

PSYPIONEER

Founded by Leslie Price

Edited by
Paul J. Gaunt

Archived by
Garth Willey



EST 2004

Volume 5, No 4: April 2009

Highlights of this issue:

SPR satisfies CC – Leslie Price	105
Margery case reopened	105
Listen to a piece of history: - Mrs Miller’s Gift CD	106
Luther Colby and The Banner – Paul J. Gaunt	108
Notes by the way: White Lotus Day – Leslie Price	114
Florence was psychoanalysed – Leslie Price	116
Recent Papers: - A neglected source for Florence Marryat? Leslie Price	117
Crookes rejects Florence	118
James Stanley Grimes: – Fox séance - Paul J. Gaunt	119
Allan Kardec’s “Spirits’ Book” review- The Spiritualist Newspaper	125
Spiritualist was convicted of murder – Leslie Price	129
Please support Psypioneer – Editor	130
Books for sale	131
How to obtain this Journal by email	132

=====

SPR SATISFIES CC

See Psypioneer previous issues:

The Society for Psychical Research has provided the Charity Commission with a written account of its handling of the Stansted Donation, which has reassured them that the society obtained a reasonable return from the surplus material.

The SPR letter, which the Society has kindly released to me, gives more information about the origin of the material which passed through Stansted, how it was removed from there, and why the SPR came to give it a low financial value. (The total return from sales was about the eBay value of just one Victorian volume of *Two Worlds*.)

The SPR does not wish to publish the letter. We think this is unfortunate, as it adds important details to the published accounts.

The Society has also said that it is their consideration that the matter is now closed. It is desirable however that the Victorian volumes which have been placed out of the reach of scholars, be made accessible again. The SPR charity trustee who was able to purchase these, and then refuse all access, has not given Spiritualists cause to trust psychical researchers.

LP.

MARGERY CASE REOPENED

One of the most disputed cases in psychical research is once again being studied. The work of the Boston medium Mina Crandon caused a split in the American SPR, leading to the formation of a separate Boston society led by Walter Franklin Prince.

It has always been difficult to get a rounded picture of the case, but in 1973, a young American scholar, Tom Tietze published an overview called "Margery". However this was truncated by the publisher.

Now Tietze is revising his book, and hopes to publish a full account, using material not previously available. If you have further material or insights into the Margery case, he would be pleased to hear from you, e-mail naylandsmith@gmail.com.

It should be noted that Tietze will not be addressing the paranormality or otherwise of the case. His object is to present the story of what happened. He told *Psypioneer*.

“The story is amazing at every turn, with all the wildly hopeful characters traipsing to Lime Street from all over the world -- and that narrative is world enough for me.”

NOTE ALSO. Barry Wiley, whose work is already familiar to Psypioneer readers, is to publish an article about Margery in History Magazine, which should make it once again a talking point among American readers.

LP.

Listen to a piece of history:
MRS MILLER’S GIFT CD

Written and produced by Gerald O’Hara B.Sc.



Helen Duncan age 32

In March 2006, Psypioneer published “Ernest Oaten Makes History” - What I believe”:¹ We stated that “*on Friday, April 13th, 1934, the first broadcast talk on Spiritualism was transmitted from London. Mr. E.W. Oaten was unanimously chosen as the representative of the Spiritualist Movement.*”

¹ Volume 2.3, *What I Believe*: By Ernest W. Oaten page 59: - <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/2.3%20PSYPIONEERFoundedbyLesliePrice.pdf>

Spiritualist author Gerald O'Hara² has now made this historic speech available on CD. The disk also includes a 1937 materialisation séance with Helen Duncan, where the voices of Duncan's controls Albert Stewart and Peggy can be heard. Sitters include Ethel Miller founder of *Edinburgh Psychic College & Library* opened in 1932; college principal Catherine Allen; and Laura Culme-Seymour.

In the Psypioneer book review³ of "*Mrs Miller's Gift*" - *A Celebration of 75 Years of the Edinburgh College of Parapsychology formerly Edinburgh Psychic College & Library*, by Gerald O'Hara & Ann Harrison, it was remarked that during the research for the book a set of three 78rpm records were found of a 1930's Duncan séance, also another 3 records were found of Ernest Oaten's historic B.B.C., speech "*What I believe*". These valuable recordings have now been professionally digitally remastered and are available on one CD.

As an extra bonus "Harry Edwards Speaks" recorded in the 1960's has been added, giving a total listening time of 49 minutes.

These unique recordings bring together the Spiritualist Philosophy of Ernest Oaten,⁴ the Séance Phenomena of Helen Duncan, and the Spiritual Healing of Harry Edwards. The CD also includes an illustrated 24 page booklet of the background and transcripts of the recordings.

Mrs Miller's Gift CD is available through Psypioneer, see page 131 of this issue

² '*Dead Men's Embers*' By Gerald O'Hara @ £14.99 +Pp £2.50 (U.K.) ISBN: 978-0-9514534-6-9. See Psypioneer book review: - <http://www.woodlandway.org/PDF/PP3.1January07..pdf>

³ Volume 4.1: - <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/PP4.1January08..pdf>

⁴ I noted a misprint in the booklet stating: Ernest Oaten 1876 – 1946. Ernest W. Oaten was born at Bristol in 1875, and died on Thursday, January 3rd 1952 at the Bristol Royal Infirmary, he was seventy-seven. Information taken from *The Two Worlds* obituary dated 19th January 1952.

LUTHER COLBY

and

THE BANNER

Luther Colby was born to Naval Captain William Colby and wife Mary on October 12th 1814 at Amesbury, Massachusetts. Having the advantage of an education, 15 year old Luther Colby left school to commence his business career in the printing industry, apprenticing at Exeter, N.H. In 1836 he moved to Boston and gained employment at one of the leading daily papers of the day, the *Post*. Here he spent the next twenty years passing through every grade from composing to the editing room.

By personal investigation he became convinced of the conscious continuity of human life beyond the grave. Through the influence of a Mr William Berry,⁵ Colby attended a séance which took place in November 1856 at the residence of Mrs. Stearns, Cambridge Street, Boston. It was there he met Mrs. J. H. Conant. So impressed with her, Colby brought her to the attention of Berry who subsequently secured her for a series of weekly séances at his residence in North Cambridge, Mass.

Below⁶ is published an account of the formation of *The Banner* as told by John W. Day,⁷ one of Colby's closest associates who worked with him from the foundation of the *Banner of Light* as apprentice, compositor, reporter, assistant editor, and later as editor.

⁵ Mr. William Berry, Co-founder of *The Banner*, was First Lieutenant of the "Andrew Sharpshooters," attached to the Fifteenth Regiment Massachusetts Volunteers. He was killed at the Battle of Antietam, Md., September 17, 1862, aged 37 years. He was co-worker with Mr. Colby in the establishment of the *Banner of Light*, and continued as its business manager until he joined the service of his country in the Civil War. As a manifesting spirit intelligence he often made his presence known, and wrote through the hand of Mr. Colby frequent messages, that were of much comfort and encouragement to him.

⁶ Taken from *Biographic memorial of Luther Colby* by John W. Day, Banner of Light Publishing Co., 1895, pages 24 – 28. Printed is the full account with the exception of the removal of a poem by R. Augusta Whiting published in *The Banner of Light Appeal* of November 26, 1872.

⁷ In 1872 Day wrote the biography of Mrs. J.H. Conant, (aka Fanny Conant), who was the first medium for *The Banner's* free public circles upon their inauguration. More on Mrs. J.H. Conant and her work with *The Banner* in a latter issue.

THE BANNER IS UNFURLED

MR. BERRY was told in the winter of 1856 that he would soon change his business, publish a paper to be called the *Banner of Light*, in the interests' of the New Revelation, and be associated with MR. COLBY and others in its conduct, - all these predictions, made through Mrs. Conant's mediumship by invisible intelligences, proving historically true.

The object of *The Banner's* establishment was thus clearly *set* forth in its prospectus:

The spiritual manifestations now being developed demand a vehicle of communication which all will respect; and the faster good organs are multiplied, the better will it be for man and truth. While the world has sheets innumerable wherein are advocated the perishing interests of Time, it is important, nay, indispensable, that Truth should have its journals also-equal in point of mental and typographical merit to any-which plead and set forth the demands and developments of Eternity. . . . The *Banner of Light* has not been started without careful thought and preparation. It is in obedience to voices, nay, commands from on high, that its publication has been determined upon; and every confidence is felt that great support will be extended, from regions of Light, to render it an instrument of good to man. *We know that this must be the case, for the evidence presented admits of no doubt' or question.* In obedience, therefore, to a company on high, the *Banner of Light* is to be unfurled.

The first issue of *The Banner* was brought out at No. 17 Washington Street (old number), April 11, 1857, by a firm bearing the title "LUTHER COLBY & Co." It will be seen that the promises made to the original publishers by their invisible prompters were fully kept.

MR. COLBY, from the time of taking up the duty laid down by the spirit counsellors was, till his passage to the Higher Life, indefatigable in its every discharge.

The Banner's chief effort has always been to emphasize the fact that the mission of Modern Spiritualism is not the organization of a new sect, nor the special separation of its believers from the rest of the world by party lines, but rather to furnish a spiritual solvent, in which the existing forms of eschatological thought are to be saturated, illumination taking the place of gloom as the result. To the harmonious outworking of this early ideal MR. COLBY ever directed his energies. In the early days of the spiritual movement he was called upon for the sake and in defence of the Cause, to withstand alike the attacks of the bigoted clergymen, and the gibes of sceptical laymen; even Harvard College itself did not shrink from attempting (though vainly) the task of shutting out the new light; but he remained firm, in the face of

most trying conditions, and with the support of his spiritual coadjutors, continued at all times true to his colors.

The history of the *Banner of Light* as a bold, honest and unselfish advocate of spirit-return and communion is before the world, and can speak always for itself. Since its inauguration it has found its way all over the globe wherever the English language is known. It has experienced the usual vicissitudes incident to business life. Its original firm of publishers changed in time to BERRY, COLBY & Co.; at the period of the civil war the financial condition of the nation, generally, found its counterpart in that of this paper. *The Banner* was then issued at No. 3 1-2 Brattle Street, but business straits drove its publishers into a failure, which necessitated going through bankruptcy. Mr. Berry, after some preliminary movements, embarked on the sanguinary flood of the civil conflict, became an officer in a Salem, Mass., contingent, and fell, bravely fighting at the head of his command, at the battle of Antietam, Md., September 17, 1862.

The paper was revived, as to publication, by the late William White (then State printer of Massachusetts), and under the firm name of William White & Co.- Messrs. Isaac B. Rich, Luther Colby and Charles H. Crowell being co-partners - was continued at 158 Washington Street (old number).

The great and historic fire of 1872, which wrought such widespread destruction in Boston, burned the Parker Building, 158 Washington Street, where *The Banner* was located; and but little was left to its publishers out of the ruin save a reduced insurance, the name of the paper, and their established mercantile reputation.

Some idea of the extent of this disaster to the publishers may be gained by the following extract from the "Report of the Boston *Banner* Relief Committee" issued November 23, 1872:

Consulting with the proprietors of *The Banner*, we learn that their loss has been as follows:

Value of books burned, lowest wholesale price ...	\$26,000
Loss of composing-room.....	3,500
Loss of mailing-machine, etc.....	1,100
Loss of circle-room pictures, furniture, etc.	1,000
Loss of office furniture, safe, etc.....	1,500
Subsequent loss by fire at Messrs. Rand, - Avery & Co.'s establishment.....	2,000
Total,	\$35,100

Amount of insurance, \$20,000, of which probably thirty per cent., or \$6,000 will eventually be obtained; leaving a net total loss of about \$30,000.

This report was signed by H. F. Gardner, M.D., Chairman, Phineas E. Gay, George A. Bacon, Daniel Farrar, L. A. Bigelow, Lizzie Doten, George W. Smith, Edward Haynes, Emma Hardinge-Britten, John Wetherbee, and others of the Music Hall Society.

Through the aid of generous friends and subscribers, the stricken firm at once set themselves at work to re-issue the paper, and took temporary headquarters at No. 14 Hanover Street.

On the 26th of April, 1873, Mr. William White suddenly passed to spirit life, at the age of sixty years - from heart failure; and the paper has since been brought out under the style of COLBY & RICH.

In the autumn of 1873 the publication office of *The Banner* was removed to No. 9 Bosworth Street (then Montgomery Place), a location which had been purchased and specially fitted up for the purpose by its business manager, Isaac B. Rich. From this place it still continues to make its appearance regularly.

**The Banner for October 13th 1894 leading editorial was headed
“GONE HOME”**

“It becomes the duty of *The Banner* to announce to its many readers in every civilized land beneath the sun, the demise of its Founder and Senior Editor, LUTHER COLBY.

“No announcement of his sickness has been made in these columns, because of the direct wish of the sufferer, who, till a short time before his passage from the mortal, had the hope that the power of will, and a naturally strong constitution, would once more place him on his feet among men. It is only just to state, however, that for nearly two years past MR. COLBY has felt the depressing influence of age, and has been fain, perforce, to yield the larger portion of his former labors to younger hands. . . .

“The event which must come to all finally drew near; and at five o'clock on the morning of Sunday, October 7th, just five days before the completion of his eightieth year, he entered Higher Life from the Crawford House, Scollay Square, Boston, which had been his home for some twelve years past.

“He was cared for during his last illness of nearly two months, by Mrs. W. P. Thaxter, of Boston (wife of Mr. W. P. Thaxter of the Crawford), who exhibited to the aged sufferer all the tender sympathy and loving care which a - daughter could have displayed, though no blood relationship existed between them. We are sure that our readers-the elderly men and women, especially, who have followed MR. COLBY's work from the days of their youth-will feel to join with us in the expression of reverent thanks to this grand trance medium, who willingly closed her office and

abandoned her own special work, to smooth the path of this wounded veteran soldier of the Truth toward 'the narrow way that leadeth to the Paradise of God.'

"MR. COLBY was never married. He leaves one brother, Moses L., who, with Mr. F. F. Morrill (son of his old friend, the late ex-Senator George W. Morrill, of Amesbury, Mass.), aided by his bedside.

On Wednesday afternoon, October 10, 1894, the spacious auditorium of the First Spiritual Temple, erected by Marcellus S. Ayer, of Boston, at the corner of Exeter and Newbury Street's, was the scene of the funeral rites held in grateful remembrance of MR. COLBY'S work when in the mortal, and in respect to the physical tenement wherefrom his enfranchised spirit had arisen to the outworking of new demands upon its energies.

The Spiritual Fraternity Society, through Mr. Ayer, placed the Temple in the hands of the Committee of Arrangements; and a large assemblage of people, including representatives of nearly every form of religious belief or non-belief in the community, convened to join in the silent expression which their presence involved, that they had lost a friend, a helper, or one in whom their respect was strongly centred.

Moses L. Colby (the only surviving brother), and other relatives, were of the assemblage.

Among others in attendance were Isaac B. Rich, partner of the deceased, and Mrs. Rich ; John W. Day, editor of the *Banner of Light*, an associate with MR. COLBY for the past twenty-seven years W. N. Eayrs, foreign translator for *The Banner*; Mr. M. S. Ayer; Professor and Mrs. Longley. (I have edited many of the names due to space)

[Offerings and addresses were numerous and long, these included addresses by Dr. H.B. Storer, Eben Cobb, and Lyman C. Howe.]

At the conclusion of the exercises the congregation gazed on the remains. Disposed around the body-which was enclosed in a casket of black cloth - were the following gentlemen, who acted as pall-bearers: Isaac B. Rich, John W. Day, Charles McArthur, Moses T. Dole, M. S. Ayer, Frederick G. Tuttle, Charles F. Fay, David W. Craig, William C. Tallman, W. S. Butler and William F. Nye. The ushers were Charles T. Wood, Marshall O. Wilcox. The funeral appointments were furnished by Mr. J. Tinkham, undertaker. Mr. H. W. Pitman-associate editor of *The Banner*-made and carried out the arrangements for the funeral. The body was taken to Forest Hills, where it was cremated. Thursday, October 11th, the ashes were interred in Mrs. Conant's lot at Forest Hills Cemetery, Boston, Mass.

All the above information has been taken from *Biographic Memorial of Luther Colby* by John W. Day Banner of Light Publishing Co., 1895

The actual date to which the *Banner* continued is a little contentious., *Encyclopedia of Occultism and Parapsychology* edited, by Leslie Shepard 1991 (3rd edition) states: *Banner of Light* ceased publication after 1910.

Hartmann's Who's Who's, 2nd edition, The Occult Press 1927, gives 1910.

Katinka Hesselink.Net: Religion and Spirituality Resources – Serials List ⁸ gives 1907, incidentally this is a handy reference list.

Tragedy of *The Banner's* Treasurer Frederick G. Tuttle, who committed suicide in 1903.⁹

Fires and the journals

The Boston fire¹⁰ of Saturday and Sunday 9, 10th November 1872 devastated two leading periodicals:

The Banner, Parker Building, 158 Washington Street, Boston as articulated above

The Western Star, published monthly by Emma Hardinge Britten at 25, Bromfield Street, Boston. *Western Star* was suspended due to the devastating fire EHB writes: ¹¹

The relentless action of the Boston fires swept off amongst other ravages the warehouses and property not only of the parties who stood related to The Western Star as its proprietors and financial guarantors, but also reduced to temporary ruin a large number of its past and prospective subscribers.

It is with the deepest regret that I am compelled to announce to the friends and patrons of this magazine the urgent necessity of suspending its publication,-at least for the present,-in consequence of the heavy losses incurred by its financial supporters in the late calamitous Boston fires.

The *Western Star* was never published again by EHB.

8

<http://209.85.129.132/search?q=cache:ah4nIoov5i4J:www.katinkahesselink.net/blavatsky/articles/v15/serials.htm+Banner+of+Light+boston&cd=29&hl=en&ct=clnk&gl=uk&ie=UTF-8>

⁹ http://query.nytimes.com/mem/archive-free/pdf?_r=1&res=9B02E3DC1039E333A25757C2A9669D946297D6CF

¹⁰ <http://www.celebrateboston.com/disasters/fires/greatbostonfire.htm>

¹¹ Nineteenth Century Miracles 1883 William Britten, Manchester see pages 430 -436.

Earlier in Chicago: Religio-Philosophical Journal (1865-1905): - "Mr. Jones's publishing house was entirely consumed in the great Chicago fire of Oct. 9th, 1871,¹² His loss was very heavy, and he received nothing from insurance companies". See Pyspioneer Vol. 3.2.¹³

Paul J. Gaunt

Notes by the Way

WHITE LOTUS DAY 1986

Not many psychic pioneers have a day in the calendar to mark to mark their memory - 31 March, Hydesville day for the Fox sisters, comes to mind. Another one is Madame Blavatsky, a founder of the Theosophy Society in 1875, who is remembered on the day of her death, 8 May (1891), known as White Lotus Day.

For me the best of such days was in 1986. For many months I had followed Dr Vernon Harrison's exposure of the Hodgson report, an exposure which had begun life as a Sunday evening lecture to the (Adyar) Theosophical Society in London (of which he was not a member.) Now after numerous obstacles, it was ready for publication in the Journal of the Society for Psychical Research of April 1986, which would be slightly late. I was asked by the SPR, for whom I had done some publicity work, to draft a press release about this and a second one about another major paper in their journal.

The notice about Dr Harrison's paper was a difficult task, surrounded as it was by high emotion, a century of misunderstanding, and two organisations with a history of conflict. On the one hand, it was desirable to get some closure to the experience of unfairness and grievance on the theosophical side; on the other the SPR had no collective view. It was possible, naturally, to quote what Dr Harrison said, which was dramatic enough, beginning with his title " J'Accuse" that echoed the Dreyfus case. So too was the press release's own heading, that Madame Blavatsky was unjustly condemned, a new study had concluded. Just to see those words on SPR notepaper was hard to believe. Generations of Theosophists had lived and died under the cloud of the Hodgson report.

There were also some almost apologetic words by the SPR editor, Dr John Beloff (a Rationalist by belief) with which he had prefaced Dr Harrison's work. And an unprecedented quote from Dr Hugh Gray, general secretary of the TS in England,

¹² <http://www.encyclopedia.chicagohistory.org/pages/1740.html>

¹³ Page 34: - <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/PP3.2February07..pdf>

welcoming the paper. The addresses and phone numbers of both organisations appeared on the press release. Quite clearly, these two bodies were not hostile any more.

Professor Arthur Ellison, centenary president of the SPR in 1982, had much to do with that. A lifelong Theosophist, for a time driven to the edge of the TS by hostility to free enquiry (as he was to recall in his Blavatsky Lecture “Science, Consciousness and the Paranormal” 1998) his calm, friendly and progressive outlook was a blessing to all. The SPR was later to ask him to serve a further term as president. If this was Theosophy, they wanted more of it!

As for Dr Harrison himself, (1912-2001) he was already in his seventies when he entered the history books, but still working an expert witness in the law court. Behind his modest bespectacled manner was fifty years experience of the psychic field in the SPR, including high profile cases like Matthew Manning and Harry Price (no relation to me) and a recognised expertise in forgery, photography, handwriting and paper. He admired HPB's writings, was influenced by her thought, but somehow had been preserved from every becoming a Theosophist! Here was a loaded gun all right, but one with beneficent effects - a man of gentleness, and a lover of music, whose immaculately typed research, step by step exposed error.

While acknowledging the many years of painstaking defence of HPB by other students of her case like Walter Carrithers, it fell to Dr Harrison to fire the shot that brought the walls down. Not that all psychical researchers, or even all Theosophists, then began to regard HPB as the soul of truthfulness; but rather the balance had been redressed, and the sting had been drawn..

After fine tuning, the text of the press release was agreed by the SPR. It is common to date such releases as embargoed until a particular time. I chose the start of 8 May, being aware of what that meant to Theosophists. 101 years after the Hodgson report, and 95 years after her death, Madame Blavatsky's public reputation was released from its imprisonment by that 1885 report.

Copies of the press statement were placed in the post, airmail to distant parts. The news was largely ignored by the secular press. Some psychic papers picked it up. Then came the theosophical publications. The TS Pasadena sent out a special letter. “The Theosophist” in Adyar called for justice for Leadbeater too! Its president's letter was reprinted by many national sections. Within months Dr Harrison's name was being read and spoken in many languages.

Later in the year began a second wave, as new books included reference to the report, first as hurried footnotes. This continues, although one book “Madame Blavatsky's Baboon” managed to mention George Harrison the Beatle but not Vernon Harrison. Once I looked at a 1997 Russian anthroposophical book. Among the Cyrillic letters, in a footnote I could read, in our alphabet, Dr Harrison's name and paper.

Dr Harrison, Dr Gray, Dr Beloff, Professor Ellison - all have since been called home. Madame Blavatsky would, I think, have benevolently enveloped them in tobacco smoke. The work of vindicating her continues with attention turning to her Tibetan and Sanskrit connections. After the psychical researchers, it is time for justice from the orientalists.

For research both for and against Madame Blavatsky and other Theosophical pioneers, one turns first to the quarterly "Theosophical History".¹⁴ Among the contributors is David Reigle, whose work was featured in Psypioneer June 2005.¹⁵

An invaluable collection of his papers can be found at "Eastern Tradition Research Institute".¹⁶ In 2008 he added "Tsongkhapa and the Teachings of the Wisdom Tradition", which has an important Appendix 2 called "On Errors in H. P. Blavatsky's Writings".

LP.

FLORENCE WAS PSYCHOANALYSED

It is not widely known that Florence Marryat was analysed (posthumously) by Dr Jule Eisenbud, best known for his Ted Serios research. Eisenbud had access not only to her two main psychic books, but also to eight of her novels, and to her father's biography. His study "The Case of Florence Marryat" was published in JASPR July 1975, and reprinted in his book "Psychoanalysis and the Unconscious".

Eisenbud noted that Florence scarcely had a mother, that her father was a distant and possibly violent figure, and that family around her died more frequently than might be expected. He detected in the novels the recurrent search for the longed-for father and a number of oedipal situations. Indeed she identified with and envied the male. Her witnessed materialisations were (he suggested) symbolic reparations for her anatomical lack.

However there was one matter which could not be so easily explained - if she was a reliable scribe, why did she always refer to Crookes as Alfred, when his name was William?

LP.

¹⁴ www.theohistory.org

¹⁵ http://woodlandway.org/PDF/Leslie_Price_PP14_2005.pdf

¹⁶ www.easterntertradition.org

*Recent Papers (2) - this series began in our January 2009 issue.*¹⁷

A NEGLECTED SOURCE FOR FLORENCE MARRYAT?



1837 – 1899

Florence Marryat¹⁸ was a successful Victorian novelist and biographer – her books on Spiritualism¹⁹ also made her a witness in several important mediumship cases, especially those of Florence Cook and her friends. Georgina O’Brien Hill of the University of Chester has examined another side of her output, in an essay in the special Victorian occult issue of “Women’s Writing”²⁰ “December 2008 - see our January issue.”²¹

In “Above the Breath of Suspicion: Florence Marryat and the Shadow of the Fraudulent Trance Medium” Hill notes that in 1872, Marryat became editor of the fashionable metropolitan periodical “London Society”. In its pages, she contributed a serial “Open! Sesame!” from March 1874 to June 1875 about a man exposed to the dangers of psychic investigation. At the same time, she carried a series of articles for and against

¹⁷ <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/PP5.1January09..pdf>

¹⁸ Mrs. Ross-Church, later Mrs. Francis Lean -her parents were the novelist Capt. Frederick Marryat and his wife Catherine. Florence Marryat obituary see: - http://query.nytimes.com/mem/archive-free/pdf?_r=1&res=9C0CE4DF1230EE32A2575BC2A9669D94689ED7CF

¹⁹ *There is No Death* 1891, *The Spirit World* 1894.

²⁰ <http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/title%7Econtent=g905687724%7Edb=all>

²¹ Volume5.1 page 32: - <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/PP5.1January09..pdf>

Spiritualism, such as one in two parts by Henry Dunphy, which defended Cook and Mary Showers. It was Showers, through whom the daughter of Marryat materialised, whom she described as above suspicion.

Ms Hill concludes “The position of the female trance medium, signifying as it did the potential for a subversive form of power in which women were able to command the public space of the séance, thus came to mirror the powerful position of the female editor, who was able to use her public position to defend their cause”. (p.345)

LP.

Crookes rejects Florence’s account:

POLEMICS OF SPIRITUALISM

[We do not normally reprint material from the SPR journal, which is available to SPR members online, but hope this will be allowable for the attached note from May 1906 about Miss Marryat which is not widely known. LP]

IN the *Annales des Sciences Psychiques* for March, 1906, pp. 140-1 (English edition, April, 1906, pp. 213-14) is published an alleged account by Sir William Crookes of a very remarkable case of “dematerialization” witnessed by him with the medium Miss Florence Cook,-when the materialised form of “Katie King” stood with outstretched arms against the wall of the séance room, and in the light of three gas burners, turned on to their full extent, melted away before the eyes of the sitters, like a wax doll melting before a hot fire, till they were left staring at the vacant spot where she had stood.

Various enquiries having reached us as to the authenticity of this striking story; it may be well to state that it does not occur in any work by Sir William Crookes. It occurs, on the contrary, (as M. Sage has pointed out to us) in a book entitled *There is no Death*, by Florence Marryat [Mrs. Ross-Church] (pp. 142-3). In regard to the passage in the *Annales*, Sir William Crookes writes to us:

“As far as I am concerned there is not a word of truth in it. Nothing of the sort ever happened in my presence, in my house or elsewhere.”

It seems particularly unfortunate that in a journal where the name of Sir William Crookes appears on the cover, and in an article consisting of animadversions on the alleged inaccuracies and unscientific spirit of an opponent, the writer should have been betrayed into this unlucky confusion between testimony offered by Sir William Crookes and that offered by Miss Florence Marryat.

JAMES STANLEY GRIMES

1807 – 1903

“Modern spiritualism originated at my lectures in Poughkeepsie, N. Y., in 1843”

Little historical attention has been given to Grimes; although he was generally against spiritualistic phenomena, he did have significant dealings with the early mediums. We have previously published his account of Andrew Jackson Davis in December 2007, “*Origin of Modern Spiritualism*” also for information on Grimes please refer to this issue.²²

I noted in the December 2007 issue that Grimes “... *claimed he was the first to publish an expose of the Fox Sisters, claiming that Mr Greeley requested him to give the expose to the Tribune* ²³ *for publication in 1850*”. This was published²⁴ in the *Tribune* on 9th, 17th, and 26th of July.

Republished below²⁵ is his interesting account of an early Fox séance, which he attended in 1850: -

.....the Fox family exhibited themselves in New York city, at Barnum's Hotel: admission, one dollar. I was in the city at the time, and, in a conversation with Mr. Greeley, related my experiences, and stated what I knew of the origin and character of the rappers. Mr. Greeley, though he did not agree; with me, that the whole thing was a sheer imposition, was a good deal interested in my statements, and requested me to give them to the Tribune for publication. I consented, and did so, only suppressing the names and residences of the parties.

I believe, that this was the first expose that had ever been made of the rappers, and it produced a considerable sensation.

The same day that I published the expose, I went, at *Mr. Greeley's* request, to see the Fox girls at Barnum's Hotel, with an understanding, that, while I tested their powers, I should not exhibit any signs of skepticism. On the door of the exhibition room was

²²Volume 3.12 page 267: - <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/PP3.12December07..pdf>

²³ Horace Greeley (1811 – 1872) founded the New York *Tribune* which first appeared 3rd April, 1841, and which he was to edit for over 30 years. Use search engine for Horace Greeley: - Psypioneer News <http://www.woodlandway.org/>

²⁴ Notes Chapter 9 note 1, *Talking to the Dead* by Barbara Weisberg, HarperSanFrancisco, 2004.

²⁵ Pages 373 – 376 inclusive, “*The Mysteries of Human Nature explained by a New System of Nervous Physiology,*” to which is added, *A Review of the Errors of Spiritualism, and Instructions for Developing or Resisting the Influence by which Subjects and Mediums are Made.* Published by R. M. Wanzer, Buffalo 1857.

posted a handbill, notifying visitors, that they must conduct themselves as in a religious meeting. On entering, I found about a dozen persons waiting for the performance to commence. No one recognized me, and I, therefore, found myself at liberty to act the part of a believer. I won the good will of the rapping sisters at once, by quietly rebuking a newspaper reporter for manifesting an uncivil degree of skeptical zeal, in examining the feet of one of the girls, to see if she used them to rap the table. I seriously reminded him of the band bill on the door, and further suggested the danger of offending the spirits, and thus preventing their manifestations. A man in the corner of the room expressed his approbation of my remarks, so decidedly, that I at once inferred that he was one of the managers of the show.

When all were ready, and each one seated at a large table, the spirits refused to communicate with any one but me, and it was, therefore, evident, that I was one of their favorites! I drew from my pocket a paper, on which I had previously written several test questions. The first question was answered correctly by raps, which seemed to me to be made on the floor, or table-leg, by the feet of the girls. I was asked if the answer was satisfactory. I hesitated; when the man in the corner interposed again, and said, that he thought the answer had not been understood by us correctly, but that it should be the reverse of what we had understood it to be; and requested us to repeat it, and let the spirits have a chance to correct the error, if it was one. I, of course, readily acquiesced, and, sure enough, the spirits reversed their decision and gave the answer wrong. This little incident led, me to look upon the man in the corner, as “a power behind the throne;” a kind of prime minister, who, by signs, advised the girls what raps to make. When all my questions were answered, and I had declared that the answers were satisfactory, the girls called upon some of the other visitors to ask questions; but the man in the corner proposed, that my paper should be first read for the gratification of the company. I declined, until the girls joined in the request. I then read it, and stated that every answer was erroneous; one question was, who is governor of New York? and, from a list of names, one of which was that of the actual governor, the spirits selected old *Dr. Jacob Townsend*. The reading of the paper produced a hearty burst of laughter, and the whole company perceived in an instant; that the spirits were “sold.” The girls were much irritated; the eldest, in particular, expressed herself in terms, any thing but spiritual. The man in the corner then inquired; whether I meant to publish an account of these proceedings? I answered, “Yes, I do.” He then asked my name; I gave it, and, in return, was informed, that the man in the corner was *Wm. Fishbough*, the same person who was once the scribe of *A. J. Davis*.

The next day, I published a detailed account of the affair, in the *Tribune*, and this same *Mr. Fishbough* answered it, and accused me of falsehood, and misrepresentation. Several other spiritual scribes and scribblers attacked me at the same time; but I made no reply to any of them. I had denounced a gross imposition, and it was to be expected that I should be abused in return.

This transaction having brought me before the public, as the opponent of modern spiritualism, I afterward lost no opportunity of witnessing the manifestations. I have traveled all over the country, and lectured on the physiology of the nervous organism,

in the places where the Spiritualists “most do congregate.” I have spared no pains nor expense to make myself thoroughly and practically acquainted with the subject. The result of my investigations is the conclusion, that:

1. The rapping, table-moving, and other physical manifestations, never take place without muscular agency.

2. The rapping noises, when made in answer to questions, so as to indicate intelligence, are always produced by some living person, with the design of deceiving.

3. The moving of tables, in spiritual circles, is always produced by juggling, or, involuntarily, by credence mesmerism.

4. A mesmerized person moves a table, just as any one else does, except that he does it unintentionally; and sometimes exerts extraordinary strength, when he sincerely declares, that he exerts none at all.

5. Speaking and writing mediums are, when honest, in no respect different from other mesmerized persons, and can produce no more, nor higher, manifestations.

6. There have been no phenomena nor manifestations exhibited, in public nor in private, under the name of spiritualism, which a skillful operator can not, publicly produce by the mesmeric art.

7. Almost all the published accounts of spiritual phenomena are, more or less, erroneous; even those which appear to be the best authenticated, are, when severely scrutinized, adulterated with just enough of exaggeration and untruth to produce a false impression, and mislead those who confide in them.

I was unable to find the original 1850 New York *Tribune*²⁶ articles by Grimes, but did manage to find the article printed in full below, this was published in *The Janesville Gazette*, Janesville, Wisconsin, on Thursday September 5th 1850.

²⁶ *The Spirit Rappers*, by Herbert G. Jackson, Jr. Published by Doubleday & Company, Inc, 1972. On page 73, there is a letter “esposed” (exposed ?) which was published in the New York *Tribune* by J.S.Grimes. There is no date given, Jackson refers to Grimes as John Stanley.

More about the knockings

J.S. Grimes writes another letter to the Tribune to which he shows how such things may be and are done.

The question is asked by almost every one, how do you account for the phenomena of the knockings? First, how are the noises made? - Second, by what means do they sometimes answer questions correctly? In regard to the manner in which the noises are made,

‘How shall we reason but from what we know?’

We must consider that the very existence of the whole deception depends upon the concealment of the means by which the noises are produced, and, there are, therefore, the strongest inducements for both collusion and ingenuity to avoid exposure, especially while the hoax is a fruitful source of revenue.- I have witnessed three exhibitions of the knockings, by three different sets of performers, and I can speak as a witness in regard to two of them, that I know precisely their *modus operandi*.-In the first instance I extorted a confession from the chief sybil, and an exposure of the concealed machinery. (See my IID letter of July 9.) In the second case, there was probably no machinery to expose, but the rapping was so awkwardly done that no confession was necessary. I actually saw one person rap the table when he thought I did not notice him.

In regard to the third case at Barnum’s Hotel, I only remained about an hour to witness it, but that was sufficient to satisfy me – 1st. That the noises are made by means which are concealed beneath the frocks of the performers.-2d. That several who pretend to be impartial inquirers are employed as confederates. 3d. That they can produce no noises under circumstances in which a skilful juggler cannot do the same. If I hold a board in my hand they can make no noise on it. 4th That their whole success depends upon that respect for the female sex which prevents an examination of their persons. 5th. That whenever they submit to be examined by ladies, they have confederates to make the noises for them in other parts of the room. 6th. That when they are so rigidly scrutinized that deception is impossible, the ‘Spirits’ refuse to rap at all and the company is told that if they have not gotten their dollar’s worth it cannot be helped, for the spirits are beyond human control.

On the occasion to which I refer, the ladies seated themselves upon the sofa and drew the table toward them; one leaned forward upon the table, with her heels under the sofa; another put her feet and dress in contact with the legs of the table; a third sat at the end of the sofa, free from the table. There was now a rapping heard. Where? Of course it was under the sofa-against the table used on the floor-under the ladies, and nowhere else. When the ladies stood on the floor, six feet from the table, they failed to raise the spirits that could rap the table or the sofa – yet they rapped the floor continually, but always under themselves. Surely it needs no spirit but that of mechanical ingenuity to perform such a simple trick successfully, when modesty and decency forbids investigation. One young man, while I was present put his head under the table when he heard the noise

there, and peeped about (like Tom of Coventry) with a laudable desire for information concerning the hidden things of the spiritual world. But his thirst for knowledge him so far that Mrs. Fish turned upon him and poured forth a torrent of eloquent indignation, the energy of which would have done honor to Mrs Kemble as Lady Macbeth.

The next question is, by what means do they answer questions correctly? I answer, by denying that they can answer any better than any one else. - They never answered me correctly in a single instance. But I am told that in some cases they have answered truly, when no human being knew what answer to make. I deny that they have ever done so, except in cases where it can be explained as an accidental co-incidence. Among so many trials as they make, it is to be reasonably expected that they'll occasionally guess a right; any shrewd person could do the same. Many of the questions are of such a nature that there is nearly as great a probability-on the lottery principle-of guessing right as wrong. I know that they have paraded the statements of various persons before the public to prove that they have used the alphabet in their peculiar manner, and actually spelled out the names of persons known only to the inquirer. One gentleman declares that he asked fifty questions, and that they were all answered correctly, though no one but himself knew anything of the matter. Another gentleman is told that he has lost so many children, and their names and ages are given to him correctly. I can easily understand that some honest but weak-minded persons may be led to suppose that Mrs. Fish is a stranger to them and their family affairs, while through her confederates she has learned their whole history, and is thus enabled to astonish them by her spiritual rappings. But I cannot understand that she can succeed without such assistance. If any man declare that those women have answered his mental questions, by the alphabet correctly, without any collusion or deception, I do not hesitate to say that he has been hoaxed, or that he is guilty of deliberate falsehood. I am sorry to say that I have known several persons who generally speak the truth, but who thought it no harm on their subject to astonish their friends with wonders that had no foundation in reality. I have also seen many other whose credulity was prolific in marvellous stories. They do not mean to tell injurious falsehoods, but they seem incapable of confining themselves to the regions of reality. I wish to avoid the necessity of pointing to particular personal instances of misrepresentation on this subject, and I will therefore, endeavor to accomplish my object by proposing a method by which the spirits can be proved to be as deficient in perceptive powers as any of their credulous worshippers, thus: I will write down 24 questions, the true answers to which will be yes or no; I will number the questions and call them by their numbers, and if they will give three fourths of the answers correctly I will engage that they shall receive \$100. Again I will write down the names of 24 citizens of New York, and seal the paper, and if they will by the alphabet, give me one of the names, I will engage that they shall receive \$200.

Mrs. Fish protests that her own mind has nothing to do with the rapping, but that the spirits perceive for themselves and rap for themselves, the rapping being in the center of the wood, and not on the surface. Take a door, and cover it with mattresses and stuffing, and then let the raps be heard from its woody fibres, even when she is in contact with it; or let me hold a plain door up, and let that be rapped. Write down a list of names, and move your pencil in the usual manner from one name to another and let her rap the answer; then place yourself where neither she nor any one else can see you when you

move your pencil, and let the spirits rap, and depend upon it you will not get any sense answer. You will find that the spirits see with mortal eyes when they see at all.

Respectfully,

J. STANLEY GRIMES.

P. S. - Since writing the preceding, I have been induced to make some experiments which led to the following suggestions;

Sound is an effect produced on the mind by certain vibrations of the air.-When a rap is made upon a door or table the vibration, instead of proceeding directly from the spot rapped to the ear, sometimes proceeds along the door from one part of it to another and then thro' the air to the ear, so that the mind is deceived as to the place where the rapping is made. The knocking spirits avail themselves of this natural fact to produce the deceptive effect which they desire us to consider supernatural. – Let me prepose an experiment which I doubt not some of your readers will amuse themselves try trying. First, read the account of the rapping on the door as given in the *Home Journal* in the elegant style of Mr. Willis. The spirits on this occasion were requested to rap the upper part of the door, and Mr. Willis placed his hand against the door and actually felt the vibrations at the place indicated at the same time the company all heard the sounds.

The experiment is as follows: Assemble a number of people who are well endowed with powers of imagination and introduce three ladies who are said to be attended by spirits that manifest themselves by knocking. Now propose to the spirits to rap against the upper part of the door; to satisfy the skeptical let the ladies stand three feet from the door and get a committee of six appointed to stand three on one side of the door and three on the other to guard against collusion; but get yourself or a friend appointed on the committee; then when all eyes are directed to the top of the door, rap against it just below the middle, and you will find that excepting yourself the whole company will be ready to swear that they heard and felt the vibration at the top of the door and those on each side of the door will suppose that those on the other side rapped the top of the door.

The truth is that if you do not know what part of the door is to be rapped you cannot tell by listening nor by holding your hand against it. The same is true of a table.

Let a company sit around a table and place their hands upon it and listen while one unseen raps one of the legs, or any other part, the company will disagree as to the place where the rapping is made.

I have repeatedly tried this experiment within a few days, and often where the rapping was made by the toe against the leg of the table near the floor, the listener declared it was made against the leaf in the middle of the table.

In the next issue: -

Significant confusion has arisen in regard to the 1848 Hydesville haunting; this confusion is primarily due the statements of Mrs. Margaret Fox, although not by her own doing...

Hippolyte Léon Denizard Rivail

Better known under the pseudonym of

Allan Kardec

1804-1869

Introductory Note by Psypioneer:

In November 2008²⁷ we published Aksakof's research²⁸ into the historical origin of Kardec's book, *Le Livre des Esprits (The Spirits' Book)* This article prompted a response from Dr. Moreira-Almeida in the January 2009²⁹ issue.

February 2009³⁰ we published Anna Blackwell's response³¹ to Aksakof's research (Blackwell had translated *Le Livre des Esprits* into English in 1875) and then in March 2009³² we published the response of P. G. Leymarie, editor of *La Revue Spirite*.³³

In this issue we publish a further article centered on *Le Livre des Esprits (The Spirits' Book)*. a review of Allan Kardec's, *Spirits Book* that appeared in *The Spiritualist Newspaper*³⁴ October 8th 1875. The review is unsigned but is presumably by its founder editor W. H. Harrison.

²⁷ Volume 4.11 page 253: - <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/PP4.11November08..pdf>

²⁸ *The Spiritualist*, August 13, 1875

²⁹ Volume 5.1 page 29: - <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/PP5.1January09..pdf>

³⁰ Volume 5.2 page 55: - <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/PP5.2February09..pdf>

³¹ *The Spiritualist* August 27, 1875

³² Volume 4.3 page 93: - <http://woodlandway.org/PDF/PP5.3March09..pdf>

³³ *The Spiritualist* October 8, 1875

³⁴ I have throughout this series referred to *The Spiritualist Newspaper* as simply *The Spiritualist* to which it later changed.

ALLAN KARDEC'S "SPIRITS' BOOK"

OPINIONS relating to reincarnation, which have struck root among such a large number of intelligent and conscientious Spiritualists in France, are entitled to most careful and respectful attention, and the subject is all the more serious because of the attempt to introduce the doctrine into this country, by the recent publication of Allan Kardec's *Spirits' Book* in the English language. Miss Blackwell is right in saying that the work should be judged only upon its own merits, without bringing in any side issues or party scandals. Whether Allan Kardec ever had anything to do with the Jesuits or not is beside the question so long as he moots a sound philosophy; moreover, we have no hesitation in saying that the book contains internal evidence that it is written conscientiously, and that the advocates of the doctrine are, at much self sacrifice, trying to introduce it into England in the belief that its tenets are calculated to benefit mankind at large.

We admit that the *Spirits' Book* ought to be reviewed upon its own merits, and that no side issues should be dragged in, so, after studying the work, and after having had the advantage of many conversations on the subject with the chief advocate in England of Allan Kardec's doctrine, the task is now undertaken, after long and deliberate consideration, of criticising the book upon its own merits.

The chief feature of the method of argument in the book is, that it is exactly the reverse of ordinary scientific procedure in dealing with any truths new or old. A scientific thinker, lecturer, or writer, first collects a great mass of facts and has fierce battles with opponents over nearly every one of those facts, so that a certain number only pass through the fire, and are admitted both by friend and foe to be true and unanswerable. After this preliminary work, which may occupy the time of half a generation, a very few conclusions are drawn from these indisputable facts, which it is impossible to deny. Allan Kardec, in his book, reverses this process. He gives us more than 400 pages of closely-printed assertions, with scarcely a solitary fact to prove any one of them, and the few facts he does mention are open to grave question in the matter of reliability. Thus the *Spirits' Book* is pre-eminently a theological and not a scientific work; its readers must accept its statements on the ground of authority, or because in their own minds they think that it explains certain problems of life which had never been so clearly elucidated on any other hypothesis.

For instance, they may think that a second career upon earth, accumulating fresh experiences, is a more rational and just future for man than an inane heaven or a merciless hell. They may also think that, in accordance with the utilitarian principles permeating God's universe, men should not quit this earth until they have exhausted all its possibilities; that is to say, until they have gained all the experience which earth life is capable of giving. But all this, whether it be considered alluring or not, is apart from the question of the actual truth or error of the doctrine. The Ptolemaic system of astronomy, which assumed the earth to be a flat plain, worked well for a long time, and while it was in vogue even the motions of the stars were accurately ascertained and could

be predicted, just as if the theory were a true one. In those days it must, therefore, have seemed unanswerable, yet because its facts were wrong, it fell to the ground when more knowledge was gained by men.

There is a serious responsibility in mooting any new doctrine on insufficient grounds. At the present time there are many persons who have been trained in narrow minded theological sects, and late in life have discovered the teachings stamped upon their minds from their youth upwards, to be in some respects at variance with the truths of nature. The result has been the deepest affliction, heart-troubles which prey upon their minds for years. The more external features of the uprooting of old-established false doctrines, are equally powerful, strife and contention among large masses of people being the result. Scientific education would do much to check the number of unproved speculations which are regularly floated upon the public mind.

An experimentalist, for instance, makes two or three discoveries in connection with light; he finds that a single theory appears to thread them together, consequently it commends itself to his mind as affording a resting-point where before all was chaos. He next sees that though his speculation appears to be true, its value is proved or disproved by a particular experiment; he spends a month or two in fitting up the apparatus, he expends a considerable amount of money; he thinks over the coming experiment by day, and dreams over it by night, until its final trial proves that his apparently promising theory is false. He then probably has to spend a year or two and make many other failures before he reaches the true explanation. The hard rubs thus given to promising speculations by experience, make him very cautious in accepting any new theory. The scientific teacher considers it a reprehensible thing to give to his classes any half-formed speculations, which apparently serve to explain some dozen or two facts, but are not proved, for, as the late Professor W. Allen Miller once said, in effect, to his hearers at the Royal Institution,—"I will not tell you the hypothesis supposed to explain these facts, and which is now a source of contention among scientific men, for I know how difficult it is to eject theories from the brain after they have been once implanted there."

The reverse of this line of action is the characteristic of Allan Kardec's book. He advances numberless assertions in the most authoritative manner, without deigning to give an atom of proof. Some of the disciples of Allan Kardec say that reincarnation is a matter of revelation; that the spirits must know best, and that those spirits who do not teach the doctrine are of a lower order, less intelligent than the others. If the authority of supposed spirit teachings is appealed to, we, who have attended probably more *seances* with different mediums than anybody in Europe, emphatically pronounce such a position to be most unsafe. Practically speaking, the doctrine has not, up to the present time, been taught through any medium of any kind residing in England, and those doctrines which have been taught here have usually (with a few striking exceptions) been strongly coloured by the opinions of the medium, or those of the sitters; in short, it may be laid down as a general principle that about ninety per cent. of spirit messages contain more of the thoughts of the medium than of the thoughts of the communicating spirit. This takes place unconsciously to the medium, of course. Where many messages professing to come

from different spirits through the same medium have been published, critical examination nearly always shows repetition of the same phraseology in the different messages.

We have a book before us now in which all the spirits, good, bad, and indifferent, are addicted to the profuse use of the word "lovely." We know full well that if the reincarnation doctrine should be agitated in England plenty of spirits will begin to teach it, the reason being that the minds of the various mediums will be set buzzing by the arguments on the subject mooted by persons around them, after which there will be plenty of spirit messages about reincarnation. The prevalence of the teaching of this doctrine by mediums in France, may be attributed to the circumstance that the sitters at the circles expect such teachings, and the minds of the mediums are full of them; therefore it is very instructive, in a scientific sense, that this doctrine should have spread so much among mediums on the Continent only, and not in England, since it shows how much the opinions of mortals colour the messages, and gives a warning to the public to be cautious about placing implicit reliance upon spirit messages.

The foregoing arguments have little or nothing to do with the truth or error of the doctrine of reincarnation, they merely attempt to show that not one tittle of evidence of its truth is contained in Allan Kardec's book, that the book is of a theological and not of a scientific order, and that it requires to be accepted, if accepted at all, upon authority, a plan which will hardly succeed, except in Roman Catholic countries, where the minds of men and women are more subject to authority. If the contents of the work should ever cause contention in England it will be a pity, for that contention will be of a theological order, with no common ground or fixed data to which to appeal. The only good which could come out of any further public discussion of its contents would be to confine the arguments to the facts on which the doctrine is alleged to be based, namely - that high and good spirits teach it, and that the said teachings during transmission were not coloured by the thoughts of the mediums, or by those of the members of the circle present; thus, at all events, some interesting information about manifestations will be brought out, and as facts will be dealt with instead of assumptions, any space given to the examination thereof will not be wasted.

Apart from the subject of reincarnation there is much that is interesting in Allan Kardec's book about problems which perplex Spiritualists, but the work displays a considerable amount of inexperience as to the real nature of mediums, manifestations, and spirit messages. That the words "Spiritualist Philosophy" should be printed on the back of the book is unjust to English Spiritualists, because they have not accepted it as such, therefore cannot approve its being laid before the general public under that guise without their consent. As a translation it is excellent, displaying great literary ability, and as a specimen of book-printing it does great credit to Mr. Trübner and Messrs. Ballantyne and Company.

Allan Kardec and Spiritism will continue in the May issue.

SPIRITUALIST WAS CONVICTED OF MURDER

Readers of the old Psypioneer web site may recall a news item from July 2000 which began as follows:

AUSTRALIAN HISTORIAN WILL STAY IN JAIL

Andrew Fitzherbert of Brisbane, author of an important survey of the literature of palmistry published by Scarecrow Press, has lost an appeal against his conviction for murdering the lady president of the Cat Protection Society.

The case had been compared by the press to an Agatha Christie mystery, not least because of the several suggested motives for the crime, but after some months DNA blood evidence linked Fitzherbert to the scene. In his appeal, Fitzherbert had argued that the DNA evidence had been manipulated to frame him.

Fitzherbert was a well-known figure in the local New Age community, active in a Spiritualist church. He was known to frequent second hand bookshops.

Fitzherbert is one of the handful of people seriously interested in theosophical and related history. Soon after the quarterly "Theosophical History" was founded, he privately drew attention to the Praed papers as a neglected Australian source.

Readers may wonder what has happened in this case since 2000.

- 1) there is a web site campaigning for his release- www.andrewfitzherbert.info..
- 2) there is a book about the case *Five Drops of Blood: Murder in the Cat Protection Society* (New Holland Publishers, Aus. \$24.95) by criminologist Professor Paul Wilson and Dianne McInnes (see the review on line in the Courier Mail July 26 2008)³⁵
- 3) a lawyer acting for Fitzherbert , Laura-Leigh Cameron-Dow, of Slater & Gordon, unsuccessfully petitioned the Queensland Attorney-General for release of crime scene materials so independent testing could be done. Ms Cameron-Dow said technology for DNA analysis had advanced since 1998, making it possible to obtain readings from blood samples at the murder scene which were not possible a decade ago.

³⁵ <http://www.news.com.au/couriermail/story/0,23739,24065494-5003424,00.html>

Ruth Bennett from the campaign told Psypioneer:

“The palmistry guild has offered to pay for samples to be tested but so far the Attorney General won't release the samples for testing.” LP

**PLEASE
SUPPORT PSYPIONEER**

Since the launch of Psypioneer Newsletter by Leslie Price in 2004, Psypioneer has grown considerably with its world-wide free subscribership during the last 5 years, becoming Psypioneer Journal this year.

The total running costs are met by the editorial team; the monthly research is a labour of self interest, and dedicated to the Psychic Pioneers.

Psypioneer would be most grateful for any donations of Books or Journals, (we pay the postage costs) to further our researches, or financial gifts to help purchase new material and the general running costs of the free journal.

Also, buying books through us helps!

Payments by PayPal please use: - paulgaunt01@aol.com

By post cheques payable to: -

P.J. Gaunt
6, South View,
Prixford,
Barnstaple,
Devon EX31 4DY
U.K.

BOOKS FOR SALE

Please e-mail psypioneer@aol.com for details

MRS MILLER'S GIFT CD: Written and produced by Gerald O'Hara B.Sc. @ £9.99 +Pp £2.00. *CD and Book £20.00 Inc U.K., postage, elsewhere (airmail) £22.95 Inc postage.

'Helen Duncan - The Mystery Show Trial' By Robert Hartley @ £12.50 + Pp ISBN: 978-0-9553420-8-0.

See Psypioneer 3.11: - <http://www.woodlandway.org/PDF/PP3.11November07..pdf>

'The Cathars and Arthur Guirdham' **Published by Psypioneer** @ £4.50 Inc U.K., postage, elsewhere (airmail) £4.95 Inc postage. ISBN: 978 0 9536719 3 9.

See Psypioneer 4.4: - <http://www.woodlandway.org/PDF/PP4.4April08..pdf>

'Aquarian Evangelist: The Age of Aquarius as It Dawned in the Mind of Levi Dowling' By John Benedict Buescher @ £14.50 – incl. U.K. postage.

See Psypioneer 4.1: - <http://www.woodlandway.org/PDF/PP4.1January08..pdf>

'Mrs Miller's Gift' - A Celebration of 75 Years of the Edinburgh College of Parapsychology formerly Edinburgh Psychic College & Library' By Gerald O'Hara & Ann Harrison @ £7.50 + Pp ISBN: 978-0-951-4534-9-0.

See Psypioneer 4.1: - <http://www.woodlandway.org/PDF/PP4.1January08..pdf>

'Dead Men's Embers' By Gerald O'Hara @ £14.99 +Pp £2.50 (U.K.) ISBN: 978-0-9514534-6-9. See Psypioneer book review: -

<http://www.woodlandway.org/PDF/PP3.1January07..pdf>

'Six Lectures on Theology and Nature' By Emma Hardinge first published in 1860. **Re-Published by Psypioneer** @ £14.95 + pp. ISBN: 978-0-9556539-0-2

See Psypioneer 3.6 issue: - <http://www.woodlandway.org/PDF/PP3.6June07..pdf>

'Magical Spiritualism - a warning address given in 1878 to mark thirty years of Modern Spiritualism', Andrew Jackson Davis. Published May 2000 by Psychic Pioneer Publications, this is a small booklet 7pp £2.00 incl. U.K., postage (please add 20% for airmail).

'The Mystery of Stainton Moses an address given in 1992 on the centenary of his death' Leslie Price Published December 1999 by Psychic Pioneer Publications, this is a small booklet 8pp £2.50 Inc U.K., postage (please add 20% for airmail).

'Occultism and Spiritualism – a book review by, Stainton Moses originally published under the pseudonym M.A. (Oxon). Published 1999 by Psychic Pioneer Publications, this is a small booklet 10pp £2.50 Inc U.K., postage (please add 20% for airmail).

All three Psychic Pioneer Publications £6.00 Inc U.K., postage (please add 20% for airmail).

How to obtain this free Journal

The Psypioneer journal is at present available, complete with all back issues on the web site <http://www.woodlandway.org> and we are greatly indebted to our Australian friends for hosting and posting this Journal. You can obtain it free and direct by sending an e-mail entitled "Subscribe" to psypioneersub@aol.com or "Unsubscribe" to discontinue.

To contact Psypioneer please e-mail psypioneer@aol.com

Paul J. Gaunt
