

*Return to High R. Redden  
Sydney Lodge, King's Hall*

# The Theosophic Voice

An Independent, Unofficial Journal, Published in the Interests of the  
American Section of the Theosophical Society

FOR THEOSOPHY AND FOR AMERICA!

**For Theosophy:** "Its creed is loyalty to truth and its ritual to honor every truth by use."—H. P. B.

**For America:** "With malice toward none, with charity for all, with firmness in the right as God gives us to see the right!"—Abraham Lincoln.

---

---

CHICAGO, ILLINOIS, MAY, 1908

---

---

"When we in our study of human history, endeavor to gauge the moral force and greatness of a people or race, we have but one standard of measurement—the dignity and permanence of their ideal and the abnegation with which they pursue it."—Maeterlinck.

## ANNOUNCEMENT

The policy of "The Theosophic Messenger," the official organ of the American Section of the Theosophical Society, as determined by the new administration inaugurated in September, 1907, is, in the opinion of many American members, in direct opposition to the best interests of the Society. Protests against this policy have been lodged with the General Secretary of the American Section without effect. The publication of such protests has been definitely refused, notwithstanding the fact that "The Messenger" has heretofore always accorded the privilege of expression to all phases of opinion. It is granted that the official organ of the Section must of necessity be distinctly biased by the views of the Executive. That also has been the case heretofore. It is not admitted, however, that "The Messenger" belongs exclusively to the party in power. In view of the fact that no word of protest has been granted place in our official organ, many American F. T. S. feel they can no longer depend upon it for a correct exposition of the views of the Section as a whole. It has seemed right and proper therefore to provide an organ which shall meet this deficit.

There are various respects in which the policy of "The Messenger" is not acceptable to many members of the American Section, but the most serious disagreement has grown out of the admission of Mr. C. W. Leadbeater as a contributor to "The Messenger" and as editor of the "Question and Answer" Department of that journal. We protest against this relationship of Mr. Leadbeater to "The Messenger" as improper and unwise, it being, in our opinion, distinctly prejudicial to the best interests of the T. S. in general and of the American Section in particular. The result of the referendum vote now being polled, cannot in any way affect this contention. Even if the majority of votes cast, should be in favor of the publication of Mr. Leadbeater's writings in "The Messenger," we hold that it is most reprehensible to force such an issue in the American Section. If those who have cried so loudly for peace are sincere, there is a curious inconsistency in their present course. A less radical policy might have mitigated somewhat the present strained conditions in the Section; the present line of action is fatal to anything like harmony. Greatly as we desire this prolonged and bitter conflict to cease, we recognize that there is something vital to the Theosophical Society to be achieved before peace may be honorably accepted. We mean the settlement of the great moral issue out of which the present conflict has arisen.

In this little independent, unofficial journal which we now introduce to friends and opponents, space will be allotted to such views as are barred from "The Messenger" under its present system of censorship. The Editor takes pleasure in announcing that *The Theosophic Voice* enters the lists untrammelled by allegiance to any sort of orthodoxy. If the appearance of what may be regarded as a "party organ" in the American Section is to be in any sense deplored, its founders feel that the responsibility for this outcome rests upon those who have made such an initiative the only thing compatible with the principles for which the protesting members stand.

### AFFIDAVIT

State of New Jersey, |

ss.

County of Somerset.

Eleanor M. Hiestand-Moore, of full age, being duly sworn, according to law, on her oath says:

That the Extracts from Mr. Leadbeater's letter to Mr. Fullerton (P. 6) constitute part of a letter dated Shanti Kunja, Benares, India, February 27, 1906, of which a certified copy is in her hands and that she has seen the original of this letter bearing Mr. Leadbeater's own signature;

That the Extracts from the Report of the London Hearing (P. 8 et seq) are absolutely in accordance with a copy of the stenographic report of that Hearing officially circulated;

That none of the letters or documents herein printed have been altered in any way save by ellipsis as indicated and that these ellipses do not in any way change the original meaning of the text from which they are taken.

(Signed) Eleanor M. Hiestand-Moore.

Sworn and subscribed to before me at Somerville, N. J., on May 20, 1908.

Edward P. Johnson, Jr.,

Master Court of Chancery of New Jersey.

### THE VOICE ENDOWMENT FUND

In the opinion of the founders of "The Theosophic Voice," its establishment for the time being as a regular monthly journal would be desirable. "The Voice" will at present appear only as the situation throughout the American Section T. S. seems to demand its services and as the extent of the financial endowment of the journal permits. The enrollment of one hundred members who will contribute one dollar per month would launch this little journal upon a career of uninterrupted prosperity and allow for the free distribution of a considerable number of copies abroad. The subscription price of "The Voice" will be one dollar per year without regard to the frequency of the issues. The journal will be supported by voluntary contributions of money apart from the stipulated rate of subscription. If you are in sympathy with these aims, we shall be very glad to place your name upon the list of contributors to the endowment fund. If your means will not permit you to subscribe thus generously, we shall be grateful for any contribution you may make and if you are entirely unable to assist "The Voice" financially, we shall still be grateful for an expression of your sympathy and co-operation.

### THE TIMBRE OF THE VOICE

"The Theosophic Voice" is established as a protest against autocracy, lax morals and superstition. It will oppose attempts to compromise with wrongdoing in the interest of "harmony." The gravity of the present situation in the Theosophical Society stultifies the loud appeals for peace uttered, for the most part, by those who are willing to let the great issues we have lately made, rest without settlement. "The Voice" represents an element in the American Section which would rather see the Theosophical Society disintegrate than compromise the high ideals which have hitherto determined its course. Our faith in the Theosophic Move-

ment is so great that we believe the destiny of that Movement does not depend entirely upon the rise or fall of any organization. We believe that the Life of the Society is forever destined to outlive its various Forms which will "come and go, like the Universes." The concern of every member of the T. S. should be to keep the organization "pure and unspotted from the world" rather than to temporize with evil in the pursuit of power and public favor. Compromises such as this have been made before by those who shirked the consequences of an open confession of weakness and the outcome of these compromises is well known to students of ecclesiastical history. The Theosophical Society has been and is still inexpressibly dear to us, yet we realize that its existence as a form is of no greater importance than the existence of any other form which under the Great Law is foredoomed to pass away and give place to other forms adapted to the changing needs of the World-scheme. No plea for peace on account of expediency can have much force with men and women who recognize the Law "which makes for righteousness." The theosophist must learn soon or late to look serenely on while all that is dear to him is swept beyond his immediate reach by the tide of evolution. It is no easy thing to stand as Krishna bade Arjuna stand, free from hatred or personal desire, steadfast and strong, with sword drawn against the foes of one's own household. Yet this we must all learn to do no matter at what cost to ourselves, and it is such a task "The Theosophic Voice" has undertaken.

Principle can never be rightly sacrificed to expediency nor can an excess of sympathy for an individual be permitted to warp one's judgment of his faults, if the science of ethics is to have any stability. Judgment is simply the adjustment of the balance of Mind. Its exercise lies at the root of all discrimination and to annul it would entail paralysis of the moral sense and an atrophy of conscience. "The Voice" repudiates the sophistry that our individual responsibility can be modified by that evanescent subjective thing we call our "motives." It does not believe that we may justly do evil in order that good may come. It is opposed to the degradation of theosophic ideals under any pretext and demands that no one shall be permitted to be a standard-bearer in the Theosophical Society whose life is not a testimony to the sincerity of his or her convictions. It is opposed on general lines to the subjugation of independent thought and the rehabilitation of the anathema for heresy, yet it contends that where the will of the individual is opposed to the interests of the state, the free exercise of that will must be restricted, since anarchy in morals is at the present stage of evolution an injurious principle.

The columns of "The Voice" are dedicated to Truth. Its founders do not favor any secession movement within the American Section. They believe that the reformation of the T. S. should go on from within outward rather than in the contrary way.

"The Voice" appeals to all those who are opposed to the present trend of executive action in the Section, to maintain a continued resistance such as becomes the true Kshatriya. We shall contend for principle, yet endeavor to avoid vindictive warfare against personalities, intemperate speech, injustice, inaccuracy and prejudice. On matters of vital interest to the T. S., "The Voice" will speak with fearless candor and endless reiteration. It will be, in a word, a true expression of the American spirit that promoted its establishment the exponent of a wholesome individualism and of independent thought along such lines as make for the development of character, for the growth of mind and morals and for spiritual enlightenment.

The editorial management of "The Theosophic Voice" has been delegated to Dr. Eleanor M. Hiestand-Moore whose earnest desire is to make this new organ a dignified exponent of independent opinion throughout the American Section. To accomplish this aim, the Editor will rely largely upon the sympathy and co-operation of many of the most active accord with the sentiments of "The Voice" to regard it as the champion American members and a cordial invitation is extended to all who are in

of their cause. Its pages will be open for the free expression of personal views along the lines indicated, though the Editor reserves the right to decline such articles as tend to prolong an aimless controversy and are not consistent with the policy of the journal. "The Voice" frankly declares itself to be the organ of those who protest against the policy of the Section executives and as such it declines to represent the views of the administration party which are accorded ample space in the official organ of the American Section now devoted exclusively to their use.

### THE HOLBROOK BUDGET

The circular issued by Dr. Van Hook immediately before the Convention last September, was of such a nature as to prepare the American members T. S. for the "Open Letters" in the Holbrook Budget. In that circular, after bombarding the prosecution with adjectives such as "stupendous," "Satanic," "Jesuitical," "wanton," "spiteful," "impish," etc., and according to Mr. Jinarajadasa, as well as to Mr. Leadbeater, the honor of a title duly capitalized as are the titles of Divine Men, Dr. Van Hook characterized the effort of the American officials to depose Mr. Leadbeater, as a sight "to make angels weep!" By the Quixotian code behind this anathema, we, of the prosecution, are guilty of "aiding the enforced retirement and disgrace of this Arhat," C. W. Leadbeater! All of this buncombe, strange to say, has erupted notwithstanding the fact that the retirement of the "Arhat" in question has the sanction of the very "mahatmas" elsewhere invoked with fanatical enthusiasm (q. v.). In this connection, we beg leave to call the attention of our readers to Colonel Olcott's letter of apology to Mr. Leadbeater which is printed in this issue.

Now comes a fresh outburst of polemics which, in view of many things makes us deeply regret that our General Secretary should become addicted to the habit of explosive language. Both Dr. Van Hook's and Mr. Warrington's "Open Letters" are intemperate, illogical and, we regret to say, recklessly untruthful. Evidently neither gentleman can be well-informed as to the facts of the Leadbeater case else they would not intentionally hazard statements susceptible to a direct refutation. The Holbrook and Kunz communications have no bearing upon the issue, since the charges against Mr. Leadbeater were made not upon sanitary, but upon moral grounds. For Mr. Warrington's position, it would be difficult to find an adequate explanation. In extenuation of Dr. Van Hook's course, we must remember that this gentleman has been a member of the T. S. only a few years; that he has all the zeal of a recent convert and that he is apparently ignorant of many details of the political history of the T. S. since H. P. B. died. No one equipped with complete evidential data would have rushed into print with statements such as are embodied in these "Open Letters" with absolutely no basis except enthusiasm and credulity.

The "Open Letters" are characteristic Leadbeaterian missives, the detonations of whose invective tend to divert attention from the main issue. It would be a waste of time to take up a controversy such as the Holbrook Budget seems to invite. Such a policy moreover is not in line with the purpose of "The Theosophic Voice." The only proper reply to all of these wild and groundless statements, is a citation of Mr. Leadbeater's own utterances and this we have made elsewhere in the present issue. There is, however, one statement made by Dr. Van Hook (in his first "Open Letter") which illustrates plainly the inaccuracy already referred to. This statement is of a nature too serious to be entirely ignored.

On P. 4 of the "Holbrook Budget," the author refers to the apparitions at the Colonel's bedside, "which," he declares, "were witnessed by Mrs. Besant" etc., etc. This is untrue. Mrs. Besant stated (See "Theosophy in India" and elsewhere,) that she was not present when the apparitions manifested. She said, however, that she had subsequently communicated with the Master and that the result of this "communication" confirmed her nomination to the Presidency as reported in the Russak-

Olcott "conversations". We noted this fact with emphasis because Mrs. Besant said in Chicago last September, at a question meeting, that we who doubted the identity of these apparitions, were without any basis for an intelligent opinion, since we were not at Adyar and had not seen the apparitions! Yet, according to her own statement (q. v.) this disqualification applied also to herself!

There are many other misstatements made by both Dr. Van Hook and Mr. Warrington doubtless owing to lapses of memory or an honest ignorance of facts. It would have been better, we thin, not to have rushed into print until the authors of such curiously mixed invective and eulogium had determined the reliability of their data.

#### LEADBEATER'S TEACHING AS DEFENDED BY HIMSELF

The following extract is from a certified copy of Mr. Leadbeater's letter to Mr. Fullerton (Shanti Kunja, Benares, India, Feb. 27, 1906). The Editor of "The Voice" has seen the original letter over Mr. Leadbeater's signature. After describing at length the difficulties attendant upon the advent of puberty in males, Mr. Leadbeater says: "\* \* \* Now all this may be avoided by periodically relieving that pressure (sic) and experience has shown that if the boy \* \* \* at stated intervals \* \* \* he can comparatively easily rid his mind of such thoughts in the interim and in that way escape all the more serious consequences. I know this is not the conventional view, but it is quite true for all that (and there is no comparison between the harm done in the two cases (cp. Prostitutes vs. Onanism, Ed.) even at the time—quite apart from the fact that the latter plan avoids the danger of entanglement with women or bad boys later on (Italics, Ed.) \* \* \* although I know that many people do not agree with this view, I am at a loss to understand how anyone can consider it criminal \* \* \* (Italics, Ed.). A doctor might advise against it, principally on the ground that the habit of occasional relief might degenerate into unrestrained self-abuse (Italics, Ed.); but this danger can be readily avoided by full explanation, etc., etc. \* \* \* Having thus explained the general position, let me turn to the particular cases cited. \* \* \*"

At the close of this letter there is a foot-note in which he refers to a statement of his own (quoted against him) concerning "the necessity of purity for aspirants to occult development" and as to "the fact that (for a certain stage of it) one life without even a single lapse is required."

"It is of course obvious," Mr. Leadbeater wrote, "that the lapse mentioned meant connection with women or criminal relations with a man, and did not at all include such relief \* \* \* as is suggested in the body of my letter," (q. v.).

After a perusal of the foregoing extracts, it would seem quite unnecessary to contend against the claim that Mr. Leadbeater's teachings were given only to boys "in the grip of evil," for he himself states that he considers his system a good one under all circumstances!

#### THE REFERENDUM VOTE

The outcome of the referendum now being polled, will probably not represent the true status of opinion upon the issue, no matter how the balloting may result. Many of the protesting Loyalists have resigned from the T. S. and many have experienced such a paralysis of hope and courage that they are disinclined to any action and refuse even to cast a ballot. This is most unfortunate. From our point of view it would be well worth while to apply for reinstatement in the T. S. if for no other reason than for the privilege of casting a ballot upon the matter of the referendum. Those who have by a hasty resignation from the T. S. forfeited their franchise, have lost their chance of defending the honor of the American Section. Of those who wilfully neglect the opportunity to vote on this issue when they have a right so to do, we can hardly speak with tolerance. It is obvious that every supporter of Mr. Leadbeater will register his or her vote without fail. It will be most

deplorable if those who think "No," should lose the opportunity to voice their sentiments which the present referendum affords.

### DOCUMENTS IN THE LEADBEATER CASE

To the Readers of "The Theosophic Voice":—

In view of the Referendum vote now being polled, I feel that no member of the American Section T. S., has a moral right to information which influences his or her decision unless that information be made equally accessible to all members.

An honorable deference to the accepted standards of fairdealing has prevented the publication of certain documents which have an important bearing upon the question of Mr. Leadbeater's offence. The course pursued by Mr. Leadbeater's adherents has been such however that I consider it would now be wrong to refrain any longer from presenting to the American members T. S. certain evidence at hand. I feel that I am released from all obligations to withhold the documents herein submitted. No one except myself is involved in this decision and on myself alone rests the responsibility for this action. None of the former officials of the American Section T. S. have authorized the publication of these documents or excerpts. I have not consulted any of them concerning this purpose. I wish to emphasize especially the fact that neither Mrs. Dennis, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Knothe nor Mrs. Davis were aware of my intention to print these documents and extracts. The direct evidence against Mr. Leadbeater, including the incriminating letters, is for obvious reasons withheld. Some important parts of the testimony at the London Hearing are also omitted because they are unfit for publication. The matter here published is, however, I believe, a complete substantiation of the principal charge made against Mr. Leadbeater. The extract of his letter to Mr. Fullerton (q. v.) contains a plain statement of his views and constitutes irrefutable evidence that his "teaching" (sic) was not designed only for the special cases of boys "already in the grip of evil," but was a system which he considered should be—and probably was—generally applied.

Yours fraternally,

ELEANOR M. HIESTAND-MOORE

### EXTRACTS

(The charges preferred against Mr. Leadbeater by the Executive Committee of the American Section T. S., Ed.)

"First. That he is teaching young boys given into his care habits of self-abuse and demoralizing personal practices.

Second. That he does this with deliberate intent and under the guise of occult training or with the promise of the increase of physical manhood.

Third. That he has demanded, at least in one case, promises of the utmost secrecy. \* \* \* (Here follows the direct testimony, Ed.)

Extracts from the Stenographic Report referred to by Mr. A. W. Warrington.

"Meeting called by Col. Olcott to discuss certain charges against Mr. C. W. Leadbeater, held at the Grosvenor Hotel, Buckingham Palace Road, S. W., on Wednesday, May 16th, 1906, at 5 p.m."

"Present: Col. H. S. Olcott, Mr. Burnett as representative of the Executive Committee of the American Section, Mr. P. E. Bernard as representative of the Executive Committee of the French Section, and the members of the Executive Committee of the British Section, namely, Mr. Sinnett, Dr. Nunn, Mr. Mead, Mrs. Stead, Miss Ward, Miss Spink, Mrs. Hooper, Mr. Glass, Mr. Keightley, and Mr. Thomas. Mr. Leadbeater was also in attendance and present at the first part of the meeting. Col. Olcott took the chair and asked Mr. Glass to act as Secretary of the meeting.

"Col. Olcott, I have called you together to act as an advisory board

in the matter before us. The matter is to listen to charges against Mr. Leadbeater of having systematically taught boys the practice of self-abuse. You have read the documents. Among them is a partial confession of Mr. Leadbeater, and rebutting evidence. The Executive Committee of the American Section would have expelled the accused, but he is not a member of their Section. They therefore appealed to the President-Founder to help them and sent a representative of the Section. The accused being a member of the London Lodge of the British Section, and holding the office of Presidential Delegate, and the appeal being made by the Executive Committee of a Section it acquires an importance which prevents me from leaving the matter in its ordinary course to a Lodge. I have therefore asked the Executive Committee of the British Section to assist me. The French Congress Committee having cancelled Mr. Leadbeater's invitation to act as Vice-President of the Congress, I have asked them to send a delegate to be present. So that we may avoid the least appearance of unfair play I have asked Mr. Leadbeater to attend the meeting. I will call upon the American and French delegates to read their credentials.

"Mr. Burnett then read the following:

"Extract from minutes of the Executive Committee American Section T. S. held in N. Y. C. on April 13th, 1906.

"Resolved that the Commissioner appointed by the Executive Committee of the American Section T. S. in the C. W. Leadbeater case be and hereby is instructed, authorized, and empowered as follows:

"First. That he go to Europe forthwith, taking with him documents containing charges and evidence against C. W. Leadbeater and personally lay them before the President-Founder and the Lodge or Lodges of the T. S. of which the accused is a member, and ask that they be acted upon immediately; said Commissioner giving all the assistance in his power to bring the matter to a speedy and final issue.

"Second. That he shall also place in the hands of the General Secretary of the British Section T. S. a copy of the said charges and evidence with accompanying documents for their information, asking his aid and that of the President-Founder in bringing the matter to an early and satisfactory conclusion *without unnecessary publicity*, (Italics mine, Ed.) so that the good name and well-being of the T. S. movement and of the T. S. may thereby be safeguarded as far as possible.

"Third. That the said Commissioner shall report progress by cable and by letter from time to time to the General Secretary, and on the termination of his mission shall submit to the Executive Committee a full and final report in writing of the same.

"It is understood and agreed that there is nothing in the foregoing instruction to the Commissioner that he will (Ellipsis in Report as printed, Ed.) in any way interfere with his using his best judgment when, after consultation with the President-Founder, a somewhat different method of procedure should be decided upon."

(signed) ALEXANDER FULLERTON, Gen. Sec'y

(In the extracts that follow the names of the questioners are omitted and the letter Q. substituted in all instances except when Colonel Olcott spoke. No other changes in the text have been made. Editor.) \* \* \*  
Extract:

"Olcott. Of course you know that the executive power is vested in me. You are here to advise me and to hear what Mr. Leadbeater has to say, and to act according to your judgment after hearing him. A resolution should be passed calling upon me to do so, and I should follow that if there was nothing in my mind against it.

"(The charges which have been already in the hands of the Committee were taken and read.)"

Extract:

"Mr. Leadbeater was then called upon to say what he wished."

Mr. Leadbeater referred to his letter to Mr. Fullerton and followed up his remarks in this way:

Extract P. 3.

"Leadbeater. \* \* \* So far as I am concerned, what I said is exactly all I can say, except that, if I were to elaborate, I could bring more reasons for the action.

"Of course I am aware that the opinion of the majority is against that course. They would regard things I look on as worse as much less objectionable. The only point in my mind is that I should assure you that there was no evil intent. I was simply offering a solution of a serious difficulty. It is not the common solution but to my mind it is far better than the common solution, but I do not expect that you should agree with me. The point is that the Society wishes to clear itself from all connection with that view. The Society is correct in taking that ground if that is the opinion of its representatives. \* \* \* Since this has come forward, it would be undesirable that I should appear before the public" (Italics mine, Ed.) \* \* \* (Here a brief discussion followed).

Extract:

"Question. \* \* \* we ought to have Mr. Leadbeater's resignation read before anything is done." \* \* \* The following letter of resignation was read:

Extract:

London, May 16th, 1906.

"The President-Founder of the Theosophical Society.

Dear Colonel Olcott: In view of recent events, and in order to save the Society from any embarrassment, I beg to place in your hands my resignation of membership.

Yours as ever,

(signed) C. W. Leadbeater." \* \* \*

\* \* \* \* \*

"Olcott. Mr. Leadbeater, you admit that it was your practice to teach certain things?

(No reply to this question is given. The following question appears to have been an interruption. Editor.)

"Question. I should like to know if Mr. Leadbeater definitely admits the accuracy of the copy of his own letter to Mr. Fullerton and the original letter to Mrs. Besant.

Leadbeater. To the best of my knowledge and belief. I have somewhere the draft which I drew up of the letter I sent. I am not in a position to certify but I believe it to be a true copy."

(A discussion followed after which Mr. Leadbeater reviewed the evidence at length. Referring to one of the letters submitted in evidence, he said as follows:

"Leadbeater. \* \* \* There is part of the letter which I wrote to him, (Italics mine, Ed.) and you will see that the advice given is along the lines I have been telling you, and that should be evidence that the reason I gave for speaking is the correct one. It is a matter of curiosity of course, but I was going to ask how that document was obtained as it was torn up and thrown away.

Q. It was found intact in a discarded garment—in the pocket.

\* \* \* \* \*

"Q. You admit giving the advice to more than two boys?

Leadbeater. You are to take it that the same advice was given to several.

Q. How many? Twenty altogether?

Leadbeater. No, not so many."

\* \* \* \* \*

"Q. The second charge reads: "That he does this with deliberate intent and under the guise of occult training or with the promise of the increase of physical manhood." The evidence of these boys says nothing about applying to him for help. I want to ask whether this advice was given on appeal or not.

Leadbeater. Sometimes without, sometimes with. I advised it at times as a prophylactic."



"Olcott. Since he did not want the boys to tell their mothers he would I should think shrink from telling Mrs. Besant.

Q. I would like to ask Mr. Leadbeater in view of the fact that he is *compos mentis* why he did not inform the fathers, before he took any of these boys, what his practices were, that the fathers might have had the opportunity of consulting with the mothers. It has been said to me by every mother, and mothers not in these charges, that if they had known he had taught these practices he would never have had the boys.

Leadbeater. I don't understand all this talk about concealment. If asked about the thing I should not have hesitated in speaking.

Q. The talk is because all the world condemns it but Mr. Leadbeater, so far as my knowledge is concerned. \* \* \* I asked your friend Dr. ——— in Chicago if he had ever seen it advised. He had never advised it and had never known it to be advised. You are flying in the face of the whole world and why then did you not tell the boys' parents?

Leadbeater. I wish I had. But one does not talk of these things."

\* \* \* \* \*

"Q. Since Mr. Leadbeater was teaching these boys to help them in case of need, considering that men may be in the same difficulty, has he ever taught this to any grown-up man? Has he taught the same thing in the same personal way to grown-up men as to children?

Leadbeater. I believe that at least on two occasions in my life I have given that advice to young men as better than the one generally adopted.

Q. Since you came into the Society?

Leadbeater. I think not, but one case might have been. You are probably not aware that one at least of the great Church organizations for young men deals with the matter in the same manner.

Q. Do you deliberately say this?

Leadbeater. Yes.

Q. What is its name?

Leadbeater. I am not free to give this. I heard of the matter first through it.

Q. Mr. Leadbeater states then that there is an organization of the Church of England which teaches self-abuse?

Q. Is it a seminary for young priests or a school?

Leadbeater. It is not in a school, but I must not give definite indications.

Q. Is it found in the Catholic Church?

Leadbeater. I expect so.

Olcott. I know that in Italy Garibaldi found many terrible things.

Q. This last statement of Mr. Leadbeater's is one of the most extraordinary things I have ever heard. It is incredible to me that there is an organization of the Church of England which teaches masturbation as a preventative against unchastity. I ask, what is the name of this organization?

Leadbeater. I certainly should not tell.

Q. I understand that it is an organization pledged to secrecy and I take it that Mr. Leadbeater received his first information from this organization.

Leadbeater. I suppose it would have been better if I had not mentioned it. \* \* \*"

When the members of the Advisory Council voted upon what disposition should be made of Mr. Leadbeater's case, six voted for his expulsion and six for accepting his resignation. After a long parley it was agreed to permit Mr. Leadbeater to resign from the T. S., Colonel Olcott having cast the deciding vote. The report continues:

Extract:  
 "(Mr. Leadbeater was then called in and the resolution accepting his resignation was read to him by the President).

Olcott (To Mr. Leadbeater). There is a desire to avoid publicity. It will have to be printed in "The Theosophist."

Leadbeater. May I make a little suggestion? You will understand

that I am not thinking about myself but about the Society. Suppose I make an announcement. Many people will write to me and to other members and it will be as well that we have some stereotyped form of reply.

Olcott. How would you suggest doing it?

Leadbeater. I was going to ask your advice—perhaps, saying over my signature that I had resigned and that the resignation was accepted—I don't know how to put it but I don't want to have a fuss about it.

Olcott. Write down your idea on paper. \* \* \* I should like to ask Mr. Leadbeater if he thinks I have acted impartially?

Leadbeater. Absolutely. If you should consider later I can do anything, let me know.

Q. Do you mean to continue this course of teaching?

Leadbeater. Seeing there is such a feeling on the matter by people whose views I respect, I do not. \* \* \*

The meeting was then brought to a conclusion."

#### COLONEL OLCOTT'S LETTER OF APOLOGY TO MR. LEADBEATER.

This letter was sent to America as part of the campaign material for use at the time of the recent Presidential election. It was placed in the Editor's hands with no defined object, but all of those to whom it was originally given, understood that it was an instrument for the promotion of a better feeling throughout the Section. Inasmuch as this letter gave very direct evidence of Colonel Olcott's apparent recognition of the identity of the Adyar apparitions and settled by a "mahatmic" fiat the question of Mr. Leadbeater's culpability, yet conceded a point to his defenders, this letter was thought to be a very effective agent in the promotion of harmony. Not all of the members have seen it and it is of a peculiar interest at the present time. In view of the authenticity of this letter and the fact that we are urged to accept without question the utterances of the Adyar apparitions on other matters, we wonder—very naturally—how the recent attempt to deny Mr. Leadbeater's culpability can be reconciled with the statements of the "Mahatmas" as herein reported by Colonel Olcott? The letter runs as follows:

Adyar, Jan. 12th, 1907.

My Dear Charles:

The Mahatmas have visited me several times lately in Their physical bodies, and in the presence of witnesses. As my life seems to be drawing to its close, They have wished to discuss with me matters They desired arranged before it was too late.

They asked me to set right the dispute between you and Annie concerning the glamour question, and I enclose what They said about the matter, and which Mrs. Russak took down at the time. I am glad to know that it was no glamour, for I have already felt she (Annie) made a mistake in saying that it was.

Concerning the other matter about the disturbance your teachings have caused, both Mahatma M. and Mahatma K. H. assured me you did well to resign; that it was right to call a council to advise upon the matter, and that I did right in accepting your resignation; but They said we were wrong in allowing the matter to be made so public, for your sake and the good of the Society. They said you should have stated in your resignation, that you resigned because you had offended the standard of ideals of the majority of the members of the Society by giving out certain teachings which were considered objectionable.

Because I have always cherished for you a sincere affection, I wish to beg your pardon, and to tell you before I die, that I am sorry that any fault of judgment on my part should have caused you such deep sorrow and mortification, for I should certainly have tried to keep the matter quiet had I not thought it would have reflected on the Society if I did so.

I feel sure that the Blessed Ones are striving to calm the present turmoil and hold together our Society from dividing against itself, and I

also feel sure that you will be called upon to help, and to forget the self for the good of the whole.

There is nothing I think that would tend to quell the present turmoil so much (and I should die happy if I knew you had done it), as for you to bow to the Will of the Divine Ones behind the Movement, and save the situation. Certainly Their wisdom is your law as it is ours, and They have told both Annie and myself that your teaching young boys to relieve themselves is wrong. I do implore you from my deathbed to bow to Their judgment in the matter, and make a public statement that you will, and that you will give Them and us your solemn promise to cease giving out such teachings.

It might be that if you did this, the Masters would open the path of reconciliation to the Society, and you could take up the great work which you were obliged to give up, because you unwisely placed yourself in the position of being unable to defend yourself against charges that gravely offended the accepted moral standard of your country, thus bringing upon the Society you loved a great blow which shook it to its foundation, because you were so universally loved and respected.

Once more, my dear friend, I beg you to consider what I ask.

With all good wishes, yours sincerely,

(Signed)

H. S. OLCOTT.

#### INTER-STATE THEOSOPHICAL SOCIETY.

In view of irreconcilable differences upon the question of Mr. Leadbeater's relation to the Theosophical Society and the present trend of executive policy, a division in the New York Theosophical Society occurred at the beginning of the year 1908. Those Loyalists who had protested against the pro-Leadbeater movement and had from the first contended against the destructive course to which the Society is now committed seceded from the New York Theosophical Society and organized a new branch called the Inter-State Theosophical Society. The charter members of this new branch were Grace Shaw Duff, Alexander Fullerton, Margaret B. Hawley, Margaret J. Hoey, Lionel Homburger, Henry Hotchner, Maurice Hotchner, Maria A. C. Knothe, Frank F. Knothe, Adeline H. Leighton, Margaret M. Leighton, David Levy, Alexander V. Morgenstern, John O'Neill, Ida Perrin, Esther Phillips, Martha Pulkhinen, Jennie Smith, Alice L. M. Wheeler, Rida Johnson Young.

Close upon the issuance of a charter to this new branch, the following circular statement was made:

New York, February 1st, 1908.

"The undersigned F. T. S. are convinced of the great importance of emphasizing at this time their protest against the tendency in the Theosophical Society to blindly sacrifice principle to personality, and to express their opposition to the evident purpose of many to minimize and speciously explain away moral laxity. They have therefore resigned their membership in the New York T. S. and have formed another lodge in the American Section, to be called the Inter-State T. S.

It is the avowed object of this Branch to affirm that a true and enduring nucleus of the Universal Brotherhood must rest upon sound morality and a proper regard for the rights of others, and to uphold moral principle as a basis for individual conduct. Each applicant for membership must declare his assent to these principles. These requirements are intended to debar only those indifferent to moral ideals, and will not exclude the so-called "sinner" who has shown willingness to desist from wrongdoing.

The Inter-State Branch deems it of the highest importance to keep alive in the Society the foregoing principles. It invites to membership F. T. S. throughout the Section who wish to co-operate in this movement,—those who are isolated from any Branch, or those who are not in accord with the prevailing sentiment in their local Branches.

Members living out of New York City will pay Two Dollars (\$2.00) a year as dues, \$1.00 of which goes to the American Section. Such non-

resident members will be kept in touch with the activities of the Branch through a Correspondence Committee.

The Inter-State Branch will establish headquarters near the poorer section of New York City, the aims being to present the practical essentials of Theosophy where most needed, and to stimulate the members to giving, rather than encourage the desire for continual getting. Methods will be devised to give congenial and practical occupation to every member who is alive to the opportunities for service.

The scope of this work will be limited by the financial support rendered. Therefore, members who are interested are earnestly requested to donate to the extent of their ability.

Those desiring further information are cordially invited to address

FRANK F. KNOTHE,  
President.

Ridgewood, N. J.

or (MISS) M. M. LEIGHTON,  
Secretary,

435 West 123rd Street, New York City."

Here follow the signatures of the charter members.

The Inter-State Theosophical Society is now established at 250 W 14th Street, New York, in very attractive quarters, with a large reading and lecture room and a resident member in attendance every afternoon and evening, except Sundays. Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Knothe and Mrs. Duff have contributed a collection of books on Theosophy. The Inter-State T. S. has established very friendly relations with the Lenox Avenue T. S. and an interchange of lectures has resulted in the growth of much good feeling. Mr. Henry Hotchner has returned to New York and will make that city hereafter his residence. His services will no doubt be available for the upbuilding of the new branch along its chosen lines. The membership of the Inter-State T. S. is now thirty-five and the large attendance of inquirers and visitors promises well for its future growth. The President, Mr. F. F. Knothe, has sent to the Editor of "The Theosophic Voice" a copy of the requirements for membership in the Branch, which are as follows:

#### INTER-STATE T. S.

As this Branch has been formed in protest against that element in the T. S. whose tendency is to blindly sacrifice principle to personality, and in opposition to the evident purpose of such members to minimize and speciously explain away moral laxity.

Therefore each applicant for membership in this Branch shall declare it to be his endeavor to uphold moral principle as a basis for conduct, and to recognize that a true and enduring nucleus of the Universal Brotherhood of man must rest upon sound morality and a proper regard for the rights of others.

These requirements are intended to debar only those who are indifferent to moral ideals, and would not exclude from membership the so-called "sinner" who has shown willingness to desist from wrong-doing.

Each member agrees that should he cease to hold these principles, he will at once relinquish membership in this Branch; this, not necessarily involving the loss of membership in the Society itself.

I hereby accept, and agree to abide by, the foregoing conditions.

(Signature) \_\_\_\_\_

The Inter-State T. S. has our best wishes for its success. We hope it may have a long and active life in its chosen field of usefulness.

#### A CHANGE IN THE POLICY OF "THE VOICE."

In the prospectus issued in February, 1908, the proposed policy of "The Theosophic Voice" was defined along lines altogether different from those laid down in the issue now before our readers. We had not originally intended to take up an aggressive warfare, but to devote ourselves rather to the defence of our principles along general lines. The present change in policy has been precipitated by the publication of the

"Holbrook Budget." If any of our subscribers are not in sympathy with this change we will, on application, refund the amount of their subscriptions. The original policy will be resumed, if "The Voice" becomes a permanent institution.

#### CONCERNING MR. LEADBEATER.

In December, 1907, the Editor of "The Voice" issued a circular protest against opening the columns of "The Theosophic Messenger" to Mr. C. W. Leadbeater, a copy of which protest was sent to the President of The Theosophical Society.

The letter printed below was Mrs. Besant's reply to this circular.

THEOSOPHICAL SOCIETY,  
Adyar, Madras,  
27, 1, 1908.

Dear Madam:

I beg to acknowledge the receipt of your circular letter of December, 29th, 1907.

I am sorry that you intend to carry on an organized opposition, but you are within your right, and I am bound to suppose that you consider it your duty to do so. It is possible that your view may be modified by the statement which will appear in the February number of "The Theosophist."

There is one thing which perhaps you should consider before beginning a renewed attack on Mr. Leadbeater. Hitherto his friends have not defended him by a statement of the facts of the case, for he has desired, and still desires, to shield the boys concerned. But if his assailants renew the attack and strive to blacken him further, it may become necessary to drop this merciful silence, and to let the world, so misled by the statements publicly made, know the facts hitherto concealed.

Sincerely yours,

ANNIE BESANT,  
P. T. S.

State of New Jersey, |  
County of Somerset, | ss.

Eleanor M. Hiestand-Moore, of full age, being duly sworn according to law, on her oath, says that the foregoing letter is a true copy of a letter received on or about February 27th, 1908, from Annie Besant, P. T. S., in answer to the circular therein mentioned.

Eleanor M. Hiestand-Moore.

Sworn and subscribed to before me at Somerville, N. J., on April 28, 1908.

Edward P. Johnson, Jr.

M. C. C. of N. J., U. S. A.

Comment upon this communication is hardly necessary, since the basis of its main contention, expressed more fully in the February "Theosophist," is shown to be erroneous by extracts from the documents in the Leadbeater case which are published in this issue of "The Theosophic Voice."

#### SOME OLD LETTERS OF MRS. BESANT'S.

##### I.

The following letter from Mrs. Besant appeared in "The Theosophic Messenger" in April, 1904. We consider it a fitting reply to those who have cried out so loudly against the monstrous presumption which dares to question Mrs. Besant's fallibility on any point:

Benares City, Feb. 17, 1904.

"My Dear Friends:

I am told, on what ought to be good authority, that there is a growing

tendency in the T. S. in London to consider me as a "sacro-sanct personality, beyond and above criticism."

Frankly, I cannot believe that any claim so wild and preposterous is set up, or that many know me so little as to imagine that, if it were set up, I would meet it with anything but the uttermost condemnation. Even a few people, holding and acting on such a theory, would be a danger to the Society; if any considerable number held and acted on it the Society would perish. Liberty of opinion is the life-breath of the Society; the fullest freedom in expressing opinions, and the fullest freedom in criticising opinions, are necessary for the preservation of the growth and evolution of the Society. A "commanding personality"—to use the cant of the day—may in many ways be of service to a movement, but in the Theosophical Society the work of such a personality would be too dearly purchased if it were bought by the surrender of individual freedom of thought, and the Society would be far safer if it did not number such a personality among its members.

Over and over again I have emphasized this fact, and have urged free criticism of all opinions, my own among them. Like everybody else, I often make mistakes, and it is a poor service to me to confirm me in those mistakes by abstaining from criticism. I would sooner never write another word than have my words made into a gag for other people's thoughts. All my life I have followed the practice of reading the harshest criticisms, with a view to utilize them, and I do not mean, as I grow old, to help the growth of crystallization by evading the most rigorous criticism. Moreover, anything that has been done through me, not by me, for Theosophy, would be outbalanced immeasurably by making my crude knowledge a measure for the thinking in the movement, and by turning me into an obstacle of future progress.

So, I pray you, if you come across any such absurd ideas as are mentioned above, that you will resist them in your own person and repudiate them on my behalf. No greater disservice could be done to the Society, or to me, than by allowing them to spread.

It is further alleged that a policy of "ostracism" is enforced against those who do not hold this view of me. I cannot insult any member of the Society by believing that he would initiate or endorse such a policy. It is obvious that this would be an intolerable tyranny, to which no self-respecting man would submit. I may say, in passing, that in all selections for office in the movement, the sole consideration should be the power of the candidate to serve the Society, and not his opinion of any person—Col. Olcott, Mr. Sinnett, Mr. Mead or myself. We do not want faction fights for party leaders, but a free choice of the best man.

Pardon me for troubling you with a formal repudiation of a view that seems too absurd to merit denial. But as it is gravely put to me as a fact, I cannot ignore it. For the Society, to me, is the object of my deepest love and service, my life is given to it, it embodies my ideal of a physical plane movement. And I would rather make myself ridiculous by tilting at a windmill, such as I believe this idea to be, than run the smallest chance of leaving to grow within the Society a form of personal idolatry which would be fatal to its usefulness to the world. In the T. S. there is no orthodoxy, there are no Popes. It is a band of students eager to learn the truth, and growing ever in the knowledge thereof, and its well-being rests on the maintenance of this ideal.

Ever your sincere friend,

ANNIE BESANT."

## II.

At the Convention of the American Section, 1906, Mrs. Kate Buffington Davis read publicly the following letter from Mrs. Besant bearing upon the Leadbeate issue: (Copy)

Esoteric School.

This Letter is Not Private.

Dear Mrs. Davis:

I have heard nothing from Mr. Jinarajadasa since I telegraphed him

Shanti Kunja,  
Benares City, Aug. 9, 1906.

that I considered officials' action unwise, i. e. in "pressing expulsion." I had not seen the circular you sent. I do not see that my cable helps him. He has been able to use my name, because my name was so unwisely used as identified with Mr. Leadbeater's by friends who should have known me better, and so a number of people, who felt I could not have really condoned what was alleged, have been casting about to find reason to justify the action ascribed to me.

I do not know how I can stop Raja's use of my name, much as I disapprove of it. I sent by last mail to Mr. Fullerton a paper which I asked him to use if he thought it right, saying that the officials had stood for the right and minor matters of procedure should be ignored;\* in sending my E. S. letter to Mrs. Dennis, I asked her to work on for a year, till this was over, so as to prevent use being made of disunion. This seems all I can do; you can, if you think it would be of any use, say that I should consider it a disgrace and a disaster if Mr. Fullerton were not re-elected Secretary. I feel it very awkward to interfere in the official work of another Section, but as my name is being unfairly used, perhaps it may be well to use it on the right side. And you may say if you think it wise, that I shall certainly not visit the American Section if it dismisses Mr. Fullerton.

You are on the spot, and I am not, so use anything I have said here, or do not use it, as it seems to you best. Anything else I can do I am ready to do.

(Signed)

Yours ever,

ANNIE BESANT.

To this letter the following foot-note is appended—Editor.

"Any proposal to reinstate Mr. Leadbeater in the membership of the T. S. would be ruinous to the Society. It would be indignantly repudiated here and in Europe and I am sure in Australia and New Zealand, if the facts were known. If such a proposal were carried in America—I do not believe it possible—I should move on the T. S. Council, the supreme authority, that the application of membership should be rejected. But I am sure that Mr. Leadbeater would not apply."

### III.

The whole of the letter from which the following extract is made, cannot be printed, as it was issued to E. S. members only under seal. The portion printed here was made public under Mrs. Besant's authority. In a letter of instruction to the Corresponding Secretary of the E. S. (a copy of which lies before us), Mrs. Besant wrote (July, 1906). "You can use my opinion on the harm done by the teaching publicly, if need arise." Portions of the extract which follows were embodied in printed circulars issued by Mr. Alexander Fullerton and Mr. Walter Greenleaf, President Chicago T. S., independently. The extract is now printed in full, we believe, for the first time. Mrs. Besant said:

"Mr. Leadbeater appeared before the Council of the British Section, representatives from the French and the American Sections being present and voting. Colonel Olcott in the chair. He denied none of the charges, but, in answers to questions, very much strengthened them, for he alleged that he had actually handled the boys himself, and that he had thus dealt with boys before puberty 'as a prophylactic.' So that the advice supposed to be given to rescue a boy, as a last resort, in the grip of sexual passions, become advice putting foul ideas into the minds of boys innocent of all sex impulses, and the long intervals, the rare relief, became 24 hours in length, a daily habit. It was conceivable that the advice as supposed to have been given, had been given with pure intent, and the presumption was so, in a teacher of Theosophical morality; anything else seemed incredible. But such advice as was given in fact, such dealing with boys before sex passion had awakened, could only be given with pure intent if the giver were, on this point, insane. Such local insanity, such perversion of the sex-instinct too forcibly restrained,

\*Mr. Fullerton refused to use this document to promote his re-election. Editor.

is not unknown to members of the medical profession. The records of a celibate priesthood and of unwise asceticism are only too full of such cases, and their victims on all other points good, are, on the sex question practically insane.

Let me here place on record my opinion that such teaching as this given to men, let alone to innocent boys, is worthy of the sternest reprobation. It distorts and perverts the sex impulse, implanted in man for the preservation of the race; it degrades the ideas of marriage, fatherhood and motherhood, humanity's most sacred ideals; it befouls the imagination, pollutes the emotions and undermines the health. Worst of all that it should be taught under the name of the Divine Wisdom, being essentially 'earthly, sensual, devilish.'

MR. SINNETT TO MRS. BESANT.

The following letter appeared in "The Vahan" for March, 1908:

To the Editor of "The Theosophist."

I have only just obtained a copy of "The Theosophist" for January containing a report of your references to myself in the course of your Presidential address to the Convention at Benares. In this address you have (doubtless unintentionally) misrepresented my actions and opinions so strangely that I trust you will give this explanation a place in the pages of "The Theosophist."

I did not, as acting President, "upset Colonel's arrangements" or take away authority from you. After Colonel Olcott's death an embarrassing state of things appeared to exist at Adyar, owing to a division of opinion among the officials there concerning the authenticity of the manifestations that took place about the time of Colonel Olcott's death. You cabled to me on February 22nd, last:—"Cable me the following, Act at Adyar my deputy till election. Besant." It seemed to me improper to comply with this request, as it would have been a departure from the impartial attitude I wished to maintain as between opposing views then represented on the Council. I was asked by one correspondent to appoint Mr. Keightley as my deputy. This also seemed to me an improper course, but as it was clearly desirable that someone on the spot should be invested with my temporary authority I cabled to the then Treasurer, Mr. Davidson, asking him to act for me. Mr. Davidson appeared to me the nearest approach to a neutral representative whom I could find.

You describe my article on "The Vicissitudes of Theosophy" as "an astonishing pronouncement," a change of view and so on, and contrive to twist some of its passages so as to give them a meaning they were not intended to bear. Of course the influence of the Masters has been the main spring of the mighty wave of regenerating thought to which I refer, but the external shaping of the Society was not dictated by Them, and for its manifold blunderings They are not responsible.

It is a complete misapprehension of the whole movement to suppose that They "sent out" Madame Blavatsky to do that which has actually been done. Madame Blavatsky used positively to assure me that when she was in Tibet with the Masters, They gave her the choice whether she would stay on permanently in Tibet as an occult pupil or return to the world. Because of her affection for her relatives she chose to return. When much later she went to America, anyone who reads Colonel Olcott's "Diary Leaves" will see that the steps taken there to form a Society bore no promise of what ultimately came into existence. Nor even when she came to India and got into touch with myself, was the Society as started in Bombay a forecast of the riper movement that followed. That, as far as the western world was concerned, was built up entirely on the basis of teaching the Masters gave out through the books I was enabled to write. When the letters of instruction were in process of coming Madame Blavatsky studied them with as much interest as I did, and declared to me over and over again that their contents were as new to her as they were to me. When I left India in 1883 she told me she meant to remain for the rest of her life at Adyar, that she did



not believe in the possibility of establishing Theosophy in the West. She only changed her mind and came to this country when the London Lodge was well established and a considerable number of people over here were showing serious interest in the new teaching.

The whole drift of your public utterances and writings about the beginnings of the movement are at variance with these facts, as also with the attitude of the Masters towards those of Their followers who may work in the outer world in Their service. In the same "Theosophist" that contains your address, you publish a letter to Mr. Leadbeater over the signature "K. H." I do not believe in the verbal authenticity of that letter, but it conveys one idea which is quite in harmony with the principles of the Adept world and curiously so with the views I am now putting forward. The Master declines to give specific directions to His correspondent, because that would make Him "responsible for every effect that might flow from the step and you would acquire but a secondary merit." That is the clue to the mystery by which so many people have been puzzled, as to why the Masters left Madame Blavatsky and Colonel Olcott to flounder along as they did in the beginning and make so many mistakes. Nothing I have said is at variance with the belief I fully entertain that when Madame Blavatsky returned to the world and was eager to do something, the Masters took advantage of that opportunity to test the readiness of the present generation for the reception of teaching concerning the Path and the principles of human evolution. Eventually the experiment proved successful. If it had failed no doubt the Masters would have started some wholly different scheme. Their purpose would ultimately have been fulfilled beyond question, but some other group of persons would then have been identified as having been "chosen" for the work.

You came into this movement many years after I had been concerned with its beginnings, and have built upon impressions gathered at a late stage of its progress a body of ideas which I have described as "mythological." Because I have objected to the twist you give to the facts you venture to speak of me as denying that "this great wave of spiritual life is the product of the Masters." That is a misapprehension of my views so gross as to be almost absurd in presence of my writings during the last five and twenty years. In asking me to resign the Vice-Presidency you cannot have been prompted by any doubt as to my loyalty to the Masters, because you have been too intimate with me to make such a mistake. It is not worth while for me now to attempt to analyze your motives, but to guard against further misconception let me repudiate the idea that in resisting your mythology I am hostile to the memory of Madame Blavatsky. It is a deplorable mistake to identify the great revelation of knowledge that has been poured into the world by the Masters through various channels during the last five and twenty years, with any of the visible personalities concerned. To regard Madame Blavatsky as Their "chosen representative" is to combine several mistakes in one. All who work on this plane for the progress of human enlightenment are free agents in doing so, as the letter quoted above suggests. To suppose them mere wire-pulled agents, is to saddle the Masters with the discredit of all the mistakes they may make. Of course it would be silly in the last degree to suppose that great adepts and Chohans could be saddled, under any circumstances, with "karmic" responsibility for such mistakes, but it is easy to mislead the conjectures of unthinking people in that direction. Finally the "chosen" theory misapprehends the nature of that steady pressure assisting spiritual growth which the Masters bring to bear on human progress from higher planes—and partly manifest in Their readiness to smile upon whatever honest efforts any of us may make on this plane, to co-operate in that great work. Meanwhile do not let us burden Theosophy with the shortcomings of any of the personalities conspicuous in the early records of the Theosophical Society.

In the last few words of the passage in your address relating to myself, you again give a little twist to the facts. The London Lodge only

decided to remain in the Society "for the present" looking on at the activities of its new President, with some anxiety as to what it might be necessary to do at a later date.

A. P. SINNETT.

### MRS. BESANT IS MISQUOTED.

The following correction of a widely-circulated report has been sent to us for publication:

In December's issue of "Theosophy in India" the report of Mrs. Besant's reply to the Benares welcome thus states: "She spoke further of the way in which, in her travels during the last few months, expected difficulties had been smoothed away, so that the work of the Society was now being carried on for the most part in the spirit of unity; and she mentioned specially the fact that in America, where the disturbances had been the greatest, those who had not carried the day in the voting had expressed their willingness to work with the majority, remaining silent upon these points, upon which they did not agree."

Evidently the reporter has omitted the words "some of" from before the words "those who," for most of the defeated voters avow no such purpose. It is inconceivable that 69 delegates, one-third of Convention, unanimously agreed to treat a distinctly moral issue as a mere personal opinion which could be shelved as indifferent. In fact, such as are known to leading loyalists have expressed their unwillingness to in any way compromise between right and wrong, or to at all consent to the doctrine that moral distinctions are of no moment. "The Theosophic Voice" is itself a proof that they have no intention to "remain silent," but rather to proclaim everywhere and unflinchingly that loyalists will never close their mouths in the interests of immorality or fictitious policy.

Very gladly does one find in reportorial omission an explanation which frees Mrs. Besant from reckless mis-statement and American moralists from flabby conviction.

### THE CONDITION OF THE AMERICAN SECTION T. S.

The state of affairs in the American Section T. S. is by no means so satisfactory as the rose-colored views set forth in "The Messenger" would seem to imply. A very extensive disintegration has followed the policy inaugurated at the last Convention. Many members have left the Society, several branches have given up their charters, two have experienced a secession on the basis of the Leadbeater issue, and throughout the Section there is reported a serious decline of interest in study-classes, poor attendance and a paralysis of effort. We are at this writing advised of a branch that has a resignation of its charter duly drawn up and signed, awaiting the result of certain issues now pending. Many letters, such as those we publish in our correspondence column, have been received at this office. An obvious effort has been made to obscure these facts and to prevent members from realizing the extent of the injury which the Section has sustained. This is the policy of all generals in time of war, but we feel that it is due to the members of the American Section that they should not be misled in this fashion. The American Members T. S. have not accepted without protest the objectionable conditions forced upon them by the stampeding of the last Convention. A very energetic resistance has been made by individuals and if the dissatisfied members will only have patience enough to retain their membership, we shall be able to raise our standard once more at the coming Convention. It can make little difference to any of us whether failure or success attends such an effort, since the important point is only that we should remain steadfast and indefatigable in the defence of Truth.

### AGAINST SECESSION

The recent policy of the Administration has created in many minds a feeling of great dissatisfaction. So strong has been this sentiment that from numerous quarters have come demands for some organized oppo-

sition—such, perhaps, as a movement toward secession from the Society. Many individual members have already expressed their disapprobation of the trend of executive affairs by resigning from the Society; others who have retired from active participation in its work, are clamoring for a public protest, in the absence of which they feel that they cannot much longer retain their membership in the T. S. Some months ago, in "The Theosophist," this element in the Society was practically invited out. "The penalist may well secede!" was the suggestive line of a leading editorial. We who protest against moral laxity and against a system of dangerous indulgence towards wrong-doers, are called the "penalists;" it is we of whom the Administration party would gladly be rid. Shall we fall into this snare and make the path of conquest easy? It is with much regret we have learned that old and tried members, one after the other, are sending in their resignations. Already the Section has lost the support of many whom it could ill afford to lose. Work in some branches has been paralyzed because so many able and experienced workers have either left the T.S. or are too completely discouraged by the present wide-spread demoralization to essay any active effort. This is much to be regretted, since this very attitude of mind has made possible the increasing triumphs of the Leadbeater party. To leave the Society or to organize a secession movement is just the way in which to play most effectively into the hands of our opponents. We can hardly blame any one for a disinclination to work for the upbuilding of the T. S. in its present state and it is only a natural feeling of integrity that forbids many of us to help recruit new members until the great moral issues before us are settled in a way to insure for the future an effective ethical purpose in the Society's work. It is possible, however, for us to continue our membership in the T. S. without a sacrifice of principle, if we still stand out against the influences that wrought such havoc among us. How can we fight against the present destructive tendencies if we give way to discouragement of indignation and abandon our cause? Is not Theosophy still what it always was—the bright and shining light which guides us to the mountain top? Was it not said of old that a few righteous might have saved a whole city? We are opposed to anything like a secession movement; we are opposed to resignations. "The Theosophic Voice" is established for the defence of Theosophy against misrepresentation. Let us hear no more about secession or about resigning from the T. S. Rather let those who have the power of steadfastness rally within the organization to the defence of that great ideal which has been to so many of us a source of comfort and inspiration. Let us stand firm whether success or failure awaits us. The Society cannot be wholly given over to error so long as there is within it a nucleus for the development of sound morality and a love of truth.

---

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENT.

Our grateful acknowledgments are hereby extended to those members in the American Section to whose generosity "The Theosophic Voice" owes its existence. There is no greater mark of unselfish devotion to a cause than that which prompts the individual to give without stint even when the outcome of a still immature venture may be uncertain. To those who may hereafter come to our assistance in the work undertaken, we shall be deeply grateful, but special thanks are due, we feel, to those who have responded to the first cry for help. Had this response been lacking "The Voice" would probably never have become articulate.

Chicago, Ill.

The Theosophic Voice Publishing Company.

---

#### THE ELECTION OF DELEGATES.

Branches opposed to the present policy of the American Executive, should instruct their representatives how to vote and see that the instructions given are clearly stated in any proxies that may be issued.

The election of Delegates to the coming convention is now in order.

## MEMBERS' ADDRESSES.

Inasmuch as "The Voice" desires to have a complete list of the names and addresses of the members of the American Section T. S., we shall be grateful to Branch Secretaries or individual members who will forward the same to the Editor. We desire especially the names and addresses of new members and request those old members who have recently changed their addresses to advise us accordingly, so that we may correct our mailing list.

## CORRESPONDENCE.

This column is open to the free expression of opinions along the lines indicated by the policy of "The Theosophic Voice," but the editor will decline to publish any letters that may be construed as personally abusive or that have no important connection with the issues before the Society. The Editor is not responsible for the opinions of correspondents.

Editor.

MR. LEADBEATER AND THE "MESSENGER."  
THE HYDE PARK T. S. PROTESTS.

## Editor "Theosophic Voice":

Referring to the referendum vote soon to be taken, as to whether or not C. W. L.'s writings shall appear in "The Messenger," we wish to state definitely the position of Hyde Park Branch.

Under date of Feb. 27, writing from Shanti Kunja, Benares, India, C. W. Leadbeater states: "The business of discovering and training specially hopeful young members and preparing them for Theosophic work has been put into my charge."\* This is followed by a detail statement of the teaching given by C. W. L. to these boys under his charge.

This plain and definite statement that the boys supposed to be receiving especially high spiritual teaching, are in reality being taught a pernicious practice which is in violation of the penal code and of the moral laws and usages of all civilized countries, led to the following correspondence:

HYDE PARK BRANCH, T. S.  
Chicago, Ill., U. S. A.

December 14, 1907.

## Editor "Messenger":

Kindly publish the following protest in the January issue: In the December number the announcement appears that C. W. Leadbeater will answer questions through the query department. Directly under this announcement, either by accident or design, appears the following question "How can we teach children Theosophy?" The significance of this question no less than your announcement impels the Hyde Park Branch to protest against lending to Mr. Leadbeater's teachings the appearance of approbation and sanction which his use of the Messenger's query department will imply.

(Signed) George B. Babcock, President.

E. R. ROBINSON, Acting Secretary.

102 State St., Chicago, Dec. 21, 1907.

## Dear Miss Robinson:

Before the election of officers at the recent Convention of the American Section Mrs. Besant had circulated among the electors printed slips stating that Mr. Charles W. Leadbeater would be a contributor to "Theosophist," which is the official organ of the Theosophical Society. The officers of the American Section were elected to support Mrs. Besant.

In putting Mr. Leadbeater's writings before readers of "Messenger" the officials of the Section are merely following the leadership of the President of the Society.

Your protest, which you ask to have published, refers, therefore, to a controversy already settled and is, consequently, respectfully declined for publication.

Sincerely yours,

(Signed) Weller Van Hook.

\*Letter to Mr. Fullerton from which an extract is quoted elsewhere.  
Editor.

State of Illinois }  
 County of Cook } ss.

I, Herbert A. Harrell, a Notary Public in and for the County of Cook and State of Illinois, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and exact copy of letters now before me.

HERBERT A. HARRELL, Notary Public.  
 Harriet T. Felix, Editor,  
 4 Ritchie Place,  
 Chicago, Ill., Dec. 20th, 1907.

Miss E. R. Robinson, Acting Secretary, Hyde Park Branch, Theosophical Society:

My Dear Miss Robinson. Your letter dated Dec. 14th, reached me last evening, Dec. 19th.

I have referred the letter to the officials of the Section as all matter in "The Messenger" is first passed upon before being published.

Yours very truly and fraternally,

(Signed) HARRIET T. FELIX.

Branches or individuals desiring further information on this matter before voting, may address Hyde Park Branch, 6054 Monroe Ave., Chicago, Ill.

#### WHAT THE TORONTO T. S. HAS TO SAY.

The following circular has been forwarded to "The Theosophic Voice":

#### THE TORONTO T. S. PROTESTS.

Theosophical Society,  
 Canadian Propaganda Committee,  
 Toronto, Canada.

#### COPY OF RESOLUTION

Passed by the officers and members of Toronto Branch T. S. at the regular monthly business meeting of the Branch in January, 1908. As there was only one dissenting vote—the objection raised being against the wording thereof but not its object—it might be said that the resolution was unanimously passed.

"Whereas "The Theosophical Messenger" for December, 1907, announces that Mr. Chas. W. Leadbeater will in future answer questions through its columns.

"And Whereas the said Chas. W. Leadbeater has never yet publicly, or so far as we are aware even privately, changed his attitude toward certain of his teachings wherein an important moral principle is involved and which teachings made necessary his withdrawal from the Theosophical Society:

"And Whereas the Editorial Management of said "Theosophical Messenger" by their action in opening the columns thereof to contributions of any kind by or from the said Chas. W. Leadbeater since his withdrawal from the Theosophical Society, do deliberately disregard and contemptuously ignore the wishes and feelings of a large proportion of the members of said Society in America:

"It is therefore hereby resolved by the Toronto Branch T. S. that the officers and members of said Branch express their strongest objection to, and place on record a most strenuous protest against, the opening of the columns of said "Messenger" under any circumstances whatever to any contribution or contributions of whatever kind or nature by or from the said Chas. W. Leadbeater until such time when he shall have repudiated unreservedly and in toto the certain teachings above referred to; And that the officers and members aforesaid also protest against the lack of consideration, indifference to, and deliberate disregard for, members' wishes and feelings as displayed and exemplified toward themselves and their many, many fellow members throughout and forming a very large proportion of the entire American Section, by said Editorial Management in the course they have chosen to adopt; And further that a copy hereof be forwarded to the Editor of the "Theosophic Messenger" and to each member of the Executive Committee of the American Section."

Certified correct,

ELMER OGILVIE, Secretary.

## A MEMBER WHO HAS OPINIONS.

## Editor of "The Theosophic Voice":

As members of the Theosophical Society we have believed in many things. The latest spiritual pronouncement from American Headquarters is that C. W. Leadbeater, and Mrs. Besant are our only avenue to the Great Masters. So at last, you see, we have gone one step ahead of the great Roman Church. Poor thing, it has only one pope; we have two.

This is only the logical conclusion to the farce to which we pinned our faith that we were all occultly examined before being admitted to the Eastern School and again before being advanced to the first degree, etc.

The only hope for the Society is that those who are convinced of the falseness of all the rubbish in which we believed for years should bravely acknowledge the error and start afresh. The Society will then live and flourish.

MARGURETTA BLACKMAN.

## WHY THE STREATOR BRANCH DISSOLVED.

## Editor of "The Theosophic Voice."

Streator, Ill., Feb. 28, 1908.

Dear Madam—Answering your inquiry relative to the disbandment of Streator Branch T. S., perhaps if I speak for myself it may in a way be representative of other members.

The T. S. philosophy is, it seems to me, a collection of doctrines selected from the wisdom of the East. There is nothing unique in them; the theories may be found by any one, scattered through the literature of the Orient. The only thing to warrant an interest in the Blavatsky theosophy is its alleged phenomenal basis. The phenomena have a justifiable psychological interest, if submitted to scientific examination and verification, and found valid. I went into the T. S. hoping that it might prove a channel by which we might be connected with the wealth of psychological data which we believe may be found in the Orient. I was disappointed. I found no authority behind its alleged supernormal phenomena except the dictum of the psychic who professed to have the experience. As a member of the London S. P. R., I knew that was valueless for evidential purposes, however sincere the person might be. After trying the T. S. sources for a dozen or more years I grew weary, and when its untested and uncriticized psychical dicta were finally erected into dogmas, intended to be operative in the world of common experience, it seemed the Society was consciously turning its back on scientific method, and I quit.

I have met several of the leaders of the Theosophical movement, among them those who profess direct vision of occult things. Although there are the plainest rules laid down for the criticism of psychic experiences, I have never found one willing to be tested by these rules, or who did not grow impatient when these tests were suggested. It is well known that the subject of an hallucination is not the best person to pass on its veridity, and when these seers of visions and hearers of voices set themselves above the tests which science has found indispensable in similar cases, I must decline to accept them. And if these supernormal experiences are made the basis for action in temporal matters, and we are asked to submit ourselves to their guidance and authority, it seems the part of wisdom for those who have parted with the old supernaturalism to decline to countenance the new.

Very respectfully,

J. E. WILLIAMS.

## THE PROVIDENCE T. S. SECEDES.

31 Creighton St., Providence, R. I.

## To the Editor of "The Theosophical Voice":

In answer to your query why the Providence Branch has severed its connection with the T. S., I hardly know what to say. (The President of the Providence T. S. had in a previous letter announced the intention

of that Branch to leave the Society. Editor.) \* \* \* To enumerate the vicissitudes which have been instrumental to this decision would take too much space, so I will confine myself to the main issue. Frankly we believe the T. S. is resting on a rotten foundation; that any Society which has so little moral stamina that it can put before the world as a criterion of spiritual living a person who has violated the rules of common decency, who has no compassion for those who have suffered through (his) misconduct, who has no proper conception of what is due parents from their children—as (is shown) in teaching deceit, etc.—or who has no sense of the responsibility incurred by one to whom absolute trust has been given—(such an organization) lacks in all the principles which will make it anything but a menace to humanity ultimately. Believing that the original purpose of the Society has been swallowed up in the pursuit of astralism and knowing the dangers of the latter devoid of philosophy and ethics, the Providence Branch deems it wise to unite with those Theosophists who still follow H. P. B.'s teaching and still believe that the Theosophical Society has, as she said, the cream of the world's ethics for their guidance in right living.

While honoring those members in the T. S. who have formed the protestant party we still believe that more effective work can be done where there is co-operation not division, where harmony rules and not discord.

Trusting that the future will show the wisdom of our course, "With malice toward none, with charity for all, with firmness in the right as God gives us to see the right," we shall strive to work for Theosophy as we believe the Masters and H. P. B. intended us to.

\* \* \* \* \*

Your friend always,

J. C. SHELDON,  
 Prest. Providence T. S.