to when speaking *ex cathedra*.

Once again and with no uncertain voice, a Fellow of the Royal Society gives his considered verdict in favor of the reality of certain of the physical phenomena of mediumship. And the time being now ripe for a more general understanding and acceptance of these phenomena as a part, and an integral part, of the scheme of nature and the evolutionary processes of life, we do not doubt that what Dr. Tillyard has to say will be pondered by all serious thinkers.

It is as an entomologist that Dr. Robin J. Tillyard has chiefly earned distinction. Zoology has been his study. For eight years (1920–1928) he was head of the Biological Department of the Cawthorn Institute, later becoming its Assistant-Director. He has since been appointed Chief Entomologist to the Commonwealth of Australia. The study of insect life with its strange permutations and metamorphoses would not improbably predispose their student to a view of the phenomenon of physical death as but another metamorphosis of greater significance to man, implying the release of the matured ethereal psyche from the outworn chrysalis of the physical body. At least it may be said that an entomologist can of all men most logically and with least strain upon his philosophical principles accept and
give endorsement to the concept of the 'subtle body' and its continued vitality and power as suggested in the phenomenon of the thumbprints of the discarnate human entity.

DR. R. J. TILLYARD'S NOTES

OF HIS SÉANCE WITH "MARGERY"

Held by him Solus in the Consulting Room of Dr. J. J. Skirball of Boston, Mass. (This being his seventh sitting with this Medium)

Object of the Séance: Previous séances held in May and June had proved conclusively the genuineness of the phenomena under conditions in which both Dr. Crandon and the Séance Room at 10 Lime Street had been eliminated. In the séance of June 1st, 1928, seven Walter thumb prints had been obtained under strict test conditions in a small room in Dr. Richardson's house, with only Dr. Tillyard and Captain Fife, the finger-print expert, present.

It was, therefore, obvious that any attack on the accuracy of these results must be directed against the bona fides of either Dr. Richardson or Captain Fife, or both. Sir Oliver Lodge, foreseeing this, had strongly urged Dr. Tillyard to press Dr. Crandon for a sitting alone with Margery in a strange room, to see whether the phenomena could be repeated under such conditions. Dr. Tillyard foresaw obvious objections to this procedure, but was willing that Sir Oliver should write to Dr. Crandon and state the case, and also agreed to write to Dr. Crandon himself, putting himself unreservedly in his hands, and promising to agree to any conditions he might make. He suggested asking Professor Brues for the use of a room in the Bussey Institution, and to have Mrs. Brues search the medium and report the results; but this was turned down, as it was feared that opposition of Harvard University to the experiments might prejudice Professor Brues. The idea of getting a private suite of rooms in a hotel was rejected, partly because of the necessity of protecting the name of the medium, and
partly because of the difficulty of getting a bare room with plain wooden furniture that could not be damaged, and a supply of hot water. Finally it was decided to approach Dr. X* an eye specialist, not associated with the Crandon group, who has a fine suite of suitable rooms in a leading street in Boston. Dr. X gave his consent. The room was shut up for some hours before the séance began, with double blinds drawn, and nobody allowed to enter it.

Dr. Crandon imposed no conditions whatever, and undertook not to enter the room nor to let anyone else enter it except Mr. E. E. Dudley, who was selected to help Dr. Tillyard affix the surgeon's tape to the medium and to carry in some of the apparatus.

**Preparation:** At 8:45 P.M. Mr. Dudley arrived at 10 Lime Street, and took charge of the large Richardson Voice-Cut-Out machine which was to be taken to Dr. X's. Dr. Tillyard took charge of Margery's séance garments, which he had previously searched, also two small, soft, white pillows, a medium-sized, rather flattish dish for the hot water, a small round dish for cold water, a white cloth folded longitudinally for the dental wax to rest upon, a small towel to protect the medium from scalding when the hot water was poured out, and a large kettle for hot water. Dr. Tillyard had also prepared, an hour previously, a set of plates of the dental wax, called "Kerr," marking six pieces with the numbers 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 respectively, and making an equivalent number of notches along the edge of each piece. The bottom left-hand corner of each piece, turned upside down, was also broken off and similarly marked for identification. The pieces of wax were put into a box and carried in Dr. Tillyard's pocket.

Margery, Dr. Crandon, Mr. Dudley and Dr. Tillyard drove thus in Dr. Crandon's car through Boston to Dr. X's rooms, where they were received by Dr. X and his lady assistant Miss Y. Miss Y took Margery into a back room and disrobed her, searched her very thoroughly, including her mouth, teeth and hair, robed her in her séance garments, and led her back into

* Dr. J. J. Skirball.
the consulting room. Her statement is attached herewith. Dr. X then proceeded to search Dr. Tillyard, taking his coat off and putting it away, examining everything in his waistcoat and trousers pockets, including the inside of his two spectacle cases and a small box of pills, and feeling him carefully all over right down to and including his shoes. His statement is also appended.

Dr. Tillyard and Mr. Dudley arranged the séance in a suitable part of the very large consulting room. A dark, three-sided screen was set up with its back to the large windows, through which a certain amount of light percolated even when both sets of blinds were drawn. A plain wooden chair was placed in position for the medium, inside the screen, and a small plain deal wooden table was put in front of it. A second plain chair was put to the left of the medium's for Dr. T., and a standing electric light, with red globe and bendable arm was arranged to left of and a little back from the side of the screen, in such a position that Dr. T. could manipulate it with his right hand, and throw the light on the table without lighting up the medium's face too strongly. Dr. T. carefully examined the table and chairs, and noted that they were of the plainest make, without any secret hollows or drawers in them.

Mr. Dudley placed the Richardson voice machine on a side table, and alongside of it he put an electric torch, for Dr. T.'s use to activate the luminous paint on the floats and top of the U-tube. Dr. T. arranged the two dishes on the table, folded the cloth longitudinally and put it into the larger dish, arranged the small towel so as to protect the medium from scalding, and put the unopened box of Kerr on the table. Miss Y brought in the kettle of hot water which had been heated to boiling, and Dr. T. placed it on a large pail to the left of his chair. Mr. Dudley then withdrew to the door, outside of which Dr. Crandon, Dr. X and Mr. Dudley stayed during the séance. Miss Y led Margery in, reported a negative result of her search, handed Margery to Dr. T. and withdrew also. Door was shut and locked. Strong red light on. Dr. T. led Margery to her chair, sat her down in it, and arranged a soft pillow for her
back. He then placed a second pillow for his own back, as Walter had said he would try to do something for the arthritis in his back, and that he would have to try to recline in his chair.

Dr. T. next called Mr. Dudley back into the room to help him to fix Margery in the chair with adhesive tape bandages. The four of these were cut off about two feet long each, and were placed tightly around bare wrists, binding these to the two arms of the chair, and around her stockinged ankles, binding these closely to the legs of the chair. Dr. T. then took a thick blue marking pencil and cross-marked each bandage in two places so that the lines ran well out on both sides on to the skin of M’s wrists and also across on her white stockings. It was quite impossible for M. to move either her hands or her feet from the strapping without betraying the fact by the changed positions of these blue pencil lines.

When binding M.’s left arm to chair, she complained that it hurt her. T. examined it and found a large bluish red bruise on it, a little above the wrist. M. said it had come during the previous séance while DeWyckoff was alone with her, and that W. had stated that he had drawn teleplasm out from the skin there and that it would be sore for a day or two. T. was careful not to put the tape too close to the bruise.

Mr. Dudley now withdrew, and the large heavy door was shut and locked. Inside the room were only M., bound in her chair, and Dr. T. Outside the door were Dr. Crandon, Dr. X, Mr. Dudley and Miss Y.

Red light out. M. lay back in her chair and sighed. T. sat in his chair holding her left hand. She was very restless. Shafts of light were coming in from the windows, and as M. did not seem comfortable T. addressed her and asked whether there was too much light. She was half awake and complained of a particular bright shaft on the wall to her right. T. located this as due to one blind being not fully drawn down; he went to the window and drew the blinds well down and fixed the edges so that only a slight line of light came through. Nevertheless the room was never really dark and T. could dimly see the door and various objects throughout the séance.
Red light out again. M. appeared more comfortable, and went to sleep holding T.’s right hand in her left.

With M. asleep, Walter soon came through with a “Hello, Tillyard” and a loud and piercing whistle. He called out loud greetings to the people outside the door, and made a pun on Dr. X’s name, which caused laughter. He also called out “Who’s the charming blonde?”, referring to Miss Y. T. explained that she was Dr. X’s assistant, and he said “Whew, he seems to specialize in blondes.” He then began whistling most vigorously and beautifully an old Canadian hymn tune (not known to Dr. T.), and went right through an eight line verse of it with beautiful modulations from piano to forte. T. asked him what it was, and he replied “God Save the King, of course,” which made T. laugh. Later on, W. whistled the Wedding March from Lohengrin equally beautifully. T. said “That’s no good now, Walter, as J. D.’s girl has chucked him.” W. said “Too bad, too bad; tell him from me that he’ll get over it.” Right through this séance W. whistled almost continuously and with tremendous power and effect, and his voice clearer and stronger than T. had ever heard it before.

After about five minutes, W. told T. to put on the light and put in the first piece of Kerr. T. did so, and W. said “Whew, that water’s hot; I’ve scorched myself.” T. reported this to Dudley, who asked whether it was his hand that was scorched. “No” said W., “It’s the tip of my tail. That water is as hot as . . . !” After a minute or so, T. heard slight splashings in the water, and then movements indicating the handling of the cloth, followed by movement of the wax in the further basin containing the cold water. Soon W. said “Put on the light and take the print out, and put another piece of wax in.” T. did so, and W. said “You’d better make sure that there is something on it,” so T. examined the wax in good red light and saw a thumb print on it. He asked W. whether he should put the light out, and W. said “No, go ahead, put it in right away.” T. looked at M. who was asleep, with her head slightly inclined to the right. He could not see any luminous teleplasm owing to the red light being so strong, but noticed
that the outline of her face was quite blurred. W. talked not once, but many times during this séance, in bright red light, his voice mostly coming from inside the cabinet to the right of M. and a little above her head, but sometimes lower down and near the table.

T. put in a second piece of wax and put out the light. W. said the water was getting a bit too cool, so T. put on the light and poured in a little more hot water, protecting the medium from possible scalding by holding the towel between her and the table. W. worked away in the dark on this piece and soon had a fine print done, which T. took out of the cool water and examined. Light out again. W. said he guessed the cloth wanted arranging and a lot more hot water put in, so T. put on the light, straightened the cloth, poured in a lot more hot water, protecting the medium with the towel, and then put in a third piece of wax. W. said this was all right, and got to work on it right away. When he took the cloth out, he said, "I guess this cloth wants squeezing out," and T. could hear him doing it and the water trinking about on the table. W. said "I guess you've got enough thumb prints, Tillyard; take this one out and put on the voice machine." T. put on red light, retrieved the third print, and almost at once M. was awake and complained that some water had poured into her lap. T. mopped up some of it. The cloth was lying quite squeezed up on the edge of the table. T. put away the three thumb prints,* and went across to the side table to get the voice machine. He turned on the electric torch, with his back to M. and strongly activated the two luminous floats and the luminous band around the top of the tube. He then brought the voice machine to the table and placed it in position. M. said that if anything went wrong with it she would "M-m-m" three times, and that T. must then put on the light again and rearrange the mouth-piece. T. then placed the mouth-piece in M.'s mouth and put the light out. M. blew up the floats and they sagged back; she did this five or six times, but could not hold the floats up. She then said "M-m-m" and T. put on the light

* See note at end of record. Ed.
and found that the junction of the glass mouth-piece and the armored tube was leaking slightly. Pushing the glass portion a little further in, T. replaced the mouth-piece in M’s mouth and put the light out. This time M. blew the floats up and kept them poised for over half a minute. W. at once spoke and said to T., “Well, here I am, what do you want me to say,” T. taken aback said, “Say anything you like, Walter,” and W. at once said, mockingly, “Say anything you like, Walter.” W. then spoke a sentence addressed to Dr. X, choosing words full of sibilants, which sibilants need lip work. T. then asked W. to whistle, which he did very clearly and loudly for some seconds. W. then made a few more remarks and T. said he was satisfied. M. let the float fall back and T. put on the light and took the mouth-piece out of her mouth. T. noted her hands still tightly affixed to the chair.

Light out again. W. said he now wanted to try to do something for T.’s back, but it was essential that he should try to lie back in his chair relaxed, just as if he were going to sleep. T. said he would do so, and that W. could put him into a trance if he wished. W. said “No fear, you won’t go into a trance, just lie back and relax.” T. arranged his pillow comfortably, saw that M. was all right and asleep again, and put out the light. W. said several times, “Relax, you must relax” and T. did so, so successfully that he began to feel drowsy and told W. he thought he could go to sleep. W. said, “No, just keep as you are; I’m doing something to your back. Now I want you to remember this; when the medium wakes up, you are to examine her back, and you will see that I have done something.” T. all this time remained drowsy but could feel some indefinable change in his back, giving a slight suggestion of straightening up and the removal of a dull sort of pain which he had felt in his vertebrae for two or three weeks. After about five minutes, W. said, “Well, that’s done; don’t forget to look at her back. Goodbye, Tillyard, good-night all.” T. turned up the red light and called out that the sitting was finished. M. woke up slowly and asked T. not to put the bright light on for a little while. T. waited and then put on the full white light.
M. said her back was hurting her a lot. T. tried to open the big door, which had got stuck, and finally he managed to open it with some difficulty. T. proceeded to examine M.'s strap controls, with the others standing around, and found them all intact. The blue pencil marks were all exactly in position and it was clear that she had not moved hand or foot during the séance. M. complained of the pain in her back and also in her left arm, and implored T. to remove the left arm bandage first. T. did this with difficulty, as the warm weather had made the strapping very sticky and it was wound twice round her and thoroughly glued together. T. had to pull it quickly across the skin to avoid causing M. too much pain. An examination of the left arm showed that the bruised area had spread a lot, and was now about an inch and a half long. T. next removed the other wrist-strap, and then the two leg straps, noting the positions of the blue pencil markings on the white stockings. T. then reported to Dr. Crandon Walter's request about examining M.'s back, and suggested that Miss Y should search her and disrobe her in the room while all the rest withdrew, and then Miss Y could report if she found anything. All withdrew from the room except Margery and Miss Y, and the door was shut. Miss Y called out shortly afterwards, and the door was slightly opened; she stated that there was a huge bluish red bruise on M.'s back covering two vertebrae. Dr. Crandon was willing that T. should examine it, but T. said he would be satisfied to see it from the doorway. Miss Y then draped Margery and placed her half leaning over a chair, back to the door, with the strong white electric light from the ceiling shining down on her. The men all could see quite plainly a large dark blue-red bruise covering the two vertebrae, which Miss Y reported were the twelfth dorsal and first lumbar. During the séance, these had been protected by the pillow. T. remarked that these were the two vertebrae in his back which had been most badly damaged by arthritis; his own back was feeling immensely better, but he naturally felt upset at Margery's vicarious suffering.

The door being again closed, Miss Y robed Margery, and
the séance closed with thanks and farewells by all to Dr. X and Miss Y. T. gathered up the four adhesive straps and got Dr. X to put each into a separate envelope with U. S. stamp on it as an exhibit.

Total time of séance about forty minutes.

Weather hot and sultry, very unsuitable for a good séance. Soon after our return to Lime Street, rain began to fall, and there was considerable lightning and thunder. M. and Dudley both appeared completely worn out. Walter says that he gets a good deal of power out of him, and that he can only get it out of heavy, well-fleshed men. When T. said to W. during the séance, "Walter, you can take some teleplasm out of me if you wish," W. retorted, "No, I can't; you haven't got any." T. is very thin, without any spare flesh.

On our return to Lime Street Walter started the Victrola playing before anybody got beyond the hall.

(Signed) R. J. TILLYARD.

Aug. 11th, 1928.
Boston, Mass., U. S. A.

A NOTE OF OTHER "SOLUS" Sittings

It is furthermore, pertinent to report in this place the fact that similar strictly-controlled "solus" sittings, with the production of typical Walter thumbprints, have been accorded to Dr. F. C. S. Schiller of Oxford (9/10/28), Dr. M. W. Richardson (8/7/28), Captain John J. Fife (8/26/27), and Mr. Joseph DeWyckoff (8/9/28).

TESTIMONY OF DR. JOSEPH J. SKIRBALL, M.D., AND HIS ASSISTANT

(Dr. X and Miss Y)

Addressed to Sir Oliver Lodge

August eleventh, 1928.

Dear Sir Oliver Lodge:

Mrs. Crandon (Margery), Dr. R. J. Tillyard and Mr. E. E. Dudley came to my office in Boston, Massachusetts, on August tenth at nine p.m. They brought with them dental wax and two shallow crockery dishes for making finger prints.
I examined Dr. Tillyard and Mr. Dudley and found that they had nothing in their pockets or on their persons except keys, chains, spectacles. My nurse, Miss A. Landstrom, examined Margery (clad only in bathrobe, stockings and shoes) and found nothing. These examinations were at 9:05 P.M.

Margery and Dr. Tillyard were alone in my office, with door closed and guarded by me. After the sitting, a second examination was made at 9:40 P.M. in my office and disclosed nothing. Margery showed, however, an area of denuded epithelium together with subcuticular hemorrhage one and three-quarter inches by one-half inch on the anterior aspect of the left forearm extending to a point about two inches above the upper end of the taping. Further examination showed the skin from the twelfth dorsal and first lumbar spine was reeled and tender, despite the fact that Mrs. Crandon used a soft pillow (previously examined) between her back and the chair during the séance.

Very truly yours,
(Signed) Joseph J. Skirball, M.D.
(Signed) Amy E. Landstrom, R.N.

LETTER OF DR. R. J. TILLYARD TO SIR OLIVER LODGE
Boston, Mass.
August 11, 1928.

My dear Lodge,

The TILLYARD Solus séance took place last night, between 9 and 10 P.M., in hot muggy weather, not suitable for good séance work, with a thunderstorm brewing which broke shortly after our return home. It was by far the most wonderful séance I have ever attended, and as far as I am concerned now I should not worry if I never had another sitting in my life. Dr. Crandon made no conditions and placed Margery unreservedly in my hands. I think the arrangements which we made were scientifically severe and at the same time put on record the most marvelous result in the whole history of psychical research. I am sending you my full report (first writing) of this séance, and wish you to consider the following suggestions:
(1) I would like a short account of the séance to appear in "Nature," but only after the criticisms of my previous article have been completed.

(2) I would also like to publish the complete account, with a photograph of one of the thumb prints and also photos of Margery’s and my own right thumb prints, in the S.P.R. I will attach to the account Dr. X’s statements as to his searching of myself; Miss Y’s statement about her two searchings of Margery; and the statement about the damage to her back; also the full names and address of Dr. X and Miss Y for you to file and keep.

It seems to me quite impossible to find a single flaw in this wonderful result.

Whether Science, under its present limitations, can ever hope to offer any explanation, philosophic or otherwise, of these extraordinary phenomena I very much doubt myself. But my object is to record scientifically that they do occur, that they are part of the phenomena of Nature, and that Science, which is the search for Truth and for Knowledge, can only ignore them at the deadly peril of its own future existence as a guiding force for the world. This séance is, for me, the culminating point of all my psychical research; I can now say, if I so desire, Nunc Dimittis, and go on with my own legitimate entomological work. For you, my very dear friend, who have never seen anything like this, I can only ask that you and your whole family, will accept my statement as absolute truth, knowing me as you do, and that it may bring added comfort and certainty to you all, if such are needed to you who already believe with your whole hearts.

As for Margery and her husband, not one man in ten thousand could have handed over his wife trustingly to a comparative stranger as Dr. Crandon did last night, and not one woman in ten thousand could have faced such a situation bravely, as Margery did. The privilege granted me by them I shall always hold to be one of the greatest events in my life, and they are bound closely to me by spiritual bonds which can never be broken, and which, I am fully persuaded, will last over into
that wonderful life of which Death is only the Entrance Gate.

Farewell, and God bless you, and many thanks for your splendid aid and advice which helped me to gain this great result. My love to you all and very best wishes for your continued welfare.

Your affectionate friend,
(Signed) Robin Tillyard.

P.S.—I must not omit paying tribute to Walter—the finest "ghost" I know of.

VI.

THE MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

A SOLUS SITTING FOR THUMB PRINT, MARCH 11, 1931

UNDER ADDITIONAL TECHNIQUE OF CONTROL

By William H. Button, A.M.,
President of the A.S.P.R.

The readers of the Journal are for the most part familiar with the long series of finger-print phenomena which have characterized the Margery Mediumship. They also undoubtedly know that these phenomena have occurred under very drastic control of the medium in the séances that have been intended to be critical. Such notably was the case in the Tillyard sitting reported in this issue of the Journal and in the sittings held at the S.P.R. rooms in London in December, 1929 (Psychic Research, June, 1930). The control of the medium on those occasions consisted among other things of securely tying her body to the back of her chair and securing her wrists to the arms of her chair and her ankles to the legs of her chair by wrapping surgeon's tape about them and drawing the tape tight around the arms and legs of the chair and for extra precaution marking the tape by pencil lines across the tape and extending to the skin of the wrists and ankles. This control properly exercised seems to leave the medium helpless.
to any normal participation in the manipulation of objects on a table in front of her, although she might be able to reach the table with her knees. It might, however, be suggested that despite the wrist control the medium could still move her hands and fingers and possibly handle objects on the table brought within reach by raising or tilting the table by her knees. In fact such a suggestion has been made.*

To those familiar with the circumstances surrounding the sittings that have been thus controlled this suggestion might well seem disingenuous. I have been trussed up at Lime Street according to this method with my knees in contact with the table, and was able to tilt the table slightly at the risk of having anything on it slide off the far side but found myself not so gifted in dexterity as to be able to reach any article on the table, let alone manipulate it afterwards. Possibly others are more skillful. I, however, remain convinced that the suggested use of the fingers cannot be resorted to if the control is properly applied.

Nevertheless the careful attention of many sitters has been given and much discomfort of the medium has been incurred in this series of experiments which form an important chapter in psychic research. It therefore seemed to me that if a little additional effort and discomfort could result in the elimination of any real or fancied deficiency in the control such effort and discomfort were well worth while. Any general and non-specific criticism of technique or control is without value and only irritating and possibly intended to be so. When some prestidigitator says that everything can be reproduced normally without specifying how, one is simply wasting time in trying to prove the contrary. Such criticism has been indulged in on this subject in the last fifty years and much ineffectual argument has resulted. If, however, a specific criticism of technique or of control is made, it should receive attention when it is reasonable and sometimes when it is not.

The sensible way to meet such a criticism would seem to be to reproduce the phenomena if possible, under circumstances

* (Proceedings S.P.R., February, 1931.)
eliminating the real or fancied objection. With these ideas in mind at a Lime Street sitting on the evening of March 10, 1931, I asked Margery's control, Walter, if he would not produce a print when the medium was controlled as above indicated with the additional control of her hands and fingers by surgeon's tape. Walter immediately announced that he never used the medium's hands or fingers in producing prints and that if desired would attempt to produce a print under such additional control. There the matter rested for that evening and I supposed that some such thing might be attempted in the future and asked Dr. Richardson to look out for it. Walter, however, is a prompt individual and evidently does not believe in procrastination. During the sitting of the next evening he remarked to me that if anything was to be done it might as well be done quickly and be gotten rid of.

At a sitting on the next evening, March 11th, Walter was in exuberant spirits. After numerous interesting phenomena he asked for suggestions as to the next thing to be done. No satisfactory suggestion being made he announced he would do something on his own notion but would not tell what it was to be. There were nine sitters present beside the medium. Walter peremptorily directed them all to leave except Dr. Richardson, Captain Fife, Mr. Dudley and myself. The others reluctantly left the room and went downstairs. Walter then directed Dr. Richardson to leave the room and guard the door. He then directed Dudley to secure the medium who was in deep trance. This was done in red light by tying her in her chair with a rope passing around her chest and under her arm-pits and knotting it tightly to the chair back: then with half-inch surgeon's tape strapping her wrists, hands and fingers to the arms of her chair, taping her ankles to the legs of my chair which had been moved to a position directly in front of the medium's chair. When the lashing was completed Walter requested Dudley to depart. Fife was then directed by Walter to search the room which he did in the red light with the aid of an electric flashlight and reported no one present except the
medium, himself and me. He was then directed by Walter to put hot water in the proper dish on the table, put in wax which he had marked for identification, put out the light and depart. Walter had directed me to place my hands in contact with the medium's. I also kept my knees and feet in contact with hers throughout. I had previously ascertained that the hot and cold water dishes were in proper condition. For Fife's connection with the finger-print experiments I would refer to "Psychic Research," December, 1928, page 693. On Fife's departure I found myself alone with the medium, she being so secured that she could not possibly move hand or foot to any effect. An interesting conversation with Walter ensued, which is not pertinent to this record except as indicated in the report appended. In a few moments I heard sounds of movement on the table, a slight splashing in the water and then Walter said the job was done. The wax impressed with a fine Walter print was duly retrieved and identified as being Fife's wax. The impression was one of the best Walter prints yet obtained. The controls were found intact. A detailed report of the sitting is appended with a reproduction of the thumb print obtained.1

I cannot refrain from commenting upon the sagacity and efficiency of Walter in the above occurrences. He devised every precaution and directed it to be carried out. I might have thought of locking the door but I probably would not have thought of posting Richardson outside it as a guard nor having the room searched as I was so confident no unexpected person was there. Walter directed what should be done with the print and ordered the entire sequence of events. I have concluded that Walter himself is the one to answer any criticisms that are made of him or of his methods.

Sitting with Margery at 10 Lime Street, Boston, Mass., Evening of March 11, 1931, in Séance Room

Present: Captain Fife, Mr. Button, Dr. Crandon, Mr. and Mrs. Litzelmann, Dr. and Mrs. Richardson, Miss . . . Rich-

1 This reproduction is omitted from this Appendix.
ardson, Mr. Dudley and Medium. Captain Fife at right of medium controlling her right hand, Mr. Button at left of the medium controlling her left hand. Mrs. Richardson searched medium with negative results before sitting. Sitting began about 9 o’clock and medium promptly went into deep trance and remained in trance throughout sitting. Walter soon came through and for something over half an hour exhibited various phenomena of interesting character not here reported. At about 9:45 or 9:50 Walter announced that he had had enough of that but added that conditions were good and the power strong and wanted suggestions as to what he should do next. Dudley stated he had something he would like to have done whereupon Walter said he did not care to do that. Button produced a box of plasticine which Dudley had given him for the purpose of attempting a fingerprint test and stated to Walter that he had that box and asked Walter whether he would try that. Walter said that was what he had been talking about to Dudley and he would not use it. Walter then said he had something that he would attempt to do. When asked what it was he said “I will show you.” Thereupon he directed that everyone should leave the room and go downstairs except Captain Fife, Mr. Button, Dr. Richardson and Mr. Dudley. The medium was still in deep trance, the red light was turned on and everybody departed except the four mentioned. The light was turned out and Walter directed Dr. Richardson to leave and stay outside the door to the séance room. Richardson did so. Button, Fife, Dudley and the medium were then left in the room alone. Walter then announced “Button, this is your sitting, what do you want to have done?” Button said he would like Walter’s suggestions. Walter said “All right” and directed Dudley to go downstairs and get a large quantity of tape and a large amount of strong rope. Dudley did so and returned in a few moments with a quantity of one-half inch surgeon’s tape and a length of rope. Walter then said “Button, how will you have the medium lashed up?” Button asked “Who is to be here?” Walter said “Only you.” Walter asked Button whether he would have the
medium lashed to him or to the chairs. Button said "Lash her feet to the legs of my chair and her arms and hands to the arms of her own chair." Then Walter directed that the table which had been directly in front of the medium be moved and placed diagonally to Button's left with one corner near the chair of the medium. Button was directly by Walter to place his chair directly in front of the medium's chair and as close to it as possible which was done, Button still occupying the chair. Dudley was then directed to secure the medium still in trance. In red light he passed the rope around the chest of the medium high up under the arms and tied one end tightly to the top of the center back spindle of the medium's chair with two half hitches and the rope passing under each arm. The other end was wound around the same spindle and tied with three knots, the rope having been drawn tight around the medium's chest. Each hand of the medium was strapped to an arm of her chair with surgeon's tape. This tape was passed several times around medium's wrist, drawn tight, and her wrists drawn tightly to the arms of the chair by passing the tape around the chair arms and drawing it tight. The fingers of each hand were then lashed with the surgeon's tape by a turn of the tape just below the first phalanx including the thumb and two more turns over the four fingers just below the second phalanx, tape being drawn tight and passed around the arm of the chair. These wrist and finger lashings were marked with pencil by Button, the markings extending across the lashings and on to the skin. Both hands were secured in the same way. Medium's ankles were strapped respectively to the legs of Button's chair by several turns of surgeon's tape drawn tight about the bare ankles of the medium and then tight around the lower ends of the legs of Button's chair. Button's left knee was between the medium's two knees and his right knee was pressing the outside of the medium's left knee and Button's feet were in contact with the feet of the medium secured as above, and all this contact continued throughout the sitting. The hot and cold water dishes were on the table, the nearest point of any dish to the tips of
medium's right hand fingers being about sixteen inches. Button examined the dishes. There was a little lukewarm water in the hot water dish with the cloth for drawing the wax out in place and there was considerable cold water in the cold water dish. Nothing else in either dish. Walter then directed Dudley to leave the room which Dudley did leaving only Fife, Button and the medium in the room, Walter then directed Fife to search the room. Fife did this at some length, using an electric flashlight, and reported there was no one in the room except Button, the medium and himself. Walter then directed Button to place his hands over the medium's hands and in contact therewith continuously from this time until the end of the sitting which Button did with no variations except in one instance as below indicated. Walter then directed Fife to pour hot water in the hot water dish and put a piece of dental wax ("Kerr") in the hot water and leave the room. Button saw Fife pour in the hot water and put in the dental wax, said Kerr having been previously marked by Fife for identification. Fife then put out the red light and left the room leaving nobody in the room except Button and the medium.

Walter and Button engaged in conversation on various subjects for three or four minutes, Button hearing slight movements on the table and splashes in the water. Presently, about 3½ or 4 minutes after Fife's departure, Walter directed Button to take the wax out of the water. Thereupon Button put his right elbow on the left hand of the medium lashed as above and his right finger tips on medium's right hand and with his left hand removed the wax from the cold water dish and then resumed the hand control above described holding the wax in his left hand. Button asked Walter whose print had been produced. Walter said it was his own. Button requested Walter to whistle for him, which Walter did. Walter then directed Button to call Richardson and Richardson came in and with the aid of the flashlight Button and Richardson examined the lashings finding them intact and the markings on the wrist and finger lashings as originally. Richardson turned on red light and
shortly thereafter the overhead light. Dudley and Fife then came in and they also examined the lashings and pronounced them to be intact. The medium came out of trance and expressed surprise to find herself lashed as described saying that she had not been so secured when the sitting began. The medium was released, it being necessary to cut the tape and rope with a knife. Button then led her to the door of the room and turned her over to Mrs. Richardson who searched her with negative results. Button put the wax print in an envelope having continuously held it in his left hand since taking it out of water and took it downstairs and there put his initials and the date on the back having observed that the wax bore the imprint of a thumb, showed it to Fife who identified it as his wax by three notches which he had put on it prior to the sitting. Fife and Dudley examined it and said it was impressed with a Walter thumbprint. Button then took possession of the wax and took it with him to New York City as Walter directed him to do. All séance occurrences were in dark except as indicated.

Richardson, Dudley and Fife reported that no one entered or left the room during the sitting except as above indicated. Dudley reported that he left the room at 10:08 and that Richardson was called in at 10:18. Dudley and Fife came into the room at 10:22. The loosing of the medium was completed at 10:25. The above notes are made by Mr. Button at his office in New York on the morning of March 12th, 1931, from rough notes made by him shortly after midnight of the night of March 11th-12th, on the train from Boston to New York and are signed by the following, each one of whom certifies, however, only to the occurrences that are indicated to have happened in his or her presence.

William H. Button
Josephine L. Richardson
John W. Fife
E. E. Dudley
Mark W. Richardson
VII.

Analysis of the Fingerprint Problem on the Basis That a Mold or Molds Are Used in Their Production

1. It is claimed that duplication is a photographic process.
2. That a dead finger is used to make the negative prints.
3. That the original is a dead finger from which casts are made.
4. That casts are made from a living finger and from these casts flexible molds are made.

1. The hypothesis of photographic reproduction of three-dimensional prints, if advanced, cannot be seriously entertained. Photographs are conventional means of presenting by light and shade effects an image which is interpreted by the observer. The latter’s interpretation is a function of the lighting effects used in photographing as well as of his imaginative powers. Chemical or mechanical processes which must be used in producing a three-dimensional mold based on a photograph are unimaginative hence are incapable of reproducing the observer’s mental picture.

2. The second assumption is untenable because of the variations in the pattern and the marked changes in form as shown by the wax prints. There is no information in fingerprint science which permits the assumption that many thumbs are practically identical as to the greater part of their minutiae and yet vary in a certain few details. It has been noted that these details which vary are not the same in every case.

3. If it is assumed that a mold is made from a dead or living original the proponent of that hypothesis should be able to account for all the facts presented by the wax imprints as well as by the conditions under which they were received.

The varying forms of these imprints imply a flexible original. For, if the original (whether mold or otherwise) were not flexible there must of necessity be such a multiplicity of rigid molds as to make the assumption palpably absurd.

If it is assumed that a flexible mold is used the original may have been a dead thumb or a living thumb—if the critic elects to deny the statements of the experts that these prints are such as would be made by contact with living flesh. For the sake of the argument we will assume that a flexible mold may be made from a dead thumb and that the results are so perfect that the experts can be deceived (no one has shown that this is the case). Then, if there are alterations in the pattern these changes must be made in the original or in the molds. But the original can be altered only if it is a dead thumb. Once altered every mold made therefrom must carry the same alterations even though additional changes have been made. The wax prints prove that this is not the case. Therefore, it must be the mold that is altered. These facts apply equally to the hypothesis that a living thumb is the original.

We are now reduced to the assumption that a multiplicity of flexible molds have been produced from a thumb, either living or dead, and that these molds have been mechanically altered in such a manner as to simulate structures of living flesh. The form and texture of the papillary ridges must be preserved wherever alterations are made. These minutiae are microscopic dimensions, as one will appreciate by studying his own fingerprints under a powerful magnifying glass. The photographic enlargements of these prints do not disclose any traces of mechanical operations. The variations are not merely the excision of certain details but in many cases they involve the substitution of other details not normally found in prints of the category under consideration.

Keeping in mind the fact that the variants which are found in these prints appear to have been made by contact with living flesh we present the following list of some of the major differences which must be accounted for on the hypothesis of normal production by the use of molds or the products of molds.

a. A terminal ridge in a positive print becomes a bifurcation as in the normal negative but retains its width as in a positive.

b. An inclosure as shown in ridge No. 5 (Fig. 6, p. 198, April, 1928), may be open at one end in one print, open at the
other in another or open at both ends in still another print. Somewhat the same modifications may be found as regards the inclosure in ridge 8, loc. cit.

c. Ridge No. 1 may be open or closed.
d. Ridge 2 may connect with ridge 3, as in the majority of prints or it may be disconnected.
e. Ridge 6 may branch to ridge 7, or this bifurcation may be open. The first is evidently the normal condition.
f. A scar may be present at the upper left portion of the negative or it may be absent.
g. A ridge which is normally bifurcated in the negative may also be bifurcated in some positives.
h. Pores which are clearly impressed in some positives and shown in the normal negatives may be absent in another positive which is otherwise clearly impressed.
i. A joint line changes its form or its position in relation to the remainder of the print.
j. The joint line may be of positive form while the remainder of the print indicates that it is of negative form.
k. The joint line may be that of a normal negative while a considerable fraction of the print is a normal positive and the balance a mirror-reversed negative.
l. A portion of the print may be in the normal negative category with the core section of mirror-reversed positive form with the corresponding joint line.
m. The central ridge of the positive may be completely excised without showing any evidence of mechanical operations.
n. A wrinkle or wrinkles may be incorporated into the print with every indication that they are made by contact with wrinkles in normal flesh.
o. These wrinkles may vary in number in different prints.
p. Wrinkles may appear in one print and not appear in another print made a few minutes later.
q. A normal negative print may be markedly convex, instead of concave, without any corresponding distortion of the ridge interval such as should result from the bending of a flexible mold.
A normal positive print may be made deeply concave without showing any indication of the above mentioned distortion.

Or, finally, a radically distorted print is produced on demand and without previous intimation and this distortion is so extensive and comprises so many variations from the norm that a distinctly different mold would be required for its production.

After having given all these variations the careful consideration which they merit it is necessary to consider certain other factors.

The concave positive has been made on the same piece of wax as a normal negative.

A print with wrinkles is made within a few minutes of a print which shows no wrinkles.

The print with the maximum distortion (Fig. 2) is repeated on the same piece of wax with a normal negative.

A print claimed by Walter to be of his left thumb is made on the same piece of wax as a normal negative print of the right thumb.

A print of a child's digit is made on the same piece of wax as a print of the Walter right thumb.

A print of another and younger child's digit is made alongside of a normal Walter print.

A distorted positive is made within a few minutes of several normal negatives.

Returning to the fourth hypothesis we see that all of the above statements apply with practically the same force. No alteration in a living original is possible and since a multiplicity of molds would be needed to make normal production possible the same strictures apply.

The results obtained at the séance of Sept. 9, 1929, show that three different molds would be needed to produce the prints of this one séance.

Setting at one side for the present all questions of control and the testimony of independent and reliable witnesses, the technical difficulties in the way of normally producing the large
collection of wax prints with their many variant details are so 
great as to make it extremely improbable that any such means 
were or could be used. (None of these prints present any in-
dication that normal mechanical operations were performed 
either on the print or the structure which made the print.)

On the other hand, the evidence of the wax prints points to 
the hypothesis that they are ideoplastic productions and that 
the variations in the Walter prints are engineered by an indi-
vidual whose normal thumbprint is the basis on which these 
variant forms are modeled.

Sir Francis Galton has likened the pattern of a fingerprint 
to that of lace. It may be stretched or warped in many ways 
but the pattern remains the same. But many of the changes in 
the Walter prints are of a different order. They involve local 
changes in the pattern but without invalidating the essential 
identity of the basic print. They exceed the known limits of 
mechanical operations since they appear to have been made in 
living flesh. They are strongly indicative of the operations of 
an independent intelligence. But this is exactly what Walter 
has claimed. He has said that he makes these changes in order 
that he may prove that these prints were not made by normal 
means. There is, we believe, ample evidence that these prints 
are not the physical prints of anyone who was present at the 
seances at which they were made.
March 6, 1933.

Dr. B. K. Thorogood
Department of Mathematics
Franklin Union
Berkeley & Appleton Streets
Boston, Massachusetts

Dear Sir:

We acknowledge your letter of March 3 stating that you desire a statement from our Company in regard to the question raised in your first letter of February 28 about stereoscopic vision.

The statement you made in first letter in the use of a Monocular Microscope is correct, that a ridge in any surface may appear as such, or as a furrow, depending upon the position of the illuminant. Such is not the case, however, with the Binocular Microscope used for opaque substances. This gives true stereoscopic vision irrespective of the position of the illuminant.

In order that you may have cut and description of Binocular Microscopes we are sending in separate mail two of our latest folders describing the Greenough and Wide Field Binocular Microscopes. The latter are now obtainable with new drum nosepiece device, also with the tilted arrangement of the binocular body.

Trusting the foregoing will give you the desired information, we remain

Very truly yours,

BAUSCH & LOMB OPTICAL CO.

(Signed) M. Schmitt
Educational Sales Division.

M.Schmitt:MMH
E.C. D-15
125
Sitting at 10 Lime Street, May 10, 1932. 9:10 P.M.

Present to left: Mr. Thorogood, Mr. Adams, Sary, Capt. Fife and Psyche. Miss Barry, stenographer, outside circle.

The mediums were searched before and after the sitting very carefully by Miss Barry. They did not leave Miss Barry’s side until they entered the séance room.

Trance came on shortly and “Walter” appeared in a few minutes and seemed to be full of business.

“Walter”: “I haven’t much time to-night so I must work fast. Adams, you take Capt. Fife’s place and Thorogood take Mr. Adams’ place.” The circle now was as follows: To left, Capt. Fife, Sara, Mr. Adams and Psyche. Thorogood inside of circle in front of “Sara.”

Walter: “Relax everybody. That doesn’t mean be dumb! I don’t want water as hot as it was last night. Mix it with a little cold water and put it in the dish. Put the red light on Adams.” The medium was snoring very loudly. Mr. Adams put the light out after the hot water was put in the dish and Walter instructed him to leave it on. Walter then asked for a small piece of wax (hand size) to be put in the dish. He told Adams to put the light out.

9:18: Wax was put in the hot water in the dish on the table in front of medium.

Walter: “What are those little pieces of wire? I get them stuck in my fingers.”

Thorogood: “That is just to identify the wax.” For the next few minutes Psyche was very restless and snoring very deeply. She had a very tight grip on Capt. Fife’s right and Mr. Adams’ left hand. Sary also had a tight grip on Capt. Fife’s left hand and Mr. Adams’ right hand.

9:22: Walter said, “You have a very fine left hand there. It is a perfect hand. Take it out of the cold water and examine it.”

Mr. Thorogood removed the wax from the cold water and on examination found it to be a very good left hand in relief.

Walter: “That is all for to-night. Friday night at 9 P.M. for a perfect right hand. Goodnight.”

Red light put on and then Walter said, “Just a minute. Notice how I polished the back of that hand with my heel. Look at it.”

Sitting closed at 9:30 P.M.
X.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, May 23, 1932. 9:10 P.M.

Present at left: Mr. Thorogood, Capt. Fife, Sary, Mr. Adams and Psyche. Miss Barry, stenographer, outside circle.

Medium searched before and after the sitting by Miss Barry as described in notes.

Trance came on in a few minutes, and at 9:20 “Walter” came through saying, “Cheer up, this is going to be a perfect evening.”

Mr. Thorogood: “I got a couple of dandy Dr. ‘X’ prints to-day.”

“Walter”: “You will get a pretty good one of me to-night.”

Thorogood: “What do you think of those prints in the book?”

“Walter”: “They aren’t mine.”

Thorogood: “Whose are they?”

“Walter”: “Ask me no questions and I’ll tell you no lies. You aren’t so dumb Fife.”

Sary was very restless and at 9:25 “Walter” told Adams to take her outside the circle. This was done and then the circle formed as follows: Capt. Fife controlled the medium’s right hand and Thorogood’s left hand, and Thorogood controlled medium’s left hand and Fife’s right hand.

“Walter”: “That is better, there was too much power.”

9:26: “Walter” asked for hot water and ordered a dry towel to be put on the table between the cold and hot water dishes.

9:28: Wax was put in the hot water dish by Mr. Thorogood.

“Walter”: “You are all right Thorogood. 1933 will be a good year for psychics. Now watch the wax go into the cold water.” (The wax was heard to splash in the cold water.)

9:29: “Walter” told Thorogood to take the wax out of the water and examine it. This was done and the wax was found to have a print of the right hand in relief. Of this hand “Walter” said: “The ectoplasm was taken from the medium. You have a perfect exhibit of the scar on her right hand exactly where the scar is and yet it is not her hand. The ectoplasm got mixed. That is why people not understanding psychics ought to be very careful about what they say about psychics. Be careful how you word that and how you point it out in your description. There is a scar of her right thumb.”

“Walter”: “Friday night I will make a negative of right and

*“Dr. X” substituted for true name.
left hands and there will be no mistake. That is a positive as you call it (meaning the hand received to-night). To make the story complete I will make a right and left negative Friday night. They are the easiest. Have two waxes the same size as you had to-night. You will find your comparisons with Dr. 'X' prints easier if they are negatives. My negatives will be beautiful. Friday we will sit between 8 and 8:30 p.m."

Sitting closed at 9:45 p.m.

---

XI.

Pattern-types of 1st to 5th Fingers in Percentage of the Number of Fingers *

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fingers</th>
<th>Hands</th>
<th>Whorls</th>
<th>Rad.</th>
<th>Uln.</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Arches</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>25.65</td>
<td>5.81</td>
<td>61.14</td>
<td>66.95</td>
<td>7.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Right</td>
<td>29.38</td>
<td>5.94</td>
<td>57.76</td>
<td>63.70</td>
<td>6.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Left</td>
<td>21.92</td>
<td>5.68</td>
<td>64.52</td>
<td>70.20</td>
<td>7.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>35.04</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>60.71</td>
<td>61.05</td>
<td>3.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Right</td>
<td>41.66</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>55.37</td>
<td>55.73</td>
<td>2.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Left</td>
<td>28.42</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>66.05</td>
<td>66.38</td>
<td>5.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>28.82</td>
<td>23.98</td>
<td>30.66</td>
<td>54.64</td>
<td>16.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Right</td>
<td>29.67</td>
<td>25.73</td>
<td>27.51</td>
<td>53.24</td>
<td>17.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Left</td>
<td>28.10</td>
<td>22.24</td>
<td>33.81</td>
<td>56.05</td>
<td>15.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>16.22</td>
<td>2.31</td>
<td>70.44</td>
<td>72.75</td>
<td>11.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Right</td>
<td>16.88</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>70.91</td>
<td>73.13</td>
<td>9.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Left</td>
<td>15.55</td>
<td>2.40</td>
<td>69.98</td>
<td>72.38</td>
<td>12.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>37.10</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>58.71</td>
<td>59.49</td>
<td>3.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Right</td>
<td>44.98</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>50.74</td>
<td>51.95</td>
<td>3.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Left</td>
<td>29.22</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>66.68</td>
<td>67.03</td>
<td>3.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>11.01</td>
<td>1.64</td>
<td>85.18</td>
<td>86.82</td>
<td>2.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Right</td>
<td>13.72</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>84.26</td>
<td>84.43</td>
<td>1.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Left</td>
<td>8.30</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>86.10</td>
<td>89.20</td>
<td>2.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Data from study made by Prof. Kristine Bonnevie, Institut Arvehighutsfors­

hing, Oslo, Norway.
XII.
10 Lime Street
Boston

Have taken Plaster Cast, and Photos sent by Bell, for further study.

Dudley, 3:30 P.M., Dec. 29, 1931.

XIII.
May 10, 1933.

Relative to the casts of thumb and index be advised as follows:
1. The casts were given me in the summer of 1926 by Dr. Crandon, personally, from a box of casts in the library.
2. They were given as incomplete examples of the paraffin glove agenda, then in course of experimentation.
3. I was not present at their production: they were given me to exemplify the morphology, presence of nails, cutaneous line, etc.
4. They were paraffin encased, the "paraffin glove fingers" having been filled with plaster of Paris.
5. I dissolved the paraffin from the index cast to exhibit the cutaneous markings: retained the thumb with paraffin casting intact, and in such state returned it to you.
6. The digit forms were retained throughout the intervening period of approximately six years in a box, along with picture wire which I had personally applied as a control of Margery in the glass cabinet, in a sitting of which you have a record.

(Signed) Eric Twatchman.
Friday, November 14, 1930.
Meeting at 8:30. Circle—Medium, Dr. R., Col. . . . . . . , Mrs. Coolidge, Mr. Coolidge, B. K. T., Miss Richardson, Miss Richardson, Mrs. Richardson, Mr. Litz, Dr. C., Mrs. Litz, Capt. Fife, in back Mr. S., Mr. E., who came late, B. K. T. was between Coolidge and Miss R.

The apparatus and dishes for the finger prints were placed on the table and lights out at 8:30, but Walter said he wanted the voice box first so the dishes were taken off and the voice box put on the table and adjusted by Mr. E. After that Walter whistled and talked, whistling, at times, two tunes at the same time, making considerable noise and what sounded like feed-back although this, in the ordinary sense, was impossible in the microphone. He then called for the dishes and Captain Fife put them on the table and when ready several asked what he was going to make and Captain Fife suggested making enlarged finger print of his right thumb. Walter said he would not do this but did not say he could not. Dr. C. thought perhaps that was stretching the matter a little too much to ask something new under the conditions, but Captain Fife kept persisting and Dr. R. suggested making anything he wanted and after several suggestions, Capt. Fife still holding his ground, Walter suggested putting in the wax which Fife did. After about a minute and a half he said "take it out" although no sound had been heard. Fife took it out of the cold water and put it in his pocket. Then the dishes were put away and the voice box was again put on the table. On top of it was put Dr. R's voice cut-out mechanism and while the medium blew that up Walter talked through the "mike." He also levitated a piece of cardboard about 2\(\frac{1}{2}\) x 1 ft., which had been illuminated on one side, three or four feet above the table and around in various oscillations and then turned it upside down and left it on the table. He made a few luminous lights but not anything very bright. The meeting was over at about 9:20 p.m.

The wax had an impression which had all the appearance of having been stretched out thus giving an enlarged print as F. suggested.
To: Mr. B. K. Thorogood,

41 Berkeley St.,

Boston, Mass.

Report: On the dermatoglyphics of "X" and "Y".

The material received comprises: (a) palm- and finger-prints, both hands, prepared by the usual ink method, of an individual marked X; (b) photographs of detail casts, both hands, of an individual marked Y; (c) photographs of thumb prints (labeled A and C), enlarged about X4, stated to be from the individual X, and photographs of thumb casts (labeled B and D) correspondingly enlarged, stated to be from Y.

This material has been submitted to the undersigned with the explanation that it concerns an "investigation of the possibility of artificial reproduction and the so-called supernormal production of finger-prints", the only further information supplied being that the subject Y, to whom the casts so marked "are supposed to belong" is no longer living. The request is for comparison of the impressions of X and Y, to determine whether the two sets are "identical". With reference to the statement of this request, it may be pointed out that the word "identical" is not exactly fitting, in that two prints from the same digit may present differences, owing to unlike pressures in printing, variation in amount of ink, etc. Such differences, though only slightly lessening the number of points of actual identity and not invalidating the correspondences between the two prints, disqualify the reference of "identical". In the present instance, it will be noted, the comparison concerns prints and casts. It would be preferable to revise the query to read: Do the prints labeled X and the casts labeled Y present correspondences indicating that they were made by the same individual—or, to invert it, are they so unlike that they could have come only from two persons?

Consideration of this query will be divided under two headings: (a) the whole hands, exclusive of the thumbs, and (b) the enlarged thumb prints and casts, A, B, C, and D.

The Whole Hands, Exclusive of the Thumbs.

The impressions of X and Y present many conspicuous differences in their major features. It may be stated with assurance that the impressions were not made by the same person. The following formulated
statement of the major dermatoglyphic characters is expressive of the existence of outstanding unlikenesses, so that it seems unnecessary to add more detailed analyses, ridge counts and the like. The formulation of palmar features follows Cummins et al. (Revised methods of interpreting and formulating palmar dermatoglyphics, American Journal of Physical Anthropology, vol. 12, 1929), while the finger-prints are indicated by the initial letters of the familiar standard pattern forms.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Palm</th>
<th>Fingers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Right 7(8) .5&quot;(6).5&quot;.3-t-Λ u.O.O.O.L</td>
<td>R U U U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left 7(8) .5&quot;(6).5'.3(2)-t-Lr.O.O.O.L</td>
<td>T U U U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right 11.9.7.5'-t-Λ u.O.O.O.L.M</td>
<td>U U U U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left 11.9.7.4'-t-Λ u.O.O.O.L.O</td>
<td>R U U U</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Enlarged Thumb Impressions: A, B, C, D.

All four impressions present the same pattern configuration, ulnar loop. In comparing them it is therefore necessary to resort to a more detailed analysis, including ridge count and the inspection of minutiae (forks of ridges, abrupt terminations of ridges, etc.). In the latter procedure I have made tracings on cellophane, indicating such features as shown on the attached sample. The desired comparisons may be readily made by superimposing such tracings, both over other tracings and the prints or casts. In doing this it is essential, of course, to keep in mind that a perfect correspondence is not to be expected even if two impressions originated from the same digit, not only for the reasons stated above but on account of the fact that the natural rounded contour of a cast is compared with the same or a similar contour reduced to a plane surface in printing.

In referring to these thumbs I designated them by the letters with which they are labeled, considering that the finding in A and B is sufficient reason to negate their respective origins from the two persons X and Y.

A and B present a correspondence indicating that they may be attributed to one and the same digit. C and D are from different digits.

Harold Cummins.
January 25, 1933

To: Mr. B. K. Thorogood,
41 Berkeley St.,
Boston, Mass.

Second Report on the Right Thumb Impressions: Marked A, B', B and A'.

After careful examination of the new material and restudy of the photographs originally submitted, I am still of the opinion that these right thumb impressions "may be attributed to one and the same digit", as stated in my report dated December 15, 1932. The evidence supporting this conclusion is now presented in some detail, in view of your apparent conviction that the impressions in question originate from two different digits. I must ask you to publish this report in full and to include in your account cuts of the prints as I have marked them for demonstration of the correspondences.

Please understand that my comments concerning "possibilities of fraudulent practice are made with no intention to question the sincerity of any individual. I am considering the situation wholly impersonally, as an outsider to whom you have presented the problem. I wish to make it clear, therefore, that the references to fraud represent merely my hypothetical reconstruction, and are in no sense to be interpreted as accusations. The comments merely indicate, for your benefit in study of the report, the deductions which may be drawn from these findings by one who examines the materials alone, as I have done.

With regard to the new photographs labeled A, B, C and D (to which I shall refer as A', B', C' and D', for distinction from the original examples bearing the same letters) you state that they show "both these right and left thumbs similar to those mounted on the yellow cardboard and lettered in the same way, A and B being the right thumbs and C and D the left thumbs". From the correspondences of these prints I take it that the wax transfer process described in your letter of January 13, 1933, yields prints which reproduce the essential features of the three-dimensional waxes. It is thus possible to determine that the new photographs are not lettered exactly "in the same way" as the original ones, for A'=B ("right thumb of Y") and B'=A ("right
MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

thumb of X’). The signs identifying the “X” and “Y” imprints are discussed below. You will recall my pointing out that two impressions from the same digit are not identical in the strict sense of the word, though they are “identical” in the meaning of one who employs the term to signify origin from the same digit.

I have made no re-examination of C and D, nor have I studied the detail in the companion prints D’ and C’, since it is clear that they originate from two different digits, as before reported. The results of restudy of A and B (Fig. 114), together with the findings in B’ and A’ (Fig. 115) are presented below.

Lacking sufficient experience with plastic, three-dimensional imprints, I have carried out some trials with several media to secure a working knowledge of the operations and results in material such as yours. Kerr’s “Perfection Impression Compound” and another dental preparation of similar qualities are among the media which I have employed. My observations pertinent to the issue at hand are: (1) Impressions made by a positive replica cast from a direct imprint of the natural finger may be indistinguishable from direct negative imprints of the finger itself. (2) Similarly, positive replicas cast from indirect negative imprints (impressions of an original positive replica) may be indistinguishable from original positives (cast from direct negative imprints of the natural finger). (3) Taking into account the variability in direct negative imprints of the actual finger, arising from unlike conditions of impression, it seems likely that successive transfers (direct natural negative to positive replica—that positive to negative, etc.), may be continued repeatedly, still without signs positively differentiating these increasingly more indirect imprints from originals—because some originals are less faithful reproductions than others. (4) Various forms of artifact may occur in plastic imprints, including not only the more obviously unnatural expressions, such as battered ridges and pitted surfaces, but also distortions of ridge relation. In the light of these observations, as well as other findings to be considered later, it is quite possible that the right thumb imprints of “Y” are indirect impressions rather than direct imprints of the natural thumb, those rendered in positive form at the séances being necessarily imprints of a negative replica, or replicas.

First making note of your data recorded on the backs of the photographs A’ and B’, I pasted them on white board for demonstration of the points of correspondence. You will note that some forty points are indicated, far in excess of the generally accepted requirement to estab-
FIGURE 114.

Photograph of the right thumb prints of Dr. "X" and "Walter" indexed by Dr. Cummins, in which he shows forty-four points of identity. The ridge disjunction which he mentions is indicated by the letters in B.
FIGURE 115.

Photograph of the right thumb prints of "Walter" and Dr. "X", similar to ink prints, both made by a transfer process from negative impressions, and indexed by Dr. Cummins.
lish positively that two prints originate from the same digit. $A'$ and $B'$ are therefore from the same digit (the right thumb of X, I assume from the circumstances), and since A and B check with these wax transfer prints all four photographs afford evidence of origin from the one digit.

With respect to your query concerning the core: (1) The core appears as a definite rod, or spike, in both A and B'. (2) There is a suggestion of the same detail in the print $A'$. (3) In B, the two core microphotographs, negative 5 (8/18/27) and positive 2 (6/14/32) there is an area at the core head which is certainly not natural, but in this area a rod core may be restored without inconsistency. (4) The wax 3/21, 27 is vague, the ridges being battered and smoothed; with suitable light and angle of view, however, the core is interpreted acceptably as a rod. (5) In waxes 7/16, 27; 8/26, 27 and 9/9/29 the core does seem to be a staple in direct view, and though the sulci agree in this same view it is to be noticed that with changed angle and illumination the core may be converted to a rod. The various waxes of "Y" are accordingly variable among themselves, and it is significant that they may be arranged in a series forming a transition to the rod state more clearly shown in A and B'. You may be surprised that I refer to varying view and illumination, placing stress on appearances thus displayed. My warrant for the procedure is that it serves, though roughly, to check the heights of ridges and depths of sulci. I may direct your attention to the equivalent mechanical check which is provided in the wax transfer impression, and that by this means also a rod core is suggested in a "Y" thumb, as shown in the print $A'$. Before receiving the second consignment of waxes I had considered the remote possibility that the core variations are due to a lesion in this region, ridges having puckered in the healing process. It was for this reason that I requested a series of dated imprints of "X" and "Y" extending over a period of years, to determine whether a history of such ridge conversion could be established. Your waxes indicate that the explanation lies elsewhere, namely, in technical defect of the impressions.

In the region of the core head there is another ridge which is variable among the several imprints of the "Y" thumb. It is the ridge coursing distally from the bifurcation numbered 6 in the photographs. In some cases this ridge fuses with ridge n, as indicated on $A'$), while in others

*These three impressions (Figs. 82b, 83b, and 87b) were later found to have been changed.
it terminates as in B'. This variant, like the core discrepancy, is thus to be regarded as an artifact of impression.

There are certain other negligible unlikenesses between A' and B' (paralleled in B and A, respectively). I shall use the natural ridge relationships shown in A and B' (right thumb of "X'') as the foundation of discussion. On each of the photographs, A and B', it is to be noted that a line joining points numbered 6 and 32 crosses fourteen ridges, while the corresponding line in B and A' transects fifteen ridges. The sequence of ridge details in A' and B' (and of course A and B) is perfect except for those points involved in the courses of the ridges lettered c, d, e, f, g and h, and for these six ridges the sequence is completed properly with interpretation of the impression artifact in the two waxes, 8/18/27 and 6/14/32.

In the waxes specified it is quite evident that the plastic was reimpressed by a rolling or other irregular movement, producing a "repeat" of the ridge b and cross-union of the six ridges succeeding it ulnarwards. The restoration of the ridges to their true relationships may be followed by comparing the correspondingly lettered ridges in the "X'" and "Y'" imprints. The repetition of like artifact in two waxes made at an interval of about six years may suggest their origin from the same replica, in which the artifact was originally introduced. It is important to observe that the described ridge disjunctions do not occur in other "Y'" waxes, though one example (9/9/29) displays ridge aberrations of like origin in another region (outlined on the wax with crayon).

On four "Y'" waxes (7/16/27, 8/26/27, 9/9/29 and 6/9/32) there is to be found a concrescence which is open, so far as I can see, to but one interpretation. The feature is located about in line with the core axis, distal to the head of the core at a distance of some twenty ridges. It is apparently the imprint of a defect of a replica employed for making these impressions, for there is certainly no normal feature of the skin which can account for the presence of this blob of wax, and I know of no lesion having its characteristics. The production of the same defect over a period of several years suggests the employment of a replica, either on replica or transfers which reproduce the defect.

In your letter of December 31, 1932, you write: "As this right thumb is the same as that which occurs on the right hand, and as the design of the right hand is different from either the right or left of the other individual, it seems almost conclusive proof that this thumb,
although much like the other, does differ in this respect (referring to core unlikenesses in the "X" and "Y" right thumb imprints)."

It does not follow, from the occurrence of a certain thumb in a hand imprint, such as that of the right hand of "Y", that the digit and hand belong to the same individual. Since the thumb imprint must be added separately it would be simple to make a substitution, as indeed it would be also, judging from the state of the "Y" hand casts as photographed, to incorporate other digits not belonging to that hand. I can lay no claim to ability to detect such substitutions from a cast alone, but with the observed correspondence of the right thumb imprints and your labels identifying them as from "X" and "Y" respectively, the inevitable conclusion is that a thumb imprint had been so substituted. It was this situation which prompted me to divide the previous report into two sections, one dealing with "The whole hands, exclusive of the thumbs?", the other with the "Enlarged thumb impressions: A, B, C, D". I refrained from stating the obvious implication of the findings, because the definition of the thumb imprints in the photographs of the right hand casts of "Y" is not sufficiently clear to make reliable determinations of the ridge details, and I had only your labels identifying A and B. Now, however, the paragraph quoted from your letter insistently reaffirms the origin of the right thumb imprints, and it is only fair that the matter should be discussed frankly. I may explain that the speculation naturally aroused by this curious situation, the right hand imprint of one individual bearing the thumb of another, led me to consider two possibilities: (1) It occurred to me that you might be responsible for the substitution, desiring to subject the thumb identification to this specific test, combining it with a strange hand. (2) But it seemed more likely that an imprint which had previously gained recognition as the thumb of "Y" had been combined with the hand of an "unknown", with the fraudulent intent of lending a quasi-identity to that hand. If I am correct in my inference that those who have examined the "Y" imprints do not agree in their judgments on identity (though why there should be disagreement I do not understand, if others have given the same careful attention to like materials), the conflict might offer an advantage to one planning a spectacular demonstration of whole hand imprints. Other evidences of the employment of a replica are enumerated above, and the same operation may have been applied in the "Y" hand imprints. There are significant differences in the finer texture of the ridges in the right and left thumbs of "Y", as shown in
B and D), the details being much more true to nature in the left thumb than in the right. The difference suggests unlike processes, or unlike conditions of impression, in the making of the right and left thumb imprints.

Summary:

(1) The right thumb imprints of "X" and "Y" originate from one and the same digit.

(2) The right hand imprint labeled "Y" thus bears a thumb which does not belong to that hand, the hand otherwise being unlike that of "X".

(3) In certain of the "Y" thumb imprints there is evidence indicating they are produced by a replica rather than the actual thumb.

Harold Cummins.
### XVII.

#### Whorls in Percentage of Fingers in the Various Human Races

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dig. Hands</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>64.6</td>
<td>54.4</td>
<td>43.4</td>
<td>40.8</td>
<td>33.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>61.5</td>
<td>56.5</td>
<td>47.5</td>
<td>47.5</td>
<td>33.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tschigaya</td>
<td>61.1</td>
<td>48.8</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>43.2</td>
<td>34.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugano</td>
<td>57.3</td>
<td>49.7</td>
<td>47.2</td>
<td>40.4</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sumatra</td>
<td>63.3</td>
<td>52.5</td>
<td>48.3</td>
<td>45.7</td>
<td>39.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nias</td>
<td>46.6</td>
<td>58.1</td>
<td>42.7</td>
<td>50.7</td>
<td>29.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>56.6</td>
<td>43.6</td>
<td>41.1</td>
<td>38.2</td>
<td>23.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>44.0</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>28.0</td>
<td>15.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>41.6</td>
<td>28.4</td>
<td>29.6</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td>16.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Loops in Percentage of Fingers in the Various Human Races

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dig. Hands</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>33.4</td>
<td>42.8</td>
<td>49.6</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>63.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>33.0</td>
<td>38.5</td>
<td>45.4</td>
<td>46.0</td>
<td>64.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tschigaya</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>49.0</td>
<td>50.4</td>
<td>50.7</td>
<td>63.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugano</td>
<td>41.4</td>
<td>47.8</td>
<td>45.4</td>
<td>52.4</td>
<td>63.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sumatra</td>
<td>36.2</td>
<td>45.8</td>
<td>46.7</td>
<td>50.3</td>
<td>67.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nias</td>
<td>52.2</td>
<td>59.4</td>
<td>52.5</td>
<td>53.9</td>
<td>75.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>42.3</td>
<td>53.5</td>
<td>46.8</td>
<td>50.4</td>
<td>70.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>65.0</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>78.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>55.7</td>
<td>66.3</td>
<td>53.2</td>
<td>56.0</td>
<td>73.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Radial Loops in Percentage of Fingers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dig. Hands</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tschigaya</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugano</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>2.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>25.73</td>
<td>22.24</td>
<td>2.22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Ulnar Loops in Percentage of Fingers in the Various Human Races

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dig.</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hands</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>32.4</td>
<td>42.2</td>
<td>32.8</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>60.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>33.0</td>
<td>36.0</td>
<td>38.0</td>
<td>32.5</td>
<td>64.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tschigaya</td>
<td>37.6</td>
<td>48.8</td>
<td>33.2</td>
<td>35.8</td>
<td>61.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugano</td>
<td>40.6</td>
<td>46.9</td>
<td>32.8</td>
<td>39.2</td>
<td>60.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>41.89</td>
<td>52.43</td>
<td>26.83</td>
<td>32.03</td>
<td>68.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>55.37</td>
<td>66.05</td>
<td>27.51</td>
<td>33.81</td>
<td>70.91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dig.</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hands</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tschigaya</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugano</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sumatra</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nias</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>11.65</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>7.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>2.61</td>
<td>5.22</td>
<td>17.09</td>
<td>15.85</td>
<td>9.99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Arches in Percentage of Fingers in the Various Human Races

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dig.</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hands</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tschigaya</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugano</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sumatra</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>11.65</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>7.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nias</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>2.61</td>
<td>5.22</td>
<td>17.09</td>
<td>15.85</td>
<td>9.99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### XVIII.

#### Statistical Occurrence of Pattern-Types in Different Human Races

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Races</th>
<th>Whorls</th>
<th>Rad</th>
<th>Un</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Arches</th>
<th>Indiv. Investigated</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>45.18</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>48.71</td>
<td>51.86</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>700 Criminals</td>
<td>Kubo 1918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eitohe</td>
<td>45.70</td>
<td>2.48</td>
<td>48.60</td>
<td>52.03</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>300 Criminals</td>
<td>Kubo 1918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tschigaya</td>
<td>45.16</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>48.92</td>
<td>52.76</td>
<td>1.81</td>
<td>700 Criminals</td>
<td>Kubo 1918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugano</td>
<td>45.18</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>47.65</td>
<td>51.85</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>1528 Criminals</td>
<td>Furuse 1913</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigata</td>
<td>43.6</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>50.4</td>
<td>53.8</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>276 Stud. Nurses</td>
<td>Kl. de Zwaan 1911</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sumatra</td>
<td>45.14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>53.13</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>500 Natives</td>
<td>Schlaginhaufen 1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>36.1</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>59.2</td>
<td>61.9</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>27 Artists</td>
<td>Kl. de Zwaan 1911</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aino</td>
<td>34.73</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>62.88</td>
<td>2.29</td>
<td>1380 Natives</td>
<td>Hasebe 1918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>31.8</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>61.4</td>
<td>65.2</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>55 Children</td>
<td>Falco 1908</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>26.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>67.3</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>500 Criminals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>25.65</td>
<td>5.81</td>
<td>61.14</td>
<td>66.95</td>
<td>7.40</td>
<td>24,518 Criminals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Statistics of Pattern-Types, Combined by Collins (1913) with the Occurrence of Brachy- and Dolichocephals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Races</th>
<th>Whorls</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Arches</th>
<th>Indiv. Investigated</th>
<th>Bronchi- and Dolichocephals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China.</td>
<td>38.7</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>5000 Brachycephals</td>
<td>Dolichocephals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India.</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2000 Dolichocephals</td>
<td>Brachycephals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India.</td>
<td>30.5</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England.</td>
<td>20.15</td>
<td>74.85</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5000 Dolichocephals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
XIX.

To Whom It May Concern:

This is to certify that I have made ink prints of the finger tips and palm patterns of both ‘‘M’’ and ‘‘C’’ and have classified these as well as two photographs of the wax impressions including the finger tips and the palms said to be ‘‘W’’ and state they are of the hands of different individuals.

(Signed) Bert Wentworth
March 24, 1933.

Note:

‘‘M’’ = ‘‘Margery’’
‘‘C’’ = Dr. ‘‘X’’
‘‘W’’ = ‘‘Walter’’

XX.

Report by W. T. Bell

On the identity of the alleged supernormal ‘‘Walter’’ prints on plaster cast of May 17, 1924.

In view of the request made to me to report as to the identity in regard to certain séance imprints obtained in Boston, which were sent to me by Sir Oliver Lodge on October 10, 1931, after making my report upon these imprints I thought it advisable to refer back to some previous published thumb prints, alleged to have been obtained in a similar manner.

In 1929 a book ‘‘The Thumbprint and Cross-Correspondence Experiments Made with the Medium ‘Margery’ During 1927 and 1928’’ was sent to me by Dr. L. R. G. Crandon.

This book is reprinted from the Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research. At the séance sittings under Margery’s Mediumship during 1927–1928 many alleged supernormal digital impressions were produced.

These imprints are in most cases identical and are referred to as the ‘‘well known Walter print.’’ A photographic copy of a supernormal ‘‘Walter print’’ shown on page 91, and marked 2-3-27 appears in exhibit and marked 1. (Our Figure 106).

On page 96, a photograph of a digital impression appears, which
MARGERY MEDIUMSHIP

is described as "Thumb of the paraffin glove of May, 1924, showing the Walter print; photographed direct from the plaster cast of the glove made at the time." This print is reported on by Mr. John W. Fife, who is described as a civilian fingerprint expert and Chief of Police of Charlestown (Boston) Navy Yard. Mr. Fife's report appears on page 87, and reads:

Capt. J. W. Fife's Report
(Quoted in Mr. Bell's Report—Exhibit 11)

"I then examined the plaster cast of a hand, marked May 17, 1924, and find that the ridges and depressions are clearly marked over most of the area of the thumb, but that the thumb, like the rest of the hand is distorted. The ball of the thumb seems to have been pinched up into a ridge above the core and this gives a different appearance to the pattern in that region as compared to the wax prints. In spite of this distortion, the pattern is in general identical with that of the wax prints in the corresponding area. The ridge count from the core to the delta is the same and the relationship of numerous bifurcations is consistent with those of the wax prints. In spite of the peculiar distortion of this thumb I am convinced that it is the same fingerprint pattern as the other prints and that it proves that the convex prints above referred to are actually models of a normal thumb.

I have compared Margery's thumb print with the ones produced by 'Walter,' and found her thumb prints to be of the ulnar type, and that they revealed some characteristics in the vicinity of the core that are almost identical with the ones found in the 'Walter' prints. Although their prints resemble each other so far as characteristics are concerned, they are not the same identical prints. The resemblance is sufficiently close to show blood relationship.

In comparing Margery's and Walter's prints with those of their mother, Mrs. Stinson, I found that the patterns and characteristics contained in the prints of all three resemble each other closely enough to indicate blood relationship. In families there is usually noted a correspondence of special characteristics amounting, in the case of a mother and son, to as much as 75 per cent, and between brother and sister to 50 per cent.

It is my opinion, based on a most careful examination of the wax prints originally submitted to me by Dr. Crandon and the prints obtained at the séance of March 21, 1927, that these prints have been made by a living thumb, that the patterns are the same in all the
prints except that some are reversed from the others, that the convex
prints were not made from any of the concave prints which I have
seen, that the prints of March 21st were not made by the thumb of
any person in the room, and that the thumb of the plaster cast carried
the same pattern as the thumb which made the normal wax impression.''

(Signed)  JOHN W. FIFE,
19 Chestnut St., Somerville, Mass.

Mr. Bell’s Report (continued)

On page 95 it is quoted “An examination of the photograph in
question (i.e., ‘Walter print’) and of the original plaster cast reveals
much of interest.’’

It does, for after careful scrutiny of these photographs, I declare
emphatically that these impressions apart from similarity of type or
pattern do not disclose any ridge characteristic data in agreement,
are not identical with each other, and therefore must be imprints or
replicas of different digits. See reversed photographs of digital mark
on Plaster Cast 11.

It should be pointed out that the reason for reversing the photo­
graphs of the cast is that the cast must show a reversal of the print
in the paraffin. A photographic reversal of the plaster print produces
a copy of the original print in the paraffin.

Having satisfied myself beyond doubt that the claim regarding the
identity of the alleged supernormal ‘‘Walter’’ and plaster-cast prints
must fail, I realized the importance of tracing, if possible, a normally
made duplicate impression of one or the other of these impressions.
Knowing that imprints of the fingers and thumbs of Margery were on
record in London I proceeded to examine them.

On examination I was at once struck with the similarity between
the plaster cast imprint and the right thumb impression of Margery.

A photographic enlargement of Margery’s right thumb print
appears on exhibit as number III.

I have carefully scrutinized the photograph of the plaster cast
impression together with the photograph of the normal imprint of
Margery’s right thumb, and have marked 18 skin ridge characteristics
on each photograph which are in agreement. I have no hesitation in
saying that the coincident sequence of ridge characteristic data found
in agreement in the plaster cast and Margery’s right thumb print
determine definitely the identity of these imprints.
Mr. Fife in his report draws attention to the very distorted appearance of the plaster print. This is true, but fingerprint experts are not easily deceived by the distorted appearance of finger impressions.

Identity of fingerprint is fixed by the type of ridge characteristics disclosed and their appearance in correct sequence.

So far as I am concerned the origin of the so-called "well known Walter print" remains a mystery for the present.

Of this I am certain, that the alleged supernormal imprint on the paraffin gloved of May, 1924 is not identical with the frequently produced and alleged supernormal Walter print, as it is claimed to be, but is identical with a normal impression of the right thumb of the medium Margery.

(Signed) W. T. Bell.

XXI.

BERT WENTWORTH
Personal Identification
44 Fourth St., Dover, N. H. Feb. 1, 1933.

B. K. Thorogood, Esq., Boston, Mass.

Dear Sir:

On careful examination I find that the plaster of Paris thumb does not belong to "M" or "C" whose prints I took Jan. 22, 1933, and it does not belong to the ones where the impressions of the whole palm and digits were impressed in wax, i.e., "W". That is it does not belong to any of the three that I have and must belong to a fourth individual.

Sincerely yours,

(Signed) BERT WENTWORTH.

XXII.

(Reprinted from Psychic Research, Dec., 1928, pp. 694-695.)

On February 6th, 1927, I received from Dr. L. R. G. Crandon, a number of fingerprint impressions made on dental wax. There were ten pieces of wax, two of which carried two prints. Examination of
each individual print revealed them to be of the same pattern. In my opinion they were impressions of a right thumb. They were of the loop pattern. In some of these prints the lines from the core flowed out toward the little finger of a right hand. To all persons familiar with finger print impressions, this type of pattern is known as an ulnar loop.

All but one of these prints were concave as though a living thumb had been pressed into the soft wax but most of them were not wholly legible. Among these prints I found one that was identical with two other clear prints with the exception that the lines of the core flowed out to the opposite side of the thumb, as though the print had been inverted. This print was convex and, because of the slope of the core, would be known as a radial loop type if it was from a right thumb.

As a finger print student, I realized that never had two prints been found to be identical in pattern but the one reversed from right to left. I also knew that if this second or convex print had been made from one of the others by pressing them together, then the second would be merely the impression of the original print, the ridges of one fitting into the grooves of the other. But none of the prints which appeared to have been made by pressing a thumb into the wax were exactly the same in form or curvature as this single print in which the pattern was reversed. I became sceptical and curious to know how such a print had been produced.

I treated these prints with white powder, in order to make it easier to photograph them, and had them photographed. A careful study of the photographs confirmed the previous examination, that one pattern was the reverse of two of the others.

On March 21st, 1927, I was present at the home of Dr. Crandon, 10 Lime St., Boston, Mass., and attended a séance during which five prints were produced on dental wax. This wax I had previously removed from a box and examined carefully. After marking the wax for later identification, I placed one piece at a time in a shallow dish containing hot water. In approximately five-minute periods, each piece of wax was out of the dish and lying on the table in front of me with a distinct print on each, which prints I later identified as being of the same pattern and having the same characteristics as the prints I had previously examined subsequent to February 6th, 1927.

One of the above prints I found to be like the convex print which I have referred to above. This print had the same pattern as the others
but reversed from left to right and, like the other convex print, could not have been made by impression from any of the prints.

Although these prints were produced in darkness, in my opinion they were not made by any living person in the room as I later examined the prints of each individual present. I was satisfied that the convex prints had not been made from any of the concave prints and yet the pattern was the same even to minute details. Microscopic examination revealed details which were entirely consistent with those of a living thumb.

My first impression of the convex print, which is incomplete in its upper portion, was that it might be a mirror image of the normal print and the photographs of the prints, taken after they had been powdered, tended to confirm this idea, but upon further study it appeared that this was a rather imperfect positive model of a thumb having the same ridge pattern and characteristics as one from which the normal negative prints had been taken. I do not attempt to supply any explanation of how this could have been done.

I then examined the plaster cast of a hand, marked May 17th, 1924, and find that the ridges and depressions are clearly marked over most of the area of the thumb but that the thumb, like the rest of the hand, is distorted. The ball of the thumb seems to have been pinched up into a ridge above the core and this gives a different appearance to the pattern in that region as compared to the wax prints. In spite of the distortion, the pattern is, in general, identical with that of the wax prints in the corresponding area. The ridge count from the core to the delta is the same and the relationship of numerous bifurcations is consistent with those of the wax prints. In spite of the peculiar distortion of this thumb I am convinced that it is the same finger print pattern as the other prints and that it proves that the convex prints above referred to are actually models of a normal thumb.

I have compared Margery's thumb prints with the ones produced by "Walter," and found her thumb prints to be of the ulnar type, and that they revealed some characteristics in the vicinity of the core that are almost identical with the ones found in the "Walter" prints. Although their prints resemble each other so far as characteristics are concerned, they are not the same identical prints. The resemblance is sufficiently close to show blood relationship.

In comparing both Margery's and "Walter's" prints with those of their mother, Mrs. Stinson, I found that the patterns and characteristics
contained in the prints of all three resemble each other closely enough to indicate blood relationship. In families there is usually noted a correspondence of special characteristics amounting, in the case of a mother and son, to as much as seventy-five per cent, and between brother and sister to fifty per cent.

It is my opinion, based on a most careful examination of the wax prints originally submitted to me by Dr. Crandon and the prints obtained at the séance of March 21st, 1927, that these prints have been made by a living thumb, that the patterns are the same in all the prints except that some are reversed from the others, that the convex prints were not made from any of the concave prints which I have seen, that the prints of March 21st were not made by the thumb of any person in the room, and that the thumb of the plaster cast carries the same pattern as the thumb which made the normal wax impressions.

(Signed) JOHN W. FIFE.

19 Chestnut St., Somerville, Mass.

XXIII.

Sitting at 10 Lime Street, February 3, 1927, 8:30 p.m. in the old cabinet.

Present: Psyche, Dr. R., Mr. Dudley, Mr. B. Bond, Mrs. R., Dr. C. (Mrs. Stinson), (Outside the circle).

Trance came on at once. “Walter” whistled and then asked to have the green light turned off. Question about sequence of evening before. He said, “You’re a poor lot of researchers if you can’t remember what happened last night. I am not going to solve your problems for you.”

Dr. C.: “Have you got your gang with you tonight?”

“Walter”: “Yes, I’ve got four with me.”

Dr. C.: “The boys here?”

“Walter”: “Yes, and two others.”

Dr. C.: “Who, if I may ask?”

“Walter”: “You wouldn’t know them. I’ve got to move this chair back to get more room for the gang to work. It’s not so easy making these finger prints. I have to have someone to hold them while I press down on the wax. You don’t think I hold it with my nose do you?”

While “Walter” talked, Psyche snored at least once. “Walter” called for water in pan. Done by Dr. C. “Walter” wanted “Kerr”
left on table so that he could put it in water when he was ready for it. Some talk about the monks and the odor of sanctity. "Walter" advised us not to get him started on the subject. Considerable discussion as to Prince and Worcester and their attitude toward this work.

"Walter": "Put in more hot water!" Done by Dr. C. Shortly about 9:00 P.M., "Walter" said, "There is the first one. I've made two on one piece. Fine!" Mr. D., "I hoped you would do that!" "Walter," "That's right, I never can get ahead of you. You're always beating me to it!" Denied!

"Walter": "Empty the water and fill it again." Done. Another Kerr on the table by Dr. R. "Walter" was asked what he used to support the paper when he was writing on the cross word puzzle Monday evening. "Walter": "I leaned it against the brimstone." "Walter" asked to have water emptied. Done. Dr. C. refilled. While doing so "Margery" moaned. When light went out "Walter" said, "You nearly broke my back that time. You hit me with the kettle. Didn't you hear the kid react?"

Shortly, he said, "This is great." Long, loud whistle. Question, "Is this the one with elephantiasis?" "Yes, that's it." He pushed it against Dr. R.'s thumb. Asked him if he felt it. Dr. R. said he did. Said it was hard. "Walter" said it was hot. "Here feel this, isn't it hot?" Dr. R., "Warm, perhaps, but not hot." "Walter": "I've got your finger-print on that one. Got you identified. I identified the mold too." (No clear trace of this on wax.) "Walter": "Cloth is stuck to wax. No, it's not on the prints. No harm done." "Walter": "Empty the water and fill it up. I'll do one more." Done. "Fix cloth in the pan, and be careful of those other prints." Done by Dr. C. "Walter": "What's the matter? You've folded those other molds into the cloth. It's lucky you didn't put them in the hot water and spoil them. You've pulled the cloth clear over to the end. Oh, well, I'll fix it. Wax is stuck to cloth, but they'll come off all right." Later he said, "It is perfect. Well I'm going now. I'm exhausted." (Voice sounded tired.)

Agreed to Saturday night test of lights. Sitting closed at 9:50 P.M.

"Margery" Séance of Tuesday, August 23, 1927, at Lime Street.

The circle proper ran, clockwise: "Margery", Bird, Pierce, Mrs. Pierce, Hutchinson (of Cincinnati), Crandon, Fife and "Margery" again. There were present in the room fourteen other persons who are fully listed in Crandon's memorandum of the séance.
Throughout the séance, save at moments when he was obliged to manipulate the water vessels, Fife had the psychic's right hand without interruption. Bird had her left throughout the séance without interruption except once when he gave it to Pierce while manipulating the scales and once when he left the room in search of apparatus. Fife throughout and Bird except one short interval, had their grips on the psychic's hands upon her corresponding knee, thereby affording a large measure of foot control.

The first act was given with the luminous basket with all control of the psychic as described. This was freely levitated, and rocked on the table. Amongst other gyrations it was hung around Bird's neck and removed. After quite a lot of this, at "Walter's" suggestion Pierce got on the floor under the table and controlled the psychic's two feet directly. Bird transferred her hand to his left and with his right reached into the cabinet to control her head. Under this absolute control of her five extremities the action of the basket continued. Bird's hand, however, having found the top of the psychic's head rather than her mouth, "Walter" insisted upon giving a repetition with Bird's hand directly over the psychic's mouth. In both these episodes levitation was excellent.

During the basket levitation the doughnut was on the table right side down. On two or three occasions it was held in a vertical position and moved freely about over a considerable area.

Articles were called for, for identification. Bird supplied two of the wooden block letters which were successfully named. Pierce supplied a handkerchief of such size as to constitute a family joke; "Walter" with unusual promptness said "Some folks might call this a handkerchief, but I would call it a tablecloth". One or two other features less identification were effected and finally Hutchinson contributed an object, making a remark or two which made it plain that it was a very tough proposition. It made a metallic sound as it was dropped into the basket. "Walter" handled it for a while and agreed that it was a tough one; presently he said that it was not one object, it was two objects together and Hutchinson agreed; and then he said after another interval that one of the objects was a match-box. He fussed for quite a while but could only say that the other was like a coin but was not a coin. The object was then passed first to Bird and later to Pierce to see what they could do with it with one hand in the dark. Bird was very confident that he would not have been able to decide that one-half
of the assembly was a match-box; but this was in fact correct according to Hutchinson. Pierce agreed with Bird here and neither of them had the remotest idea what the rest of the assembly was. In point of fact it was a safe deposit key, so assembled into the match-box that only the circular handle of the key could be found unless a very difficult task of disengagement were performed.

The voice machine was used successfully under the usual conditions, plus the fact that Pierce stood up and held his hand immediately above the open top of the U. "Walter" followed this by a series of rapid eclipses to the various sitters of the two luminous floats. Somebody rather defied him to eclipse the luminous top of the tube and he did this although no sitter could reach it without standing up.

Pierce, Twatchmann and Fifé each had a piece of marked Kerr. "Walter" announced his readiness to go on to the thumb-print episode and this was done, Fifé doing all the manipulations with the water and Bird recovering each finished print from the cold bowl. Before the thing got under way Fifé asked "Walter" if he could not produce a left thumb by way of variety. During his work on the three prints and after they had been delivered "Walter" repeatedly made remarks to the general effect that Fifé and Dudley were going to have their eyes knocked out by the results. After the séance when the three prints were examined Fifé pronounced them identical; different from the print known as "Walter's" right thumb; and consistent in form with the theory that they represented a left thumb. All sitters within reach of the table whose prints were not on file had their thumb-prints taken and none of these corresponded with the séance prints.

The last act consisted of the scales. Pierce was instructed to put four weights on one pan and one on the other, at his own pleasure. He put the four on the west pan. There was excellent dynamic levitation in several periods of red light and finally while Bird lifted the scales unit off the table to a height of about two feet the white flash was used freely together with exploration by the hands of the sitters.

Bird and Fifé reported cold breezes to an unusual degree. The psychic was in trance during the levitation, identification, and thumb-print episodes. She came out for the V. C. O. and remained out for the scales. The trance was unusually quiet as regards both voice and movement.

(Signed) Bird.
My Dear Dr. Crandon:

Your letter dated February 2d just reached me today it having been addressed to Cincinnati, and remailed from there.

Referring to the question asked I will give you as complete a résumé of the sitting in question as I remember.

On the night in question you handed to me a piece of wax, asking me to mark with a private mark, which I did. On going upstairs to the séance room, I was seated with others in the middle of the front row, opposite the table and cabinet. On the table two pans were placed with a water bottle. At my right at the table was seated Captain Fife, at my left Mr. Bird, you being seated behind Captain Fife. In one pan cold water, in the other hot water from a Thermos bottle I believe.

At the commencement Captain Fife requested "Walter" that as all thumb prints previously made were of the right thumb, could he give us the left thumb. "Walter" answered that he would see or try. I do not recollect who placed the first wax in the hot water bath, but when called upon to put mine in I reached for the pan and placed the wax in the water slightly scalding my fingers in the operation. After listening to the movements seemingly of wax in the pans, I was handed the wax by Mr. Bird and he suggested wrapping a handkerchief around it until the séance was over, which I did.

Dr. Twachtman, who was also given a wax was called upon and he, squeezing through the front row, placed his in the pan, and when told it was ready, could not get through, and it was handed to me, and I gave it to him.

On going downstairs our finger prints were taken, and the three waxes were examined by Captain Fife, Bird and Dudley. Captain Fife exclaimed, "Why these are all left thumb prints!" On examining the prints I think it was Fife said that these two are the best for photographing, and one was handed to me, by, I think, Mr. Dudley. I was very glad to have it given to me. I did not make any request for it, in fact not expecting it at all. I compared the mark, a letter H, and saw that it was the one I marked. There was no remarks of the kind suggested made to me or by me, and the one shipped to Mr. Carrington.
is the same one I received the night in question, it never having left
my possession at any time until now.

Knowing nothing of finger prints I could not say if it is right or
left, except as said by others who know.

My report to the Curtis Society, if in existence, I know will cover
the same story, as also the one I wrote to Mr. Carrington when requested.

Trusting that this will cover the matter, and anxiously awaiting the
fuller details of the matter, of which I, as yet, know comparatively
nothing, having seen only the Boston Bulletin.

My highest regards to yourself and Mrs. Crandon, I am

Yours truly,

(Signed) W. L. Hutchinson.

---

XXV.

WILBUR F. TURNER

Expert Examiner and Photographer of Questioned Documents
61 Hanover Street, Boston

Mr. B. K. Thorogood,
41 Berkeley St.,
Boston, Mass.

Feb. 15, 1933.

Dear Sir:

I have made an examination of the figures on eight photographs.
My opinion is that the figures on waxes numbered #47—#48—#10 and
other figures marked in blue pencil were written by the same person
that wrote the figures 8-23-27, #1 and #3. In fact all the figures I have
marked with a blue pencil were written by the same person.

Very truly yours,

(Signed) W. F. Turner.

W.F.T./M.T.P.

Numbers refer to individual waxes in the group of waxes shown in
Fig. 43. Also to waxes shown in Figures 51, 52, 107a and 108.
XXVI.

Preliminary Report

The undersigned at the request of the American Society for Psychical Research are making a systematic study of a recent unsigned exhibit consisting of four photographs with brief description purporting to show that the thumb impressions (made in dental compound Kerr) of the so-called "Walter" prints are identical with the ordinary ink prints of the thumb of Dr. "X".

After comparing this photographic exhibit with the actual wax impression of the "Walter" thumbs in our possession, some of which were made coincident with the wax which this photograph is purported to represent, as well as those of earlier and later dates, we find:

That all evidence at this time tends to show that the actual ink prints of the thumbs of Dr. "X" do not correspond with the authentic wax impressions in our files of the "Walter" thumbs.

Further, the classification of the hands of Dr. "X" and those of "Walter" are far from identical both as regards finger print pattern and palm pattern.

A formal report will be presented covering the complete details as soon as all facts accumulated over the long period of years can be scientifically analyzed.

Respectfully submitted,

BRACKETT K. THOROGOOD

(Signed) JOHN W. FIFE

RALPH G. ADAMS

June 8, 1932.
Listed below are some of the references used by the writer in the preparation of this report as well as some publications which contain data pertinent to the subject. The list by no means forms a complete bibliography.


Bonnevie, K. "Main Results of a Statistical Investigation of Finger Prints from 24,518 individuals." Eugenics, Genetics, and Family, Vol. 1, 1923a.


Clark and Lhamon. Anatomical Record, 1917, Vol. XII.


"Le impronte digitale in 140 criminali." Riforma Medica, 1894.


Flammarion, Camille. "'Lumen.'" New York: Dodd, Mead and Co., 1897.
Freeman, Frank N. "'The Handwriting Movement.'" Univ. Press, Chicago, 1918.
"'Personal Identification.'" Journal Royal Institute, May 25, 1888.
"'Finger-Print Directories.'" London, 1895.
Heilbronn, L. V. "'Colloid Chemistry of Protoplasms.'" Borntraeger, Berlin, 1928.
Keyser, C. J. "Concerning the Figure and the Dimensions of the Universe of Space." Science, June 13, 1913.


"The Sense of Touch in Mammals and Birds with Special Reference to Papillary Ridges." London, 1907 (known from a review in Science, 1908).


"Outlines of Abnormal Psychology." Charles Scribner, 1926.


